



1. Project Data:		Date Posted : 08/07/2014	
Country:	Yemen		
Project ID:	P114253	Appraisal	Actual
Project Name:	Education For All Fast-track Initiative Catalytic Fund Phase Iii	Project Costs (US\$M):	20.0
L/C Number:		Loan/Credit (US\$M):	0
Sector Board :	Education	Cofinancing (US\$M):	0
Cofinanciers :		Board Approval Date :	09/30/2009
		Closing Date :	09/30/2012
Sector(s):	Primary education (93%); Public administration- Education (7%)		
Theme(s):	Education for all (100% - P)		
Prepared by :	Reviewed by :	ICR Review Coordinator :	Group:
Judith Hahn Gaubatz	Judyth L. Twigg	Lourdes N. Pagaran	IEGPS2

2. Project Objectives and Components:

a. Objectives:

According to the Project Appraisal Document (PAD, page 12 and the Grant Agreement (page 3), the project objective was as follows:

- **To increase access of children, especially girls, to primary education in seven underserved governorates .**

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

Yes

If yes, did the Board approve the revised objectives /key associated outcome targets?

No

c. Components:

1. Increasing Access to Primary Education in Targeted Districts (Appraisal: US\$ 11.22 million; Actual: US\$ 11.18 million): This component aimed to address supply -side issues by creating new (or improved) student places in the seven targeted governorates of Al-Hodeidah, Hajjah, Dhamar, Al-Baida, Ryma, Al-Mahweet, and Al-Daleh. These governorates were selected according to low education participation rates, low proportion of girls attending primary school, and significant proportion of out-of-school children, as well the relative absence of other donor support. This component was expected to support construction and /or rehabilitation of classrooms.

2. Improving Enrollment and Retention of Primary School Students (Appraisal: US\$ 6.60 million; Actual: US\$ 6.97 million): This component aimed to address demand-side barriers to enrollment, particularly for girls and the

poor. This would be achieved through training and contracting of female teachers in rural schools, capacity building support through regular field inspections, and distribution of school material kits for students in grades 1-6.

3. Supporting Grant Implementation, Administration, and Monitoring (Appraisal: US\$ 1.23 million; Actual: US\$ 1.84 million): This component provided support to the existing Project Administration Unit (which had managed the prior Education For All Fast Track Initiative grants I and II) for project management. This component also financed an impact assessment of all three phases of the grant.

d. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates:

Project cost

- The appraised and actual project cost was US\$ 20.0 million.

Financing

- The project was financed entirely by a US\$ 20.0 million grant from the Education For All - Fast Track Initiative Catalytic Fund. It was disbursed in its entirety.

Borrower contribution

- There was no planned Borrower contribution.

Dates

- *July 2011 - January 2012*: Disbursements in the country-wide portfolio were suspended due to civil unrest.
- *September 2012*: Due to the period of civil unrest and the subsequent escalation in construction and materials prices, the outcome targets for number of classrooms constructed and the number of school kits distributed were scaled back. The closing date was extended from September 2012 to March 2013 to account for the implementation delays, including during the period of disbursement suspension.
- *March 2013*: The closing date was extended a second time to August 2013, to allow completion of construction in schools. Continued high prices for materials and elevated insecurity contributed to these implementation delays.

3. Relevance of Objectives & Design:

a. Relevance of Objectives:

High. The gross enrollment rate for basic education has been improving in the last few decades in Yemen, although it remains overall low at approximately 74% (2007-2008 data), with a notable gap between boys' (83%) and girls' (64%) enrollment rates. Hence, the project objective is highly relevant to country conditions at the time of appraisal. It is also highly relevant to the national education strategy, which prioritizes the education-related Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), including increased enrollment in basic education for girls. The Bank's Country Partnership Strategy for FY2010-2013 also identifies increased access to education as a key thematic area.

b. Relevance of Design:

Substantial. The project interventions were likely to achieve the intended outcomes of increased access and enrollment in primary education. The project interventions addressed both supply issues, through establishing classroom spaces, and demand issues, through recruiting female teachers and providing educational supplies. The project targeted hard-to-reach populations in the seven most remote governorates, where half of the out-of-school children aged 6-14 years old reside.

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy):

To increase access of children, especially girls, to primary education in seven underserved governorates

Original targets: **Substantial.**

Revised targets: **Substantial.**

The number of students enrolled in primary school in the project areas increased for both boys and girls. There were no other donors financing school construction in the project areas; therefore, it is reasonable to assume that in the absence of this project, there would have been no other enrollment opportunities for these children.

