

International Experience on Youth Employment Interventions: The Youth Employment Inventory¹

Olga Susana Puerto²

1. Overview of the youth employment inventory

1.1. Introduction

The Youth Employment Inventory (YEI) is a World Bank initiative that compiles policies and interventions designed to integrate young people into the labor market. The documentation of 289 studies, synthesis reports and experiences from 84 countries has yielded a rich knowledge base on what can be done to support young workers. The inventory offers a highly comprehensive sample of interventions for youth, with an exhaustive collection of programs with impact evaluations, as well as programs with only basic and descriptive information. It is not confined to success stories, on the principle that there is a great deal to be learned from mistakes and failures.³

Aiming to provide substantial evidence-based policy choices, the inventory focuses greatly on employment problems of disadvantaged youth rather than simply on those who are unemployed⁴. Documented programs seek to: (i) increase the demand for labor in general in relation to supply, as well as (ii) those that improve the employability profile of youth, so when the demand for labor increases, they can take advantage of the greater scope for improving the quality and quantity of their employment. Based on these premises and the programs' primary purpose, the inventory established nine categories of intervention, and obtained evidence on seven categories, as displayed in Table 1.⁵

¹ This is a background paper for the World Bank's 2007 Economic and Sector Work on "*Sierra Leone, Youth and Employment*". It draws extensively from the work and analysis of the Youth Employment Inventory conducted by the Social Protection and Labor Unit of the World Bank. Main sources of information include the inventory's synthesis report (Betcherman *et al.* 2007) and several background papers on the inventory's regional coverage. This paper benefited greatly from insightful comments and discussions with Pia Peeters and Arvil Van Adams.

² Correspondence: Olga Susana Puerto, World Bank, opuerto@worldbank.org.

³ It was designed as a live-database that can be updated regularly. Current information on the Youth Employment Inventory can be accessed at <http://go.worldbank.org/48Z06GMD70> (under Data & Indicators / Youth Employment Inventory Database).

⁴ Some limitations were imposed when compiling and categorizing interventions: (i) the inventory covers mainly programs for youth, with some emphasis on programs for workers of all ages that have a specific focus on the young; and (ii) it is limited to post-schooling interventions. These limitations say the inventory is just a sample of programs in the big set of interventions for youth; and lessons drawn from it should be analyzed and used with caution as they are only part of the available possibilities to alleviate the employment problems of young people.

⁵ Two categories of intervention lacked evidence. They are: "*Programs to counteract residential segregation of disadvantaged young people*" and "*Programs for overseas employment of young people*". Accordingly, these categories were dropped from this paper.

The most popular interventions are skills training (particularly vocational training and apprenticeships systems), and multi-service or comprehensive programs (combining job and life skills⁶ training, work experience, subsidies, and other support services); which account for 38 and 33 percent, respectively, of all interventions covered by the inventory. Other prevalent categories are interventions to make the labor market work better for young people (such as wage subsidies, public works, information, and job placement), and entrepreneurship schemes.

Table 1: Coverage of the Inventory by Category of Intervention and Region

Category of intervention	Europe & Central Asia	Latin America & Caribbean	Middle East & North Africa	OECD	South & East Asia & the Pacific	Sub-Saharan Africa	Total	%
1. Making the labor market work better for young people	13	3	1	17	0	1	35	12%
1a. counseling, job search skills	2	1		3			6	
1b. wage subsidies	8			9			17	
1c. public works programs	3		1	3		1	8	
1d. anti-discrimination legislation							0	
1e. other		2		2			4	
2. Improving chances for young entrepreneurs	3	5	1	11	6	7	33	11%
3. Skills training for young people	18	38	2	38	9	6	111	38%
3a. vocational training including apprenticeship systems	13	36	2	33	8	6	98	
3b. literacy & numeracy – young adult literacy programs							0	
3c. 2nd chance & equivalency programs	3	1		3	1		8	
3d. other	2	1		2			5	
4. Making training systems work better for young people	0	0	0	6	1	4	11	4%
4a. information				1		2	3	
4b. credit (to individuals or enterprises)				1			1	
4c. financial incentives (subsidies, vouchers)				2	1	1	4	
4d. other				2		1	3	
6. Improving labor market regulations to the benefit of young people				1	1		2	1%
8. Comprehensive approach	6	22	4	47	4	11	94	33%
9. Other (e.g. voluntary national service programs)	1			2			3	1%
Total	41	68	8	122	21	29	289	100%

Source: World Bank Youth Employment Inventory, 2007

More attention is given to improving the employability profile of youth than to increasing the demand for labor. Nearly 78 percent of documented interventions seek to assist the supply

⁶ According to UNICEF, life skills refers to a large group of psycho-social and interpersonal skills which can help people make informed decisions, communicate effectively, and develop coping and self-management skills that may help them lead a healthy and productive life. Life skills may be directed toward personal actions and actions toward others, as well as actions to change the surrounding environment to make it conducive to health.

side of the labor market, offering job counseling and search assistance, targeted remedial education, and training. On the other hand, about 21 percent of interventions support the demand side, including public works programs, targeted wage subsidies, and self-employment or entrepreneurship schemes. Very few interventions - such as labor market regulations and credit to individuals or enterprises involved in training programs - favor both demand and supply sides.

Most programs covered by the inventory were implemented in advanced and middle income countries and only a small share come from developing regions, such as Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) and the Middle East and North Africa (MENA). The composition of active labor market measures for youth varies by income level. OECD countries tend to have a diverse portfolio of programs, with comprehensive and training programs being the most popular ones; while middle income countries are highly oriented towards training systems. Coverage of programs in low income countries is relatively small, compared to more developed economies. Most interventions in this group belong to Sub-Saharan African countries (21 out of 36 programs), in addition to some interventions collected in South and East Asia and the Pacific (SEAP), Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC), and Europe and Central Asia (ECA). Categories of intervention have a fairly equal distribution within this group, with training, entrepreneurship schemes, and comprehensive programs at the top of the governments' agenda.

The inventory has documented programs in post-conflict countries and low income countries under stress (LICUS). The LICUS initiative was undertaken by the World Bank in 2002, as a response to improving development aid effectiveness in fragile states. Since then, the Bank has identified 35 member countries and assessed potential tools and recommendations to help them get back on a path of sustained growth and poverty reduction. Nine LICUS and post-conflict countries have been covered by the inventory, namely Burundi, Central African Republic, Cote d'Ivoire, Guinea, Kosovo, Nigeria, West Bank and Gaza, Zimbabwe, and Bosnia and Herzegovina⁷. In this small sample, there is a distinct tradition of programs to provide skills training for young people, especially in Africa: two thirds of interventions involve vocational training, apprenticeship systems and training-related programs, which have been applied in Burundi, Central African Republic, Cote d'Ivoire, Guinea, and Zimbabwe.

1.2. Targeting

Not all programs are focused exclusively on youth. One out of five programs is open to persons of all ages. Entrepreneurship, training, and multiple-service programs are the most youth-oriented. Rural youth in low income countries, although having a large share of the poverty problem in these countries, receive less attention than youth in urban areas. Only 10 percent of programs target rural youths, with high incidence in developing countries through entrepreneurship systems (see some examples in Box 1). About 28 percent of all programs target specifically urban youth and 62 percent target both rural and urban areas.

Targeting strategies vary significantly by level of development. There is a widespread interest in developing countries to assist youths from low income families, as they have relatively high unemployment rates and are more prone to engage in or be subject to risk-taking behaviors. This is the case in Latin America, where most economically disadvantaged youth have been supported by government-sponsored comprehensive programs (such as the Jóvenes programs) and by well targeted training programs (such as Entra 21 programs, financed by local

⁷ Burundi, Cote d'Ivoire and Kosovo are both post-conflict countries and LICUS. Bosnia and Herzegovina is not defined as LICUS but post-conflict country.

governments, international partnerships, and the private sector). See Boxes 2 and 3 for further information.

Box 1: Entrepreneurship programs with orientation towards rural youth

Bosnia and Herzegovina: Youth Promotion Project - Fruit and Vegetables.

The Swiss Cooperation Office designed a project to foster rural youth entrepreneurship in a post-conflict setting. GTZ implemented the program since 2003, assisting rural youth, ages 19-25, in six villages in the Banja Luka and Tuzla regions. The program aims at increasing the attractiveness of life in rural areas for young people and decrease pressure for migration. It offers training in specific agriculture fields, assists youth in selected agricultural sectors, especially fruit and vegetable, and fosters the establishment of small farms.

Philippines: Farm Youth Development Program (FYDP)

FYDP is a government program aiming to counteract the youth unemployment and skills shortages in the rural areas. The program targets Filipino youth, 15-24 years of age, and offers training on integrated farming, entrepreneurial, and cooperative management skills, as well as other activities including international exchange programs and demonstration farms. A livelihood support is provided through the Department of Agriculture's National Agriculture and Fishery Council, and it is focused on micro-enterprise and mini-enterprise projects with credit assistance. Between 1989 and 1992, a total of 2,436 farm youth were trained and 156 micro-enterprises in 78 provinces received financial support.

Kenya: Project Baobab

Project Baobab is a non-profit organization that teaches youth skills for economic independence through six partner secondary schools since 2000. It targets low-income youth, mainly females, in rural areas, and provides free business skills training (entrepreneurship training along with a life-skills training program) and small grants for business start-ups for some of those who are trained in secondary schools and vocational centers. The project's main components are:

- **Life Skills**: courses are introduced in the third year of secondary school, fostering self-confidence and openness to express ideas before a group.
- **Entrepreneurial Skills**: courses are introduced in the fourth year of secondary school, offering training in job readiness, business planning and development skills. Students are led to create individual business plans that focus on enterprises like selling second-hand clothes, raising bees or chickens, or tailoring.
- **Start-up loans**: students submit business plans to a committee from the local business community. The most promising enterprises are recommended to receive start-up loans from Project Baobab. Each year and in each partner school, approximately 3 to 4 grants of US\$100 each are awarded to students with outstanding business plans.

A gross impact evaluation shows that between 2000 and 2004 about 50 percent of the grantees were running businesses with good-to-marginal success. About 20 percent of the businesses were not operating (business failed or drop out of school).

Sources: www.sdc-seco.ba; www.yesweb.org/gkr/project_factsheet.html?pid=107; www.unescap.org/esid/hds/youth/youth_philippines.pdf; www.projectbaobab.org.

Programs in transitional countries, on the other hand, have a marked orientation towards unemployed youth with low levels of education or out of school. About two thirds of all programs in ECA have a focus on school leavers and students who have already completed, or are about to finish their studies. Most of these programs offer skills training and wage subsidies.⁸

⁸ A positive causality between the growth in out-of-school joblessness and the growth of complete youth inactivity (i.e., non-participation in both schooling and the labor market) has been found in advanced and

Evidence of programs for young women, disabled youth, and youth from ethnic or minority groups is rather scarce. Only 45 programs out of 289 covered by the inventory have a focus on women, with a modest incidence in African countries (more than one third of interventions covered in SSA targeted women, offering skills development, training, and assistance in income generation projects). Thirty-two programs included disabled youth in their target population, with higher occurrence in OECD countries and in multi-service programs. Lastly, only 21 programs targeted ethnic groups, with larger incidence in transitional and advanced countries.

Box 2: Entra 21 Programs

Entra 21 is an initiative developed by the International Youth Foundation to prepare LAC youth, 16 to 29 years of age, for today's information-based economy. It has been widely implemented by local and central governments, NGOs, and local businesses to improve the employability of disadvantaged youths. The program started in 2002 with the goal of providing skills training in information and communication technology to 12,000 young workers in a 3-year period and place at least 40 percent of them in employment.

Entra 21 programs are co-financed by the Multilateral Investment Fund of the Inter-American Development Bank. Other important partners in this endeavor are: Microsoft Corporation, Lucent Technologies Foundation, Merrill Lynch, and USAID. Grants have been awarded in 18 countries, namely Argentina, Belize, Bolivia, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama, Paraguay, Peru, Uruguay, and Venezuela.

Entra 21 Programs support youths through well-designed and coordinated lectures and internships. They offer life-skills training and continuous tutoring; these are central features of the intervention and key determinants of its success. There is also a financial scheme to provide an incentive for youth to register in the program. Programs last two years on average, *and target mainly un/underemployed disadvantaged young people who have completed high school (or are in process of doing so)*. Gender is equally represented, as well as some minority groups (indigenous youths are particularly targeted by Entra 21 programs in Guatemala and Bolivia).

Evaluations in El Salvador, Dominican Republic, Peru, Panama, Colombia, Paraguay, Bolivia, and Brazil have shown positive "gross" impacts in employability of participants. Estimated job placement rates have ranged from 68 percent in Peru to 41 percent in Paraguay, with high satisfaction levels of employers and beneficiaries. Placement rates have been lower for women, especially in Panama, where 34 percent of female participants got a job, compared to 64 percent of male participants. On the other hand, in Sao Paulo, Brazil, both genders obtained the same placement rate. Regarding earnings effects, evaluations found that average monthly wages were at least as high as the minimum wage in Peru, Bolivia, Dominican Republic, Panama, Paraguay and Brazil. Most youth attained a job in the formal sector with at least one or more benefits, such as paid vacations, one month bonus and health insurance.

Source: Pezzullo (2005)

transitional economies. For instance, in Czech Republic, Hungary and Poland, at least three quarters of teenagers with low educational attainments (i.e., who have not completed upper secondary education) were jobless in 2002 (Ryan 2006).

1.3. Sources of financing

The major source of finance for youth employment programs is the government, but joint public-private venture with international organizations and bilateral donors play an important role in the delivery of youth programs nevertheless. About 56 percent of programs are primarily government-sponsored, and 33 percent are financed by a mix of institutions, such as central and local governments, international organizations (including the World Bank, the ILO, and the UN family), bilateral donors, civil society, and the private sector. The provision of training programs and entrepreneurship schemes in developing countries relies greatly on resources from international partnerships and the participation of non-government organizations.

1.4. Impact evaluations

Drawing conclusions based on rigorous evaluations of the impact of youth programs is difficult. The inventory exposes the significant deficit of impact evaluations in employment programs, widely discussed in the literature (Betcherman *et al.* 2004; and Dar and Tzannatos 1999). Only one quarter of documented interventions have impact evaluations (Table 2), using treatment and control groups to measure the net gains of the programs on employability and/or earnings. Moreover, few net impact evaluations (10 percent in the whole inventory) calculated costs and provided estimates on cost-effectiveness. The evaluation gap is more prominent in South and East Asia and the Pacific, the Middle East and North Africa, and Sub-Saharan Africa.

Despite the lack of evaluation evidence, there is a substantial amount of information to assess the quality of interventions and draw lessons from what seems to be working when approaching young workers. The inventory designed a rating mechanism to judge the success of the programs on employment and earnings (Table 2). Constraining the sample to programs with net impact evaluations – 73 out of 289 interventions– the inventory shows that 60 percent of ‘evaluated’ programs had a positive impact in the labor market, while only 15 percent are cost-effective.

Of the programs that were rigorously evaluated with treatment and control groups, the impacts in OECD countries were found to be disappointing, while in the much smaller number of developing and transitional economies with rigorous evaluations, the program impacts were more promising.⁹ This is an important finding given the significant amount of past and future resources allocated in active labor market programs (ALMP) in both OECD and other countries. The finding for developing and transitional economies has to be interpreted with caution given the small number of programs evaluated in developing and transitional economies. Three hypotheses have been suggested as potential explanations for this finding. *The first hypothesis* involves measurement problems, stressing the wealth of rigorous evaluations in advanced countries and the potential underestimated effects in developing countries. A meta-analysis conducted with the YEI dataset rules out this hypothesis by showing that even across comparable evaluations (all with control and treatment groups) the probability that a program has a positive impact declines as the country’s income level rises. *The second hypothesis*, which cannot be tested with YEI dataset, recognizes the high levels of human capital in developed countries, where an additional investment in youths reports just marginal improvements on their labor market conditions, compared to the significant changes that these interventions can bring to youth in the developing world. *The last explanation* alludes to the effect of employment protection laws

⁹ Based on probit estimates of positive program outcomes against country level of development (Puerto, 2007 forthcoming).

on the effectiveness of the programs. However, this explanation is not enough to explain the differences between developed and non-developed economies, since OECD countries have some of the most flexible labor markets around the world.

Table 2: Coverage of the Inventory by Quality of Intervention and Quality of Evaluation

Quality of Evaluation	Quality of Intervention					Total
	0	1	2	3	99	
0					114	114
1	9	2	85	3	3	102
2	22	1	21	1		45
3	7	8	3	10		28
Total	38	11	109	14	117	289

Quality of the Evaluation:

0 Intervention has no evaluation information available on outcomes or impact.

1: Evaluation includes basic information on the gross outcomes of the intervention (e.g. number of participants/ young people who found a job after the intervention, improvement in earnings of participants) without considering net effects (i.e., there is no control group).

2: Evaluation includes estimate of net impact on, e.g., employment and earnings in the labor market (using control groups to measure impact) but no cost-benefit analysis.

3: Evaluation includes net impact plus cost-benefit analysis.

Quality of the Intervention:

0: Intervention had negative or zero impact on labor market outcomes.

1: Intervention had positive impact on labor market outcomes but is not cost-effective.

2: Intervention had positive impact on labor market outcomes and there is no evidence on costs.

3: Intervention had positive impact on labor market outcomes and is cost-effective.

99: Missing value. Not enough evidence to make an assessment.

Some types of programs are found to produce more positive impacts for youth than others. **Three categories performed better than average:**

- **Making the labor market work better for young people** had 7 out of 11 evaluated interventions rated with positive impacts. The Restart program for example has a positive impact on labor market outcomes and is cost-effective. The program is a British intervention with compulsory interviews to reinforce rules on unemployment benefits eligibility and job placement of unemployed individuals. Welfare payments are contingent on participation. An evaluation study five years after participation found positive impacts for male participants with unemployment rates 6 points lower than those in the control group. There were no long-term positive effects observed for women. These findings, of course, apply mainly to more advanced countries as few if any developing countries offer unemployment benefits.

Box 3: Jóvenes Programs

The Jóvenes programs are public initiatives developed in Latin America and the Caribbean since the early nineties. With the emphasis on demand, the model targets disadvantaged young workers, ages 16-29, with vocational training and numerous support services. The model was replicated in several countries across the region –first Chile and subsequently Venezuela, Argentina, Paraguay, Peru, Colombia, Panama, and the Dominican Republic. Few programs are currently operating; most have been adopted by national public training institutions or substituted by smaller interventions that have inherited several features from this model.

Implementing the programs:

- **Recruitment:** Advertising campaigns in selected municipalities ensured the promotion of the programs. Screening of potential participants took place in local offices, where, upon selection, participants were introduced to the program and its features.
- **Training:** Beneficiaries received technical skills of an occupation (agriculture, industry, services, and construction). Courses aimed to develop work habits and strengthen the necessary skills on a day-to-day basis (e.g. reading and writing, mathematics, problem solving, logical reasoning, team work, interaction with peers and superiors, and understanding instructions). The component lasts 150-to-250 hours in average. Some programs also offered job search assistance for 6-to-12 weeks.
- **Internship:** Participants acquire experience in a real labor environment. Paid internships were uncommon. Most trainees didn't receive wages from the sponsoring firms. Internships last about 2-to-3 months in average.

Through a bidding process, the programs selected training providers based on experience and the quality of their proposals. Similarly, firms for the internships were chosen by their experience, features (infrastructure, supplies, etc), and the relevance of their activity with the training content.

Costs and Benefits:

Estimates on unit cost for the Jóvenes programs range from the upper US\$600s to about US\$2,000 per participant served. Across programs, there is evidence of increased employment probability and earnings of participants upon graduation, compared to their control group. In Argentina, for instance, there is a 10 percent increase in the employment probability of adult women, while in Chile the program increased the probability in 21 percentage points, with significant results for youths 21 and younger and women. Similarly, earnings increased in about 10 percentage points in Argentina and Dominican Republic, with particularly favorable outcomes for young males and adult females; and about 26 percent in Chile, with best results for the youngest.

In addition, the Jóvenes programs are relatively cost-effective. Early evidence from Peru indicates that the positive earnings effect shall last at least 7 years for PROJoven to yield a positive net gain. A recent longitudinal version of propensity score matching of PROJoven showed a positive internal rate of return, consistently above 4 percent. In Dominican Republic, the investment on training is recuperated after 2 years.

Sources: Aedo and Nunez (2001); Aedo and Pizarro (2004); Elias *et al.* (2004); Card *et al.* (2006); Nopo *et al.* (2002); and Diaz and Jaramillo (2006).

From the demand side of the market, wage subsidies programs had significant positive effects on youth in transition and developed countries. Four out of five evaluated programs reported positive impacts on employability or earnings. Indications of the

success of wage subsidies interventions in improving employability conditions of young workers have also been reported by other studies. For instance, an overview study of European ALMP suggested positive net impacts of wage subsidies on unemployed youth, in particular “those with a more advantaged background” (Kluve 2006). The impact of this intervention in developing countries where job creation is especially weak remains to be tested.

- **Comprehensive approaches** also did slightly better than average: 21 out of 34 evaluated programs reported positive net impacts. In LAC, the *Jóvenes* Programs for example have been widely analyzed and cited as a successful story in assisting young workers in developing countries (World Bank 2006). They use a demand-driven model that targets economically disadvantaged youth, fosters private sector participation, and promotes competition among training providers. It has been successful in improving job placement and earnings, but became particularly expensive for some countries where it has been replaced by smaller and more focused interventions.
- Despite its low frequency in interventions and evaluations, **entrepreneurship programs** show improvements in employment and earnings of young people. Three evaluated programs produced positive effects, but their cost-effectiveness is in doubt: one program in ECA (Bulgaria’s Self-employment Program) reports better outcomes for educated youth and those with shorter spell of unemployment, but costs per placement exceed those of training and subsidized employment programs (Kolev 2003). The other two entrepreneurship initiatives were undertaken in Peru, and aimed to increase earnings of participants through the creation of profitable small businesses and the development of trade skills. Their evaluations expose positive impacts but there is no solid evidence on cost-effectiveness (Box 4).

Perhaps surprisingly, overall **training-related programs** were relatively less successful than average, due to the significant negative outcomes reported in developed countries (6 out of 15 evaluated programs). Nonetheless, *training programs in developing and transition countries had substantial successful results*, with 7 out 10 evaluated reporting positive labor market impacts. Training comprises vocational skills training, apprenticeships, second-chance programs, and interventions to make training systems work better for young people (such as financial incentives and sanctions schemes in publicly-supported training programs for the most disadvantaged). Some promising interventions in non-developed countries shed light on how to improve results in ongoing training programs.

