

Assessing Swaziland's Technical and Vocational Education and Training System to Improve Economic Growth



Assessing Swaziland's Technical and Vocational Education and Training System to Improve Economic Growth



© 2014 The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/The World Bank

1818 H St. NW Washington, DC 20433 Telephone: (202) 473-1000 Web site: http://www.worldbank.org E-mail: feedback@worldbank.org

All rights reserved.

Copyright Statement:

The material in this publication is copyrighted. Copying and/or transmitting portions or all of this work without permission may be a violation of applicable law. The International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank encourages dissemination of its work and will normally grant permission to reproduce portions of the work promptly.

For permission to photocopy or reprint any part of this work, please send a request with complete information to the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA, telephone 978-750-8400, fax 978-750-4470, http://www.copyright.com/.

All other queries on rights and licenses, including subsidiary rights, should be addressed to the Office of the Publisher, The World Bank, 1818 H Street NW, Washington, DC 20433, USA, fax 202-522-2422, e-mail pubrights@worldbank.org.

Standard Disclaimer:

This volume is a product of the staff of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions expressed in this paper do not necessarily reflect the views of the Executive Directors of The World Bank or the governments they represent. The World Bank does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this work. The boundaries, colors, denominations, and other information shown on any map in this work do not imply any judgment on the part of The World Bank concerning the legal status of any territory or the endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries.

Cover photos courtesy of Xiaonan Cao/The World Bank.

Table of Contents

Ac	knowledgement v
Ab	breviations vii
Ex	ecutive Summary ix
1.	Introduction1Country Context and Youth Labor Markets1Government Effort on Skills Development3
2.	Current TVET Provision5Size and Principal Characteristics of the System5Types, Subjects, and Modalities of Training Programs6Characteristics of Trainers7Program Admissions and Completion Rate8Governance8Financing10
3.	Issues with the Current TVET Provision11Principal Issues11Priority Issue – Relevance14
4.	Conclusion 15
Αρ	AppendicesAppendix A: A Rapid Assessment Study of Current TVET Provision in SwazilandAppendix B: Survey Questionnaire20Appendix C: Summary of TVET Institutions by Region30Appendix D: Training Programs Offered by TVET Institutions33Appendix E: Trainer Occupations Identified in the Survey34

18

Figures

Figure 1: Labor Market Indicators 2	
Figure 2: Level of Institutions by Type of Institution6	
Figure 3: Modality of Training Delivery 7	
Figure 4: Modality of Training Delivery by Type of Institution 7	
Figure 5: Trainers by Academic Qualification 8	
Figure 6: Admission Requirement by Type of Institution 8	
Figure 7: Who Makes Decisions on New Program Development? 9	
Figure 8: Relationship with Professional Association by Type of Institution10	
Figure 9: Institutions with Government Subsidy by Type of Institution 10	
Figure 10: Distribution of Size of TVET Institutions by Type of Institution12	
T []	
lables	
Table 1: Distribution of Institutions by Region and Type5	
Table 2: Number of Trainees and Trainers by Type of Institution6	
Table 3: Top 10 Programs with Largest Number of Trainees in 2011–20136	
Table 4: Top 10 Programs Offered by TVET Institutions7	
Table 5: Program Completion Rate8	
Table 6: Program Completion Rate by Type of Institution9	
Table 7: Governing Board or Management Team Claimed by Type of Institution	9
Table 8: TVET Institutions with/without a Quality Council by Type of Institution	9
Table 9: Trainer's Average Monthly Salary by Type of Institution10	
Table 10: Average Tuition by Type of Institution10	
Table 11: Distribution of Size of TVET Institutions by Number of Trainees12	
Table 12: Trainee-to-Trainer Ratio by Type of Institution12	
Table 13: General Information about Tuition and Salary in TVET by Region13	
Table 14: Tuition and Salary Summary of Business Management Program by Region	14
Table 15: Percentage of Trainees Employed within 12 Months after Training Completion	14

Acknowledgement

¹his rapid assessment of the current provision of technical and vocational education and training (TVET) in Swaziland was conducted jointly by the World Bank and the Ministry of Education and Training of Swaziland. It was led by the Task Team Leader Xiaonan Cao, Senior Education Specialist at the Africa Region of the World Bank, with the support of Ms. Callista Chen, Mr. Jabulani William Ntuli, and Ms. Nokuthula Pearlygate Mathobela of the World Bank Pretoria Office. The Ministry provided generous support to the process and organized a successful identification workshop of TVET providers. In particular, Mr. Mboni Dlamini, Director for Planning, provided general guidance to the task; Mr. Jabu Shabalala, Manager of the EMIS Department, and Mr. Earnest Simelane, TVET Officer, provided valuable inputs to the design of the survey instrument and general support to the project implementation. The active participation of the identified TVET institutions

in Swaziland in the survey is much appreciated. Appreciation is also extended to ActivQuest for its well-organized data collection and to Ms. Yayun Pan for the data processing and analysis. They completed their respective assignments in about two weeks with decent quality, which is very impressive. Also, it should be acknowledged that, from the Africa Region of the World Bank, Mr. Fernando Gabriel Im, Economist of the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Unit provided the macroeconomic background of Swaziland for this report. From the Human Development Unit, Ms. Sajitha Bashir, Manager of Education for Eastern and Southern Africa, provided overall guidance to this project; Ms. Tazeen Fasih, Senior Human Development Economist advised the project at its initial stage. Review comments and additional contributions from Ms. Callista Chen, Mr. Fernando Gabriel Im and Ms. Yayun Pan are much appreciated.

Abbreviations

- GDP Gross Domestic Product
- ICT Information and Communications Technology
- MoET Ministry of Education and Training
- NGO Non-Governmental Organization
- NQF National Qualification Framework
- SACU Southern Africa Customs Union
- TVET Technical and Vocational Education and Training
- TVETSD Technical and Vocational Education and Training and Skills Development

Executive Summary

S waziland's economic growth has moderated over the last two decades and has been among the lowest in Sub-Saharan Africa. The slow growth has exacerbated the serious challenges facing the country's development, for example, high unemployment, particularly among the youth. The demographic shift in the coming two decades will cause working age population growth to outpace population growth. At the recent GDP growth rates, job creation will fail to keep pace with the number of new entrants, most of them are the youth and current job seekers in the labor market. All these factors have raised expectations for skills development of young people that could potentially lead to higher utilization of human resources thereby breaking the vicious cycle of high unemployment, high poverty and low growth.

Although skills development is a continuing process and most of it takes place on the job, for young people, foundational skills are developed in education and training institutions. In particular, their basic vocational and technical skills are developed through technical and vocational education and training (TVET). Thus, whether the current TVET system in the country can meet the above mentioned expectations needs to be examined. Until recently, information on TVET provision in Swaziland was based on a 2008 survey that produced very limited data. In order to provide a clear picture of the current condition of the country's TVET provision with a view to making improvements, the Ministry of Education and Training (MoET) of Swaziland and the World Bank jointly undertook a rapid assessment of TVET institutions in Swaziland in May 2013.

The rapid assessment provides an overview of a highly varied landscape of TVET providers. At present, Swaziland has 70 TVET institutions, 27 are public, 29 are private, for-profit, and 14 are run by NGOs, churches and communities (private but non-profit). These institutions offer 415 training programs in 60 areas ranging from vocational programs such as sewing, farming, carpentry, etc. to highly technical and professional programs such as business management, computer programming, education, etc. Fifty five percent of the training programs are short-term (less than 12 months) and many of them are vocational. At the time of the survey, the institutions employed 767 trainers and enrolled 6,881 trainees (of whom 56 percent were females). The general completion rate is around 80 percent.

Given that only a third of the institutions are public and enroll about a third of the total trainees, the private provision of TVET plays a significant role in skills development in the country. However, many private providers are not registered and they operate fairly independently. With a youth population (age 15–24) of roughly 314,000 and secondary school enrollment at roughly 90,000, the TVET provision caters to very few people in Swaziland, and is far from sufficient in terms of meeting the needs of the country's economic recovery and growth.

