

Document of  
The World Bank

**FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY**

Report No: PAD1954

INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION

PROJECT PAPER

ON A

PROPOSED ADDITIONAL IDA GRANT  
IN THE AMOUNT OF SDR 5.4 MILLION (US\$7.5 MILLION EQUIVALENT)

AND AN

EARLY LEARNING PARTNERSHIP (ELP) GRANT  
IN THE AMOUNT OF US\$1 MILLION

TO THE

REPUBLIC OF THE GAMBIA

FOR A

RESULTS FOR EDUCATION ACHIEVEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (READ)

August 18, 2016

Education Global Practice  
Africa Region

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

**CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS**  
(Exchange Rate Effective June 30, 2016)

Currency Unit = Gambian Dalasi (GMD)  
GMD 43.5681 = US\$1  
SDR 0.71487804 = US\$1

**FISCAL YEAR**  
January 1 – December 31

**ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS**

AfDB	African Development Bank
AF	Additional Financing
CB	Central Bank
CCT	Conditional Cash Transfer
COT	Classroom Observation Tool
DA	Designated Account
DLI	Disbursement Linked Indicator
ECD	Early Childhood Development
ELP	Early Learning Partnership
EMIS	Education Management Information System
ESMF	Environmental and Social Management Framework
ESSP	Education Sector Strategic Plan
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GER	Gross Enrollment Rate
GOALS	Gambia Open Active Learning Space
GPE	Global Partnership for Education
GRS	Grievance Redress Service
GTUCCU	Gambia Teachers' Union Co-operative Credit Union
HTC	Higher Teacher Certificate
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
IFR	Interim Financial Report
ISR	Implementation Status and Results Report
JPS	Joint Partnership Strategy
LBS	Lower Basic Schools
LEARNET	Learning, Education, Activities and Resources Network
MoBSE	Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education
MoFEA	Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs
MoHERST	Ministry of Higher Education, Research, Science and Technology
NAT	National Assessment Test
NEA	National Environment Agency
PCR	Primary Completion Rate
PCU	Project Coordination Unit

PDO	Project Development Objective
PLR	Performance and Learning Review
PPP	Public-Private Partnership
PS	Permanent Secretary
PSI-PMI	Progressive Science Initiative and Progressive Math Initiative
PTC	Primary Teacher Certificate
READ	Results for Education Achievement and Development Project
RED	Regional Education Directorate
RF	Results Framework
RPF	Resettlement Policy Framework
SQAD	Standards and Quality Assurance Directorate
SSS	Senior Secondary Schools
STED	Science and Technology Education Directorate
UBS	Upper Basic Schools

Regional Vice President:	Makhtar Diop
Country Director:	Louise J. Cord
Acting Senior Global Practice Director:	Amit Dar
Practice Manager:	Meskerem Mulatu
Task Team Leader:	Ryoko Tomita

**THE REPUBLIC OF THE GAMBIA**  
**RESULTS FOR EDUCATION ACHIEVEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT PROJECT (READ)**  
**ADDITIONAL FINANCING**

CONTENTS

I.	Introduction .....	8
II.	Background and Rationale for Additional Financing .....	8
III.	Proposed Changes.....	15
IV.	Original and revised project financing .....	28
V.	World Bank Grievance Redress.....	29
VI.	The Gambia: Country Financing Parameters .....	29
	Annex 1: Revised Results Framework and Monitoring Indicators .....	31

**ADDITIONAL FINANCING DATA SHEET**

*Gambia, The*

*Results for Education Achievement and Development Project (READ) (P160282)*

*AFRICA*

*Education Global Practice*

<b>Basic Information – Parent</b>							
Parent Project ID:	P133079			Original EA Category:	B - Partial Assessment		
Current Closing Date:	28-Feb-2018						
<b>Basic Information – Additional Financing (AF)</b>							
Project ID:	P160282			Additional Financing Type (from AUS):	Scale Up		
Regional Vice President:	Makhtar Diop			Proposed EA Category:			
Country Director:	Louise J. Cord			Expected Effectiveness Date:	31-Oct-2016		
Senior Global Practice Director:	Amit Dar			Expected Closing Date:	28-Feb-2018		
Practice Manager/Manager:	Meskerem Mulatu			Report No:	PAD1954		
Team Leader(s):	Ryoko Tomita						
<b>Borrower</b>							
Organization Name	Contact	Title	Telephone	Email			
Republic of The Gambia	Abdou Kolley	Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs	2204227529	info@mof.gov.gm			
<b>Project Financing Data - Parent ( READ: Results for Education Achievement and Development Project-P133079 ) (in US\$, millions)</b>							
Key Dates							
Project	Ln/Cr/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Original Closing Date	Revised Closing Date
P133079	IDA-H9160	Effective	06-Mar-2014	09-Apr-2014	25-Apr-2014	28-Feb-2018	28-Feb-2018
P133079	TF-16496	Effective	09-Apr-2014	09-Apr-2014	25-Apr-2014	28-Feb-2018	28-Feb-2018

Disbursements									
Project	Ln/Cr/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P133079	IDA-H9160	Effective	US\$	11.90	11.90	0.00	9.37	2.17	78.72
P133079	TF-16496	Effective	US\$	6.90	6.90	0.00	4.67	2.23	67.67
<b>Project Financing Data - Additional Financing (Results for Education Achievement and Development Project [READ] - P160282) (in US\$, millions)</b>									
<input type="checkbox"/> Loan <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grant <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> IDA Grant <input type="checkbox"/> Credit <input type="checkbox"/> Guarantee <input type="checkbox"/> Other									
Total Project Cost:		8.50		Total Bank Financing:		7.50			
Financing Gap:		0.00							
Financing Source – Additional Financing (AF)								Amount	
BORROWER/RECIPIENT								0.00	
IDA Grant								7.50	
Early Learning Partnership								1.00	
Total								8.50	
<b>Policy Waivers</b>									
Does the project depart from the CAS in content or in other significant respects?							No		
Explanation									
Does the project require any policy waiver(s)?							No		
Explanation									
<b>Team Composition</b>									
<b>Bank Staff</b>									
Name	Role	Title	Specialization	Unit					
Ryoko Tomita	Team Leader (ADM Responsible)	Economist	Education	GED07					
Moustapha Ould El Bechir	Procurement Specialist (ADM Responsible)	Senior Procurement Specialist	Procurement	GGO07					
Ngor Sene	Financial	Financial	Financial	GGO13					

	Management Specialist	Management Specialist	Management	
Alexandra C. Sperling	Team Member	Legal Analyst	Legal	LEGAM
Alison Marie Mills	Team Member	Education Specialist	Education	GED07
Emmanuel Ngollo	Environmental Specialist	Consultant	Environment	GENDR
Lalaina Noelinirina Rasoloharison	Team Member	Program Assistant	Operational assistance	GED07
Laura S. McDonald	Team Member	Consultant	Education	GED07
Maiada Mahmoud Abdel Fattah Kassem	Team Member	Finance Officer	Finance Officer	WFALA
Mariangeles Sabella	Counsel	Senior Counsel	Legal	LEGEN
Zoe Kolovou	Counsel	Lead Counsel	Legal	LEGAM
Nelli Khachatryan	Team Member	Operations Assistant	Operations	AFRDE
Tanya June Savrimootoo	Team Member	Consultant	Education	GED07
Upulee Iresha Dasanayake	Safeguards Specialist	Consultant	Safeguards	AFCSN

#### Extended Team

Name	Title	Location

#### Locations

Country	First Administrative Division	Location	Planned	Actual	Comments
Gambia, The		Western Division	X		
Gambia, The		Upper River Division	X		
Gambia, The		North Bank Division	X		
Gambia, The		Central River Division	X		
Gambia, The		Lower River Division	X		

#### Institutional Data

Parent (READ: Results for Education Achievement and Development Project-P133079 )

#### Practice Area (Lead)

Education

#### Contributing Practice Areas

<b>Additional Financing Results for Education Achievement and Development Project [READ] - P160282 )</b>
--

<b>Practice Area (Lead)</b>
-----------------------------

Education
-----------

<b>Contributing Practice Areas</b>
------------------------------------

Gender
--------



## I. Introduction

1. **This Project Paper seeks the approval of the Executive Directors to provide an additional grant to the the Results for Education Achievement and Development Project (READ) in the amount of SDR 5.4 million (US\$7.5 million equivalent) from the International Development Association (IDA).** The proposed additional grant will help finance the costs of providing (a) teachers' salaries, allowances, and school grants (IDA additional grant) and (b) additional support for Early Childhood Development (ECD) activities (ELP grant). **In addition, a grant in the amount of US\$1 million (TF0A2125) from the Early Learning Partnership (ELP) Trust Fund has been approved by the Bank's Country Director for The Gambia.**

2. **The proposed additional financing (AF) and accompanying restructuring will retain the original project development objective (PDO) to increase access to basic education, improve quality of teaching and learning in lower basic schools, and strengthen education systems,** providing US\$7.5 million IDA financing to Components 1 (*Subcomponent 1.4: Provision of school subgrants to support subprojects to all lower and upper basic public schools and stationery to all students in hardship areas*) and 2 (*Subcomponent 2.9: Teacher salaries for public lower basic schools (LBS), upper basic schools (UBS) and senior secondary schools (SSS) teachers, and allowances for eligible public LBS, UBS, and SSS teachers*), and US\$1 million from the ELP trust fund to Component 1 (*Subcomponent 1.3: Community-based ECD*) of the original project. The proposed AF is also accompanied by a restructuring requested by the Government in a letter dated December 21, 2015, which includes (a) cancellation of five disbursement linked indicators (DLIs); (b) removal and modification of activities supported under Subcomponent 2.8 to provide broadband connectivity and electricity to schools because of high set-up costs; and (c) reallocation between disbursement categories. There will also be changes to the results framework (RF) to reflect the AF and the project restructuring. The closing date of February 28, 2018, will remain the same as under the original project.