- i. In Brazil, the *National Plan of Professional Education (PLANFOR)* provided marginalized youth¹⁰ with strong basic skills. *PLANFOR* was less concerned with the concrete existence of jobs after graduation, and more into the quality of training (topics, materials, instructors, etc). As a result, training matched effectively the needs of the target population, in particular those with regular jobs in the formal sector and informal sector workers. Net impact evaluations report statistically significant impacts on employment and positive net benefits when employment duration exceeds 17 months (de Moura Castro and Verdisco 1998; and ECLAC 2003).

¹⁰ PLANFOR targeted very disadvantaged young and adult workers with the following characteristics: (i) unemployed (mainly unemployment benefit recipients and first time job seekers); (ii) workers at risk of unemployment due to firm restructuring and/or macroeconomic policies; (iii) small producers and (iv) self-employed.

- ii. *Training programs with non-guaranteed jobs* were particularly successful and cost-effective in Bulgaria. Young and unemployed participants with low levels of education tend to benefit more from this measure than from guaranteed jobs programs. Unlike PLANFOR, the Bulgarian training program targets unemployed youth regardless of their individual socio-demographic profile, and gives high priority to the needs of the productive sector (Walsh *et al.* 2001). The latter indicates that training is closely linked to skills demanded by the market.

Box 4: Young Micro Entrepreneurs' Qualification Program in Peru

The *Programa de Calificación de Jóvenes Creadores de Microempresas* is implemented by the Peruvian NGO Colectivo Integral de Desarrollo. It started in 1999 as an initiative to counteract the significant lack of entrepreneurial skills among young people. ***The objective of the program is to improve earnings and quality of life of beneficiaries by providing assistance and training in the development of business plans and the creation of profitable businesses.***

The target population consists of economically disadvantaged young people, 15 to 25 years old, with entrepreneurial skills or owning a small and/or informal business (with less than a year of operation), and residing in the localities targeted by the Program.

Impact:

Impact estimates with experimental data four months after the end of the program suggest: (i) an increase of 7.8 percentage points in the probability of having a business operating, and (ii) an 8 percent-increase on the beneficiaries' average income. Estimates from quasi-experimental data show: (i) an increase in almost 40 percentage points in the probability of the business to operate for more than a year, and (ii) increase in earnings by 40 percentage points. An important secondary effect was on the job generation capacity. Beneficiaries employ 17.3 percent more workers than the control group (interested but non-enrolled peers).

Costs per beneficiary (in US\$):

1. Pre-selection of the beneficiaries	\$ 84
Pre-support for the Business Plan	\$ 29
Pre-training courses	\$ 45
Identification and promotion	\$ 10
2. Post-selection of the beneficiaries	\$404
Post-support (personalized tracking)	\$132
Post-training courses	\$ 51
Internships (per beneficiary)	\$173
Support Net (commercial fairs)	\$ 48
3. Equipment and Adm. Costs	\$ 48
Total Cost	\$536

Even though evaluations haven't produced cost-benefit estimates, the program seems to yield positive net gains. Further evaluation and follow-up is needed to monitor the success of the program in a larger span (follow up on business for at least 2 years). Regarding its replication in other localities, increasing the program's scale may hamper its effectiveness, which relies to a great extent on personalized service.

Sources: Jaramillo (2006); and Jaramillo and Parodi (2003).

For the OECD area Kluve (2006) shows negative and often insignificant (or modestly positive) treatment effects from training. This finding is particularly discouraging for the young population. In the US, two meta-analyses of several youth employment programs applied since 1962 found very modest gains for young workers (Gay *et al.* 1980, and Greenberg *et al.* 2003).

Here, it is useful to distinguish between programs that offer training only and other more comprehensive programs that include training as an intervention. In general, both types of programs have strong training components as well as internships and on-the-job training elements. However, comprehensive programs go beyond the standard model, they provide youths with extended services such as daily stipends to cover transportation costs, health insurance, subsidies for female participants with young children, books, materials, and working clothing. These incentives, along with mentoring and counseling, seem to make a difference in the life of young workers.

1.5. Youth employment programs in Sub-Saharan Africa

Labor market programs in SSA countries are relatively rare. Of the 29 programs collected by YEI in the region, the most popular interventions offer a comprehensive approach to young people, entrepreneurship schemes and training-related programs. Relatively less common are interventions to make the labor market work better for youth such as wage subsidies and public works programs.

Youth employment programs in the SSA region depend almost entirely on external funding. The largest source of financing in the region is a mix of donors' aid and local governments support. Examples of such financing strategies include the *Micro-Enterprise and Credit Support Program for street-involved children* in Zambia, or the *Bugaya Youth Dairy Farm Project* in Uganda. Participation of NGOs in sponsoring and implementing the programs has been crucial to approach disadvantaged populations. For example, the *Swiss-South African Cooperation Initiative* financed its program through a social investment fund which was established by the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation and numerous Swiss companies that are active in the South African private sector.

More systematic evaluations of program performance are needed to draw strong conclusions from the evidence. The lack of net impact evaluations in the region derives a substantial amount of programs with insufficient evidence to make a sound assessment on the quality of intervention. Limited evaluation evidence shows positive labor market impact and potential cost-effectiveness from two programs, the *Program for the Promotion of Children and Youth* in Uganda (Box 8) and the *Swiss-South African Co-operation Initiative*. These programs provide multiple services to disadvantaged youth such as vocational skills training, life skills, and tutoring in job search. Additional services comprise enterprise development projects, which involve the provision of business-development services to emerging young entrepreneurs.

Ten interventions reported positive outcomes in participants' labor market prospects, including three entrepreneurship programs (*Bugaya Youth Dairy Farm Project* and *Youth Entrepreneurs Scheme* in Uganda; and *BAOBAB Project* in Kenya (Box 1)), four training-related programs (*INSTARN Program* in Zimbabwe; *HRD for Community Based Training of persons with disabilities* and the *KAYEC Scheme* in Namibia; and *Jua Kali* in Kenya (Box 5)), one public works program (*Expanded Public Works Programme* in South Africa), and two multiple service programs (*National Open Apprenticeship Scheme* in Nigeria and *Urban Conflict Management* in

South Africa). Despite their positive outcomes, it is not clear whether the benefits exceeded the costs associated with the programs' implementation in all of the cases.¹¹

One key lesson emerging from this performance patterns appears to be that **successful interventions are often associated with a multifaceted, integrated bundle of services** such as skills training, promoting entrepreneurship and social elements. Moreover, programs aimed at strengthening entrepreneurship also seem to deliver satisfactory results in many cases. The effect of wage subsidies and public works programs remains to be tested. Finally, the evaluation may systematically underestimate the benefits associated with programs targeted at the most disadvantaged sectors of society; as such interventions may have significant benefits that are not adequately captured in employment statistics.¹²

Box 5: Jua Kali Voucher Program in Kenya

One of the best known programs under this heading is Kenya's Jua Kali voucher program, established in 1997 as a pilot program, under the auspices of the Micro and Small Enterprise Training and Technology Project. Under this type of program, vouchers are issued to unemployed youth, who can personally select a training provider based on their needs and objectives, rather than having them chosen by a bureaucratic institution. Vouchers for training have been used for some time in the UK and more recently in Germany as well as other countries. The voucher program intends to empower recipients with the capacity to buy training on the open market and thereby promote competition between private and public suppliers. The approach should improve the quality of training and bring down the costs, while at the same time ensuring a better match between the participant and the training course.

Under the Jua Kali pilot program, anyone eligible for training is given a voucher which can be cashed in at the chosen training provider. Participants pay only 10 percent of the cost of the voucher with the government subsidizing the remaining 90 percent. Master craftsmen were the major providers of training, responding to demand from clients. Although the Jua Kali voucher scheme did not focus entirely on youth, the majority of those trained were young and disadvantaged. Under this program, 37,606 vouchers were issued to entrepreneurs and employees in enterprises with fifty workers or less over the 1997-2001 period. There is evidence that the scheme has had a positive impact on those who were trained and that it has boosted employment, assets, and business for enterprises which participated (in comparison with a control group). These findings relate to a small population served by the pilot program; there is no evidence of outcomes/impact in a large (national) sample. The scheme was complex and costly to establish, and it has proven to be difficult to phase out the subsidization of the vouchers. Lessons learned from the experience include the following: such schemes should be administered through the private sector rather than (as in Kenya) through a government ministry; the scheme should include provision for upgrading of training providers, especially those from small enterprises; and it should promote the willingness of clients to pay for training. An exit strategy is needed unless subsidies are to last forever. But, overall, the Jua Kali experience suggests that there is scope for the use of vouchers in a system more precisely targeted at the most vulnerable.

Source: Johnson and Adams (2004)

¹¹ While there is general information available on many projects, it is sparse and incomplete from results perspective. In most cases, results are assessed by labor market outcomes only. The evaluation includes basic information on gross outcomes of the intervention, like number of participants/ young people who found a job after the intervention and improvement in earnings of participants, but without considering net effects (i.e., there is no control group).

¹² Self-assessments of such programs tend to report positive results regarding their social dimension (getting children off the streets, health, crime-related, psychological support etc.).

2. Lessons learnt

Using the 73 programs in the youth employment inventory with net impact evaluations (i.e. evaluations with treatment and control groups), comparisons of employment outcomes, effectiveness and potential factors of success are summarized below by category of intervention together with the lessons learnt for design, targeting, cost, and mitigation of program risks. Where evidence is available, lessons also include experiences in developing economies. Main lessons and findings from the inventory have been summarized in Box 6, as well as in Table 5 (which includes an overview description of the main categories of intervention and their impact in developed and non-developed economies).

2.1. *Making the labor market work better for young people*

Relatively few interventions have been evaluated under this category: 11 out of 35 programs, 4 in Europe and Central Asia and 7 in OECD countries. Across sub-categories, public works programs are the most evaluated (4 out of 8 programs), followed by wage subsidies programs (5 out of 17 programs), ‘other’ (featuring a job placement program with sanctions: 1 out of 4 programs in this category), and counseling and job search skills (1 out of 6 programs).

2.1.1. Wage subsidies programs

(i) *Description of approach:* These programs seek to facilitate new employment by temporarily subsidizing employers wage costs. Subsidies are provided upon hiring an entitled unemployed worker during a specified period of time. Subsidies last from 6 months in transition countries to 2 years in developed countries. The amount of subsidies to employers and allowance payments to beneficiaries (whenever applicable) are usually set and provided directly by the Employment Offices. Some programs offer additional incentives for employers to permanently retain workers. The minimum wage is the standard remuneration level for young participants in the U.S.

(ii) *Impact and Effectiveness:* **Wage subsidies programs have been particularly successful in improving short-term employment outcomes for youth in transition economies, while having mixed outcomes in industrialized countries.** In the transition economies of the Czech Republic and Poland, the net employment effect improves from 12 to 15.6 percent. Young women and low educated participants tend to benefit the most. The impact on monthly earnings is slightly negative. A cost-benefit analysis carried out in Poland indicates positive net benefits to society mostly because of the significant gain related to the value of public goods and services produced by the program. Akin estimates for the government are less encouraging, showing a negative net benefit for both the National Labor Office and the National Government (O’Leary 1998).

In industrialized economies, however, the effect of wage subsidies is less uniform. Belgium and the US reported statistically significant positive effects on employment and earnings, while Sweden found negative short-term and insignificant long-term effects on these outcomes. The employment effect for the main target population of African American youngsters in the U.S. case is 21.6 percent with a 39.2 percent increase in weekly earnings when compared with their control group. Long-term unemployed youth in Belgium, particularly women, realized

a positive impact on employment duration (i.e. in the first year the transition rate from employment to non-employment decreased by 31 percent).¹³

Box 6: Summary of Findings and Lessons from the Youth Employment Inventory

The Youth Employment Inventory (YEI) is based on available documentation of current and past programs and includes evidence from 289 studies of interventions from 84 countries in all regions of the world. These studies have been analyzed based on the evaluation evidence available in order to (i) document the types of programs that have been implemented to support young workers to find work, and (ii) identify what appears to succeed in terms of improving employment outcomes for youth.

Main findings and lessons from the inventory are extracted from both, (i) an overview and qualitative analysis of the interventions; and (ii) a systematic and quantitative cross-country, cross-program analysis that examines the evaluation evidence in a meta-analytical framework.

1. Training is the dominant form of intervention used to integrate young people into the labor market.
2. Interventions are often targeted at low-income or poorly-educated young people, particularly in non-developed countries.
3. Available information on youth employment interventions is stronger in developed countries.
4. The overall evaluation evidence on youth employment interventions is weak. Only one-fourth of interventions in the inventory have estimates of net impact, and just one in ten has evidence on cost-effectiveness.
5. Properly evaluated interventions are less likely to lead to positive assessments of impact and effectiveness than judgments based on “non-scientific” methodologies: where there is not a proper evaluation, intervention benefits are likely to be overestimated.
6. Among interventions with net impact evaluations, about 60 percent have positive effects on employment and/or earnings. When cost-effectiveness is taken into account, only about one-third of all interventions are “successful” (i.e. achieve positive net benefits).
7. Program success is not determined by the type of intervention. There are no major differences across types of interventions in terms of impact. Accordingly, policy-makers should consider which type of intervention best addresses the problem of concern.
8. Interventions tend to be more successful in developing and transition countries than in advanced economies.
9. Interventions tend to be more successful in countries with higher labor market flexibility.
10. There is a potential learning process in the implementation of youth employment interventions: newer interventions perform better than older ones in terms of impact.
11. Interventions targeting poor youth have higher probability of improving employability and earnings than otherwise.

Sources: Betcherman et al. (2007) and Puerto (2007).

¹³ Why Swedish youth obtained relatively less benefits than its peer OECD countries? A possible explanation relies on the targeting strategy: while the U.S. and Belgium targeted poor youths with low levels of education, the Swedish program targeted unemployed youth regardless income and education.

(iii) **Targeting:** Programs were implemented at the national level, covering urban and rural areas equally. Unemployed workers are the main target population. Programs in countries in transition sought female participation, while economically disadvantaged youth was particularly targeted in the U.S. and Belgium. Another characteristic of the U.S. program was its focus on disadvantaged black youths who had not as yet graduated from high school.

(iv) **Cost:** Cross-country comparisons of ALMPs performed by Fretwell *et al.* (1999) in ECA suggest that wage subsidies are rather expensive when compared to retraining and self-employment interventions. Despite the relatively higher cost per participant, wage subsidy policies are particularly appealing for governments to reduce the duration of unemployment in specific groups, which favors the expansion of the programs.

(v) **Risk and mitigation strategies:** Wage subsidies measures are threatened by low-qualified tasks. Evidence from OECD countries – i.e. Sweden- stresses the importance of providing subsidies to firms that offer jobs with potential to create human capital accumulation among the young. This process implies sufficient planning and follow-up to ensure that the tasks assigned to beneficiaries are consistent with the experience demanded by the market.

2.1.2. Public works programs

(i) **Description of approach:** These programs tend to be exclusively managed by governments with the main objective of reducing unemployment rates and improving chances for disadvantaged workers. In ECA, public works have been particularly appealing to governments intending to address equity issues, rather than market inefficiencies. Interventions in transitional countries had a large-scale participation and focus mainly on the provision of temporary income support and activities to long-term unemployed youths and adults.

OECD countries have a larger tradition of public works programs targeting unemployed workers of all ages¹⁴. Programs were aimed to create and provide public works or other activities that produced public goods or services. In the U.S. for example, the Youth Corps was implemented as a full-time paid service work program for young adults out of school, offering –in average- 32 hours per week of work on a wide range of environmental improvement and land management, human service, and community improvement projects, and eight hours per week of other developmental activities. Participants are employed for terms lasting between nine and 12 months.

(ii) **Impact and Effectiveness: While some programs show positive impact on employment, others have no or even negative impacts on employability.** Two studies indicate positive impacts on employment probability, ranging from 6 to 26 percent in Bulgaria (*Temporary Employment Program*) and the U.S. (*American Conservation and Youth Service Corps*) respectively; while two programs in France (*Contrat d'Emploi Solidarity (CES)*) and Poland (*Public Service Employment*) show no effects at best, and often negative impacts on the employment probability (-7 percent) and wages (US\$6-decrease in current monthly earnings). A cost benefit analysis in Bulgaria suggests a negligible net gain, not enough to recover the relatively high cost per placement compared to other active labor market measures undertaken in the country. On the other side, benefits in the U.S. program are sufficiently higher than costs,

¹⁴ Nearly 18 percent of ALMP spending in OECD countries during the last two decades have been directed to Public Employment Services (OECD 2006).

roughly by 6 percentage points. Positive net benefits to society as a whole appear when computing the value of the public good and services produced by the programs, as it is the case in Poland.

These rather mixed records from evaluated programs offer important lessons in terms of establishing coherent targeting strategy. Results from the Bulgarian program suggest that the program could become cost-effective if temporary employment programs are directed to the most vulnerable groups in the labor market, i.e. poor people and minority groups who in the absence of the program would not be able to find a job (Kolev 2003)

Participation in programs can lead to lower risk-taking behavior of youth. Program participation in the U.S. reduced the likelihood that youths would be arrested, the incidence of pregnancy among single African-American women and the drinking of alcoholic beverages among white women.

(iii) Targeting: Public works are mainly targeted at the most disadvantaged workers, “pursuing the aim to keep them in contact with the labor market and preclude loss of human capital during a period of unemployment” (Kluge 2006). Most public works programs are oriented towards unemployed workers of all ages; only the US Youth Corps targeted young adults out of school. Programs in Poland and Bulgaria showed a specific orientation towards male participants and the disabled, respectively.

(iv) Cost: Costs in the US Youth Corps are expressed in terms of hours of service:

- Operational costs of the program (net of stipends, fringes, and post-program benefits) reach \$9.66 for each hour of service.
- Participant stipends, fringes, and post-service benefits are \$6.76 for each hour of service.
- Institutional costs are \$0.20 for each hour of service

(v) Risk and mitigation strategies: Programs may create higher dependency among participants, hindering the transition into unsubsidized employment. Evidence from public works programs in Poland indicates that the effect of the programs on reemployment gradually diminishes after the fifteenth month of registering as unemployed.

2.2. *Improving chances for young entrepreneurs*

Only three out of 33 interventions in this category were rigorously evaluated: one in Europe and Central Asia (Bulgaria’s *Self-employment Programme*) and two in Latin America (*Formación Empresarial de la Juventud* and *Calificación de Jóvenes Creadores de Microempresas* (Box 4), both implemented in Peru).

(i) Description of approach: The central feature of these programs is their promotion of entrepreneurial skills in young people, namely, the ability to create and manage sustainable and efficient businesses that are capable of offering permanent jobs. The Peruvian programs offer a detailed description on implementation design:

- Diffusion and registration process with a massive advertising campaign.

- Training during the screening process (or pre business creation services): all registered participants received training with special focus on the creation of Business Plans as well as individual counseling.
- Selection of beneficiaries: a jury -composed by successful entrepreneurs, university professors and specialists- selected the projects or business plans that promised the highest profits and feasibility. The competition represented a difficult hurdle for many participants with only very few of them subsequently presenting a proposal.
- Services after the selection process (or post business creation services): the services included *training, counseling and internships*. In this stage training plays a key role by first preparing youths in the elaboration of Action Plans in accordance with their previously drafted Business Plan. Action Plans helped participants and tutors to identify and quantify the need for credit and establish the topics where assistance was most needed. Subsequently, training encompasses courses in accounting, taxes, financial management and sales strategies. Internships were carried out in private firms and lasted 170 hours. Loans were provided by an external financial institution.

These programs have begun to attract private sector and NGO financing and implementation, although the initial programs evaluated were financed and implemented solely by the government. Micro-credit and start-up loans have been crucial to support the creation and maintenance of small new business. Evidence on their implementation in youth employment programs is still very limited. Box 7 displays the characteristics of a micro-credit scheme developed in India, which has been replicated in developing countries in Asia and Africa.

(ii) Impact and Effectiveness: **These measures tend to produce significantly positive short-term treatment effects on the employment probability of young participants, but their cost-effectiveness still remains to be tested.** Only one program, out of three evaluated ones, has evidence on net gains, stressing the need for further evaluations. In addition, there is no evidence on long-term effects, usually crucial in determining the success of this type of program. In general, beneficiaries' earnings and the state of their business are monitored and followed-up within one year after participating in the programs, limiting impact estimates to the short term.

In Bulgaria, the program increased the probability of being employed by at least 50 percentage points, with particularly higher effects on female young participants. Net benefit analyses report a benefit-cost ratio of 42.7 percent. In Peru, participation in the programs increased the probability of having a business by at least 7.8 percent. In addition, programs increased the percentage of people with their own business by 11 percentage points (46.8 points in the best country case), and reduced the unemployment and inactivity rates by at least 6.5 percentage points. Beneficiaries had 25 percent more employees than the control group and a higher degree of business formalization. Bootstrapping techniques indicated higher average earnings in the beneficiaries group than in the control group (e.g. *Calificación de Jóvenes Creadores de Microempresas* obtained a net positive 61.25 percent increase, with a 99% confidence level). Although, there is no evidence on cost-effectiveness, the programs seem to yield short-term positive net gains. Key determinant of success are access to credit and the high frequency of counseling visits.

(iii) Targeting: Programs in ECA have targeted unemployed people regardless of their individual socio-demographic profile, whereas programs in LAC have targeted specifically disadvantaged youth, 15 to 25 years old, with entrepreneurial skills or owning a small and/or informal business (with less than a year of operation), and residing in the localities targeted by the programs.

Table 3: Unit costs of Youth Employment Programs

Country	Program	2005 USD ^a
Wage Subsidy Programs		
Czech Rep.	Government ALMP: Wage Subsidy	\$1,438
Poland ^b	Government ALMP: Intervention Works Program	\$891
U.S.	Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Projects (YIEPP)	\$1,475
Public Works Programs		
Bulgaria	Government's Temporary Employment Program	\$252
Poland ^b	Public Service Employment	\$1,218
Entrepreneurship Programs		
Bulgaria	Government's Self- Employment Program	\$465
Peru	Calificación de Jóvenes creadores de microempresas	\$536
Skills Training Programs		
U.S.	National Supported Work Demonstration	\$ 12,132 - \$ 16,235 ^c
	Summer Youth Employment and Training Program (SYETP)	\$2,337
Brazil	PLANFOR - National Plan of Professional Education	\$110
Bulgaria	Government Re-training Program: Guaranteed & Non-guaranteed Jobs	\$39
Czech Rep.	Government Re-training Program	\$431
Hungary	Government Re-training Program	\$818
Poland	Government Re-training Program	\$498
Turkey	Government Re-training Program	\$286
<i>Second-chance Programs</i>		
U.S.	Jobstart Demonstration	\$7,140
	Jobstart Demonstration - CET Project in San Jose	\$3,193
Comprehensive Programs		
Argentina	Proyecto Joven	\$1,159
Chile	Chile Joven	\$ 825 - \$ 1.051
Peru	PROJoven	\$691
Canada	Youth Service Canada (YSC)	\$8,169
U.K.	New Deal for the Young Unemployed ^d	\$ 950 - \$1.653
U.S.	Sample of government-sponsored programs ^e	\$10,032
	Job Corps	\$17,151
	Job Training Partnership Act - Title II-A (JTPA) ^f	\$3,511
	New Chance Demonstration	\$11,645
	New Hope Project ^g	\$6,314

Notes: a: Unit costs in US2005 were computed based on reported costs for individual programs.

b: Includes the direct cost of operating the program per participant and the administrative cost of program per participant

c: The upper bound is the program cost per AFDC (Aid to Families with Dependent Children) participant and the lower bound is the cost for other target groups.

d: Estimates based on a total cost estimate of 68.1 million, and a number of participants ranging between 86,200 and 150,000.

e: Estimated for a meta-analysis of 8 comprehensive training programs (Greenberg *et al.* 2003).

f: Proxy estimate using the data for JTPA adult trainees.

g: Unit cost per family. The average family consisted of one adult and two or three children

(iv) *Cost*: See Table 3.

