

LAND POLICY DIALOGUES
Addressing Urban-Rural Synergies
in World Bank facilitated dialogues in the last decade

Final Report
June 27th 2007

Acknowledgements:

This report was authored by Shrikant Barhate (Short Term Consultant) under the guidance of Robin Rajack and Malcolm Childress – co-chairs of the World Bank’s Thematic Groups on Housing & Land and Land Policy and Administration respectively. The review was funded by a Challenge Fund grant awarded by the Sustainable Development Network’s Vice-Presidency. Comments on an earlier draft were received from Robert Buckley (Housing Advisor) and Olivier Hassler (Senior Housing Finance Specialist). The views expressed are those of the author and not necessarily the World Bank.

Executive Summary:

Land policy, administration and management are areas of strong client demand for technical advice and operational support. With rapid urbanization, the contentiousness of these issues particularly with respect to land at the urban/rural fringe has increased significantly. This Review sought to help the Bank better position itself to present coherent advice on policy, institutional arrangements and practice. The potential implications are a lowering of reputational risk to the Bank; greater efficiency in the process including joint data gathering; and building of greater momentum and ownership of national land policy dialogues.

The approach adopted for the review started with a general outline of the Bank's development logic in rural and urban sectors followed by a review of some key documents that outline the Bank's policy positions. This led to the identification of specific lenses for assessing the extent to which the urban and rural Bank task teams accommodate each other's perspectives in the content of the dialogues that they facilitate. The lenses were as follows:

- Land conversion in peri-urban areas
- Land policy impact on food security issues
- Land use planning, zoning, regulations etc.
- Compensation for land acquisition
- Institutional integration for land admin.
- Political economy concerns
- Development priorities

This was followed by a summary of the Bank's land policy dialogue portfolio over the decade FY96 to FY06. The dialogues were classified according to themes, sector and regions. A non-random sample of individual land policy dialogues was then reviewed based on the earlier identified criteria. Another regionally mixed sample of dialogues was also examined through similar lenses but this time the operational project interface was considered and the focal point was the package of dialogues and related projects in the country rather than the individual dialogues. The reviewed dialogues were then classified according to the extent to which core Bank team membership and peer reviewers were cross-sectoral. Finally some concluding reflections and tentative recommendations were offered.

The outputs of the exercise are:

- (i) A database of the Bank's Land Policy Dialogues in the last 10 years
- (ii) A Background Paper that will later inform a Position Paper
- (iii) Tentative Recommendations for improving the way ongoing and future dialogues are pursued

The Review found that dialogues are not as divergent as initially thought. Positions that are central to the Bank's message on tenure security, land market efficiencies, administrative integration, proactive and economically efficient land use management and encouragement of rental markets, all receive consonant reflection from the prescriptive policy advice generated by the Bank. The link between balanced dialogues and balanced projects is; however, weaker. Team mixture normally occurs at the peer review level rather than core team composition although in some rare cases such as Albania, more encouraging examples of cross-sectoral team and project composition were found.

The Review suggests that an integrated approach does not warrant the liquidation of certain specialized thematic policy perspectives; but would probably be better served by a conscious effort to achieve an optimum institutional balance in the dialogue and project review processes and in core team composition. As such, no compelling case for merging of the Housing and Land and the Land Policy and Administration Thematic Groups was found.

The review notes that especially in democratic environments, policy prescriptions are to be judged in the dynamics of political economy and that land is one component where the bargaining becomes most contested. However few avenues in existing dialogues were found to address cross-sectoral political economy concerns which are arguably vital to the success of Bank's efforts to launch appropriate interventions. Correcting this may require shortening the informative part of dialogue documentation and strengthening the analytical component with conclusions and recommendations. This is important in the context of post-implementation evaluation as it would provide a conceptual foundation for follow-up activities related to the dialogues.

Finally the Review suggests the need to go beyond the desk review that was possible in this undertaking and to use more extensive consultations with Task Team Leaders and Sector Managers to convert the Background Paper produced under the current exercise into a Position Paper with a wider audience.

Introduction

This report outlines a framework for the assessment of land policy dialogues and then applies it to a cross-section of dialogues facilitated by the World Bank over the last ten years. The Bank's interest in promoting an effective land policy approach in the developing world is prominently reflected in three recent major Bank publications. These include the 2003 policy research report 'Land Policies for Growth and Poverty Reduction'; the 'Dynamics of Global Urban Expansion' published in 2005; and the 2006 urban shelter portfolio review, 'Thirty Years of World Bank Shelter Lending' .

Given the increasing recognition of the importance of land policy to development, the Bank is keen to ensure that there is enough coordination between the staff affiliated with urban and rural sector interventions and that the policy advice generated by these staff adequately accommodates the features of rural and urban development logic. The view is that this pre-requisite would remove the probability of policy inconsistencies, ambiguities and contradictions especially in the context of the rural/urban fringe where the rate of land conversion is usually highest. There is an admission of the sense of urgency to review the scope and nature of land policy dialogues and analytical work given the recent placement of both the urban and rural development sectors of bank work under the new Sustainable Development Network. This report is the first step in undertaking that review and is meant to serve as a background piece to a position paper that the Bank would later produce.

Structure of the Report/ Review

The approach adopted for the review is reflected in the structure of this Report. It starts with a general outline of the Bank's development logic in the rural and urban sectors followed by a review of some key documents that either outline the Bank's policy prescriptions or sets the agenda for the debate for exploring the right policy path for urban and rural land. This leads to the identification of some specific lenses for assessing the extent to which the urban and rural Bank task teams accommodate each other's perspectives in the content of the dialogues that they facilitate.

This is followed by a summary of the Bank's land policy dialogue portfolio over the decade FY96 to FY06. The dialogues are classified according to themes, sector and regions.

The next section (Section 3) presents a review of a non-random sample of individual land policy dialogues based on the earlier identified criteria. In Section 4, another regionally representative sample of dialogues is examined through similar lenses but this time the operational project interface is considered and the focal point is the package of dialogues in the country rather than the individual dialogues. The report then briefly classifies the reviewed dialogues according to the extent to which core Bank team membership and peer reviewers were cross-sectoral. Finally some concluding reflections and recommendations are offered.

SECTION 1:

Development Logic

Under its Comprehensive Development Framework the Bank expects development strategies to be ‘comprehensive and shaped by a long-term vision’ as a principled position. It also sees a desirable link among the adjustment of strategy, targeted outcomes and a changing world. While this strategic direction enjoys a closer link with the Bank’s view of sustainable development, it also forces a probative enquiry into different sets of conceptual contents and policy directions.

For example, within the gamut of urban development, the Bank defines sustainable objectives as improving the lives of the poor and promoting equity. These are objectives of considerable magnitude and therefore require appropriate strategies including due insistence on property rights. At the same time national development objectives need to be seen in the context of a changing world, which also needs strategic adjustment. Urban growth may put pressure on the land supply within the city and land use planning may require a fundamental review with clear implications for peri-urban areas. Nations may have to make land available for the rationale of economic development which in turn may have impact on agricultural land.

Land policy is one of the areas where these two sets of objectives need to be reconciled. For example, nations such as India, China, and Indonesia are currently facing substantial problems in large level land acquisition for development purposes to the extent that in some instances the appearance of social upheaval is attributed to the changes in national land policy directions. Land use conversion in these contexts requires subsequent development interventions for the people whose land is at stake. Many times the debate is drawn clearly on the urban-rural divide. Therefore it is useful here to ask whether targeted outcomes in urban and rural policy environments are always compatible in a changing world and whether contestation of economic spaces can be classified along the urban rural lines. And if there are indeed real concerns for managing the interfaces between urban and rural land, it would be expected that ways through which the policy environment can be adjusted to address the concerns should emerge from the policy dialogues.

Policy normally assumes more than one meaning, ranging from policy as a statement of intent, as a label for a field of activity, as an expression of general purpose or desired state of affairs, as a program, as a theory or model or policy as specific proposals (Hogwood & Gunn, 1984). World Bank’s policy advice envelops all of these meanings. Additionally in the context of the Bank’s role and functions, the prescriptive dimension of policy assumes a new importance. World Bank’s possesses significant capabilities, not only reflected in the technical sphere of development operations but also augmented by its vast institutional memory and diverse range of experiences throughout the world. It therefore matters what the Bank has to say about the critical areas of development dynamics. Land amounts to be a critical quantum of such dynamics.

It is thus worthwhile to know the urban-rural land policy features of the Bank’s thinking over the decade. However given the context of the rural/urban fringe where the rate of

land conversion is usually highest and where the interest of this exercise is specifically focused, some degree of issue filtration is required. At this juncture it would be appropriate look at four documents which capture the Bank's recent overarching thinking for urban and rural land policies.

Evolution of the WB's Land Policy

In their 1999 research paper titled 'The Evolution of the World Bank's Land Policy: Principles, Experience and future Challenges', Deininger & Binswanger argued that a considerable shift has occurred in the earlier assumptions concerning rural land policies that were reflected in the Bank's Land Reform Policy Paper in 1975. They found that contrary to an earlier advice of the Bank to abandon communal tenure system in favor of freehold titles some communal tenure arrangements can increase tenure security and provide a (limited) basis for cost effective land transactions moreso than freehold titles. They also linked the issue of titles to a broader strategy for rural development. Research also adopted a cautious view of unrestricted land markets and emphasized removing the restrictions on rental markets and presented an optimistic opinion about the approach of encouraging community-managed agrarian reform based on voluntary negotiation for solving the problem of asset distribution and social exclusion. It would be worthy to know whether the same principles have continued to evolve as an effective solution in peri-urban context.