The assessment also reveals the fragmentation and lack of coordination of the country's current TVET system. Some principal weaknesses include:

 Low efficiency of the system, especially in the public sector. There is great variation in institutional size and trainee-trainer ratio among the TVET institutions. In particular, the data shows that the current provision of TVET includes many institutions with a small numbers of trainees, e.g., 40 institutions with less than 50 trainees at the time of the survey. In addition, a number of observations imply that public providers are less efficient than both for-profit and non-profit private institutions, e.g., the public institutions collectively have more trainers for fewer trainees (6:1) than the for-profit (13:1) and non-profit (11:1) private institutions. The public system serves only about a third of the total trainees, but supports more than half of the total trainers.

- 2. Limited range of programs. In recent years, the tourism, food processing, manufacturing and mining industries have been identified as potential areas for growth and foreign investment in Swaziland. However, training programs for skills needed in these areas such as mechanical, electric, electronic and food processing technicians are not sufficiently supplied by the TVET institutions. In fact, mechanical engineering was the only one in the top 10 TVET programs with a large number of trainees in 2011–2013.
- 3. Lack of strong quality assurance mechanisms at both national and institutional levels. Most private TVET institutions have a quality council or committee to oversee the quality of their training programs and the development of new programs. But, only less than half of the public TVET institutions have established such quality control mechanisms. Forty-nine institutions report a relationship with at least one professional association but it is unclear whether these professional associations have the capacity to provide the respective qualification standards and guidance.
- Insufficient public investment in TVET. Investment in TVET in Swaziland is very limited. Except the financial support in the form of salary payments for trainers who are classified as civil servants, 76% of

TVET institutions claim not to receive any subsidies from the government. TVET operations are costly. In order for TVET to have a good impact on national economic development, appropriate government investment and close partnerships with the private sector are much needed.

From the assessment, it is clear that urgent attention must be given to the weak alignment between current TVET provision and labor market requirements. This is particularly evident in priority industries of tourism, food processing, manufacturing, and mining. While few TVET institutions offer training programs related to food processing or hospitality, at least 19 to 20 institutions offer overlapping programs in computer programming and fashion. An earlier review of public provision of TVET conducted by MoET in 2008 also concluded that the TVET provision in the country tended to be more supply-driven and disconnected from the labor market.

Many of the issues that surfaced from this assessment can be attributed to the absence of sound regulatory and national qualification frameworks. The current provision of TVET in Swaziland is insufficient and incapable of equipping the youth with the necessary market skills or supporting the necessary economic recovery and growth in the country. Further analysis on human resource needs and skills gaps in priority growth industries can help the Swazi government identify appropriate policy interventions for skills development, realize the growth potential of priority industries, establish a mechanism responsive to market needs, and promote partnership with the private sector for TVET improvement in Swaziland.

Introduction

S waziland has been struggling with economic growth in recent years. Unemployment is high, particularly among the youth. According to the Labor Force Survey of 2010, 28.5 percent of the labor force is unemployed.¹ The moderation in economic growth over the past two decades, exacerbated by the fiscal crisis of 2010–2011, has not been conducive to job creation. Faster growth rates are required to make a significant dent in the high levels of joblessness. An important area that needs to be addressed for the economic development of the country as well as for improving the widespread joblessness among the workforce, especially the youth, is skills development.

Skills development is a continuing process and most of it takes place through on-the-job training; however, for young people, foundational skills are developed in education and training institutions. In particular, their basic vocational and technical skills are developed through the country's TVET system. Thus, it is critical that Swaziland has a sound TVET system that can provide sufficient skills to the youth. Based on a joint rapid assessment of the current state of TVET provision in Swaziland carried out by the Ministry of Education and Training of Swaziland and the World Bank, this report sheds light on potential areas for policy intervention to improve the TVET system and make it more effective in helping address youth unemployment in the country.

Country Context and Youth Labor Markets

Swaziland is slowly recovering from the fiscal crisis of 2010–11. The negative growth spillovers from the liquidity

crunch and fiscal crisis have started to subside, helped by the recent recovery in Southern Africa Customs Union (SACU) receipts which represent over half of the government's total revenues. While the government's fiscal and external positions have improved significantly, fiscal sustainability remains vulnerable in the medium-term as elevated government expenditures and the high dependence on SACU receipts remain to be addressed. Provisional estimates by the Central Bank of Swaziland and the Ministry of Economic Planning and Development indicate that real GDP growth was 1.9 percent in 2012 and 2.8 percent in 2013, following a contraction of 0.7 percent in 2011.

However, Swaziland's growth troubles date back further than the fiscal crisis of 2010-11. Swaziland's economic growth moderated over the last two decades and has been among the lowest in Sub-Saharan Africa. Growth averaged just 2.0 percent during 2000-2012, much lower than that of its major trading partner South Africa (3.5 percent) and that of Sub-Saharan Africa (5.0 percent). Furthermore, the economic slowdown has exacerbated the country's serious developmental challenges. Despite being classified as a middle income country, an estimated 63 percent of the population lives below the national poverty line. The majority of the population resides in rural areas (75.8 percent according to the Household Income and Expenditure Surveys 2009–10). Poverty headcount in rural areas is estimated at about 73.1 percent, compared to 31.1 percent in urban areas. Unemployment is high, estimated at 28.5 percent overall and 52.3 percent among the youth. Currently, an estimated 31 percent of Swazis ages 18-49 are HIV-positive and life

¹ The "relaxed" unemployment rate, which takes into account discouraged workers who are no longer actively looking for jobs in the labor market, is 40.7.

Figure 1

0

Unemployment

rate (strict)

Labor Market Indicators



0

Employment to

population rate

Unemployment

rate (strict)



Labor force

particiation

2010

Unemployment

rate (relaxed)

2007

expectancy has fallen to about 48 years.² A significant number of children are either orphans or otherwise vulnerable, reflecting the significant socio-economic impact of the HIV/AIDS epidemic.

Swaziland is expected to undergo a demographic transition over the next two decades. As a result, working age population growth will outpace population growth. The ratio of working age population to total population is bound to increase and the dependency ratio to fall. However, this will not automatically translate into higher economic growth, an increase in the employment rate, and a fall in the unemployment rate. At the recent GDP growth rates, job creation will fail to keep pace with the number of new entrants and current job seekers in the labor market. The recent fiscal crisis most likely had a negative impact on poverty and labor market outcomes. While a more recent Labor Force Survey is not available, it is reasonable to assume that the fall in SACU revenues and the effects of the fiscal crisis and liquidity crunch–with the wage and hiring freeze, the cuts in social and capital expenditures and the accumulation of arrears to the private sector, including small and medium enterprises (SMEs)–most likely have had a negative impact on job creation, and the level and duration of unemployment spells. According to a recent survey (*UN Swaziland, 2012*), out of 1,334 interviewed households, 7.3 percent had at least one member who lost a job during the past 12 months, 4.4 percent of households experienced wage cuts, 4.9 percent reduced

Labor force

particiation

2010

2007

Employment to

population rate

2

Source: Labour Force Surveys of 2007 and 2010 (CSO) and HealthStats (The World Bank).

² Swaziland HIV Incidence Measurement Survey (2012)

3

business operations, and 4.7 percent were informed that one member may lose a job or experience a wage cut.

As evidenced from the past, slow growth was accompanied by slow job creation. Labor market outcomes have not improved between 2007-2010. In fact, some indicators worsened over time. Unemployment rate (relaxed definition) rose from 38.0 percent in 2007 to 40.7 percent in 2010. Less than 3.4 persons out of ten in the working age population were employed in 2010, down from 3.7 in 2007. More worrisome is the long duration of unemployment and underemployment spells, reflecting underlying structural factors that if not addressed will likely perpetuate a vicious cycle of high unemployment, high poverty and low growth. There must be an effort to address these structural issues, including the need for skills development that could potentially lead to higher utilization of human resources. This could eventually lead to major steps towards poverty reduction and more inclusive growth.

Given Swaziland's weak economic performance, the demand for skills may seem relatively muted. Most enterprises in the country are not skill-intensive and do not demand highly trained or educated workers. The 2006 Investment Climate Report indicated that skill constraints are not viewed as a major problem by most employers in Swaziland. Only 12 per cent of enterprises in the survey identified skill levels as a constraint on business compared to 22 percent in Sub-Saharan Africa as a whole. Nevertheless, skill shortages may be limiting investment in new sectors that have growth potential. For example, the 2006 survey revealed that potential growth areas such as food processing and light manufacturing (other than textiles) were more likely to report the lack of skills as a major constraint. More recent interviews of enterprises further support this finding-for example, the food processing sector is particularly concerned about the lack of engineers and technicians with experience in the sector. Although skill shortages may not be hindering growth for existing enterprises which rely largely on unskilled workers,³ it could be one of the factors limiting growth in high-potential industry sectors.