(v) ***Risk and mitigation strategies: Programs can have high dropout rates and high failure rate of business created if beneficiaries are not well selected.*** In the above described Peru program in response to the high dropout rate and the small proportion of business the criteria for the selection of new participants were tightened: ownership of a business became a requirement to participate in the program. Furthermore, youths had to pass a personal examination and the evaluation of their business plan to become beneficiaries. The training component prior to the selection of beneficiaries was optional, and after completion of the business plan the Program had the same components as in the first round.

Box 7: A micro-credit scheme for youth in India

The Commonwealth Youth Credit Initiative (CYCI) in India is a small enterprise scheme for unemployed young people involving “micro-credit” (small-scale lending), training and enterprise development. The scheme aims to create employment opportunities by providing low-cost, easily accessible credit to establish successful businesses and training in financial and enterprise management. The program also increases the knowledge of young people and youth-related organizations in the operation and management of credit programs.

Services for youth are provided through low interest rates, low training costs, partnership with NGOs, and ongoing training and monitoring of enterprises. The focus is on developing capacity for enterprise management, a pre-requisite for the self-employed. The program has three stages:

Stage I: Pre Credit (community outreach support system and identification and selection of youth).

Stage II: Training for Capacity Building (capacity building, group formation, basic credit management, and entrepreneurship training).

Stage III: Credit Delivery & Support (credit dispersion, credit management system, post-training support for growth and expansion, and re-lending).

The CYCI was designed by the Commonwealth Secretariat, an intergovernmental agency of the British Commonwealth of Nations. CYCI completed a three-year pilot cycle at Ahmedabad, Gujarat, India in 1999; which was conducted in collaboration with the International Centre for Entrepreneurship and Career Development (ICECD). It became self-sustaining after three years with operational self-sufficiency of 98 percent. After the three-year pilot program, 82 percent of participants were successfully operating micro-enterprises on self-sustainable basis. Female participation reached over 75 percent of the assisted population. Over 2,500 young people in India were trained and provided with small loans. Similar schemes have been transferred to other Commonwealth member states in Africa, South Asia and the Caribbean.

In Africa, the Secretariat has been consulting with the Governments of Cameroon, Mozambique, Seychelles and Sierra Leone to implement CYCI. Short-term training in enterprise development was provided in Ghana in January 2005 as the first phase of a national CYCI project there.

Sources: www.thecommonwealth.org and www.icecd.org

The lack of success/failure indicators (i.e. information systems and long-term evaluation evidence) may lead to budget cuts, posing great risk to the programs sustainability. A cross-country analysis of entrepreneurship initiatives in Latin America pointed out the important role of labor market information systems to ensure continuity and potential expansion of the programs. An information system that allows comparisons across programs

(regarding number of new businesses created and performance indicators in subsequent years) is a valuable tool to improve the structure of the interventions and scale-up (Jaramillo 2004). A successful example of information systems for entrepreneurship schemes was developed in Colombia in the late nineties. The Sistema de Evaluación de Impacto de los Programas de Apoyo a la Microempresa (Impact evaluation system of micro-entrepreneurship programs) was jointly sponsored by public and private institutions and implemented in five cities across the country. It provided periodic and standardized information on programs outputs. Preliminary analyses show a reduction in the mortality rate of businesses after the introduction of the information system.

2.3. Skills training for young people

Training is the most popular intervention for young people. Out of 111 training programs covered by the inventory, only 22 have been rigorously evaluated: 7 in Europe and Central Asia, 2 in Latin America and 13 in the OECD area. Across sub-categories, vocational training and apprenticeship programs are the most widely applied with 18 evaluated programs. In addition, there are 3 evaluations of second chance programs and 1 evaluation under sub-category 'other', featuring outcomes from a national training institution in LAC.

2.3.1. Vocational training including apprenticeship systems

(i) Description of approach: Training programs have played a decisive role in removing skill bottlenecks in the labor market. They aim to improve the skills of unemployed job seekers and marginalized workers, while at the same time fulfilling the needs of the labor demand. Some programs are designed to develop basic job readiness only, while others offer a comprehensive array of services that includes vocational classroom and on-the-job training.

Training interventions are typically sponsored by the public sector and managed by the Ministries of Labor and Education. Some governments are direct providers of training, and others give room to private sector participation, fostering competition among training institutions. Most training programs in LAC aim to increase employment and improve employability conditions of un/underemployed workers, while at the same time developing a private market for training services (Ibarraran and Rosas 2006). The length of the training programs varies from 4.5 months (in the U.S. and Turkey) to 2 years in France.

Good practices in the design of training programs in developing countries draw special attention to the market needs. Demand-driven models have been implemented to create sound training courses consistent with the skills required by the productive sector. Consultations with the private sector and experienced training institutions favored the design of curricula and courses length. The involvement of the private sector has led to the propagation of on-the-job training programs in developing countries, where targeting has been focused on disadvantaged populations.

(ii) Impact and Effectiveness: Training is the most used and evaluated component across employment interventions. The assessment of its effectiveness shows mixed results across regions, gender and age. **Evidence collected by the inventory indicates better effects from training in transitional and developing countries than in advanced economies.**

Evidence on less developed economies, particularly in ECA and LAC, shows rather positive impacts of training, compared to OECD countries. Six out of 8 evaluated vocational

training programs reported positive labor market impacts for participants, with relatively proven cost-effectiveness (Table 4). The programs increased the likelihood of employment among the young by a minimum of 6 percent in Hungary and a maximum of 57 percent in Bosnia and Herzegovina¹⁵. This wide range of effects on employment is mostly determined by gender and level of education: **female participants and the low-educated tend to obtain higher gains from the programs than male participants and those with university degrees**, respectively.

Training programs also implied positive outcomes on earnings. For instance, in Bosnia and Herzegovina participants less than 25 years of age increased their monthly income by at least 42 DM (approximately US\$28). The largest impact on earnings occurred in the subgroup of youth with university education, whose monthly income raised by 279 DM (approximately US\$185)¹⁶. Impact evaluations in other countries report non-significant effects on earnings.

Table 4: Assessment of labor market impacts of training programs in Non-developed countries

Country	Program	Negative or zero impact	Positive Impact		
			but cost-ineffective	unknown cost-efficiency	and cost-effective
Brazil	PLANFOR - National Plan of Professional Education				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Bulgaria	Government Re-training Program: Guaranteed & Non-guaranteed Jobs				<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Bosnia and Herzegovina	Emergency Demobilization and Reintegration Project (EDRP)			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Hungary	Government Re-training Program			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Romania	Government (Public Employment Offices) Re-training Program			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	
Poland	Government Re-training Program		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		
Czech Rep.	Government Re-training Program	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			
Turkey	Government Re-training Program	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>			

Cost-benefit analyses show mixed results. They were undertaken in Brazil, Bulgaria and Poland. PLANFOR in Brazil reported positive net benefits if new jobs for participants lasted more than 17 months (ECLAC 2003). In Bulgaria, retraining programs with guaranteed jobs reported a benefit-cost ratio of 11.1 percent, while programs with non-guaranteed jobs reported a ratio of 10.3 percent. Poland, on the other hand, obtained negative net gains overall: (i) from the perspective of all society, the program generated a lost of about US\$500 (of 2005) per participant served. (ii) Similarly, the National Government suffered a lost of about US\$970 (of 2005) per participant served.

OECD countries have extensively applied training programs for more than three decades, but the programs have not become more effective over time (Greenberg *et al.* 2003). In fact, cross-country evaluations often suggest insignificant effects on employment probability, with some positive indications for adult women and educated men, but **in general negligible and**

¹⁵ Employment effects in Bulgaria, Brazil, Romania and Poland are within this range.

¹⁶ DM stands for Deutsche Mark, currency to which the local currency of Bosnia and Herzegovina was pegged at par in the late nineties. €1 = 1.95583 DM or convertible marka.

negative effects for youth (especially disadvantaged youth and youth-at-risk). Five out of eight training programs documented by the inventory (Table A.8.) reported negative or null impacts on employment and earnings. Estimates are particularly negative for the short-term (i.e. one year after the program starts) and become statistically non-significant after the second year.

An evaluation for the U.S. National Supported Work Demonstration shows that training for disadvantaged youth is significantly associated with an 11 percent fall in earnings. Some modest improvements appear (i) when youths were assigned to closely supervised work crews in stead of traditional work experience positions, and (ii) when youths with an arrest record and fewer job skills were served in place of more employable and skilled youths. In France, an apprenticeship system yielded better outcomes when on-the-job-training was provided by private firms rather than firms from the public sector.

Few evaluations mention positive impacts on labor market outcomes, and whenever cost-benefit analyses are available, they report negative net gains. Furthermore, recent studies find a high incidence of zero and non-significant net benefits when labor market impacts of training are estimated in the long-term, using administrative earnings records (US DoL 2005).

Estimates on social impacts in the OECD area are not better off: (i) the Labor Market Training program in Sweden reported short-term negative effects of training on the probability of regular education; (ii) while crime rates among U.S. Supported Work beneficiaries did not decline, even during on-the-job training.

(iii) Targeting: Training programs have an ample scope of coverage and targeting, from disadvantaged youth to the long term-unemployed, underemployed or job seekers in both urban and rural areas. More developed economies tend to target unemployed youth, while transitional and developing economies offer training to all registered unemployed regardless of age. Most programs target both female and male workers with low levels of education.

The training program in Bosnia and Herzegovina targeted primarily demobilized soldiers, with a secondary focus on refugees, war victims and the disabled, widows and the general unemployed. Further interest was placed in assisting all ethnic groups, namely Muslims, Croats and Serbians. Immigrants and minority groups were also targeted by the Trainee Places program in Norway and the New Youth Initiatives in Apprenticeship in the U.S.

(iv) Cost and sustainability: While training programs in OECD countries tend to be expensive, in transitional and developing economies, the costs tend to be more favorable. Evidence in the U.S. suggests that training in developed countries is substantially more expensive than in less developed settings. For instance, training programs in ECA are among the least expensive active labor market measures in terms of costs per placement, compared to wage subsidies, public works and self-employment programs. In LAC, several programs have historically used training components to served unemployed workers, and in particular disadvantaged youth. PLANFOR in Brazil has a relatively low unit cost of US\$2.13 per hour, compared to comprehensive programs with skills training implemented in Chile and Argentina, whose unit costs per hour reached US\$2.91 and US\$4.36, respectively.

(v) Risk and mitigation strategies: “While training programs can lead to increases in productivity and employability, they can be costly and of limited use when job opportunities for trained workers are scarce” (Betcherman *et al.* 2004). Strategies to reduce the costs of training involve the participation of the private sector in the provision of training services. On the other hand, consultations with employers and civil society strengthen the relevance of the courses and

their consistency with the skills required by the labor demand. This may favor job placement and increase opportunities for trained workers.

Training programs might suffer from high drop out rates. In Poland, sanction schemes were designed to reduce the probability of dropping out: participants who left a course before completion had to reimburse the cost of training.

2.3.2. Second chance & equivalency programs

Second-chance interventions documented by the inventory aimed at bringing school drop-outs up to an overall academic level equivalent to what they have missed. Only three programs -out of eight in the whole inventory- have impact evaluations, i.e. the Youth Unemployment Programme (YUP) in Denmark, and the U.S. JOBSTART Demonstration, with estimated outcomes across the country¹⁷ and in a particular site (the Center for Employment and Training (CET) Project in San Jose, California).

(i) Description of approach: In general, second-chance programs aim to strengthen the employment possibilities for unemployed, low-educated youth and to provide motivation for them to undertake education. Young adults and early school leavers, who for whatever reason do not go for further education or for a long-term TVET program, are the main target population. Despite the scant evidence in developing countries, second-chance programs allow participants to complete their elementary schooling in a shorter period of time and offer professional training for the job market.

A recent program implemented in Brazil offers an illustration of program design in a developing setting. ProJovem promotes labor placement of young people between the ages of 18 and 24 in the 27 state capitals and the Federal District. The contents of the courses are decided by the city halls according to the labor market conditions. They cover basic IT, mathematics, languages, job preparedness, and citizenship. It includes a two-week volunteer project and provides career and general support services to participants. Beneficiaries receive a monthly stipend of nearly US\$ 42 (100 reais) and get a certificate upon completion of the courses. These youths are candidates for a more comprehensive public intervention (i.e. First Job Program or Primeiro Emprego).

(ii) Impact and Effectiveness: Evaluation evidence is only available for OECD countries. The Danish YUP reported small but positive short-run effects on employment. In particular, unemployment rates declined due to the significant transition rate from unemployment to schooling rather than the transition rate from unemployment to employment. This impact relies largely on a direct program effect and slightly on a sanction effect. There is no data on cost-effectiveness.

The U.S. JOBSTART Demonstration implemented in the mid-to-late eighties was a non-residential program for school dropouts with poor reading skills. A nation-wide evaluation showed rather disappointing results, with beneficiaries' employment rates not consistently better than the control group and negative and non-significant net effects on earnings. Cave *et al.* (1993) showed that after four years of implementation, JOBSTART generated losses to society

¹⁷ The program was implemented in 13 sites, namely Buffalo, NY; Atlanta, GA; New York, NY; Hartford, CT; San Jose, CA; Chicago, IL; Pittsburgh, PA; Monterey Park, CA; Dallas, TX; Denver, CO; Los Angeles, CA; Phoenix, AZ; and Corpus Christi, TX.

amounting to nearly US\$7,000 (2005 USD), which implied that the positive net gains received for beneficiaries were insufficient to offset the large losses to taxpayers. On the other hand, the evaluation of a specific site in San Jose, California showed sustained average annual earnings gains: beneficiaries received about 40 percent higher earnings than the control group. But what was different about the San Jose program? The JOBSTART program in San Jose was characterized by its short length but more intensive experience, in which participants spent over 80 hours per month in training.

Despite the poor nation-wide labor market outcomes, JOBSTART improved educational attainment rates and the reduction of illegal activities. Crime rates showed a short-term improvement with a small but significant reduction in the probability of arrest during the first year of the program.

(iii) Targeting: This measure is intended for low-educated young people, in particular school dropouts.

(iv) Cost and sustainability: Even though JOBSTART net benefits fell short against its costs, the program was considerably less expensive than similar programs such as the U.S. Job Corps. The average expenditure per program participant was about US\$7,140 (in 2005 USD), which is by far less than the recently estimated cost of US\$17,151 (in 2005 USD) per Job Corps beneficiary (see Table 3).

(v) Risk and mitigation strategies: According to Cave *et al.* (1993), the lack of large, sustained and statistically significant positive impacts on earnings is the most important concern for the JOBSTART program. Suggestions for combating the initial earnings losses for participants include providing income during program participation and restructuring the duration and sequence of program services. Likewise, some options for increasing long-term payoffs comprise (i) linking program services more closely to the job market; (ii) placing more emphasis on addressing the developmental needs of youths; (iii) creating various means to help more people complete the program; (iv) helping more participants receive a GED; (v) strengthening job placement assistance; and (vi) continuing program services after the initial job placement.

In general, regular monitoring of intermediate and long-term objectives of second-chance programs and constant motivation of participants and staff have been identified as key factors of success and a promising mitigation strategy of program risks.

2.4. Making training systems work better for young people

There is scant evaluation evidence on interventions that endorse training systems with information, credits or financial incentives. This section summarizes findings from a voucher program in Kenya (the Jua Kali Voucher Program, described in Box 5) and two compulsory schemes to keep teenage parents on welfare out of unemployment (the U.S. the Teenage Parent Demonstration (TPD) and the Learning, Earning and Parenting (LEAP) program implemented in Ohio).

(i) Description of approach: Interventions to improve training systems aim to counteract training market failure and re-orient a training system towards the disadvantaged young. They support training systems and national training institutions by offering mainly information and subsidies that help attract young people towards a better education and job readiness. The **Jua Kali Voucher Program in Kenya is an innovative voucher scheme** that facilitates the

provision of training for disadvantaged workers (mainly youth). Vouchers are issued directly to beneficiaries, who can freely select a training provider, based on their needs and objectives. Participants paid only 10 percent of the cost of the voucher with the government subsidizing the remaining 90 percent. The scheme seeks to reduce the costs of training provision and improve quality by fostering competition among public and private suppliers.

The TPD required teenage mothers who have applied for Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC) to participate in education, job training, or employment-related activities or be sanctioned until they did participate. Sanctions implied significant reductions of AFDC grants. Additional case management and support services (including job readiness and life skills) were offered to beneficiaries. The Ohio's LEAP aimed to assist young single parents on welfare to complete their education and move out of unemployment. The program designed a system of incentives and sanctions to ensure compliance with the rules: participant mothers who attend either high school or an adult basic education program perceived an increase in their AFDC grants; while non-attendees faced a reduction. Case managers work closely with LEAP teens to monitor school attendance and help them with problems that arise.

(ii) Impact and Effectiveness: Even though the Jua Kali Voucher Program hasn't been rigorously evaluated, there is **evidence of positive net impacts on employment and assets of beneficiaries**. Participating firms reported net improvements in terms of job creation, productivity and business profits. "An unexpected impact of the voucher training program was the emergence of skilled craftsmen as the leading providers of training. Entrepreneurs preferred the training services of master craftspersons in the informal sector to training in formal institutions. The training by master craftspersons was usually well adapted to entrepreneurs' need for short, practical training. These training providers were previously invisible to agencies that wished to pay for training directly" (Johanson and Adams 2004).

The U.S. programs report positive but no lasting impacts on the labor market. Two years after entering the program, TPD participants were less likely to be unemployed (by 13 percentage points) and received annual earnings US\$300 higher than the control group. However, six years after welfare sanctions had expired, the positive labor market effects had vanished. Similar estimates are observed in the evaluation of Ohio's LEAP program: after three years of follow-up there are no significant differences across employment rates and earnings of treatment and control groups. These programs played an important role in reducing short-term welfare dependence among the treated group.

(iii) Targeting: Though Jua Kali voucher scheme did not focus entirely on youth, the majority of those trained were young and disadvantaged. Women were particularly encouraged to participate and enrolled as start-up entrepreneurs. Ex-post survey shows that nearly 60 percent of participants were women. In order to participate in the programs, participants only needed to prove their current unemployment status. In the case of the U.S. programs, targeting was aimed chiefly to teenage mothers. They were screened and selected after applying for welfare support.

(iv) Cost: See Table 3.

(v) Risk and mitigation strategies: **Loosing political support might put programs at risk:** TPD programs were generally well implemented and achieved high rates of initial participation and moderate rates of ongoing participation, enhancing the changes for scaling-up. However, the program lost political support due to the large number of mothers that remained on AFDC for long spells.

Sanctions put into place to ensure compliance with rules must be monitored in order to be effective. The US based programs lacked control measures to enforce the application of sanctions. Evidence indicates that sanctions were actually applied in less than half the cases.

2.5. Comprehensive, multiple-service approach

Comprehensive interventions are the most examined measures around the world. The inventory has documented findings from 34 evaluation studies of youth employment programs, 14 of which were implemented in developing countries and 20 in industrialized economies. Many comprehensive programs contain more than one entry in the inventory, reflecting the results and characteristics of the programs in different periods of time and under different analytical tools (Table A.8).

(i) *Description of approach:* Most comprehensive programs are financed and coordinated by the government. A comprehensive program encompasses job and life skills training (in classroom and/or on-the-job), apprenticeship and entrepreneurship schemes, information, counseling, placement, financial incentives (to employers and beneficiaries) and other support services.

OECD countries have a large history of comprehensive programs – back to the 1960s–with primary focus on skills and vocational training. Solid evidence of similar programs in developing countries appears in the early nineties. In Latin America, multi-service approaches to disadvantaged youth have been modeled after the Jóvenes programs, implemented first in 1991 in Chile. Government-funded and training-oriented, Chile Jóven was quickly replicated in Argentina, Uruguay, Paraguay, Peru, Colombia, Dominican Republic and Venezuela. The Jóvenes programs (Box 3) have served as a model for new interventions in Latin America. In stead of scaling-up the old programs, most governments have used their knowledge to design more targeted interventions for disadvantaged youth (e.g. increased attention on vocational and technical education and the school-to-work transition in Chile). A promising application of the demand-oriented model is found in Entra 21 Programs¹⁸, which in the last five years have assisted youths in 18 Latin American countries, with apparent (still to be properly evaluated) positive impacts on employability (Box 2).

In Sub-Saharan Africa, Uganda’s Program for the Promotion of Children and Youth has been partially evaluated, and some of its preliminary results have been summarized in Box 8.

Another interesting example on implementation designs come from the Job Corps. Students enroll in a 30-weeks course (in average) to learn a trade, earn a high school diploma or GED and get help finding a good job. They are paid a monthly allowance during their training and receive career counseling and transition support for up to 12 months after graduation. The “Gateway period” of the New Deal –in the U.K. – is an assessment phase that last up to four months, and involves mentoring, training and extensive job search assistance to find unsubsidized employment. If beneficiaries are not successful in this phase, they can proceed to subsequent 12-month phase with four options: subsidized employment and on-the-job training, vocational education or training, voluntary work, and public employment in an environmental project. If after this phase participants haven’t found a job, they go back to the initial phase (Ryan 2006).

¹⁸ A novel initiative of the International Youth Foundation (IYF), in collaboration with the Multilateral Investment Fund of the Inter-American Development Bank.

Box 8: Programme for the Promotion of Children and Youth (PCY) in Uganda

PCY is a Ugandan-German intervention to promote children and youth in difficult circumstances. PCY was implemented between 2003 and 2006, as a comprehensive approach to disadvantaged youth living in rural areas and currently un/underemployed. Comprehensive services for youth encompass: (i) promotion in areas of social work, (ii) information and counseling, (iii) entrepreneurship and self-employment activities, and (iv) local skills development, i.e. life skills, reproductive health and HIV/AIDS prevention. PCY also provides interventions for youth in conflict-affected areas as well as Internally Displaced Persons' camps.

