

THE WORLD BANK

*Discussion Paper*

EDUCATION AND TRAINING SERIES

*Report No. EDT20*

*Lending in Primary Education: Bank  
Performance Review, 1962–1983*

Ralph Romain

*November 1985*

Education and Training Department

Operations Policy Staff

Other EDT Discussion Papers

EDT1	General Operational Review of Textbooks	B. Searle	July 1985
EDT2	Does SENA Matter?--Some Preliminary Results on the Impact of Colombia's National Training System on Earnings	E. Jimenez B. Kugler	August 1985
EDT3	Higher Education in Sub-Saharan Africa	K. Hinchliffe	August 1985
EDT4	Planning of Education: Where Do We Stand?	G. Psacharopoulos	August 1985
EDT5	Evaluation in World Bank Education Projects: Lessons from Three Case Studies	B. Searle, ed.	August 1985
EDT6	Financing Technical Education in LDCs: Economic Implications from a Survey of Training Modes in the Republic of Korea	C. Lee	September 1985
EDT7	Raising School Quality in Developing Countries: What Investments Boost Learning?	B. Fuller	September 1985
EDT8	The Structure of Educational Costs: Multiproduct Cost Functions for Primary and Secondary Schools in Latin America	E. Jimenez	August 1985
EDT10	Classroom Uses of the Computer: A Retrospective View with Implications for Developing Countries	J. Friend	November 1985
EDT20	Lending in Primary Education: Bank Performance Review, 1962-1983	R. Romain	November 1985
EDT21	Teacher Training: A Review of World Bank Experience	W. Haddad	November 1985
EDT22	Institutional Development in Education and Training in Sub-Saharan African Countries	J. Auerhan, et al.	November 1985

Discussion Paper

Education and Training Series

Report No. EDT20

LENDING IN PRIMARY EDUCATION:  
BANK PERFORMANCE REVIEW, 1962 - 1983

Ralph Romain  
Education Policy Division  
Education and Training Department

November 1985

The World Bank does not accept responsibility for the views expressed herein, which are those of the author and should not be attributed to the World Bank or to its affiliated organizations. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions are the results of research or analysis supported by the Bank; they do not necessarily represent official policy of the Bank. The designations employed, the presentation of material, and any maps used in this document are solely for the convenience of the reader and do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Bank or its affiliates concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city, area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its boundaries, or national affiliation.

## **Abstract**

This study does not attempt to deal with the primary education problems of the world. It looks at the Bank in the context of the peculiar nature and identity of primary education. It seeks to analyze the Bank's performance in primary education with a view to a better understanding of those characteristics of operations in this subsector which require closer attention on the part of Bank staff. The paper is therefore rather narrowly focused on Bank performance and on areas in which the Bank might be more effective. It is necessarily more detailed on project design than on project implementation and results, in which the experience is more limited.

LENDING IN PRIMARY EDUCATION:  
BANK PERFORMANCE REVIEW FY63-83

	<u>Page No.</u>
SUMMARY (a) Main Findings .....	(i)
(b) Implications for Policy .....	(iv)
PREFACE .....	(vi)
CHAPTER I - Evolution of Lending Policy and Operations in Primary Education .....	1
A. Policy Background in Primary Education .....	1
B. Amount and Distribution of Primary Education Investment .....	4
C. Bank-Sponsored Research .....	6
CHAPTER II - Project Design and Purpose .....	8
A. The Origin of the Projects .....	8
B. Goals and Objectives .....	8
C. The Means Selected .....	12
D. Design of Implementation Arrangements .....	23
E. Regional Characteristics in Project Provision .....	24
CHAPTER III - The Implementation of Primary Education Components .....	27
A. Implementation Time .....	27
B. Changes in Scope .....	28
C. Implementing Education Programs .....	29
D. Conclusion .....	32
ANNEXES - 1. Projects Selected for Desk Review .....	33
2. Primary Education as a Proportion of Total Education Investment (by FY) .....	34
3. Regional Distribution of Primary School Places to be Provided under Projects Involving Primary Education .....	36
4. Sample of Efforts in Projects in Some African Countries to Cope with Basic Education Needs Through Means Other than Regular Formal Primary Schooling .....	39
5. Origins of Projects .....	41
6. Length of Primary/Basic Schooling .....	42
7. Programs of Ruralizing of Curricula .....	45
8. Textbook Provision in Projects within the Sample .....	47
9. Project-Related Programs of Teacher Training .....	48
10. Provision for Primary Education in Education Projects (by Region) .....	50
11. Implementation Time Performance on Selected Projects (Primary Education Components) .....	57
12. Reasons for Delays in Implementing Primary Education Components .....	58
13. Implementing Education Programs .....	59

#### ABBREVIATIONS USED

I II	As in Liberia II - the First or Second Bank/IDA assisted Education project in the country concerned.
EMENA	Europe Middle East and North Africa Regional Office
FY	Fiscal Year July 1 - June 30
IDA	International Development Association
LAC	Latin America and the Caribbean Regional Office
OED	Operations Evaluation Department
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
UPE	Universal Primary Enrollment

LENDING IN PRIMARY EDUCATION:  
BANK PERFORMANCE REVIEW FY63-83

SUMMARY

(a) Main Findings

1. Extensive research has shown that primary education contributes to improved productivity in rural areas, higher urban earnings and improved management of households, leading, among other things, to reduced infant and child death rates. Governments throughout the world generally accept that attendance at primary schools should be free and compulsory.

2. The Bank began lending for education in FY63. For the first seven years, however, lending for primary education was not allowed. Lending policies were progressively widened to include primary education expansion and the measures needed to effect qualitative change. Of the 264 education projects approved over the period FY63-83, 68 contained primary education components, all of them approved FY70-83. These components were expected to supply 3.8 million school places and were estimated to cost US\$1.4 billion or 14 percent of estimated costs of all education projects.

3. The scale of this investment, however, is not commensurate with the Bank's bold policy statements about expanding primary education and meeting the needs of the lower 40 percent in the socio-economic scale. Lending operations in primary education have been increasing, but at a slower rate was forecast in sector policy papers. Furthermore, the bulk of this primary education investment and these school places has been concentrated in East Asia and the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbean, while only 20 percent of the school places and 21 percent of the investments were directed toward those Regions with lowest incomes and enrollment ratios - South Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa (paras. 1.01 - 1.17). Considerably more needs to be done in these latter Regions to address the scale of the problem.

Design of Primary Education Components.

4. Review of a random sample of 25 of the 68 projects shows that, while the primary education components have generally been related to Government plans and policies, greater care is needed to elaborate their goals and objectives and to ensure that such components fit well within national long-range development plans (paras. 2.01 - 2.05).

5. These components have had two broad aims. The first has been to expand opportunity, usually with a view to more equitable access to education (especially for the more deprived rural areas), in several instances with specific concern for improved participation by girls and by all ethnic groups. However, a stronger pursuit of universal primary enrollment is needed with greater concern for low cost buildings and for the intensive use of buildings (paras. 2.01 - 2.05; 2.12 - 2.13).

6. A second aim has been to improve the quality and efficiency of primary education, chiefly through making curricula more appropriate to rural needs by adding practical subjects (gardening and domestic arts)

(paras. 2.07 - 2.10). A few projects went too far in the direction of vocational and pre-vocational training, appearing to lose sight of the paramount purpose of primary education, which is a grounding in the basic subjects (paras. 2.16 - 2.17).

7. Several of the projects supported textbooks, but there appeared to be a decline in recent years in support for local manufacture (as distinct from purchase) of textbooks. There has also been a decline in support for educational broadcasting. It would appear that some evaluation of large-scale projects in educational broadcasting and local manufacture of textbooks is needed to assist the Bank in designing informed aid policies in these areas which are so crucial for mass education at an economical cost (paras. 2.21 - 2.24). Many projects financed the supply of textbooks in a local language; however, there was no support for strengthening institutes or academies for the development of local languages (para. 2.20).

8. The projects paid close attention to the need for appropriately trained teachers. Teacher training was well supported for purposes directly connected with reform efforts financed by the projects--to assist teachers to reform their methods, to use the textbooks and to undertake multi-grade teaching, for example. These ad hoc programs highlight the need to strengthen the regular teacher training systems to cover these basic training needs (paras. 2.25 - 2.26).

9. In regard to staff housing which is important in rural primary education, the Bank did not follow consistent policies regarding cost recovery, standard of housing, and the amounts of housing considered desirable (para. 2.27). Guidelines on this matter appear necessary.

10. The projects have increasingly addressed the need to build up management capacity and evaluation. Nevertheless, the Bank needs to do more in institutional development--building up permanent planning, management and research capacity--and to use local universities more as a resource for developing primary education (paras. 1.17, 1.19 - 1.22, 2.28 - 2.33).

11. The state of project preparation for the primary education components was generally less advanced at Board approval than the Bank's guidelines require. There appears to be a need for more lead time for planning and preparation, in view of the special nature of primary education which often involves a large number of sites. Project management arrangements for primary education followed the typical education project device of Project Implementation Units, despite the special logistical problems of primary education which often involves remote rural areas and a variety of inputs which need to be coordinated. There appeared to be a need for greater mobilization of existing resources for project implementation, including village resources and the agencies operating in rural areas such as nongovernmental organizations (paras. 2.34 - 2.37).

Implementation of Primary Education Components.

12. From the limited implementation experience of these primary education components, it appears that implementation time scheduling is unrealistic in the light of the innovative nature of the components and the large numbers of remote sites with which primary education is generally associated (paras. 3.02 - 3.04). The average implementation period for 15 of the 25 projects was 6.8 years while the originally allowed time was 4.1 years. Delays have been experienced largely because of weaknesses in project management, site selection and acquisition and borrower capacity to provide funding as and when needed (para. 3.05). During implementation, considerable change in the scope of primary education components occurred. In some projects, there was an increase--from 10 to 15 schools in Brazil II, from 150 to 250 workshops in Rwanda I, or from 550 to 750 schools in Ethiopia IV. In others, however, there was a decrease (paras. 3.06-3.07). While their impact on equity or improved access is implicit, no evaluations have been done to establish this.

13. Projects have helped to bring about the intended changes in curricula. Little is known of how effectively the new curricula are being applied (paras. 3.09-3.10). Implementing large scale national reforms of primary education, especially in regard to practical subjects, has proven to be quite risky, with significant changes occurring in country policy during implementation, in favor of reducing the importance of practical subjects. This underscores the need for more piloting of reforms and choice of realistic goals (paras. 3.11 - 3.12). Some reforms supported by the projects--Morocco III, Malawi II, for example--have proven too costly for replication on a national scale. The search should therefore be intensified for reforms which are replicable (paras. 3.13 - 3.15). Experience with providing textbooks has been mixed (paras. 3.16-3.17).

14. Despite their special characteristics which make them uniquely prone to implementation problems, primary education projects have not proven to be unusually difficult to implement. Indeed they constitute a relatively successful aspect of Bank operations. The various experiments with alternatives to formal primary education, have clearly demonstrated that, while non-formal education has its merits, there is no viable alternative to formal primary schools and the countries and the Bank have generally accepted this. Clearly there are no insuperable operational obstacles to expanded Bank activity in primary education, especially in those countries in which large numbers of children are still out of school. The Governments are anxious to expand and improve primary schools and to undertake bold programs of qualitative improvement. Given the well-known benefits of primary schooling, operational experience to date suggests that the Bank could and should do much more in primary education to identify itself prominently with the pursuit of universal primary enrollment.

(b) Implications for Policy

Recommendation 1

The Bank needs to be better identified in its operations with the pursuit of universal primary enrollment, as a crucial element in promoting both social equity and economic development. Bank operations in Regions of low incomes and low enrollment ratios--Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia-- should accord high priority to finding cost effective ways of rapidly expanding opportunities for primary schooling (paras. 1.13 - 1.18).

Recommendation 2

With a view to finding more effective ways of promoting primary education, the Bank should attend to the following substantive issues:

- (a) Devising a strategy for building up the institutional capacity to manage, plan and research education in the countries, including greater use of local universities to assist in primary education development (paras. 1.17, 2.30 - 2.33);
- (b) Reviewing experience with mass media in primary education, particularly educational broadcasting and textbook manufacture, as the basis for a better informed policy in these areas (para. 2.22);
- (c) Undertaking more research on educational topics of relevance to primary education and support the inclusion in projects of measures designed to build up country research capacity as well as funding for research topics (paras. 1.19 - 1.22);
- (d) Strengthening exchange of information across Regional education divisions on primary education development as well as cooperation with Unesco on such matters as low-cost primary school buildings (paras. 2.12 and 2.42);
- (e) Considering support for institutes or academies concerned with developing local languages (paras. 2.20); and
- (f) Ensuring that in those textbook components which it finances in primary education, there are no barriers placed in the way of student purchase of books (paras. 2.23-2.24).

Recommendation 3

In order to improve project design in the primary education subsector, Bank staff need to improve project processing in the following ways:

- (a) Elaborate project goals and objectives more precisely and thoroughly in appraisal reports (paras. 2.03 - 2.04).
- (b) Ensure that agreed long-range development plans and policies form the basis of primary education components, especially where these components are introducing major reform.
- (c) Scrutinize curricular reform components with a view to ensuring (i) that they are not too costly to be replicated generally over the country and (ii) that they do not neglect the main purpose of primary education, namely instruction in the basic subjects (paras. 2.17, 3.09 - 3.14) (iii) that the venture into large scale reform is not premature and has been preceded by some pilot or demonstration projects (para. 3.15).
- (d) Allow adequate lead time for project preparation (para. 2.36) and build into the project design some flexibility regarding targets (paras. 3.06 - 3.07) and an allowance in implementation scheduling. This should take into account the inherent difficulties of managing primary education projects and ensuring that the required teachers, materials, and buildings are delivered and supported by supervision and evaluation services (paras. 3.02 - 3.04).
- (e) Make wider use of existing agencies for project implementation, especially those already operating at the village level (including non-governmental organizations) and greater mobilization of village resources (paras. 2.34 - 2.35).

