



## Nigeria - Kaduna State Economic Transformation Program-for-Results (P161998)

AFRICA | Nigeria | Finance, Competitiveness and Innovation Global Practice | Requesting Unit: AFCW2 | Responsible Unit: GFCAC  
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results | FY 2017 | Team Leader(s): Guillemette Sidonie Jaffrin, Roland Lomme

Seq No: 1 | ARCHIVED on 20-Jun-2018 | ISR29888 | Created by: Guillemette Sidonie Jaffrin on 06-Oct-2017 | Modified by: Guillemette Sidonie Jaffrin on 13-Jun-2018

### Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

The Project Development Objective is to improve the business enabling environment and strengthen fiscal management and accountability in Kaduna State.

### Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	--	● Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	--	● Satisfactory

### Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The Kaduna State Economic Transformation Program-for-Results (PForR) was approved by the World Bank Board on June 20, 2017. The effectiveness of the PForR is pending.

### Data on Financial Performance

#### Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P161998	IDA-60980	Not Effective	USD	133.79	133.79	0.00	0.00	138.14	0%
P161998	IDA-60990	Not Effective	USD	216.21	216.21	0.00	0.00	223.35	0%

#### Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
---------	----------------	--------	---------------	--------------	--------------------	--------------------	-------------------

### Program Action Plan

Action Description
Review KADIPA's 2017 budget (and outer years) to ensure it is commensurate to KADIPA's mandate

Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	Yes	Yearly			In Progress
<b>Comments</b>	This action refers to DLI 1, 3, 4 and 5.				

<b>Action Description</b>					
Development and implementation by KADIPA of a strategy based on a socio-economic assessment to maximize benefits sharing of investments					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	Yes	Yearly		3. Strengthening investment promotion: number of new Memoranda of Understanding signed between investors and KADIPA	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>					
Development of investors' satisfaction survey (including satisfaction with KADIPA facilitation services) and of investors' grievance redressal mechanism by KADIPA					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	Yes	Yearly		3. Strengthening investment promotion: number of new Memoranda of Understanding signed between investors and KADIPA	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>					
KADIPA to lead the development of the proposed North West Investment Area Agreement					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	No		30-Jun-2018	3. Strengthening investment promotion: number of new Memoranda of Understanding signed between investors and KADIPA	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					



<b>Action Description</b>	Development of a PPP legal and institutional framework that appropriately manages E&S risks: (i) PforR PIM to incorporate E&S aspects & outline risk assessment criteria for low E&S risk; (ii) PPP manual incorporates best practice E&S risk management				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		31-Oct-2017	4. Development of the legal and institutional framework for PPP	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>	Commission of a study of social impact of tax reforms, through distributive analysis (KADIRS)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		31-Dec-2018		Not Yet Due
<b>Comments</b>	This action refers to DLI 6 and 7.				

<b>Action Description</b>	Undertake a Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment to support the Kaduna State Infrastructure Master Plan: (i) Outline and Terms of Reference; (ii) Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		31-Dec-2018	8. Increasing capital expenditure execution rate	Not Yet Due
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>	Publish Budget Execution Report, Annual Financial Statement and audit opinion on the Kaduna State Government and Local Governments financial statements				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	Yes	Yearly			In Progress
<b>Comments</b>	This action refers to DLI 6, 8 and 10.				

<b>Action Description</b>	Development and implementation of the Framework for Responsible and Inclusive Land Intensive Agricultural Investments - FRILIA (KADGIS)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		31-Dec-2017	5. Development and implementation of a Framework for Responsible and Inclusive Land-Intensive Agricultural	In Progress

				Investments (FRILIA)	
<b>Comments</b>	FRILIA principles approved by negotiations, in May 2017.				

<b>Action Description</b>	Review KADGIS' 2017 budget (and outer years) to ensure it is commensurate to KADGIS mandate				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	Yes	Yearly			In Progress
<b>Comments</b>	This action refers to DLI 2 and 5.				

<b>Action Description</b>	Agreed amendments to Kaduna State Land Use Regulations (KADGIS)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		15-May-2017	2. Implementation of systematic property registration program: number of new CofOs issued	Completed
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>	Undertake, review, and enhance the Systematic Property Registration Program Stakeholder Engagement Strategy (KADGIS)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		31-Dec-2017	2. Implementation of systematic property registration program: number of new CofOs issued	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>	Implementation of a grievance redressal mechanism for the Systematic Property Registration Program (KADGIS)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		31-Dec-2017	2. Implementation of systematic property registration program: number of new CofOs issued	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					