The program integrated the views and policy-preferences of the Ugandan Government, serving as a liaison between the Ministries of Labor, Children and Youth, and Education. This coordination and capacity building process across institutions facilitated the development of the National Action Plan on Youth Employment, where PCY played an important role in supporting the newly established Task Force in the government.

Impact

A first impact evaluation in 2003/04 showed the incomes of PCY participants were about 26 percent higher than those of other community members. Furthermore, the main sources of income of youth promoters/youth group members were from salaries (23 percent) and youth group activities (38.5 percent), while other community members are still mainly engaged in subsistence farming (76 percent). Preliminary results of the ongoing impact evaluation suggest PCY has a positive cost-benefit ratio.

In addition, PCY strengthened the institutional capacity of the government (labor officers, community development workers, and young public workers) and other stakeholders regarding youth policy in general, as well as tools and methods of social work with young people (e.g. youth associations and NGOs).

Source: Betcherman *et al.* (2007) and GTZ project documents.

(ii) Impact and Effectiveness: About two thirds of evaluated programs reported positive impacts on the labor market, and six evaluations obtained positive outcomes with cost-effectiveness. **The influence of multi-service interventions on the labor market varies significantly by the countries' income level and institutional framework.**

Comprehensive programs are more effective in developing than advanced countries. Evidence from the Jóvenes programs in LAC indicates an increase in the employment probability and earnings of beneficiaries upon graduation, compared to their control group. In Argentina, for instance, there is a 10 percent increase in the employment probability of adult women, while in Chile the program increased the probability in 21 percentage points, with significant results for youths 21 and younger and women. Similarly, earnings increased in about 10 percentage points in Argentina and Dominican Republic, with particularly favorable outcomes for young males and adult females; and about 26 percent in Chile, with best results for the youngest. (Aedo and Nunez (2001); Aedo and Pizarro (2004); Elias *et al.* (2004); and Card *et al.* (2006)).

In addition, the Jóvenes programs are relatively cost-effective. Early evidence from Peru indicates that the positive earnings effect shall last at least 7 years for PROJoven to yield a

positive net gain. A recent longitudinal version of propensity score matching of PROJoven showed a positive internal rate of return, consistently above 4 percent. (Nopo *et al.* 2002; and Diaz and Jaramillo 2006). In Dominican Republic, the investment on training is recuperated after 2 years.

The least successful net returns were found in Argentina, where the program needed 12 years of benefits to obtain a positive net gain. For young males and adult females (group with the highest and statistically significant earning impacts), Proyecto Jóven required benefits to last at least 9 years in order to reach a positive net present value.

On the other side, the **OECD picture is less fortunate. A recent meta-analysis of eight youth employment programs for youth, implemented in the U.S., from 1962 to 1998, found very moderate and often negative impacts on the labor market**¹⁹. Greenberg *et al.* (2003), analyzed the findings of 31 studies (of which 15 were youth-related) and estimated the earnings effects on the served population. Findings for youth were particularly discouraging, such that the un-weighted mean effect on earnings was -\$92 (US\$ of 1999), which was not significantly different from zero²⁰. Across program components, classroom training yielded consistently positive effects (exceeding \$1,400 in different specifications) relative to on-the-job training. Training appeared to be less effective for whites and female beneficiaries than for all other participants²¹. The study found a statistically significant positive correlation between training effects and program cost (e.g. a \$1,000-increase in program cost raised the training effect by about \$108).

Within OECD countries, comprehensive programs have yielded better returns in Anglo-Saxon countries than continental Europe. Nine, out of 20 studies, in the OECD area yielded positive impacts, and they all occurred in Anglo-Saxon countries. Effective programs in these economies produced significant labor market benefits for participants, particularly for those who were unemployed just prior to entering the program. In Canada, the Employability Improvement Program (EIP) had a substantial impact on annual earnings due to increase in weeks worked. Earning gains ranked from about \$3,800 to nearly \$5,200; while unemployed beneficiaries received 7.4 to 5.1 fewer weeks of unemployment insurance. In the U.K., young unemployed men are about 20 percent more likely to gain jobs as a result of the New Deal for Young People program. This impact derives from the positive effect of job subsidies and enhanced job search assistance (also called “Gateway period”, see sub-section (ii)). The cost-benefit analysis suggests an annual net social benefit of around £57 million (Van Reenen 2003).

Factual comparisons between Anglo-Saxon countries and other OECD member states point to marked differences in their institutional framework: Anglo-Saxon economies have more

¹⁹ Programs included in the meta-analysis: MDTA (Manpower Development and Training Act, 1962-73); NYC (Neighborhood Youth Corps, 1964-73); Job Corps (1964-1998); CETA (Comprehensive Employment and Training Act, 1973-83); National Supported Work Demonstration (1975-78); JOBSTART Demonstration (1985-88); New Chance Demonstration (1989-92); and JTPA (Job Training Partnership Act, 1983-98).

²⁰ Statistically significant estimates were obtained for two national programs only: CETA, with a positive net effect of \$698; and NYC, with a negative net effect of -\$1,055, compared to their comparison groups (in 1999 USD)

²¹ An earlier overview study developed by Gay *et al.* (1998) found similar results by using a longitudinal sample of federally sponsored programs. There were significant negative impacts on post-program earnings of non-black NYC participants and all Job Corps beneficiaries.

flexible labor market regulations than continental Europe²². The meta-analysis of the YEI shows that for the whole sample of evaluated programs, the higher the rigidity of employment, the lower the probability of having positive impacts from youth employment programs.

(iii) Targeting: These measures are mostly directed toward un/underemployed and inactive youths. Developing countries and the U.S. have been particularly open to youth from low-income families and with low levels of education. Participants' age ranges between 14 and 30 years.

(iv) Cost: Estimates on unit cost for the Jóvenes programs range from the upper US\$600s to about US\$2,000 per participant served. Active private sector participation represents significant savings to the government when firms cover the costs of on-the-job training. Likewise, the bidding mechanism to select training institutions has shown to be an efficient instrument to set competitive training prices, ensuring high quality and low cost. (See Table 3)

PROJoven in Peru is one of the few ongoing programs that have continuously measured costs and benefits since its implementation in 1996. Direct costs are nearly two thirds of the total costs, as can be shown by breaking total expenses into training, financial incentives and beneficiaries' opportunity cost (Jaramillo 2006):

<u>Direct cost (per beneficiary in USD):</u>	<u>Opportunity Cost (per beneficiary in USD):</u>
Training costs: \$ 316.2	Training Phase (3 months): \$ 96.5
Payments, subsidies and insurance: \$ 118	Internship Phase (3 months): \$ 160.7

Across Jóvenes programs, Proyecto Jóven in Argentina reported relatively high costs²³, which became hardly affordable for the government, hampering its sustainability. The program ended in 2001 and was replaced by smaller programs (such as Programa Capacitar), which inherited the demand-driven model, but were implemented at a much lower scope.

In the OECD area, evidence on costs shows rather high estimates. An overview study of several interventions in the U.S. reports an average cost of US\$10,032 per participant (in 2005 USD), above their counterparts in LAC. The difference on costs reflects the larger scope (courses, infrastructure, materials) of the U.S. programs, their considerable efforts to provide post-program support service, as well as sizeable spending on evaluation design (experimental and quasi-experimental methods) and implementation (extensive follow-up). The U.S. government has recently stressed that greater employer and provider cost sharing is a promising strategy to increase sustainability and scale-up programs such as the Job Corps.

The New Deal in the U.K. stands as the least costly intervention for youth in OECD countries, reaching levels comparable to those attained by the Jóvenes programs. In addition to the costs per participant served, recent studies have estimated the cost per job created by the New Deal. Results indicate that given an average placement rate of 17,250 participants per year, the program's social cost per additional employee is under £4,000 (in 1999 £) (Van Reenen 2003),

²² In general, Anglo-Saxon economies have a tradition of last resort in social assistance measures and specific policies to target disadvantaged groups. They rely less on social insurance instruments and have relatively mild participation of unions in the labor market. On the other hand, social insurance instruments (pensions, health and unemployment insurance) and unions play an important role in continental Europe countries.

²³ De Moura and Verdisco (1998) indicated that the average hourly expenditure per trainee in Chile Jóven was US\$2.91, nearly half the amount spent in Argentina, estimated to be between US\$4.36 and US\$4.98.

still lower than placements costs in the Job Corps, estimated over US\$18,000²⁴. Regarding its sustainability, the New Deal has received extensive political support and the government is placing greater emphasis on enhancing and scaling-up the assistance during the Gateway period.

(v) Risk and mitigation strategies:

Excessive costs have deferred the returns of positive net gains in several interventions. Potential mitigation strategies include means to implement or improved cost-sharing mechanisms between public and private firms, particularly in the provision of on-the-job training. Evidence from LAC suggests that a commitment letter of participation from employers is not enough to ensure private sector participation. Instead, wage subsidies and tax exceptions have been effective measures to raise private sector involvement.

Coordination problems created delays in the delivery of services. In Argentina, and excessive degree of centralization limited substantially the capacity of local institutions to function. An illustrative implication of this is the excessive time invested in the preparation and implementation of the bidding process for the selection of training providers. Strengthening institutional coordination and the ability to manage multi-service programs may play an important role in the task of reducing operative costs²⁵.

Sustainability of programs relies greatly on the quality and relevance of training. Permanent exchange of experiences and follow-up allows programs' managers to improve curriculums timely and monitor the role of training providers. In addition, private sector participation ensures consistency between training and the skills required by the market.

²⁴ Based on a unit cost of \$14,128 (McConnell and Glazerman 2001) and a placement rate of 77% (DoL at www.expectmore.gov) for all terminees, the cost per job created by the Job Corps surpasses the US\$18,000.

²⁵ Diaz and Jaramillo (2006) stated that the good institutional performance of PROJoven derives from its low political attention. In their view, the program was unattractive to political capture, due to "its size, location in the poorest ministry of the central government's public administration, small visibility, and the political difficulties of selling vocational training" against other public investments.

Table 5: Main Characteristics and Findings from the Youth Employment Inventory

Target	Implementation Design and Risks	Impacts and Outcomes	
		Developed countries	Non-developed countries
Making the labor market work better for young people			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Youth 14 to 30 years of age. ▪ Also open to workers of all ages (i.e. public works programs). ▪ Unemployed workers in advanced and transition countries; and poor youth in developing countries. ▪ Low levels of education are common among beneficiaries. ▪ Rural and urban focus. ▪ Some orientation towards women in developing and transition economies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Wage subsidies are provided upon hiring an entitled unemployed worker during a specified period of time. ▪ Public works programs offer temporary employment, mainly in the public sector. They are not youth-specific in general, but can be designed to pay particular attention to young people. ▪ It is key to target firms and sectors with potential to create human capital accumulation among the young. ▪ There is a risk of increasing welfare dependency among beneficiaries. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Wage subsidies have positive outcomes for youth, increasing employment rates, duration and earnings. <i>Successful examples: U.S. YIEPP and the Belgian Employment Plan.</i> ▪ Public works present mixed results. Positive outcomes indicate greater employment probability of about 26% with respect to the control group. <i>Successful examples: American Conservation and Youth Service Corps.</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Wage subsidies have improved employment outcomes with net employment effects from 12 to 15.6 %. Young women and low educated participants tend to benefit the most. The impact on monthly earnings is slightly negative. <i>Successful examples: Czech Republic's Wage Subsidy Program and Poland's Intervention Works Program.</i> ▪ Public works present mixed results. Positive outcomes indicate greater employment probability of about 6% with respect to the control group. Cost-effectiveness remains to be tested. <i>Successful examples: Bulgaria's Temporary Employment Program.</i>
Improving chances for young entrepreneurs			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Youth 14 to 35 years of age. ▪ Unemployed workers in advanced and transition countries; and poor youth in developing countries. ▪ Low levels of education are characteristic in developing countries. ▪ Rural and urban focus. ▪ Some orientation towards women in developing economies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Entrepreneurship schemes go from basic training on managerial skills and the creation of business plans, to more comprehensive programs including further training in accounting, taxes, sales, internships in local businesses and start-up loans. ▪ Credit market failure limits entrepreneurial possibilities among the young due to lack of credit history, collateral, etc. ▪ There is great and increasing participation of NGOs in design and implementation. ▪ The lack of success/failure indicators (i.e. information systems and long-term evaluation evidence) may lead to budget cuts, hindering programs sustainability. 	<p>There is no evaluation evidence in OECD countries.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Evidence from countries in transition shows positive effects on employment and cost-effectiveness. <i>Successful examples: Bulgaria's Self-employment Programme.</i> ▪ Evidence from developing countries show an increase of 7.8 percentage points in the probability of having a business operating, and an 8%-increase in the beneficiaries' average income. <i>Successful examples: Peru's Formación Empresarial de la Juventud and Calificación de Jóvenes Creadores de Microempresas.</i>

Target	Implementation Design and Risks	Impacts and Outcomes	
		Developed countries	Non-developed countries
Skills training for young people			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Youth 14 to 30 years of age. Unemployed and disadvantaged youth with low levels of education (i.e. school dropouts). There is a distinct urban focus in developing countries. Some orientation towards women in transition economies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Comprises non-formal vocational skills training, second chance programs and apprenticeship systems. Training systems include public-private alliances in the design and provision of services, creating cost-sharing structures and allowing consistency between courses and skills demanded by the market. Sanction schemes have been designed to reduce the probability of dropping out. 	<p>Cross-country evaluations in OECD countries suggest non-significant labor market impacts. There are some positive effects for adult women and educated men, but in general negligible and negative effects for youth. <i>Successful examples: Finland's Active labor market policy and the U.S. Summer Youth Employment and Training Program.</i></p>	<p>There are positive impacts from training with relatively proven cost-effectiveness. Programs increased the likelihood of employment among the young between 6 and 57%. This wide range of effects on employment is mostly determined by gender and education level: women and the low-educated tend to obtain higher gains than the rest. <i>Successful examples: Brazil's PLANFOR and Bulgaria's Re-training Program (Guaranteed & Non-guaranteed Jobs).</i></p>
Making training systems work better for young people			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Disadvantaged and unemployed youth with low education levels. Rural and urban focus. Wide orientation towards women, particularly teenage mothers in developed countries. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> These programs offer information networks, vouchers and subsidies to allow young people to acquire training. The lack of evaluation evidence in developing countries may lead to budget cuts, hindering programs sustainability. Risk of increased welfare dependency. 	<p>Programs report positive but no lasting impacts on the labor market.</p>	<p>There is no solid evaluation evidence in developing countries. <i>Kenya's Jua Kali Pilot Voucher Program</i> reported net improvements in terms of job creation, productivity and business profits, but its overall effectiveness remains to be tested.</p>
Comprehensive interventions			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Youth 14 to 30 years of age. Un/underemployed youth, with low income and education level. Rural and urban areas are equally served with some focus in the main cities in developing countries. Some orientation towards women in developing economies. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Encompasses job and life skills training (in classroom and/or on-the-job), apprenticeship and entrepreneurship schemes, information, counseling, placement, financial incentives (to employers and beneficiaries) and other support services. Most programs are publicly-sponsored. Quality and relevance of training is key to ensure success and sustainability. Very large scale programs may experience coordination problems between local and central agencies. Excessive costs may defer the returns of positive net gains and hinder sustainability. 	<p>Evidence from OECD countries suggests mixed effects from comprehensive programs. A cross-program study in the U.S. found very moderate and often negative impacts on the labor market. When impacts were positive they were surpassed by program costs. In other countries (Canada and the U.K.) programs increased annual earnings and the likelihood of getting a job after graduation. <i>Successful examples: Canada's Employability Improvement Program, U.K. New Deal for Young People and the U.S. Job Corps.</i></p>	<p>Comprehensive programs reported positive outcomes on employment and earnings. Evidence from LAC shows 10 to 21% increase in the employment probabilities, and about 10 to 26% net increase in earnings. The most benefited are young youths and women. Programs are also cost-effective. <i>Successful examples: Jóvenes Programs.</i></p>

References:

- Aedo, Cristian and Marcelo Pizarro. 2004. "Rentabilidad económica del programa de capacitación laboral de jóvenes Chile Joven". Mimeo.
- Aedo, Cristian and Sergio Núñez. 2001. "The impact of training policies in Latin America and the Caribbean: The Case of Programa Joven". ILADES and Georgetown University. May 2001.
- Betcherman, Gordon, Karina Olivas, and Amit Dar. 2004. "Impacts of Active Labor Market Programs: New Evidence from Evaluations with Particular Attention to Developing and transition Countries." Washington, D.C.: World Bank, Social Protection Discussion Paper Series 0402.
- Betcherman, Gordon, Martin Godfrey, Olga Susana Puerto, Friederike Rother, and Antoneta Stavreska. 2007. "Global Inventory of Interventions to Support Young Workers: Synthesis Report." World Bank. Washington, D.C. Processed.
- Card, David; Pablo Ibararan; Ferdinando Regalia; David Rosas; and Yuri Soares. 2006. "Labor Market Impacts of Youth Training in the Dominican Republic: Evidence from a Randomized Program". Inter-American Development Bank, Washington, DC.
- Cave, George, Bos, H., Doolittle, F., & Toussaint, C. 1993. "Jobstart: Final report on a program for school dropouts". New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation.
- Dar, Amit and P. Zafiris Tzannatos. 1999. "Active Labor Market Programs: A Review of the Evidence from Evaluations," Social Protection Discussion Paper no. 9901, January. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.
- de Moura Castro, Claudio and A. Verdisco. 1998. "Training Unemployed Youth in Latin America: Same old sad story?" Inter-American Development Bank, Washington, DC.
- Díaz, Juan José and Miguel Jaramillo. 2006. Evaluation of the Peruvian "Youth Labor Training Program - ProJoven". Working Paper, October. Grupo de Analisis para el Desarrollo, GRADE, Lima.
- ECLAC. 2003. "Poverty and Markets in Brazil: an appraisal of public policy initiatives". Brasilia: ECLAC Office in Brazil/DFID, 2003.
- Elias, Victor, F. Ruiz-Nunez, R. Cossa, and D. Bravo. 2004. "An econometric cost-benefit analysis of Argentina's Youth Training Program". Inter-American Development Bank, Research Network Working Paper #R-482.
- Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O'Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915, Washington: The World Bank.
- Gay, Robert, and Michael Borus. 1980. "Validating performance indicators for employment and training programs," Journal of Human Resources. Winter 1980, 15, 29-48.

- Greenberg, David H.; Charles Michalopoulos; Philip K. Robins. 2003. "A Meta-Analysis of Government-Sponsored Training Programs". *Industrial & Labor Relations Review*. Volume 57, Issue 1 2003 Article 2.
- Ibarraran, Pablo and David Rosas. 2005. IDB's Labor Training Operations: Ex-Post Thematic Evaluation Approach Paper. Office of Evaluation and Oversight, OVE. Inter-American Development Bank. Washington, D.C. June 15, 2005
- Jaramillo, Miguel and Sandro Parodi. 2003. "Jovenes Emprendedores". Instituto Apoyo. First Edition, Lima, January 2003.
- Jaramillo, Miguel. 2004. Los emprendimientos juveniles en América Latina ¿una respuesta ante las dificultades de empleo? - 1a ed. - Buenos Aires: Red Etis, 2004.
- Jaramillo, Miguel. 2006. "Youth at-risk in Latin America and the Caribbean: Supporting Youth Facing Labor Market Risks". Policy Note (Preliminary version) for the World Bank. October. The World Bank. Washington, D.C.
- Johanson, Richard K., and Arvil Van Adams. 2004. Skills Development in Sub-Saharan Africa. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- Kluge, J. 2006. "The Effectiveness of European Active Labor Market Policy", IZA Discussion Paper, No. 2018, Bonn.
- Kolev, Alexandre. 2003. Joblessness and Precarious Work in Bulgaria: Addressing the Multiple Aspects of Vulnerability in the Labour Market. February 2003.
- McConnell, Sheena and Steven Glazerman. 2001. National Job Corps Study: the Benefits and Costs of Job Corps. Washington DC: Mathematica Policy Research Inc.
- Nopo, Hugo, M. Robles, and Jaime Saavedra. 2002. "Una Medición del Impacto del Programa de Capacitación Laboral Juvenil PROJoven". Documento de Trabajo 36, Grade. Perú.
- O'Leary, Christopher J. 1998. Evaluating the Effectiveness of Active Labor Programs in Poland. Upjohn Institute Technical Report No. 98-012. June 1998
- OECD. 2006. *OECD Employment Outlook 2006*, Paris.
- Pezzullo, Susana, 2005, *Project Effectiveness and Impact: Youth Employability and Job Placement*, Baltimore, International Youth Foundation.
- Puerto, Olga Susana. 2007, forthcoming. Meta-analysis of the Youth Employment Inventory. World Bank. Washington, D.C. Processed.
- Ryan, Paul. 2006. *Youth at Risk in Developed Economies: Unemployment, Inactivity and Joblessness*. Policy Note prepared for the World Bank, October 2006. Washington, DC.
- US DoL. 2005. National Job Corps Study: Findings Using Administrative Earnings Records Data Employment and Training Administration, US Department of Labor, 2005 (www.doleta.gov/performance/guidance/current-rep.cfm).

Van Reenen, J. 2003. Active Labour Market Policies and the British New Deal for the young unemployed in context, NBER Working Paper 9576.

Walsh K., M. Kotzeva, E. Dölle, R. Dorenbos. 2001. "Evaluation of the Net Impact of Active Labour Market Programmes in Bulgaria". NEI Labour and Education, Summary. EB5213 DOL/AL. Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, Bulgaria.