3. **The READ Project is financed jointly by IDA (US\$11.9 million) and the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) (US\$6.9 million).** It was approved by IDA on March 6, 2014, and by the GPE on April 9, 2014, and provides funding for elements of the Education Sector Strategic Plan (ESSP) (2014–2022) which covers the entire education sector (from ECD to tertiary education) in partnership with the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education (MoBSE) and the Ministry of Higher Education, Research, Science and Technology (MoHERST). The READ Project's Financing Agreement and Grant Agreement were signed on April 9, 2014, and became effective on April 25, 2014, with a closing date of February 28, 2018. This is the first proposed AF for the project. The project is progressing well toward achievement of its PDO.

## II. Background and Rationale for Additional Financing

### A. Country Context

4. The Gambia is a small open economy that relies primarily on tourism, agriculture, and remittance inflows, and is vulnerable to external shocks, as illustrated by the recent Ebola virus disease crisis and the delayed rainy season, which led to a poor harvest in 2014. From 2010 through 2014, the real gross domestic product (GDP) growth averaged 2.7 percent and shrank by an average of 0.5

percent annually, in per capita terms, in part reflecting a severe drought that contributed to a 4.3 percent contraction in GDP in 2011.

5. **The key long-term development challenges that The Gambia faces are related to its undiversified economy, small internal market, limited access to resources, lack of skills necessary to build effective institutions, high population growth, lack of private sector job creation, and a high rate of out-migration.** Resilience to external shocks (such as volatile weather conditions and the effects of climate change) needs to be strengthened through (a) diversification of the economy and an improved private sector investment climate; (b) effective civil service reform and improved public management capacity geared toward enhanced service delivery and conditions to support long-term growth and employment; and (c) improved transparency and accountability in public affairs and increased citizen participation.

6. **In recent years, fiscal strains have mounted substantially largely because of fiscal slippages and poor performance of state-owned enterprises that have led to a significant buildup of public sector debt.** The fiscal deficit averaged 11 percent as a share of GDP from 2013 through 2015, contributing to a rise in public sector debt to 108 percent of GDP in 2015 from 83.3 percent in 2013. Heavy reliance on costly domestic markets has contributed to rising debt. Interest payments increased from 25 percent of revenues in 2013 to 40 percent in 2015 and are projected to reach nearly 50 percent in 2016. Contingent liabilities that reached five percent of GDP in 2014 are also a contributing factor.

7. **Exchange rate policies that sharply overvalued the Gambian Dalasi have also contributed to financial strains and balance of payment imbalances.** The official foreign reserves of the Central Bank (CB) have declined significantly, with the periodic imposition of currency controls since 2013 and overvaluation against the U.S. dollar, as high as 30 percent over pre-pegged, market-determined rates. The controls have constrained the availability of foreign exchange, discouraged private investment, and strained the capacity of the authorities to service public sector debt. The lifting of currency controls, since January 2016, should facilitate a rebuilding of reserves over time.

8. **The last World Bank Group country strategy for The Gambia was the Second Joint Partnership Strategy (JPS) (FY2013 to FY2016), which was a joint document (Report #72140) of the World Bank and the African Development Bank (AfDB).** A Performance and Learning Review (PLR) is currently under preparation, which will review the World Bank's performance under this strategy and will propose an extension of it while a Systematic Country Diagnostic and Country Partnership Framework are developed. This PLR will set out World Bank support to The Gambian authorities in the 2016 calendar year, which is expected to focus on supporting the poorest segments of the population, who are most affected by the current macroeconomic strains and fiscal slippages and who are most likely to be negatively affected if the situation deteriorates further. This proposed AF aims to provide support in this context.

## **B. Sectoral and Institutional Context**

9. **The MoBSE and the MoHERST are together responsible for implementation of the ESSP.** Specifically, the MoBSE is responsible for basic education (ECD to grade 12) and the MoHERST for technical and vocational education and training and higher education. The MoBSE and the MoHERST, guided by the ESSP, aim to achieve universal access to education and improve the quality of education

provided in The Gambia. The Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA) is providing financing for teachers' salaries and allowances and school subgrants. In 2015, teachers' salaries (including allowances) and school subgrants accounted for 39 percent and 11 percent, respectively, of the MoBSE's expenditure. Despite the financial difficulties faced by the Government, teachers' salaries (and allowances) and school subgrants have been paid on time.

10. **The Gambia decided to implement the fee-free education policy in public LBS, UBS, and SSS in 2013, 2014, and 2015, respectively, by providing subgrants to schools.** The MoBSE prohibited public schools from charging parents with formal and informal fees. Parents and students have been able to enjoy free education from grades 1–12. The objective of the school subgrants is to increase access to education, as the cost of education was preventing financially disadvantaged children from attending school. Hardship and non-hardship LBS receive GMD 150 and 100 per student per year, respectively; non-hardship and hardship UBS receive GMD 575 and GMD 675, respectively, and all public SSS receive GMD 1,800 per student per year. A school is considered a 'hardship' school if it is located more than 3 km from a main road.

11. **Enrollment has been increasing in The Gambia; however, the gross enrollment rate (GER) in UBS has remained stagnant.** During 2010 to 2016, there was a 35 percent increase in LBS enrollment (from 228,105 to 308,729) with the GER increasing from 88.3 percent in 2010 to 104.0 percent in 2016; and a 20 percent increase in UBS enrollment (from 75,635 to 90,838) with GER increasing from 66.2 percent in 2010 to 66.8 percent in 2016. As the enrollment has been increasing at the same pace as the population, the GER in UBS has stagnated. The primary completion rate (PCR) remained at 73.6 percent from 2010 to 2015 because of high dropout rates coupled with population growth, though it increased to 75.4 percent in 2016.

12. **Recent assessments have shown that learning outcomes are low in The Gambia.** The Early Grade Reading Assessment was undertaken for students in grades 1 through 3 on four occasions (2007, 2009, 2011, and 2013). The 2007 test results revealed very low scores. As a result, the MoBSE has been providing training to lower grade teachers to improve students' literacy skills. The 2013 Early Grade Reading Assessment tests showed significant improvements in the knowledge of letter sounds and word recognition. However, a large portion of students still had difficulties with reading comprehension. The average score on reading comprehension for grade 3 was 34 percent (out of 100 percent) in 2013. The National Assessment Test (NAT), which is conducted semiannually for grades 3 and 5 and annually for grade 8 and measures scores on English and mathematics, found low learning outcomes, as well. On the 2012 NAT, the average score in English was 41.5 percent in grade 3 and 45.5 percent in grade 5 and the average score in mathematics was 37.2 in grade 3 and 44.7 in grade 5.

13. **Improving student learning outcomes is the MoBSE's priority.** The Government has been making a significant effort to improve student learning outcomes by supporting in-service teacher training (including the targeted training for the early grades as described above) and undertaking regular student learning assessments. The focus has been to improve LBS teachers' content knowledge of English and mathematics, as well as pedagogy. The first cohort, comprised 3,000 teachers, who participated in 130 days of training during school holidays over a two-year period, and the second cohort comprised 940 teachers, who participated in 70 days of training. At the end of each training, the teachers were required to take tests; test items were linked to the pre-test. These tests revealed that their content knowledge had improved because of training but that there was still room for improvement. The Government has also supported a number of student learning assessments. Some of

these will provide a better understanding of learning trends over time because the Government has taken steps to link the test items across several years. Further, the Government has expressed interest in providing additional support to ECD activities, given the growing evidence of ECD's important role in improved education outcomes.

14. **The GER for ECD in The Gambia was 46 percent in 2016.** Although this is higher than in some Sub-Saharan Africa countries, there are regional and socioeconomic disparities in access to ECD in The Gambia. In the central areas of Regions 1 and 2, the GER in ECD is 47 percent and 56 percent, respectively, while in Regions 3–6, the rates are 40 percent, 45 percent, 25 percent, and 47 percent, respectively. In addition, the GER within the lowest quintile is 27 percent while the rate in the highest quintile is 54 percent.<sup>1</sup>

15. **The MoBSE has taken important steps to increase access to ECD in The Gambia.** Currently, there are private programs (mostly in relatively urbanized areas and serving the wealthier households) and public programs. There are two types of public programs—‘community-based ECD’ programs (funded by the Japan Social Development Fund through a pilot project)<sup>2</sup> and ‘annexed ECD’ programs which are set up in (annexed to) public LBS. A new curriculum and syllabus (Gambia Open Active Learning Space [GOALS] Curriculum) were developed and adopted by all three types of centers in an effort to standardize ECD provision in the country.

