



National Targeted Programs Support Project (P159737)

EAST ASIA AND PACIFIC | Vietnam | Agriculture and Food Global Practice | Requesting Unit: EACVF | Responsible Unit: SEAAG
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2017 | Team Leader(s): Hardwick Tchale, Carolina V. Figueroa-Geron, Nghi Quy Nguyen

Seq No: 6 | ARCHIVED on 25-Feb-2021 | ISR45530 | Created by: Hardwick Tchale on 02-Feb-2021 | Modified by: Hardwick Tchale on 21-Feb-2021

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

To improve the delivery of, and access to, investments for increasing agricultural production and enhancing livelihood opportunities within the Program area.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	☐ Moderately Unsatisfactory	☐ Moderately Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	☐ Moderately Satisfactory	☐ Moderately Satisfactory

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

Overall Progress Update: Overall, the verified results are quite positive in that Disbursement Targets for cumulative DLIs 2, and 7 have been substantially met, while the annual Year 3 (2019) targets for DLIs 3 and 5 were also met. The extent of achievement of DLIs 8.2 and 8.3 is pending further verification with regard to delays observed in updating physical and financial data in the provincial and national websites. Based on achievements documented in the first Verification report for DLIs 2,3,5 and 7, SDR 33.146 million (equivalent to US\$46 million) has been approved and this has increased overall disbursement to increase from 19% to 48% of the total credit.

Next steps: The next implementation support mission (which will also be the Mid-term review) will be undertaken in March 2021 to reach a final agreement on the scope for restructuring and cancellation of part of the credit. Following the restructuring/MTR mission, the team will proceed with the restructuring to be formally submitted for Bank approval before the end of June 2021. The task team will continually keep following up closely on the implementation of the second verification and end line surveys, to ensure the reports are provided on time for the submission of the final withdrawal application before the project closes on December 31, 2021.

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P159737	IDA-61130	Effective	USD	153.00	153.00	0.00	76.79	81.63	48%

Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P159737	IDA-61130	Effective	28-Jun-2017	28-Dec-2018	15-May-2019	31-Dec-2021	31-Dec-2021



DLI Disbursement

DLI ID	DLI Type	Description	Coc	DLI Amount	Achievement Status	Disbursed amount in Coc	Disbursement % for DLI
Loan: IDA61130-001							
DL#1	Prior Results Financing DLI	Issuance of P&GI for NRD&SRP-P135	XDR	14,580,000.00	Fully Achieved	14,579,999.87	100 %
DL#2	Regular	# of Participating Prov w/ NTP-SEDP IPP	XDR	10,940,000.00	Fully Achieved	10,940,000.00	100 %
DLI#3	Regular	% of Infra Inv Sub-pr in complying w/ EO	XDR	21,850,000.00	Partially Achieved	8,737,000.00	40 %
DLI#4	Regular	%increase in ethnic min&satisfied women	XDR	7,300,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DLI#5	Regular	%of Livelihood Supp Sub-pr complying EOM	XDR	21,850,000.00	Partially Achieved	7,637,000.00	35 %
DLI#6	Regular	%points increase in HHs sharew/ add'l DI	XDR	7,300,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DLI#7	Regular	#of officers at prov,dist,commune EOM tr	XDR	7,300,000.00	Partially Achieved	5,832,000.00	80 %
DL8.1	Regular	#of mon&evel framewrks dev NRD&SPR-P135	XDR	3,640,000.00	Fully Achieved	3,639,999.96	100 %
DL8.2	Regular	#of part prov w/ operational NRD-MIS	XDR	6,550,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DL8.3	Regular	#of publ accessible websitesNRD&SPR-P135	XDR	3,640,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DLI#9	Regular	Baseline&end-line track survey NRD&SPR-P	XDR	6,550,000.00	Partially Achieved	3,275,000.07	50 %

Program Action Plan

Action Description	Develop an M&E framework for NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 and roll out an MIS for NRD with financial information from TABMIS: (i) M&E Framework Submitted for NRD and SPR-P135; (ii)Operational MIS for NRD with physical and financial reporting updated quarterly				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Due Date	29-Jun-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement	M&E Framework document discussed during the mission.				
Comments	M&E Framework was developed and approved together with the EOM. There were initial challenges with the rolling out of an MIS for NRD and the link with financial information from TABMIS. However, these challenges are gradually being addressed.				