Recommendation 4

In order to assist Bank staff in applying these findings and in achieving greater awareness and consistency in approaches to developing primary education, the following should be done:

- (a) Guidelines need to be prepared on the standards which the Bank is prepared to support in providing housing for primary school teachers, including amount of housing, cost recovery and quality of housing (para. 2.27).
- (b) A seminar is needed which would include discussion of (a) expectations as to the content and outcome of primary schooling (paras. 2.16-2.18; (b) the length of the primary cycle (para. 2.19); and (c) approaches to project design and scope in the various Regions (paras. 2.37-2.42).

LENDING IN PRIMARY EDUCATION:  
BANK PERFORMANCE REVIEW  
FY63-83

PREFACE

(i) Why a review of primary education at this time? The Education Sector Policy Paper 1980 noted as significant issues (a) the deficiencies in rates of schooling and literacy, (b) inefficiencies (both internal and external) in existing education systems and (c) the heavy demands upon education administrators resulting from the unprecedented expansion of education systems over the previous 25 years. The Paper put forward certain principles on the basis of which the Bank would promote educational development. These principles included promoting social equity, providing basic education for all as soon as resources and conditions permit, improving internal efficiency of education systems, seeking to make education relevant to work and environment, and strengthening institutional capabilities in education and training. Lending for the primary subsector, which had been estimated to be 5% of total lending in the sector 1970-74 and 14% 1975-78, was projected to rise to 24% in 1979-83. There is enough Bank experience with primary education to warrant undertaking a search for lessons so as to better inform lending for primary education in the future.

(ii) The problems of primary education in the world are fairly well known: relatively low enrollment ratios, especially in South Asia and Sub-Saharan Africa; unit costs in several poor countries which are considered relatively high and hence appear to stand in the way of realizing universal primary enrollment; inadequacy and unsuitability of books and instructional materials, physical plant and teachers; inappropriateness of curricula; and serious weaknesses in management, planning and research. Primary education touches, through pupils, parents and teachers, a vast section of any population and is consequently politically sensitive.

(iii) This study does not attempt to deal with the primary education problems of the world. It looks at the Bank in the context of the peculiar nature and identity of primary education. It seeks to analyze the Bank's performance in primary education with a view to a better understanding of those characteristics of operations in this subsector which require closer attention on the part of Bank staff. The paper is therefore rather narrowly focused on Bank performance and on areas in which the Bank might be more effective. It is necessarily more detailed on project design than on project implementation and results, in which the experience is more limited.

(iv) The principal sources of information have been the project documents available in the Bank--Appraisal and Supervision reports, Project Completion Reports and Project Performance Audit Reports. For the purposes of a closer scrutiny of operations, 25 of the 68 projects which involved primary education over the period FY63-83 were randomly selected for more detailed desk review. A list of these is given in Annex 1 and they cover 19 countries. No field visits were undertaken specifically in connection with this study.

(v) In this paper, primary education is taken to mean the first cycle and includes any services such as broadcasting or book production intended for that cycle. It does not encompass regular primary teacher training (see footnote to para. 1.01). The study is complemented by others which have been undertaken or will be undertaken shortly on textbooks, educational broadcasting, educational change, costs and financing, non-formal education, teacher training, and institutional development in Sub-Saharan Africa. Thus this study avoids any major excursion into these specialized areas. Throughout the report the emphasis is upon selected issues rather than upon providing a comprehensive picture.

(vi) The term "Bank" as used here covers both the Bank and IDA and "loans" or "lending" covers both loans and credits.

I. EVOLUTION OF LENDING POLICY AND OPERATIONS  
IN PRIMARY EDUCATION

A. Policy Background in Primary Education

1.01 The 1960s. Bank lending in education began in FY63. The early lending criteria excluded from Bank funding: (a) primary education, (b) the normal annual expansion of school facilities required for a constantly growing school age population and (c) items other than buildings and equipment. The Bank opted to concentrate its resources on secondary, vocational, technical and higher education and primary teacher training - the direct production of trained manpower.<sup>1/</sup>

1.02 The series of Unesco Regional Conferences on education held in the early 1960s emphasized the urgency of expanding primary education. At that time it was well-known, in the Bank and elsewhere, that there was considerable popular pressure in LDCs to expand primary education and that rapid expansion in this subsector posed a danger to educational standards, in view of the shortage of trained teachers and physical plant. The Bank also acknowledged that the primary education system in some cases was inadequate to provide a proper basis for the development of other aspects of the national educational development plans. There were still misgivings within the Bank about how suitable education was as an object of lending. Primary education in particular was considered to be consumption rather than investment, unlimited in its demands and not directly productive. The Bank and other agencies felt that, at the very least, the countries should take care of their primary subsector out of their own resources.

1.03 Some of the requests to the Bank for educational financing in the 1960s (Korea, for example, in 1965) included the primary education subsector as a priority area. In 1968 Unesco requested that the Bank support primary education and software and that the Bank design its assistance on the basis only of "the assessed needs and priorities of a recipient country" rather than on pre-determined criteria. The Bank President agreed and emphasized that the Bank would support (a) "well conceived" or "experimental projects in primary education (including those involving modern educational technology such as educational television), which promised improvements in economy, efficiency and the relevance of instruction to the real needs of the community"; (b) software; (c) basic equipment and supplies for the school system as a whole; (d) an initial stock of textbooks and supplies for project schools and (e) facilities for the local production of textbooks and other teaching materials.

---

<sup>1/</sup> For the purposes of this report, primary teacher training is regarded as indirect financing of primary education and therefore not included. A separate General Operational Review will deal with primary teacher training. However, ad hoc or special programs for orientation or training of teachers for a specific set of project primary schools, or for the use of project supplied text-books etc., is regarded as direct financing of primary education and covered in this review.

1.04 An internal Bank review of education operations in late 1969 endorsed the emerging interest in the Bank in support of new activities, such as software and educational technology, and concluded that greater Bank attention should be given to the management of education systems and to expanding the use of universities to give technical assistance to education.

1.05 The 1970s. The Ivory Coast First Education Project, approved with strong expressions of Board support in March 1970, included Educational Television for primary education. Although Bank lending for the television component was a minor part of the financing of that component as well as a minor part of the Loan amount, this Loan established the principle of direct financing of primary education. It was not until June 1970, however, when Board presentation of the Spain First Education Project took place, that the Board questioned the advisability of financing primary education (and of financing education in a marginal country such as Spain). Thirty-six percent of the cost of the proposed project was devoted to a program covering Grades 1-8. After a special Board discussion of the subject, lending for primary education was accepted.

1.06 In addition to the reasons advanced in the 1960s for expanding into primary education--objective determination of the subsector or activity in which investment should be made, and piloting reform, improvement or modernization--the 1970s added new impetus for financing primary education, arising largely from the Bank's interest in equity, in meeting basic needs and in alleviating poverty. Within the education sector, these interests appeared synonymous with support for primary education. The policy against meeting needs arising from population growth has effectively been discarded.

1.07 The 1971 Sector Working Paper observed that over the period 1960-66 primary school enrollment in LDCs had grown by 55 million, secondary by 15 million and higher by 2 million. The Paper considered this to be evidence of "narrow concentration by governments and also by external assistance agencies upon the improvement of human resources for the modern economic sector", to the neglect of rural communities and nonformal education. The qualitative implications of this enormous growth, in a subsector to which insufficient investment had been directed, were beginning to become clear. The Paper concentrated upon the need to find new sources of educational financing, to contain growth and to promote efficiency in school systems through such measures as educational radio and television, programmed learning and teaching materials and equipment, which were expected to receive greater Bank attention. Support was given to the idea of making each stage of education more "terminal" in character, rather than a preparation for the succeeding stage. All of these measures were applicable to primary education. Nevertheless, the 1971 Sector Working Paper was not a mandate for more lending in primary education; instead, the Paper emphasized that during the 1970s there would be a search for alternatives to formal primary education.

1.08 The mandate for more lending in primary education came in the 1974 Sector Working Paper. There had been some slackening in enrollment growth rates in primary education over the period 1965-70 by comparison

with 1960-65<sup>2/</sup>. The 1974 Sector Working Paper, considered this "stagnation in enrollment," confronted more directly than did the 1971 edition the problem of large numbers of children of school age being out of school, and better reflected the new Bank emphasis upon poverty and the rural areas.

1.09 The concern was to meet basic needs by (i) making schools more relevant to the rural milieu and utilizing rural education centers and traditional religious institutions, (ii) adjusting ages of attendance, (iii) broadening the primary school programs to make them more terminal, (iv) using mass media in support and (v) making increased use of the mother tongue in basic education. Other issues were raised for consideration, such as defining minimum learning packages, grade promotion policy, causes of drop-out and repetition, class sizes, teacher qualifications and their cost implications and the structure of school systems. The Paper suggested that, while those countries with high primary enrollment ratios might concentrate on qualitative improvement, those with low ratios (and low incomes) should explore alternatives to expanding the formal systems (including restructuring primary education) for providing basic education. One of the four principles on which the Bank would promote educational development was said to be that "there should be at least a minimum basic education for all", but with the qualifying statement "as soon as available resources permit and the course of development requires".

1.10 It was estimated that lending for primary/basic education, which had comprised 5% of lending 1963-71 and 11% 1972-74, would rise to 27% 1974-78, and that this would be a "tooling up" period for a large-scale attack on worldwide needs after 1978, a period which would include (a) research into the conditions related to basic education, (b) development of curricula, teacher training, institutional models, project design, use of mass media, management training, administrative reorganization, monitoring and evaluation, planning and policy formulation by the countries. Lending was also expected to include support for the local design, production and distribution of textbooks and instructional equipment.

1.11 The 1980 Sector Policy Paper noted the continued decline in enrollment growth rates and offered the most comprehensive Bank policy statement on primary education. It addressed the urgency of attending to the large and growing number of persons still not in school. To this end, the Paper referred to mobilizing community resources, improving school location planning, equalizing "quality" in the school system (teachers, materials, etc.), including compensatory measures for disadvantaged children, the value of instructional materials and the use of mass media. The Paper noted (a) the problems of using local languages as the medium of instruction, (b) the persistence of disparities between enrollments of boys and those of girls, (c) problems of internal efficiency, and (d) that pilot projects are not easily replicable, attempts to ruralize the primary school curricula had proved difficult and there were advantages in allowing the school to concentrate on general education.

---

<sup>2/</sup> The 1960-65 growth in primary schools enrollment had been 40.7 million, while the 1965-70 growth was 40.8 million. In primary, secondary and higher education the growth rates for 1965-70 were lower than the 1960-65 rates.

1.12 This Paper emphasized institution building and reiterated the priorities of extending basic education in low income countries. The principle of basic education for all was restated, with the same qualification as in the 1974 paper (para. 1.09). Lending for primary education was expected to rise to 24% of education lending in the 1979-83 period.

B. Amount and Distribution of Primary Education Investment

1.13 Lending for primary/basic education developed slowly after the liberalization of lending criteria. In the 1960s none of the 32 projects approved included direct financing of primary education. In the period FY70-73, eight projects, or 12% of the total number of education projects for which lending was approved, had a primary education component. This proportion rose to roughly one third - 35% in FY74-78 and 33% in FY79-83. The amount of overall project investment devoted to primary education - the portion of project cost attributable to primary education - rose from US\$68.6 million in FY69-73 to US\$342.6 million in FY74-78 and US\$1032.6 million in FY79-83.<sup>3/</sup> This represented an increasing proportion of the total costs of all education projects - from 4.9% in FY69-73 to 13.4% in FY74-78 and 17% in FY79-83. Primary education also became increasingly significant in its own right within projects, often being the sole concern of projects or constituting a growing proportion of the projects which contained primary education (Annex 2).

1.14 In regard to regional distribution, the emphasis upon primary education followed patterns which were not fully consistent with the emphasis which the Sector Policy Papers placed upon countries of low

Table 1: Regional Distribution of Investment in Primary Education FY63-83

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Region (Total No. of Education Projects in Parenthesis)	No. of Projects with Primary Education	Regional % of Total Projects	Primary Education Cost (US\$M)	Regional % of Total Primary Education Cost	No. of Primary School Places to be Provided (in 000's)	Regional % of Total Places
E. Africa (57)	17	25.0	173.69	12.03	325	8.5
W. Africa (41)	14	20.6	71.28	4.94	66	1.7
E. Asia & Pac.(4)	11	16.2	709.51	49.25	2,405	62.8
S. Asia (17)	2	2.9	61.18	4.24	373	9.7
EMENA (52)	6	8.8	86.45	5.99	94	2.5
LAC (51)	18	26.5	341.38	23.65	566	14.8
TOTAL (264)	68	100	1,443.49	100	3,830*	100.0

\*For details see Annexes 3 and 10

<sup>3/</sup> No attempt is made to determine the amount of lending for primary education as this is extremely difficult to isolate. Instead, the amount of the estimated project cost has been used in order to obtain an idea of proportions.

incomes and enrollment ratios. Eastern and Western Africa and South Asia, would normally have been expected to receive the bulk of primary education investment, because of their almost intractable problems of (often extremely) low incomes and enrollment ratios. The picture which emerges from the following table is not in keeping with this expectation:

1.15 Thus the three Regions which, according to the Sector Policy Paper criteria, need it least - East Asia & Pacific, EMENA and Latin America & Caribbean - were allocated 79% of overall investment in primary education and 80% of the school places concerned. The shortfall is most evident in two Regions, South Asia and Western Africa. South Asia accounted for only 4% of total investment, 10% of school places. Western Africa, despite the four primary education projects approved for FY83, accounted for less than 5% of total planned Bank-assisted project investment in primary education and less than 2% of school places intended to be provided under these projects.