World Bank. 2006. *World Development Report 2007: Development and the next generation*. New York: Oxford University Press.

www.expectmore.gov

www.icecd.org

www.projectbaobab.org

www.sdc-seco.ba

www.thecommonwealth.org

www.unescap.org/esid/hds/youth/youth_philippines.pdf

www.yesweb.org/gkr/project_factsheet.html?pid=107

Annex

Table A.1: Coverage of YEI by category of intervention, location, and age group served

Category of intervention	Urban		Rural		Both		Unknown		Total	
	Only young people	All ages	Only young people	All ages	Only young people	All ages	Only young people	All ages	Only young people	All ages
1. Making the labor market work better for young people										
1a. counseling, job search skills		2			3	1			3	3
1b. wage subsidies	1				11	5			12	5
1c. public works programs			1		2	5			3	5
1d. anti-discrimination legislation									0	0
1e. other	1				2	1			3	1
Sub-total	2	2	1	0	18	12	0	0	21	14
2. Improving chances for young entrepreneurs	5		7	1	16	4			28	5
3. Skills training for young people										
3a. vocational training including apprenticeship systems	38	2	7	1	36	14			81	17
3b. literacy & numeracy – young adult literacy programs									0	0
3c. 2nd chance & equivalency programs	5				2		1		8	0
3d. other	1	1			3				4	1
Sub-total	44	3	7	1	41	14	1	0	93	18
4. Making training systems work better for young people										
4a. information					2	1			2	1
4b. credit (to individuals or enterprises)		1							0	1
4c. financial incentives (subsidies, vouchers)		1		1	2				2	2
4d. other	1				2				3	0
Sub-total	1	2	0	1	6	1	0	0	7	4
5. Programs to counteract residential segregation of disadvantaged young people	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
6. Improving labor market regulations to the benefit of young people					1	1			1	1
7. Programs for overseas employment of young people									0	0
8. Comprehensive, multiple-service approach	17	3	8	3	53	10			78	16
9. Other (e.g. voluntary national service programs)	1				1	1			2	1
Total	70	10	23	6	136	43	1	0	230	59

Table A.2: Coverage of YEI by category of intervention and source of finance

Category of intervention	Source of finance					
	Government	Beneficiaries	Employers	NGOs	Other	NA
1. Making the labor market work better for young people						
1a. counseling, job search skills	4				2	
1b. wage subsidies	14		1		2	
1c. public works programs	7				1	
1d. anti-discrimination legislation						
1e. other	2			1	1	
Sub-total	27	0	1	1	6	0
2. Improving chances for young entrepreneurs	15	1		5	7	5
3. Skills training for young people						
3a. vocational training including apprenticeship systems	40		5	1	48	4
3b. literacy & numeracy – young adult literacy programs						
3c. 2nd chance & equivalency programs	4				4	
3d. other	2				3	
Sub-total	46	0	5	1	55	4
4. Making training systems work better for young people						
4a. information	2				1	
4b. credit (to individuals or enterprises)	1					
4c. financial incentives (subsidies, vouchers)	3		1			
4d. other	2				1	
Sub-total	8	0	1	0	2	0
5. Programs to counteract residential segregation of disadvantaged young people	0	0	0	0	0	0
6. Improving labor market regulations to the benefit of young people			1			1
7. Programs for overseas employment of young people						
8. Comprehensive, multiple-service approach	66		4	1	21	2
9. Other (e.g. voluntary national service programs)					3	
Total	162	1	12	8	94	12

Table A.3: Orientation towards disadvantaged groups by broad category of intervention

Gender	Category of intervention									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	Total
Women	7	6	17	6				9		45
Neutral	25	26	91	4		2		79	3	230
Men	3		2							5
Not known		1	1	1				6		9
Total	35	33	111	11	0	2	0	94	3	289

Disability	Category of intervention									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	Total
Disabled	5	3	4	1				18	1	32
Neutral	21	18	82	8		1		57	2	189
Non-disabled	1		1					1		3
Not known	8	12	24	2		1		18		65
Total	35	33	111	11	0	2	0	94	3	289

Ethnicity	Category of intervention									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	Total
Particular group(s)	3	2	10					5	1	21
Neutral	25	21	85	9		1		74	2	217
Negative	1									1
Not known	6	10	16	2		1		15		50
Total	35	33	111	11	0	2	0	94	3	289

Income	Category of intervention									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	Total
Low-income	13	14	65	3				51	3	149
Neutral	15	15	34	6		1		30		101
Non-poor										0
Not known	7	4	12	2		1		13		39
Total	35	33	111	11	0	2	0	94	3	289

Education	Category of intervention									
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	Total
Low-education	18	10	51	4		1		56	3	143
Neutral	11	17	50	4				26		108
Non-low-education	1	1	4	1				2		9
Not known	5	5	6	2		1		10		29
Total	35	33	111	11	0	2	0	94	3	289

Table A.4: Quality of evaluation (QOE) evidence by category of intervention

Category of intervention	Quality of Evaluation (QOE)				
	0	1	2	3	Total
1. Making the labor market work better for young people					
1a. counseling, job search skills	1	4	1		6
1b. wage subsidies	3	9	3	2	17
1c. public works programs	1	3	1	3	8
1e. other	2	1		1	4
Sub-total	7	17	5	6	35
2. Improving chances for young entrepreneurs	18	12	2	1	33
3. Skills training for young people					
3a. vocational training including apprenticeship systems	46	34	11	7	98
3c. 2 nd chance & equivalency programs	3	2	2	1	8
3d. other	3	1	1		5
Sub-total	52	37	14	8	111
4. Making training systems work better for young people					
4a. information	3				3
4b. credit (to individuals or enterprises)		1			1
4c. financial incentives (subsidies, vouchers)	2		1	1	4
4d. other	2		1		3
Sub-total	7	1	2	1	11
6. Improving labor market regulations to the benefit of young people	1	1			2
8. Comprehensive, multiple-service approach	29	31	22	12	94
9. Other (e.g. voluntary national service programs)		3			3
Total	114	102	45	28	289

Notes: QOE specification

0: Program has no evaluation information available on outcomes or impact

1: Evaluation includes basic information on the gross outcomes of the intervention (e.g. number of participants/ young people who found a job after the intervention, improvement in earnings of participants) without considering net effects (i.e., there is no control group).

2: Evaluation includes estimate of net impact on, e.g., employment and earnings in the labor market (using control groups to measure impact) but no cost-benefit analysis.

3: Evaluation includes net impact plus cost-benefit analysis.

Table A.5: Summary rating of quality of intervention (QOI) by category of intervention

Category of intervention	Quality of Intervention (QOI)					
	0	1	2	3	99	Total
1. Making the labor market work better for young people						
1a. counseling, job search skills	1		2		3	6
1b. wage subsidies	2		11	1	3	17
1c. public works programs	2	2	2	1	1	8
1e. other			1	1	2	4
Sub-total	5	2	16	3	9	35
2. Improving chances for young entrepreneurs		1	14		18	33
3. Skills training for young people						
3a. vocational training including apprenticeship systems	11	2	35	3	47	98
3c. 2 nd chance & equivalency programs	1		4		3	8
3d. other	1		1		3	5
Sub-total	13	2	40	3	53	111
4. Making training systems work better for young people						
4a. information					3	3
4b. credit (to individuals or enterprises)			1			1
4c. financial incentives (subsidies, vouchers)	1		1		2	4
4d. other	1				2	3
Sub-total	2		2		7	11
6. Improving labor market regulations to the benefit of young people			1		1	2
8. Comprehensive, multiple-service approach	18	6	34	7	29	94
9. Other (e.g. voluntary national service programs)			2	1		3
Total	38	11	109	14	117	289

Notes:

- 0: Program had negative or zero impact in the labor market.
- 1: Program had positive impact in the labor market, but it is not cost effective.
- 2: Program had positive impact in the labor market and there is no evidence on costs.
- 3: Program had positive impact in the labor market and is cost effective.
- 99: Missing Value: Not enough evidence to make an assessment.

Table A.6: Quality of intervention (QOI) disaggregated by Quality of evaluation (QOE)

Quality of Evaluation	Quality of Intervention					
	0	1	2	3	99	Total
0					114	114
1	9	2	85	3	3	102
2	22	1	21	1		45
3	7	8	3	10		28
Total	38	11	109	14	117	289

Note: QOI and QOE values as described in Tables A.4 and A.5.

Table A.7: Summary rating of quality of intervention by country context

Type of Country	Quality of Intervention					
	0	1	2	3	99	Total
Developing	7	4	57	5	56	129
Transition	2	3	19	3	11	38
Industrialized	29	4	33	6	50	122
Total	38	11	109	14	117	289

Income Level	Quality of Intervention					
	0	1	2	3	99	Total
Low	2		18	1	15	36
Lower Middle	4	3	35	5	28	75
Upper Middle	3	4	22	2	23	54
High (No OECD)			1		1	2
OECD	29	4	33	6	50	122
Total	38	11	109	14	117	289

Rigidity of Employment Index	Quality of Intervention					
	0	1	2	3	99	Total
From 0 to 25	18	3	40	7	42	110
From 26 to 50	6	7	41	5	39	98
From 51 to 75	14	1	26	2	33	76
From 75 to 100					1	1
Unclassified			2		2	4
Total	38	11	109	14	117	289

Notes:

0: Program had negative or zero impact in the labor market.

1: Program had positive impact in the labor market, but it is not cost effective.

2: Program had positive impact in the labor market and there is no evidence on costs.

3: Program had positive impact in the labor market and is cost effective.

99: Missing Value: Not enough evidence to make an assessment.

Table A.8: YEI: List of programs by category of intervention, region, country and sources of information

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
1. Making the labor market work better for young people					
1a. counseling, job search skills					
ECA	Kyrgyz Republic	Kyrgyzstan: Youth Placement Office (YPO)	1	2	BMZ and GTZ. BMZ. 2006. Cornerstones of Youth Employment Promotion in Development Cooperation. Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Division of Development Education and Information. Germany. May 2006. Available online at: www.bmz.de/en/service/infothek/fach/diskurs/diskurs007en.pdf
ECA	Romania	Assistance for the integration of youngsters from public care	1	99	Walther, Andreas and Axel Pohl. 2005. Thematic Study on Policy Measures concerning Disadvantaged Youth. Study commissioned by the European Commission, DG Employment and Social Affairs in the framework of the Community Action Programme to Combat Social Exclusion 2002 – 2006. Final Report. Tübingen, October 2005. Available online at: http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/social_inclusion/docs/youth_study_en.pdf
LAC	Chile	Joblab© Chile	1	2	CD-Rom “Joblab©” available upon request. For more information see: www.joblab.de
OECD	Germany	Nokia Make a Connection	0	99	www.makeaconnection.org/opencms/opencms/makeaconnection/org/content/MediaCenter/press/press05.html
OECD	Portugal	Programa InserJovem	2	0	Centeno, Luis; Mario Centeno and Alvaro Novo. 2004. Evaluating the impact of a mandatory job search program: evidence from a large longitudinal dataset. 13th September 2004. Draft version, mimeo. Government of Portugal. 2005. Plano Nacional de Accao para a Inclusao. Update Report NAPIincl. 2005 - 2006. June 2005.
OECD	Sweden	Youth Teams	1	99	Jonzon, B. and Wise, L. R. 1989. Getting young people to work: An evaluation of Swedish youth employment policy, <i>International Labour Review</i> , 1989, 128, 3; <i>ABI/INFORM Global</i> pg. 337
1b. wage subsidies					
ECA	Bulgaria	Employment in Public Administration for Young Graduates Programme	1	2	www.eu-employment-observatory.net/resources/reviews/eeo_review_autumn2004_en.pdf
ECA	Czech Republic	Government ALPs: Wage Subsidy	3	2	Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O’Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. <i>Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915</i> ,

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
					Washington: The World Bank.
ECA	Hungary	"New Services" - Employment of Youth	0	99	Ministry of Employment and Labour of Hungary. 2005. Youth on the labour market. Employment Week 2005. Budapest, April 2005. Available online at: www.szmm.gov.hu/download.php?ctag=download&docID=11429 Implementing agency: Regional Training Centre of Pécs and Labour Centre of Baranya County. http://en.afsz.hu
ECA	Kyrgyz Republic	Youth Job Vouchers	1	2	BMZ and GTZ. BMZ. 2006. Cornerstones of Youth Employment Promotion in Development Cooperation. Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Division of Development Education and Information. Germany. May 2006. Available online at: www.bmz.de/en/service/infothek/fach/diskurs/diskurs007en.pdf
ECA	Latvia	Acquisition of working skills during the summer holidays for students from secondary and secondary vocational schools (vocational training students)	1	2	www.eu-employment-observatory.net/resources/reviews/eo_review_autumn2004_en.pdf
ECA	Poland	Government ALPs: Intervention Works Program	3	3	Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O'Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915, Washington: The World Bank.
ECA	Romania	Incentives for employers to employ (young) graduates	1	2	Walther, Andreas and Axel Pohl. 2005. Thematic Study on Policy Measures concerning Disadvantaged Youth. Study commissioned by the European Commission, DG Employment and Social Affairs in the framework of the Community Action Programme to Combat Social Exclusion 2002 – 2006. Final Report. Tübingen, October 2005. Available online at: http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/social_inclusion/docs/youth_study_en.pdf
ECA	Slovak Republic	Support for the work experience of school leavers	1	2	www.eu-employment-observatory.net/resources/reviews/spring_rvw_05_en.pdf
OECD	Austria	Private sector wage incentives - Subsidies for young people	0	99	Lassnigg, Lorenz. 1998. Youth Labour Market Policy in Austria 1980-1997. Institute for Advanced Studies, Austria, April 1998. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/40/38/1925668.pdf
OECD	Austria	Private sector wage incentives - Wage incentives for additional employment of young people	0	99	Lassnigg, Lorenz. 1998. Youth Labour Market Policy in Austria 1980-1997. Institute for Advanced Studies, Austria, April 1998. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/40/38/1925668.pdf
OECD	Belgium	The Belgian	2	2	Cockx, B. and C. Göbel. 2004. "Subsidized employment for young long-term unemployed workers – an

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		Employment Plan			evaluation", mimeo.
OECD	Canada	Newfoundland's Graduate Employment Programme (demand-side measures program)	1	2	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Japan	Promote Reg Employment Youth Independence and Challenge Plan	1	2	Government of Japan. 2004. Government Policy on Employment and Development of Young Workers in Japan. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Japan.
OECD	Sweden	Youth Practice	2	0	Larsson, L. 2000. Evaluation of Swedish youth labour market programmes. Uppsala University & Office of Labour Market Policy Evaluation, Sweden.
OECD	United Kingdom	Young Workers Scheme (YWS)	1	0	Lindley, R. M. 1996. The school-to-work transition in the United Kingdom. <i>International Labour Review</i> , 135, no. 2, 159-80.
OECD	United States	Targeted Jobs Tax Credit (TJTC)	1	2	Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outcomes. Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998. Katz, Lawrence. 1998. "Wage Subsidies for the Disadvantaged", in R. Freeman and P. Gottschalk, eds. <i>Generating Jobs</i> , Russell Sage Foundation, New York, N.Y. 1998. U.S. Department of Labor, Office of the Inspector General. 1994. "Targeted Jobs Tax Credit: Employer Inducement or Windfall?", August, 1994.
OECD	United States	Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Projects (YIEPP)	2	2	Farkas, George; D.A. Smith and E.W. Stromsdorfer. 1983. The Youth Entitlement Demonstration: Subsidized Employment with a Schooling Requirement. <i>The Journal of Human Resources</i> , Vol. 18, No. 4 Gueron, Judith M. 1984. Lessons from a job guarantee: The Incentive Entitlement Pilot Projects. Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation. June 1984. Farkas, et al. 1982. Impacts from the Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Projects: participation, work, and schooling over the full program period, New York: MDRC. Farkas, et al. 1984. Post-program impacts of the Youth Incentive Entitlement Pilot Projects. New York: MDRC. Johnson, Clifford M. and Ana Carricchi Lopez. 1997. "Shattering the Myth of Failure: Promising Findings from Ten Public Job Creation Initiatives". Center on Budget and Policy Priorities. December 22, 1997. Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outcomes. Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998.
1c. public works programs					
ECA	Bulgaria	Government's Temporary	3	1	Walsh, K.; M. Kotzeva; E. Dölle; and R. Dorenbos. 2001. NEI Labour and Education. Evaluation of the Net Impact of Active Labour Market Programmes in Bulgaria. Summary. EB5213 DOL/AL. Ministry of Labour

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		Employment Program			and Social Policy, Bulgaria, 2001. Kolev, Alexandre. 2003. Joblessness and Precarious Work in Bulgaria: Addressing the Multiple Aspects of Vulnerability in the Labour Market. February 2003. www.undp.org.mk
ECA	Macedonia, FYR	Youth Employment Support programme (YES): (MCD/01/004)	1	2	
ECA	Poland	Public Service Employment	3	0	Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O'Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915, Washington: The World Bank.
MENA	Egypt, Arab Rep.	Public Works Programme in Egypt	1	1	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva. Information also available at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/afpro/mdtharare/download/discussionpapers/ppp14.doc
OECD	France	Employment solidarity contract (contrat d'emploi solidarité CES)	2	0	Bonnal, L., Fougere, D., and Serandon, A. 1997. Evaluating the impact of French employment policies on individual labor market histories. Review of Economic Studies 64, 683-713. Brodaty, T., Crepon, B., Fougere, D. 1999. Using matching estimators to evaluate alternative youth employment programmes: Evidence from France, 1986-1988 and 1995-1998. Mimeo. Fougere, D, Kramarz, F, Magnac T. 2000. Youth Employment Policies in France, European Economic Review 44 (2000), 928-942.
OECD	Italy	Socially useful activities (SUA)	0	99	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.
OECD	United States	American Conservation and Youth Service Corps	3	3	Bonnal, L., Fougere, D., and Serandon, A. 1997. Evaluating the impact of French employment policies on individual labor market histories. Review of Economic Studies 64, 683-713. Brodaty, T., Crepon, B., Fougere, D. 1999. Using matching estimators to evaluate alternative youth employment programmes: Evidence from France, 1986-1988 and 1995-1998. Mimeo. Websites: www.americorps.org; www.abtassoc.com Johnson, Clifford M. and Ana Carricchi Lopez. 1997. "Shattering the Myth of Failure: Promising Findings from Ten Public Job Creation Initiatives". Center on Budget and Policy Priorities. December 22, 1997
SSA	South Africa	Expanded Public Works Programme	1	2	www.epwp.gov.za/index.htm
1e. other					
LAC	Chile	Employability-Strategies of Youth - Support to youth	1	2	www.interjoven.cl (with reference to several publications)

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		organizations in poor areas			
LAC	Honduras	YES Honduras	0	99	http://projects.takingitglobal.org/YES-Honduras http://www.yesweb.org/yesnetworks/map.html http://espanol.groups.yahoo.com/group/edyeshonduras/
OECD	United Kingdom	Action Research Grants Program	0	99	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva.
OECD	United Kingdom	Restart	3	3	Dolton, Peter and Donal O'Neill. 2002. "The Long-Run Effects of Unemployment Monitoring and Work-Search Programs: Experimental Evidence from the United Kingdom". Journal of Labor Economics, 2002, vol. 20, no. 2.

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
2. Improving chances for young entrepreneurs					
ECA	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Youth Promotion Project - Fruit and Vegetables	0	99	SDC Web www.sdc-seco.ba
ECA	Bulgaria	Government's Self-employment Programme	3	1	Walsh, K.; M. Kotzeva; E. Dölle; and R. Dorenbos. 2001. NEI Labour and Education. Evaluation of the Net Impact of Active Labour Market Programmes in Bulgaria. Summary. EB5213 DOL/AL. Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, Bulgaria, 2001. Kolev, Alexandre. 2003. Joblessness and Precarious Work in Bulgaria: Addressing the Multiple Aspects of Vulnerability in the Labour Market. February 2003.
ECA	Hungary	Youth Business International (YBI)	0	99	Chambers, Rachel and Anna Lake. 1980. Youth Business International: Bridging the gap between unemployment and self-employment for disadvantaged youth. InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability. Skills Working Paper No. 3, International Labour Organisation. Geneva. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/skills/youth/download/skillswp3.pdf
LAC	Nicaragua	YES Nicaragua	0	99	International Labor Organization, YEN, Justin Sykes. Further information collected from: Registry of qualification, Registry before the Chamber of Commerce, Financial statement of the companies.
LAC	Peru	Creer para Crear	0	99	IADB, official documents. "Promotion of Youth Startups in Peru" (TC-99-11-18-3-PE). Available online at: http://www.iadb.org/exr/doc98/apr/PE7138e.pdf
LAC	Peru	Formacion empresarial de la juventud - Youth Entrepreneurship Program	2	2	Jaramillo, Miguel and Sandro Parodi. 2003. Jovenes Emprendedores. Instituto Apoyo. First edition, Lima, January 2003.
LAC	Peru	Calificacion de jovenes creadores de microempresas - Certification of Youth Entrepreneurship	2	2	Jaramillo, Miguel and Sandro Parodi. 2003. Jovenes Emprendedores. Instituto Apoyo. First edition, Lima, January 2003.
LAC	Venezuela, RB	Micro-credits for young people - (Employment and Community-orientated Youth Promotion)	1	2	BMZ and GTZ.