Action Description	Set up and maintain a web portal for citizen to leave feedbacks and complaints (on corruption/ procurement/program planning process). (text to be continued in comment section)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Due Date	29-Mar-2019	Completed



Completion Measurement	Website to record feedbacks and complaints developed.
Comments	

Action Description	Contract a Capacity Building Program (CBP) Officer in the NRD and SPR-P135 NCOs to oversee the implementation of the CBP to support national, provincial, district and commune level training under TORs acceptable to the Bank.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Due Date	30-Sep-2020	In Progress
Completion Measurement	In progress				
Comments					

Action Description	Enhanced Operations Manual for Planning, Infrastructure and livelihoods approved and Instructions issued for the use of the targeted Program provinces, districts and communes (text to be continued in comment section)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEM	Due Date	29-Mar-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	completed and approved.				
Comments					

Action Description	The Bank's most updated lists of debarred and suspended firms and individuals, as a complement to the national debarment list, adopted and regularly shared, coordinated and monitored by the two NCOs, (text to be continued at comment)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		MARD and CEMA	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress
Completion Measurement	Continuous updating required.				
Comments	NCO has reported difficulty in accessing this information from the Bank. It has been agreed that the Bank would follow-up to resolve this problem.				

Action Description	In conjunction with the enhanced operations manual, and in conformity with Vietnamese Legislation, issue community/citizen, gender-sensitive guidelines, in both a language and format understood and accessible to beneficiaries, (continue in comment)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Included in the approved EOM				
Comments	Included in the approved EOM				



Action Description	Issuance of a “Voluntary Land Donation Guideline” to be included in the enhanced operations manual for adoption by the targeted Program provinces which would provide for “Voluntary Donation” (text continues in comments section)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		MARD and CEM	Due Date	29-Mar-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Approved together with the EOM.				
Comments					

Action Description	Conduct of baseline and end-line survey for the 2 NTPs				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEM	Due Date	29-Nov-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Baseline survey report completed and approved.				
Comments					

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Macroeconomic	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Sector Strategies and Policies	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Technical Design of Project or Program	<input type="checkbox"/> High	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	<input type="checkbox"/> High	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Fiduciary	<input type="checkbox"/> High	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Environment and Social	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Stakeholders	<input type="checkbox"/> High	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Other	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Overall	<input type="checkbox"/> High	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate

Comments

The residual risk after the first successful verification is Moderate. This is an improvement over the Substantial rating before the first verification was completed.



The residual Procurement Risks has been reduced to Low after all mitigation measures being recommended in the Action Plan recorded in PRAMS have been taken, given the following: All procurement activities under the project are of small value and low complexity. There exist clear regulations specifically guiding implementation of project activities, which are reasonably adequate to promote transparency, economy and efficiency for the Program, and subject to compliance with the Program Action Plan (PAP) for procurement related actions. The first Independent verification for the project implementation by SAV was initiated in May 2020 then the first audit report was shared & discussed with the Bank within October 2020. Roll-out of the SAV Independent verification was delayed due to travel restrictions as an impact of COVID-19. Possible risks of Fraud & Corruption practices (at small scales) at 18 project provinces. Two options for project restructuring with possible risks of partial cancellation of loan funds have been following up on both sides for final decision to be made in March 2021.

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Improved Program Planning and Governance				
▶ Number of participating provinces with an NTP-SEDP integrated planning process (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	18.00	18.00
Date	28-Jun-2017	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	As confirmed through the first verification report.			
Increased Access to Program Investments				
▶ Share of households with additional diversified income sources (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	60.00	0.00	0.00	80.00
Date	28-Jun-2017	30-Jun-2020	30-Oct-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	This result will be measured through the end-line survey which will be conducted in Q2/Q3 of 2021. The baseline figure is based on the baseline survey which was undertaken prior to the project effectiveness.			
Increased Access to Program Investments				
▶ Share of ethnic minorities and women satisfied with access to, and quality of community assets or services for increasing agricultural production and livelihoods. (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	40.00	40.00	40.00	60.00
Date	31-Aug-2018	30-Jun-2020	30-Oct-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	This will be measured during the end line survey to be conducted this year (2021).			

Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas



Improved Program Planning and Governance				
► Issuance of Policy and Guidance instruments for the NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 that include PforR agreed planning, technical and implementation improvements/reforms (Text, Custom) (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	None	2 Decisions issued for implementation of NTP-NRD and NTP-SPR issued in August and Sept 2016	2 Decisions issued for implementation of NTP-NRD and NTP-SPR issued in August and Sept 2016	Two decisions issued for NTP-NRD and NTP-SPR
Date	30-Jun-2016	30-Jun-2020	28-Mar-2019	30-Aug-2016
Comments	Achieved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			
► Issuance of Policy and Guidance instruments for the NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	30-Jun-2020	28-Mar-2019	30-Aug-2016
Comments	Achieved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			
► Number of targeted Program provinces with plans prepared in a participatory manner (bottom-up) with community involvement with effective consultations of ethnic minorities and women (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	18.00	18.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Confirmed through the first verification.			