Land Policies for Growth and Poverty Reduction

'Land Policies for Growth and Poverty Reduction', a World Bank report in 2003, projects land policy as something fundamentally important to the broader development process rather than being perceived as a merely technical intervention. In the process, and based on post 1975 research findings, this report makes certain specific observations.

In urban land sale markets in Asia, especially at the rural urban fringe, the report talks about an 'inverse relationship between informality and the imposition of regulations' where a variety of restrictions including restrictions on conversion from agricultural to urban land in many peri-urban areas causes high prices of land for settlement which in turn encourages informality. The report outlines a policy option to auction unoccupied and valuable state owned/managed urban land to compensate original landowners or to provide land and services to the poor at the urban fringes at much lower cost. Based on the Chinese experience it notices the link between renewable, transferable longer user rights to urban lands with mortgage value and with longer time limits than for rural lands, and an active urban market in the advanced coastal provinces (Wang and Murie 2000).

While discussing the land administration institutions, the report relates the inadequate land ownership record with the reduced scope for privatizing high-value urban land and associated industries (Wadhwa 2002).

The report cautions against the state's tendency to employ land use regulation, especially in peri-urban areas, to impose state ownership of land or other ambitious undertakings and recommends the limiting of discretionary bureaucratic behavior especially in peri-urban areas.

In the concluding chapter the report aptly captures the issue based complementarities between the urban and rural land issues when it states

“Land issues often become most acute in peri-urban and urban areas. Because the same regulatory and institutional framework will apply to rural and urban land even though modalities of implementation may vary, separation between the two is frequently difficult to justify, and approaches now often deal with both simultaneously”.

Thirty Years of Shelter Lending

The Bank published a review in 2006 titled ‘Thirty Years of World Bank Shelter Lending: What have We Learned’ prepared by a team directed by Robert Buckley. The report focuses on the central query concerning the effectiveness of the World Bank's assistance to the developing countries in dealing with the shelter issues in the context of ever-expanding urbanization. This review also critically appreciates the impact exchanges between the changing policy environment and the structure of the Bank assistance over the years.

The report makes a vital observation that a considerable section of underserved people in countries in which formal housing finance is in an emergent stage indeed represent ‘an enormous potential audience for Bank assistance’ once the regulatory constraints are removed. At the same time, the report remains explicitly aware of the fact that the shelter sector issues need to be perceived, along with responding to the increased demand for assistance, within the complex framework of political economy.

In discussing the land market issues, the report questions the policy priority of formal titling and instead considers granting assurance to squatters against forceful demolition of dwellings as a viable option. In the post Istanbul-Habitat context, this policy recommendation not only appears cogent but also carries significant implications for the question of land use planning in the framework of urban expansion. The report notices an anomaly in not exploring interventions such as the land readjustment and land swaps as instruments of intervention in land markets. Based on the experiences and practices in places such as Germany, Japan, the Republic of Korea, Nepal and Singapore, the report remains optimistic about land readjustment schemes, and their ‘considerable potential for pursuing the dual objectives of enhancing tenure security and land use efficiency’. Besides the formal acknowledgement of the ‘mixed experiences with land acquisition’ the report also notices the potential future for enhancing the ‘governance of this process (land acquisition) and facilitating interventions on more strategically located land in future projects. In the representation of its view that formal titling may not be the most

important first step to take, the report agrees with a similar conclusion in relation to rural land in the Bank's 2003 Deininger-authored document on land policy.

In the concluding chapter, the report laments that the policy reforms and acceptance of the private sector participation is not complemented by the policy makers where they treat 'land as an important input into the provision of housing services'.

Urban Expansion

In 2005, the World Bank published a study titled 'The Dynamics of Global Urban Expansion'. This extensive study, through analyzing population data and satellite images for two time periods, observed that a doubling of urban population generally corresponds with 66 percent increase in urban land area. The report also notices that a doubling of income is associated with a 49 to 50 percent increase in urban land area. On the hand, the report links increasing agricultural productivity to the decline of urban land use.

These observations generate an important message; Urbanization will have an impact on the rural land and peri-urban areas should get ready for an urban expansion. The report asks for 'making realistic yet minimal plans for urban expansion' including measures identifying the spatial extensions to accommodate urban expansion as well as measures for 'protecting sensitive land from incursion by new urban development'.

In the context land policies, above mentioned measures raises the questions about planning choices, development priorities, institutional harmony and features of land transactions.

Analytical lenses for examining urban-rural land policy interface.

From the above discussion an analytical framework for for examining urban-rural land policy interface is proposed. It comprises seven lenses as follows:

1. Land conversion in the peri-urban areas
2. Land Policy impact on food security issues
3. Land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment
4. Compensation for the land acquisition
5. Institutional integration for land administration
6. Political economy concerns
7. Development priorities

SECTION 2

Summary of the Portfolio

For the purpose of this exercise a number of reports both from the category of Economic Sector Work as well as Technical Assistance were identified. A preliminary scrutiny of 90 documents based on the Regions (AFRICA, MENA, SAR, EA&P, ECA, LCR and MENA) Sectors (Urban and Rural), Document Type (Economic Sector Work & Technical Assistance) and Land Document Themes was done. Land documents were categorized in following themes.

- i. Rural Land Policy Documents (**RLPD**)
- ii. Urban Land Policy Documents (**ULPD**)
- iii. Land Reform Documents (**LRD**)
- iv. Land Administration Documents (**LAD**)
- v. Land Management Documents (**LMD**)
- vi. Land Issues in Urban Context (**LUCD**)
- vii. Housing/Slums Related Land Components (**HSLC**)
- viii. Land Studies (**LS**) including Land Rights, Land Markets, Land & Poverty, Land & Forest etc.

A complete list of the 92 documents is annexed (Annex.1). Approximately 57 of these documents were identified for their potential relevance to this assignment. These documents were primarily selected in the first five categories. The known gaps in this data are two-fold. This list generally does not include TA between the periods of 1996-2000 as the Operations Portal search capacity on the Bank's intranet does not cover this period for the documents in question. . This list also does not generally include the TA undertaken exclusively as part of the operational projects.

Table 1 shows that during the period in question the Bank was engaged in approximately sixty land policy dialogues. The most active regions were South Asia, East Asia and the Pacific and Africa. Land issues in the urban context were the most commonly focused upon theme followed by rural land policy and land reform. India was the subject of the highest number of dialogues.

Table 1: A Summary of Land Policy Dialogues: FY96-FY06

Region	Sector	Theme								Type	Total
		<u>RLPD</u>	<u>ULPD</u>	<u>LRD</u>	<u>LAD</u>	<u>LMD</u>	<u>LUCD</u>	<u>HSLC</u>	<u>LS</u>		
Africa	RS	1 South Africa		2 Regional South Africa	1 Madag.					ESW	
	RS			4 South Africa2 Zimbab. Namibia						TA	
	UDTP						3 Ethiop. Ghana Tanza.			ESW	
	UDTP									TA	
											<u>11</u>
SAR	RS	3 India 1 Sri Lanka 2			1 India					1 Ban gla.	ESW
	RS				1 India					TA	
	UDTP		1 Pakist.			1 Afghn.	2 Bangla. India	1 India		ESW	
	UDTP						3 India Sri lan. Pakist.	1 Maldiv	1 Indi.	TA	<u>16</u>
Region	Sector	Theme								Type	Total
EA&P	RS	1Viatn.		2 China			1 China			ESW	
	RS	2 Viatn.			1					TA	

		Indone.			Guinea Bissau						
	UDTP						1 Togo		1 Co mbo	ESW	
	UDTP						1 Indone.	1 Vietn.		TA	
											<u>11</u>
MENA	RS								2 Mor occo	ESW	
	RS									TA	
	UDTP		1 Yemen			1 Egypt		1 Iran	1 Yem en	ESW	
	UDTP									TA	
											<u>6</u>
LCR	RS	3 Regional Mexico Nicarag.			1 Ecuado r					ESW	
	RS				1 Mexico					TA	
	UDTP						2 Brazil México			ESW	
	UDTP						1 Brazil			TA	
											<u>8</u>
ECA	RS			2 ECA Mongol.						ESW	
Region	Sector	Theme								Type	Total
	RS									TA	
	UDTP						3 ECA	1 ECA		ESW	

							Alban.				
	UDTP						Hunga.			TA	
							1				
							Mongo.				<u>7</u>
Total		10	2	10	6	2	18	5	6		<u>59</u>

KEY: Rural Land Policy Documents (**RLPD**), Urban Land Policy Documents (**ULPD**), Land Reform Documents (**LRD**) Land Administration Documents (**LAD**), Land Management Documents (**LMD**), Land Issues in Urban Context (**LUCD**), Housing/Slums Related Land Components (**HSLC**), Land Studies (**LS**) including Land Rights, Land Markets, Land & Poverty, Land & Forest etc.

SECTION 3

A Review of Some Specific Land Policy Dialogues

In this Section, a sample of dialogues from three different regions, South Asia, East Asia and the Middle-East and North Africa are reviewed through the six lenses of urban-rural linkages outlined above. The countries covered are India, Indonesia, Afghanistan, Egypt and Yemen.

(a) India: Land policies for Growth and Poverty Reduction

A ‘Land policies for Growth and Poverty Reduction’ report for India was prepared by the Agriculture and Rural Development Sector Unit of South Asia Region.

The main purpose of this report is stated to review land administration and land policy based on emerging empirical evidences, to identify possible interaction between the two, and to derive policy conclusions. The empirical basis was derived from a plethora of reviews of land records, survey and settlement, and land registration in 14 states.

