



Better Education Service Delivery for All (P160430)

AFRICA WEST | Nigeria | Education Global Practice | Requesting Unit: AWCW2 | Responsible Unit: HAW3
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2017 | Team Leader(s): Thanh Thi Mai, Aisha Garba Mohammed, Ikechukwu John Azubike Nweje

Seq No: 7 | ARCHIVED on 20-Oct-2021 | ISR45242 | Created by: Thanh Thi Mai on 10-Jan-2021 | Modified by: Thanh Thi Mai on 14-Oct-2021

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

To increase equitable access for out-of-school children and improve literacy in focus states, and strengthen accountability for results, in basic education in Nigeria.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderately Satisfactory	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderately Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderately Satisfactory	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderately Satisfactory

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

Under Results Area 1 - Increasing equitable access for out-of-school (OOS) children in focus states - the NEDS 2020 completed in March 2020 confirmed a 27 percent expansion of the basic education system. This included an increase of the number of children ages 6 to 15 attending schools 17 focus states from 15,384,718 in 2015 (NEDS2015) to 19,591,100 in 2020 (NEDS2020). 924,590 OOSC (633,772 girls and 290,818 boys) were estimated as the reduction in OOSC between 2015 and 2020, and this narrowed the gender gap in access to basic education as the number of OOS girls was twice that among OOS boys. Also, significant progress had been recorded in provision of basic education through the non-formal learning centers (NFLCs) to over 4 million OOSC across the 17 focus states. For Results Area 2 (improving literacy rates in focus states), 11 out of 17 focus states registered improvement in literacy rates between NEDS2015 and NEDS2020, and all 17 focus states had adopted one or more form of intensive literacy program across 21, 035 formal basic education schools. Under Results Area 3 (Strengthening accountability for results), the Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC) completed the 2018 annual review of the Universal Basic Education (UBE) program, all states have prepared 2017-2019 state basic education strategic plans and FME/UBEC- BESDA is finalizing modalities for verification of states' efforts by commissioning field verification exercise by independent verification agents.

BESDA significant results in the two major outcome areas: (i) reduction in the Out of School Children; and (ii) improvement in the literacy rates had enabled the World Bank to disburse \$192.4m to 14 out of 17 focus states who recorded progress in these outcomes.

At the government's request, BESDA has been restructured to: (i) make interventions for out of school children more specific to the different types of OOS; (ii) support the government in mitigating the impacts of COVID19 pandemic; and (iii) update the result framework and targets based on the latest data on school attendance and literacy from the NEDS2020.

Two new DLIs are added to BESDA result area 1 (Reduction of Out of School Children) in 17 focus states:

DLI 6: Increased access of OOS children to non-formal basic education

DLI 7: Grants for improving school attendance

Verification of DLI achievement in school years 2019/20 and 2020/21. The NBS has been engaged to conduct verification of school level results for DLI 2, 4, 6 and 7 for the two school year results. NBS has prepared the verification protocol covering each type of schools (formal and non-formal) in both focus and non-focus states and pilot-tested this protocol in 6 states. Because the COVID-19 pandemic resulted in different school calendars in different states, NBS has now launched the fieldwork which will be in two phases: Phase 1 in August and September covering 18 states and Phase 2 in September and October (19 states and FCT). NBS is expected to finalize the field work by the end of October and submit the verification report in November 2021

Preparation for BESDA implementation during 2021/22 school year. BESDA team (UBEC and FME) has worked with all participating states to prepare the detailed implementation plans for the remaining DLIs (2, 4, 5, 6 and 7) that will need to be carried out in school year 2021/22. Targets for each of this DLI has been presented, discussed, agreed and documented in the mission AM. If the targets are achieved by states and verified by the NBS (for DLI 2, 4, 6, and 7) and other independent verification agents (for DLI 5), BESDA will be able to finance up to a total of US\$150 million for 17 focus states and US\$30 million for the remaining 19 states and FCT by the end of 2020/21 school year. It is critical that UBEC work with all the 36 states including FCT to implement BESDA delivery plans and FMFBNP and FME ensure verification for the 2021/22 school year will be launched in March 2022.



Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P160430	IDA-60950	Effective	USD	578.00	578.00	0.00	288.63	311.63	48%
P160430	IDA-60960	Effective	USD	33.00	33.00	0.00	17.54	16.74	51%

Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P160430	IDA-60950	Effective	20-Jun-2017	29-Sep-2017	22-Jan-2018	31-Oct-2022	31-Oct-2022
P160430	IDA-60960	Effective	20-Jun-2017	29-Sep-2017	22-Jan-2018	31-Oct-2022	31-Oct-2022

DLI Disbursement

DLI ID	DLI Type	Description	Coc	DLI Amount	Achievement Status	Disbursed amount in Coc	Disbursement % for DLI
Loan: IDA60950-001							
1	Regular	Reduced no. out sch children	XDR	249,100,000.00	Partially Achieved	122,040,012.56	49 %
2	Regular	Sch Adopting Pri 1-2 intensive Lit. prog	XDR	87,500,000.00	Partially Achieved	11,594,643.88	13 %
3	Regular	Improve Literacy Rates	XDR	43,800,000.00	Partially Achieved	33,100,000.00	76 %
4	Regular	Total States Imp and pub. Annual Sch Cen	XDR	15,300,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	0 %
5	Regular	Total States Compl. Basic Ed Plan	XDR	25,900,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	0 %

Program Action Plan

Action Description	Computerize UBEC's accounting system				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	30-Jun-2020	In Progress
Completion Measurement	Software purchased and deployed.				
Comments	UBEC is in the process of procuring the accounting software.				

Action Description	UBEC will assign at least one internal auditor to conduct ex-post systemic and risk-based audits of the Program and report quarterly to the UBEC Executive Secretary and the Federal Ministry of Education Permanent Secretary
---------------------------	--



Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	30-Jun-2020	Completed
Completion Measurement	Internal Auditor assigned.				
Comments	Internal Auditors in UBEC are preparing risk-based audits based on the external audits results and recommendations				

Action Description	Progressively clear backlog of UBEC's unaudited financial statements				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	UBEC financial statement audits completed				
Comments	Audit up to 2019 completed, submitted and reviewed by the Bank. 2020 audit report is being prepared.				

Action Description	Mainstream open contracting across Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC) interventions				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress
Completion Measurement	Open Contract deployed.				
Comments	Bureau of Public Procurement (BPP) has deployed the Open Contract Development Standard with UBEC and BPP has issued a guidance note to all ministries, departments, and agencies (MDAs) including UBEC.				

Action Description	Apply service standards for submission of Withdrawal Applications and timely transfer of states' share of financing proceeds to states through Government processes for results achieved by the states under the disbursement-linked indicators				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress
Completion Measurement	Timely transfers of DLIs funds to states.				
Comments	DLI payments were transferred to states in September 2021.				

Action Description	Conduct post-procurement review of State Universal Basic Education Boards (SUBEBs) on a rotational basis				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Post-review conducted.				
Comments	UBEC conducted post-review in December 2019				



Action Description	Operationalize fraud and corruption/complaints redress mechanism				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	22-Jan-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Fraud and corruption/complaints redress mechanism established.				
Comments					

Action Description	Prepare and mainstream environmental and social guidelines based on national and state laws and regulations as well as good international practice on land acquisition, grievance redress mechanisms, and measures for environmental and social management				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress
Completion Measurement	Government safeguards policies in compliance.				
Comments					

Action Description	Conduct Universal Basic Education program evaluation				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		Client	Due Date	31-Dec-2020	Completed
Completion Measurement	UBE program evaluated.				
Comments	UBE program evaluation report 2018 published				

Action Description	Conduct annual monitoring of progress on environmental and social issues				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Safeguards monitoring conducted.				
Comments					

Action Description	Establish a communication plan for stakeholder engagement and comply with requirements on proactive information disclosure from the Freedom of Information Act				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	In Progress



Completion Measurement	Communication plan established and implemented.
Comments	

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	High	Substantial	Substantial
Macroeconomic	High	Substantial	Substantial
Sector Strategies and Policies	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate
Technical Design of Project or Program	Substantial	Substantial	Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	Substantial	Substantial	Moderate
Fiduciary	High	High	Substantial
Environment and Social	Moderate	Substantial	Moderate
Stakeholders	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate
Other	--	--	--
Overall	Substantial	Substantial	Moderate

Comments

Change in Technical design risk: The program has been restructured to address the design weakness identified during the implementation.
 Change in Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability: The program is well anchored in the government both at the federal and state levels and the achievement of the results is evidence of improved capacity to deliver.
 Change in Social risk: The program has made substantial progress on safeguarding social risks including: training for program officers on SEA/SH prevention conducted by WB Gender-based violence expert; detailed GBV Action Plan developed, and a Safeguard/GBV Specialists has been hired to lead its implementation at UBEC; and non-focus states are being supported to set up safeguard structures.
 While the Political, Governance, Macro and Fiduciary risks stay at "Substantial", progress in technical design, institutional capacity and social safeguards has enable the overall risk rating to "Moderate".