Improved quality of program investments				
► Issuance of enhanced operations manual for socio-economic infrastructure for both the NTP-NRD and SPR-135 (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	None	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	One comprehensive enhanced operations manual with several volumes issued
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	28-Mar-2019	30-Jun-2018
Comments	Achieved. EOM finalized and cleared during the first ISM. GoV have also issued their approval/clearance note on the EOM.			
► Percentage of infrastructure investment sub-projects implemented in compliance with the enhanced operations manual (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target



Value	0.00	0.00	73.00	90.00
Date	31-Aug-2018	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	This is confirmed as per the first verification report.			
► Issuance of ed standardized procedures for scaling up climate-resilient livelihood and enterprise support established for both the NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 informed by value chain analysis (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	None	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	One comprehensive enhanced operations manual with several volumes issued
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	28-Mar-2019	31-Oct-2017
Comments	Reported as achieved as part of the EoM and to be verified as part of the first verification currently underway.			
► Percentage of livelihood support subprojects implemented in compliance with the enhanced operations manual (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	90.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	To be verified as part of the first verification currently underway.			

Increased Access to Program Investments				
► Percentage of spending linked to value-chain based and climate-resilient livelihood investments (separately for NRD and SPR-P135) (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	68.00	30.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Verified through the first verification process.			

Improved Program Monitoring and Management				
► Number of officers at the provincial, district, commune and village-level trained in the use of the enhanced operations manual (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	39,948.00	50,000.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Verified achievement.			



▶ Number of monitoring reports submitted to the NTP steering committee with updated information on end of year implementation status and reporting of Program impacts at completion (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	6.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	Achieved.			
▶ Number of monitoring and evaluation (M&E) frameworks developed for NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Oct-2017
Comments	Achieved.			
▶ Number of participating provinces with an operational NRD-MIS web-based platform, including semi-annual reports with physical outputs and financial information from TABMIS (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	18.00	18.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2019
Comments	Yet to be verified during the second verification exercise to be conducted from March to June 2021.			
▶ Number of publicly accessible websites publishing semi-annual reports on physical progress and financial information on NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Achieved.			
▶ Baseline and end-line tracking survey for NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	1.00	1.00	2.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Aug-2021
Comments	Baseline survey report finalized and approved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			

Disbursement Linked Indicators

▶ DLI 1 Issuance of the Policy and Guidance Instruments for the NRD and SPR-P135 (Output, 20.00, 0%)



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	28-Mar-2019	--
Comments	Prior action, done already. Notification of achievement submitted to the Bank.			

► DLI 2 Number of Participating Provinces with an NTP-SEDP integrated planning process (Intermediate Outcome, 15.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	18.00	18.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			

► DLI 3 Percentage of Infrastructure Investment Sub-projects implemented in compliance with the Enhanced Operations Manual (Intermediate Outcome, 30.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	73.00	90.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			

► DLI 4 Percentage points increase of ethnic minorities and women satisfied with access and quality of community assets or services for increasing agricultural production and livelihoods (Outcome, 10.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	20.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Not yet achieved. To be measured through the end line survey to be conducted in 2021.			

► DLI 5 Percentage of Livelihood Support Sub-projects implemented in compliance with the Enhanced Operations Manual (Intermediate Outcome, 30.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	68.00	90.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			



► DLI 6 Percentage points increase in the share of households with additional diversified income sources (Outcome, 10.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	20.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Not yet achieved. To be measured through the end line survey.			

► DLI 7 Number of officers at the provincial-, district-, commune- and village-level trained in the use of the Enhanced Operations Manual (Output, 10.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	39,948.00	50,000.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			

► DLI 8 Development of an M&E framework for NTP-NRD & SPR/P135 and roll out of an MIS for NRD with financial information from TABMIS with program information published online via public disclosure portal (Intermediate Outcome, 19.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Reported as achieved. Notification submitted to the Bank and cleared in April 2020. Allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			

DLI 8.1 Number of monitoring and evaluation (M&E) frameworks developed for NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 (Intermediate Outcome, 5.00, 0%)
Unit of Measure: Number
Indicator Type:

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Achieved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			

DLI 8.2 Number of participating provinces with an operational NRD-MIS web-based platform including semi-annual reports with physical outputs and financial information from the TABMIS (Intermediate Outcome, 9.00, 0%)
Unit of Measure: Number
Indicator Type:



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	18.00	18.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Not yet achieved. Reported as achieved, but to be verified through the second verification.			
<p>□ DLI 8.3 Number of publicly accessible websites publishing semi-annual reports on physical progress and financial information on NRD and SPR-P135 (Output, 5.00, 0%)</p> <p>Unit of Measure: Number</p> <p>Indicator Type:</p>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Oct-2020	--
Comments	Not yet achieved. Reported as achieved but needs to be verified during the second verification.			

► DLI 9 Baseline and end-line tracking survey for NRD and SPR-P135 (Output, 9.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	1.00	1.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Baseline report finalized and approved. Endline survey is scheduled for Q2 2021.			