16. **With support provided by the ELP, a rigorous evaluation of the effectiveness of the two types of public ECD programs (community-based and annexed) for children ages 3–6 was conducted in 2014.** To study the impact of each of these programs, a treatment and control group was established for each type of public program. In the treatment groups, (a) the new curriculum and syllabus (GOALS) were used; (b) teachers attended training sessions to learn how to use the syllabus; (c) materials associated with the syllabus were used; and (d) monitoring and support were provided by the MoBSE ECD Unit. The main differences between community-based ECD and annexed ECD programs are: (a) all teachers in annexed ECD are qualified whereas facilitators in community-based ECD have a lower level of education and are not qualified teachers and (b) children in annexed ECD have opportunities to interact with LBS students and see how LBS students are learning whereas community-based ECDs often do not have an LBS nearby. The evaluation showed that only the annexed ECD program/model had a significant positive impact on children's learning outcomes. Treatment effects as measured by the Malawi Developmental Assessment Tool scores were statistically significant on both language and fine motor skills. Because of these findings, the MoBSE announced its policy to expand the annexed ECD approach in The Gambia.

### C. Relationship to Joint Partnership Strategy

17. **The proposed AF is consistent with the Second JPS (FY2013–FY2016) developed by the Government of the Gambia, IDA, the International Finance Corporation, and AfDB in 2013.** It presents a core strategy of the development partners from 2013 to 2016 and provides the framework for managing and harmonizing development efforts supported by the Government and bilateral and multilateral donors in The Gambia.

---

<sup>1</sup> Demographic Household Survey 2013.

<sup>2</sup> The ECD community-based pilot project supported the implementation of community-based ECD pilot programs in Regions 2 and 6 from 2009 to 2014.

18. **The main objective related to education highlighted in the JPS is the improvement of the quality of basic education and, in turn, learning outcomes.** The JPS further highlights that support to ECD is critical for school readiness and also for improved learning outcomes in basic education. The JPS also suggested that the provision of hardship allowances in remote and poverty stricken areas be continued as it contributed to the equalization of the percentage of qualified teachers in urban and rural areas. The hardship allowance will continue to be supported under the original financing.

19. The proposed AF is consistent with paragraph 29 of OP/BP 10.00, (Investment Project Financing) under which the World Bank may provide AF to an ongoing, well-performing project for completion of project activities when there is a financing gap, for scaling up the development effectiveness of the project, and in cases of project restructuring, when the original World Bank grant is insufficient for the additional activities. The ratings for the project have been consistently rated Moderately Satisfactory or better over the most recent 12 months and there is substantial compliance with key loan covenants, including audit and financial management reporting requirements.

#### **D. Status of the Activities under the Original Project**

20. **The READ Project has made progress toward achievement of its PDO and related outcomes and the pace of implementation has been progressing well.** The project has the following three objectives: (a) increase access to basic education; (b) improve quality of teaching and learning in lower basic schools; and (c) strengthen education systems. Progress toward achievement of Objective 1 is measured by the increase in number of students in basic education. Progress towards achievement of Objective 2 is measured by an improvement in teachers' content knowledge and progress toward achievement of Objective 3 is measured through the timely payment of school grants, timely completion of construction, increased participation in NATs, and the timely collection, analysis, and reporting of school census data. In the most recent Implementation Status and Results Report (ISR) (June 2016), progress toward achievement of the PDO was rated Satisfactory and Implementation Progress was rated Moderately Satisfactory. Table 1 provides an overview of project ratings in the last ISR. As of July 15, 2016, the project has a disbursement rate of 67 percent under the GPE Grant (TF16496) and a disbursement rate of 78 percent under the IDA Grant (H9160).

**Table 1. Ratings in the last ISR (June 2016)**

<b>Area</b>	<b>Rating</b>
Progress toward achievement of PDO	Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress	Moderately Satisfactory
Component 1: Increase Access to Basic Education	Satisfactory
Component 2: Improve Quality of Teaching and Learning	Moderately Satisfactory
Component 3: Technical and Institutional Support	Satisfactory
Component 4: Strengthening the Education System with a Focus on Governance and Management Results	Moderately Satisfactory
Financial Management	Satisfactory
Project Management	Satisfactory
Counterpart Funding	Satisfactory
Procurement	Satisfactory
Monitoring and Evaluation	Satisfactory

**21. Progress has been observed under each component toward the achievement of the PDO.**

The major activity supported under Component 1 is school construction, which was completed in February 2016. In The Gambia, more and more children are enrolling in school each year with the annual grade 1 intake rate increasing by nine percent, on average. Almost all activities under Component 2 are progressing well, including in-service teaching training, mentioned previously, though the Learning, Education, Activities, and Resources Network (LEARNET) initiative for information and communication technology (ICT) integration in learning and teaching activity (supported by Subcomponent 2.8) requires modifications. All activities supported under Component 3 are progressing well.

**22. Under Component 4, the MoBSE has also been making great efforts to achieve all of the DLIs. However, there are two DLIs that are not fully under the Government’s control (DLIs 5 and 8).**

Under the proposed restructuring, these DLIs will be cancelled but will be kept as intermediate results indicators in the project’s RF. In addition, as described later, three other DLIs will be cancelled but will also be kept as intermediate results indicators. The allocation for the five cancelled DLIs will be moved to support lending activities under Component 2. There is an acute shortage of textbooks in the country, so US\$700,000 will be used for printing textbooks for core subjects in grades 1–9 (English, Mathematics, Science, Social and Environmental Studies) and the national languages and the French language. With this distribution of textbooks, The Gambia will achieve a textbook to pupil ratio of 1:1 for the next three years for grades 1–9 for all of the abovementioned subjects. About US\$200,000 will be used for the NAT in 2017. In addition, about US\$900,000 will be used to develop digital content for English Language Arts for grades 7–12, and US\$200,000 will be used for teacher training. The work to develop the digital content has been ongoing since July 2015 but there has been a shortage of funds because it was expected that the DLI proceeds could be used to conduct this exercise.

**Table 2. List of DLIs and current status**

<b>Target date</b>	<b>Description of DLI</b>	<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>
Year 0 (from April 1, 2013 through March 31, 2014)	1. MoBSE shall publish, on or before March 17, 2014, in at least one of the recipient's local newspapers, the package of final bidding documents for the construction of 40 multi-grade schools and 40 water points under the project in form and substance acceptable to the Association	Achieved	
Year 0 (from April 1, 2013 through March 31, 2014)	2. MoBSE shall transfer the first tranche (equivalent to 40 percent of the entire annual allocation) of annual school subgrants to all public lower basic schools on or before September 15, 2013	Achieved	
Year 1 (from April 1, 2014 through March 31, 2015)	3. MoBSE shall transfer the first tranche (equivalent to 40 percent of the entire annual allocation) of annual school subgrants to all public upper basic schools on or before September 15, 2014	Achieved	
Year 1 (from April 1, 2014 through March 31, 2015)	4. Annual formal and informal school fees paid by parents to all public lower basic schools shall equal zero	Currently a third party (firm) is validating this DLI. The findings are expected to be available by October 2016. Although this indicator will be kept as an intermediate results indicator, it will be cancelled as a DLI.	Verification of this DLI has been delayed because it was difficult to find a consultancy firm that can do this work and does not have a relationship with MoBSE.
Year 1 (from April 1, 2014 through March 31, 2015)	5. MoBSE shall complete the verification on an aggregate average attendance of 93 percent of students of grades 3, 5, and 8 of all public schools in NAT for two full days in 2014	Will be cancelled as a DLI, and will be retained as an intermediate results indicator	
Year 1 (from April 1, 2014 through March 31, 2015)	6. MoBSE shall complete the annual school census, including Madrassas, and with a minimum of 95 percent response rate and results and analytical report released by May 30, 2014	Achieved	
Year 2 (from April 1, 2015 through March 31, 2016)	7. Annual formal and informal school fees paid by parents to all public upper basic schools shall equal zero	Currently a third party (firm) is validating this DLI. The findings are expected to be available by October 2016. Although this indicator will be retained as an intermediate results indicator, it will be cancelled as a DLI.	
Year 2 (from April 1, 2015 through March 31, 2016)	8. MoBSE shall complete the verification on an aggregate average attendance of 95 percent of students of grades 3, 5, and 8 of all public schools in NAT for two full days in 2015	Will be cancelled as a DLI but will be retained as an intermediate results indicator	
Year 3 (from April 1,	9. Improved school development plans for	Will be cancelled as a DLI	

Target date	Description of DLI	Status	Comments
2016 through March 31, 2017)	70 percent of public lower basic schools in response to NAT results shall be approved by the regional directorates under the supervision of the MoBSE (Standards and Quality Assurance Directorate [SQAD]) and using the agreed upon checklist	but will be retained as a PDO-level indicator	

23. **The original financing places an emphasis on gender equity.** There are more female students than male students enrolled in basic education in The Gambia. In UBS, the Gender Parity Index for the PCR is 1.02 and for the GER is 1.03 (Education Management Information System (EMIS), 2016). One of the reasons that there are more female students in basic education is because a portion of male students are in *Majalis* (religious centers where they reside with Koranic teachers), rather than in the formal education system. Those who are in *Majalis* are not counted as enrolled students in the EMIS, but considered out-of-school children. The READ Project provides opportunities for these male students to learn math and literacy (English) through a conditional cash transfer (CCT) (Subcomponent 2.7). The Koranic teachers, who are responsible for food and lodging of these students, are provided GMD 100 (about US\$3) per month per student on the condition that they allow their students to take math and English classes for five hours each week.