1.16 It is useful to measure this effort to supply school places against the number of children of primary school age who were estimated to be out of school in these Regions. The school places included in the projects amounted to less than 10% of the places needed in the relevant Western African countries to accommodate those children of school age estimated to be out of school. In South Asia, the proportion was 4%; in Eastern Africa, 3.3%; in EMENA, 2.1%. In contrast, in Latin America and the Caribbean it was 33% and in East Asia it was above 100%. (Annex 3) It is quite clear that the projects in the areas of lowest enrollment ratios provide grossly insufficient inroads into the exclusion of school age children from school. The limited South Asia performance reflects some lack of Bank access to the sector in some of the countries; it reflects as well a relatively low priority to education in not only the development policies of the countries but also the Bank Group Country Programs as well. The Eastern and Western Africa weakness reflects a more general problem: investments in the sector--and not simply the subsector--are relatively small. In Western Africa especially, there was also a period in the earlier 1970s when the search for alternatives to formal primary schooling distracted the Bank from the need to invest in primary education (see Annex 4).

1.17 The performance to date shows that countries with higher incomes and enrollment ratios and rapidly developing education systems are more keenly aware of the urgency of investing in primary education in order to improve the quality and equity of the system and for its beneficial impact upon the education system as a whole and upon society. This in turn indicates the urgent need to strengthen the institutional infrastructure - the leadership in management, planning and research in education - upon which depend progressive policies that accord due attention to primary education. This investment in absorptive capacity is a pre-condition of extensive primary education investment.

1.18 Within the Bank a significant and conspicuous change in policy, increased attention to the problem of children out of school and a higher priority to achieving universal primary enrollment is needed. A firm commitment by senior management to such a goal would go a long way toward encouraging countries and Bank staff in the search for realistic ways of achieving it.

### C. Bank-Sponsored Research

1.19 The Bank has directed some of its research efforts in the sector to problems and questions concerning primary education. One major Bank sponsored idea was the search for alternatives to formal primary schooling which was financed in Western Africa under several education projects (Annex 4). The Bank financed a seminar to discuss the issue and helped to produce a useful synthesis of findings (M. Botti, M. D. Carelli and M. Saliba: Basic Education in the Sahel Countries (Unesco Institute for Education, Hamburg, 1978)). Most Bank research on primary education occurred after 1977 and it would be unrealistic to expect it to have had any large-scale impact upon education policies at this stage. The principal concerns of research studies have been economics-oriented, covering costs, rates of return and the contribution to economic development, with some detailed studies of productivity of farmers and the urban poor. Another area of concern has been the extent to which various factors influence qualitative improvement, including, for example, teacher training, textbooks, technology, the language of instruction and the home environment. Efforts have also been directed toward ascertaining achievement in mathematics and the retention of literacy and numeracy among primary school-leavers. More recently, efforts have been directed at analyzing levels of education expenditures among the various subsectors with a view to establishing whether, with cost recovery and shifts in resources from, say, the higher education subsector, the funding of primary or basic education might be improved.

1.20 Research in both the Bank and elsewhere has so far served to reconfirm the high returns to investment in primary education, the primary education contribution to raising farm incomes and to helping communities to profit from new agricultural techniques, the impact of primary education on fertility of women and on child care, and the importance of textbooks. Research has also shown that teachers can successfully cope with relatively large classes, and that levels of educational achievement in developing countries are low by comparison with those in most developed countries.

1.21 In the past, the educational research program of the Bank was criticized as being negligible in size, determined by staff interests and lacking coordination and operational relevance. While the program has been enlarged, it is still not of the magnitude needed to form the basis of major policy changes in the sector. The Bank has recognized that the bulk of the research needs in the sector will have to be met by researches conducted by and within the borrowing countries. This is particularly true for such a community based sub-sector as primary education. A strategy to meet these needs has not as yet been devised but will require strengthened research capacity in these countries.

1.22 Research topics which are indicated by the several aspects of this study include, for example, (1) learning problems and achievements in various subjects at primary level, (2) the educational value of "practical" subjects in the primary school curriculum, (3) efficiency of teaching and the efficiency of testing and examinations at the primary level, (4) the social and educational implications of the use of the mother tongue as the language of instruction, (5) availability and impact of information resources upon primary schooling, (6) low-cost design and construction of primary school buildings, (7) mobilization of community resources for primary education, (8) requirements of strengthening educational research and (9) external productivity of primary education. This study has not surveyed the research priorities of the borrowers. The role of the Bank, however, in addition to ascertaining these priorities, should include (i) supporting and encouraging the building up of educational research capacity in the countries (ii) and encouraging the inclusion of useful educational research in primary education components of projects.

## II. PROJECT DESIGN AND PURPOSE

2.00 Analysis of all education projects approved up to the end of FY83 revealed that 68 contained primary education components. Twenty five of these were randomly selected for closer analysis as to their design and implementation. In regard to design, the questions about these components centered around their relevance to Government plans and policies, their goals and objectives, the means selected to achieve the goals and objectives, the design of implementation arrangements and evidence of regional patterns.

### A. The Origin of the Projects

2.01 Some nine of the 25 projects selected for closer study accorded more or less with the education sections of national development plans (usually five-year plans). A further eight were derived from special education plans (often long-term). Two of these 17 plan-based projects were further developed as a result of Bank subsector studies (Bangladesh, Colombia). Another project (Barbados) was designed on the basis of a Unesco sector study and appeared to fit well within the Government sector policy. In the case of Chad III, Rwanda I and Burundi I, there were Government-accepted, ongoing, qualitative reforms being assisted by Unesco/UNDP; there was need for some supporting investment in physical plant and other items and these three projects were designed to respond to this need. However, while the relationship to a development plan was not clear in these cases, the projects were well linked to a development policy. On the whole, this suggests that the projects were generally well related to Government priorities and intentions (Annex 5).

2.02 There was, however, a small minority of projects in which the origins of the primary education component were less clear. The primary education components of Mauritania I and Tunisia III were not related to Government plans. Both financed items closely related to the Bank Sector Policy and essentially sponsored without sufficiently wide Government support. In Mauritania, the component represented a search for less costly alternatives to primary schooling. In Tunisia, the broad application of an innovation which had already been tested was also financed, but this projected generalizing of the program did not belong to any sector or national plan. The primary education components of both projects encountered serious difficulties during implementation. Given the political sensitivity of primary education, it is very important to ensure that projects are rooted in approved national policy. Given the length of time needed to effect major change in this subsector, long-term plans would form the best basis for projects in primary education.

### B. Goals and Objectives

2.03 As primary education constitutes the base of the education system, its goals are not the easiest to express; they may include any or all of the myriad goals of education as a whole. Nevertheless, a project must be based on certain goals which relate to the country problem(s) being addressed.

2.04 On the whole, in the primary education components of these projects, while goals could be deduced or were implicit in the project design, it is difficult to find well-stated goals in the appraisal reports. In several cases there was failure to identify clearly the type and educational level of person that the primary school course was expected to produce and to assess the measures needed to bring this about. If a synthesis of the scattered descriptions and inferences were to be attempted, it would probably be as follows: supporting borrower efforts to deliver, to a higher proportion of the population, basic education which would enhance the socio-economic status of the target group and contribute to nation building in economic and social senses. This broad aim emerges more from a reading of sector background sections of appraisal reports, outlining sector problems and government policies and plans, than from specific statements of goals in the appraisal reports.

2.05 The specific objectives of project items relating to primary education were enunciated in varying degrees of thoroughness. Where they were not well expressed, there appeared to be an assumption (often unwarranted) that they were self-evident. In general, the objectives were:

- (a) to support expansion of the school system, in some cases as part of a planned step toward universal primary education, in such a way as to stimulate the attendance of rural dwellers and often of females as well;
- (b) to improve the quality of primary education in the sense of both raising standards and improving the relevance of education to the needs of the communities; and
- (c) to raise the levels of internal and external efficiency of the programs and, in some cases, to find a more economical or cost effective way of producing the graduates of the schools.

2.06 Expansion. One of the most important objectives was that of expanding educational opportunity, in most cases by building more school places. The focus was on the most disadvantaged areas, usually rural, which lacked not only schools but other basic educational support services as well. References to equalizing opportunities as among ethnic/linguistic groups arose only in Malaysia II, Bolivia I, Ethiopia V, although it was probably an objective in other expansion programs as well. Reference to providing for an increase in female enrollment occurred in eight cases and, in three of these, a campaign to encourage girls to attend school was considered necessary (Bangladesh IV, Bolivia I and Ethiopia IV). Concern with reaching the more deprived areas was always present, perhaps because the discipline of equitable geographical distribution was always inherent in educational planning. However, the expression "school mapping" or "school location planning" crept increasingly into the discussion after

1975. Only in a few cases was this expansion stated to be part of a planned effort to attain universal primary enrollment (UPE)--in Madagascar (II) by 1987, Ethiopia (V) by 1989 and Morocco (III) by 1995.<sup>4/</sup> UPE is one of the fundamental indices of equity in the society and the role of Bank financed projects in achieving this goal needs to be highlighted. Any appraisal report, therefore, for a project which deals with primary education in a society where UPE does not exist, should indicate the expected contribution of the project to, and target date for achieving, universal primary enrollment.

2.07 Quality. Improvement in the quality of education was often explicitly cited without an indication as to whether it meant the raising of academic standards or the improvement of relevance to the socio-economic environment.<sup>5/</sup> Where the project provision was more narrowly concerned with providing physical plant (Lesotho III, Chad III), the qualitative objectives, which were being pursued separately from (but parallel to) these projects, received only nominal treatment.

2.08 In the majority of projects, what was recognized as a means of improving quality was a need for infrastructure for effective teaching and learning--good physical plant, competent teachers and materials, including textbooks and teaching aids. Thus some qualitative objective could be deduced even if it had not been explicitly stated. In some appraisal reports there was mention of raising standards of teaching in mathematics and science (Malaysia II, III, Morocco III) and in others there was mention of prevailing low standards (Bangladesh IV, Colombia IV). Nevertheless, there was little reference to the strengthening of primary education as a basis for improvement in the sector as a whole, perhaps because of preoccupation with the suitability of primary education for the majority terminating their schooling at that level and a perception of primary education as an end in itself.

2.09 The importance of the relevance of curricula to the environment was widely recognized; often this relevance was already the aim of ongoing efforts in curriculum reform. In a few cases (Malaysia II, III, Madagascar II, Burundi I, Bolivia I and Lesotho III), the use of a national language in primary schools was specified. However, by far the most common device for achieving relevance to the needs of the communities, especially in projects approved between FY75 and FY79, was to include domestic or rural arts and agricultural and "prevocational" skills in the curriculum. The projects provided physical plant for these subjects as well as for the

---

<sup>4/</sup> In Liberia (II), UPE was mentioned as a Government objective without a target date. It was not, however, a project goal.

<sup>5/</sup> The ambiguity and colloquiality in various languages of the word 'quality' needs to be better appreciated in an international agency. Quality in various circumstances may connote, for example, standard, type, value, caliber, level etc. It is one of the terms used most loosely in appraisal reports. The reader's confidence in the term is sometimes jolted by such expressions as "increasing the quality" or "what is taught is of sound quality" or "quality education".

other basic primary subjects. There were other changes or improvements sought, whether within or outside the sample, but the most consistently pursued change was in the direction of adapting curricula to rural needs or "ruralizing" them so to speak (see also para. 2.38).

2.10 Efficiency. Improved efficiency was frequently mentioned as an aim, sometimes without specificity as to whether this meant internal or external efficiency.<sup>6/</sup> Internal efficiency objectives were implicit in most cases where an improved learning/teaching environment was sought. Consideration of more liberal grade promotion (Morocco III, Burundi I), closer attention to remediation (Morocco III, Barbados I) and shortening of the primary cycle (Burundi I, Madagascar I) suggest concern with achieving a less sluggish throughput of the primary school. There were efforts to adjust teacher:pupil ratios downward (Barbados I, Bolivia I, Lebanon I), or upward (Madagascar I) and to seek economies (Lebanon I, Mauritania I, Ethiopia IV), which suggest concern with deriving optimum benefits from the costs incurred in the subsector. Several efforts were intended to reduce attrition and the perceived obstacles to attendance: to provide school meals (Morocco III), uniforms (Bangladesh IV) and textbooks (in over 70% of the projects), to locate schools more strategically (in most projects) and to adjust the school terms in the light of crop cycles (Bolivia I). Objectives concerning external efficiency were less clear but closely linked with the efforts toward a more "relevant" curriculum. In Burundi I, it was expected that one result would be an improvement in the productivity of rural holdings.

---

<sup>6/</sup> The methods of illustrating internal efficiency in the Bank are not all satisfactory. If four boys enroll in a 6-grade primary school and two drop out after Grade 3, one after grade 5 and one completes grade 6, the Bank reports state that in this case 17 years of schooling were needed to produce one graduate. Furthermore, each grade repetition would add to that total. The one who dropped out after Grade 5 is regarded as wastage; had the primary cycle been 5 grades, however, he would have been regarded as a graduate, not wastage. Thus the educational investment is seen not in terms of its actual achievement--four persons having received some 17 years of schooling--but in terms of completion of a cycle. In certain fields and at higher levels - training medical doctors or engineers for example - this may make some sense in that the drop-outs cannot be employed in the same capacity as the registered practitioners. In primary education it does not; each year schooling achieved is important in itself. The study of retention of literacy in Egypt confirmed that literacy was retained by persons who had completed three and four years of schooling.

C. The Means Selected

2.11 Among the means selected to achieve the objectives were:

- (1) new school plant (new or rebuilt classrooms, workshops, usually furnished and equipped and sited within relatively easy reach of the target population);
- (2) educational reform of varying scope, including adjustment of the length of the primary cycle, new curricula, change in language of instruction;
- (3) direct assistance or support for the learning and teaching process, in the form of textbooks and materials or educational broadcasting;
- (4) an improvement in the supply of trained teachers;
- (5) institution building at the level of central and district offices for more effective primary school management and development and
- (6) mobilizing village or local community support.