1. Land conversion in the peri-urban areas

A high level of land-related conflict’s negative impact on investment and productive land use in the form of ‘freezing’ land assets in increasingly valued peri-urban areas is noted. The report prescribes to develop regulation to resolve these conflicts in an incentive-compatible way.

The report acknowledges the acute problem of restrictions on subdivision in a number of states, especially in peri-urban areas, since it prevents small farmers from selling their land in small pieces to benefit from high prices thus leading to informal deals and corruption. Eliminating such restrictions is recommended.

The report also notices the restrictions on land use change in a number of states and its impact in terms of complicating transfer of land to non-agricultural purposes and discouraging direct negotiation between the land owners and potential buyers, sometimes through the expropriation under the land acquisition act.

Review and possible elimination of unwarranted restrictions on land sales, encouraging direct negotiations between land owners and potential buyers in peri-urban areas and revision of the land acquisition act is recommended.

2. Policy impact on food security issues

The report does not directly deal with the question of food security as a possible aspect of land policy. However it defines the significance of agricultural land as an ‘asset that can generate self-employment, utilize unused family labor in the most productive manner to produce for self-consumption and marketable surplus. Moreover, according to the report agriculture ‘utilizes the skills of the poor, and can be transferred if the family wants to shift out of agriculture’. Given the land distribution constraints of states in India, the report considers ‘acquisition of land through purchase by the poor, often in a group’, as a policy option.

3. Land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment

Lack of quality control and standards for data products

The seriousness of the problem of lack of updating for urban areas that were previously part of a village is noticed. Municipal Councils often receives layout plans from Town Development authorities for acquired land for urban expansion purpose. Lack of responsibility or incentives for such Municipal Councils to maintain detailed data on the land ownership is detected.

Clarification of responsibilities, establishment of clear standards and technical capacity for monitoring the implementation is recommended.

4. Compensation for the land acquisition

In order to allow more decentralized negotiation, issue of compensation is framed within the dynamics of clearly defined and strengthened individual land rights where land acquisition is likely to occur.

5. Institutional integration for land administration

As mentioned earlier, unlocking peri-urban properties from legal wrangling is a concern expressed strongly. A system of speedy resolution is recommended.

Cost-effective ways of updating the spatial records to reduce boundary disputes in peri-urban areas is urged. To remove ‘spatial data vacuum’ in some instances, the report recommends the creation of a uniform agency capable of maintaining spatial records in rural and urban areas. The report projects this approach as a policy priority.

Land record inconsistencies emerging out of limited integration of registration records with the overall record system are noticed as possible catalysts for land conflict. The report talks about refining systems for ‘back-office integration of records and registry, including definitions and standards, to ensure interoperability of systems’.

The report notices difficulties associated with the integration of the various systems. It acknowledges that such integration “requires overcoming the current fragmented nature of land administration institutions (e.g. between rural and urban land records or between land records, registration, and survey) which has often little substantive justification”. Instead of what it calls as ‘far-reaching institutional changes’, the report prefers ‘virtual’ integration of processes, functions, and information across departments.

6. Political economy concerns

The report does not specifically deals with political economy attributes of rural-urban interfaces.

7. Development priorities

Rural-urban land policy and its relationship with development priorities are not discussed.

(b) Indonesia: National Land Policy Framework (NLPF)

The government of Indonesia formulated National Land Policy Framework (NLPF) in January 2004. The formulation of NLPF was financed by grant of World Bank, which proceeded by study on land problems/issues in the framework of Land Management and Policy Development Program (LMPDP). The study which is governed by Coordinating Team and Technical Team on LMPDP, covers four aspects, they are: (1) Land law and land conflict, (2) Land administration, (3) Land tenure and land use, (4) Land institution and decentralization. The study began in 2002 and the first draft of NLPF was completed in January 2004. The structure of this first draft consists of three main parts, they are: (1) Existing land problems, (2) General frame of Land Policy Covering Principles of Land Policy, General objective and Specific objective and (3) Policy Guidelines and Action Plan.¹

¹ Narration extracted from the ‘Acknowledgements’ of the report

1. Land conversion in the peri-urban areas

The report talks about the land disputes in relation to land acquisition for development of infrastructure, industries, housing, tourism, large-scale plantation, and other sectors. It identifies the non transparent process of land acquisition, insufficient compensation and use of force as some of the major problems. The report also describes the weak administrative boundaries between the urban and rural land. This needs to be seen in the context of the stated fact that the farm land size is steadily decreasing and thus culminating in the steady increase in the number of landless farmers.

Apparently in the rural context the prescriptive policy measures calls for ‘just access to whole people, especially farmers and other poor groups to control, to own, to use and to utilize lands as the source of their lives and livelihood’. This include the provision for reviewing various business permits for big enterprises controlling large lands in order to safeguard farmers business interests including the right to fertile lands and strategic and accessible location.

At the same time, it is noted that in the urban context, policy intends to ‘regulate transparent and just mechanism of land acquisition and land provision for public and enterprise interests, without resulting losses’ and encourages ‘joint venture in development activities between the former landholders and the investors purchasing their lands’.

2. Policy impact on food security issues

The report does not discuss the issue of food security issues related to land policy in detail. However it recognizes the absence of specific law and regulations for land management of coastal regions and small islands. One of its relevant policy objectives is to establish land management systems in the coastal region and small islands to ‘develop maritime natural resources for the maximum welfare of the people’. Implications for fish stocks are clear in this regard.

Prescriptive measures include the regulation for land use conversion from agriculture to non-agriculture and building ‘inventory and mapping of the coastal area and small islands as well as of maritime resources’.

3. Land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment

The report states that, when underutilized, the conversion of agricultural land for non-agricultural purposes causes the loss of people’s access to land. It describes ‘uncontrolled land use planning, uncontrolled land use and land utilization conversion, suboptimal land use practices’ as a capacity problem. The report notices the absence of the link between the conversion aspect and sustainable environment in the existing land use practices.

Policy position implies building ‘control mechanism over the implementation of land use planning’ that accommodates interest of multiple stakeholders. Policy measures, among

others, invoke the development of permit mechanism for increasing utility and effectiveness in land use management. Developing joint venture system in land use practices and standard mechanism in land conversion are seen as answers on the problem of potential land conflict over the issue of conversion.

4. Compensation for the land acquisition

The report expresses concerns over the loss of rights over land where land is taken over formally by other parties. Prescriptive measure insists upon a 'balanced relational pattern between the State and the citizens in the process of land conversion for public interests' and asks for consultation process and provision of sufficient and proper compensation.

5. Institutional integration for land administration

The report discusses number of administrative features and anomalies including weaker boundaries between forest and non-forest areas against the land administration based on forest and non-forest areas; absence of coordination and absence of one institution; unclear authorities among the governmental institutions both at the central and local level; complex and expensive land registration system and inconsistent land classifications; and the lack of integration in the information system which hinders the coordination among the institutions. These issue need to be seen in the context of potential land conflicts where conversion is concerned to the extent where court orders are stated to be ineffective.

Prescriptive measures involve institutional review. The policy direction prefers segmented approach for land administration based on 'government level' and inter-sectoral functions. It also calls for a gradual approach for the land management and developing a technical coordination pattern for exchange and utilization of data form different institutions that collect, store/possess, and use land-based Information.

6. Political economy concerns

Large land owning by a small number of rural households is mentioned. Link between the small land holding, which incidentally is very high in Indonesia, and the impact of urban expansion through conversions, is not discussed. However ultra sensitivity of land issues and potential for land related conflicts weighs heavily in the text. A general lack of political commitment among government institutions, including legislative and judicative bodies is mentioned.

7. Development priorities

The report cites the mandate of Article 33 paragraph 3 Constitution 1945, that establishes the State's control over the land, water, space and the natural resources for the maximum benefits of the people and declares that it is the duty of State to project the people's rights and to give just access to 'agrarian resources, including the land'.

(c) Afghanistan: Kabul Urban Land Policy Note

1. Land conversion in the peri-urban areas

The report discusses the prominence of mono-centric Kabul in the light of its topographical attributes and predicts the lesser probability for important sub centers emerging in the future. This implies that land conversion would be concentrated in the limited area relevant to current expansionary patterns.

Although the land conversion issues are not directly dealt with by the report, it nonetheless acknowledges the residual farmland properties in greater Kabul. The report talks about the transaction problem between the property holders (in this context the farmland owners) and the people who have purchased the land. The system, through which this farmland is converted for residential purpose, does not become clear.

The report talks about a proposed National Urban/Rural Vulnerability Assessment (NUVA) dealing with the specific aspects and causes of tenure insecurity though it is unclear whether this assessment will specifically look at the peri-urban area.

2. Policy impact on food security issues

The report does not discuss any land policy impact on food security.

3. Land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment

The report talks about a joint initiative by the Ministry of Urban Development and Housing and the municipality of Kabul for creating a new structure plan for Kabul which will define the central and local government objectives for urban development. As a part of effecting a spatial framework, the report notices that this new structure plan will also contain a zoning map identifying areas for the city expansion and will narrate the uses and standards expected in each respective area. It may be implied here that this plan will look at the issue of land use planning for the adjacent areas to the city where agricultural land may arrive in the scenario.

The report advises against acquiring the land for the purpose of road infrastructure and asks to view the process from the angle of land readjustment. The report also advises for taking into account the boundaries in agricultural areas where boundary lines are visible and well known.

4. Law, Compensation for the land acquisition

Given the contrasting nature of the urban property disputes (concerning individually-owned properties and houses) with rural disputes (concerning common properties like pastures), the report prescribes that the conflict resolution strategies in rural and urban spheres should be considered separately.