Outputs

- Construction of 213 classrooms in new schools in the project areas . This fell short of the original target of 240, but achieved the revised target of 216.
- Extension of existing schools to create 132 additional classrooms. This fell short of the original target of 150, but achieved the revised target of 132.
- Rehabilitation of 173 classrooms in existing schools. This fell short of the original target of 191, but essentially achieved the revised target of 175.
- Due to the above three outputs, 15,540 new (or improved) student places were created in the project areas . This fell short of original target of 17,430, but essentially achieved the revised target of 15,690.
- Provision of training to and contracting of 476 female teachers in the project areas . This fell short of the original target of 500 and the revised target of 491.
- Provision of 852,781 school kits for students in grades 1-6. This fell short of the original target of 900,000, but surpassed the revised target of 756,072. This activity was intended to encourage enrollment in schools, and the ICR (page 15) reports that "80% of the student beneficiaries surveyed stated that the kits encouraged them to be enrolled in school."
- Conducting of at least three inspection visits per year in each of 2,000 schools in the project areas .
- Provision of equipment and training for 360 administrative staff. This surpassed the original target of 100 and achieved the revised target of 360.
- Conducting of a project impact study by the Ministry of Education, consisting of qualitative and quantitative data drawn from questionnaires, interviews, and classroom observations .

Outcomes

Access/ Enrollment

- The number of boys enrolled in grades 1-6 in the seven project governorates increased from 616,874 in 2007/08 to 711,971 in 2013. This surpassed the original target of 667,000, as well as the revised target of 699,679.
- The number of girls enrolled in grades 1-6 in the seven project governorates increased from 437,450 in 2007/08 to 539,602 in 2013. This surpassed the original target of 507,000, as well as the revised target of 508,000.

Other

- According to the impact study (as reported in the ICR, page 15), the regular inspection visits helped central and local level Ministry of Education staff to work more collectively (i.e. reports sent from the field were reviewed by all team members and took into account recommendations and issues raised at the local level) and to provide teachers and staff with a clearer vision for the learning and teaching process .
- According to the ICR (page 14), stakeholder interviews collected anecdotal evidence that the female teachers recruited through the project "now form a strong community of practice in their respective villages and act as role models for young girls."

5. Efficiency:

Substantial . The project was implemented with minimal delays, including the lack of any significant delays due to financial management or procurement. Project management costs comprised only 3.5% of total project cost. Although some construction targets were scaled back due to the impacts of civil unrest, the project still achieved its outcome targets, in part through effective targeting of governorates with the greatest need for school construction. Also, the average cost for schools constructed by the project was US\$ 284.90 - 348.00/ sq. meter (ICR, page 25). The ICR reports that this is "comparable" to the cost of schools implemented by the government social fund program (Social Fund for Development), although specific data are not provided. The rural female teacher program is likely cost-effective because teachers are locally based and thus far have remained in their positions rather than moving to less underserved areas .

The PAD (page 63) provided an economic internal rate of return analysis based on benefits of increased grade 6 completion rates (which is correlated with higher expected earnings) versus project costs. The estimated rate of return was 15.8%. The ICR does not provide an updated analysis .

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR)/Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation :

Rate Available?

Point Value

Coverage/Scope*

Appraisal
ICR estimate

Yes
No

15.8%

90%

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome:

The relevance of the project objectives is High, while the relevance of the project design is Substantial . Achievement of the objective to increase access of children, especially girls, to primary education in underserved areas is rated Substantial under the original targets as well as for the revised targets . Efficiency is also rated Substantial. Taken together, these ratings are indicative of minor shortcomings and therefore an overall Outcome rating of Satisfactory .

According to harmonized OPCS/IEG guidelines, when project objectives and/or associated outcome targets are revised, the project outcome rating should be assessed under the original targets and the revised targets . As the overall project outcome is considered Satisfactory under both sets of targets, a weighted calculation of the outcome rating is not needed .

a. Outcome Rating : Satisfactory

7. Rationale for Risk to Development Outcome Rating:

Financial support is likely to be continued through a planned Phase IV grant, with identical implementation arrangements and interventions planned . In addition, the female teacher recruitment program will be continued through other Bank projects . However, a school maintenance program to ensure that schools remain in adequate operational condition has not been established, and the volatile security situation remains a significant risk.

a. Risk to Development Outcome Rating : Significant

8. Assessment of Bank Performance:

a. Quality at entry:

The project was the third phase in a series of Education For All - Fast Track Initiative grants, with Phase I approved in 2003 and Phase II approved in 2005. The previous two grants had financed similar outputs, including construction of new classrooms, training of teachers, and provision of school materials . This Phase III grant, however, focused more heavily on girls living in underserved areas . This project built upon the improved capacity of the Borrower in implementing large -scale education grants, by using the implementation arrangements through the Public Works Project (an implementing agency in the Ministry of Planning and International Cooperation that has had extensive experience in implementing donor projects) to implement civil works components of the project . The project design also took measures to ensure readiness for implementation during the preparation phase, including undertaking initial steps for baseline inventories for civil works and drafting Memoranda of Understanding with the Public Works Program and the Ministry of Education. The risk assessment was comprehensive, with the main risk that materialized being civil unrest, which could not have been foreseen at the time of project design . The results framework was simple and focused on measurable outcomes during the short project period .