The mix of objectives and means was unique to each project. The more comprehensive multifaceted approach to effecting improvement gathered momentum especially after FY76, not only providing school places, trained teachers and educational materials, but also assisting school and educational administration and the supply of staff housing.

2.12 (1) School Plant. Twenty-one of the 25 selected projects included provision for new school buildings. The exceptions were Madagascar II, predominantly an institution building effort; Malaysia II and III, which supported educational broadcasting and curriculum development, and Mauritania I, which sponsored a small experiment in the use of existing Koranic schools. Low-cost designs were mentioned in appraisal reports as an objective in a few projects (Ethiopia IV, Chad III for example) but only in two of the 19 countries<sup>7/</sup> was a search for designs suitable for construction on the basis of village self-help efforts specifically mentioned. While this does not necessarily mean lack of concern in other projects with economical construction, the emphasis was missing. Given the urgency of finding cost effective and economical ways of providing and servicing physical plant for rural primary schools, the pursuit of this goal appears to have been relatively muted. Furthermore,

---

<sup>7/</sup> Liberia (II), Malawi (II and III).

pooling of knowledge and experiences appears to be absent.<sup>8/</sup>

2.13 More efficient use of school plant was an objective but not prominently so. Possible double shift use in El Salvador IV, Burundi I and Brazil II was foreseen and this was implicit in Ethiopia V. In El Salvador IV, Malawi II, Liberia II and Ethiopia IV, the use of buildings by adults in the evening was also foreseen. The emphasis upon serving rural areas with scattered populations may have limited the scope for more intensive use; nevertheless, it is a legitimate question whether, in areas of low enrollment ratios, the double shift use of the village school should not be the norm, as part of a strategy to achieve maximum enrollment with the given investment, or to free funds for textbooks and other school supplies and equipment. It is well recognized, of course, that the double shift system is much more easily accepted or operated in some communities than in others.

2.14 (2) Aspects of Reform. The projects tended to promote various forms of change, innovation and experiment. Most of these amounted to no more than trying to put into practice much of what is well known to educators about the essentials of good primary schooling. No problem existed as to technical awareness on the part of countries or Bank staff on the need for a variety of inputs--trained teachers, appropriate curricula and educational materials, closer integration of the school within the community and improved administration and supervision. On occasion the new schools were known by specific names, such as the "community school" in Liberia II or the "escuela nueva" in Colombia IV. Three aspects of change are selected for discussion--(i) "ruralizing" the curriculum (ii) the length of the primary cycle and (iii) the use of local languages--because of the frequency with which they arose and the lessons which they may hold for the Bank.

2.15 With regard to the curriculum, it has been alleged that primary schools in developing countries and especially those in rural areas, alienate children from the rural environment, disseminate information and values irrelevant to rural life, promote disdain of labor and stimulate the rural exodus and educate persons more for continuing into secondary schools--the lot of the minority--than for terminating their schooling at

---

<sup>8/</sup> In most projects, there was concern with economical designs. However, there seems to be no link between the experiences of one country and those of another. In Liberia, under the Second Project (FY77), the study and application of low cost construction of schools which could be maintained by villages and of new designs of furniture (using local lumber), which could be made and repaired at the village level was supported. In Sierra Leone, with almost identical village communities and flora as in neighboring Liberia, funding was included in the Third Project (FY85) to study the possibility of low cost construction for primary schools. There is an abundance of experience with various approaches to low cost construction in many countries (including several funded by Bank-assisted projects, especially in Eastern Africa) which has not been synthesized. The vast experience of UNESCO in this area is not being systematically tapped by the Bank. In Bangladesh IV, UNESCO was called in at a late stage to advise the Public Works Department on economical designs.

the primary level, which is the lot of the majority. In some form or another, these changes have been made since the inception of mass education in the 19th century. They have persisted because they contain some hard truth. Education is not simply a stabilizer of societies. It fosters mobility and drives on the part of individuals which effect powerful social ferment and changes.

2.16 Primary education is expected to inculcate certain values which vary among and within societies in regard to mores, values and culture generally. It is also expected, regardless of which society it serves, to develop in each pupil a certain degree of literacy, numeracy, and capacity to understand and deal rationally with the environment. Such intellectual and moral cultivation enhances the self-confidence, self-esteem, initiative, mobility and marketability of the graduate and responsiveness to his/her environment. Primary education would, therefore, have the effect of encouraging persons to reject feudalism, to aspire to a better life and seek the best rewards for their labor. Its contribution to economic development includes risks of challenge to and interference with the socio-economic status quo, especially in societies where illiteracy is rampant. However, it would be pointless to assign to primary education, per se, responsibility for market forces governing the rewards to unskilled labor and for migration to towns, or to consider whether changes in the type of primary education would by themselves significantly alter results and public attitudes. Some of the appraisal reports implied rather extravagant goals, although only in Tunisia III was the objective explicitly to "endeavor to eradicate long-standing unfavorable attitudes towards manual work." The Bank needs to determine what constitutes a reasonable expectation of primary education and what social impact of primary education it is prepared to support.

2.17 In some thirteen of the 19 countries covered by the sample of 25 projects, the projects referred to increasing the agricultural or practical subjects in the curriculum with a view to improving relevance to the environment.<sup>9/</sup> The projects included either physical facilities (such as workshops and equipment), to help teachers to teach the new 'rural' curricula efficiently, or support to develop new syllabi. Several appraisal reports implicitly equated "ruralization" with external efficiency. The goal of rendering curricula more closely related to the environment of the child is an excellent one. This would apply to all subjects in the curriculum and would enhance the learning process as well as the child's more positive interaction with his/her environment. Furthermore, some exposure to practical subjects, including gardening,

---

<sup>9/</sup> The six exceptions were Malaysia where a Curriculum Development Center was being established under the second project; Lebanon, which included practical subjects but not specifically identifying agriculture; Mauritania, where the objectives were limited; Madagascar, where the project nevertheless was designed to assist in producing books of environmental relevance; Chad, where the curriculum was under reform but not discussed; and Bangladesh, where the appropriateness of the curriculum was not an issue. See Annex 6 for a brief statement of the reforming efforts contained in each project.

could be extremely valuable in reinforcing and demonstrating the lessons to be communicated (a benefit which appears to have been overlooked in many of these projects). In any event, with the exception of a few metropolitan centers, most LDCs are predominantly rural in character and a "rural" curriculum would be valid in most schools. To this extent, ruralization can be conducive to better learning and higher internal efficiency. Reform at the primary level, however, should not mean the over-burdening of curricula with unrealistic goals and subjects; often, it should mean simplification and concentration upon essentials. When the reform effort becomes heavily directed toward vocational or pre-vocational aims, several problems arise, including (a) the neglect of those basic subjects with which primary education should be principally concerned (b) the high recurrent cost of efficient instruction in the practical subjects (c) the appropriateness of such aims to the age group, especially with a weak educational base and (d) the scarcity of good teachers of practical subjects. A good balance was maintained in many of the projects; in some, however, there were problems.

2.18 The emphasis upon practical subjects went well beyond the normal bounds of the purposes of primary education at the project design stage in two projects. Tunisia III supported exposure of Grades 5-6 pupils to a program of initiation into manual work, whether in agricultural or in industrial oriented curricula. In the industrial-oriented curricula, in addition to metalwork/woodwork, the 5th grade pupils were expected to do masonry and the 6th grade would do "basic construction" and "simple electrical repairs". In Morocco III, the 4th and 5th grades were to have two hours per week of "basic nonfarm and farm skills" in a program of "prevocational preparation", in addition to a stronger emphasis upon science and mathematics.

2.19 The second issue concerns the length of the primary cycle. The Bank construction of the term "primary education" is extremely elastic. In this sample of 25 projects, the primary cycle ranged from five to eight years.<sup>10/</sup> Revision in the length of the cycle was involved in three of these projects--whether to reduce it (from six to five years in Madagascar or from seven to six in Burundi) or to extend it (from five to six years in Lebanon). Given a normal entry age which was between five and seven years, the typical primary school graduate (without grade repetition) could therefore have ranged in age from 11 (Barbados, Lebanon, Bangladesh) to 14 (Malawi) or 15 (Brazil).<sup>11/</sup> With fairly late entry of pupils into the schools and, in many cases, grade repetition, the actual age in the upper grades would presumably be markedly higher. In several cases, pre-school grades existed in the public school system; what impact this sub-system has on the movement of younger pupils through the system is not clear, but it may tend to reduce the age at which children reach the top grades. In Liberia IV, it was noted that these pre-school grades would be phased out.

---

<sup>10/</sup> See Annex 7. In ten of the 19 countries, it was six years; in two cases it was seven (Lesotho, Mauritania) and in two it was eight (Brazil, Malawi). In five countries, it was five years.

<sup>11/</sup> In Barbados, the primary schools accommodated post-primary classes and the project was aimed at removing these "post-primary students from the primary schools. In some cases of nine year year basic schools the upper three grades may be seen as lower secondary (Brazil).

The Bank needs to clarify for itself what the primary cycle is; it has tended to support short cycles for poor countries and long cycles for more wealthy ones. This does not resolve the question as to what is professionally desirable at particular grade levels. The Bank should also determine whether it is prepared to support pre-school education in circumstances where full enrollment of school age children has not as yet been achieved. For this purpose a seminar of Bank educators may be the most appropriate vehicle.

2.20 A third issue in primary education reform relates to the use of the mother tongue. The Bank has generally been slow to become involved in this delicate area. Nevertheless, there has been considerable effort by borrowers to replace "metropolitan" languages as the language of instruction at primary level and some of the projects provided support for these efforts. Textbooks were scheduled to be developed or produced in Kinyarwanda (Rwanda I), Kirundi (Burundi I), Malagasy (Madagascar II), Chichewa (Malawi III), Sesotho (Lesotho III), and in five local languages in Ethiopia (Fifth Project). The Bolivia project was intended to introduce Aymara in the first three grades along with Spanish. It is well recognized that, before the mother tongue can be used for primary education, extensive language development work may be needed in a language academy or institute. An important question is whether the Bank has been sufficiently concerned with the inefficiency of primary schooling outside one's mother tongue and with support for national language institutes or academies. Evidence from this sample suggests that this has not been an item of priority.

2.21 (3) Teaching Support. Two of the principal forms of supplementary assistance to the teacher in these projects were (i) textbooks and teaching materials and (ii) educational broadcasting. In 19 of the 25 projects there was some provision which could be identified within either category. (Of the other six projects, four - Brazil II, Chad III, Malawi II, and Lebanon I - had their focus clearly on expanding the number of school places available).

2.22 Seven of the sample projects were approved in FY72-75; of these, two supported radio, two television and two textbook production. Of the four FY77 projects, three included provision to develop and produce textbooks. Thereafter, only textbook purchases (not production) were financed and no new broadcasting activities were financed.<sup>12/</sup> Building up a local textbook production capability is especially important where, if only for reasons of language, cost and flexibility, it would be virtually

---

<sup>12/</sup> These comments relate only to the 25 projects in the sample. Some projects after FY77 - in Colombia (FY83), Philippines (FY81), Malawi (FY79) and Bangladesh (FY80) - supported the procurement of books by various means, including those produced through the existing indigenous and functioning textbook production machinery. In one case (El Salvador FY79), an increase in capacity was envisaged under the project. On the other hand, Liberia IV (FY83) represented some retreat from the capacity-building objectives of Liberia II (FY77) in textbook production. In Lesotho III (FY81), it was recognized that the country needed to build up its capacity to produce its own textbooks but, in addition to funding the importation of textbooks, the project provided no assistance toward building up that capacity.

impossible to depend upon an external source for textbooks.<sup>13/</sup> Much more attention needs to be devoted to strengthening local capacity to produce books inexpensively on any scale. Support for libraries as an integral part of the learning system was generally absent, unlike at secondary and tertiary levels where libraries play a large role in the projects. Support for educational broadcasting was absent in the more recent projects. This apparent retreat by the Bank from financing educational broadcasting is difficult to understand. No studies or evaluation of textbook production or educational broadcasting in Bank-financed projects have been conducted by disinterested parties which might justify such a retreat<sup>14/</sup>. It is clear that the potential of educational broadcasting in developing countries has not been fully explored. It would be useful for the Bank to evaluate not only its own experience but the experience of various countries as well which have had sustained and large scale involvement in educational broadcasting (such as Ethiopia, Kenya, Korea, Malaysia, Pakistan and Venezuela) and textbooks and determine the achievements and problems, with a view to devising an informed Bank policy in crucially important areas.

---

<sup>13/</sup> Deciding to establish or strengthen a local textbook production capacity is not simply a matter of comparing the cost of local production of a particular book with that of imported books. For an education system, that local capacity is of strategic importance because, apart from benefits of import substitution and promoting the acquisition of technology, it offers the following advantages: (i) the production of not simply textbooks but also a wide range of educational materials, including charts, cards, supplementary readers, educational research papers, etc. in quantities which would ordinarily be too small to attract outside printing services at a reasonable price (ii) experimentation with formats (iii) building up a pool of knowledge and expertise on the basis of which to make more informed choices as to the need for outside printing services and as to procuring such services (iv) an alternative to outside printing services on those occasions when reasonable bids are not received or when time is too short for the normal outside procurement processes.

<sup>14/</sup> In television, the Ivory Coast I experience was unfortunate and OED attempted an evaluation of this component. The conclusion was not that ETV was unwise in itself but that the conception in this case was ill-advised-- use of expensive storage batteries, insufficient program production capacity and so on. The large Indonesia III textbook project was not evaluated by OED although it was the first such large-scale Bank investment and doubtless had many lessons to offer.

