



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 06/07/2005	
PROJ ID: P005911		Appraisal	Actual
Project Name: Ry Education Sector	Project Costs (US\$M)	49.7	32.84
Country: Yemen	Loan/Credit (US\$M)	33.04	31.73
Sector(s): Board: ED - Secondary education (56%), Tertiary education (32%), Central government administration (12%)	Cofinancing (US\$M)		
L/C Number: C2570			
	Board Approval (FY)		95
Partners involved :	Closing Date	09/30/2001	09/30/2004
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	Group Manager :	Group:
Helen Abadzi	Kris Hallberg	Alain A. Barbu	OEDSG
2. Project Objectives and Components			
a. Objectives			
The project was to improve Yemen's capacity to develop human resources and meet the emerging needs of the economy through a planned change program that would : (a) enhance the learning achievements of secondary students with special emphasis on science and mathematics education and quality of teaching; (b) improve the access of girls to secondary education; and (c) establish labor market oriented two-year post-secondary education programs covering business, commerce and industry .			
b. Components			
The project was designed to address the broad policy objectives in eight areas : (a) physical facilities (appraisal US\$11m, actual US\$5.86m), (b) teacher performance (appraisal US\$0.5m, actual US\$0.21m), (c) curriculum development (appraisal US\$1.1m, actual US\$0.65m), (d) school management (US\$1.6m, actual US\$0.69m), (e) learning resources (appraisal US\$2.7m, actual US\$0.05m), (f) student evaluation (appraisal US\$1.0m, actual US\$0.02m), (g) female access appraisal US\$4.9m, actual US\$10.55m) (h) community colleges (appraisal US\$14.8m, actual US\$12.71m), (i) monitoring (appraisal US\$0.5m, actual US\$1.71m), and (j) 25 national or subnational subprojects (appraisal US\$11.6m with contingencies, actual US\$0.38m).			
c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates			
This very complex project disbursed very little early on and was restructured with a substantial change in scope at mid-term review. It closed after extensions totaling 3 years, and US\$1.27m was canceled. Expected OPEC cofinancing of US\$8m was canceled in the process.			
3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:			
(a) Enhancing the learning achievements of secondary students, particularly in math and science (not achieved). The components that were to support this objective (training, equipment, materials) were greatly reduced. Data on learning trends in math and science were not collected .			
(b) Improving girls' access to secondary education (achieved). The project built 335 additional classrooms in urban secondary schools, 120 of these for girls; 60 girls secondary schools in rural areas were also constructed, furnished, and equipped. Against an original target of 5,000, the project thus created 17,500 new places for girls and thus may have relieved the overcrowding of existing schools . About 250 selected students from rural areas graduated from a program designed to overcome the extreme shortage of math, science, and English female teachers .			
(c) Establishing labor market oriented two -year post-secondary education programs covering business, commerce and industry (achieved). Community colleges were built in Sanaa and Aden, enrolling 1,510 students at project closing. According to a tracer study reported in the ICR, the first graduates of three -year programs had 80% employment rates, and employers reported high satisfaction .			
4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:			
-The project contributed substantially towards gender parity in secondary school . Part of the financing from the canceled components was redirected to building girls' secondary schools in rural areas . Girls' enrollments in grades 7-12 increased by 224% in 1998-2003, while boys' enrollments increased by 78%. The share of girls in secondary			

education classes rose from 26% to 39% during the life of the project.

- The project successfully pioneered community colleges in Yemen and demonstrated that they are a viable alternative to university and vocational education, that also responds to a market demand .

5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):

The region rated quality at entry as highly unsatisfactory . Project scope and complexity were far beyond the country's implementation capacity . The multiple components required multiple directors, but practically no funds were allocated for project management . The complexity was such that little activity took place for the first 18 months, until restructuring . Eight of the 25 subprojects were greatly curtailed, particularly the all-important quality improvement measures, school equipment, and learning resources . Monitoring and evaluation was neglected .

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome :	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	The ICR text mentions that project outcome was moderately satisfactory, but it had no such rating available under the current 4-point scale.
Institutional Dev .:	Modest	Modest	
Sustainability :	Likely	Likely	
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Quality at entry was highly unsatisfactory and continued to affect the project throughout implementation . However, supervision in the last three years improved significantly and was rated highly satisfactory by a QAG review . Project revisions and improved supervision contributed to the achievement of school construction targets (even though quality improvement targets were not met), and overall Outcome was Moderately Satisfactory . This performance merits an overall Bank Performance rating of Moderately Satisfactory, but in the absence of such a rating at this time Bank Performance is rated Satisfactory .
Borrower Perf .:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Performance was moderately satisfactory . The Borrower did not take adequate measures to address early implementation issues in a timely way . However its performance improved significantly in the last three years of the project.
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

-Problem projects that suffer from weak initial design can be turned around, given concerted efforts by both the Borrower and the Bank . However, time and opportunities to improve services to beneficiaries are lost .

- It is important to match project ambitions and design not only to borrower priorities but also to the government's capacity to carry out the work in a given sector .

- It is possible to increase female participation in secondary school considerably if suitable buildings are available and if families perceive that their daughters can gain suitable employment .

8. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

Why? To verify the ratings.

9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR satisfactorily relates the events of this project and has a good borrower contribution . However, it should have clarified why the OPEC financing was canceled .