BMZ. 2006. Cornerstones of Youth Employment Promotion in Development Cooperation. Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Division of Development Education and Information. Germany. May 2006. Available online at:

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
MENA	Egypt, Arab Rep.	Sohag Rural Development Project	0	99	www.bmz.de/en/service/infothek/fach/diskurs/diskurs007en.pdf World Bank. 1998. Egypt - Sohag Rural Development Project, Volume 1, Staff Appraisal Report. The World Bank: Washington DC.
OECD	Australia	Youth Business International (YBI)	0	99	Chambers, Rachel and Anna Lake. 1980. Youth Business International: Bridging the gap between unemployment and self-employment for disadvantaged youth. InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability. Skills Working Paper No. 3, International Labour Organisation. Geneva. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/skills/youth/download/skillswp3.pdf
OECD	Australia	Youth 2 Youth	0	99	www.youth2youth.com.au
OECD	Canada	British Columbia's Youth Business and Entrepreneurship Training Programme (self-employment program)	0	99	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Nova Scotia's Centre for Entrepreneurship Education and Development (CEED) (self-employment program)	1	2	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Québec's Youth Entrepreneurs programme (self-employment program)	0	99	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Youth Business International (YBI)	0	99	Chambers, Rachel and Anna Lake. 1980. Youth Business International: Bridging the gap between unemployment and self-employment for disadvantaged youth. InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability. Skills Working Paper No. 3, International Labour Organisation. Geneva. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/skills/youth/download/skillswp3.pdf
OECD	Ireland	Youth Business International (YBI)	0	99	Chambers, Rachel and Anna Lake. 1980. Youth Business International: Bridging the gap between unemployment and self-employment for disadvantaged youth. InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability. Skills Working Paper No. 3, International Labour Organisation. Geneva. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/skills/youth/download/skillswp3.pdf
OECD	Italy	Financial incentives for young entrepreneurship	0	99	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.
OECD	Italy	Fiscal Incentives	1	2	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.
OECD	Italy	Promotion of youth self-employment	0	99	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
OECD	United Kingdom	Youth Business International (YBI)	0	99	Chambers, Rachel and Anna Lake. 1980. Youth Business International: Bridging the gap between unemployment and self-employment for disadvantaged youth. InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability. Skills Working Paper No. 3, International Labour Organisation. Geneva. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/skills/youth/download/skillswp3.pdf
SAR and EAP	Indonesia	TKPMP - YPED: Young Professional Entrepreneur Development (Tenaga Kerja Pemuda Mandiri dan Profesional)	1	2	http://www.acys.utas.edu.au/ianys/proceedings/1996/paper-5.html http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/bangkok/conf/youth/con_stu/synthes.pdf
SAR and EAP	Micronesia, Fed. Sts.	Creation of Micronesian Entrepreneur Development Centre (MEDC) DP/MIC/92/001; MIC/95/002	1	2	http://www.unido.org http://www.undp.org.fj/FSM_Past_Projects.htm
SAR and EAP	Philippines	Farm Youth Development Programme (FYDP)	1	2	http://www.yesweb.org/gkr/project_factsheet.html?pid=107 http://www.unescap.org/esid/hds/youth/youth_philippines.pdf
SAR and EAP	India	Bharatiya Yuva Shakti Trust (BYST)	1	2	http://www.bystonline.org
SAR and EAP	India	Commonwealth Youth Credit Initiative (CYCI)	1	2	www.icecd.org www.thecommonwealth.org
SAR and EAP	India	Prime Minister's Rozgar Yojana (A Scheme for Educated Unemployed Youth)	1	2	Mitra, Amit. 2004. InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability. Informal Economy, Training and Skill Formation for Decent Work in the Informal Sector: Case Studies from South India. Skills Working Papers. ILO, Geneva. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/infeco/download/mitra.pdf Visaria, Pravin. 1998. Unemployment among youth in India: Level, nature and policy implications. ILO. Employment and Training Papers No. 36. Institute of Economic Growth University of Delhi. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/download/etp36.pdf
SSA	South Africa and other	Youth Entrepreneurship	0	99	United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), Productive work for youth: Youth Entrepreneurship Development Programme (YEDP). Available online at:

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
	countries	Development Programme (YEDP)			http://exchange.unido.org/pdf/cso/CSOprojectsheets.pdf Further information: Small and Medium Enterprises Branch (PTC/SME) Tel: +43-1-26026-4772 Fax: +43-1-21346-4772 E-mail: S.Hisakawa@unido.org
SSA	Kenya	BAOBAB Project - Teaching Kenyan Youth Skills for Independence	1	2	http://www.projectbaobab.org
SSA	Senegal	Youth enterprise and capacity building	0	99	YMCA of Senegal, B P 4152/rue 12 X Bourguiba, Dakar, Senegal, E-mail: ymcasn@yahoo.fr , Telephone: 00-221-824-1385, Fax: 00-221-824-2444
SSA	Uganda	Bugaya Youth Dairy Farm Project	1	2	http://www.yesweb.org/gkr/project_factsheet.html?pid=721 http://www.un.org/events/youth98/backinfo/yfund.htm
SSA	Uganda	Youth Entrepreneurs Scheme (YES)	1	2	Okech, Anthony. 2005. "Youth Employment in Uganda - A Study of Existing Policies Legislation and Programmes", draft, July 2005.
SSA	Zambia	SKI: Micro-Enterprise and Credit Support for Street-Involved Youth	0	99	ILO web site
SSA	Zimbabwe	Technical skills Programme	0	99	http://www.idex.org/article.php?id=54

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
3. Skills training for young people					
3a. vocational training including apprenticeship systems					
ECA	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Emergency Demobilization and Reintegration Project (EDRP)	2	2	Benus J., J. Rude, and S. Patrabansh. 2001. Bosnia & Herzegovina: Impact of the Emergency Demobilization and Reintegration Project", April 2001, Prepared for: U.S. Department of Labor Bureau of International Affairs Office of Foreign Relations.
ECA	Bosnia and Herzegovina	Re-Connect	0	99	Swiss Agency for Development Cooperation web site www.sdc-seco.ba
ECA	Bulgaria	Computer Training for Young People Programme	1	2	Walther, Andreas and Axel Pohl. 2005. Thematic Study on Policy Measures concerning Disadvantaged Youth. Study commissioned by the European Commission, DG Employment and Social Affairs in the framework of the Community Action Programme to Combat Social Exclusion 2002 – 2006. Final Report. Tübingen, October 2005. Available online at: http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/social_inclusion/docs/youth_study_en.pdf
ECA	Bulgaria	Incentives for Employers to Provide Training to Unemployed Young People	1	2	Walther, Andreas and Axel Pohl. 2005. Thematic Study on Policy Measures concerning Disadvantaged Youth. Study commissioned by the European Commission, DG Employment and Social Affairs in the framework of the Community Action Programme to Combat Social Exclusion 2002 – 2006. Final Report. Tübingen, October 2005. Available online at: http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/social_inclusion/docs/youth_study_en.pdf
ECA	Bulgaria	Project for Professional Training of Young Women in the Region of Gabrovo	0	99	www.unicreditfoundation.org/eng/stampa-uk.asp?id_progetto=38
ECA	Bulgaria	Government's Re/Trainings: with Guaranteed & Non-guaranteed Jobs	3	3	Walsh, K.; M. Kotzeva; E. Dölle; and R. Dorenbos. 2001. NEI Labour and Education. Evaluation of the Net Impact of Active Labour Market Programmes in Bulgaria. Summary. EB5213 DOL/AL. Ministry of Labour and Social Policy, Bulgaria, 2001. Kolev, Alexandre. 2003. Joblessness and Precarious Work in Bulgaria: Addressing the Multiple Aspects of Vulnerability in the Labour Market. February 2003.
ECA	Czech Republic	Government ALMs: Re/Training Program	3	0	Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O'Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915, Washington: The World Bank.
ECA	Hungary	Government ALPs: Re/Training Program	3	2	Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O'Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915, Washington: The World Bank.
ECA	Kosovo	Job Oriented Modular Training (JOMT)	1	2	http://www.swisscooperation-kosovo.ch/index.php?navID=22434&langID=1

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
ECA	Poland	ALPs: Government Re/Training Program	3	1	Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O'Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915, Washington: The World Bank.
ECA	Romania	Government (Public Employment Offices) Re-training Programs in Romania	2	2	Benus, J; R. Brinza; V. Cuica; I. Denisova; and M. Kartseva. 2004. Re-Training Programs in Russia and Romania: Impact Evaluation Study. Available online at: http://www.cefir.ru/index.php?l=eng&id=34&yf=2004
ECA	Turkey	Government Re/Training Program	3	0	Fretwell, D.H., J. Benus, and C.J. O'Leary. 1999. Evaluating the Impact of Active Labor Market Programs: Results of Cross Country Studies in Europe and Asia. Social Protection Discussion paper No. 9915, Washington: The World Bank.
ECA	Turkey	Vocational Training Programmes (MEKSA Foundation)	1	2	http://www.vetnet.ch/fs/fs1.asp?kt=4&skt=9&sID=23&iLId=2
LAC	Argentina	ENTRA 21 and ADEC Partnership (Argentina)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Agencia para el Desarrollo Economico de la Ciudad de Cordoba (ADEC)
LAC	Argentina	ENTRA 21 and Fundacion SES Partnership (Argentina)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion SES http://www.fundses.org.ar or trabajo@fundses.org.ar
LAC	Argentina	Programa Oportunidad (Opportunity Program)	0	99	Municipalidad de Rosario. Secretaría de la Producción, Promoción del Empleo y Comercio Exterior. Programa oportunidad. Educación, capacitación y empleo para jóvenes. Evaluacion General Programa Oportunidad. Information available online at: http://www.logos-net.net/ilo/195_base/es/init/ar
LAC	Belize	ENTRA 21 and University of Belize Partnership (Belize)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org
LAC	Bolivia	ENTRA 21 and Quipus Partnership (Bolivia)	1	2	Aguilar Ch., Rodrigo. 2005. "Informe de Evaluación Externa del Proyecto ENTRA 21 en Bolivia - Ejecutado por la FUNDACIÓN CULTURAL QUIPUS". August 2005. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Quipus Cultural Foundation, Nur University and Care-Bolivia. http://www.quipusbolivia.org . Contact: Peter McFarren/Cassilla 1696. La Paz, Bolivia. Tel: 591-22-44-311. Fax: 591-22-442-848. mcfarren@entelnet.bo
LAC	Brazil	ENTRA 21 and AHUB Partnership (Brazil) - Project Trampoline	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006.

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
LAC	Brazil	ENTRA 21 and BLUSOFT Partnership (Brazil)	0	99	http://www.iyfnet.org IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006.
LAC	Brazil	ENTRA 21 and CEPRO Partnership (Brazil)	1	2	http://www.iyfnet.org Blumenau Polo Tecnologico de Informatica http://www.blusoftbrasil.com.br IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. IYF. 2005. Apoena Social and Fundacao de Rotarios de Sao Paulo. 2005. Projeto Entra 21. Relatorio final de avaliacao externa. Agosto de 2005. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacao Rotarios de Sao Paulo and Centro de Ensino Profissionalizante Rotary.
LAC	Brazil	ENTRA 21 and IAA Partnership (Brazil)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org IAA http://www.institutoalianca.org.br
LAC	Brazil	ENTRA 21 and Instituto de Hospitalidade Partnership (Brazil)	1	2	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Specto, 2005. Relatorio de Avaliacao Externa do Projeto Turismo e Responsabilidade Social. Outubro 2005. IYF. 2006. Colaborando con el sector privado: El Caso del Programa del Turismo y Responsabilidad Social del Instituto de Hospitalidade de Salvador, Bahia, Brasil. Learning Series #3. Instituto de Hospitalidade de Salvador, Bahia, Brasil.
LAC	Brazil	PLANFOR - National Plan of Professional Education	3	3	de Moura Castro, Claudio and Aimee Verdisco. 1998. Training Unemployed Youth in Latin America: Same Old Sad Story? Inter-American Development Bank. Washington, DC ECLAC. 2003. "Poverty and Markets in Brazil: an appraisal of public policy initiatives". Brasilia: ECLAC Office in Brazil/DFID, 2003. Paes de Barros, R., Corseuil, C.H. and Gonzaga, G. 1999. "Labor market regulations and the demand for labor in Brazil", Texto para Discussão 656, IPEA, Rio de Janeiro. Paes de Barros, R., Corseuil, C.H. and Foguel, M. 2000. "Os incentivos adversos e a focalização dos programas de proteção ao trabalhador no Brasil", Planejamento e Políticas Públicas, 22. Fausto, A. and Alves-Mazzotti, A.J. 2002. "El servicio civil voluntario en el Brasil: educación básica, profesional y ciudadana", in Jacinto, C. et al., Nuevas Alianzas y Estrategias en la Formación para el Trabajo de Jóvenes Desfavorecidos, Paris: IPE-UNESCO. Rios-Neto, Eduardo and C. Oliveira 1998. Uma Metodologia de Avaliação do Plano Estadual de Qualificação Profissional (PEQ): O Caso de Minas Gerais em 1996. Belo Horizonte.

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
LAC	Chile	ENTRA 21 and Asociacion Chilena Pro Naciones Unidas Partnership (Chile)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Asociacion Chilena Pro Naciones Unidas (ACHNU) http://www.achnu.cl/
LAC	Chile	ENTRA 21 and Fundacion Chile Partnership (Chile)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion Chile http://www.fundacionchile.cl
LAC	Chile	Apprentices Hiring Program	1	2	Programa Contratacion de Aprendices: Ministerio de Trabajo y Protección Social, Servicio Nacional de Capacitación y Empleo (SENSE) Navarro, Patricio, E. Martinez and M. Torres. 2002. Evaluación del Programa de Contratación de Aprendices. Informe Final. Ministerio de Hacienda – División de Presupuesto – Programa de evaluación de proyectos gubernamentales. Santiago de Chile.
LAC	Colombia	ENTRA 21 and Comfacaucá Partnership (Colombia)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Comfacaucá www.comfacaucá.com
LAC	Colombia	ENTRA 21 and Comfenalco Partnership (Colombia)	1	2	COMFENALCO. 2005. Calculo de Horas y Costos de Capacitación Entra 21. 6 febrero de 2006 COMFENALCO. 2005. Estudio de Seguimiento Proyecto Entra 21 en Medellín, Colombia - JOVEN COMPETITIVO. Diciembre 2005 IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Comfenalco Antioquia - Proyecto Joven Competitivo. Dirección: Unidad de Servicios Educativos y Culturales COMFENALCO Sede Colombia. http://www.comfenalcoantioquia.com.co
LAC	Colombia	ENTRA 21 and Fundacion Empresarios por la Educacion Partnership (Colombia)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion Empresarios por la Educacion http://www.fundacionexe.org.co/wps/portal/
LAC	Colombia	ENTRA 21 and Industrial Partnership (Colombia)	1	2	Balseiro, Elvira et al. 2006. Evaluación externa de la efectividad de las estrategias de intervención y las buenas practicas del programa ENTRA 21 en la ciudad de Cartagena (Colombia). Fundación para la

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
					Investigación y el Desarrollo del Caribe Colombiano, Fundación Internacional para la Juventud (IYF) and Fondo Multilateral de Inversiones. Marzo de 2006. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion Indufrial http://www.usbctg.edu.co/noticias/noti200512.htm
LAC	Colombia	ENTRA 21 and Fundacion Luker Partnership (Colombia)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion Luker http://fundacionluker.org.co
LAC	Dominican Republic	ENTRA 21 and Fundacion Sur Futuro, Inc. Partnership (Dominican Republic)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion Sur Futuro http://www.surfuturo.org/
LAC	Dominican Republic	ENTRA 21 and ISA Partnership (Dominican Republic)	1	2	Oscar Amargos. 2005. Evaluacion Externa Proyecto de Formacion en tecnologías basicas de la información. Programa Entra 21 - ISA. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org ISA Proyecto de Formación en Tecnologías Básicas de La Información - Entra 21 http://www.isa.edu.do/entra21.html and proyecto.isa@codetel.net.do
LAC	Ecuador	ENTRA 21 and Esquel Partnership (Ecuador)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion Esquel Ecuador http://www.esquel.org.ec
LAC	El Salvador	ENTRA 21 and AGAPE Partnership (El Salvador)	1	2	Unimer, El Salvador. 2005. Investigación de mercado, Proyecto Entra 21. Denominada inserción laboral y empleabilidad de los jóvenes del Proyecto Entra 21. El Salvador, Marzo 2005. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Asociacion Agape de El Salvador
LAC	Guatemala	ENTRA 21 and PoA/CADI Partnership (Guatemala)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
					Partners of the Americas Programa CADI 21
LAC	Honduras	ENTRA 21 and ACJ Partnership (Honduras)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Asociacion Cristiana de Jovenes
LAC	Honduras	ENTRA 21 and CADERH Partnership (Honduras)	1	2	Venegas M., Melvin E. 2005. Proyecto Entra 21 en Honduras. Informe de Evaluacion Externa. Agosto 4 de 2005. Tegucigalpa. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org CADERH http://www.caderh.hn/entra21/
LAC	Mexico	ENTRA 21 and CIPEC Partnership (Mexico)	1	2	Estrategos Leon. 2006. "Evaluación Externa Entra 21 del CIPEC". Reporte Final. León, Guanajuato, México. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org CIPEC http://pagina.de/cipec#
LAC	Mexico	ENTRA 21 and SEPICJ Partnership (Mexico)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Servicio de Promocion Integral Comunitario Juvenil (SEPICJ)
LAC	Nicaragua	ENTRA 21 and Don Bosco Partnership (Nicaragua)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Congregacion Salesiana de Nicaragua / Centro Juvenil Don Bosco http://www.donbosco.edu.ni/
LAC	Panama	ENTRA 21 and COSPAE Partnership (Panama)	1	2	Acevedo Riquelme, Dacil. 2005. Informe Final de Evaluación Externa Entra 21 - COSPAE. República de Panamá. 6 de abril de 2005. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org COSPAE http://www.cospae.org/nosotros.htm
LAC	Paraguay	ENTRA 21 and CIRD Partnership (Paraguay)	1	2	Elías, Rodolfo et al. 2005. Fundacion Comunitaria CIRD - Proyecto Insercion Laboral de Jovenes Capacitados en Tecnologias de la Informacion. Evaluacion Externa. Paraguay. Julio, 2005 IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
LAC	Peru	ENTRA 21 and Alternativa Partnership (Peru)	1	2	CIRD, Instituto de Ciencias de la computacion and Universidad Privada Columbia, http://www.cird.org.py/cird/proyectos.php , http://www.cird.org.py/empleojoven/ Briceño Bustillos, Luis. 2005. Informe final de evaluación externa. Proyecto: "Capacitación en tecnologotas de las información para el empleo juvenil". Alternativa and Internacional Youth Foundation. Lima, Peru. April 2005. IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org NGO Alternativa
LAC	Peru	ENTRA 21 and ITDG Partnership (Peru)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Intermediate Technology Development Group (ITDG)
LAC	Uruguay	ENTRA 21 and Institucion Kolping Partnership (Uruguay)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Institucion Kolping NGO http://www.kolping.org.uy/
LAC	Venezuela, RB	ENTRA 21 and Oportunitas Partnership (Venezuela)	0	99	IYF. 2006. Entra 21 Cameos - Projects approved as of February 2006. http://www.iyfnet.org Fundacion para la infancia y la Juventud - Oportunitas E-mail: oportunitas@cantv.net , web: http://www.oportunitas.org
LAC	Venezuela, RB	Plan Empleo Joven	0	99	Fuenmayor, Nila del Carmen and Teresa Gamboa Cáceres. 2002. "¿Empleo juvenil o reproducción de la pobreza en Venezuela?" CAYAPA Revista Venezolana de Economía Social - Año 2 - N° 3 - Junio 2002.
MENA	Egypt, Arab Rep.	Introduction of a Co-operative (Dual) System in Technical Education	1	0	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva. Kanyenze, Godfrey; Guy C.Z. Mhone and Theo Sparreboom. 2000. Strategies to Combat Youth Unemployment and Marginalisation in Anglophone Africa, ILO/SAMAT Discussion Paper No. 14, Harare, Zimbabwe, 2000. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/afpro/mdtharare/download/discussionpapers/paps14.doc van Eekelen, W., Loretta de Luca and Nagwa Ismail. 2001. Youth Employment in Egypt, ILO Skills Working Paper No.2, Geneva, ILO.
MENA	Lebanon	The Global NetCorps (GNC)	0	99	YMCA/ Lebanon, Delta Center, 3rd Floor, Horsh Tabet - Sin El-Fi, P.O.Box: 11-5520, Beirut - Lebanon, Tel./Fax: 01-490640, 01-490685, 01-491740, E-mail: ymca@ymca-leb.org.lb
OECD	Australia	Collaborating with the corporate sector-work	1	3	www.workventures.com.au

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		ventures and Microsoft			
OECD	Australia	Creating high technology jobs for young people in regional Australia (Adacel Techn. In Wodonga, AU)	0	99	http://www.dsf.org.au/papers/88.htm Mr. Paul Foley Software Engineering Centre, 19 Stanley Street, Wodonga, Vic. 3689; Ph: +61 2 6024 2699; Fax: +61 2 6024 3288; Email: paul.foley@adacel.com ; www.adacel.com.au
OECD	Austria	Training Measures - Training for the improvement of employability/trainability of disadvantaged youth (Berufsvorbereitung)	0	99	Lassnigg, Lorenz. 1998. Youth Labour Market Policy in Austria 1980-1997. Institute for Advanced Studies, Austria, April 1998. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/40/38/1925668.pdf
OECD	Belgium	Stage et insertion professionnelle des jeunes (First Job Agreement Program - FJA)	1	2	Nicaise, I. 2001. The "Rosetta Plan" - A Springboard for Young People into Employment, Discussion Paper, Hoger Instituut voor de Arbeid, Leuven, Belgium National Initiatives Concerning Human Resources Development of the Youth - Belgium, International Labour Organisations, http://www.logos-net.net/ilo/195_base/en/topic_n/t_48_bel.htm#Evaluation and http://www.egss.ulg.ac.be/economie/dossiers/Fonder.pdf
OECD	Canada	Ontario Youth Apprenticeship Program (OYAP)	0	99	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Internships (training)	0	99	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Finland	Active labor market policy	2	2	Pehkonen, J. 1997. Displacement Effects of Active Labour Market Policy: The Youth Labour Market in Finland, <i>Empirica</i> 24: 195-208, <i>Empirica</i> 24: 195-208, Netherlands
OECD	France	Promotion of training programs in the private sector	2	0	Bonnal, L., Fougere, D., and Serandon, A. 1997. Evaluating the impact of French employment policies on individual labor market histories. <i>Review of Economic Studies</i> 64, 683-713. Brodaty, T., Crepon, B., Fougere, D. 1999. Using matching estimators to evaluate alternative youth employment programmes: Evidence from France, 1986-1988 and 1995-1998. Mimeo.
OECD	Germany	University of Cooperative Education (UCE) - BA	1	2	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva.
OECD	Italy	Apprenticeship contract	0	99	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, <i>Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica</i> , Università di Salerno, Italy.

