



<b>1. Project Data:</b>		<b>Date Posted :</b> 06/14/2001	
PROJ ID: P002357		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Actual</b>
<b>Project Name :</b> Human Res Dev't II	<b>Project Costs (US\$M)</b>	72.8	72.8
<b>Country:</b> Senegal	<b>Loan/Credit (US\$M)</b>	40	39.17
<b>Sector(s):</b> Board: ED - Primary education (83%), Central government administration (7%), Secondary education (5%), Tertiary education (5%)	<b>Cofinancing (US\$M)</b>	5.8	5.8
<b>L/C Number:</b> C2473			
	<b>Board Approval (FY)</b>		93
<b>Partners involved :</b> Germany-KfW, UNICEF, French government	<b>Closing Date</b>	06/30/1999	12/31/1999

<b>Prepared by :</b>	<b>Reviewed by :</b>	<b>Group Manager :</b>	<b>Group:</b>
Helen Abadzi	Ronald S. Parker	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST

**2. Project Objectives and Components**

**a. Objectives**

The project assisted the government in implementing its education development program (for the period 1993-98) which aimed mainly to (a) improve access to, and the quality and efficiency of primary education. Specific targets included raising the primary enrollment ratio from 58% in 1992 to 65% by 1988 and (b) improving the quality and efficiency of secondary and higher education and (c) strengthening education sector planning and management. To achieve these objectives, the project supported policy measures: (a) in primary education to contain costs, diversify sources of financing, and reduce inequities between urban and rural areas, and between boys and girls; (b) in secondary education to improve internal efficiency; and (c) in sector planning and management, to decentralize education planning, administration, and supervision to the regional and departmental levels

**b. Components**

Components included (a) school construction, equipment, maintenance, (b) boosting girls' participation, (c) establishing a sustainable textbook system, (d) strengthening teacher preservice and inservice training, supporting school-initiated quality improvements, (e) establishing a student assessment system; (f) strengthening planning capacity. More components were later introduced: a volunteer teachers' program, internet centers in schools, principals' training.

**c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates**

The CFAF devaluation enabled many more activities to take place through credit funds. The project was completed six months later than expected. The ICR did not give the amounts that donors spent as parallel financiers. The total project cost is estimated based on IDA and government expenditures.

**3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:**

Objectives were mostly achieved. Despite an initial decline, the main goal of increasing primary enrollments was met. More classrooms were built than expected (1076 instead of 875) but fewer were refurbished (891 out of 1080; other donors built 2000 additional classrooms in coordination with the IDA -financed project). Teacher training and student assessment activities were carried out as planned, the supervision system was effectively reorganized, and secondary school principals were trained. Regional inspectorates and offices of education were substantially decentralized.

**4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:**

Secondary school libraries were stocked with books and schools received learning kits (which, however, have not been effectively used). A public awareness campaign for girls' education was launched. About 4500 primary and 8000 secondary teachers participated in inservice training, though instructional delivery improvement has not been documented. A highly qualified team put together an assessment system and measured student achievement, although it has not been possible to improve the curriculum to reflect the findings. Young, minimally paid "volunteer" teachers filled 20% of primary classrooms by 1998, while accounting for 9% of the salary bill. Computers and training were given to 12 secondary schools.

**5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):**

Classroom construction encountered serious delays, partly because communities and small NGOs were unable to

contribute as expected. (Currency devaluation was part of the problem.) Eventually, plans were revised to rely much more on the government construction agency (AGETIP). Community construction work was often poor, and furniture was delivered late. The buildings are not receiving maintenance. Grants to schools for improvements were delayed and put in place only at the end of the project. Though girls' enrollments increased from 41% in 1992 to 47% in 1998, there is no evidence that the project contributed to this increase. About 2.7 million textbooks were financed that were to be free or sold cheaply through private vendors, but about 30% of the books were lost; also, prices were hiked above what many poor parents could pay, and eventually only 20% of students received books. The textbook fund was mismanaged, audits showed that funds disappeared, but the PIU did not move to correct the problem. The PIU was seen as a privileged unit and raised some animosity among other government services.

6. Ratings:	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
<b>Outcome:</b>	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Shortcomings raise some doubt regarding the extent to which objectives were achieved
<b>Institutional Dev.:</b>	Substantial	Substantial	
<b>Sustainability:</b>	Likely	Likely	
<b>Bank Performance:</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Borrower Perf.:</b>	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
<b>Quality of ICR:</b>		Satisfactory	

NOTE: ICR rating values flagged with '\*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

#### 7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- The capacity of communities and small NGOs to build schools is often overestimated. When construction programs rely on them extensively, delays and low-quality work may be encountered.
- It is difficult to establish a book sale system without understanding the market forces and incentives of the vendors. In countries where losses are heavy, it may be better to provide textbooks free of charge to students.
- In areas where PIU staff receive better salaries than other government servants, antagonism may arise. It may be preferable to integrate PIU functions in Ministries.
- In areas where there are educated urban students willing to become volunteer teachers, opportunities exist to expand the teacher force and at the same time give the volunteers some useful work experience.

8. Assessment Recommended?  Yes  No

**Why?** Project shortcomings raise some doubt regarding the extent to which objectives were achieved

#### 9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR was detailed and explained the various issues with clarity. However, the table showing disbursements was incomplete, and various donors who financed independent projects were shown as cofinanciers.