### III. Proposed Changes

#### Summary of Proposed Changes

The proposed AF will support the Government in: (a) providing salaries and allowances to teachers in public LBS, UBS, SSS, financed by IDA; (b) providing school subgrants to all public LBS, public UBS in Regions 1 and 2, and all public SSS, financed by IDA; and (c) expanding the annexed ECD approach, financed by the ELP Grant.

The rationale for providing financing for teachers' salaries, allowances, and school subgrants is to reduce the macroeconomic burden on the MoFEA for a short period as The Gambia is currently facing financial difficulties. The rationale for supporting the annexed ECD approach through the proposed AF is based on (a) the findings from an impact evaluation, which showed the effectiveness of the annexed ECD program; (b) the Government's decision to use this approach (expanding the annexed ECD program) to increase access to ECD in The Gambia; (c) the recent construction of 48 LBS (multi-grade schools) where these ECD programs could be annexed but which do not have annexed ECD classrooms due to financial constraints; and (d) lack of access in these communities to ECD programs.

This AF for the READ Project also includes a proposed restructuring of the original project. In addition to supporting teachers' salaries, allowances, school subgrants, and the construction of ECD classrooms, the following modifications will also be introduced: (a) cancellation of five DLIs; (b) removal of an activity supported under Subcomponent 2.8 to provide broadband connectivity and electricity to all public UBS and SSS because of high set-up costs and low private sector support; (c) evidence-based changes to the provision of ECD, moving from a community-based to an annexed approach; (d) relevant changes in the RF; (e) reallocation of financing to each category; and (f) modifications to costs of component resulting from a thorough review of the costing of each activity.



Change in Implementing Agency	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change in Project's Development Objectives	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change in Results Framework	Yes [ X ] No [ ]
Change in Safeguard Policies Triggered	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change of EA category	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Other Changes to Safeguards	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change in Legal Covenants	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change in Loan Closing Date(s)	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Cancellations Proposed	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change in Disbursement Arrangements	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Reallocation between Disbursement Categories	Yes [ X ] No [ ]
Change in Disbursement Estimates	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change to Components and Cost	Yes [ X ] No [ ]
Change in Institutional Arrangements	Yes [ X ] No [ ]
Change in Financial Management	Yes [ X ] No [ ]
Change in Procurement	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Change in Implementation Schedule	Yes [ ] No [ X ]
Other Change(s)	Yes [ ] No [ X ]

### Development Objective/Results

#### Project's Development Objectives

##### Original PDO

To increase access to basic education, improve quality of teaching and learning in lower basic schools, and strengthen education systems.

#### Change in Results Framework

Explanation:

**The RF has been adjusted to reflect changes resulting from the AF and restructuring as outlined below and in annex 1.**

**PDO level indicators will remain the same, however the following targets will be slightly adjusted in the RF.** Due to the higher than expected increase in enrollment in LBS and UBS, the proposed restructuring will revise the end-of-project targets for the indicators related to increasing enrollment in LBS including revising – ‘Direct project beneficiaries’ and ‘additional students in public ECD, LBS, and UBS’ upward, and revising the NAT mean score downward, given the increased enrollment of lower basic students. The NAT mean score target is being revised downward because these additional students are predominantly from disadvantaged families and international experience shows that performance on language tests by students with this background is lower, in general, than the average student.

In addition, the indicator, ‘Teachers in grades 1–3 showing good teaching performance as observed through the new classroom observation tool’ will be modified to be more concise and will read ‘Teachers in grades 1–3, from a randomly selected 15 percent of schools, showing good teaching performance as observed through the new classroom observation tool’. Finally, the indicator, ‘Head Teachers in lower basic schools adjusting School Development Plans in response to the NAT result and approved by regional directorates using an agreed upon checklist (DLI year 3)’ will be modified to omit ‘(DLI year 3)’ from the indicator.

**Seven intermediate results indicators will be revised, five will be added, and one will be dropped from the RF.** Revisions include the following:

- The target of intermediate results indicator ‘Stationary packages provided to students in lower basic schools in hardship areas’ will be revised from 36,500 to 47,000 because of a greater than expected increase in enrollment.
- The target of intermediate results indicator ‘Number of additional classrooms built or rehabilitated at the primary level resulting from project interventions’ will be revised from 80 to 84 to include the construction of an additional 4 classrooms for primary education (2 multi-grade schools).
- The intermediate results indicator ‘Public upper basic and senior schools connected to broadband’ will be revised to ‘Public upper basic and senior secondary schools installed with solar power’. As described above, installing and maintaining the broadband services would be too costly. Because the schools connected to the main grid report unreliable power supply and frequent cuts, they will need solar panels to have constant and reliable electricity.
- The intermediate results indicator ‘Basic Education Sector communication strategy developed by Science Technology Education Directorate (STED)’ will be modified to ‘Basic Education Sector communication strategy developed by the MoBSE’ because it will be developed by the MoBSE, rather than by STED, which is a directorate under the MoBSE.
- The intermediate results indicator ‘Externally controlled end-of-year examination in place for students completing second year of revised Primary Teacher Certificate (PTC) and Higher Teacher Certificate (HTC) programs at Gambia College’ will be revised to read ‘Externally *reviewed and overseen* end-of-year examination in place for students completing second year of revised PTC and HTC programs at Gambia College’. Because the word ‘controlled’ was too strong and did not reflect the reality on the ground, it will be replaced with ‘reviewed and overseen’.
- For two indicators, (DLIs 4 and 7), the word ‘DLI’ will be removed, but other than that, these two indicators will remain the same. They are: ‘Annual formal and informal school fees paid by parents to public lower basic schools’, and ‘Annual formal and informal school fees paid by parents to public upper basic schools’.

**Five new intermediate results indicators will be added to the RF:**

- ‘Number of additional classrooms built for ECD’
- ‘Citizen feedback was included in the development of school improvement grant manual’
- ‘Pupil textbook ratio of core textbooks in grades 1–9 in public schools’
- DLIs 5 and 8, ‘Average attendance by students in public schools in NAT for grades 3, 5, an 8 for full two days’ will be dropped. However these indicators will be captured as a new intermediate results indicator in the RF.

**Compliance**

**Covenants - Additional Financing ( Results for Education Achievement and Development Project (READ) - P160282 )**

Source of Funds	Finance Agreement Reference	Description of Covenants	Date Due	Recurrent	Frequency	Action
				<input type="checkbox"/>		

**Conditions**

Source Of Fund	Name	Type
IDA	Article IV. 4.01 Project Implementation Manual	Effectiveness

**Description of Condition**

The Recipient has updated the Project Implementation Manual in form and substance satisfactory to the Association.

Source Of Fund	Name	Type
IDA	Article IV. 4.01 Cofinancing Agreements	Effectiveness

**Description of Condition**

The Cofinancing Agreements have been executed and delivered, and all conditions precedent to the effectiveness or to the right of the recipient to make withdrawals under said Cofinancing Agreements have been fulfilled.

Source Of Fund	Name	Type
ELP	Article IV. 4.01 Amended and Restated Financing Agreement	Effectiveness

**Description of Condition**

The amended and restated Financing Agreement has been executed and delivered, and all conditions precedent to the effectiveness or to the right of the recipient to make withdrawals under amended and restated Financing Agreement.

Source Of Fund	Name	Type
IDA	Schedule 2, Section IV, B.1.b, DLIs 1 and 2	Disbursement

**Description of Condition**

No withdrawal shall be made under categories (3)(a) and 3(b) unless the Recipient shall have furnished to the Association by no later than March 31, 2014 or the Effective Date if said Effective Date is later than March 31, 2014, evidence, satisfactory to the Association, of the achievement of DLIs 1 and 2, as set out in the DLI Table.

Source Of Fund	Name	Type
IDA	Schedule 2, Section IV, B.1.c, DLIs 3 and 6	Disbursement

**Description of Condition**

No withdrawal shall be made under Categories (3)(c) and 3(f), unless the Recipient shall have furnished to the Association: (i) the IUFRR for the period ending on September 30, 2014; and (ii) by no later than

December 15, 2014, evidence, satisfactory to the Association, of the achievement of DLIs 3 and 6 as set out in the DLI Table.				
<b>Risk</b>				
<b>Risk Category</b>			<b>Rating (H, S, M, L)</b>	
1. Political and Governance			Moderate	
2. Macroeconomic			High	
3. Sector Strategies and Policies			Moderate	
4. Technical Design of Project or Program			Moderate	
5. Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability			Substantial	
6. Fiduciary			Moderate	
7. Environment and Social			Moderate	
8. Stakeholders			Moderate	
9. Other				
<b>OVERALL</b>			<b>Substantial</b>	
<b>Finance</b>				
<b>Loan Closing Date - Additional Financing ( Results for Education Achievement and Development Project (READ) - P160282 )</b>				
<b>Source of Funds</b>			<b>Proposed Additional Financing Loan Closing Date</b>	
Early Learning Partnership			28-Feb-2018	
IDA Grant			28-Feb-2018	
<b>Allocations - Additional Financing ( Results for Education Achievement and Development Project (READ) - P160282 )</b>				
Source of Fund	Currency	Category of Expenditure	Allocation	Disbursement % (Type Total)
			Proposed	Proposed
IDAT	USD	Category 5: Teachers' Salaries and Allowances	5,200,000.00	100.00
IDAT	USD	Category 6: School Sub-grants in UBS Regions 1 and 2; School Sub-grants in LBS and SSS in Regions 1 through 6	2,300,000.00	100.00
		<b>Total:</b>	7,500,000.00	
ELP	USD	Category 7: Goods, works, nonconsulting services, consultants' services, Operating Costs, Training for Part 1(c) of Project	1,000,000.00	100.00

