



1. Project Data :
OEDID: C2428
Project ID: P000933
Project Name: Tertiary Education Project
Country: Ghana
Sector: Higher Education
L/C Number: Cr. 2428-GH
Partners involved : None
Prepared by : Rebecca Macina
Reviewed by : Linda A. Dove
Group Manager : G. Ingram
Date Posted : 05/14/1999

<p>2. Project Objectives, Financing, Costs and Components :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To support the first phase of the government's tertiary education reform program . <p><i>Objectives:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> To increase educational quality and relevance in tertiary institutions . To establish financing arrangements within the tertiary system capable of maintaining quality as enrollments increased. To gradually expand access to tertiary education . To improve management efficiency in resource use . To establish institutional capacities for system monitoring and evaluation . <p><i>Components:</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> A central component for the Ministry of Education (MOE) and the proposed new boards for accreditation, admissions and examinations, consisting of: (i) office equipment, computers, and vehicles; (ii) staff development; (iii) technical assistance; (iv) studies; and (v) assistance in project management. An institutional component for each of the three established universities, the proposed University College and the six existing polytechnics, consisting of (i) civil works; (ii) laboratory and workshop equipment and equipment maintenance; (iii) textbooks, library journals and reference books, (iv) computers; (v) vehicles, (vi) staff development; (vii) research funding (at the universities); and (viii) management and technical assistance (TA). <p><i>Partnership</i></p> <p>IDA project would build upon the achievements of an earlier AfDB investment of US\$ 15 million in the construction and rehabilitation of teaching workshops at the polytechnics .</p>
--

<p>3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives :</p> <p>To address the decline in educational quality, the project provided large inputs of instructional materials . The relevance of the polytechnic curriculum was addressed with TA to support the updating of course objectives, organization, and practical training . A substantial staff development program in the polytechnics was undertaken to strengthen the foundation for increased offerings of Higher National Diploma courses . Government established polytechnic councils with strong private sector representation to oversee the relevance of these institutional programs. Professional development opportunity for 216 university staff and skills upgrading in pedagogy was provided. A research fund which sought to introduce greater Ghanaian content into university teaching was established. A national Accreditation Board to permanently monitor the quality of educational programs was established.</p>

<p>4. Significant Achievements :</p> <p>Despite challenging budgetary and political upheavals, the government eventually (1998/99) succeeded in introducing hostel fees, covering about 25 percent of the full cost of student accommodation . Polytechnics and universities gradually established other cost-recovery charges of US\$50 to US\$80 per student. Gains in cost-sharing, however, could not stabilize a huge financing problem . The government also united five small teacher</p>

training colleges on a common campus in Winneba . This institution is slowly beginning to help upgrade teacher quality and is increasing its capacity to offer in -service distance learning programs for teachers .

5. Significant Shortcomings :

In OED's view, the main shortcoming was that the improvements made in management's efficiency of resource use was not sufficient to achieve an appropriate balance between expansion and quality . University enrollments expanded by 95%, but far surpassed the agreed 1997/98 ceiling for managed system expansion of 22%, though the ICR did not spell out the cost and budgetary implications . Under severe budgetary and political duress, the Government undermined its investments in quality by reducing the tertiary sub -sector share of the education budget by one-fifth and by postponing decisions on student cost -sharing. The student loan scheme proved non -viable having generated a US\$ 16 million deficit; a committee was belatedly appointed to recommend restructuring of the program, with a report expected in 1999. Numerous changes of leadership also weakened the ability of institutions and government to meet their obligations in pursuit of project goals . Persistently weak and tense communication among middle-level managers at the tertiary institutions and with the MOE and the Project Management Unit did little to help project implementation. Timely provision of matching funds by government was a chronic problem . Lobbying for funds absorbed the project manager's time to the detriment of other important aspects . AfDB re-organization and staffing turnover seriously delayed its project, thereby disrupting the sequencing of the IDA project . These delays also slowed completion of the IDA project's civil works by one year .

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome :	Satisfactory	Marginally Satisfactory	OED validates the ICR comment that outcome was satisfactory but barely so .
Institutional Dev .:	Substantial	Substantial	
Sustainability :	Uncertain	Uncertain	
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	ICR comments that performance was barely satisfactory in the policy area, but highly satisfactory in implementation of activities. OED notes that policy changes were begun in difficult circumstances and rates implementation as satisfactory .
Quality of ICR :		Exemplary	

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability :

OED validates the main ICR lessons .

- (Borrower) The Bank needs to be more sensitive to political constraints and behave with awareness that where change involves people, implementation necessarily takes longer .
- (Bank) Tertiary education projects are unusual in that the universities are generally stronger, better endowed, and more capable than other public institutions and have an organized and powerful constituency . Thus, broad consultation and institutional participation is essential not only in project design, but continuously through implementation. Consequently, Bank supervision of tertiary projects requires more effort and resources than is the norm .
- Managed expansion of tertiary enrollments is critical for maintaining educational quality, yet political demands make it very difficult for governments to exercise this control even with the support of the legal agreement agreed with the Bank . For this reason, Bank staff should make these key project variables a permanent part of their dialogue with government and be prepared to take strong measures at the first indication that enrollment growth is exceeding government's capacity to finance the expansion . Total recurrent expenditure per student is recommended as the main performance indicator for monitoring the balance between expansion and quality .
- Where improvement in the quality of tertiary education is an explicit project objective, relevant performance indicators measuring student learning should be identified or created to effectively monitor impact .
- When Bank-supported projects are expected to include parallel donor financing, care should be taken to ensure that each donor-financed component can be implemented independently . The difficulties of coordinating procurement, no-objections, and disbursements by two separate funding institutions are nearly

insurmountable.

- Tertiary students can stalemata tertiary reform, particularly with regard to cost -sharing, student privileges, student loans, and scholarships . However, the transitory status of students and frequent turnover in student leadership make effective consensus -building with students difficult to attain . Consequently, any agreements reached are likely to be temporary . Mechanisms for continuous communication and consultation should be included in project design . Nevertheless, in the case of Ghana, the Borrower and the Bank recognize that consultations may sometimes fail to foster agreements .

OED adds in the design of investment projects the Bank and borrower must tailor their goals and implementation plans to include strong contingency plans to offset risks foreseen that do eventually cause serious problems during implementation. As the ICR states, they must act decisively when necessary to redesign components under threat . In this case, risks were accurately identified but contingencies were insufficiently worked out or remedies to hand were not applied promptly.

8. Audit Recommended? Yes No

Why? Eventual review of education sector development operations assisted by the Bank and other donors assistance in a key CDF pilot country; and a future update to the 1995 CAR.

9. Comments on Quality of ICR :

The ICR is candid, balanced, fair and analytical and the self -evaluation is richer than is typical for ICRs in education . Lessons for Ghana are insightful and also more broadly relevant .