Young people and families in Swaziland face few incentives to invest in human capital and skills development. Swaziland provides 7 years of primary schooling, 3 years of junior secondary (Form I-III), 2 years of senior secondary (Form IV-V), and higher education to its citizens. The provision of TVET starts from the junior secondary level and goes up to the tertiary level (i.e., Swaziland College of Technology). The Junior Certificate issued by MoET for the completion of junior secondary education is the most common entry-level qualification for employment. In 2011, the country spent about 7.8 percent of its GDP and 21 percent of government expenditure on education. Its primary education completion rate was about 77 percent (girls' slightly higher than boys). The gross enrollment rate for secondary schools was about 60 percent and for tertiary education only 6% (male and female student numbers are more or less the same at these two levels of education, with females being slightly lower at the secondary level and higher at the tertiary level).⁴ Overall, this suggests that Swaziland needs to place greater effort towards the development of its human capital base. Initiatives for skills development can contribute towards alleviating the widespread youth unemployment in the country.

Government Effort on Skills Development

Since 2007, the government has developed a broad range of policies to guide the country's economic recovery and to achieve the goal of "growth acceleration with equity." To reach the targets set out in those policies, especially with regard to the 30 percent poverty reduction by 2015 and poverty eradication by 2022, it is estimated that 5 percent average annual GDP growth over a sustained period of time is required.⁵

The government is fully aware of the urgency of the need for skills development and has invested heavily in developing policies and strategies to improve the education, training and skills development sector in recent years. MoET has issued national policy documents such as *The*

³ "Institutions, Governance and Growth: Identifying Constraints to Growth in Swaziland", World Bank, September 2013 (draft version)

⁴ Open Data Source, World Bank

⁵ "Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010–2022", Ministry of Education and Training, Swaziland, November 2010

National Technical and Vocational Education and Training and Skills Development (TVETSD) Policy and Strategy (May 2010), Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010–2022 (November 2010), and The Swaziland Education and Training Sector Policy (April 2011). Although the cohesiveness and alignment of these plans are not perfect, they have pointed out the main challenges in the country's TVETSD system and outlined a vision and plans for improvement.

MoET's review of the country's TVETSD system pointed out the following key issues:⁶

- 1. Limited external efficiency and relevance;
- Poor coordination, governance, organizational and regulatory structure at the national level;
- 3. Constrained access in terms of equity;
- 4. Constrained access in terms of participation;
- 5. Unsustainable financing;
- 6. Lack of quality assurance;
- Lack of a clear direction on the future of the prevocational program;
- Lack of a Technical and Vocational Education and Training Institution in the country that offers degree programs;
- Not responsive to skills demand and poor program articulation; and
- 10. Doubtful instructor competencies and obsolete equipment.

Facing these challenges, MoET has a vision to "develop a quality, relevant, and sustainable TVETSD system as an integral part of the social and economic strategy for the Kingdom of Swaziland." It believes that the mission of the country's TVETSD should be: "The provision of a market-driven, quality technical and vocational education and training system in the context of a National Qualifications Framework (NQF) through competency based education and training, cognizant of prior learning for all, inclusive of the socioeconomically disadvantaged, unemployed, special target groups, and incorporating gender sensitivity."⁷

With this vision and mission in mind, MoET has proposed a set of ambitious goals for improving the current TVETSD system in the country. Here are some specific goals and expected outcomes:

- "A competent and employable work force provided with skills for addressing the diverse social and economic development needs of the individual and the country;
- An effective TVETSD governance and management system with clear roles and responsibilities, accountable to the national Assembly through the Ministry responsible for Education and training;
- An internally efficient TVETSD system with mechanisms for portability of qualifications articulating diverse forms of TVETSD provision, including the formal, non-formal and informal, having provisions for flexible exit and entry to both academic and skill related pathways;
- A TVETSD system that is accessible in terms of equitable distribution and participation to all individuals needing skills for employability in the formal sector, on own account and for income generation; and
- A financially sustainable TVETSD system funded through diverse sources that include the government, employers, end users, fees, donations and income generation activities by the providers. The funding disbursement should be accountable and must benefit different forms of learners."⁸

To achieve these ambitious goals, MoET has started to consider policy interventions and concrete implementation plans for the above mentioned development strategies. In doing so, it has reached out to development partners for technical assistance. For example, the European Union has been providing support for the establishment of a national qualification framework. The World Bank has assisted MoET in assessing the current state of the country's technical and vocational education and training provision. These activities will help MoET align the TVETSD improvement plan with the national socioeconomic development agenda.

⁷ Same as the above

⁶ "National Technical and Vocational Education and Training and Skills Development (TVETSD) Policy and Strategy" (May 2010) and "Education Sector Strategic Plan 2010–2022" (November 2010), Ministry of Education and Training, Swaziland

⁸ "National Technical and Vocational Education and Training and Skills Development (TVETSD) Policy and Strategy" (May 2010), Ministry of Education and Training, Swaziland

Current TVET Provision

n general, TVET in Swaziland has been seen as fragmented, lacking coordination and having huge variation of quality among its providers. The World Bank's technical assistance to MoET in assessing the current provision of TVET in the country is timely. The assessment was carried out with an institutional survey⁹ in May 2013 and revealed the present landscape of TVET provision in Swaziland (see Appendix A for the methodology and Appendix B for the questionnaire of the survey).

Size and Principal Characteristics of the System

Swaziland has four administrative regions—Hhohho, Lubombo, Manzini, and Shiselweni. These regions have different populations and socioeconomic conditions which have shaped their TVET institutions in terms of size, infrastructure, financing, operations, training methods, quality and outputs. At present, there are about 70 TVET institutions in Swaziland (see Appendix C for a summary list). Twenty-seven of them are public, 29 are private, for-profit, and 14 are run by NGOs, churches and communities (private but non-profit). A third of them were established in the past decade and only about a third of the 70 institutions consider themselves at the tertiary level. Table 1 provides the distribution of institutions across categories and regions.

Together, these institutions employ 767 trainers (of which 54 percent is female) and enroll a total of 6,881 trainees (of which 56 percent is female) in 2013. Against the youth population of roughly 314,000 (age 15-24) and secondary school enrollment of roughly 90,000 (about a third of them enrolled in senior secondary schools),¹⁰ this is far from sufficient. An earlier World Bank report¹¹ estimated the potentially unmet demand for TVET to be 14,000 individuals each year.¹² As described in Table 2, about a third of all TVET trainees are enrolled in public institutions, and nearly half are enrolled in private, for-profit institutions. The remaining trainees attend private, not-for-profit institutions. The public sector comprises about a third of the institutions (39 percent) and trainees (36 percent), but more than half (54 percent) of the trainers.

Table 1:

Distribution of Institutions by Region and Type

Туре	Region						
of Inst.	ннонно	LUBOMBO	MANZINI	SHISELWENI	Total		
Public	8	6	9	4	27		
Private	12	1	13	3	29		
Others	4	3	5	2	14		
Total	24	10	27	9	70		

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013

⁹ The survey did not include enterprise-based training, trade testing, and other non-institutionalized training.

¹⁰ Open Society Initiative for Southern Africa, http://www.osisa. org/open-learning/swaziland/swaziland-education-system

¹¹ "The Education System in Swaziland." World Bank. 2010.

¹² "The Education System in Swaziland" calculated that the 14,000 individuals include the 7,500 students who terminate their studies after Grade 7, Form 3 and Form 5, and the 6,500 students who drop out of secondary education.

Types, Subjects, and Modalities of Training Programs

Of Swaziland's 70 TVET institutions, a third of them consider themselves at the level of lower secondary education (see Figure 2 for the breakdown by type of institution).

Collectively, 415 programs in 60 areas are offered by these 70 institutions (see Appendix D). Fifty-five percent of them are short-term (less than 12 months) and 45 percent are long-term (12 months or more). These programs cover some 60 subject areas such as sewing, farming, carpentry, business management, computer programming and education.