5. Institutional integration for land administration

Multiplicity of legal systems in Afghanistan i.e. Islamic law, customary law and civil and statutory law is acknowledged. Prospects for integrating the informal justice system with the formal system whereby decisions made in the former would be eligible to be recorded in the latter (providing that the decisions were consistent with Islamic and civil law) is acknowledged as an important development of relevance to dispute resolution in the context of regularization.

6. Political economy concerns

The report, based on evidence, draws the link between discouraging migration through restrictive measures such as demolishing, withholding formal property rights, or by depriving new informal settlements from elementary services and ‘the creation of large permanent slums with intractable environmental and social problems’. This has clear implications for land use planning at the national level. The report also notices an incidence where a significant amount of houses were demolished in a controversial fashion. The report remains aware of the post-Taliban sensitivities throughout its narration although no specific discussion is devoted to the frame the urban-rural aspects of land policy issues within the political economy.

7. Development priorities

The report does not contain a narration defining any development priority concerns and their impact on the urban-rural interfaces.

However, the Annex #2 of the report outlines the terms of reference for the preparation of Kabul Development Plan. Under the component titled Phase One: identification of National and Municipal Government objectives, it is expected in the preparation of the development plan that the consultant will consult with various level of government to obtain indications for the Government’s priorities related to the issues such as access to land, housing, infrastructure and social services and the quality of the urban environment.

(d) Egypt: Public Land Management Strategy

1. Land conversion in the peri-urban areas

The problem of unauthorized conversion of agricultural lands to urban uses in the peri-urban areas is acknowledged. Failure of penalties and other deterrence policies are

identified as reasons behind the agricultural land succumbing to the high price differential between urban and agricultural lands. The report also mentions the difficulty of enforcement. A new approach reflected in the 2004 policy document produced by Egyptians, entitled “Preservation of Agricultural Land and Management of Urban Development in Egypt” that involves ‘regularizing existing informal development on arable land, and authorizing limited and measured urban expansion on agricultural land where no other alternatives exist’ is acknowledged.

2. Policy impact on food security issues

Direct references to food security related aspects of land management policies are not made. Nonetheless some observations and a policy recommendation are made which has a potential to influence the issue of food security. The report remains apprehensive of the blanket application of hierarchy (security, agricultural land reclamation, and new settlements) for control over unallocated public land among sectoral agencies outside of the Zimam, i.e. Boundaries of cultivated and uncultivated agricultural lands, since, according to the report it does not ensure that a site is allocated to its most productive use and thus does not follow an economic rationale.

The report recommends the formulation of a national land council or board with cross-sectional representation that would propose public land management related national policies and guidelines for Cabinet’s review, and advise policymakers on overall public land management including decisions to reclassify public land into public or private domain of the State. Since there are aspects of urbanization in Egypt which would involve peri-urban areas and eventually impact upon land use planning and conversions, the above mentioned recommendation has a significant relevance.

3. Land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment

The report remains concerned about the inability of the Governorates i.e. State Assets Protection Agencies’ to influence the public land allocation decisions in urban expansion areas of cities within their jurisdiction. On the other hand the report also remains concerned about Governorates’ local development strategies and land use plans not being accommodated by the sectoral authorities. The impact of this deficiency on generating revenues from the land sale/lease in the peri-urban fringe, which in turn could finance service delivery, is noted.

In the similar context the report acknowledges the reforms in land use planning regulation and the land development control system which would affect ‘the inefficient supply-driven top-down land use planning process and the cumbersome land development controls’.

4. Compensation for the land acquisition

Issues related to compensation for expropriated properties are discussed. No specific reference is made to land acquisition in peri-urban areas and related compensation.

5. Institutional integration for land administration

The report recognizes a critical need for an overarching entity that would establish, regularly update and maintain a public land information system which would address the areas such as a complete record of allocated and not allocated public lands and contract information.

The report also recommends the establishment of a 'Technical Secretariat' that would review and provide technical advice on strategic development and land use plans, feasibility studies and other public land management issues.

6. Political economy concerns

Prospects for political resistance from the groups including line ministries and sectoral authorities, which would lose control over the public lands in the reform process is discussed at length. Although the report introduces the idea of creating a Policy Development Group (PDG) which will, among others, 'build up the political constituency for priority changes in land policy and law' and articulate public land management issues, a clear indication of a policy objective that will accommodate the rural or peri-urban issues, does not emerge.

7. Development priorities

No pertinent discussions were devoted to assess the relationship between the development priorities and land policies.

(e) Yemen: Urban Land Policy and Land Administration- Policy Note

1. Land conversion in the peri-urban areas

The report acknowledges that the intense development pressures in urban areas are accelerating the contestation of public and private land ownership in peri-urban areas, especially by tribal claimants. This problem is stated to be particularly acute in the main cities including Aden.

The report mentions that the instances where Ministry of Agriculture had granted lease for agricultural land in peri-urban areas, they were often issued on the basis of existing status of the land as agriculture land, supported by testimony from two witnesses. However such lands, when found planned for residential or investment land uses in the urban expansion schema, created conflicts between planners' objective and the holders of such land.

In another context, the report, while reflecting on the issue of property rights in the context of marahek i.e. public rainfall paths, observes that Yemeni law implies that when landowners subdivide and sell their landholdings for conversion to urban use, marahek would cease and it would become state's property. The report observes that in granting 'adjacent landowners the ownership of an area of the marahek that is equivalent to their agricultural landholdings', State may have succumbed to the special interests and may have recognized 'ancillary use rights as ownership rights'.

The report discusses different type of land ownerships and the institutional confusion. Acute land shortages and the fact that State has to buy land from the private landowners are acknowledged. However private land (Mulk horr) conversion and acquisition issues in peri-urban areas are not discussed.

2. Policy impact on food security issues

No reference was made to the impact of land policy on the issue of food security. However the report mentions that since a parallel Country Social Assessment (CSA) is being carried out by the World Bank, the study does not deal with all land-related issues.

3. Land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment

The report cites the admission of fact by State Land & Real Estate Agency of Yemen, that there is no information pertaining to urban-rural land classification or land type classification such as urban, agricultural, uncultivated, desert, etc. in Yemen. The report makes a strong recommendation to build a comprehensive and centralized inventory of State-owned lands and also recommends the financial strengthening of the State Land & Real Estate Agency.

The report also makes an emphatic case for the land readjustment process. In order to overcome the overall distrust among landowners of government planning processes, it recommends the participatory approach. This approach is projected as a solution on the problem of implementing the planning and service delivery in the peri-urban areas.

4. Compensation for the land acquisition

While the report acknowledges the commitment expressed by the State for providing fair compensation to private owners in the cases where land is acquired for the public purpose, it also recommends that the compensation should be determined on the basis of the discussions with the communities.

5. Institutional integration for land administration

In acknowledging a huge problem of chaos in land administration system due to the multi-layered system, the report recommends that the practice of multiple government

entities directly allocating/disposing of State-owned lands should be immediately discontinued and State Land & Real Estate Agency be given the role as a sole custodian of State lands.

6. Political economy concerns

The report on several occasions mentions concerns over insufficient political will, especially in the context of tribal contestation of land claims and State's less than required political will. Political feasibility weighs considerably throughout the report. A clear narration of political economy angle in the state land management policy, where private land holding is very small, does not emerge.

7. Development priorities

No pertinent discussions were devoted to assess the relationship between the development priorities and land policies.

Preliminary Trends

This sample of land policy dialogues revealed mixed trends. Where land conversion issues in peri-urban areas were found acknowledged in almost all instances, impact of land use policy trends on food security was discussed with only few details. Issues such as land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment, compensation for the land acquisition, and institutional integration for land administration found consonant references in urban and rural context. On the other hand issues related to political economy concerns and development priorities were found underrepresented.

Section 4

A closer look at some prominent country dialogues

Given the rapid urbanization and subsequent demand pressure for land to accommodate expanding urban areas, there are rising concerns for open space preservation especially in the context of farmland conservation. Some literature pertaining to countries such as Egypt, Albania, Mexico or to an extent India among others have accommodated concerns regarding the issue of land conversion in peri-urban areas.

Some argue that a substantial amount of active cultivation on arable land is required to achieve long-term food security goals of developing nations. This would mean that support is required within the land policy frameworks of the developing nations for embedding institutional measures to preserve farmland. It is argued that even when the conversion is necessary and rooted in a sound and sustainable economic rationale, there must be a proper institutional framework within which associated issues such as compensation, land rights and political economy nuances can be resolved.

On the implied issue of food security and urbanization, the UNCHS Report of 2001 on Human settlements defined some major consequences of urban expansion for urban food security. It explicitly recognized the competition between demands for land needed for housing, industry and infrastructure and land needed for agricultural production within and around cities and concludes that the agriculturally productive lands would be lost in this competition². It is noteworthy to recall that the Bank's document on Urban Expansion does not subscribe to the view that the expanding urbanization has any serious impact on the agricultural land. There is also a view that the extent to which the decline in base acreage of agricultural land becomes a concern depends not only on facts, but also on the values of individuals and governments³.

Another consequence UNCHS recognized is in the form of food delivery related traffic inflow in the city, its subsequent environmental penalty and additional stress on existing food distribution infrastructure and facilities. It is contended that urban expansion increases the distance from food markets for the poor and imposes additional penalty on the poor in terms of transport cost⁴.