		<b>Total:</b>	1,000,000.00	

**Reallocation between Disbursement Categories**

Explanation:

As five DLIs will be canceled, the amount will be reallocated to Category 1 ‘Goods, works, non-consulting services, consultants’ services, operating costs, and training for parts 1, 2, and 3 of the project’. In addition, three new categories (one for teachers’ salaries and allowances funded by the AF from the IDA Grant [Category 5], one for school grants funded by the AF from the IDA Grant [Category 6], and one for the activities funded by the ELP [Category 7]) will be created. In addition, the amount that was originally allocated under Category 2 is excessive, so some funds in Category 2 will be reallocated to Category 1 during this restructuring. Specifically, this funding will be used to support in-service teacher training for mathematics and English grades 1–6 and for Progressive Science Initiative and Progressive Math Initiative (PSI-PMI) training for the remaining subjects from the pilot program.

Ln/Cr/TF	Currency	Current Category of Expenditure	Allocation		Disbursement % (Type Total)	
			Current	Proposed	Current	Proposed
TF-16496	USD	GDS, WKS,NCS, CS, OP TRG	3,780,000.00	4,827,000.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		Skol sub grant, Studt allow & CCTs	1,820,000.00	1,493,000.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 1 on or about effective date	145,000.00	145,000.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 2 on or about effective date	145,000.00	145,000.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 3 on or after December 15, 2014	145,000.00	145,000.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 4 on or after March 15, 2015	145,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 5 on or after December 15, 2014	145,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 6 on or after December 15, 2014	145,000.00	145,000.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 7 on or after March 15, 2016	145,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 8 on or after March 15, 2016	145,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		DLI 9 on or after March 15, 2017	140,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
TF-16496		Designated Account	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
		<b>Total:</b>	6,900,000.00	6,900,000.00		

IDA-H9160	XDR	GDS, WKS,NCS, CS, OP TRG	3,420,000.00	4,926,000.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		Skol sub grant, Studt allow & CCTs	2,000,000.00	1,314,000.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 1 on or about effective date	170,000.00	170,000.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 2 on or about effective date	170,000.00	170,000.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 3 on or after December 15, 2014	170,000.00	170,000.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 4 on or after March 15, 2014	170,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 5 on or after December 15, 2014	170,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 6 on or after December 15, 2014	170,000.00	170,000.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 7 on or after March 15, 2016	170,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 8 on or after March 15, 2016	170,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		DLI 9 on or after March 15, 2017	140,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		PPF REFINANCING	900,000.00	900,000.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		Designated Account	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
IDA-H9160		Designated Account	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
		<b>Total:</b>	7,820,000.00	7,820,000.00		

### Components

#### Change to Components and Cost

Explanation:

Changes made to relevant project subcomponents under the AF are described below and more detailed tables showing changes in cost across components can be found in section IV.

#### **Component 1: Increase Access to Basic Education**

Under this restructuring/AF, modifications will be made to Subcomponents 1.3 and 1.4 as follows.

#### **Subcomponent 1.3: Community-based early childhood care and development (ECD)**

The name of this subcomponent will be changed to 'Early Childhood Development' to reflect the change in the approach to be used under the AF. The changes to this subcomponent will be supported by the US\$1 million ELP Grant. Instead of building 40 community-based ECD structures as had been planned under the

READ Project, the original project will be modified to support the construction of two multi-grade LBS with two classrooms for grades 1–6, an ECD classroom, as well as staff quarters and a toilet block (the cost of constructing 40 community-based structures is similar to that of two multi-grade schools). Because an impact evaluation found more positive learning outcomes associated with the annexed ECD approach (attached to LBS), the Government has decided to expand the ECD program following this model. Therefore, this proposed change is aligned with Government strategy.

Eight multi-grade schools (16 classrooms), which cover grades 1 to 6, were built in remote areas under the former IDA-funded project (Third Education Project, P077903) which closed in December 2013. In 2013, during the preparation of the READ Project, it was found that 17 percent of communities (339 communities) in the country still did not have an LBS within 3 km. As such, it was decided that an additional 40 multi-grade schools (80 classrooms) would be built in these remote communities and the construction has since been completed. All of the newly built multi-grade schools comprise two classrooms, accommodation for teachers, a water point, and furniture (desks and chairs).

These 48 multi-grade schools do not have an ECD classroom attached to them. Because it is a government policy to have three years of formal ECD education before LBS, and their goal is to set up an annexed ECD within every LBS, it is essential to construct ECD classrooms attached or next to these multi-grade schools and to provide furniture and teaching and learning materials, while also providing training to ECD teachers and monitoring the ECD classes through the MoBSE ECD unit.

In addition to the construction of two multi-grade schools (each with an annexed ECD classroom) to be funded by the original project, of the 48 multi-grade schools already constructed, the proposed AF will construct 27 ECD classrooms either attached or next to 27 multi-grade schools (annexed ECD approach). As all of the 48 multi-grade schools are in remote areas, 27 will be selected based on the size of the population ages 0 to 6, current enrollment of students, and economic disadvantage. The MoBSE will try to find other resources to construct ECD classrooms in the remaining 21 multi-grade schools. In addition to the construction of 27 ECD classrooms, the proposed AF will also support: (a) provision of ECD furniture in the 27 classrooms; (b) training of ECD teachers, including in-service training; (c) provision of GOALS material and other teaching and learning materials; and (d) monitoring and supervision by the MoBSE ECD unit.

#### **Subcomponent 1.4: Provision of school subgrants to support subprojects to all public LBS and UBS and stationery to all students in hardship areas**

Of the US\$7.5 million AF, US\$2.3 million will be used to financially support school subgrants. The READ Project has already been supporting school subgrants for public UBS in Regions 3, 4, 5, and 6. Therefore, the AF will support the school subgrants for all public LBS in Regions 1 through 6, all public UBS in Regions 1 and 2, and all public SSS in Regions 1 through 6. It is estimated that this support will finance school subgrants for about 7 months.

#### **Component 2: Improve Quality of Teaching and Learning**

Under this restructuring/AF, modifications will be made to Subcomponents 2.3 and 2.8 as follows.

#### **Subcomponent 2.3: Hardship allowances for public lower and upper basic teachers in remote areas**

The parent project has been financing the hardship allowances for public LBS teachers whereas the government has been financing the hardship allowances for public UBS teachers. During the time when the proposed AF covers the teachers' salaries and allowances, hardship allowances for public UBS teachers will also be covered by the proposed AF. After that period, the Government will finance these allowances using its own resources.

#### **Subcomponent 2.8: LEARNET (Learning, Education, Activities, and Resources Network), a Public-Private Partnership (PPP) initiative for ICT integration in learning, and teaching, will provide**

### **broadband and curriculum-linked dynamic e-content to public schools**

The name of this subcomponent will be changed to 'LEARNET will provide curriculum-linked dynamic e-content to public schools and provide teacher training on Progressive Science Initiative and Progressive Math Initiative (PSI-PMI)'. The PSI-PMI pilot program, an innovative ICT program using 21st century technology using an interactive board, has been implemented in 24 schools since 2013. The provision of broadband services to all UBS and SSS will no longer be supported under the project because of the high cost. Originally, it was envisioned that there would be PPPs and the private sector would support this subcomponent, but this did not materialize. Estimates obtained through field-based research indicate that the initial setup cost for 19 PSI-PMI schools alone, which are close enough to be connected to the pop sites of fiber optics, would be approximately US\$500,000, and the recurrent cost for broadband connectivity would be approximately US\$50,000 for these schools every 10 months. Further, the provision of solar panels will be limited to 24 PSI-PMI schools rather than all public schools because of financial constraints. Provision of solar panels to the 24 PSI-PMI schools is essential because the program requires electricity to operate and the power grid is very unstable.

The project will finance the training of teachers in subjects which were not included as training subjects in the PSI-PMI pilot program (The Gambia Teaching Math and Physics through e-learning Project, P129888). The project will also continue to support the development of curriculum-linked digital content of mathematics, science, and English for grades 7–12. It is important to note that the new digital content can be used without broadband connectivity as it can be downloaded to computers.

### **Subcomponent 2.9: Teacher salaries for public LBS, UBS and SSS teachers, and allowances for eligible public LBS, UBS, and SSS teachers**

Subcomponent 2.9 will be added under the proposed AF. Of the US\$7.5 million AF, US\$5.2 million will be used to financially support all public LBS, UBS and SSS teachers' salaries and allowances for eligible public LBS, UBS, and SSS teachers. Allowances include Provincial Allowance, Travel Home to Office Allowance, Civil Servants Special Allowance, Special Skills Allowance, Retention Allowance, Teaching Allowance, Double Shift 50 percent Allowance, Cost of Living Allowance, and other allowances. Hardship allowances for LBS teachers are paid through the parent project under Subcomponent 2.3. Hardship allowances for UBS teachers, which have previously been paid by the Government, will now be supported by the project.