Table 3 lists the top ten subjects based on enrollment, which to a large extent reflects demand. For all three academic years covered in the survey, Business Management,

Figure 2 Level of Institutions by Type of Institution



Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Table 3

Top 10 Programs with Largest Number of Trainees in 2011–2013

	2011	2012	2013
1	Business Management	Business Management	Education
2	Computer Programming	Education	Business Management
3	Education	Computer Programming	Computer Programming
4	Mechanical Engineering	Mechanical Engineering	Mechanical Engineering
5	Secretarial	Dress and Fashion	Civil Engineering
6	Sewing	Accounting & Finance	House Wiring and Electrical Work
7	Dress and Fashion	Information Technology	Information Technology
8	Accounting & Finance	Secretarial Work	Catering
9	Medical	Civil Engineering	AAT
10	Civil Engineering	Catering	Decoration

Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Computer Programming, Education and Mechanical Engineering consistently attracted a large number of trainees.

An analysis of the supply side shows the top ten programs based on the number of offering institutions in 2013 (Table 4). Most of these programs are specific skills oriented. Business Management, Computer Programming, Dress and Fashion, and IT are the top four subject areas in which almost a third of the institutions offer training programs. As the data show, there is high consistency among the programs offered across institutions.

In recent years, the tourism, food processing, manufacturing and mining industries have been identified as potential areas for growth and foreign investment in

Table 2

Number of Trainees and Trainers by Type of Institution

	Institutions Trainees			Trainers				
Type of Inst.	No.	%	No.	%	% female	No.	%	% female
Public	27	39%	2482	36%	44%	411	54%	68%
Private	29	41%	3322	48%	68%	255	33%	38%
Others	14	20%	1077	16%	45%	101	13%	39%
Total	70	100%	6881	100%	56%	767	100%	54%

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013

Swaziland. These are relatively skill-intensive industries and access to skilled workers is the key to their development. However, training programs for skills needed by the market such as mechanical, electric, electronic and food processing technicians are not sufficiently supplied by the TVET institutions.

With increased availability of technology and demand for more marketable skills, the modality of TVET instruction and learning has evolved over the past decade. Investigating currently-used modalities could provide useful information for the improvement of curriculum design and instructional effectiveness. In Swaziland, the most commonly used method of training delivery, traditional classroom-based instruction, is used by 80 percent of the surveyed TVET institutions. At present, there is limited use of information and communications technology (ICT) for online delivery of training; only 4 percent of the surveyed institutions use this approach. Only about half of the institutions have internet access (the Lubombo Region has the lowest access rate, 30 percent) and computers in working condition (the Shiselweni Region has the lowest computer usage, 33 percent). About 70 percent of the institutions provide laboratory/workshop-based instruction and some have internship programs. Figure 3 provides an overview of the training delivery methods that are currently employed by the TVET institutions in Swaziland and Figure 4 provides at breakdown by type of institution. For the most part, private,

Table 4

Top 10 Programs Offered by TVET Institutions

	Program Title	Offered by No. of Institutions
1	Business Management	20
2	Computer Programming	20
3	Dress and Fashion	19
4	Information Technology	19
5	Sewing	17
6	House Wiring and Electrical Work	16
7	Accounting and Finance	14
8	Secretarial Work	12
9	Carpentry	12
10	Catering	9

Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013

Figure 3

Modality of Training Delivery



Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.





Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

for-profit institutions are most likely to use a wide range of delivery methods.

Characteristics of Trainers

The TVET system has a total of 767 trainers. Forty-six percent of them are civil servants and school-contracted and part-time trainers account for 21 percent and 20 percent respectively. On average, these trainers have about 11 years of training experience. They come from approximately 34 occupational backgrounds (see Appendix E for the full list). In general, almost all trainers have an academic qualification that falls in the six recognized categories (see Figure 5) but only 37 percent of them have a Bachelor's degree and 21 percent have a higher national diploma. This seems to suggest that the majority of trainers are practitioners.

Program Admissions and Completion Rate

Among the current 70 TVET institutions in the country, 21 of them admit their trainees through the national examination and 31 use interviews to recruit trainees for certain programs. Half of the institutions do not use either of these methods to admit their trainees. Figure 6 provides the breakdown of admission requirement by type of institution. Surprisingly, fewer public institutions use the national examination for selecting their trainees.

Overall, the program completion rate of trainees is roughly 80 percent.¹³ However, the data has limited use in assessing program completion due to a relatively large amount of missing values. With the available data, Table 5 calculates the average completion rate for all trainees (including

Figure 5 Trainers by Academic Qualification



Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Figure 6





Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Table 5

Program Completion Rate

	2011		20	012
	Total	Female	Total	Female
Average Completion Rate	83.7%	74.9%	78.2%	72.4%
Missing Values (Percent) ^a	25.7%	37.1%	28.6%	30.0%

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013. Note:

^a Percentage of Missing Values here refers to the number of institutions that did not respond to this question in the survey relative to the total number of institutions. Programs here include both short- and long-term ones. Data for 2013 data is indicative as the academic year was only half-way through at the time of data collection.

females) over the last three academic years and Table 6 provides the completion information by type of institution. The completion rates are similar across the types of institutions. In all cases, women were slightly less likely than men to complete their programs. The seemingly declining completion rate coupled with the failure of some institutions to report this data deserves further investigation.

Governance

Most institutions seem to have a management team and about two-thirds of them claim to have a governing board (Table 7). Most private institutions have a quality council or committee to oversee the quality of their training

¹³ 2012/2013 academic year was not finished yet when this survey was conducted, thus the completion data for the latest academic year is not available.

9

Table 6 Program Completion Rate by Type of Institution^a

Tuno of	2(011	2	012
Institution	Total	Female	Total	Female
Public	89.2%	85.1%	78.2%	74.3%
Private	81.7%	67.4%	83.7%	75.0%
Others	84.2%	75.5%	69.1%	64.4%

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013. Note:

^a Program completion rate is calculated based on the limited data that was provided by the surveyed TVET institutions.

programs and the development of new programs (Table 8). However, less than half of the public institutions have established such quality control mechanisms. The fact that less than half of the public institutions have a quality assurance body is worrisome. Further investigation is required with regard to how the quality assurance mechanism actually works in private institutions.

When it comes to developing new programs, the time needed and the decision-maker varies across the surveyed

Table 7

Governing Board or Management Team Claimed by Type of Institution

Type of Institution	No. Institutions	Governing Board	Management Team
Public	27	17	26
Private	29	16	29
Others	14	13	11
Total	70	46	66

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Table 8

TVET Institutions with/without a Quality Council by Type of Institution^a

Type of Inst.	No. of Institutions with Quality Council	No. of Institutions without Quality Council
Public	12	14
Private	24	3
Others	6	8

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013. Note:

^a One pubic and two private institutions did not report on this question in the survey (missing values)

institutions (see Figure 7). In general, the quality council/ committee is responsible for reviewing any new program proposals. Thirty percent of public institutions tend to have their academic committee make decisions on launching new programs. In contrast, 41 percent of private institutions have the head of the institution make this decision. On an average, it takes about one and a half months for public institutions to launch a new program, while private institutions need almost two and a half months to do the same.

Affiliation with professional associations is particularly important to the quality of TVET. Professional associations often provide both qualification standards and information on market needs for skills which guide the development of TVET curricula and help TVET institutions ensure the market relevance of their training offerings. Across 70 TVET institutions in Swaziland, 49 of them report a relationship with at least one professional association (see Figure 8 below for the breakdown by type of institution). About 80 percent of these relationships are said to be formal. But, how close such relationships are, how they function and whether or not they connect labor market needs to TVET provision needs more investigation. It is unclear whether those TVET-affiliated professional associations have the capacity to provide qualification standards or help TVET institutions improve their quality.

Figure 7

Who Makes Decisions on New Program Development?



Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Figure 8

Relationship with Professional Association by Type of Institution







Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Financing

By and large, TVET institutions in Swaziland are financed through incomes from tuition fees and government subsidies for trainer salaries. Three-quarter of the institutions do not receive government subsidies (see Figure 9 for the breakdown by type of institution). Government financial support is provided in the form of salary payment to those trainers who are classified as civil servants (46 percent of the total trainers), regardless of what type of institution hires them.

Interestingly, public sector trainers earn nearly twice the amount earned by trainers at other (private, non-profit) institutions, and more than twice the amount earned at private, for-profit institutions (Table 9).

Tuition fees vary from program to program and, for the same program, differ from region to region (Table 10). Programs at public institutions tend to be the most expensive, both in terms of total and monthly tuition fees.