2.23 The policy regarding textbook supply varied from project to project (Annex 8). In some projects, the aim was to supply every student with books (Rwanda I, Burundi I, Malawi III, El Salvador IV in rural areas); in others, the target was one book for more than one student (El Salvador IV in urban areas, Bangladesh IV, Liberia IV, Colombia IV, and Philippines VII). In most cases, the Government was expected to provide the books at the schools free of charge to the pupils. In Malawi III, where books had traditionally been financed through a school fee collected by the local community, and the central government was beginning to assume the full financial burden. There were some exceptions. In Lesotho III, a "book usage" fee, graduated according to the level of the class (grade), was to be charged which would produce a self-sustaining fund out of which future book purchases would be financed. Provisions for exempting the very poor from payment were envisaged. In Liberia II, for the proposed government-produced books, a replenishment fund was intended to finance production, principally on the basis of book purchase by the pupils who could afford it and government-supplied books for those who could not. In Liberia IV, the Government was expected to purchase books in lots and sell to the students through commercial outlets, thus producing a self-generating fund.

2.24 In some cases it was not clear whether the government-supplied books would be used only at schools, lent to the students for the year, or given to the students. It was clear in Burundi I and Lesotho III that the books would be used in and stay at the school. In El Salvador IV, they were to be lent to the students for use outside school hours as well. There is a principle regarding access to information which the Bank should uphold. Student access to books should not be restricted. Consequently, in cases where the government is purchasing the books (whether for free distribution, loan or resale) or is in any way controlling the supply, students (and parents) should be free at all times to purchase their own books from commercial suppliers or from the government, leaving the government at the very least only the responsibility of supplying the needy, whether through gift or loan of the books. Bank support should always be based on agreement that the pupils/parents will have the right to purchase the books. It is extremely important to get the books into the home, and not just the school, and such purchase would be an important cost recovery device.

2.25 (4) Teacher Supply. Extensive consideration was given to teacher training needs within the context of the expansion and improvement supported by the projects (Annex 9). The teacher training approaches varied widely. In some, the aim was simple expansion (with strengthening) of the regular teacher training system (Liberia II, Bangladesh IV, Malawi II and III, Barbados I, and Malaysia III for example); in others, the in-service teacher training capacity was to be increased in four recent projects. In Liberia II, an extension program of training was envisaged; in Liberia IV, it was proposed to institutionalize a system of in-service teacher training. In-service training, specifically for the use of textbooks, was intended in four projects. A broader purpose of familiarizing teachers with the reform was included in the comprehensive refresher programs of Bolivia I, Brazil II, and El Salvador IV (and to some extent Lebanon I). Special programs to train the much needed practical subject teachers were included in Barbados I, Burundi I, and

Tunisia III; in Rwanda I, bilateral sources were expected to assist in this. District agencies were to be established or strengthened to help with in-service training in Ethiopia V, Malaysia IV, and Madagascar II, or to reach serving teachers in El Salvador IV and Mauritania I. The efforts in Liberia II and Bangladesh IV to assure a better supply of female teachers were intended to encourage the attendance and education of girls. In Liberia, it was sought through increased accommodation for women at the teacher training institute and, in Bangladesh, through a new policy of employing female teachers at a lower level of qualification than the fully trained teacher.

2.26 The attention to expanding and improving the existing regular teacher training system, including district centers, to cope better with preservice and in-service needs, represents one of the best aspects of these projects. Such ad hoc needs suggest that a much larger problem exists in the training system as a whole, since normally, with a little guidance from supervisory staff and guides prepared for the use of the textbooks, a properly trained teacher should be able to cope with new textbooks, which should be covering parts of a curriculum in which the teacher should be well versed. Another often mentioned ad hoc training need is multi-grade teaching, which should be included in all regular teacher training programs and has for decades been a part of teacher training and teaching practice in some developing countries. The Bank review of regular teacher training programs and the project items concerning primary teacher training systems should therefore include attention to these points, so that over a period of years the need for these ad hoc programs will diminish.

2.27 Housing for staff (teachers) was included in only four of the 25 projects for primary school teachers--Burundi I, 200 units; Malawi III, 500 units; Morocco III, 272 units; and Bolivia I, 287 units. Given that these 25 projects concerned mainly expansion into remoter rural areas, this represents quite a small proportion of projects with staff housing. This ratio of 16% is slightly below the average of 25% in the universe of 68 projects (Annex 10). In Burundi, two houses were included for each multi-purpose learning center as a means of both attracting staff and ensuring some continuous oversight of school gardens; the modest house for the principal was 54 m<sup>2</sup> at an average estimated base cost of US\$2,850 per house. (Compared to Sierra Leone III, where the rural teacher's house was planned to be approximately 90m<sup>2</sup> at a base cost of approximately US\$7,400). In Malawi, one staff house was provided for every two teachers. In Morocco, the six teachers of each of the 47 remote schools were to be provided with housing. The Bolivia project provided for about 25% of the teachers in rural areas where alternative housing was not available. On the other hand, by the time of processing El Salvador IV, the government had already experimented with staff housing as an inducement for rural service in El Salvador II; and elected instead to help teachers through housing loans, and to pay teachers compensation for teaching a second shift in the rural areas. The Bank lacks a definite policy as to cost recovery, standard of housing and rate at which housing should be supplied (whether for all or only a portion of the staff) in primary education. Yet, for primary education in rural areas, some guidelines are urgently needed.

2.28 (5) Institutional Development.<sup>\*</sup> Certain currents of institution building were evident in these 25 projects without, however, any pattern emerging. General training of educational and school administrators and/or planners was included in Liberia II and IV, Brazil II, Colombia IV. The fact that many of the earlier projects (FY73-76) in the sample<sup>15/</sup> did not include institution building components probably reflects both the early Bank inertia on software and institution building and unawareness that some aspects of primary education development required strong institution building support. Some of the projects provided in a major way for building up central and district offices for better administrative or professional leadership of the primary education system. The strongest efforts were in Malaysia where a large Curriculum Development Center was financed under the Second Project (FY72), followed by 13 Education Media Service Centers under the Third (FY74) and four Regional Education Resource Centers (for regular inservice teacher training and general support of the role of the Curriculum Development Center) under the Fourth Project (FY77). Other major efforts were in Madagascar II (FY77), which included five Regional Education Centers and a National Teaching Materials Production Center, Ethiopia V (FY81) which included 40 Awraja Pedagogical Centers, and expansion of the National Curriculum Development Center, and Malawi III (FY79) which helped to establish the Institute of Education. Efforts to strengthen school supervision were included mainly in the more recent projects-- Liberia IV (FY83), El Salvador IV (FY79), Colombia IV (FY83), Bolivia I (FY77), Bangladesh IV (FY80) and Malawi III (FY79). Institution building in regard to primary school construction was included in Liberia II, Rwanda I, and Chad III.

2.29 Technical assistance experts for primary education did not appear in this sample early; Rwanda I (FY75) had included expertise for evaluating selection procedures for secondary education and Brazil II (FY75) included a specialist for rural education, but neither was specifically for primary education. Morocco III (FY76) included provision for an expert in prevocational training. Thus of the first 12 projects (all approved FY72-77), only Mauritania I (FY74), Liberia II (FY76) and Burundi I (FY77) included provision for technical assistance experts for primary education. Thereafter all of the 13 projects included expertise for primary education in such fields as evaluation, textbooks, curriculum development, teacher

---

\*Note: For the purposes of this paper, institutional development refers to establishing strengthening or enhancing the capacity of units agencies or institutions concerned with primary education to perform their roles efficiently. This includes units concerned with managing, planning, researching and supervising primary education and schools and includes such leadership services as curriculum development, examinations, publications and broadcasting which serve primary schools.

---

<sup>15/</sup> Lebanon I (FY73), Mauritania I (FY74), Ethiopia IV (FY75), Malawi II (FY76), Tunisia III (FY76), Morocco III (FY76).

training, administration and school supervision and testing, including large numbers of local experts for Bangladesh IV and Philippines VII. An even sharper division over time occurred with fellowships. Fellowships for primary education were not included in the 11 projects approved FY72-76. Thereafter they were provided in nine of the 14 projects FY77-83, generally in the same fields for which experts were provided. This suggested a broadening concept of technical assistance and a more aggressive approach to the transfer of expertise.

2.30 With reference to the use of universities as a resource for research, studies and technical assistance in primary education, the picture presented by these 25 projects is uneven. In all countries, local higher education institutions existed whose area of operations included primary education. It was expected that some of the local experts in Bangladesh IV (FY80) and Philippines VII (FY81) would be drawn from local universities and the provision of fellowships for study locally in Philippines VII indicates recognition of local institutions with expertise. However, only Liberia II (FY76) and IV (FY83), Barbados I (FY79) and Malawi III (FY79) were designed to draw upon a local university as a source of expert assistance in primary education. In Liberia II, the University of Liberia was intended to assist in evaluation. In Liberia IV, Cuttington College and the University of Liberia were to conduct in-service teacher training and provision was made to strengthen them. In Barbados, the Institute of Education of the University of the West Indies was used. A similar institute was established under Malawi III and the university was also involved in that project. On the whole, therefore, the local universities remain a neglected and by-passed resource for a subsector which has extensive cultural obligations and therefore should be minimally dependent upon external expertise. Participation by these institutions in national education would be one important way of keeping them relevant to national problems and improving them generally, apart from the direct benefits to primary education arising from such participation.<sup>16/</sup>

2.31 Evaluation of primary education components was not built into the projects approved in the earlier years except for an experimental item--the

16/ The East Asia and Pacific Projects Division has indicated that in Malaysia, the University of Malaya Faculty of Education has been involved in useful studies on primary education including (a) research on student achievement and examinations with regard to educational inputs, (b) evaluation of the new curriculum prior to its general application and (c) project completion reporting, which was of value in improving the design of new projects.

Koranic school study in Mauritania I (FY74). The Rwanda I (FY 75) project required an evaluation of the secondary school entrance system, which was not a project item. On the other hand, of the 18 projects approved after FY75, only a few--Malawi II (FY76), Malaysia IV (FY77), Barbados I (FY79) - did not include specific arrangements for evaluation.<sup>17/</sup> In one case evaluation covered one exceptionally minor item--the school meals program (Morocco III). In others, it addressed project schools--the ITM<sup>18/</sup>program (Tunisia III), the community schools program (Liberia II), the project schools (Bolivia I), the IMPACT experiment<sup>19/</sup> (Bangladesh IV). A broader evaluation of the project as a whole was envisaged in Madagascar II,<sup>20/</sup> Chad III, Malawi III (which also included evaluation of Malawi II), and El Salvador IV and of the subsector program as a whole in Colombia IV, at a cost of US\$0.25 m., and Philippines VII. Evaluation of the reform supported under the project was included in Ethiopia V, and evaluation of determinants of participation in and performance at school was provided for in Bangladesh IV and Philippines VII. Support for building up permanent evaluation capabilities was relatively rare - Bangladesh IV (where a project evaluation unit was to be established in the Project Implementation Unit), Lesotho III (which included a US\$175,000 program for evaluation as well as evaluation capacity building) and Liberia IV.

2.32 In some cases the evaluation net is clearly being spread too wide; in others the topic selected for the evaluation focus is of little importance. There is insufficient concern for building up regular evaluation capacity as an integral part of the management and planning process in the countries.

2.33 The Bank should continue to intensify its institution building efforts in primary education in professional development, research capacity, management, planning and provision of primary school buildings and increase the emphasis on fellowships as a means of transferring expertise. A strategy for achieving these essentially long term institutional development goals needs to be devised.

2.34 (6) Mobilizing Community Support. One distinctive feature in East Africa is the strength of the local community involvement in primary education. In LAC, Emena and East Asia and the Pacific, the identity and role of the community in the program and functioning of the school do not

---

<sup>17/</sup> In Barbados, the Government was expected to prepare a completion report which represents some evaluation. This, however, is not regarded as built-in evaluation. In Burundi, the concern was similar--evaluating project implementation.

<sup>18/</sup> Initiation aux travaux manuels (initiation into manual work).

<sup>19/</sup> IMPACT = Instructional Management by Parents, Community and Teachers (see para. 3.14 below).

<sup>20/</sup> For example, the new curriculum, the teacher training program for National Servicemen, the selection examination for secondary school entry and educational administration at the provincial level were all to be evaluated.

emerge strongly from appraisal reports. It is evident in Western Africa but not as institutionalized as in Eastern Africa.<sup>21/</sup> In Madagascar II, the Fokonolona (village associations) were very strong and one of the eventual aims was to have them responsible for paying the teachers. The parents in Burundi were expected to help with maintaining school buildings and gardens. The ongoing self help program for constructing primary schools in Malawi III was to be utilized under the project involving the supply of both some materials and labor by the communities. A similar sort of self help program for construction in Ethiopia was expected to be developed and maintenance was stated to be a local community responsibility. In part, the Eastern Africa situation represents the strong survival of the traditional dependence of the primary school upon the local community which in many other places has been replaced by dependence upon the central government. Greater efforts by the Bank are needed to encourage local community participation in providing and maintaining schools and primary education.

#### D. Design of Implementation Arrangements

2.35 Project Management. The characteristics of primary education components include:

- (a) innovativeness - whether it is a multipurpose learning center, or educational television, radio, new kind of workshop, a self-help construction effort or a reform of the curriculum, the extent of involvement of these projects in introducing changes and new ways of behaving was considerable;
- (b) the attention to remote areas which had been neglected in the part in large measure because they were difficult to reach; and
- (c) the novel scale of the components in terms of numbers of sites to be covered.

These characteristics suggest the need for project management arrangements which can cope with formidable logistical problems, utilize village resources and take advantage of any expertise of existing agencies which already service remote rural areas and understand the environment. Twenty-one of the 25 projects were scheduled to be implemented through Project Implementation Units (PIU), usually under Ministries of Education, but occasionally under a Ministry of Works (Madagascar II) or Planning (Mauritania I), or an Executive Council (Lebanon I). In some cases (Malaysia, Liberia, for instance) the PIUs became reasonably well integrated into the Ministries. The four which did not have PIUs had more institutionalized arrangements - Rwanda I (FY75), the School Financing and Construction Unit; Brazil II (FY75), a special agency responsible for this and other development projects; and Philippines VII and Colombia IV where, because these were broad subsector programs, much more complex arrangements were designed to bring together all relevant sections of the Ministries.