Currently there are a total of 13,932 teachers in public LBS, UBS, and SSS in the country. Of the 13,932 teachers, 7,240 teachers have a bank account and are paid by a direct bank deposit. The remaining 6,692 teachers do not have access to a bank, therefore, they receive their salaries through the Gambia Teachers' Union Co-operative Credit Union (GTUCCU). The payment mechanism is described under the Technical Analysis section below. The total net monthly payroll of public LBS, UBS, and SSS teachers for a recent month was GMD 36,874,309 (about US\$877,959). The payroll department of MoBSE prepares and updates the payroll data.

### **Component 3: Technical and Institutional Support**

There are no changes to Component 3 under the proposed restructuring/AF.

### **Component 4: Strengthening the Education System with a Focus on Governance and Management Results**

#### **Cancellation of five DLIs**

Two of the DLIs will be dropped from the project because the targets were not achieved. The funding will be reallocated to Component 2. The dropped DLIs include DLI 5 'MoBSE shall complete the verification on an aggregate average attendance of 93 percent of student of grades 3, 5, and 8 of all public schools in National Assessment Test (NAT) for two full days in 2014' and DLI 8 'MoBSE shall complete the verification on an aggregate average attendance of 95 percent of student of grades 3, 5, and 8 of all public



schools in National Assessment Test (NAT) for two full days in 2015'. Although these two DLIs will be dropped, they will be monitored as intermediate results indicators.

Despite tremendous efforts from MoBSE the targets were not achieved because they were (a) too ambitious and (b) did not take into account shifts in attendance rates beyond the control of the Government.

The target of 95 percent average attendance in grades 3, 5, and 8 against enrollment was too high, especially given that students are counted as 'having attended' only when they take the tests in all subjects. Furthermore, the NAT attendance rates are calculated on the basis of enrollment data (denominator), which are collected six months before the NAT through the EMIS. During this six-month period, the enrollment usually decreases because some students drop out from school or migrate to other countries. Further, some students are unable to take the NAT because of family travel and cultural engagements during that time of the year (June). Although the NAT attendance rates did improve from 87 percent (2013) to 90 percent (2015) (using this same calculation), the Government cannot fully control the reduction in enrollment over the six-month period between the EMIS data collection and the NAT.

Another three DLIs (DLIs 4, 7, and 9) will be dropped and the funding will be reallocated to Component 2. These will be kept as intermediate results indicators; however, the funding implications associated with the DLIs will be removed. This is because (a) the DLIs' payment mechanism makes it difficult for the MoBSE to have access to the funds because DLI proceeds are paid to the MoFEA, and MoBSE is not allowed to spend more than the budget approved by the National Assembly and (b) MoBSE's budget has not been augmented to capture the DLI proceeds because of the present macroeconomic constraints.

According to the project design, the DLI funds under Component 4 are transferred to the Government's consolidated account (MoFEA) once the MoBSE meets the annual DLIs. Owing to the present macroeconomic constraints, the sector has not been able to benefit from additional resources after meeting the DLIs. In a resource constrained context, the MoFEA has not been able to fully execute the budget. While the MoBSE met the first two DLIs (DLIs 1 and 2) in September 2013 and March 2014 and the World Bank transferred the money to the MoFEA in late 2014, the money has not yet been transferred to the MoBSE.

### **Project Financing by Component**

Amounts in each component will be slightly modified after thorough financial calculation of all the activities under the project. As less funding is needed to implement school sub-grants for UBS (subcomponent 1.4) in regions 3 through 6, and institutional support and capacity building (subcomponent 3.2), it will be allocated to Component 2 to support the NAT, teacher training, and reading program for early grades. The table below provides a brief overview of current and proposed costs including the Government contribution of US\$16 million while tables in section IV describes financing by components described in the original PAD and proposed changes.

<b>Current Component Name</b>	<b>Proposed Component Name</b>	<b>Current Cost (US\$M)</b>	<b>Proposed Cost (US\$M)</b>	<b>Action</b>
Component 1: Increase access to basic education	Component 1: Increase access to basic education	13.20	13.20	Revised
Component 2: Improve quality of teaching and learning	Component 2: Improve quality of teaching and learning	10.80	22.60	Revised
Component 3: Technical and Institutional Support	Component 3: Technical and Institutional Support	7.20	5.90	Revised

Component 4: Strengthening the education system with a focus on governance and management results	Component 4: Strengthening the education system with a focus on governance and management results	3.60	1.60	Revised
	<b>Total:</b>	34.80	43.30	

### Other Change(s)

Implementing Agency Name	Type	Action

### Change in Institutional Arrangements

Explanation:

**Co-operative Credit (GTUCCU).** While the MoBSE will be the implementation agency for the majority of activities including all activities funded by the ELP and providing the school subgrants, the MoFEA will also be responsible for payment of teachers' salaries and allowances, especially for the teachers who have a bank account. Details on the teacher salary and allowance mechanism as well as the mechanism in place for subgrants are provided below.

**Teacher's salaries and allowances.** For teachers' salaries and allowances, the MoBSE already provided the World Bank with the list of teachers in all public schools including employment numbers, names, position, location, and monthly net payroll amount, and the payment mechanism has been examined. The mechanism for payment of teachers' salaries and allowances is well established and well monitored and will be used to implement the AF. In The Gambia, teachers who have access to a bank receive their salaries through direct bank transfers from the Treasury under the MoFEA, whereas those who do not have access to any banks receive their salaries through the Gambia Teachers' Union. Monthly, the Accounting Unit of the MoBSE sends the list of teachers to be paid to the Treasury. The Treasury sends a payment advice to the CB with the list of the teachers to be paid. The Treasury writes a check under the MoBSE Permanent Secretary's (PS) name and gives the check to the PS. Then, the MoBSE PS requests the CB to pay the check amount to the GTUCCU and gives the voucher to the GTUCCU. The GTUCCU goes to each school every month with a list of teachers provided by the MoBSE. Each teacher has to be physically present with their national ID to receive their salaries. After making the payment, the GTUCCU and a payment focal point from each Regional Education Directorate (RED) have a meeting to discuss if teachers who were not at school on the payment day have been transferred to another region. If not, the GTUCCU sends the salaries of those not in attendance back to the Treasury. For reporting to the World Bank, the MoFEA will send the bank transfer confirmation for each teacher. The GTUCCU will provide the proof of payment to the teachers who were paid through them. In The Gambia, the issue of ghost teachers is minimal because a multi-layer monitoring system is in place which includes the following: (a) head teachers report to the RED if a teacher does not come to school for three days maximum without authorization, (b) 60 cluster monitors in the country, each in charge of about 12 schools, visit each school at least twice a month, and (c) head teachers report attendance of teachers to the RED everyday using mobile phones' text messages.

**School subgrants.** For school subgrants, as this has been already part of the project as DLIs 2 and 3 and in Subcomponent 1.4, the robust and transparent payment mechanism has already been proved efficient. For the construction work, the MoBSE has visited all 48 newly built multi-grade schools and surrounding communities, and there are strong needs for the ECD program in these communities. The impact evaluation has shown the positive impact of such programs on the learning of children who participated in ECD

programs annexed to LBS. The MoBSE will ensure the deployment of experienced qualified teachers in the ECD activities funded by this proposed AF.

**Procurement.** The procurement activities for the AF will be conducted using the existing institutional arrangements under the project coordination unit (PCU) for the implementation of the recent education sector projects (original project: P133079, Third Education Project - Phase 2: P077903, and Education For All Fast Track Initiative (EFA/FTI) Project: P115427). Procurement will be carried out according to the Guidelines: Procurement of Goods, Works and Non-consulting Services under IBRD Loans and IDA Credit and Grants by World Bank Borrowers dated January 2011 (revised July 2014) and Guidelines: Selection and Employment of Consultants under IBRD Loans and IDA Credits and Grants by World Bank Borrowers dated January 2011 (revised July 2014). The Procurement Plan for the project (dated July 28 2016) has been updated. The PCU is fully integrated in the MoBSE and the team is well versed in the IDA procedures, and has handled procurement under previous and ongoing IDA programs as well as all other donor operations where an executing agency is not in place (including AfDB, Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa, and Islamic Development Bank, among others). The PCU has been functioning satisfactorily over the past 10 years. Based on this experience, it is expected that the sum of expertise gained in the education sector projects will highly benefit the arrangement of the READ extension project and will help mitigate the residual risks that may exist.

### Change in Financial Management

Explanation:

**Flow of funds.** For expenditures under category 5 (new), that is, teachers' salaries and allowances and so on, the MoFEA will use the reimbursement method of expenditures pre-financed from the recipient's resources. Hence, no designated account (DA) is needed for this category. For expenditures under new categories 6 (IDA Grant financed) and 7 (ELP Trust Fund financed), one new pooled DA will be opened and managed by the MoBSE in the CB of the Gambia. This DA will use interim financial report (IFR)-based disbursements (that is, IFRs). The initial advance to this account will be based on a six-month forecast of expenditures and replenished quarterly for ongoing periods.

**Financial reporting.** The IFR reporting arrangements as in place under the original financing will continue but will be done through one consolidated revised IFR template which incorporates this AF grant and trust fund.