Another argument against the urban expansion and its policy implications has to do with the apprehension over the primacy of tenural security. There are concerns that the land acquisition for development many times is not necessarily conducive to the concept of the private property and tenural security. Examples are drawn from the ongoing contexts such as China, Indonesia or India where the actual conflict or the potential for conflict over land exists. It is also claimed often that there is silent but a powerful shift from the instrument of tenure to the instruments designed to facilitate access to land resources, for example transferable longer user rights, especially in the urban context. It is noteworthy that the World Bank's seminal work in 2003 on land policy with a strong rural contextual underpinning, 'Land Policies for Growth and Poverty Reduction', supports maintaining the focus on rental arrangements along with the title security.

On the other hand there is a view that is concerned about the prominence of rural centric land policies. It is difficult to discern how much of this counter divide is entrenched in the policy formation environment of the Bank. Nonetheless some concerns for the rural land programs were expressed. One common contention is that high rates of urbanization require a reliable and adequate supply of land. It is argued that this land supply, consistent with the conceptual commitment of the Bank, should be regulated by the market mechanisms at best, or at least the State should not have a monopolistic command on the channels of land supply as to do so would distort land markets.

² Cities in a Globalizing World: Global Report on Human Settlements, UNCHS, 2001

³ Issues at the Rural-Urban Fringe: The Land Use Debate--Situational Background, Rodney L. Clouser, Institute of Food and Agricultural Sciences University of Florida, <http://edis.ifas.ufl.edu/FE551>

⁴ Cities in a Globalizing World: Global Report on Human Settlements, UNCHS, 2001

As was mentioned title security forms one of the fundamental pillars of land policy in rural contexts. If this means that the State has to choose aligning its synergies for protecting the sanctity of title then it would also mean that the State is not ruling out the probability of impacting upon the land market dynamics as an arbitrator. It would also mean that the state will have to redefine the definition of public interest and development purpose under which, the convention suggests, land (specifically peri-urban land) can be acquired.

The urban perspective in this regard is clear. It attempts to find a way out of the quagmire by adding the component of ‘negotiated basis’ and fair compensation. Often the lower prices for agricultural land on the open market is seen linked with the excessive and insular regulatory environment that dampens the capitalization of benefits from agricultural land..

Concerns about fragmented and hap-hazard measures of land use planning also feature prominently in the debate. Should land use planning in the peri-urban areas be conditioned in a mixed use ethos in order to preserve the green-belts? Should the enactment of restrictive administrative and legislative rules be weighed against the reduced rate of returns in terms of reduced property values and resultant demand pressure that may accelerate conversion of agricultural land? Should the management of public land in the peri-urban areas be contextualized in the framework of rural land administration or should it be a component of urban land management as a tactical response to expansion?

The Bank has been maintaining a consistent line in the referred literature in advocating an integrated approach for land administration and management. There is also a growing appreciation of the political economy dimension where the political interests of an individual or group are seen being impacted by the policy decisions and their desire to influence policies is acknowledged.

It is noteworthy that both perspectives understand the need to have a systemic response to the anomalies of asymmetrical information in the arena of land management and administration. One difference has to do with the set of objectives. Some of the concerns expressed by the urban perspectives in this regard can be articulated in the following way:

- Rural land dialogues/ projects focus upon computerizing and process reengineering of land administration (especially registration) but on its own this falls short of impacting incentives and land market outcomes (including supply, pricing etc) .
- Rural land policy dialogues/projects tend to focus upon conventional property rights titling which can complicate urban land redevelopment and land acquisition for urban development purposes.

- Rural land titling projects increase the vulnerability of urban informal settlements to buyouts/ displacement on account of market forces

In the recent years growth management has gained prominence as a policy issue. One of the potential arguments by the rural perspective may have to do with the difficulty in rigorously measuring the urban growth pressures, implicit spatial (in a regional sense) relativity of those measures and the folly in designing a blanket supply side land management solution.

Designing systemic data resources in order to track urban growth and understand changes in development patterns thus can be a vital part of *raison d'etre* for the urban land management initiatives from an urban perspective. At the same time fortifying the administrative aspects of the system can yield institutionalized arrangements for reconciling the historical data resources with the projected or ongoing changes in land use patterns through documentation. In a practical sense this would translate into the mix of strategic response to urban growth enveloping the jurisdictional and operational features of land policy in urban as well as rural contexts.

The urban-rural debate also has a context of what can be described as the ‘acceptability’ attribute of public policy. The Bank has to offer policy insights albeit with the clear understanding of the general policy environment of the country, involved political sensibilities and resulting development priorities. For example open space preservation can be an issue dear to the heart of different constituencies. At the same time rights-base movements in the urban arena may insist upon the access to land for informal settlers.

It is often argued that the policy scenario in which net payoff is positive for some and negative for others would face the danger of being characterized as arbitrary. It is therefore important to see whether policy prescriptions are careful in avoiding uncomfortably skewed positions. There is already a conventional standpoint that urban growth, when impacting upon the agricultural land, can be a legitimate concern enough for the State to intervene. As mentioned earlier, negative payoff of urban growth, especially in peri-urban areas and adjacent to farmland is a prominent issue in countries such as China, India, Egypt etc. It is perceived as an unending phenomenon with huge long term impact on the national food security. The counter argument is often based on the economic and opportunity costs of farmland preservation and agricultural activity on the edge of cities. The economic tenability of the logic of food security is questioned and sometimes the very logic is brought under the scrutiny against the backdrop of inevitability of urbanization and its impact upon national growth.

Various positions discussed above have a direct bearing on the issues of systems and structures of land administration, land use planning preferences, political economy involved and consequently, development priorities. In this context some countries emerge as prime examples of where different postulates can be seen interlocked with each other having implications for policy formulation. The following review of the land policy dialogues in selected countries attempts to grasp the breadth of the issues covered and their corollaries with the project features.

China

The Bank undoubtedly recognizes the importance of land issues in the broader quest for development solutions. It is useful to see therefore in which ways these differing positions are accommodated in the operations initiated by the Bank and the Bank's engagement in providing technical assistance. China, as mentioned earlier, offers an environment where the Bank has effectively attempted to manage the rural-urban interface of land policy dialogue.

Land Policy Reform for Sustainable Economic and Social Development

China's growth in recent years is reflected in the rapid urbanization. In recent years the Bank's engagement in China is increasingly accompanied by the land policy implications of the pace of development. In early 2004 the Bank was asked by the Development Research Center (DRC) of the State Council and the Ministry of Land and Resources (MLR) of China to address the land policy issues. This produced a context to a fact finding mission in order to gain a first-hand understanding of the situation and identify possible cooperation areas. Based on the findings from the discussions and field visits, the Bank's mission prepared a roadmap for a comprehensive land policy reform in China.

Compelling features of the findings included the need to address the persisting duality of rural and urban land tenure systems and the State's monopoly of the primary market for urban land; the need to improve requisition processes and compensation practices; the need to strengthen farmers' land rights; the need to reduce over-reliance by local governments on revenue from land transfers and land-related financing and the need to reduce the rate of farmland conversion.

As an overall observation, the Bank's land policy dialogues in China projects the adequate understanding of the urban-rural dimensions. Under the 'Land Policy Reform for Sustainable Economic and Social Development' the Bank attempts to address the issue of what mix of land tenure reforms and security-enhancing measures for farmers can best support the sustainable productive use of land.

There is a clear appreciation of China's quest for economic growth, national food security and social stability and the key role of the allocation of secure land rights in achieving these. The role of the land use choices in influencing and shaping the sustainability of China's rapid urbanization along with the future prospects of its agriculture is recognized.

By focusing its attention on the interface between urban and rural land, the Bank engaged the complex interplay of pressing land issues including those of special relevance to the agricultural sector. Closer examination of land policy at the urban fringe is expected to draw attention to the sharp and persistent divide between rural and urban land in terms of rights and administration with increasingly problematic implications.

The Report discusses five inter-related subjects: (i) the duality of urban and rural land tenure systems, the monopoly of the primary market for urban land by the State, and the resulting economic and land use distortions; (ii) the complex issues surrounding the requisition of rural land for urban expansion, including perceptions of unfairness in the payment of compensation; (iii) the continuing relative weakness of farmers' rights to land, despite important legislative achievements in this regard; (iv) the problematic nature of local governments' reliance on land related income and debt; and (v) difficulties in effectively restricting the conversion of farmland.

Institutional integration for land administration

The Bank remains concerned about the persisting duality of rural and urban land tenure systems, the State's monopoly of the primary market for urban land and the role of the State as a sole mediator of the urban-rural interface.

The Bank's policy prescription is to progressively integrate urban and rural land markets, rights, planning and administration, including reducing the government's monopoly over the primary market for urban land.

Compensation for the land acquisition and State monopoly and Political Economy involved

The Bank highlights the current inadequate approach which undermines the real value of rural land as recognized by the urban market. The compensation is often tied to the use of land for cultivation, and hence is usually many times lower than the value of the land in its new urban form. There is an adequate recognition of the hazy boundaries of compulsory acquisition in the definition of current provision of "special circumstances" utilized for a broad range of readjustment. The Bank remains aware of the subsequent widespread and significant social and economic consequences. The Bank also acknowledges a progressive enhancement of the land rights of farmers, based on the recognition of security of tenure.

The Bank's policy prescription, framed in the context of its acknowledgement of a progressive enhancement of the land rights of farmers and based on the recognition of security of tenure, focuses on adequate compensation. It expects the re-examination and revision of compulsory acquisition rules and fair and open process and appropriate guiding standards.

Land use planning, zoning regulations, land readjustment

The Bank links price distortion, a more land-extensive investment pattern and inefficient use of land together. In the Bank's view, the demand for new land on the urban fringe for real estate and other commercial development is inculcated by an emphasis on the outward spread of cities rather than the more efficient use of existing urban space. The demand is seen further exasperated by the ready availability of cheap rural land.