Table 9

Figure 9

Trainer's Average Monthly Salary by Type of Institution^a

Type of Institution	Average Monthly Salary
Public	E10,766
Private	E3,890
Others	E5,191

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.. Note:

^a Missing values are observed.

Table 10

Average Tuition by Type of Institution

Type of Institution	Average Total Tuition	Average Monthly Tuition
Public	E10,693	E2,310
Private	E5,419	E1,341
Others	E2,305	E169

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.



Issues with the Current TVET Provision

Principal Issues

The rapid assessment revealed a number of issues with the current provision of TVET in Swaziland, including coverage, lack of information systems, lack of a National Qualifications Framework, efficiency, quality assurance, and sustainability.

Coverage

As noted earlier, in 2013, the TVET system served 6,881 trainees. It is estimated the potential unmet need is approximately 14,000 individuals annually. This low coverage could be because of the overall lack of incentives for young people to invest in their own development, the apparent lack of relevance of programs or weak signals from the labor market. An earlier World Bank study¹⁴ had noted other possible reasons for low coverage, including limited number of spaces for trainees, extended duration of many programs (2–3 years), unaffordable fees, and, for rural dwellers, geographic distance (i.e., more institutions are in urban areas).

Lack of information systems to provide guidance to providers, students, employers

Besides the MoET 2008 assessment and this rapid assessment, there is little data on the provision of TVET in Swaziland. Since TVET providers are not required to register with or provide basic data on their operations to MoET, there is no central repository of data to guide providers and students. Further, there is no established mechanism to connect employers and TVET providers. If employers could alert TVET providers to skills demand from the market and also provide input for curriculum improvement and quality assurance, this would result in a relevant TVET system well able to support the country's economic activities.

Lack of a national qualifications framework

A National Qualifications Framework (NQF) is an instrument which aims to integrate and coordinate national qualification subsystems and improve the transparency, access, progression and quality of qualifications in relation to the labor market and civil society.¹⁵ The absence of an NQF makes it difficult to align TVET provision with current regional and national priorities. Further studies in combination with the national/regional economic datasets and sector strategic plans are needed so that the urgent need for an NQF can be fulfilled.

Efficiency

Various inefficiencies plague Swaziland's TVET provision. There is great variation in institutional size and trainee-trainer ratio among the TVET institutions. For example, there are institutions with over 300 trainees and there are institutions with less than 10 trainees (see Table 11 and Figure 10). In particular, the data shows that the current provision of TVET includes many institutions with small numbers of trainees. More than half (57 percent) of the institutions have 50 or fewer trainees, and more

¹⁴ "The Education System in Swaziland." World Bank, 2010.

¹⁵ "Added Value of National Qualifications Frameworks in Implementing the EQF," by Jens Bjornavold and Mike Coles, 2010. http://www.ehea.info/Uploads/qualification/note2_en.pdf

than two thirds of the institutions (69 percent) have 100 or fewer trainees. Combined with the earlier noted data on the high consistency among programs offered by institutions, the large number of small programs seems to imply that there is significant duplication across the system.

Some institutions have a trainee-trainer ratio of more than 20:1 and some have just 4–5:1. Given the total enrollment of 6,881 trainees and 767 trainers in the country, the overall average trainee-trainer ratio in Swazi TVET institutions is only about 9:1 (Table 12). In particular, a number of observations imply that public providers are less efficient than both for-profit and non-profit private institutions. Collectively, the public institutions have more trainers for fewer trainees (6:1) than the for-profit (13:1) and non-profit (11:1) private institutions (Table 12). Furthermore, the

Table 11

Distribution of Size of TVET Institutions by Number of Trainees

No. of Trainees	No. of Institutions	Percentage of Total
10 or less	12	17%
Between 11–50	28	40%
Between 51–100	8	11%
Between 101-200	13	19%
Between 201-300	4	6%
Between 301-450	3	4%
More than 450	2	3%
Total	70	100%

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Figure 10

Distribution of Size of TVET Institutions by Type of Institution



Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Table 12

Trainee-to-Trainer Ratio by Type of Institution

Type of Institution	Trainee-to-Trainer Ratio
Public	6.04
Private	13.03
Other	10.66
Total Average	8.97

Source: The assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

enrollment in the public TVET institutions has declined in recent years, from 2,858 in 2007 to 2,482 in 2013 (down by 13 percent), while the number of trainers increased from 297 to 411 during the same period (up by 38 percent). As noted earlier, the public system serves only about a third of the total trainees, but supports more than half of the total trainers. These facts suggest that the public TVET institutions in Swaziland are performing under capacity.

Quality assurance

While the alignment of TVET provision with market needs is important to national development, the quality of TVET provision ultimately determines whether graduates have the actual skills required by the labor market to serve the national development needs. The quality of TVET depends on admission, trainer qualification, curriculum design, training methods, quality assurance mechanisms, governance and professional affiliation. Though this rapid assessment does not provide a complete picture of how the current TVET provision in Swaziland fares in these areas, certain observations on the quality of TVET can be made.

As noted above, very few TVET providers are registered with the government in Swaziland. This lack of registration makes it unclear which providers are eligible to provide TVET training in which areas. This puts the quality of TVET provision at risk.

In addition, as described in the section on Governance, there is no universal quality assurance mechanism for all TVET institutions in Swaziland. Some institutions do have established quality assurance bodies; however, their level of effectiveness is questionable. Some have affiliations with professional associations but just how constructive such affiliations are to the improvement of quality and

13

relevance needs more study. That quality is such an unclear area is largely because of the lack of an NQF. While the NQF is being developed, some work on quality improvement could be initiated, for example, capacity building programs on quality assurance.

Sustainability

Investment in TVET in Swaziland is limited. According to a previous study, the funding for TVET is between 2–3 percent of the total of public and private funding for education and training in the country.¹⁶ The government pays the salaries of those trainers classified as civil servants but 76 percent of Swazi TVET institutions claim they do not receive any subsidies from the government. The operating costs of most institutions are largely covered by tuition fees and donations. International experience shows that TVET provision is costly. Appropriate government investment and close partnerships between the public and private sector are needed if TVET is to have a good impact on national economic development. Purely relying on private investment may be insufficient for certain national priority areas for economic growth especially if the areas require heavy investment upfront. Government intervention is needed. The fact that there are so few training programs for the skills needed by the market, such as mechanical, electric, electronic and food processing technicians may be attributed to the heavy investment in equipment and special facilities required for such programs. Tuition fees alone are insufficient to finance these programs. Further investigation in this area is needed.

Since the financial condition of TVET institutions depends largely on tuition fees and government subsidies for trainer salaries, those institutions in regions with higher living standards tend to have higher tuitions and salaries. This is demonstrated in Table 13 based on the assessment survey. It is possible that tuition varies from program to program and from institution to institution both within each region and across the regions. For the same program, tuition could vary significantly across the regions. Using Business Management as an example, Table 14 shows the variation. Upon close examination of tuition fees across the regions, it becomes clear that the most expensive programs are offered by public TVET institutions. Whether such a financing model for TVET is sustainable in Swaziland and can serve the national development needs for skilled workers is questionable. Further research is needed to understand the variation of tuition fees and salaries across the regions in order to identify a sustainable financing model for the future development of TVET in the country.

The above analysis and discussion suggest that the resource constraint facing the TVET system will remain in Swaziland for a while. But, effort could be made to improve efficiency in the current TVET system such as increasing trainee-trainer ratio. For longer term development, a sustainable financing mechanism for TVET has to be established. Further development of public-private partnerships could be helpful for greater effectiveness and efficiency of TVET in Swaziland.

More than a third of the current TVET institutions are at the low secondary education level. Another 13 percent are special training centers that basically provide vocational

¹⁶ See above footnote #14.