<b>Action Description</b>	Prepare and regularly review Systematic Property Registration Program documentation (KADGIS)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		30-Jun-2018	2. Implementation of systematic property registration program: number of new CofOs issued	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>	Review KEPA budget for 2017 (and subsequent years) to ensure that it allows KEPA to satisfactorily fulfill its mandate, with a focus on private investments in Kaduna State; and detailed capacity-building program outlined and budgeted				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	Yes	Yearly		3. Strengthening investment promotion: number of new Memoranda of Understanding signed between investors and KADIPA	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>	Strengthening of grievance redressal system for taxpayers (KADIRS)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	No		31-Dec-2017	7. Improvement of tax collection: increase in number of registered taxpayers (TIN) filing returns	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>	Production and dissemination of statistical information, with a focus on socio-economic information (Kaduna State Bureau of Statistics)				
<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Recurrent</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Due Date</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Status</b>
Client	Yes	Yearly			In Progress
<b>Comments</b>	This action refers to DLI 3 and 10.				

<b>Action Description</b>	Prepare Procurement Plans for five MDAs with highest volume procurements as part of the budget preparation and approval process				
---------------------------	---	--	--	--	--



Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	No		30-Jun-2018	9. Increasing procurement effectiveness	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>					
Adoption of fund release policy to MDAs for improved predictability of resource flows to MDAs					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	No		31-Dec-2018		Not Yet Due
<b>Comments</b>	This refers to DLI 6 and 8.				

<b>Action Description</b>					
Capacity building on e-procurement procedures and contract management conducted annually for pilot MDAs (KPPA)					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	No		31-Dec-2017	9. Increasing procurement effectiveness	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>					
Implementation of grievance redressal mechanism (KPPA)					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	No		31-Mar-2018	9. Increasing procurement effectiveness	In Progress
<b>Comments</b>					

<b>Action Description</b>					
Introduction of risk-based internal audit function outside the expenditure processing cycle (Accountant General)					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status
Client	No		31-Dec-2018		Not Yet Due
<b>Comments</b>	This action refers to DLI 8 and 9.				

<b>Action Description</b>					
Operationalization of the state anticorruption framework (for PForR lead agencies)					
Responsibility	Recurrent	Frequency	Due Date	DLI#	Status



Client	No		31-Dec-2017		In Progress
Comments	This action refers to all DLIs (all PForR lead agencies).				

## Risks

### Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	● High	--	● High
Macroeconomic	● High	--	● High
Sector Strategies and Policies	● Substantial	--	● Substantial
Technical Design of Project or Program	● Substantial	--	● Substantial
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	● High	--	● High
Fiduciary	● Substantial	--	● Substantial
Environment and Social	● Substantial	--	● Substantial
Stakeholders	● High	--	● High
Other	● High	--	● High
Overall	● High	--	● High

#### Comments

"Other" risk refers to Conflict risk.

## Results

### PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Improving the business enabling environment				
► 1. Simplified business processes: reduction in the time required to start a business, deal with construction permit and register property (DLI1) (Days, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	248.00	--	248.00	123.00
Date	31-Dec-2014	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020



Strengthening fiscal management and accountability

►2. Increased budget credibility: IGR outturn and capital expenditure execution rate, in percentage (DLI 6 & 8) (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	42; 50	--	53; 43	66; 70
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020

►3. Increased fiscal accountability, measured by improved government responsiveness to citizens' feedback on fiscal performance: responsiveness is indicated by the percentage of capital projects improv (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	0.00	20.00
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020

Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Improving the business enabling environment

►Implemented reforms supporting private sector development (Number, Corporate)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	0.00	20.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020

►Implementation of systematic property registration program: new Certificates of Occupancy (CofOs) issued (DLI 2) (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	0.00	40,000.00
Date	01-Jan-2017	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020

►Strengthening investment promotion: Memoranda of Understanding signed between investors and KADIPA (DLI 3) (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	10.00	--	10.00	32.00
Date	01-Jan-2017	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020

►Investors that reach operations stage or aftercare in Kaduna State with KADIPA facilitation (Amount(USD), Custom)





	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	2.00	--	2.00	20.00
Date	01-Jan-2017	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
<b>►Development of the legal and institutional framework for PPP (DLI 4) (Text, Custom)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	Incomplete legal and institutional framework	--	incomplete legal and institutional framework	One PPP transaction with low E&S risks reaches commercial closure
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
<b>►Development and implementation of a Framework for Responsible and Inclusive Land-Intensive Agricultural Investments (DLI 5) (Text, Custom)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No FRILIA	--	No FRILIA	FRILIA adopted through a legal instrument and under satisfactory implementation
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020