Quality-at-Entry Rating : Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision:

Although the period of suspended disbursements (and severe security threats, which led to staff evacuation or work stoppages) led to implementation disruption, a minimal but sufficient level of implementation efforts was maintained. The Bank team conducted three "reverse" missions from a nearby country to maintain implementation efforts. A third Party monitoring agency was also contracted from November 2012 to September 2013 to conduct field supervision .

Quality of Supervision Rating : Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating : Satisfactory

9. Assessment of Borrower Performance:

a. Government Performance:

The Ministry of Education provided effective institutional support for the project . This included clarifying the roles of the two primary implementing agencies, as well as ensuring employment of contractual female teachers as a critical part of project design .

Government Performance Rating Satisfactory

b. Implementing Agency Performance:

There were two primary implementing agencies for this project . The Public Works Program implemented civil works, while the Project Administrative Unit implemented all other activities . During the period of civil unrest, these agencies were able to maintain partial (albeit slow) implementation, and in the end, most project activities were implemented as planned . M&E responsibilities were effectively carried out .

Implementing Agency Performance Rating : Satisfactory

Overall Borrower Performance Rating : Satisfactory

10. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization:

a. M&E Design:

The M&E design was simple and focused on measurable outcomes during the brief project period . Indicators largely tracked outputs and intermediate outcomes, as longer -term outcomes such as retention rates or learning outcomes were unrealistic . An impact assessment was included in the project design, given that this project represented the final phase of a series of three grants .

b. M&E Implementation:

Education-related data as well as construction outputs were regularly monitored, although there were some delays in confirming data due to the civil unrest . The third party monitoring agency also provided useful information through monitoring reports . The impact study was conducted; however, it covered only the third phase rather than all three phases .

c. M&E Utilization:

Project monitoring data were collected regularly, which enabled the revision of targets to more realistic levels during the project restructuring .

M&E Quality Rating : Substantial

11. Other Issues

a. Safeguards:

The project was classified as a Category "B" project due to potential environmental impact from civil works . Safeguard policies for Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01) and Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP 4/12) were triggered. The Environmental Management Plan that had been prepared for the first two phases of the grant was updated, to ensure effective environmental management during school construction and /or rehabilitation activities. The ICR (page 11) reports that the civil works activities were implemented in accordance with the Plan and that no environmental issues were reported . The planned impact study was to include an assessment of the environmental management plan; however, these findings are not reported in the ICR.

A Resettlement Policy Framework was also prepared for the project but was not used as no resettlement took place.e

b. Fiduciary Compliance:

Financial Management: Financial management was overall satisfactory for both the Public Works Program implementing civil works, and the Project Administrative Unit implementing non -civil works activities. Project audits were timely and unqualified. No major problems were reported.

Procurement: Procurement was also overall satisfactory for both implementing agencies . Procurement staff received adequate training and ensured compliance with procurement guidelines . Post-reviews were conducted regularly, and no major procurement problems were reported .

c. Unintended Impacts (positive or negative):

None reported.

d. Other:

12. Ratings :	ICR	IEG Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Risk to Development Outcome:	Moderate	Significant	Significant risk to outcomes remains due to the lack of a school maintenance plan and the continued volatile security situation .
Bank Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Borrower Performance :	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTES:

- When insufficient information is provided by the Bank for IEG to arrive at a clear rating, IEG will downgrade the relevant ratings as warranted beginning July 1, 2006.
- The "Reason for Disagreement/Comments" column could cross-reference other sections of the ICR Review, as appropriate.

13. Lessons:

Lessons from the ICR, adapted by IEG :

- Satisfactory quality-at-entry is a key factor for project performance in fragile environments . In the case of this project, strong project preparation included simple project design, realistic targets, and the use of existing implementation arrangements .

- Contracting female teachers in remote, rural areas can be a facilitating factor in increasing enrollment rates for female students. In the case of this project, stakeholders reported that there was a strong perception in the local communities that " the presence of female teachers encouraged a cultural shift in promoting girls' education" (ICR, page 14). Particularly if the teachers are locally recruited, there is also a higher likelihood that they will remain in the project areas and continue teaching and therefore also contribute to project sustainability .
- The use of an externally contracted agent to monitor project implementation can be critical in context of social or political unrest. In the case of this project, direct supervision of project activities by the Bank team was made impossible by the civil unrest; however, task team leaders confirmed that the third party monitoring agency was important for verifying implementation on the ground (including the quality of civil works), and making recommendations for follow-up actions (ICR, page 21). These actions helped to sustain project momentum in spite of the fragile context .
- The preparation of school maintenance plans was not given adequate consideration in the project design . In the case of this project, the lack of such plans pose a significant risk to the sustainability of the project achievements.

14. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

15. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR is concise and focused on realistic outcomes of the project, given the relatively short implementation period of the operation. The quality of the evidence and analysis was satisfactory . Lessons were clearly derived from project experience and are useful for projects implemented in similar contexts .

a.Quality of ICR Rating : Satisfactory