Implementing successful measures for the conservation of agricultural land is seen in the context of land use planning, zoning regulations and land readjustment. This supply

driven approach is somewhat balanced with the subtle nuances of the demand driven approach in the urban projects (e.g. Sichuan urban development project) that talks about the 'effective economic and social integration into urban communities' and restoring livelihood of the displaced people.

The Bank expects minimizing the land acquisition and resettlement in the long-term development of the urban areas through a more concentrated and integrated development pattern of enclave land, rather than the linear pattern of land development. On the other hand there is also a view which identifies the need to adjust the urban area development and sales plan proportionate to the evolving situations in urban demand. Land adjustments and change of land use pattern is argued in the light of calculation of the economic return and the opportunity cost of the undeveloped land.

Policy impact on Land Rights

The core argument for the land rights comes with angle of land registration systems programs.

The policy position is aligned with the pragmatic aspects of land rights and is concerned with the channels of implementation as opposed to any particular unconditional insistence upon the inevitability of land rights.

Farm land conversion/Food security

Farm land conversion and food security issues are perceived in the context of policy anomalies and administrative inefficiencies. The Bank highlights the ineffectiveness of the regulatory measures to restrict farmland conversion and the presence of strong contrary incentives. The Bank warns of the imminent failure of the 'evasive techniques' in the form of tighter regulatory controls on farmland conversion, if the 'economic incentive structures driving urban expansion at its current rapid pace' are not altered.

The policy prescription involves the review of current incentives for land use conversion, better coordination of planning mechanisms and more efficient land use strategies.

India (with main emphasis on Maharashtra)

In recent years the Bank has been engaged in generating technical assistance pertaining to land policy in India. Major works include Deininger's land policy report on the theme of growth and poverty reduction, analytical background papers on the urban land markets in India, work on the Maharashtra land administration project and an analytical report on the real estate in Mumbai.

Each report was prepared in the context of different themes. For example where Deininger work was concerned with the review of land administration and land policy based on emerging empirical evidences with a view to locate spaces for possible interaction between the two, analytical Urban work was primarily concerned with the allocational and distributional effects of urban land policy.

Despite having the focus on the rural context, the Deininger report is quick to acknowledge that the distinction between rural and urban is to some extent artificial. It calls for a national land administration system, where the needs of both rural and urban areas are accommodated in the flexible legal and institutional framework. In the view of this report it is important to remove the spatial data vacuum to achieve functional integration, preferably in the form of one agency for maintaining the spatial records in rural and urban areas. It is explicit in its recognition of such need as a policy priority. It is noteworthy here that the peer review comments on the urban sector work by Deininger reminds that the urban study has only tackled the land use regulation when the McKinsey report suggested modernizing land administration system and property taxation is equally important. On the complementary side, the urban study asserts that while it approached the property taxation, in defining the Vision Mumbai Business plan, the issue of modernizing land administration will be approached.

In Deininger's report, informality assumes a causal connection in the combined form of complex and costly procedures of land administration with the legislations that makes land leasing difficult. This is acknowledged in the Maharashtra land administration project where the administrative reforms are seen in the context of designing policies and specific mechanisms to improve access to land by the poor in a socially sustainable manner. At the same time the Bank's urban position is concerned with the clarification of the ambiguous property rights for informal settlers/slum dwellers. It is also aware of the scenario where despite owners having security of tenure, settlements are often excluded by public agencies in access to service networks.

Deininger's report remains sympathetic towards the conventional land reforms in India and presents a fortified argument based on a number of social indicators, that land reforms in India benefited from far-reaching and long-lasting positive implications of redistributive land policy effects.

The report also points out the inadequacies in rental market restrictions, administrative channels for policy conveyance and the impacts of rent ceilings and other forms of policy restrictions that increase transaction costs of land rental in urban contexts.

Inefficiencies of the land administration system along with restricted supply, it warns, are the catalysts for driving the land prices in India to an exorbitant level.

This position is consistent with the Bank's policy prescriptions in urban context that involves the reforms in land use planning and removing rental restrictions and legal ambiguities among others. Mumbai's Strategic Development, in the view of the Bank, must put specific emphasis on land use constraints.

Some of the links however are not clear. A clear prescriptive approach that reconciles the land ownership restrictions in rural context and the required land supply and associated market factors in urban context does not emerge in the referred urban and rural land policy literature. Documents on Mumbai's urban development insist upon the need to have an upward and outward extension of the city. While removing FSI restrictions

addresses the problem of upward prospects to accommodate city growth, it is not clear how the additional land can be made available outside of the city. There is no substantial discussion around the issue of land conversion in the areas that are in between the city and administratively defined rural areas although the negative impact of rental restriction on the land supply is formally acknowledged.

It is observed in general that different land policy documents do not project the views that are radically opposite to each other. However the scope and span of the generated land policy advice remains committed to their respective central themes and thus restricts the comprehensive treatment of the possible aspects that have cross-sectoral implications.

Mexico

In recent times Mexico undertook major efforts to transform its rural and agricultural sector, and in particular its ejidos⁵. A 2001 study titled 'Land Policy a Decade after the Ejido', stated its objective to assess land policy in the broader context of rural development efforts in Mexico. It attempted to assess the extent to which the Mexican reforms have actually been implemented, to estimate their impact on the rural population, and to outline the challenges for the future.

Policy issues addressed by the study included the identification of the economic and non-economic benefits generated by the program such as its impact on household welfare, environmental management, and measurement of other benefits; assessment of the program sustainability; and the need for further reforms and the implications for the institutional structure.

Reforms noticed by the study with approval included the replacement of the wholesale ban on the ability to exchange land with a more nuanced set of regulations through which land rental was freed completely (sales were allowed within the ejido but not with outsiders) and the establishment of a clear set of rules, including compensation, for expropriation. The study put emphasis upon the strengthening of self-governance of the ejido in a way that allowed it to choose, among others, its property rights regime; eliminating the land rental restrictions and a reducing the discretionary powers of the executive.

The study acknowledges that there is now greater equity through increased land access. The report also discusses the issue of land markets in the context of the inadequacies of the previous policy environment. It highlights the political anomalies in the effective implementation and the acceleration of the pace of such reforms. On the positive side, conflict resolution and improved functioning of land markets in rural areas is ascribed to the reforms.

⁵ Study defines ejidos as 'rural communities modeled after a mixture of soviet-style collectives and pre-colonial indigenous social structures'

The study specifically acknowledges the link between the ejidos and the demand pressures likely to be caused by the growing pace of urbanization. Its solution on the illegal invasions of the ejido and communal lands by poor migrants, resultant increased costs of service and infrastructure and lower real estate values, is largely institutional. The study emphasizes upon the significance of the ability to quickly and efficiently incorporate ejido lands into peri-urban development as critical to the Government's success in providing affordable housing for a large number of the urban poor. It stresses the requirement for municipalities and States to establish plans for urban expansion and zoning as a first step in the right direction. One other significant suggestion is to increase transparency by establishing a land price monitoring system that would enable ejidatarios and comuneros to access consistent and reliable information about land prices and their evolution over time.

On the administrative front the study recommends reducing disincentives for the maintenance of registry information, reducing the transaction costs of registration and improving information sharing, exploring options for coordination/unification between the national Agrarian Registry and public registries and improving the legal and regulatory environment for long-term land rental arrangements.

The 2002 National Urban Strategy Report attempts to generate policy direction concerning urban development and the fight against poverty in urban areas. While the focus of this report is not exclusively on land policies, it nonetheless sees the issue of effective land management as central to the success of the urban strategy. It identifies the absence of good formal means of developing land for the low/moderate income population. In its estimate there are fewer solutions since the 1992 legal law modifications that allowed for privatization of *ejido* (rural communal) land. This situation is accentuated by the command of high-end private-sector developers on almost one third of the land in the periphery of medium and large towns. The report notices that the rest of the *ejido* land is constrained by the required excessively high development standards

The report stresses the importance of strengthening the state housing agencies so that they are able to convert agricultural to urban land and provide the macro infrastructure. The report also emphasizes the facilitation of partnerships, allowed by the 1992 law, between ejidarios and land developers. It is noteworthy that the study on the post ejido policy reforms also confirms the same direction as a response to the increased land demand.

Mexico low income housing report of 2002 identifies the ejido land reforms of 1992 that allowed for titling and eventual sale of ejido land, as problematic. In its view these reforms actually reduced the land available for low income housing. In line with the opinions expressed in the urban strategy, the report identifies a 'fissure between urban management and the process of converting lands from rural to urban use'; 'cumbersome public interventions and titling procedures that have been overtaken by the illegal sales' and conflicts regarding the allocation of rents caused by land titling and urbanization, with the agricultural and urban authorities developing parallel and sometimes contradictory programs. The policy suggestion was to decentralize the authority over the

conversion of land from agricultural to urban to the state level, with an active participation of the municipalities in the procedures.

In its analysis, the low income housing report gives sufficient attention to the political economy aspects of the pre and post 1992 ejido reforms. The report emphasizes the importance of the Programa de Certificación de Derechos Ejidales y Titulación de Solares Urbanos (Procede), a program to register and certify ejido property in reducing the demand pressures in peri-urban areas.

Although all referred reports hint towards the multiplicity of administrative mechanisms and in some contexts the contradictory implications of systemic variances, a detail discussion around integration of the administrative systems could not be located. Documents were also constrained with regards to the absence of discussions around the greenbelt implications of the land policy. The issue of food security was not featured.

In terms of consistency of the messages, Mexican land policy dialogues were found congruent.