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
OECD	Italy	Social program for young unemployed in the South of Italy	0	99	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.
OECD	Italy	Work access and training program for young people	0	99	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.
OECD	Italy	Vocational training	0	99	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.
OECD	Japan	Vocational Education (Youth Independence and Challenge Plan)	0	99	Government of Japan. 2004. Government Policy on Employment and Development of Young Workers in Japan. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Japan.
OECD	Netherlands	Employment Plan between Philips and the Dutch Unions	1	2	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva.
OECD	Norway	Trainee Places and Labour Market Training Courses (LMT)	2	1	OECD. 1997. Norway, Thematich Review of the Transition from Initial Education to Working Life, Background Report
OECD	United Kingdom	Youth Training Scheme (YTS)	1	99	Bradley, S. 1995. The Youth Training Scheme: a critical review of the evaluation literature, International Journal of Manpower, Vol. 16 No. 4, 1995, pp. 30-56. MCB University Press. Main, B.G.M. & Shelly, M.A. 1989. The Effectiveness of the Youth Training Scheme as a Manpower Policy, Economica, New Series, Vol. 57, No. 228 (Nov., 1990), pp. 495-514
OECD	Sweden	Labor Market Training	2	0	Larsson, L. 2000. Evaluation of Swedish youth labour market programmes. Uppsala University & Office of Labour Market Policy Evaluation, Sweden.
OECD	United States	Youth Entrepreneurship Programs funded by the DC Children and Youth Investment Trust Corporation	0	99	Bronte-Tinkew, Jacinta, K.A. Moore, K. Webber, and Z. Redd. 2002. Outcomes for Participants in Youth Entrepreneurship Programs - Summary Report of a Pilot Study (draft). Report to the DC Children and Youth Investment Trust Corporation. Child Trends, Inc. Bronte-Tinkew, Jacinta and Zakia Redd. 2001. Logic Models and Outcomes for Youth Entrepreneurship Programs. Child Trends - Report to the DC Children and Youth Investment Trust Corporation. September 17, 2001. www.cyitc.org/cyitc/about
OECD	United States	Manpower Development and Training Act	2	0	Kiefer, Nicholas M. 1979. Population Heterogeneity and Inference from Panel Data on the Effects of Vocational Education. The Journal of Political Economy, Vol. 87, No. 5, Part 2: Education and Income Distribution. (Oct. 1979) Kiefer, Nicholas M. 1978. Federally Subsidized Occupational Training and the Employment and Earnings of male trainees. Journal of Econometrics 8 (1978).
OECD	United States	Migrant and Seasonal Farmworker Youth	0	99	DOLETA

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		Program			
OECD	United States	National Supported Work Demonstration	3	0	Hollister, Robinson G., Peter Kemper, and Rebecca Maynard. 1984. The National Supported Work Demonstration. Madison, Wis.: University of Wisconsin. Long, David A. 1987. Analyzing Social Program Production: an assessment of Supported Work for Youths. The Journal of Human Resources, Vol. 22 No. 4 (Autumn, 1987).
OECD		National Supported Work Demonstration	2	2	LaLonde, Robert J. 1986. Evaluating the econometric evaluations of training programs with experimental data. The American Economic Review, Vol. 76, No. 4.
OECD		National Supported Work Demonstration	2	0	Couch, Kenneth A. 1992. New evidence on the Long-Term Effects of Employment Training Programs. Journal of Labor Economics, Vol. 10, No. 4.
OECD	United States	New Youth Initiatives in Apprenticeship	2	0	Williams, G.D., E.P. Davin, B. Barrett, and J.M. Richards, Jr. 1981. Report on Impacts: Study of New Youth Initiatives in Apprenticeship. CSR, Inc., Washington DC. Betsey, Charles L., R.G. Hollister Jr, and M.R. Papageorgiou. 1985. Youth Employment and Training Programs: The YEDPA Years (1985). Committee on Youth Employment Programs, Commission on Behavioral and Social Sciences and Education and National Research Council. National Academy Press, Washington DC.
OECD	United States	BIA-OJT (Bureau of Indian Affairs - On-the-Job Training)	1	2	Scott, Loren C. 1970. The Economic Effectiveness of On-the-Job Training: The experience of the Bureau of Indian Affairs in Oklahoma. Industrial and Labor Relations Review, Vol. 23, No. 2. Jan 1970, 220 – 236. Barsby, Steve L. 1971. The Economic Effectiveness of On-the-Job Training: The experience of the Bureau of Indian Affairs in Oklahoma: Comment. Industrial and Labor Relations Review, Vol. 24, No. 2 (Jan., 1971). Scott, Loren C. 1971. [The Economic Effectiveness of On-the-Job Training: The experience of the Bureau of Indian Affairs in Oklahoma]: Reply. Industrial and Labor Relations Review, Vol. 24, No. 2.
OECD	United States	Rewarding Youth Achievement Summer Program - San Diego, CA	0	99	University of California, San Diego. Equal Opportunity/ Staff Affirmative Action.
OECD	United States	Rewarding Youth Achievement Summer Program	0	99	DOLETA and University of California, San Diego. Equal Opportunity/ Staff Affirmative Action.
OECD	United States	School-to-Work (STW)/Youth Apprenticeship Demonstration	1	2	DOLETA. 1997. Experiences and Lessons of the School-to-Work/Youth Apprenticeship Demonstration Research and Evaluation Report Series 97-E. U.S. Department of Labor - Employment and Training Administration - Office of Policy and Research.
OECD	United States	Summer Youth Employment and Training Program (SYETP) in New Mexico	0	99	http://www.ydinm.org/main.asp
OECD	United States	Summer Youth Employment and	2	2	Westat. 1993. The 1993 Summer Youth Employment Program: Study of the JTPA Title IIB Program During the Summer of 1993, Final Report. Westat, Inc. (Rockville, MD)

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		Training Program (SYETP)			Crane, Jon and David Ellwood. 1984. The Summer Youth Employment Program: Private Job Supplement or Substitute. Harvard University. March, 1984. Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outcomes. Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998.
OECD	United States	Youth Apprenticeship in Wisconsin	0	99	Scribner, Jay Paredes and David Wakelyn. 1997. Youth Apprenticeship Experiences in Wisconsin: A Stakeholder-Based Evaluation.
OECD	United States	Youth Activities	0	99	DOLETA
SAR and EAP	China	Labour Preparation Programme	0	99	Ministry of Labour and Social Security Department of Training and Employment People's Republic of China. (n/d). Skills training in the informal sector in China. Research Group of the Department of Training and Employment. In Focus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, ILO. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/infeco/download/china.pdf
SAR and EAP	Philippines	Working Youth Centre - (WYC)	1	2	http://www.yesweb.org/gkr/project_factsheet.html?pid=107
SAR and EAP	Samoa	Opportunity for Vulnerable Poor Youth (Grant: SAM35446-01)	0	99	http://www.unescap.org/esid/hds/youth/youth_philippines.pdf www.adb.org
SAR and EAP	Vietnam	Training for Disadvantaged Youth	1	2	http://www.sdc.org.vn/ressources/resource_en_24177.pdf?userhash=29ee2f3e77daa8645ffe2d1b568bade4
SAR and EAP	India	Baatchit Project	1	2	Brewer, Laura. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work. ILO, IFP/SKILLS Working Paper No. 19
SAR and EAP	India	TRYSEM	1	0	Visaria, Pravin. 1998. Unemployment among youth in India: Level, nature and policy implications. ILO. Employment and Training Papers No. 36. Institute of Economic Growth University of Delhi. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/download/etp36.pdf
SAR and EAP	Maldives	Employment Skills Project	0	99	http://www.adb.org/Documents/Profiles/LOAN/33217013.ASP http://adb.org/media/Articles/2003/3814_Maldives_Jobs_and_Skills_Training/
SAR and EAP	Nepal	Franchising SKILL (F-Skill)	1	2	http://www.sdc.org.np/index.php?navID=22178&langID=1&userhash=bf9a881594c59fb576d04b7099b0fe04
SSA	Burundi	Promote rural youth employment, part of the	1	0	Burundi - Agricultural Services Sector Project, Volume 1, Staff Appraisal Report, World Bank, 1989 and Burundi - Agricultural Services Sector Project, Volume 1, Implementation Completion Report, World Bank,

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		Agricultural Services Sector Project			1997
SSA	Central African Republic	Agricultural Services Development Project	0	99	Central African Republic - Agricultural Services Development Project, Volume 1, Staff Appraisal Report, World Bank, 1992 and Central African Republic - Agricultural Services Development Project, Implementation Completion Report, World Bank, 1999
SSA	Cote d'Ivoire	Appui à l'introduction de la Formation Professionnelle par Alternance (AIFPA)	0	99	Brewer, Laura. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work. ILO, IFP/SKILLS Working Paper No. 19
SSA	Namibia	HRD for Community Based Training of persons with disabilities	1	2	Brewer, Laura. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work. ILO, IFP/SKILLS Working Paper No. 19
SSA	Namibia	Katutura Youth Enterprise Centre (KAYEC) Scheme/Program	1	2	http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/skills/youth/publ/skillwp1.htm http://www.technoserve.org/TNS%20Kenya%202004%20YE%20Report.pdf http://www.usaid.org/na/project.asp?proid=1#25
SSA	Zimbabwe	The Informal Sector Training and Resource Network (INSTARN) Programme	1	2	Kanyenze, Godfrey; Guy C.Z. Mhone and Theo Sparreboom. 2000. Strategies to Combat Youth Unemployment and Marginalisation in Anglophone Africa, ILO/SAMAT Discussion Paper No. 14, Harare, Zimbabwe, 2000. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/afpro/mdtharare/download/discussionpapers/pp14.doc
3c. 2nd chance & equivalency programs					
ECA	Albania	ISDO - Increase of Skills Development of Opportunities (phases I & II)	1	2	http://www.vetnet.ch/fs/fs1.asp?kt=4&skt=9&sID=11&iLId=2
ECA		ISDO - Increase of Skills Development of Opportunities (phase III)	0	99	Report External Review ISDO, Feb.2004 (http://www.vetnet.ch/fs/fs1.asp?kt=4&skt=9&sID=11&iLId=3&dId=114)
ECA	Estonia	RESTART (Comprehensive Measure for Integrating the Youth with Criminal Records into the Labour Market)	0	99	http://www.tta.ee/esf/index.php?lk=114
LAC	Brazil	ProJovem (National Youth Inclusion)	0	99	http://www.brasil.gov.br/governo_federal/Plan_prog_proj/edittrab/projovem/programa_view/

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		Program)			
OECD	Denmark	Youth Unemployment Programme (YUP)	2	2	Jensen p., et al. 1999. The Effects of Benefits, Incentives, and Sanctions on Youth Unemployment, Working paper, Centre for Labour Market and Social Research, Denmark.
OECD	United States	Jobstart Demonstration - CET Project in San Jose	2	2	Filges, T, & Larsen, B. 2002. The Impact of Youth Unemployment Policy, Working paper 2:2002, The Danish Institute of Social Research, Denmark Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outomes. Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998.
OECD	United States	Jobstart Demonstration	3	0	Cave, George, Bos, H., Doolittle, F., & Toussaint, C. 1993. Jobstart: Final report on a program for school dropouts. New York: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation. Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outomes. Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998.
SAR and EAP	Nepal	Training for Employment Project	1	2	http://www.sdc.org.np/index.php?navID=22180&langID=1&userhash=bf9a881594c59fb576d04b7099b0fe04 http://www.alliance.com.np/default.htm
3d. other					
ECA	Bulgaria	Junior Achievement Bulgaria	1	2	http://www.iyfnet.org/uploads/WW%20Balkan%20Youth.pdf
ECA	Turkey	Empowerment of Youth for Improved e-Governance in Turkey (00036948)	0	99	UNDP - Project Document 00036948 - Empowerment of Youth for Improved e-Governance in Turkey
LAC	Colombia	Servicio Nacional de Aprendizaje (SENA)	2	0	Gaviria Alejandro and Jairo Nuñez. 2003. Evaluating the impact of SENA on earnings and employment. Departamento Nacional de Planeación. January 2003
OECD	United States	San Diego Youth @ Work program	0	99	www.Sandiegotwork.com
OECD	United States	Youth Training Grants	0	99	DOLETA

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
4. Making training systems work better for young people					
4a. information					
OECD	Japan	Placement Support for Graduates Wakamono Jilitsu Chōsen Pulan (Youth Independence and Challenge Plan)	0	99	Government of Japan. 2004. Government Policy on Employment and Development of Young Workers in Japan. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Japan.
SSA	Guinea	Modernisation of the Apprenticeship system in Guinea	0	99	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva.
SSA	Mali	Vocational Education and Training Consolidation Project	0	99	Mali - Vocational Education and Training Consolidation Project, Volume 1, Staff Appraisal Report, World Bank, 1996 and Mali - Vocational Education and Training Consolidation Project, Implementation Completion Report, World Bank, 2003
4b. credit (to individuals or enterprises)					
OECD	Australia	Information Technology Scholarships for Young Unemployed (TAFE)	1	2	http://www.dsf.org.au/papers/88.htm David Dercho, Economic Development Manager City of Salisbury, PO Box 8, Salisbury, SA 5108 AUSTRALIA. Phone: (08) 8406-8222; Email: ddercho@salisbury.sa.gov.au Website: www.salisbury.sa.gov.au
4c. financial incentives (subsidies, vouchers)					
OECD	Austria	Training Measures - Subsidies for apprenticeship	0	99	Lassnigg, Lorenz. 1998. Youth Labour Market Policy in Austria 1980-1997. Institute for Advanced Studies, Austria, April 1998. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/40/38/1925668.pdf
OECD	United States	Ohio's Learning, Earning and Parenting (LEAP)	2	0	Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outcomes. Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998. Bloom, D., Fellerath, V., Long, D., & Wood, R.G. 1993. LEAP: Interim findings on a welfare initiative to improve school attendance among teenage parents. New York, NY: Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation
SAR and EAP	Sri Lanka	Export Processing Villages Project	0	99	www.yensl.org

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
SSA	Kenya	Jua Kali - Voucher Programme/Training vouchers for "workers under the sun"	3	2	http://www.uneca.org/eca_programmes/policy_analysis/publications/youth_educ_skills_emp.pdf http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/HDNet/HDDocs.nsf/0/8B3BE05276D13BEA85256DF1005BD394?OpenDocument
4d. other					
OECD	Austria	Training Measures - Provision of specific skills in labor market training	0	99	Lassnigg, Lorenz. 1998. Youth Labour Market Policy in Austria 1980-1997. Institute for Advanced Studies, Austria, April 1998. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/40/38/1925668.pdf
OECD	United States	Teenage Parent Demonstration	2	0	Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outcomes. Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998. http://aspe.hhs.gov/hsp/isp/tpd/
SSA	Rwanda	Improving Technical Education in Rwanda	0	99	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva. West African Network on Economic education in Rwanda: http://www.gtz.de/wbfwestafrika/

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
6. Improving labor market regulations to the benefit of young people					
OECD	Austria	Reforming Apprenticeship	0	99	Lassnigg, Lorenz. 1998. Youth Labour Market Policy in Austria 1980-1997. Institute for Advanced Studies, Austria, April 1998. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/40/38/1925668.pdf
SAR and EAP	Vietnam	Enactment of 2000 Enterprise Law	1	2	Pending

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
8. Comprehensive, multiple-service approach					
ECA	Bulgaria	Clearing the path to employment for youths	0	99	Ministry of Labour and Social Policy of Republic of Bulgaria. Project BG 0202.01 – Clearing the path to employment for youths, Phare 2002/Youths/GRANTS. Information available online at: http://www.mlsp.government.bg/en/projects/bg0202-01/
ECA	Hungary	Supporting Employment of Young Graduates	1	2	Ministry of Employment and Labour of Hungary. 2005. Youth on the labour market. Employment Week 2005. Budapest, April 2005. Available online at: www.szmm.gov.hu/download.php?ctag=download&docID=11429 Implementing agency: Labour Centre of Szabolcs-Szatmár-Bereg County. http://www.szstbmunkaugy.hu
ECA	Kyrgyz Republic	Agriculture and Rural Vocational Education Project (AVEP)	1	2	http://www.helvetas.ch/global/pdf/projects/asien/04_09_berufsbildung_e.pdf
ECA	Poland	Youth Support Centre for Professional Training and Micro-credit in the Region of Pomerania	0	99	www.unicreditfoundation.org/eng/stampa-uk.asp?id_progetto=38
ECA	Poland	Tripartite Contracts and the "First Work" Programme	1	2	Walther, Andreas and Axel Pohl. 2005. Thematic Study on Policy Measures concerning Disadvantaged Youth. Study commissioned by the European Commission, DG Employment and Social Affairs in the framework of the Community Action Programme to Combat Social Exclusion 2002 – 2006. Final Report. Tübingen, October 2005. Available online at: http://ec.europa.eu/employment_social/social_inclusion/docs/youth_study_en.pdf
ECA	Slovak Republic	Training and Micro-credit Program	0	99	www.unicreditfoundation.org/eng/stampa-uk.asp?id_progetto=38
LAC	Argentina	Programa Capacitar (Formación laboral para jóvenes)	0	99	Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Formación de Recursos Humanos. Programa de apoyo a la productividad y empleabilidad de jóvenes "CAPACITAR". http://www.ispm.org.ar/documentos/parte_6.htm
LAC	Argentina	Programa Nacional de Inclusión Juvenil (INCLUIR)	0	99	http://www.juventud.gov.ar/incluir/index.htm ; Phone number: (011) 4342.6122 - 4334.1468 Fax: (011) 4342.6195 ; E-Mail: juventud@desarrollosocial.gov.ar
LAC	Argentina	Proyecto Joven	3	1	Programa Proyecto Joven: Secretaria de Empleo y Capacitación Laboral, Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social. Devia, Sergio. 2003. “¿Éxito o fracaso de las políticas públicas de capacitación laboral a jóvenes? - Evaluación del programa testigo: "Proyecto Joven" de Argentina (1993-2000)”. Trabajo elaborado para su presentación como Tesis para la obtención de título de posgrado de Magister de la Universidad de Buenos Aires en Administración Pública. Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo. 1998. “Informe de Terminación de Proyecto (ITP): Programa de Apoyo a la Reconversión Productiva, Proyecto Nro. AR-0062”. Programa de Apoyo a la Reconversión Productiva. 1998. “Evaluación de impacto

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
					<p>Proyecto Joven, beneficiarios del 5° Llamado a Licitación, Informe de Avance”, 7-ago-1998.</p> <p>Programa de Apoyo a la Reconversión Productiva. 1999. “Informe de Seguimiento y Evaluación al 28/02/1999”.</p> <p>Giordano, Oswaldo, Torres, Alejandra, Colina, Jorge. 2005. “Department for International Development Policies for Addressing Inequalities – Two case studies of Chile Joven and Proyecto Joven (Argentina)” – June 2005</p> <p>Cohen, Ernesto; Rodrigo Martínez and Cecilia Navarrete. 2001. Gestion de programas sociales en América Latina - Análisis de casos Vol. I: Proyecto Joven de Argentina. CEPAL (ECLAC) - División de Desarrollo Social. Políticas Sociales. Serie No. 46.</p> <p>de Moura Castro, Claudio. 1999. Proyecto Joven: New Solutions and Some Surprises. Inter-American Development Bank - July 1999.</p> <p>de Moura Castro, Claudio and A. Verdisco. 1998. Training Unemployed Youth in Latin America: Same old sad story? IADB.</p>
LAC		Proyecto Joven	3	1	Elias, Victor, F. Ruiz-Nunez, R. Cossa, and D. Bravo. 2004. An econometric cost-benefit analysis of Argentina’s Youth Training Program. IADB Research Network Working Paper #R-482.
LAC		Proyecto Joven	3	1	Aedo, Cristian and Sergio Nunez. 2001. The impact of training policies in Latin America and the Caribbean: The Case of Programa Joven”. ILADES and Georgetown University. May 2001.
LAC	Brazil	Programa Primeiro Emprego - Rio Grande do Sul	2	0	<p>http://www.mte.gov.br/FuturoTrabalhador/default.asp</p> <p>World Bank, PID P086639 and other background papers, such as Bonelli, Regis; José Guilherme Reis and Alinne Veiga (2004). Characteristics and Determinants of Youth Unemployment in Brazil (An analysis to subsidize policy decisions on the FEP — First Employment Program). Research Report (March 30, 2004).</p>
LAC	Brazil	National Program for First Employment (Programa Nacional de Estímulo ao Primeiro Emprego)	0	99	<p>http://www.mte.gov.br/FuturoTrabalhador/default.asp</p> <p>World Bank, PID P086639 and other background papers, such as Bonelli, Regis; José Guilherme Reis and Alinne Veiga (2004). Characteristics and Determinants of Youth Unemployment in Brazil (An analysis to subsidize policy decisions on the FEP — First Employment Program). Research Report (March 30, 2004).</p>
LAC	Chile	Chile Joven	2	2	<p>Programa Chile Joven: http://www.sence.cl/chjoven.htm and http://www.inacap.cl</p> <p>SENCE. 1997. Chile Joven, una experiencia pionera revisada. Boletín CINTEFOR No. 139-140, April – September 1997, based on: Presentación y Análisis de Resultados. Programa de Capacitación Laboral de Jóvenes. Fase I. SENCE - Subsecretaría del Trabajo del Ministerio de Trabajo y Previsión Social de Chile. Abril de 1996. Mimeo.</p> <p>Giordano, Oswaldo, Torres, Alejandra, Colina, Jorge. 2005. “Department for International Development Policies for Addressing Inequalities – Two case studies of</p>

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
					Chile Joven and Proyecto Joven (Argentina)" – June 2005 de Moura Castro, Claudio. 1999. Proyecto Joven: New Solutions and Some Surprises. Inter-American Development Bank - July 1999. de Moura Castro, Claudio and A. Verdisco. 1998. Training Unemployed Youth in Latin America: Same old sad story? IADB. Santiago Consultores Asociados. 1999. "Evaluación Ex-Post Chile Joven Fase II", Mimeo.
LAC		Chile Joven	2	2	
LAC		Chile Joven	2	2	Aedo, Cristian and Marcelo Pizarro. 2004. Rentabilidad económica del programa de capacitación laboral de jóvenes Chile Joven [caedo@inacap.cl]
LAC	Chile	Programa de Formación en Oficios para Jóvenes de Escasos Recursos.	1	2	Jara, Osvaldo. 2001. Estudio de seguimiento y evaluación del Programa de Formación en Oficios para Jóvenes de Escasos Recursos. Informe ejecutivo de estudio. Encargado por SENCE a Geo-Consultores, Marzo 2001. Programa de Formación en Oficios para Jóvenes Dirección Dirección Nacional del SENCE y Regionales, Huérfanos 1273. Phone number 8706164. E - mail webmaster@sence.cl ; Web http://www.sence.cl/estudios/desc_Especial%20de%20jóvenes.htm ; http://www.sence.cl/estudios/index.htm
LAC	Colombia	Jovenes en Accion (Youth in Action)	1	2	Unión Temporal IFS – Econometría S.A. - SEI. 2004. Consultoria para la evaluacion de impacto del subprograma Jovenes en Accion: Analisis de resultados de las primeras convocatorias del Programa Jovenes en Accion. Informe Final. Departamento Nacional de Planeacion, Unión Temporal IFS – Econometría S.A. - SEI. Octubre 15 de 2004. Further information: econometria@econometriaconsultores.com
LAC	Colombia	Proyecto de Servicios Integrados para Jovenes	2	0	Rubiano, Norma. 2003. Evaluacion de impacto del Proyecto Servicios Integrados para Jovenes. Consolidado Nacional. Universidad Externado de Colombia - Centro de Investigaciones sobre Dinamica Social. Junio 2003. Parra, Ernesto. 2002. Evaluacion de impacto del Proyecto Servicios Integrados para Jovenes. Informe linea de base tercera parte. Resultados Bucaramanga. Abril 2002. Parra, Ernesto. 2002. Evaluacion de impacto del Proyecto Servicios Integrados para Jovenes. Informe linea de base tercera parte. Resultados Cucuta. Noviembre 2002.
LAC	Dominican Republic	Programa Juventud y Empleo	3	3	Card, David et al. 2006. Labor Market Impacts of Youth Training in the Dominican Republic: Evidence from a Randomized Program. IADB. Secretaria de Trabajo de Estado http://www.set.gov.do/juventudyempleo/default.htm Amargos, Oscar. 2005. Evaluacion Externa Proyecto de Formacion en tecnologías basicas de la información. Programa Entra 21 - ISA.
LAC	El Salvador	El Salvador: Social and Economic Integration of Youth	1	2	Project homepage: http://www.juventud.org.sv/
LAC	El Salvador	Rapid employment creation in El Salvador (REC)	1	2	GTZ. El Salvador: Anja.Kramer@gtz.de
LAC	Peru	PROJoven	2	2	Burga, Cybele. 2003. Re-evaluando Projoven: Propensity score matching y una

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
					evaluacion parametrica. Final version February 5th, 2003. Peru. Programa de Capacitacion Laboral Juvenil Projoven. Av. Salaverry 655, Jesus Maria Lima, Peru. 51-1-4332512 infoprojoven@mtps.gob.pe or http://www.mtps.gob.pe/projoven.htm
LAC		PROJoven	2	2	Projoven. 1999. "La evaluacion de impacto de Projoven: Primeros resultados". Ministerio de Trabajo y Proteccion Social. Saavedra, Jaime and Juan Chacaltana. 2000. "El Programa de Capacitacion Laboral Juvenil (Projoven)". Boletin Cinteфор, No. 150, setiembre-diciembre de 2000. Office of Evaluation and Oversight of the InterAmerican Development Bank.
LAC		PROJoven	3	3	Nopo, Hugo, M. Robles, and Jaime Saavedra. 2002. Una Medicion del Impacto del Programa de Capacitacion Laboral Juvenil PROJoven. Documento de Trabajo 36, Grade. Peru.
LAC	Uruguay	Opcion Joven (Youth Option)	2	2	Naranjo Silva, Alicia. 2002. "Capacitacion y formacion profesional para jovenes en Uruguay: Los programas Opcion Joven y Projoven a traves de sus experiencias de evaluacion". PNUD and OIT. Bucheli, Marisa and González Rozada, Martín. 1997. Evaluación Final del Programa de Capacitación y Desarrollo Empresarial de los Jóvenes. Sub - programa de Capacitación para la Inserción Laboral. Montevideo, Uruguay. Diciembre. González Rozada, Martín. 1995. Propuesta de Implementación de la Metodología de Evaluación del Programa Opción Joven-Montevideo, Uruguay. Diciembre.
LAC	Uruguay	ProJoven	1	2	Naranjo Silva, Alicia. 2002. "Capacitacion y formacion profesional para jovenes en Uruguay: Los programas Opcion Joven y Projoven a traves de sus experiencias de evaluacion". PNUD and OIT. Projoven. 2000. Un programa de Capacitación e Inserción Laboral para Jóvenes-Uruguay. Marzo. Naranjo Silva, Alicia. 2001. "El impacto de la formación profesional para jóvenes pobres sobre su inserción en el mercado laboral uruguayo: el Programa Projoven". Thesis work for a Master in Public Policy. Universidad ORT-Uruguay. http://www.projoven.gub.uy
LAC		ProJoven	1	2	Lasida, Javier and Javier Pereira. 1999. Jovenes, Formacion y Empleo: ProJoven, encuentro y negociacion entre la capacitacion y el mercado. CINTERFOR
MENA	Jordan	The INJAZ program	0	99	Youth Employment in the ESCWA Region, Paper prepared by the Economic and Social Commission for Western Asia (ESCWA) for the Youth Employment Summit Alexandria, Egypt, September 7- 11, 2002
MENA	Lebanon	The Accelerated Vocational Training Program (AVTP)	0	99	YMCA/ Lebanon, Delta Center, 3rd Floor, Horsh Tabet - Sin El-Fi, P.O.Box: 11-5520, Beirut - Lebanon, Tel./Fax: 01-490640, 01-490685, 01-491740, E-mail: ymca@ymca-leb.org.lb
MENA	West Bank and Gaza	Palestine: Non- formal education	1	2	http://www.tvet-pal.org/ .