Table 13

General Information about Tuition and Salary in TVET by Region

	Tuition			Salary					
Region	Min	Max	Average	Min	Мах	Average			
ННОННО	EO	E30,000	E5,071	E2,000	E63,000	E5,343			
LUBOMBO	EO	E37,000	E4,534	E2,300	E18,000	E5,406			
MANZINI	EO	E40,580	E5,468	E633	E20,000	E6,167			
SHISELWENI	EO	E6,000	E1,231	E2,450	E13,975	E6,476			
Total Average	_	—	E4,937	—	_	E5,800			

Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

Table 14

Tuition and Salary Summary of Business Management Program by Region

Region	No. of Offering Institutions	Average Tuition	Average Monthly Salary
ННОННО	11	E5,531	E4,368
LUBOMBO	1	E18,000	E4,000
MANZINI	7	E7,968	E4,271
SHISELWENI	1	EO	—
Total Average	_	E6,448	E4,324

Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

education (teaching/learning a particular low-level skill). These TVET institutions are different from those which focus more on technical education and training. For example, Swaziland College of Training enrolled over 900 trainees in 2013 and Ekuphakameni Rural Education Center enrolled only 4 trainees in 2013. Mixing the different types of TVET institutions may create great challenges for developing policy interventions that aim at addressing improvement needs for both. Breaking down TVET into two parts, one for vocational education and one for technical education/training, with different targeted groups and different qualification requirements, may help make improvement policies more effective and gain better results. Tanzania, for instance, started this separately now.

Priority Issue – Relevance

Of the many issues identified by the rapid assessment of TVET provision in Swaziland, the one requiring the most urgent attention is that of alignment to labor market needs. Economic recovery has been of primary concern to the government in recent years, and skills development through a TVET system well aligned with labor market needs is a critical part of that recovery.

As noted earlier, priority industries for development (tourism, food processing, manufacturing, and mining) have been identified; both earlier studies and the results of this rapid assessment suggest that alignment between current TVET provision and market needs is weak. For example, many institutions offer similar training programs–20 institutions offer computer programming and 19 offer training in fashion, but very few offer training related to food processing and hospitality.

An earlier review of public provision of TVET conducted by MoET in 2008 revealed low levels of satisfaction among employers and employees with TVET institutions and highlighted the challenges facing Swazi companies in finding appropriately-skilled workers in areas such as mechanical, electrical, electronic and computer technicians.¹⁷ The review also revealed that many TVET graduates had to receive retraining or skills upgrading once they were employed. It concluded that many TVET graduates were not job ready and that the TVET provision was more supply driven in the country.

Employability of graduates is a proxy for indicating the level of relevance and outcome of TVET provision. Based on the available data, this rapid assessment survey shows little change in the reported graduate employability in recent years. Over 70 percent of the trainees seem to find a job or become self-employed within 12 months after the completion of training. Graduates who completed their training from the private, for-profit institutions seem to have a better chance of finding a job than those from the public or non-profit institutions (Table 15).

Table 15

Percentage of Trainees Employed within 12 Months after Training Completion

Type of Institution	2011	2012
Public	65%	64%
Private	76%	76%
Others	57%	55%

Source: Assessment survey conducted jointly by the World Bank and MoET, May 2013.

¹⁷ "Policy Note on Skills and Foreign Direct Investment in Swaziland", World Bank, 2010.

Conclusion

he high youth unemployment rate and the stagnant economic development in Swaziland have raised expectations for skills development of young people entering the labor market. Whether the country's TVET system can meet these expectations is unclear. This rapid assessment conducted jointly by the MoET and the World Bank in 2013 provides a general picture of the current condition of TVET provision in the country. Swaziland has 70 TVET institutions which employ 767 trainers and offer 415 training programs in 60 areas to 6,881 trainees (of whom 56 percent are females). Fifty five percent of the training programs are short-term (less than 12 months) and many of them are vocational. The general completion rate is around 80 percent. Given the fact that only a third of the institutions are public and they enroll about a third of the total trainees, the private provision of TVET plays a significant role in skills development in the country. With a youth population (age 15-24) of roughly 314,000 and secondary school enrollment of roughly 90,000, the TVET provision caters to

very few people in Swaziland, and is far from sufficient in terms of meeting the needs of the country's economic recovery and growth. The principal weaknesses revealed from the assessment are: (i) poor efficiency of the system, especially in the public sector; (ii) limited range of programs, especially in the priority areas of national development (e.g., tourism and food processing); (iii) lack of strong quality assurance mechanisms at both national and institutional levels; and (iv) insufficient public investment in TVET. In particular, the alignment between current TVET provision and labor market needs is very weak. Many issues surfaced from this assessment can be attributed to the absence of sound regulatory and national qualification frameworks. The current provision of TVET in Swaziland is insufficient, incapable and not robust enough to equip the youth with necessary skills for the labor market and support the country's economic recovery. Further studies are needed in order to propose appropriate policy interventions for TVET improvement in Swaziland.

Appendices

Appendix A: A Rapid Assessment Study of Current TVET Provision in Swaziland

Until recently, the MoET's information on the TVET institutions was based on a 2008 survey that provided limited data on the number of institutions, their enrollment levels and key courses offered. The lack of good consistent data makes it very difficult for the MoET to align the TVETSD improvement plan with the national socioeconomic development agenda and to pursue a data-driven, evidence-based policymaking approach. The MoET approached the World Bank for technical assistance in assessing the status and establishing the baseline data for the TVET system in the country. In collaboration with the EMIS Department of the Ministry, a status assessment of TVET provision in Swaziland was conducted in May 2013. The intended purpose of this assessment study was to: 1) provide the MoET with information on efficiency, relevance and quality of the current TVET system; 2) gather baseline data to help the MoET design solutions for addressing the TVETSD challenges mentioned above in line with its overall strategy; and 3) establish a basic process and tools that could be used by the MoET to update the TVET data in future years.

Scope

This status assessment focuses on the current TVET provision in Swaziland. The data collected is at the institutional level from all TVET institutions (public, private and others) that could be identified. In order to make the collected data useful for decision-making in the future, data was collected in following 13 categories across all the identified TVET institutions:

- 1. Identification and general information
- 2. Number of trainees by program both short and long
- 3. Trainees' background
- 4. Selection methods for admission
- 5. Employment status of graduates by program
- 6. Program completion
- 7. Staff census
- 8. Training delivery modality

- 9. Quality and new program development
- 10. Building and equipment
- 11. Partnership and relationship
- 12. Cost of training
- 13. Governance and management

Methodology

The status assessment employs standard survey methodology to gather information on Swazi TVET institutions in areas important to delivering high quality, relevant training to skill seekers. The survey instrument is a questionnaire developed to capture basic information in the 13 categories listed above (see Appendix B for the entire questionnaire). Data collected was then aggregated at the institutional level, along with various dimensions to characterize the landscape of TVET provision in Swaziland. Data analyses were organized to provide an overview of the TVET institutions, their trainers, trainees and training programs respectively. The main findings are presented in this report.

In the absence of data on individual trainers and trainees, the questionnaire allows surveyed TVET institutions to provide average aggregated data in some categories to the best of their abilities, e.g., percentage of trainees who are employed after one year of completion of their training programs, average years of experience of trainers, etc.

Data Collection

Little is known about TVET institutions in Swaziland who they are, where they are, how many of them exist, etc. Identifying TVET institutions was a challenge to this study. Through newspaper advertisement, a stakeholder workshop, "word of mouth", and the list of TVET providers in the 2008 survey, 70 TVET institutions were identified and included in this survey.¹⁸

The survey was conducted during the last two weeks of May 2013. Based on the data collection, three datasets

¹⁸ Two institutions admit international students only and two institutions were contacted but did not want to participate in the survey. These four institutions are excluded in this study.

19

were constructed for analysis. The first dataset contains information about trainees and the facilities at each TVET institution surveyed (146 variables for general information on the 70 institutions). The second dataset contains each institution's personnel information (119 variables and 165 entries of trainers' occupations which include 34 unique values).¹⁹ The third dataset contains information on training programs provided by each TVET institution (63 variables and 420 entries of training programs which include 60 unique values).²⁰

¹⁹ See Appendix C.

²⁰ See Appendix D.

Appendix B: Survey Questionnaire





MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND TRAINING

Collection of Data from Vocational and Technical Training Providers from 2011 to 2013

I. Identification and General Information

1	Name of the Provider:
2	Code of the Provider (Not to be filled out)
3	District/Region:
4	Physical Address:
5	P.O. Box: _ Town:
6	Zone: 1=Urban 2=Rural
7	Telephone No.: Mobile No.:
8	Email: Website:
9	Year of Establishment: Year of Registration: Reg. No. (Not to be filled out)
10	Accreditation (if any): 1=Yes 2=No By whom:
11	Name of Ministry/NGO/Owner Reporting to:
12	Total Number of Trainees in 2013: Of Whom Are Females:
13	Total Number of Trainers/Instructors/Lecturers in 2013: Of Whom Are Females:
14	Name of Head of Institution: Gender: 1= Male 2= Female
15	Type of Institution: 1=Public, 2=Private, 3=NGO, 4=Church/Community-Based
16	Level of Institution: 1=Lower Secondary, 2=Upper Secondary,
17	Does your Institution have an operational Internet connection? 1=Yes 2=No
18	Respondent's Name: Title:
19	Respondent's Mobile No.:

Information collected in this survey will be kept confidential.