## Appraisal Summary

### Economic and Financial Analysis

Explanation:

A thorough economic and financial analysis was conducted during preparation of the original project. It found evidence of increasing returns to education as the level of education increases and found the project to be economically viable. The project rationale as applied to the AF remains. The lower bound of present discounted value of benefits for the overall project was estimated to be US\$74.4 million while the present discounted value of costs was estimated to be US\$40.3 million. The cost-benefit scenario under Component 1 (Access to Education) reveals a strong, convincing investment decision even under very narrow conservative assumptions.

Currently there are 100,349 children in ECD (EMIS 2016) with disparities in the GER at regional and district levels. There are 48 multi-grade schools that were recently built in remote areas that had neither an LBS nor an ECD program. Out of these 48 schools, 27 schools will be selected to have an ECD classroom built attached to them, as described above, based on the number of children ages 0 to 6 and distance to the nearest ECD program. With this proposed AF, an additional 800 children are expected to enroll to pre-primary education in these remote areas. In addition, through the support to teachers' salaries, 13,932

teachers will be temporarily compensated through the project to address the emergency financial crisis.

The Government, by providing free education to children from grade 1 to 12, supports their participation in schooling and promotes equity. Given the cost to education is the biggest barrier to education (Barriers to Participation and Retention Study. MoBSE and World Bank 2013), public provision and financing of free education for children is a critical intervention. Further, since the provision of school grants by the Government started, enrollment has been increasing, as mentioned in the Sectoral and Institutional Context of this Project Paper.

A key aspect of the Bank's value added relates to the proposed approach for the AF and is that it will provide support to address the emergency financial situation while at the same time building capacity and strengthening the education system overall. The Bank is uniquely placed to deliver this approach of providing substantial financial support in the sector as well as strengthening the education system. The importance of the system-based approach is that it fosters important behaviors on the part of the client, including planning and monitoring of education sector outcomes.

### **Technical Analysis**

Explanation:

The technical design builds on that of the original project, particularly by drawing on lessons learned related to the adjustment of the ECD component. Consistent progress in implementation of the original project suggests that current project design and implementation arrangements remain sufficient and that the AF will benefit from solid financial mechanisms put in place under the original project. Of particular importance are the lessons learned from the analysis on annex and community-based approaches to ECD and the evidence base which indicates that funding for the annexed approach is the best approach in this context. Technical analysis was also conducted for the temporary funding of teachers' salaries. For these salaries and allowances, the MoBSE already provided the World Bank with the list of teachers in all public schools, including employment numbers, names, positions, locations, and monthly net payroll amounts, and the payment mechanism has been examined. The mechanism for payment of teachers' salaries and allowances is well established and well monitored and the AF carefully builds upon this well-established mechanism to receive accurate verification of payments for reimbursements. Finally, for school subgrants, which have been funded under the parent project and will be further funded under the AF, the robust and transparent payment mechanism already established will remain in place as part of DLIs 2 and 3.

### **Social Analysis**

Explanation:

The safeguard classification for the project remains Category B. The proposed AF will maintain the safeguard arrangements put in place for the implementation of the original project. The PCU, in collaboration with the National Environment Agency (NEA) will continue screening all activities to determine whether they trigger any safeguard policies. All subprojects that trigger any safeguard policy would comply with the measures outlined in the Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) and the Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), that were prepared, reviewed, approved, and disclosed both in-country and at the World Bank's InfoShop before the appraisal of the original project in August 2013. The ESMF was recently modified and disclosed in the country and at the InfoShop on July 8, 2016. Resettlement Action Plans would be prepared if necessary during project implementation, especially during school construction subprojects. The proposed changes to the project will not trigger any additional safeguard policies.

### **Environmental Analysis**

Explanation:

The environmental categorization for the project remains unchanged. The project is classified as Category B because of the potential environmental and social impacts associated with school building construction (including teachers' quarters, water points, and latrines), which are localized and can be easily mitigated. As noted above, the project has an ESMF and RPF outlining screening mechanisms and mitigation measures, in compliance with the safeguard policies triggered: Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01) and Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP 4.12). Environmental and Social Management Plans will be prepared as and when necessary during project implementation, especially for all schools construction subprojects. In addition, the implementing agency, MoBSE, has entered into an agreement (through a memorandum of understanding signed in 2013) with the NEA for safeguards compliance monitoring in line with both World Bank and national environmental safeguards policies.

**Risk**

Explanation:

The AF overall risk rating is assessed as Substantial with substantial risk ratings in Macroeconomic and Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability. As stated in the country context section, The Gambia is currently facing very difficult fiscal issues. The overvalued Dalasi against the U.S. dollar with the pegged exchange rate, although lifted in January 2016, accelerated depletion of the foreign reserves. Due to the Ebola crisis in the neighboring countries, tourism in The Gambia tremendously decreased in 2014 and 2015, and it still has not come back to the level before the Ebola crisis. Delays in spending cuts, declining tax receipts, unbudgeted spending, and debt payments, all contributed to a fiscal deficit of 9.6 percent of GDP in 2015. The International Monetary Fund and the World Bank have been closely monitoring the macro situation in the country and discussing with the MoFEA what needs to be done to mitigate the financial crisis.

Due to the nature of the project, which is centered on temporary provision of salaries to teachers and adding classrooms to preexisting schools (using the annexed ECD approach in which an extra room is added to a preexisting structure) to expand ECD, no risks have been identified as having a potential negative impact on climate. Construction related to the ECD subcomponent (Subcomponent 1.3) is expected to be low risk, small-scale, and site specific and will fit into the preexisting environmental safeguards instruments, which cover the target regions. Precautions which consider heavy rains during the rainy season are already taken into account for the school construction component and environmental risks are regularly assessed as part of the safeguards monitoring.

**IV. Original and revised project financing**

**Table 1. Original Project Financing Detail (US\$M)**

Component Name	Total Cost	Financing Sources		
		IDA Parent	GPE	Government
Component 1: Increase access to basic education	13.2	3.6	2.4	7.2
Component 2: Improve quality of teaching and learning	10.8	4.0	2.2	4.6
Component 3: Technical and Institutional Support	7.2	2.0	1.0	4.2

Component 4: Strengthening the education system with a focus on governance and management results	3.6	2.3	1.3	0.0
Total Financing Cost	34.8	11.9	6.9	16.0

**Table 2. Proposed Project Financing Detail (US\$M)**

Component Name	Total Cost	Financing Sources				
		IDA Parent	GPE	Gov't	IDA AF	ELP
Component 1: Increase access to basic education	13.2	2.1	2.9	7.2		1.0
Component 2: Improve quality of teaching and learning	22.6	8.1	2.4	4.6		7.5
Component 3: Technical and Institutional Support	5.9	0.7	1.0	4.2		
Component 4: Strengthening the education system with a focus on governance and management results	1.6	1.0	0.6	0		
Total Financing Cost	43.3	11.9	6.9	16.0	7.5	1.0

## V. World Bank Grievance Redress

Communities and individuals who believe that they are adversely affected by a World Bank (WB) supported project may submit complaints to existing project-level grievance redress mechanisms or the WB's Grievance Redress Service (GRS). The GRS ensures that complaints received are promptly reviewed in order to address project-related concerns. Project affected communities and individuals may submit their complaint to the WB's independent Inspection Panel which determines whether harm occurred, or could occur, as a result of WB non-compliance with its policies and procedures. Complaints may be submitted at any time after concerns have been brought directly to the World Bank's attention, and Bank Management has been given an opportunity to respond. For information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank's corporate Grievance Redress Service (GRS), please visit <http://www.worldbank.org/GRS>. For information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank Inspection Panel, please visit [www.inspectionpanel.org](http://www.inspectionpanel.org)

## VI. The Gambia: Country Financing Parameters

24. The Gambia: Country Financing Parameters states "Recurrent cost financing will be determined by project specific considerations. Generally, only short-term recurrent expenditures necessary for project implementation have been and are expected to be financed, and hence, the level of recurrent cost financing in World Bank projects is not expected to be significant. However, in preparing the Community Driven Development project the possibility of financing recurrent costs of local governments will be explored. In determining World Bank financing of recurrent costs in individual projects, the World Bank will take into account sustainability issues at the sector and project levels."

25. Providing financing for teacher salaries and allowances is justified for the following reason: as discussed in the Country Context section above, The Gambian economy is currently facing the combined effects of macroeconomic challenges and policy slippages. These effects are putting increasing pressure on revenue and therefore on the Government's ability to execute its planned budget for 2016. There is evidence that resource allocations, in 2016, to a number of departments have been substantially reduced, compared both to 2015 and to their original 2016 budgetary authority. These reductions have already affected payments for some programmed education sector expenditures managed by the MoBSE. However, up to June 2016, the MoFEA has been paying all teachers' salaries, allowances, and school subgrants related to the READ Project on time. It is planned that the proposed AF will start financing teachers' salaries and school grants soon after the AF becomes effective.

26. Nevertheless, there is no guarantee that these levels of resource allocation can or will be sustained. Looking forward there are a number of major expenditures that need to be paid in the coming months, including debt payments and fuel for the power sector, which will challenge the Government's cash flow management. There is, therefore, a substantial risk that payments in support of the READ Project will be disrupted.