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
MENA	Tunisia	Republic of Tunisia Employment Strategy - Active Labor Market Programs (ALMP)	0	99	World Bank. 2004. Republic of Tunisia Employment Strategy, Main report, Volume 1 of 2, Sector Report.
OECD	Australia	Connectus	0	99	www.connectus.com.au
OECD	Australia	Closing the IT-Divide-Infochange and the Green PC, Victoria AU	2	2	http://www.dsf.org.au/papers/88.htm Infoxchange Australia, 375 Johnston Street, Abbotsford VIC 3067, Ph: +61 3 9486 9355, Fax: +61 3 9486 9344; Email: info@infoxchange.net.au
OECD	Australia	Mamo-Wichi-Hetwin Area Management Board (AMB)	0	99	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva.
OECD	Australia	Aboriginal Youth Leadership Program	0	99	Aboriginal Youth Leadership Program, Projects Fact Sheets, http://www.yesweb.org/gkr/project_factsheet.html?pid=646. Further information: Canada World Youth, Western Canada Regional Office, 10816 A, 82nd Avenue.
OECD	Australia	Using local resources to create jobs - Salty Seas	1	2	Beacon.foundation@bigpond.com
OECD	Belgium	Double Impact: Youth Prevention. VDAB (Flemish Service for Employment and Vocational Training) Training and Education	1	2	Double Impact: Youth Prevention. VDAB (Flemish Service for Employment and Vocational Training) Training and Education, Programme information, VDAB: Flemish Service for Employment and Vocational Training, Belgium, Available online at http://eddra.emcdda.eu.int/eddra/plsql/ShowQ
OECD	Canada	Alberta's Youth Employment Services Centres (multi-faceted program)	0	99	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	British Columbia's Workplace Based Training (WBT) programme (demand-side measures program)	1	2	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Cooperative Education Option	2	0	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Employability Improvement Program (EIP)	3	3	Human Resources Development Canada, Evaluation and Data Development Strategic Policy. 1995. Evaluation of the Employability Improvement Program - Final Report.
OECD	Canada	Youth Futures (multi-faceted program)	0	99	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Newfoundland's linkages programme	0	99	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
OECD	Canada	Blade Runners - Work based training for disadvantaged youth	1	2	Social Research and Demonstration Corporation. 2001. "Blade Runners and Picasso Café: A Case Study Evaluation of Two Work-Based Training Programs for Disadvantaged Youth.
OECD	Canada	Saskatchewan's Job Start/Future Skills programme (demand-side measures program)	1	2	Marquardt, R. 1998. Labour market policies and programmes affecting youth in Canada. Paper commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review.
OECD	Canada	Young Canada Works	1	1	Human Resources Development Canada. 1998. A.S. Roy, G. Wong: Direct Job Creation Programs: Evaluation Lessons
OECD	Canada	Youth Service Canada (YSC)	3	0	Human Resources Development Canada. 1999. Summative Evaluation of Youth Service Canada - August 1999 http://www11.hrsdc.gc.ca/en/cs/sp/hrsdcd/edd/brief/1999-000588/seysc.shtml .
OECD	Denmark	Employment and training policies for youth with disabilities	0	99	Russell, C. 1998. Education, employment and training policies and programmes for youth with disabilities in four European countries, Action Programme on Youth Unemployment, Employment and Training Papers 21, International Labour Organization (ILO), Switzerland. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/publ/etp21.htm
OECD	France	Employment-cum-Training Contracts for Unemployed Youths (CFE)	1	0	Soffer, B. & Zymelman, M. 1993: Global Overview of Youth Employment Programs, AFTHR Technical Note No. 8, Human Resources Division, The World Bank, Washington, DC., USA Gaspar, M.L. 1988. "Employment-cum-training contracts in France: the 1975-85 Record" International Labour Review Vol 127 No.4 (1988) pp 445-461
OECD	France	French Youth Employment Programs (1980's-1990's)	2	0	Brodaty, Thomas; Bruno Crépon and Denis Fougère. 2002. "Do long-term unemployed workers benefit from active labor market programs? Evidence from France, 1986-1998".
OECD	Germany	Employment and training policies for youth with disabilities	0	99	Russell, C. 1998. Education, employment and training policies and programmes for youth with disabilities in four European countries, Action Programme on Youth Unemployment, Employment and Training Papers 21, International Labour Organization (ILO), Switzerland. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/publ/etp21.htm
OECD	Ireland	The Work Experience Programme (WEP)	1	0	Breen, R. 1988. The Work Experience Programme in Ireland, International Labour Review, 1988, 127, 4, pg 429-444, ABI/INFORM Global
OECD	Italy	Italian Active Labor Market Policies	1	0	Caroleo, E. and F. Pastore. 2001. "How fine targeted is ALMP to the youth long term unemployed in Italy", CELPE Discussion Papers 62.
OECD	Italy	Youth training contracts (YTCs)	1	0	Caroleo, F.E. and F. Mazzotta. 1999. Youth unemployment and youth employment policies in Italy, Centro di economia del lavoro e politica economica, Università di Salerno, Italy.
OECD	Japan	One Stop Agency (Youth Independence and Challenge Plan)	0	99	Government of Japan. 2004. Government Policy on Employment and Development of Young Workers in Japan. Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare. Japan.
OECD	Netherlands	NL-Guaranteed Youth Employment Scheme and	1	2	Nissen, C. et al. 1998. "Review of National Youth Policies - Youth Policies in the Netherlands" - A government report by an international expert group appointed by the

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
		Incentive Policy on Youth Employment			Council of Europe, August 1998. Available online at: http://www.coe.int/t/e/cultural_cooperation/youth/YP_netherlands.pdf
OECD	New Zealand	4 Trades Apprenticeship	1	2	Brewer, L. 2004. Youth at risk: The role of skills development in facilitating the transition to work, InFocus Programme on Skills, Knowledge and Employability, Skills Working Paper No. 19, p. 71-72, International Labour Organization, Geneva.
OECD	Norway	Active Labor Market Programs for Youth in Norway	2	0	Hardoy, Inés. 2005. "Impact of Multiple Labour Market Programmes on Multiple Outcomes: The Case of Norwegian Youth Programmes" . Labour, Vol. 19, No. 3, pp. 425-467, September 2005
OECD	United Kingdom	Youth Opportunity Programme (YOP)	1	0	Main, B.G.M. 1985. School-Leaver Unemployment and the Youth Opportunities Programme in Scotland, Oxford Economic Papers, New Series, Vol. 37, No. 3 (Sep., 1985), pp. 426-447
OECD	Spain	Employment and training policies for youth with disabilities	0	99	Russell, C. 1998. Education, employment and training policies and programmes for youth with disabilities in four European countries, Action Programme on Youth Unemployment, Employment and Training Papers 21, International Labour Organization (ILO), Switzerland. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/publ/etp21.htm
OECD	Sweden	Labor Market Training Program in Sweden	2	0	Andrén, T. and B. Gustafsson. 2004. "Income Effects from Labor Market Training Programs in Sweden During the 80's and 90's", International Journal of Manpower 25, no. 8. Sianesi, Barbara. 2004. "An Evaluation of the Swedish System of Active Labor Market Programs in the 1990s". The Review of Economics and Statistics. February 2004, Vol. 86, No. 1, Pages 133-155.
OECD	United Kingdom	New Deal for the Young Unemployed	3	3	Van Reenen, J. 2003. Active Labour Market Policies and the British New Deal for the young unemployed in context, NBER Working Paper 9576 Layard, R. 2000. "Welfare to Work and the New Deal" The Business Economist 31,3. Riley, R. and Young G. 2001 "The macroeconomic impact of the New Deal for Young People" National Institute for Economic and Social Research Working Paper No. 185 Anderton, B., Riley and G. Young. 1999. The New Deal for Young People: Early Findings from the Pathfinder areas, Employment Service Research and Development Paper No. 34 Bryson, A., Knight, G., and White, M. 2000. "New Deal for Young People: National Survey of Participants stage 1" Employment Service Report ESR 44
OECD	United Kingdom	Employment and training policies for youth with disabilities	0	99	Russell, C. 1998. Education, employment and training policies and programmes for youth with disabilities in four European countries, Action Programme on Youth Unemployment, Employment and Training Papers 21, International Labour Organization (ILO), Switzerland. Available online at: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/strat/publ/etp21.htm
OECD	United States	Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (CETA) Programs	2	0	Bassi, Laurie, et al. 1984. "Measuring the effect of CETA on Youth and the economically disadvantaged." Final report prepared for the U.S. Department of Labor

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
					under contract No. 20-11-82-19, Washington DC: The Urban Institute, 1984. Barnow, Burt. 1987. The impact of CETA Programs in earnings. <i>Journal of Human Resources</i> 22 (1987): 157-93.
OECD		Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (CETA) Programs	2	0	Dickinson, Katherine; Terry R. Johnson; Richard W. West, 1987. "An analysis of the sensitivity of quasi-experimental net impact estimates of CETA Programs". <i>Evaluation Review</i> , Vol. 11, No. 4, Pp. 452 – 472. Dickinson, Katherine, Terry Johnson, and Richard West. 1984. "An analysis of the impact of CETA on participants' earnings". Final report prepared for US. DOL under contract No. 20-06-82-21. Menlo Park, California: SRI International. Dickinson, Katherine, Terry Johnson, and Richard West. 1986. "An analysis of the impact of CETA on participants' earnings", <i>Journal of Human Resources</i> , Winter 1986, 21, 64-91.
OECD		Comprehensive Employment and Training Act (CETA) Programs	2	2	Bryant, Edward and Kalman Rupp, "Evaluating the impact of CETA on participants' earnings", <i>Evaluation Review</i> , August 1987, 11, 473-92.
OECD	United States	Job Corps	3	1	Schochet, Peter Z., S. McConnell and J. Burghardt. 2003. National Job Corps Study: Findings Using Administrative Earnings Records Data - Final Report. October 2003. Mathematica Policy Research, Inc. Betsey, Charles L., R.G. Hollister Jr, and M.R. Papageorgiou. 1985. Youth Employment and Training Programs: The YEDPA Years (1985). Committee on Youth Employment Programs, Commission on Behavioral and Social Sciences and Education and National Research Council. National Academy Press, Washington DC. (800) 733-JOBS or (800) 733-5627 in the US or http://jobcorps.doleta.gov/about.cfm Krueger, Alan B. 2006. New (and Sometimes Conflicting) Data on the Value to Society of the Job Corps. <i>Economic Scene</i> . January 4 - also appear in the <i>New York Times</i> , Jan.5, 2006.
OECD		Job Corps	3	3	Mallar, Charles, S. Kerachsky, C. Thornton, and D. Long. 1982. Evaluation of the Economic Impact of the Job Corps Program Third Follow-Up Report - Executive Summary. September 1982. Mathematica Policy Research, Inc.
OECD	United States	Job Training Partnership Act - Title II-A (JTPA)	3	1	Bloom, Howard S.; Larry L. Orr; Stephen H. Bell; George Cave; Fred Doolittle; Winston Lin; Johannes M. Bos. 1997. The Benefits and Costs of JTPA Title II-A Programs: Key findings from the National Job Training Partnership Act Study. <i>The Journal of Human Resources</i> , Vol. 32, No. 3 (Summer, 1997), 549-576. Orr, L.L., Bloom, H.S., Bell, S.H., Doolittle, F., Lin, W., & Cave, G. 1996. Does training for the disadvantaged work? Evidence from the national JTPA study. Washington, DC: The Urban Institute Press. Hair, E., Ling, T., & Cochran, S. W. 2003. Youth development programs serving educationally disadvantaged youth: A synthesis of experimental evaluations. Washington, DC: Child Trends. http://www.childtrends.org/Lifecourse/programs/JobTrainingPartnershipAct.htm

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
OECD	United States	Meta-Analysis (sample of government-sponsored programs from 1962 to 1980)	2	0	Gay, Robert, and Michael Borus. 1980. "Validating performance indicators for employment and training programs," <i>Journal of Human Resources</i> , Winter 1980, 15, 29-48.
OECD	United States	Meta-Analysis (sample of government-sponsored programs from 1962 to 2003)	2	0	Greenberg, David H.; Charles Michalopoulos; Philip K. Robins. 2003. "A Meta-Analysis of Government-Sponsored Training Programs". <i>Industrial & Labor Relations Review</i> . Volume 57, Issue 1 2003 Article 2.
OECD	United States	New Chance Demonstration	3	0	Quint, Janet; Johannes Bos; and Denise Polit. 1997. <i>New Chance: Final Report on a Comprehensive Program for Young Mothers and Their Children</i> , Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation, July, 1997. Stanley, Marcus; L. Katz; and A. Krueger. 1998. <i>Developing Skills - What we know about the impacts of American Employment and Training Programs on Employment, Earnings and Education Outcomes</i> . Harvard University and Princeton University. October, 1998.
OECD	United States	New Hope Project	2	2	Huston, Aletha C.; Cynthia Miller; Lashawn Richburg-Hayes; Greg J. Duncan; Carolyn A. Eldred; Thomas S. Weisner; Edward Lowe; Vonnie A. McLoyd; Daniella A. Crosby; Marika N. Ripke; and Cindy Redcross. 2003. "New Hope for Families and Children. Five-Year Results of a Program to Reduce Poverty and Reform Welfare". MDRC Publication. Johnson, Clifford M. and Ana Carricchi Lopez. 1997. "Shattering the Myth of Failure: Promising Findings from Ten Public Job Creation Initiatives". <i>Center on Budget and Policy Priorities</i> . December 22, 1997. The New Hope Project, Inc. Julie Kerkisick, Executive Director. (414) 342-3338 Brash, Julian; Robert Granger; and Susan Poglinco. 1998. "An Early Look at Community Service Jobs in the New Hope Demonstration". July 1998. MDRC Publication.
OECD	United States	Programs in the National Evaluation of Welfare-to-Work Strategies (NEWWS)	2	2	Freedman, Stephen. 2003. "Pursuing Economic Security for Young Adults - Five-Year Impacts of Pre-Employment Services in the National Evaluation of Welfare-to-Work Strategies". MDRC
OECD	United States	Youth Fair Chance	2	0	Corson, Walter et al. 1996. <i>A Positive Force: The first two years of Youth Fair Chance</i> . Mathematica Policy Research, Inc. December 1996. Needels, Karen; Mark Dynarski, and Walter Corson. 1998. "Helping Young People in High-Poverty Communities: Lessons from Youth Fair Chance." Princeton, NJ: Mathematica Policy Research, Inc., December 1998. Document No. PR98-81.
OECD	United States	The Youth Offender Demonstration Project (YODP)	1	2	Miller, Ed and Lois MacGillivray. 2002. <i>Youth Offender Demonstration Project Process Evaluation (Final Report)</i> , Research and Evaluation Associates, Inc, Department of Labor and Employment and Training Administration. April 2002.
OECD	United States	Youth Opportunity Grants	1	2	DOLETA Harris, Linda. 2006. <i>Learning from the Youth Opportunity Experience: Executive Summary</i> . Center for Law and Social Policy (CLASP). January, 2006.

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
OECD	United States	Youth Opportunities Unlimited	0	99	http://www.clasp.org/publications.php?id=14 Orr, Margaret Terry and Cheri Fancsali. 1997. Improving Chances and Opportunities: The Accomplishments and Lessons From a National Community-Focused Youth Services, February 1997, Academy for Educational Development (New York, NY). (Chapter 6, "Youth Outcomes").
SAR and EAP	Hong Kong, China	Youth Pre-employment Training Programme (YPTP)	1	2	http://www.yptp.labour.gov.hk/eng_content/1/1.html http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/bangkok/conf/youth/con_stu/hongkong.pdf
SAR and EAP	Hong Kong, China	Youth Work Experience and Training Scheme - YWETS	0	99	HK, Labor Department
SAR and EAP	Philippines	PHILIPPINES - Kabataan 2000	1	2	http://www.unescap.org/esid/hds/youth/youth_philippines.pdf http://www.yesweb.org/gkr/project_factsheet.html?pid=107
SAR and EAP	Sri Lanka	Sarvodaya Economic Enterprise Development Services (SEEDS)	1	2	www.yensl.org/YouthOpportunities www.seeds.lk/sarvodayashramadana_societies.htm
SSA	Lesotho	Rural Development and Environmental Management (Support for the Establishment of a National Environment Youth Corps)	0	99	United Nations Development Programme, Government of Lesotho: First Country Co-Operative Framework: 1997-2000; Programme Area III: Rural Development and Environmental Management; LES/94/008: Phase II of Support for the Establishment of a National Environme
SSA	Malawi	Alliance for African Youth Employability PPP	0	99	http://www.iyfnet.org/document.cfm/752
SSA	Malawi	Skills Development and Income Generation Project	0	99	African Development Bank, Republic of Malawi, Appraisal report: Skills Development and Income Generation Project (MLW/PSWI/2001/01)
SSA	Mozambique	Alliance for African Youth Employability PPP	0	99	http://www.iyfnet.org/document.cfm/752
SSA	Nigeria	National Open Apprenticeship Scheme (NOAS)	1	2	Technoserve - Business Solutions to Rural Poverty: Youth Entrepreneurship: A Driving Force for Employment and Wealth Creation in Kenya ILO Geneva - InFocus Programme on Boosting Employment through Small Enterprise Development Job Creation and Enterprise Department (SEED Working Paper No. 59)
SSA	Rwanda	Alliance for African Youth Employability PPP	0	99	http://www.iyfnet.org/document.cfm/752
SSA	South Africa	Alliance for African Youth Employability PPP	0	99	http://www.iyfnet.org/document.cfm/752

Region	Country	Program	QOE	QOI	Source of Information
SSA	South Africa	Urban Conflict Management Project	1	2	GTZ; Ulrich Burgmer, Project Manager in South Africa: Ulrich.Burgmer@gtz.de
SSA	South Africa	Swiss-South African Co-operation Initiative (SSACI)	1	3	http://www.ssaci.org.za/ http://www.vetnet.ch/fs/fs1.asp?kt=4&skt=6&SID=13&iLId=2
SSA	South Africa	Umsobomvu Youth Fund	0	99	http://www.epwp.gov.za/index.htm
SSA	Uganda	Promotion of Children and Youth in Uganda (PCY)	2	3	BMZ and GTZ. BMZ. 2006. Cornerstones of Youth Employment Promotion in Development Cooperation. Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, Division of Development Education and Information. Germany. May 2006. Available online at: www.bmz.de/en/service/infothek/fach/diskurs/diskurs007en.pdf Project documents; James.Macbeth@gtz.de (Technical Advisor to the Ugandan Ministry of Gender, Labour and Social Development, MoGLSD)

9. Other (e.g. voluntary national service programs)

ECA	Albania	Youth Albania Parcel Service (YAPS)	1	3	http://www.unicef.org/albania/adolescence_690.html UNICEF Report: Youth and Transition: Issues Confronting Albania's Key Resource (November 2003) (http://www.unicef.org/albania/YouthTransition.pdf) http://www.unicef.org/albania/media_742.html
OECD	United States	Washington Service Corps - Federal Way School District AmeriCorps Program	1	2	Jastrzab, JoAnn; M. Ciurea; C. Cohen; C. Hostica; D. Small; and A. St. George. 2000. Evaluation of the Washington Service Corps - Final Report - Executive Summary. Abt Associates Inc. May 2000.
OECD	United States	YouthBuild USA Demonstration	1	2	Ferguson, Ronald F. and Philip L. Clay. 1996. "YouthBuild in developmental perspective: A Formative Evaluation of the YouthBuild Demonstration Project". September 1996. Harvard University and the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Johnson, Clifford M. and Ana Carricchi Lopez. 1997. "Shattering the Myth of Failure: Promising Findings from Ten Public Job Creation Initiatives". Center on Budget and Policy Priorities. December 22, 1997. www.youthbuild.org