II. Number of Trainees in the Institution by Programme *II.1 Short-Term Programmes* (less than 12 months)

			Number of Trainees											
					То	tal					Fem	ales		
	Duration	If A grandition	20)11	20	12	20	13	20)11	20	12	20	13
Programme Title	(month)	by Whom	FT	PT	FT	РТ	FT	PT	FT	РТ	FT	РТ	FT	PT
							_							
											_			
											_			
											_			

Note: FT = full-time, PT = part-time

II.2 Long-Term Programmes (12 months and above)

							Nu	nber o	of Train	iees				
					То	tal					Fem	ales		
	Duration	If A coundited	20	11	20	12	20	13	20	11	20	12	20	13
Programme Title	(month)	by Whom	FT	PT	FT	PT	FT	PT	FT	РТ	FT	РТ	FT	РТ

Note: FT = full-time, PT = part-time.

23

III. Trainees — Background

Trainees' Origin	How Many of Them in 2013 School Year
With no schooling (who can neither read nor write)	
Literate (who can only read and write)	
Primary education	
Junior general secondary education	
Junior technical secondary education	
Upper-level general secondary education	
Upper-level technical secondary education	
Higher education	
Worker (in search of requalification or promotion)	
Retired	
Others (e.g. people seeking retraining)	
Note: The 'origin' here means the status of the trainee at the admission. The education lev Each trainee could be in two origin categories, e.g., a trainee is an employed worker and l	rel here means the highest level of education the trainee has received at the point of admission. has received upper-level general secondary education when he is admitted to the programme.

IV. Trainees — Selection Methods for Admission

Selection Method	Yes	No	% of Total Admitted
Through national examination			
Through interview for certain programs			
Through direct government assignments			
Others			

V. Employment Status of Graduates from Each Programme

Programme Title	% (within 12	% of Graduates Who Found Jobs (within 12 months after the completion of training)							
	2011	2012	2013						
te: "Jobs" here also includes self-employed.									

VI. Certification (end-of-programme certificates)

		Registered					Com	pleted th	e Progra	mme		
		Total			Females			Total			Females	
Programme Title	2011	2012	2013	2011	2012	2013	2011	2012	2013	2011	2012	2013

VII. Personnel Census

VII.1 Administrative and Support Staff

Staff Category	Males	Females	Total	Average Years of Experience	Average Age
Head of Department					
Registrar / Secretary					
Administrator / Principal					
Accountant					
Librarian					
Laboratory Assistant					
Other Support Staff					

VII.2 Training Staff

VII.2.1 Status of Trainers

Trainer's Status	Males	Females	Total	Average Years of Training Experience	Average Age
Civil Servants / Permanent					
School-Contracted Employees					
Part-Time					
Others					
Total					

Note: "Trainers" here is a general term for all trainers, instructors and lecturers who do the actual training.

VII.2.2 Trainers by Occupation and Experience

		Trainers			A
Occupation/Field	Males	Females	Total	How Many of Them Have Industry Experience	Average Years of Experience As A Trainer

VII.2.3 Teaching Staff by Academic Qualification

Academic Qualification	Males	Females	Total
Master's Degree			
Bachelor's Degree			
Higher National Diploma			
National Diploma			
National Certificate			
Other Academic Qualifications			
No Academic Qualification			
Total			

VIII. Training Delivery Modality

	not used	seldom used	often used
Classroom-Based Instruction (as a part of the institutional programme of instruction)	1	2	3
Laboratory/Workshop-Based Instruction (as a part of the institutional programme of instruction)	1	2	3
Internships in Private Sector (may also be known as on-the-job training)	1	2	3
Short-Term Classes (for requesting firms or special training needs of trainees)	1	2	3
School-Based Production (for income generation or work experience)	1	2	3
Adult Evening Courses (for employed workers in business and industry)	1	2	3
Apprenticeships (formal, with training contract) (an alternative to institutional training, but may include pre-apprenticeship training at the institution)	1	2	3
On-line Modules/Courses (as part of a course if it is a module or a stand-alone course)	1	2	3

IX. Quality and New Program Development

Is there a quality council/committee in the institution? 1=Yes 2=No	
Is there a designated staff in charge of quality in the institution? 1=Yes 2=No	
How many new training programmes have been launched during 2011–2013?	
How many months does it take in average to develop a new programme?	
Who makes decision on creating a new programme? 1=Academic Committee, 2=Governing Board, 3=Head of Institution, 4=Trainer/Instructor	
How much does it cost in average to develop a new program? 1=E150,000 2=E180,000 3=E200,000 4=E250,000 5=More	

27

X. Buildings and Equipment

X.1 Workshops, Laborate	ories, Specialised	Rooms and Classrooms
-------------------------	--------------------	----------------------

			Permaner	t Building	Temporary	y Building
Type of Building	How Many	No. of Seats or Work Stations	Good Condition	Poor Condition	Good Condition	Poor Condition
Ordinary Classrooms						
Specialised Classrooms						
Workshops / Laboratories						
Multimedia Resource Unit						
Offices (buildings)						
Library						
Student Dormitory						
Staff Accommodation Houses						
Others						

X.2 Information on Other Equipment and Facilities

XI. Partnership and Relationship

Does the institution have a relationship with any professional association? 1=Yes 2=No	
a) If yes, specify the type of relationship 1=Formal <i>(based on an existing agreement)</i> 2=Informal	
b) Specify the type of partners involved :	
Public institutions Professional organisations	
□ Private companies □ Civil society (NGO)	
SMEs Others	
c) Specify the purpose of the partnership:	
□ Financial assistance □ Supply of equipment	
□ Work-study programme □ Internship	
□ Seminar/conference □ Technical projects with companies	
\square On-going training of company personnel \square Professionals in the management committee	
capacity building	
Company visit 🗆 Others, specify	
d) Has your institution received any financial assistance in the following nature in 2012,:	
Apprenticeship Tax Deduction	1=Yes 2=No
Donations	1=Yes 2=No
Grants	1=Yes 2=No
Internship fees	1=Yes 2=No
Government Subsidy	1=Yes 2=No
Scholarships	1=Yes 2=No
Others	

XII. Cost of Training

Programme Title	Duration of Training (month)	No. of Trainees	Tuition Fee	Registration Fee	No. of Trainers	Average Trainer's Monthly Salary

XIII. Governance and Management

Does the institution have a governing board? 1=Yes 2=No	
a) If yes, how many people on the Board? and	
how many of them come from industries?	
b) If yes, can the Board make independent decisions for the institution?	1=Yes 2=No
Does the institution have a management team?	1=Yes 2=No
a) If yes, how many staff on this team? and	
how many of them are females?	
b) If yes, can this team make independent decisions on personnel and academic affairs?	1=Yes 2=No
Is there an established feedback mechanism to get training market information for updating the training programmes and content?	1=Yes 2=No

Questionnaire Filling Date (day/month/year):	
Signature or Stamp of the Head of Institution	