---

<sup>21/</sup> The village communities in Liberia were supposed to provide the land and clear the site for the primary school and if possible to provide some free labor toward construction. They generally did the former but not the latter.

Thus the traditional Bank style of project implementation arrangements persisted without a perceived need to change simply because of the special nature of primary education development.

2.36 State of Preparation. A distinguishing feature of primary education is the large quantities involved. In the case of the subsector loans, the numbers reached about 11,000 schools per year in Philippines VII and 1,650 schools in Colombia IV. The number of sites entailed in the regular projects had an upper level of 850 (Malaysia IV) and 550 (Ethiopia IV). On the lower extreme, there were 10 schools in Barbados I and 10 (and later 15) institutions in Brazil II. Site selection (and acquisition) for primary school development is therefore on a scale which is encountered in no other subsector. Most of the projects at the appraisal stage did not have all sites selected.<sup>22/</sup> The criteria for site selection had generally been agreed between Bank and the Government; and in some cases some locations had been identified. In this respect, no greater state of preparedness was observed in the more recent projects than in the older ones. Thus what we have is more of a program than a project approach on primary schools--proceeding with implementation on the basis of agreed criteria, but with large aspects of the projects not fully prepared. Contrary to the Bank's stated policy of lending later in the project cycle in education, it is lending relatively early in the cycle in the primary subsector. This has the high risk of (a) implementation delays attributable to lack of sites, and (b) unforeseen costs. The remedy would appear to lie in much more advanced preparation and therefore a longer lead time for planning and preparation. It is unrealistic to expect that dozens or hundreds of sites which cannot be identified by appraisal, will be punctually identified according to a normal implementation schedule during project implementation.

#### E. Regional Characteristics in Project Provision

2.37 Annex 10 presents the regional distribution of the provision made in the 68 projects (FY63-83) for physical plant, materials and supplies and technical assistance for primary education and the purposes for which this provision was made. School buildings, furniture, equipment and supplies were included in over 90% of the projects. Technical assistance was less frequent - experts in 46% and fellowships in 41% of the cases. Experts were heavily used in Eastern Africa and fellowships in the Asia Regions and Western Africa. Fellowships were least used in EMENA and Eastern Africa.

2.38 The incidence of activities or purposes for which this hardware training and personnel were provided was as follows:

- (i) new educational materials and textbooks (49 projects)
- (ii) introducing new teaching techniques (47)
- (iii) reorienting or otherwise producing suitable teachers (44)
- (iv) new curricula (38)
- (v) research and studies (26)
- (vi) improving school management (26)
- (vii) strengthening central or district management (23)

---

<sup>22/</sup> A few did not need new sites because they concerned existing schools.

On a lesser scale were radio (8), television (6), examination reform (4) and school welfare support (such as boarding, uniforms, meals) in eight projects. School housing was included in 17 cases.

2.39 The concern with educational materials and textbooks, teaching techniques and teacher supply was fairly well distributed over the six Regions. Beyond that, the comparison shows relatively strong emphasis on (a) school and central/district administration, curriculum reform, research/studies, and use of broadcasting in LAC; (b) curriculum reform, school management and school welfare support in South Asia; (c) broadcasting and central/district administration in East Asia; (d) broadcasting and research/studies in Western Africa; and (e) central/district administration and staff housing in Eastern Africa.

2.40 While it is impossible in a limited survey such as this to make firm judgments on the wisdom of project provision in each case, a few general observations appear to be warranted:

- (a) the emphasis, especially in more recent projects, upon educational materials and textbooks is sound; however stronger efforts are needed, especially in Western Africa, on building local manufacturing capacity;
- (b) efforts regarding the use of the vernacular in primary education, will require, inter alia, stronger support for linguistic work and local publishing and information services;
- (c) educational broadcasting appears to have been insufficiently explored and utilized in this subsector.

2.41 From the narrower sample of 25 projects we can discern some similarity in a particular Regional Office in the response to the challenges of primary education development. To some extent this similarity perhaps reflects the community of ideas, traditions, culture, and educational problems among borrowers in a given Region; but it may also owe much more to the influence of Unesco and Bank staff. Many of the curriculum reforms in Africa and the EMENA countries were Unesco-assisted. There is a strong similarity between Morocco III and Tunisia III in regard to manual work in the primary schools. Patterns appeared in seven Eastern Africa projects - change to the mother tongue, strong community involvement, use of primary schools for adult education, a search for cost effective approaches to providing buildings, and production of textbooks (as distinct from simple purchase). Definite patterns also appeared in Latin America where the approach was more integral, centering around nuclearization, including strong attention to supervision and administration, and an integrated approach to teacher training, textbooks, research, and evaluation and developing models for replication.

2.42 This cursory review suggests, however, that there is little transfer of techniques, ideas and responses to the various challenges

across regions; each region is developing its approaches almost in isolation.<sup>23/</sup> More exchange of experiences appears to be needed among the Regions.

---

<sup>23/</sup> Some limits on the transferability of ideas should be recognized. For example, Bank/Unesco/Unicef staff familiar with nuclearization in Latin American countries worked on the Burundi reform and concluded that, despite a tradition in Burundi of central and branch schools, it was not feasible for various reasons to introduce the nuclearization system in Burundi.

### III. IMPLEMENTATION OF PRIMARY EDUCATION COMPONENTS

3.01 While the sample contains a higher proportion of the older projects (42% of the sample having been approved before FY76 by comparison with 38% in the universe of projects with primary education), the implementation experience of primary education components in the 25 selected projects is understandably quite limited. Only 16 of these projects can provide useful information on implementation. Three--Lebanon I, El Salvador IV and Chad III--have had such unsettled country conditions for so long that too little is known about performance and six others were too recently approved (FY80-83)<sup>24/</sup>, Tunisia III was changed drastically during implementation that it provides only marginal data; nevertheless it is included. Some of these 16 projects with useful implementation experiences have been the subject of completion reports and project performance audit reports. None has yet been the subject of impact evaluation and so the educational and other outcomes or results are generally not known. The important issues of wide applicability to these projects are those of (a) implementation time performance, (b) changes in scope and (c) the implementation of the education programs.

#### A. Implementation Time

3.02 Annex 11 presents the time performance in 15 projects.<sup>25/</sup> The average time allowed for completion of primary education components was 4.12 years; the average time taken was 6.83 years. Thus on average, there was a 66% time overrun. The shorter times allowed--Malawi II, Malaysia II and III (2.5 years each) and Mauritania I and Liberia II (3.0 years)--were manifestly unrealistic. Even though all these projects were completed in below average time, they all had very high time overruns. Only one project (Ethiopia IV with 6.3 years) stayed within the allotted time.

3.03 There was little difference whether the project involved school buildings, large numbers of schools or several components other than primary education; it suffered a time overrun in regard to its primary education component. On the whole, this performance is about the same as the averages which we have seen in other studies of education projects as a whole. Thus it is reasonable to question the realism of implementation scheduling for primary education components, given the state of project preparation at the loan approval stage.

3.04 The special characteristics of primary education components noted in para. 2.35 present implementation problems which suggest that an allowance for unforeseen difficulties should be made in the scheduling of

---

<sup>24/</sup> Bangladesh IV, Lesotho II, Ethiopia V, Philippines VII, Liberia IV and Colombia IV.

<sup>25/</sup> The estimates of completion dates used for the on-going projects have been taken from supervision reports and experience shows that they are often too optimistic; hence the actual completion would generally, be a bit later than shown in this table.

implementation, perhaps of the order of 40% above the best estimate which is based upon foreseen problems, assuming that preparation is better advanced at the start of implementation than was the case with this sample of projects.

3.05 Annex 12 lists the reasons given in Supervision Reports for the delays experienced. The list of sources of delay is not complete; obviously there are many other reasons (not necessarily mentioned in Supervision Reports) and many are interrelated. The most frequently cited was project management weaknesses and it is a crucial matter. Managerial capabilities in project execution would clearly go a long way toward obviating many of the other listed causes of delay. A good example is Ethiopia IV where, despite various country problems and beginning with a realistic implementation schedule, the project, even with some increase in scope, was implemented in time.<sup>26/</sup> It was clearly necessary to have paid closer attention to project management arrangements in Malawi III, where the project was large and widespread, and in Philippines VII where the complexity of the sub sector program and the uncertain future of the former ad hoc project unit were known. One of the more pervasive problems appears to be site selection and acquisition which has surfaced in a project with a relatively small number of sites (Brazil II) as well as in one with hundreds of sites (Malaysia IV). This suggests that more advanced preparation in this respect would be useful. Adequate physical planning for the school system should include site identification for the development program several years into the future, in order to allow time for soil tests and acquisition. The third most frequently mentioned problem was financial constraints.<sup>27/</sup> Other problems did not appear to occur with any pattern over country or time but, nonetheless, reflected insufficiently advanced preparation (delays in recruiting architects and in preparing building designs and tender documents). In the case of Tunisia III, 20 months after loan approval, the Government informed the Bank of its objections to the project as designed and its determination not to implement it in that form. On the other hand, Bolivia I experienced changes of government, and consequently policy, for which the project design can hardly be blamed.

#### B. Changes in Scope

3.06 The problems and successes of implementation resulted in some significant adjustments to project content. It is difficult to tell

---

<sup>26/</sup> These comments on Ethiopia IV refer to the primary education component only; some other components were deleted because of slow progress.

<sup>27/</sup> Because of the paucity of data, it is difficult to assess the significance of this. In Burundi, public education expenditure as a proportion of total public expenditure declined from 21% in 1974 to 15% in 1981 (Unesco); in Brazil it declined from 12% in 1974 to 6% in 1982. Data for Madagascar, Bolivia, Barbados and Morocco are not available. To what extent the financial constraints grew out of the unforeseen oil crisis of the mid 1970s exacerbated by the worldwide recession of the late 1970s and early 1980s is also difficult to determine.

without elaborate enquiry whether this represented an extraordinary amount of change in the context of the experience of the sector as a whole. Because of delays in initiating construction of the educational television studio in Malaysia II some five years into implementation, this studio was transferred to be provided under Malaysia V. Upon amendment of Mauritania I (FY74) in 1978 (following reappraisal in 1976), the educational radio item was deleted and this may have affected the outcome of the Koranic school experiment. Recognition of the difficulty of carrying out the entire projects as designed, whether because of financial or logistical constraints, resulted in scaling down from 100 to 47 multipurpose learning centers in Burundi I and from 955 to 580 classrooms in Bolivia I. Upon redesign of Tunisia III, to accord with country wishes, the Government decided to finance all primary school construction without reimbursement from loan proceeds. In Malawi II, most of the technical assistance was supplied by bi-lateral sources and there was a small reduction in the number of classrooms retained in the project. A few schools and the equipment to strengthen the print shop were deleted from Liberia II. These reductions generally resulted in lower than expected overall project cost.

3.07 Some projects experienced expansion of the primary education components. Brazil II eventually included not 10 but 15 Basic Schools; Rwanda I increased from 150 to 250 workshops, having had funds made available by deletion of some items and an unusually good response from villagers assisting in the construction program. The number of schools was increased from 550 to 750 in Ethiopia IV, following an unexpectedly good construction performance and deletion of sizeable non-primary education components. These expansions represent a departure from the norm in education projects which generally have reductions in scope during implementation. What appears to distinguish the primary subsector components is that the needs are so vast that the earliest opportunity is seized to utilize "savings" for expansion. This suggests that primary school construction programs included in projects should be within a certain range so as to allow adjustments in achievement without the unpreparedness which might characterize added-on elements.

### C. Implementing Education Programs

3.08 The software aspects of project implementation have not received extensive treatment in operational reviews or project evaluation, partly because valid judgments about success or failure are available only in the long run. The aspects selected for treatment in this review are educational change and reform and the provision of textbooks. A summary of implementation experience with selected education programs is presented in the Annex 13.

3.09 Reform - To the extent that is possible, reports indicate that the ruralizing of curricula has been widely carried out. Given the fact that it is professionally sound and desirable to have maximum possible curricular relevance to the environment and that carefully selected practical activities enhance the learning process, such a goal should normally present no difficulty. To what extent the new facilities and curricula are being applied is not well known. Whether there has been any effect upon the rural exodus or attitudes toward labor or agriculture

clearly cannot be answered now if at all. Problems have arisen where the reforms were too ambitious and the vocational or prevocational aims too dominant.

3.10 There were cases in which there was no major change in borrower education policy during implementation; these were Malaysia II, Ethiopia IV, Malawi II, Liberia II, Morocco III and Burundi I. With various relatively minor modifications, the intended educational improvements were introduced. There was considerable achievement in Malawi II and Ethiopia IV.

3.11 On the other hand, a few projects were adversely affected by borrower policy changes. In Brazil II, the basic schools originally accorded with the national reform in progress; however, during project implementation, the national debate on this reform resulted in a policy shift toward reduced emphasis upon vocational training and increased emphasis upon good general education in the basic cycle.<sup>28/</sup> Bolivia I encountered policy changes which were consequent upon changes in Government; the difficult points appeared to lie not in the realm of the "practical" program. In Tunisia III, a change occurred which could hardly be described as a Borrower policy change. The Bank had played an unusually large role in project generation; the project was not designed by the Borrower. After refusing to proceed with implementation of the project as designed, the Borrower eventually agreed to a modified version in which construction needs were reduced and a broader approach to the "practical" program was adopted, spreading it over not just grades 5 and 6 but over the two succeeding post primary grades as well.<sup>29/</sup> Brazil II, Tunisia III and Morocco III, as originally designed, had ventured into pre-vocational training to a degree which was inappropriate for primary education. In Morocco III, however, the Unesco expert in curriculum development modified and interpreted the objectives in a pedagogically sound manner, emphasizing the educational objectives (See para. viii of Appendix).