Vietnam

A 2005 report titled *Land Policy in Vietnam: Current Status and Key Challenges* begins with emphasizing the multi-contextual nature of land issues and its linkages with the different constituencies with different sets of priorities.

For example accelerating land use conversion at the urban fringe, the report states, has implications for a wide range of issues including the growth of business, tenure security, spatially rational and environmentally sound urban growth, food security, urban finance and accountable governance. Throughout the report these inter-linkages are acknowledged.

The report deals with following issues.

The evolving land market: In dealing with the question of the current state of the land market in Vietnam, it found that the moves to extend the formal market for land have met with limited success. The high percentage of informality in the urban land market is noted by the report

Land access and availability: In defining the factors constraining access to land, the report highlights the policy driven distortions of the real estate market, largely emerging out of the fact that the Vietnamese real estate market is shaped by the government managed transactions. The report notices that the preferential access and continued large scale holdings by State Owned Enterprises limits the availability of land.

Land tenure and the scope and security of land rights: In its judgment the report notices that despite the history of land law reforms for some years, land rights remain weakened

and tenure security remains vulnerable to outside intervention such as rigid and lesser duration of time limits. The report suggests the removal of remaining time limits for the majority of land users.

Land administration: The report acknowledges the land administration problems in the urban areas such as the dual administrative system for registry; legal and procedural complexity; and jurisdictional overlaps.

Compulsory acquisition and resettlement: The report argues that the current approaches to conversion are slow and unpredictable, limits the availability of urban land and frustrates investors. The report also puts emphasis on existing excessive reliance on conversion in order to open up new land and warns that it would lead to inefficient forms of urban growth. The report remains concerned about the impact of massive land conversion on the livelihood of the people related to agriculture and cautions about the scale and option of conversion.

Land use planning and conversion: The report urges linking land use planning with demand forecasting and cautions that over-eagerness on the part of many local authorities to promote industrial development would lead to over-allocating land for industrial purposes without taking into account the level of actual investment.

A World Bank 2005 report, titled ‘Land Consolidation in Northern Vietnam - Institutions, Implementation, Impacts’ forms a part of the Bank’s work in the policy area of land consolidation, its implementation procedures and practical outcomes. This report, unlike the observations made in the earlier report discussed above, remains primarily concerned with the central theme of the report i.e. land consolidation. The report recommends the need for complementary markets to be developed in parallel with the implementation of land consolidation. The report does not engage rural-urban interfaces related to land administration, land use planning or the discussions around the political framework within which the consolidation is viewed as an intervention. Land conversion is discussed albeit in the context of a higher production system.

Food security and ‘unconstrained land conversions’ were noted as dominant concerns running through the Vietnam land policy dialogues. This is reflected in the Bank’s work. The resettlement policy framework of the Vietnam Urban Upgrading Project for example contains a provision for agricultural land of equal productive capacity according to PAP’s preference.

Ghana

A 2007 draft report on Ghana titled ‘Urban Development and Economic Growth’ has three major components. One major component, apart from the deliberations on municipal finance and local economics, deals with urbanization and land markets. Observations made in this component are consistent with the general land policy direction the World Bank has adopted in recent years.

In the institutional context, the report observes too many actors dealing with land policy related matters. This is also a view expressed in the Ghana Land Administration project documentation.

The report points out that the district assemblies in Ghana have restricted fiscal and administrative bases. It notices that despite a series of decrees and laws for transferring the responsibilities from the central government to local authorities, including land management and urban planning (land use planning and activities related to public land development), implementation of such decentralization has remained very weak.

The report discusses the inadequacies and distortions in spatial planning and land markets. The report defines planning in Ghana as sporadic and non-compliant with anomalies in the urban land market such as inadequate land registration and titling. Consistent with the concern expressed in the Land Administration project, the report points out that land administration is a constraining factor in the dynamics of the demand and supply for housing in urban areas.

The report highlights an unclear boundary demarcation and identification among various land owning groups. From a political economy perspective, the report notices that the monopoly held by the traditional political institutions in land related affairs decides the supply and price of land into the development stream. Their key role in the land market of the city is recognized and seen as reflected in the traditional authorities' capacity to create booms and depressions in the supply of land in the city and hence influence land prices.

The report also acknowledges that an enabling environment created by the urban authorities for private sector development would generate positive spillovers in the rural areas.

Ghana Land Administration Project (2003) was designed to facilitate access to land and improving security of rights and interests in land through a range of comprehensive reforms. This project outlines three main objectives and linkages. First of all, it sees improving the land administration framework linked with the reduced conflicts in land ownership and land use. The second objective of reforming and modernizing land administration and management and decentralizing land administration services is seen linked to rational land management policies and reduced transaction costs to rural and under-privileged communities. It is also seen as a measure that would facilitate investment and growth and reserve space for future community development. The third objective of facilitating participation of the civil society and the private sector is seen as a check on the excesses of public sector management and a factor that would promote transparency in the administration and management of both public and private land.

The Land Administration project acknowledges that since land administration in Ghana is governed by both customary and enacted legislation, it faces the situation where many of laws and regulations conflict with one another. It observes that the State agencies have not developed good mechanisms for active collaboration with the traditional authorities.

It points out that this multiplicity of actors not only creates procedural delays but also hinders any prospective plans for land development.

The project notices that except in few urban centers, there is no systematic cadastral mapping, registration and titling program in Ghana. Its other observation pertains to frequent encroachments on public and private lands, unapproved development schemes and frequent violent confrontations among opposing claimants. The project links the inefficiency of the land markets with the high urban land prices and subsequently development of peri-urban lands in a haphazard manner.

As a remedial measure the report insists that the selection of the broad policy, legislative and institutional reform approach would require joint consideration of rural and urban land issues. The project notices that many urban areas in the southern part of the country are expanding into rural lands. The project therefore emphasizes dealing with both rural and urban issues simultaneously to ensure the emergence of consistent policies and legislation. It argues that doing so would protect the different interests in land and the development of procedures for cadastral mapping, systematic titling and registration of land and land records management, especially in the peri-urban areas where problems of land conflict are acute.

The project contains measures such as divestiture of vested lands under the broader reform of 'Harmonizing Land Policy and Regulatory Framework for Sustainable Land Administration', restructuring of public sector land agencies, strengthening private land sector institutions and land use planning and management under the reforms pertaining to 'Improving Land Titling, Registration, Valuation and Information Systems'.

Albania

The Albanian Urban Sector Review Report of 2006 focuses on trends and issues emerging out of rapid urbanization and the recent decentralization policy direction. The report engages a cluster of issues related to urban management. The urban land use management component has an implicit objective of maintaining the balance of public and private sector. Discussions around the issues related to urbanization contain references to the rural features of Albania. For example the report acknowledges the effect of rural-urban migration and its impact on the demographic characteristics of the urban centers, administrative reassignment of rural to urban categories (e.g., from commune to municipality status) reflecting increases in built-up density of rural areas on the periphery of cities and changes in the economic structure of the rural communities and their transformation with urban characteristics.

The report expresses concern over the mountainous inland in the north and south-east with poorer agricultural fertility, less natural environment and resources and decreasing rural population. It further stresses the need to have a deliberate action targeting the underdeveloped areas. The migrant flow from rural areas is seen in the context of

uncertainty of land tenure and the higher rate of peri-urban vacant land occupation made easier by the legal framework vacuum created by the collapse of the communist regime.

In reflecting on the urban planning and land management, the report sees the need for Albania to change its current approach that, in the words of the report, ‘has subjected “public law” to “private law”, reduced “urban development” to “construction”, and limited “urban planning” to “physical design”’.

The Report points out that land use criteria, including criteria for land conversion, are still underdeveloped and acknowledges private sector’s concerns for the absence of clear land use criteria, excessive delays and occasional reversals. On the other hand the report also expresses its concern over the lower economic returns by the landowners who generated higher land and property values.

The Report outlines the need to reconcile urban laws with existing environmental laws, which are not properly enforced. The report mentions the need to incorporate the legal regulation of the coastal land in urban land management while reserving ‘the most important environmental features’. It is unclear whether this was also intended for farmland and despite greater occurrence of peri-urban land conversion there was no discussion around the issue of food security, from either perspective.

The report looks at the issue of peri-urban land conversion from the compensation angle. The report acknowledges that much of the incursions into agricultural land in Albania occurred due to distorted incentives created by the restitution/compensation framework. At the same time it also admits that rapid and growing urbanization will only intensify the conversion. The proposed solution is to modernize the process of planning as a flexible, market-responsive and transparent system.

The Report also discusses the political aspects in the context of the issues of land use planning, compensation, enforceability of measures against illegal settlements and disconnects between the political and fiscal developments and emphasizes the need to resolve political economy concerns in different aspects.

Albania’s Land Administration and Management Project (2007) is linked to the Country Assistance Strategy’s observation that the uncontrolled urban growth, inadequate public infrastructure, weak governance and public service delivery pose substantial threats to sustainable development of Albania. In order to address these issues the LAMP intends to assist the government in addressing three key areas. Component A of the LAMP focuses on the security of property rights, component B addresses issues related to development of land use plans, and implementation of property taxation system and the component C would provide an incentive to local governments to implement the reform agenda with respect to the preparation and enforcement of land use plans and the collection of property taxes based on market values.

The LAMP makes some observations with respect to Albania’s land management and administration system. It recognizes that the land and property rights are not fully secure

in Albania. It ascribes the undermined security of property rights to the slow pace of resolution of restitution and compensation claims. The same link is drawn with respect to the slow registration of property rights, especially in the high value coastal areas.

The Project observes that a large number of illegal land subdivisions and construction projects in peri-urban areas are often without any property rights, adequate zoning or building permit procedures. These observations are consistent with the observations made by the Urban Sector Review report.