Appendix C: Summary of TVET Institutions by Region

Areas	Name of Institutions	No of Trainees in 2013	No of Female Trainees in 2013	No of Trainers in 2013	No of Female Trainers in 2013	Type of Institutions
ннонно	AMADI UNIVERSITY COLLEGE	431	395	45	14	Private
	BOOKVILLE INSTITUTION	32	23	5	2	Private
	BSA TRAINING CENTRE	33	3	2	1	Private
	CENTRE FOR INTERNATIONAL TECHNOLOGY	370	293	6	2	Private
	COLLEGE OF MANAGEMENT STUDIES	34	18	5	0	Private
	CORPORATE TRAINING & DEVELOPMENT CENTRE	61	53	11	9	Private
	DVOKOLWAKO RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	8	8	2	2	Church/ Community- Based
	EDUGATE	40	38	2	2	NGO
	KUSILE KITCHEN	14	14	2	2	Private
	LUTSANGO LWAKANGWANE VOCATIONAL CENTRE (MBABANE)	5	5	1	1	Church/ Community- Based
	NATIONAL HANDICRAFT TRAINING CENTRE	0	0	19	5	Public
	NTFONJENI RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	21	8	2	0	Public
	PIGG'S PEAK DIGITAL OPPORTUNITY CENTRE	90	43	1	1	Public
	PROVIDENC E INTERNATIONAL TRAINING CENTRE	150	90	21	7	Private
	SEBENTA NATIONAL INSTITUTE	138	93	220	200	Public
	SIDWASHINI VOCATIONAL TRAINING&REHABILITATION CENTRE	30	11	3	1	Public
	SWAZILAND COLLEGE OF TRAINING	945	337	46	23	Public
	VISION INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT INSTITUTE	28	11	6	3	Private
	VUSUMNOTFO	200	150	8	5	NGO
	WESCO	145	112	9	2	Private
	WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT (NTFONJENI)	20	19	4	1	Public
	WORKERS MANAGEMENT TRAINING CENTRE	130	80	7	6	Private
	SPTC TRAINING CENTRE	0	0	4	0	Private
	DIRECTORATE OF INDUSTRIAL AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING	268	18			Public
HHOHHO Tota	al	3193	1822	431	289	46
LUBOMBO	BIG BEND RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	50	27	5	5	Church/ Community- Based
	GOODSHEPARD NURSING SCHOOL	60	44	8	6	Public
	LUBOMBO COMMUNITY MULTIMEDIA CENTRE	20	18	3	1	NGO

(Continued on next page)

Continued

Areas	Name of Institutions	No of Trainees in 2013	No of Female Trainees in 2013	No of Trainers in 2013	No of Female Trainers in 2013	Type of Institutions
	MPAKA VOCATIONAL	104	32	11	2	Public
	SITEKI INDUSTRIAL TRAINING CENTRE	88	24	12	4	NGO
	SITHOBELA RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	11	8	2	1	Public
	U-TECH COLLEGE	349	96	10	2	Private
	VUVLANE RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	10	10	2	2	Public
	WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT (SIPHOFANENI)	23	21	6	4	Public
	WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT (SITHOBELWENI)	9	6	2	2	Public
LUBOMBO To	tal	724	286	61	29	18
MANZINI	365 HAIR DOCTOR TRAINING CENTRE	0	0	1	1	Private
	AFRICAN AMERICAN INSTITUTE FOR MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT	25	4	8	5	Private
	BUHLE CATERING SCHOOL	170	158	2	2	Private
	CITEC	250	200	11	1	Private
	COMPUTEACH	32	26	8	4	Private
	EKULULAMENI TRAINING CENTRE	53	14	7	4	Church/ Community- Based
	EKUPHAKAMENI RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	4	4	1	1	Public
	EKUPHILENI KWASESITJENI SKILL CENTRE	19	18	1	1	Public
	GWAMILE VOCTIM	139	40	27	6	Public
	HILLSIDE COLLEGE	114	92	11	5	Public
	INSTITUTE OF DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT	279	175	11	1	Public
	INTERNATIONAL EXECUTIVE TRAINING CENTRE	18	0	3	0	Public
	KUSILE KITCHEN	9	8	2	2	Private
	LULWIMI LETANDLA MANAGEMENT CONSULTANCY	60	48	3	1	Private
	LUTSANGO LWAKANGWANE VOCATIONAL CENTRE (MANZINI)	13	12	1	1	Public
	MALKERNS VOCATIONAL TRAINING & REHABILITATION CENTRE	10	2	1	0	Public
	MANZINI INDUSTRIAL TRAING CENTRE	206	30	19	1	NGO
	MANZINI YOUTH CARE	183	66	23	3	NGO
	MTDI Management Institute	20	12	6	2	Private

(Continued on next page)

31

Continued

Areas	Name of Institutions	No of Trainees in 2013	No of Female Trainees in 2013	No of Trainers in 2013	No of Female Trainers in 2013	Type of Institutions
	NGWANE PARK YOUTH TRAINING CENTRE	192	106	14	6	Church/ Community- Based
	OXFORD BUSINESS INSTITUTE	500	400	20	9	Private
	OZONE BEAUTY CENTRE	30	30	5	5	Public
	ST JULIAN CONVENT	5	5	2	2	Church/ Community- Based
	STAN CATERING	20	17	2	2	Private
	SWAZILAND BUSINESS CONSULTANCY	26	21	14	6	Private
	UNIVERSE TECHNIKON	46	7	9	0	Private
	WORKERS COLLEGE	178	90	17	7	Private
MANZINI Total		2601	1585	229	78	53
SHISELWENI	ELULAKENI RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	14	7	2	1	Public
	MANTECH TRAINING CENTRE	60	45	5	2	Private
	NGWANE RURAL EDUCATION CENTRE	5	5	2	2	Church/ Community- Based
	NHLANGANO AGRICULTURE SKILLS TRAINING CENTRE	114	23	11	1	Private
	NHLANGANO DOC(DIGITAL OPPORTUNITY CENTRE)	22	17	1	1	NGO
	NHLANGANO FARMERS TRAINING CENTRE(AGRICULTURE)	60	44	15	4	Public
	NHLANGANO VOCATIONAL TRAINING & REHABILITATION SERVICES	30	8	3	1	Public
	PRO INSTITUTE	35	13	3	3	Private
	WOMEN IN DEVELOPMENT (MAHAMBA)	23	19	4	4	Public
SHISELWENI T	otal	363	181	46	19	17
Grand Total		6881	3874	767	415	134

Appendix D: Training Programs Offered by TVET Institutions

1	Sawing	31	Machanical Engineering
I	Sewing	21	Motor mechanics
2	Gardening	32	Upholstery
3	Agriculture	33	Plumbing
4	Information Technology MICROSOFT MCITP CISCO CCNA COMPTIA A+ N+	34	Metal Work
5	Carpentry	35	Ceramics
6	Leather Craft	36	Dress and Fashion
7	ERP Training	37	Business Management
8	House Wiring and Electrical Work	38	Relief Development
9	Literacy	39	Medical Work
10	Catering/Hospitality	40	Accounting/Finance/Electronic Payment System
11	Decoration	41	Power System
12	Baking	42	Civil Engineering
13	Computer Desktop Publication & Web Design Graphic Design	43	Public Sector Expenditure
14	Secretarial Work	44	Data Processing
15	Electronics	45	AAT (UK accounting certification program)
16	Telecommunication & Electronics	46	ACCA (accounting certification program)
17	Preschool Teachers Training	47	Certified Accounting Technician
18	Construction	48	Water and Waste Waster
19	Bead Work	49	Project Implementation
20	Grass Work	50	Accident and Incident Investigation
21	Skills for Daily Living	51	Occupational Health and Safety
22	Nursing, home care, care facilitation	52	Community Development
23	Waiting	53	Library
24	ICT	54	Travel and Tourism
25	Sign Language	55	UAT (User Acceptance Testing)
26	Art and craft	56	In-House Training
27	Home industry	57	Outreach
28	Food and nutrition	58	ECCD (Early Childhood Care and Development)
29	Education/family life education	59	Journalism
30	Fabrication	60	PABX (Private Automatic Branch Exchange)

Appendix E: Trainer Occupations Identified in the Survey

1	Hairdresser	18	Motor Mechanics Engineers
2	Sewing Instructor	19	Fabrication
3	Computer IT Technician	20	Upholstery
4	Gardening	21	Plumbing Electrician
5	Home-economist	22	Fine Arts Wood Carving
6	Secretary Coordinator	23	Electronics
7	Accountants	24	Ceramics
8	Journalism	25	Metal Work
9	Preschool Teacher	26	Home Craft Leather Craft
10	Rehabilitation	27	Communication Public Administration and Sociology
11	Cabinet Making Carpentry	28	Welder
12	Building and Construction	29	Entrepreneur Marketing Management Financial Management
13	Agriculture Farmers	30	HIV AIDS Counselors
14	Fashion Design	31	CIDESCO/ITEC
15	Instructors Tutors Teacher AAT Lecture	32	Caterers Hospitality
16	Nursing	33	Community Development Officer Human Resource Officer Mechanical Officer
17	Sign Language Instructor	34	Food Processing & Preservation



THE WORLD BANK

1818 H Street, NW Washington, DC 20433