3.12 Professional reservations on the role of education are harbored by Borrower officials and these do not disappear upon signature of a loan agreement. Projects have a character of being hard and well defined;

---

<sup>28/</sup> This tendency, after intense national debate, for the pendulum to swing back in favor of leaving the basic schools to concentrate upon general education has been observed in other countries. In Spain I, which involved Basic Schools Grades 1-8 with a strong practical content, the Bank and Borrower eventually found themselves with irreconcilable differences when, among other things, the Borrower sought to reduce the emphasis upon practical work. The Loan was consequently cancelled for this and other reasons. In Peru I, a similar retreat occurred in regard to practical subjects in the basic cycle.

<sup>29/</sup> According to the Project Completion Report issued by the Regional Office, the program covers grades 5, 6, 7 and 8. The Regional Office in commenting on the draft of this Review draws a distinction between grades 7 and 8, which the Region considers to be exclusively in secondary schools, and post primary "years", which are not.

reforms are more flexible and constantly in evolution. Too early and large-scale project involvement in radical reforms tends to involve high risk; practical subjects are high on the list of risky aspects. The Bank, therefore, needs to be careful in this area, because, with the countries constantly in search of better links between schools (at all levels) and the employment world and with practical activities making good pedagogical sense, there will be regular confrontations with the idea. In Liberia II, the Bank correctly avoided supporting an ambitious practical work proposal for the rural primary schools and concentrated on the minimal basic requirements, but even this was not eventually implemented.

3.13 The cost of the reformed primary education is an issue. It requires that school supplies be provided on a more generous scale than previously, especially for practical subjects. Instead, the budget for supplies appears to diminish as a proportion of the total school budget in many countries, especially in Sub-Saharan Africa; indeed, overall school budgets may have declined considerably in real terms in many of these countries. In LAC countries, the several nuclearization initiatives have yielded positive results in the communities covered by the projects. However, the single most pressing barrier to generalizing this over the countries as a whole has been the high cost. The same question as to the financial feasibility of replication was posed in Morocco III, where the reform has been introduced in less than 50 schools which constitute under 2% of the schools in the country,<sup>30/</sup> and in Malawi II.

3.14 The Bank has devoted efforts to persuading borrowers to adopt cost recovery measures and to transfer resources from higher to primary education. However, the real challenge for primary education is to find ways of realizing economical and efficient schools which can be generalized over the country as a whole. Realistic assessment of the capacity of countries to bear the recurrent costs appears to be an area in which appraisal needs to be more rigorous. Project designs which do not pass the test of replicability on grounds of cost should not be supported by the Bank, since support would amount to endorsement of some permanent duality in the school system concerned.

3.15 The Bank has been associated extensively with innovation but not significantly with experiments. The Mauritania project included an experiment in the use of Koranic schools which showed that these schools can be used for teaching arithmetic. Perhaps no experiment was needed to establish this (especially at a cost of US\$0.6M). The search, however, was for alternatives to formal primary schooling, and as such was fundamentally ill-conceived. Borrower apathy about the experiment, however, renders the findings of little value. The Bank is also involved in the IMPACT experiment in Bangladesh IV (FY80), which is concerned with programmed learning, self-teaching and peer group instruction, and which seeks to utilize a smaller number of teachers and less qualified (hence cheaper) ones than are used in the regular schools. It is too early for results,

---

<sup>30/</sup> The Regional Office considers that the "importance of the program (in Morocco) is such that savings will be found elsewhere".

although the same experiment has been tried in the Philippines and elsewhere. The vast problems of quantity and quality in basic education especially in African countries and South Asia suggest the need for a vigorous program of pilot efforts using mass media, particularly radio and printed materials, as a supplement in a situation of shortage of well qualified teachers.

3.16 Textbooks - Of the earlier projects in this sample, only Rwanda I (FY75), Liberia II (FY76), Bolivia I and Burundi I (FY77) included textbooks. Malawi III and El Salvador IV (FY79) and subsequent projects are too recent for any important results.

3.17 For reasons which are not clear, in Liberia II where an existing textbook production unit (printing and publishing) was being strengthened to improve its output and the Government was expected to prepare a textbook production plan, very little was accomplished and no books were produced. In other projects performance was faced with only very minor problems. Because of management problems, there were delays in Burundi I. Instead of 680,000 books produced by December, 1982, only 370,000 were produced and only one half of these had been distributed. In Lesotho III, after the distribution of books in the pilot area, more children were attracted to attend school, perhaps because of the availability of books at a reduced fee. As a result, a greater number of books had to be purchased for national distribution. There were delays in completing the printshop, in Madagascar II but the materials were prepared and their production was expected to proceed. In Bolivia I, the materials were produced in Spanish and had to be redone in the bilingual format with the recent Government policy reversion to bilingualism. In Malawi III, Liberia IV, Bangladesh IV and Philippines VII, the printing and distribution of textbooks was considered in 1983 to be proceeding satisfactorily. No attempt is made here to assess the quality and use of the textbooks.

#### D. Conclusion

3.18 Despite their special characteristics which make them uniquely prone to implementation problems, primary education projects have not proven to be unusually difficult to implement. Indeed they constitute a relatively successful aspect of Bank operations. The various experiments with alternatives to formal primary education, have clearly demonstrated that, while non-formal education has its merits, there is no viable alternative to formal primary schools (see Annex 4) and the countries and the Bank have generally accepted this. Clearly there are no insuperable operational obstacles to expanded Bank activity in primary education, especially in those countries in which large numbers of children are still out of school. The Governments are anxious to expand and improve primary schools and to undertake bold experiments to effect qualitative improvement. Given the well known benefits of primary schooling, operational experience to date suggests that the Bank could and should do much more in primary education to identify itself prominently with the pursuit of universal primary enrollment.

**PROJECTS SELECTED FOR DESK REVIEW**  
 (Approximate Proportion of Project Cost Devoted to the Primary Component is Given in Parenthesis)

FY	Eastern Africa	Western Africa	East Asia	South Asia	EMENA	Latin America & Caribbean	Total Number Projects
72			Malaysia II (8%)				1
73					Lebanon I (60%)		1
74		Mauritania I (10%)	Malaysia III (8%)				2
75	Rwanda I (99%) Ethiopia IV (44%)					Brazil II (21%)	3
76	Malawi II (37%)	Liberia II (43%)			Morocco III (23%) Tunisia III (70%)		4
77	Madagascar II (100%) Burundi I (80%)		Malaysia IV (82%)			Bolivia I (92%)	4
78		Chad III (64%)					1
79	Malawi III (47%)					Barbados I (50%) El Salvador IV (84%)	3
80				Bangladesh IV (100%)			1
81	Lesotho III (48%) Ethiopia V (16%)		Philippines VII (99%)				3
82							0
83		Liberia IV (46%)				Colombia IV (100%)	2
<b>Total</b>							
No. of Projects Selected	8	4	4	1	3	5	25
<b>Total</b>							
No. of Projects in Bank Portfolio Involving Primary Education	17	14	11	2	6	18	68
<b>% Selected</b>	<b>47%</b>	<b>29%</b>	<b>36%</b>	<b>50%</b>	<b>50%</b>	<b>28%</b>	<b>37%</b>

PRIMARY EDUCATION AS A PROPORTION OF  
TOTAL EDUCATION INVESTMENT (BY FY)

FY	(a) No. of Educ. Projects	(b) No. Involving Primary Education	(c) (b) as % of (a)	(d) Total Costs of All Educ. Projects (US\$m)	(e) Costs of Projects Involving Primary Educ. (US\$m)	(f) Total Primary Costs (US\$m)	(g) (f) as % of (d)	(h) (f) as % of (e)
(64-68	22	0	-	268.90	-	-	-	- )
69	10	0	-	153.70	-	-	-	-
70	11	2	18.20	136.10	43.14	9.40	6.9	21.8
71	14	1	7.1	205.80	41.66	6.74	3.3	16.20
72	14	1	7.10	383.70	28.45	2.28	0.6	8.0
73	18	4	22.2	518.00	177.08	49.84	9.6	28.15
(69-73	67	8	11.94	139.30	290.33	68.26	4.9	23.51)
74	10	4	40.0	284.85	109.96	28.06	9.9	25.52
75	19	6	31.60	410.50	137.30	45.45	11.1	33.10
76	20	8	40.0	595.07	197.58	68.76	11.6	34.80
77	16	6	37.5	637.90	206.52	164.27	25.8	79.54
78	20	6	30.0	624.60	76.37	36.00	5.8	47.22
(74-78	85	30	35.29	2552.92	727.73	342.60	13.4	47.08)
79	18	6	33.33	960.05	243.74	126.13	13.1	51.75
80	13	3	23.10	1343.52	124.50	115.64	12.5	92.88
81	19	6	31.60	1537.95	634.43	519.34	33.8	81.86
82	19	6	31.60	1203.50	218.34	119.50	9.9	42.93
83	21	9	42.85	1020.20	227.76	152.02	14.9	66.75
(79-83	90	30	33.33	6065.22	1508.77	1032.63	17.0	68.44)
TOTAL	264	68	25.76	10284.34	2526.83	1443.49	14.0	57.13

Regional Distribution of Education Projects  
Containing Primary/Basic Education Components

FY	Eastern Africa	Western Africa	East Asia & Pacific	South Asia	Europe Middle East & North Africa	Latin America & Caribbean	Total No. of Projects
63-69							-
70-73	1	2	2		3	8	8
74		1	1			2	4
75	3	1	0			2	6
76	1	2	1		2	2	8
77	2	1	1			2	6
78	1	2	1			2	6
79	1		1	1		3	6
80	1	0	0	1		1	3
81	3	0	2			1	6
82	2	1	2		1	0	6
83	2	4				3	9
Total No. of Projects	17	14	11	2	6	18	68
(% (Dist.)	25.0	20.59	16.18	2.94	8.82	26.47	100%

REGIONAL DISTRIBUTION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL  
PLACES TO BE PROVIDED UNDER PROJECTS  
INVOLVING PRIMARY EDUCATION

ANNEX 3  
Page 1 of 3

Project	(FY)	Schools New/Rebuilt	Classrooms New/Rebuilt	Total Places to be Provided <sup>1/</sup>	(4)	(5)
					School Age Population "Not in School" At Project Appraisal <sup>2/</sup> (In millions) <sup>2/</sup>	(3) as percentage of (4)
<u>EASTERN AFRICA</u>						
1. Botswana III	(82)	-	500	20,000	0.01	-
2. Burundi I	(77)	100	-	27,000	0.49	5.5
3. Burundi III	(83)	24	-	5,760	0.44	1.3
4. Comoros I	(82)	-	-	600	-	-
5. Ethiopia IV	(75)	550	2,200	110,000	3.4	3.2
6. Ethiopia V	(81)	350	1,400	40,000	3.3	1.2
7. Kenya IV	(78)	13	-	4,550	-	-
8. Lesotho III	(81)	-	150	7,500	-	-
9. Madagascar II	(77)	-	-	-	-	-
10. Malawi II	(76)	22	176	9,200	0.48	1.9
11. Malawi III	(79)	-	1,000	50,000	0.53	9.4
12. Rwanda I	(75)	150 (w)	-	6,000	0.37	1.6
13. Sudan II	(75)	-	-	-	-	-
14. Swaziland III	(80)	-	-	-	-	-
15. Tanzania IV	(73)	-	-	-	-	-
16. Tanzania VII	(81)	-	360	21,000	0.14	14.6
17. Uganda III	(83)	(5,000) <sup>3/</sup>	-	-	-	-
Sub-Total				301,610		3.3 (Average)
<u>WESTERN AFRICA</u>						
1. Benin II	(82)	-	-	-	-	-
2. CAR II	(83)	120	300	25,000	0.14	18.1
3. Chad III	(78)	60	-	n.a.	-	-
4. Congo II	(77)	-	-	-	-	-
5. Gabon II	(75)	-	-	-	-	-
6. Guinea II	(83)	-	-	-	-	-
7. Ivory Coast I	(70)	-	-	-	-	-
8. Liberia II	(76)	50	-	12,000	0.09	13.7
9. Liberia IV	(83)	24	144	6,624	0.14	4.9
10. Mali II	(78)	-	-	-	-	-
11. Mauritania I	(74)	-	-	-	-	-
12. Nigeria III	(73)	-	66(work units)	-	-	-
13. Sierra Leone II	(76)	-	-	-	-	-
14. Sierra Leone III	(83)	17	500	22,500	0.39	5.8
Sub-Total				66,124		8.8 (Average)

- <sup>1/</sup> These are not net additional places; the figure includes replacement of existing places.
- <sup>2/</sup> This is only a notional figure, equivalent to the percentage not included in the enrollment ratio. Obviously some of these are in secondary school and some who are within the enrollment ratio are overaged.
- <sup>3/</sup> The program of improvement scheduled for this project is expected to affect 200-300,000 places but will comprise largely repairs of existing schools, particularly re-roofing, approximately US\$200 per school being allowed for roofing materials. The Regional Office does not regard this as particularly a physical improvement program.