Urban references contained in the LAMP include provisions for the completion of first registration of immovable properties mainly urban and peri-urban properties and further development of the regulatory framework. The project will finance the development or revisions of critical laws and regulations in order to enhance tenure security; strengthening the capacity of municipalities in urban land management through supporting market-responsive, participatory urban planning and development control system; development of regulatory plans including City Development Strategies in the largest 10 municipalities and formulation of urban land management regulations that will finance the preparation, through consultative processes and public hearings, of the urban law and the key implementing regulations.

**SECTION 5:
Cross-Sectoral Expertise Representation in Bank Dialogues**

Table 2 shows the extent to which urban and rural alnd expertise was drawn upon in the dialogues and projects reviewed in this Report. It shows that team mixture normally occurs at the peer review level rather than core team composition although in some rare cases such as Albania, more encouraging examples of cross-sectoral team and project composition were found.**Table 2: Cross-Sectoral Expertise Representation in Bank Dialogues**

Policy/Project	Category			
	Mixed core team/Peer reviewers	Mixed core team/Uniform Peer reviewers	Uniform core team/Mixed peer reviewers	Uniform core team/Uniform peer reviewers
India				
Land policies for Growth and Poverty Reduction				•?
Business Plan for the city of Mumbai				•
Urban Study				•

Indonesia				
National Land Policy Framework (NLPF)	?	?	?	?
Afghanistan				
Kabul Urban Land Policy Note	•			
Egypt				
Egypt Public Land Management Strategy	•? PR in Question			
Yemen				
Urban Land Policy and Land Administration-Policy Note	•			
China				
Land Policy Reform for Sustainable Economic and Social Development				•? No info on PR
Sichuan Development				•?
Mexico				
Land Policy a Decade after the Ejido				• No info on PR
Low income housing report				•
National Urban Strategy Report				• No info on PR
Vietnam	?	?	?	?
Ghana				
Urban Development and Economic Growth			•	
Ghana Land Administration Project		•?		
Albania				
Urban Sector Review Report				•
Land Administration and Management Project	•			

SECTION 6

Conclusions and Recommendations

As an overall conclusion it is important to acknowledge that generally the global and country level dialogues initiated by the World are quite consonant. The Review found that dialogues are not as divergent as initially thought. Positions that are central to the Bank's message on tenure security, land market efficiencies, administrative integration, proactive and economically efficient land use management and encouragement of rental markets, all receive consonant reflection from the prescriptive policy advice generated by the Bank.

Divergence of views may appear in a very limited context and this may be only because of the absence of detailed explanatory discussions in certain special areas. All the reviewed country dialogues carry a sense of uniformity in the content of policy advice where the urban-rural interface is concerned. It is equally true that since the policy dialogues tend to deal with different aspects of land policy, the nature of policy dialogues is influenced by its thematic priority and the contextual framework within which the dialogue has taken place. Hence it is not always possible for a particular body of work to accommodate all possible aspects of the land policy. This therefore should not be considered as an indicator of the difference of content but the difference in the span of content covered under a particular dialogue. For example national land policy dialogues are more likely to reflect on a wide variety of aspects involved as opposed to a piece of work on land markets alone.

An amalgamated version of the implied messages in the land policy dialogues can be articulated in the following way. All reviewed country cases insisted upon the integrated system of land administration and management; in urban as well as in rural contexts. The Deininger report goes further and presents a forceful argument in favor of an integrated system. Other land policy dialogues, primarily concerned with the urban dimension also adhere to the same view.

Operations/projects in the reviewed countries carry the same theme as mentioned above. In the Mexican case in the context of peri-urban land emphasis was placed on facilitating the coordination of different agencies with different mandates in land management, Vietnam land policy advice warns against the dual administrative system for registry, legal and procedural complexity and jurisdictional overlaps and the Ghana documents talk about integrating the customary and other systems to achieve sustainable objectives in land affairs to name the few examples.

In the context of national land administration and policy advice a specific focus on security of tenure was noted. It should be said however at the same time that the national land policy advisory work also reflected on the issue of better functioning land markets. India, China, Albania are some of the examples where the land markets and their

relationship with the administrative capacity received appropriate attention. This was also the case with other country level documents.

Country dialogues with a clear urban focus paid sufficient attention in acknowledging the propriety of linking property rights information systems and institutions with the proper functioning of urban land markets. There was, however, insufficient evidence that the issue of tenure security was discussed in the light of cross-sectoral implications, especially for informal settlements and associated features such as protection from evictions or sell-offs, sub-division of land and the conversion, and impact of secured property rights on urban land supply etc. Tenure security was generally reflected upon as an objective in itself apart from one or two notable exceptions such as in the Indian land policy dialogue.

There was a limited evidence of placing the relationship between the delicate social, economic and legal problems and the transition/competition between urban and rural land as one of the central themes. Despite the occasional references no significant discussion around the interdisciplinary trajectory of land policy featured prominently in the dialogues.

There is no clearly articulated position in Country dialogues on the opportunity cost in maintaining/converting farm land in peri-urban areas. There is instead a clear focus on the land markets to work in an environment that is not constrained by the regulatory caps. In the context of land acquisition the message is often accompanied by a clear position on fair compensation and emphasis on negotiation between the private sector and land owners. Concerns for managing land conversions without triggering speculative trends to ensure the provision of affordable land were discussed. However the discussions appeared more concerned with the administrative anomalies rather than the political economy implications of the issue. Technical interventions such as land consolidation found primacy in the discussions in some country cases. For some reasons, apart from few exceptions, country dialogues did not deal with the types of political resistance in the land conversion or the conditions under which policy recommendations can be accommodated by the governments, the nature of political bargaining and social actors and the impact of asymmetry on the distribution of gains.

The issue of land conversion is not entirely an administrative issue. In an environment where the land is jubilantly contested by the governments and land owners, especially by the farmers, acquiring land always have major political economy concerns. India and China are two of the more prominent examples where this contestation can raise significant concerns. Land conversion, not only for the purpose of accommodating growing urbanization but also for the purpose economic development (as in the case of Special Economic Zones in India and the acquisition of land for the similar purposes by the China) is being challenged. It is thus required that the Bank's advice probes into the specific dynamics of possible trade-offs in the process of land conversion.

Despite the consosnce of main messages emerging from urban and rural perspectives, the link between balanced dialogues and balanced projects appeared weaker on the basis of a

very limited look at the operational linkages to dialogues. Team mixture normally occurs at the peer review level rather than core team composition although in some rare cases such as Albania, more encouraging examples of cross-sectoral team and project composition were found.

There may be a tendency to maintain a project team comprising of entirely either rural or urban land expertise. This accentuates the possibility that the team may not do justice to all the aspects under land projects. To do so would require an eclectic combination of subject matter expertise. For example in the urban land policy context of Africa, addressing complex social and legal issues implied by the transition of customary to more formal property rights regime requires a balanced approach supported by a composite dialogue with rural and urban players. The Ghana country dialogue can be cited as an example where the team composition has an adequate representation from urban as well as rural side. One possible approach for reflecting cross-cutting concerns therefore can be an institutional measure that requires some representation of subject matter expertise in urban and rural context. This can be mirrored in team composition, peer reviewers and external inputs by consultants.

It is equally important to take into account the process and effects of ongoing institutional transition, as new inter-sectoral agreements may add to or further refine the structures of thematic group's linkages with other group. However given the specific nature of knowledge, skills and abilities involved in the Housing and Land thematic group and the Land Policy and Administration thematic group, at this juncture there is no rationale enough for their merging .

The Review suggests that an integrated approach does not warrant the liquidation of certain specialized thematic policy perspectives; but would probably be better served by a conscious effort to achieve an optimum institutional balance in the dialogue and project review processes and in core team composition. As such, no compelling case for merging of the Housing and Land and the Land Policy and Administration Thematic Groups was found. Clear evidence for some form of coordination between these two groups, though not necessarily at a mandatory level, has been found in some country reviews. Increased coordination in this context should not be viewed as an indicator towards the need to collapse these groups into each other since it may face the loss of isolated and independent perspectives, which are equally required as conceptually balancing factors.

The review notes that especially in democratic environments, policy prescriptions are to be judged in the dynamics of political economy and that land is one component where the bargaining becomes most contested. However few avenues in existing dialogues were found to address cross-sectoral political economy concerns which are arguably vital to the success of Bank's efforts to launch appropriate interventions. Correcting this may require shortening the informative part of dialogue documentation and strengthening the analytical component with conclusions and recommendations. This is important in the context of post-implementation evaluation as it would provide a conceptual foundation for follow-up activities related to the dialogues.

There is a need for a large scale study specifically probing the political economy of land in developing countries. The literature review revealed that eventually the Bank will have to deal with the political economy concerns. In this particular area it can be asked whether there had been sufficient engagement by the Bank staff with member countries or whether the Bank's position was appropriately clear and candid in expressing its assessments regarding the political economy angle of land policies. Since the debate of political economy generally encompass a broad set of issues and multiple disciplines, to develop a comprehensive understanding is a difficult task. Nonetheless in the arena of public policy it is not only important to say correct things but also to outline correct as well as acceptable ways through which the prescribed policy principles are accepted and implemented. Thus, despite difficulties embedded in the highly country specific political economy issues, an effort to look into the global sample and to derive a discernible pattern is important.

Finally the Review suggests the need to go beyond the desk review that was possible in this undertaking and to use more extensive consultations with Task Team Leaders and Sector Managers to convert the Background Paper produced under the current exercise into a Position Paper with a wider audience.