### Strengthening fiscal management and accountability

<b>►Improvement of tax collection: registered taxpayers (TIN) filing tax returns (DLI 7) (Number, Custom)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	6,000.00	--	6,000.00	200,000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
<b>►Compliance of large (over 250 employees) private and public corporate entities with Personal Income Tax Administration (PAYE) system (Text, Custom)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	70% for private; 80% for public entities	--	70% for private; 80% for public entities	80% for private, 90% for public entities
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
<b>►Enhanced strategic planning and budgeting of public investment: MDAs whose budgeted capital expenditure are aligned with Sector Implementation Plans (SIP) (Percentage, Custom)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target



Value	25.00	--	25.00	100.00
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
▶Increased procurement effectiveness: main procuring MDAs implementing e-procurement, disclosing information on contract awards and conducting procurement audits (DLI 9) (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	--	0.00	15.00
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
▶Timely payment of contractors by public entities: arrears of payment to contractors as percentage of appropriation (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	1.70	--	1.70	0.50
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
▶Improving performance information on service delivery: sector programs evaluated after three years of implementation (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	5.00	--	5.00	50.00
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020
▶Increased fiscal transparency of State and Local Governments (LG): disclosure of state and LG appropriations and budget execution audit reports (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	LG budgets disclosed for first time in 2016; audit report of LG budget execution not disclosed.	--	LG Budgets disclosed in 2017; audit report of LG budget execution not disclosed.	Timely disclosure of state and LG budgets and audit reports of state and LG budget execution.
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	31-Dec-2020

### Disbursement Linked Indicators

▶DLI 1. Simplified business processes: reduction in the time required to start a business, deal with construction permit and register property (Outcome, 35.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	248.00	--	248.00	123.00
Date	31-Dec-2014	--	07-Jun-2018	--



<b>Comments</b>	Updated information not available as PForR not effective.
-----------------	---

►DLI 2. Implementation of systematic property registration program: number of new CofOs issued (Intermediate Outcome, 35.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	0.00	--	0.00	10000.00
Date	01-Jan-2017	--	07-Jun-2018	--
<b>Comments</b>	Updated information not available as PForR not effective.			

►DLI 3. Strengthening investment promotion: number of new Memoranda of Understanding signed between investors and KADIPA (Intermediate Outcome, 35.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	10.00	--	10.00	8.00
Date	01-Jan-2017	--	07-Jun-2018	--
<b>Comments</b>	Updated information not available as PForR not effective.			

►DLI 4. Development of the legal and institutional framework for PPP (Output, 35.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	Incomplete legal and institutional framework	--	Incomplete legal and institutional framework	One PPP transaction with low E&S risks reaches commercial closure.
Date	01-Jan-2017	--	07-Jun-2018	--
<b>Comments</b>				

►DLI 5. Development and implementation of a Framework for Responsible and Inclusive Land-Intensive Agricultural Investments (FRILIA) (Output, 35.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	No FRILIA	--	No FRILIA	Social audit confirms satisfactory implementation of FRILIA.
Date	01-Jan-2017	--	07-Jun-2018	--



<b>Comments</b>

<b>►DLI 6. Increasing IGR outturn (Outcome, 35.00, 0%)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	42.00	--	53.00	66.00
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	--
<b>Comments</b>	Information publicly available: Kaduna State Government released its audited accounts for 2017 in May 2018.			

<b>►DLI 7. Improvement of tax collection: increase in number of registered taxpayers (TIN) filing returns (Intermediate Outcome, 35.00, 0%)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	6,000.00	--	30,000.00	200000.00
Date	31-Dec-2015	--	07-Jun-2018	--
<b>Comments</b>	No updated information as PForR not yet effective (30,000 as of June 2017).			

<b>►DLI 8. Increasing capital expenditure execution rate (Outcome, 35.00, 0%)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	50.00	--	43.00	70.00
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	--
<b>Comments</b>	Publicly available information, as Kaduna State Government released its audited accounts for 2017 in May 2018.			

<b>►DLI 9. Increasing procurement effectiveness (Intermediate Outcome, 35.00, 0%)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	Low level of transparency and competitiveness in procurement process	--	Low level of transparency and competitiveness in procurement process	Implementation of e-procurement, disclosure of contract awards, procurement audit in 15 main procuring MDAs.
Date	31-Dec-2015	--	07-Jun-2018	--

<b>Comments</b>

<b>►DLI 10. Improved government responsiveness to citizens' feedback on fiscal performance: percentage of capital projects improved in response to citizens' feedback (Intermediate Outcome, 35.00, 0%)</b>				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020
Value	0.00	--	0.00	20.00
Date	31-Dec-2016	--	07-Jun-2018	--
<b>Comments</b>	Updated information not available as PForR not effective.			