27. The success of the READ Project depends crucially on sustaining the momentum of implementation and ensuring predictable educational experiences for children who are attending schools. Any disruption to salary payments would likely impact teacher attendance. Besides the short-term impact of such absences, in the medium-term they might well undermine community and parental confidence in school attendance, especially if school grants were also held back. It could take time to recover from such loss of confidence, even after salary payments resume.

### Annex 1: Revised Results Framework and Monitoring Indicators

Project Name:	Results for Education Achievement and Development Project (READ) (P160282)			Project Stage:	Additional Financing	Status:	DRAFT
Team Leader(s):	Ryoko Tomita	Requesting Unit:	AFCF1	Created by:	Ryoko Tomita on 10-Jun-2016		
Product Line:	IBRD/IDA	Responsible Unit:	GED07	Modified by:	Ryoko Tomita on 25-Jul-2016		
Country:	Gambia, The	Approval FY:	2017				
Region:	AFRICA	Lending Instrument:	Investment Project Financing				
Parent Project ID:	P133079	Parent Project Name:	READ: Results for Education Achievement and Development Project (P133079)				
<b>Project Development Objectives</b>							
Original Project Development Objective - Parent:							
To increase access to basic education, improve quality of teaching and learning in lower basic schools, and strengthen education systems.							
Proposed Project Development Objective - Additional Financing (AF):							
<b>Results</b>							
Core sector indicators are considered: Yes				Results reporting level: Program Level			
<b>Project Development Objective Indicators</b>							
Status	Indicator Name	Core	Unit of Measure		Baseline	Actual(Current)	End Target
Revised	Direct project beneficiaries	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	300,463	305,000
				Date	15-Aug-2013	10-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	The target of this indicator is being revised upward because more than an estimated annual increase of 3		



					percent of students are enrolling in schools. About the same number of students will be enrolled in the 2 multi-grade schools and 27 ECD classrooms funded by the ELP as the number of students who would have been enrolled in 40 community-based ECD centers.		
No Change	Female beneficiaries	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	0.00	52.00	50.00
			Sub Type				
			Supplemental				
Revised	Additional students in public ECD, LBS, and UBS (Total)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	45,702	48,000
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment		Baseline (EMIS 2013): Government ECD: 18,152; Public LBS: 184,080; Public UBS: 69,372  Current (EMIS 2016): Government ECD: 23,897; Public LBS: 221,204; Public UBS: 72,205	The target is being revised to take account of additional students in public schools targeted by the project.
Revised	Mean scores in (English) in grade 3 in National Assessment Test (NAT)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	41.50		43.00
				Date	31-Jul-2012	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	Currently not available as designed. It will be available after NAT 2017. The revision of the target is to take account of an increase in the grade 1 intake by 22 percent from 2012 to 2015. Many of these additional students are from disadvantaged families. International experience		

					shows that performance in language tests by students with this background in general is lower compared to the average student.		
Revised	Teachers in grades 1–3, from randomly selected 15% of schools, showing good teaching performance as observed through the new classroom observation tool	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	0.00	0.00	60.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	The indicator is being revised to add ‘from randomly selected 15% of schools’. More precisely, data source and methodology will be revised to: annual sample of 15% of randomly selected public LBS generated by MoBSE Planning Directorate during second term January–March with collection of all classroom observation tool (COT) forms from the selected schools. In 2016, samples from 50 schools were collected and 13 schools were using the COT properly.		
Revised	Head Teachers in lower basic schools adjusting School Development Plans in response to NAT results and approved by regional directorates using an agreed upon checklist	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	0.00	0.00	80.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	The indicator remains the same. However, the word ‘DLI year 3’ is being removed. Verification is being slightly modified to reflect the reality of approval system, from ‘Verification is being undertaken by a third party (consultancy) based on agreed upon terms of reference through review and evaluation of the Annual School Development Plans based on the checklist and the Approval Letters by Regional Directors. The MoBSE monitoring and evaluation function will provide the Annual School Development Plans’ to ‘Verification will be undertaken by a third party (consultancy) based on agreed upon terms of reference through review and evaluation of the Annual School Development Plans based on the checklist and approval with stamp and signature by Regional Directors. The MoBSE SQAD will provide the Annual School Development Plans’.		
<b>Intermediate Results Indicators</b>							

Status	Indicator Name	Core	Unit of Measure		Baseline	Actual(Current)	End Target
New	Citizen feedback was included in the development of school improvement grant manual, measured by minutes of meeting with citizens	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	Yes	Yes
				Comment	This indicator is being added because an indicator measuring citizen engagement is now a World Bank requirement.		
New	Pupil textbook ratio of core textbooks in grades 1–9 in public schools	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ratio	Value	0.00	0.00	1.00
				Date	06-Jul-2016	06-Jul-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	This indicator is being added because now the project will support the provision of textbooks.		
New	Number of additional classrooms built for ECD	<input type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	0.00	29.00
				Date	01-Jun-2016	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	The target value includes 27 ECD classrooms annexed to LBS and 2 ECD classrooms in the 2 multi-grade schools.		
New	Average NAT attendance of grade 3 and 5 students in all public schools for two full days	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	89.10	92.30	95.00
				Date	01-Sep-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	G3: 89.8, and G5: 88.5 (2013 NAT)	G3: 92.7, and G5: 92 (2015 NAT for G3 and 2014 NAT for G5)	
New	Average NAT attendance of grade 8 students in all public schools for two full days	<input type="checkbox"/>	Ratio	Value	83.70	87.10	90.00
				Date	01-Sep-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment		(2015 NAT)	
Revised	Stationery packages provided to students in lower basic schools in hardship areas	<input type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	46,731	47,000
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment		Hardship data	The end target is being

						<p>were not updated in the EMIS data system when the project was prepared, and the final updating of EMIS data on hardship schools has just been completed. To determine if each school is in a hardship area or not requires mapping of each school, as schools are considered to be in a hardship area if they are more than 3 km from the main road.</p>	<p>revised upward based on the revised school mapping of hardship areas.</p>
Revised	Number of additional classrooms built or rehabilitated at the primary level resulting from project interventions.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	80.00	84.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	The target is being revised to take into consideration the construction of two multi-grade schools (four classrooms for primary level).		
No Change	Communities more than 3 km to nearest lower basic school in Regions 3,4,5, and 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	17.00	12.50	14.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	Target is not being revised even though it has been		

					surpassed. Progress calculation is based on 2003 census data with projections. Achievement may change when the calculation is conducted based on the data from 2013 census.		
No Change	Number of additional qualified primary teachers resulting from project interventions	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	994	1,750
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	Student teachers enrolled in revised PTC program	<input type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	0.00	900
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
Revised	Externally reviewed and overseen end-of-year examination in place for students completing second year of revised PTC and HTC programs at Gambia College	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	No	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	Average teachers' attendance on time	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	90.00	95.00	95.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	ECD monitoring tool developed by ECD Unit in MoBSE	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
Revised	Public upper basic and senior secondary schools installed with solar power	<input type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value	0.00	0.00	24
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
Revised	Basic Education Sector communication strategy developed by the MoBSE	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	No	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			

No Change	Reading curriculum guidelines developed by Directorate of Curriculum at MoBSE based on evaluation results of early reading strategies	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	HR supplementary data (personnel details, qualifications, promotion and postings history) updated in HR database at Directorate of HR at MoBSE	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
Revised	Annual formal and informal school fees paid by parents to public lower basic schools	<input type="checkbox"/>	Amount (US\$)	Value	12.00	0.00	0.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	The indicator remains the same. The only change will be the word 'DLI' being removed. It will be a regular intermediate results indicator.		
Revised	Annual formal and informal school fees paid by parents to public upper basic schools	<input type="checkbox"/>	Amount (US\$)	Value	17.00	0.00	0.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	The indicator remains the same. The only change will be the word 'DLI' being removed. It will be a regular intermediate results indicator.		
No Change	DLI 2: First tranche (40%) of annual school grants transferred from MoBSE by September 15 in year 0 to all public lower basic schools (DLI year 0)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	15-Dec-2015	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	DLI 3: First tranche (40%) of annual school grants transferred from MoBSE by September 15 in year 1 to all	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			

	public upper basic schools (DLI year 1)						
Marked for Deletion	DLI 5 and 8: Average attendance by students in public schools in NAT for grade 3, 5, and 8 for full two days (DLI year 1 and 2)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	88.00	90.00	95.00
				Date	31-Jul-2012	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment	This indicator will be deleted; however, it will be captured as two new intermediate results indicators tracking (a) average attendance by students in public schools in NAT grades 3 and 5, and (b) average attendance by students in public schools in NAT grade 8.		
No Change	Annual training, promotion and postings exercise based on annually updated personnel records in interfaced EMIS and HR systems	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	DLI 6: Annual school census data collection carried out including Madrassas and minimum 95% response rate and results and analytical report released by May 2014	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes/No	Value	No	Yes	Yes
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	Head teachers skilled to interpret NAT results	<input type="checkbox"/>	Percentage	Value	0.00	95.00	95.00
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			
No Change	UBS and SSS English teachers benefited from training programs using the newly developed e-curriculum	<input type="checkbox"/>	Number	Value		0.00	200
				Date	15-Aug-2013	01-Jun-2016	28-Feb-2018
				Comment			

Note: HR = Human Resources.