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Increase equitable access for out-of-school children in focus states				
▶ Reduced number of out-of-school children in focus states, by gender (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	924,590.00	924,590.00	1,300,000.00



Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	31-Oct-2022
Comments				
Improve literacy in focus states				
▶ Improved literacy rates in focus states, by state (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	11.00	11.00	17.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2021	31-Aug-2021	31-Oct-2022
Comments				
Strengthen accountability for results in basic education in Nigeria				
▶ Publicly disclosed Universal Basic Education program strategic plan reflecting annual progress reports and program evaluation findings (Yes/No, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2021	31-Aug-2021	31-Oct-2022
Comments	UBEC 2018 annual report completed, reviewed and publicly disclosed.			

Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Increase equitable access for out-of-school children in focus states				
▶ Average pupil/latrine ratio, by state and urban/rural (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	440.00	141.00	141.00	0.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	24-Dec-2019	24-Dec-2019	31-Oct-2022
Comments	This indicator will be removed as per the restructuring when the portal sync with the restructuring is done.			
▶ Average pupil/class ratio, by state and urban/rural (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	32.80	44.00	44.00	32.10
Date	30-Jun-2016	24-Dec-2019	24-Dec-2019	31-Oct-2022
Comments	This indicator will be removed as per the restructuring when the portal sync with the restructuring is done.			



Improve literacy in focus states				
▶ Schools adopting primary 1-3 intensive literacy programs in focus states (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	21,247.00	21,247.00	20,000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2021	31-Oct-2022
Comments				
▶ Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning (Number, Corporate)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	1,792,883.00	3,800,000.00	3,600,000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2021	31-Oct-2022
Comments				
▶ Teachers recruited or trained (Number, Corporate)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	40,275.00	40,000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	12-Dec-2018	30-Jun-2021	31-Oct-2022
Comments				
☐ Number of teachers trained (Number, Corporate Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	40,275.00	40,275.00	40,000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2021	31-Oct-2022
Strengthen accountability for results in basic education in Nigeria				
▶ System of national learning assessment developed and implemented (Yes/No, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	31-Oct-2022
Comments				
▶ Total states implementing and publishing the Annual School Census (ASC), verified by school-based management committees (SBMCs) (Number, Custom)				



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	37.00	37.00	37.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	31-Oct-2022
Comments	<p>► Total states completing state basic education plan and progress report on Universal Basic Education program implementation, approved by Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC) (Number, Custom)</p>			
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	37.00	37.00	37.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	31-Oct-2022
Comments	<p>All states have prepared the state education sector plans. UBEC will need to review and approve these plans.</p>			
<p>► Publicly disclosed Universal Basic Education program annual progress report (Yes/No, Custom)</p>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	31-Oct-2022
Comments	<p>► Universal Basic Education program evaluation and report completed (Yes/No, Custom)</p>			
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	31-Dec-2015	12-Dec-2018	12-Dec-2018	31-Oct-2022
Comments				

Disbursement Linked Indicators

► DLI 1 Reduced number of out-of-school children in focus states, by gender (Outcome, 341,500,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	Year 4
Value	0.00	924,590.00	924,590.00	3,800,000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	--
Comments	<p>The number of OOS reduced by 924,590 of which 633,772 are girls and 290,818 are boys between NEDS2015 and NEDS2020</p>			

► DLI 2 Schools adopting primary 1-3 intensive literacy programs in focus states (Output, 120,000,000.00, 0%)				
---	--	--	--	--



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	Year 4
Value	0.00	21,247.00	21,247.00	20,000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	--
Comments				

► DLI 3 Improved literacy rates in focus states, by state (Outcome, 60,000,000.00, 72%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	Year 4
Value	0.00	11.00	43,000,000.00	0.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	30-Jun-2021	--
Comments	11 out of 17 states registered improved literacy rates (above 2%) between NEDS2015 and NEDS2020, resulting in prorated disbursement of USD43m.			

► DLI 4 Total states implementing and publishing the Annual School Census (ASC), verified by school-based management committees (SBMCs) (Intermediate Outcome, 21,000,000.00, 0%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	Year 4
Value	0.00	147,000.00	37.00	37.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	30-Jun-2021	--
Comments	37 states collected annual school census data from 147,000 primary and junior secondary school in 2018.			

► DLI 5 Total states completing state basic education plan and progress report on Universal Basic Education program implementation, approved by Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC) (Intermediate Outcome, 35,500,000.00, 0%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	Year 4
Value	0.00	37.00	37.00	37.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	31-Aug-2020	31-Aug-2020	--
Comments	37 states prepared 2017-19 plans			