Project	(FY)	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
		Schools New/Rebuilt	Classrooms New/Rebuilt	Total Places to be Provided	School Age Population "Not in School" At Project Appraisal (In millions)	as per- centage of (4)
<u>EAST ASIA &amp; PACIFIC</u>						
1. Indonesia III	(73)	-	-	-	-	-
2. Indonesia X	(82)	-	-	-	-	-
3. Malaysia II	(72)	-	-	-	-	-
4. Malaysia III	(74)	-	-	-	-	-
5. Malaysia IV	(77)	848	4,070	190,000	0.02	100+
6. Papua New Guinea II	(81)	-	-	-	-	-
7. Philippines III	(76)	-	-	-	-	-
8. Philippines V	(78)	-	-	-	-	-
9. Philippines VII	(81)	-	55,000	2,200,000	1.49	100+
10. Solomon Islands I	(82)	-	300	(15,000 Est.)	0.02	77.9
11. Thailand V	(79)	-	-	-	-	-
Sub-Total				2,405,000		158% (Average)
<u>SOUTH ASIA</u>						
1. Bangladesh IV	(80)	-	6,455	322,750	4.22	7.6
2. Pakistan IV	(79)	-	1,014	(50,000 Est.)	5.05	1.0
Sub-Total				372,750		4.0 (Average)
<u>EMENA</u>						
1. Iran I	(71)	12		13,440	1.62	.83
2. Lebanon I	(73)	39		30,960	0.14	22
3. Morocco III	(77)	47		9,400	1.34	.7
4. Morocco IV	(79)	40		8,000	1.01	.8
5. Spain I	(70)	19		16,720	0.31	5.4
6. Tunisia III	(76)	55	18(classrooms) 156(workshops)	15,700	0.11	14
Sub-Total				94,220		2.1 (Average)

Project	(1) (FY)	(2) Schools New/Rebuilt	(3) Classrooms New/Rebuilt	(4) Total Places to be Provided	(5) School Age Population "Not in School" At Project Appraisal (In million)	(6) as per- centage of (4)
<u>LAC</u>						
1. Barbados I	(79)	10	-	5,880	-	-
2. Bolivia I	(77)	-	726	37,820	0.01	2.70
3. Brazil II	(75)	15	-	9,310	4.54	.02
4. Brazil IV	(80)	-	1,691	62,020	2.73	2.27
5. Colombia IV	(83)	1,650	1,914	(100,000 Est.)	1.33	7.52
6. Dominican Republic II	(75)	204	-	30,000	-	-
7. El Salvador II	(75)	563	-	56,000	0.06	96
8. El Salvador IV	(79)	245	609	46,920	0.09	52
9. Guatemala III	(83)	-	680	15,000	0.45	3
10. Haiti I	(76)	75	-	16,000	0.52	3
11. Haiti II	(78)	41	-	12,000	0.21	6
12. Haiti III	(83)	45	180	9,000	0.27	3
13. Honduras II	(78)	558	-	33,720	0.05	65
14. Nicaragua II	(76)	204	-	43,000	0.05	91
15. Paraguay III	(77)	83	-	30,000	0.10	30
16. Paraguay IV	(81)	498	-	46,440	0.10	45
17. Peru I	(74)	10	-	3,700	0.96	0.4
18. Trinidad & Tobago III	(79)	27	-	9,320	-	-
Sub-Total				566,130	33.2 (Avg)	
Grand Total				3,805,834		

SUMMARY OF DISTRIBUTION OF SCHOOL PLACES

Region	Places	Regional % of Total	Average Ratio of Places to School Age Population "Not in School"
Eastern Africa	301,610	7.9	3.3
Western Africa	66,124	1.7	8.8
East Asia & Pacific	2,405,000	63.2	158
South Asia	372,750	9.8	4.0
EMENA	94,220	2.5	2.1
LAC	566,130	14.9	33.2
Total	3,805,834	100.0	10.4

Sample of Efforts in Projects in Some Sub-Saharan African Countries  
to Cope with Basic Education Needs Through Means Other  
than Regular Formal Primary Schooling

Project	Item	Brief Statement of Outcome
Ethiopia II (FY71)	Rural Education Institutes to serve as post-primary agricultural training centers and literacy centers.	Institute buildings constructed but not expected to operate as originally intended, as Government not keen on the concept. Centers would probably become junior secondary or farmer training institutions.
Malawi II (FY76)	Adult Education Centers. The use of primary school buildings by various agencies to promote adult rural training for illiterates and other youth and adults.	Because of insufficient cooperation between the agencies responsible for adult education on the one hand and the Ministry of Education on the other hand, utilization rates for these buildings in adult education are quite low.
Mali I (FY73)	Study to design and test low cost alternatives for basic education of the school age population.	No testing of this idea was done under this project. Some programs were recommended to (a) expand and improve functional literacy; (b) produce and use more local materials in local languages; (c) develop and test basic education programs using national languages. Under the Second Education Project, the functional literacy and the non-formal education programs for youth have been tested, with promising results so far.
Upper Volta I (FY73)	Rural Education Centers for illiterate youth--to impart agricultural skills, literacy, numeracy and health education.	Considerable progress has been made, with some modifications to the original idea such as increasing the emphasis on the use of French; the attrition and repeater rates are lower than in formal primary schools and community support is good.

Project	Item	Brief Statement of Outcome
Mauritania I (FY74)	Three-year study of the potential of the Koranic school to broaden the scope of literacy and numeracy teaching by providing support through radio, instructor training, and improved supervision and instructional materials; review of existing formal primary schooling and costing of alternative structures.	Insufficient support secured from religious leaders. Some progress was made in introducing modern curricula into some traditional schools; many uncertainties exist regarding the use of Koranic schools to expand primary education in the short-run, and expanding the formal system now viewed by Regional staff as a more satisfactory approach.
Benin I (FY75)	Youth clubs - expanding an ongoing program for training rural youth in literacy, numeracy, rural skills and health, in part in order to help reduce the rural exodus.	Rural skills being taught and economic and social independence of the participants being promoted; however, literacy and numeracy being relatively neglected.
Somalia II (FY75)	Nomadic Training Centers (4-year primary schools for nomads).	Problems of coordination developed between Ministry of Education and Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development on the staffing and recurrent financing of the Centers. Function of the Centers has been changed to adult education and vocational training.

ORIGINS OF THE 25 PROJECTS IN THE SAMPLE

	National Education Plan		Sector Study		Origins Unclear
	Long Range Sector Plan	National 5-Year Plan	Unesco	Bank	
1. Malaysia II (FY72)		X			
2. Lebanon I (FY73)		X			
3. Mauritania I (FY74) (experiment)					X
4. Malaysia III (FY74)		X			
5. Rwanda I (FY75)					X
6. Ethiopia IV (FY75)	X				
7. Brazil II (FY75)		X			
8. Malawi II (FY76)	X				
9. Tunisia III (FY76)					X
10. Liberia II (FY76)	X				
11. Morocco III (FY76)		X			
12. Madagascar II (FY77)		X			
13. Burundi I (FY77)					X
14. Malaysia IV (FY77)		X			
15. Bolivia I (FY77)	X				
16. Chad III (FY78)					X
17. Barbados I (FY79)			X		
18. Malawi III (FY79)	X				
19. El Salvador IV (FY79)		X			
20. Bangladesh IV (FY80)				X	
21. Lesotho III (FY81)		X			
22. Ethiopia V (FY81)	X				
23. Philippines VII (FY81)	X				
24. Liberia IV (FY83)	X				
25. Colombia IV (FY83)	X			X	

LENGTH OF PRIMARY/BASIC SCHOOLING

Project	Year of Approval	Grades	Starting Age	Theoretical Leaving Age	Remarks (as at time of project generation)
1. Bangladesh IV	FY80	1 - 5	6	11	-
2. Barbados I	FY79	1 - 6	5	11	One nursery (pre-school) year exists. A further 3 years may be spent in the elementary school after Grade 6.
3. Brazil II	FY75	1 - 8	7	15	Increased basic cycle from 4 to 8 years under a reform program assisted by the project.
4. Bolivia I	FY77	1 - 5	6	11	A two-year pre-school cycle in existence.
5. Burundi I	FY77	1 - 6	6	12	Recently reduced primary cycle from 7 to 6 years as part of ongoing reform.
6. Chad III	FY78	1 - 6	6	12	-
7. Colombia IV	FY83	1 - 5	7	12	-

Project	Year of Approval	Grades	Starting Age	Theoretical Leaving Age	Remarks (as at time of project generation)
8. El Salvador IV	FY79	1 - 6	7	13	One year pre-school kindergarten. Basic education comprises 3 cycles of 3 years each. Grades 1-6 primary.
9. Ethiopia	FY75/81	1 - 6	7	13	
10. Lebanon	FY73	1 - 5	6	11	Three pre-school grades exist. Under the reform only one pre-school would exist, thus making the primary program Grades 2 - 6.
11. Lesotho III	FY81	1 - 7	6	13	
12. Liberia II/IV	FY76/83	1 - 6	7	13	In FY76 a pre-elementary program was in effect for a limited number of persons. In FY83 this program was scheduled to abolished.
13. Madagascar II	FY77	1 - 6	6	12	Intention to reduce cycle to 5 grades.
14. Malawi II/III	FY76/79	1 - 8	6	14	Two cycles: 5+3; Grades 4-8 do practical subjects.
15. Malaysia II/III/IV	FY72/74/77	1 - 6	6	12	

1  
4  
3  
1

Project	Year of Approval	Grades	Starting Age	Theoretical Leaving Age	Remarks (as at time of project generation)
16. Mauritania I	FY74	1 - 7	6	13	For the formal system; however, for Koranic schools, entry at about age 5, departure at about age 10-12.
17. Morocco III	FY76	1 - 5	7	12	Pre-schooling for about 12% of the 3-6 year age group.
18. Philippines VII	FY81	1 - 6	7	13	
19. Rwanda I	FY75	1 - 6	7	13	Under the project streaming to occur after Grade 4--10% to pre-secondary and 90% to terminal "practical" course.
20. Tunisia III	FY76	1- 6	6	12	

PROGRAMS OF "RURALIZING" OF CURRICULA

1. Malaysia II (FY72) Curriculum development center to be established.
2. Lebanon I (FY73) Practical subjects to be included but no reference to a rural program.
3. Mauritania I (FY74) Ruralizing not involved in the experiment with Koranic schools.
4. Malaysia III (FY74) Not applicable.
5. Rwanda I (FY75) Workshops for agriculture related woodwork, metalwork & home economics.
6. Ethiopia IV (FY75) New rurally-oriented practical studies program being implemented.
7. Brazil II (FY75) Facilities to be added for agriculture, home economics, industrial arts, commerce, for Grades 5-8.
8. Malawi II (FY76) Addition of agriculture, crafts, domestic science in Grades 4-8.
9. Tunisia III (FY76) Grades 5 & 6 would add initiation into manual work (agricultural in rural areas).
10. Liberia II (FY76) School gardening and handicraft envisaged in project schools; curriculum development assisted.
11. Morocco III (FY76) Grades 4 & 5 would have induction into manual work including non-farm and farm skills.
12. Madagascar II (FY77) Textbooks to be produced in environmental studies.
13. Burundi I (FY77) Multipurpose Learning Centers for agricultural and related rural practical skills to be provided.
14. Malaysia IV (FY77) Curriculum not mentioned.
15. Bolivia I (FY77) New curricula and materials emphasizing agriculture, rural crafts, home arts, health.
16. Chad III (FY78) Curriculum change in this respect not mentioned; however, reform being implemented.
17. Barbados I (FY79) New curriculum to be effectively applied in facilities designed for special subjects including agriculture, handicrafts, home economics.

18. Malawi III (FY79) See Malawi II.
19. El Salvador IV (FY79) Provision of tools for gardening, industrial arts workshops.
20. Bangladesh IV (FY80) Curriculum change in this respect not mentioned.
21. Lesotho III (FY81) Agriculture.
22. Ethiopia V (FY81) Rural pedagogical centers to be established.
23. Philippines VII (FY81) Environmental education in Grades 3-6, with some emphasis on practical arts in Grades 5-6.
24. Liberia IV (FY83) School gardening.
25. Colombia IV (FY83) School gardening.

TEXTBOOK PROVISION IN PROJECTS  
WITHIN THE SAMPLE

Country Projects	Target no. of books (in million)	Estimate of supply to pupils	How financed	Pupil access	Teacher training in use	Built-in evaluation of books
Rwanda I	2.7 (plus 1.6 in guides)	All pupils to receive books	Government (free to pupils)	n.a.	Yes (through inspection)	-
Madagascar II	4.0	n.a.	Government	n.a.	Yes	-
Burundi I	0.17-0.22	Each pupil to receive books	Government	Books to stay in lockers at school	-	-
Bolivia I	n.a.	n.a.	Government	n.a.	n.a.	Yes
Malawi III	2.22	Three books per pupil in grades 1-8	Traditionally by fee; but government will begin to assume burden	-	-	Yes
El Salvador IV	1.0	One book for every rural pupil; one book for every five urban pupils.	Government (free to pupils)	Books owned by school; lent for home use	Yes	Yes (US\$0.25m)
Bangladesh IV	n.a. (books to 2.1 m. pupils)	Books for one half of age cohort 1981-85	Government (free to pupils)	-	-	-
Lesotho III	1.9		Book use fee (graduated by grade level) with exemptions for the needy; to produce self-sustaining fund	Use for the year; stored at the school	Yes, via supplier of books	Yes
Liberia IV	1.8	To reach 66% of pupils grades 1-6 with about one book per subject	Virtually government but eventually through self-sustaining fund fed by sale of books	Full ownership by pupils	Yes	-
Colombia IV	0.34	One for every two or three pupils	Government	n.a.	-	-
Philippines VII	55.0	One for every two pupils in each subject	Government	Use at school only	-	-

PROJECT-RELATED PROGRAMS OF TEACHER TRAINING

1. Malaysia II (FY72) In-service teacher training in new curricula (by Curriculum Development Center) and in use of Educational Broadcasting.
2. Lebanon I (FY73) Need of Primary Teacher Training Institutes would provide the teachers needed for the new curricula.
3. Mauritania I (FY74)  
(experiment) Use of radio and National Pedagogical Center to train teachers.
4. Malaysia III (FY74) Teacher training expansion to meet rural needs.
5. Rwanda I (FY75) Practical teachers needed for boys' courses would be trained with bilateral aid.
6. Ethiopia IV (FY75) -
7. Brazil II (FY75) Special program of refresher courses for teachers and administrators for carrying out the reform.
8. Malawi II (FY76) (The expansion of the teacher training system was not specifically related to qualitative change in primary education).
9. Tunisia III (FY76) Workshops for training practical subjects teachers.
10. Liberia II (FY76) Effort to strengthen teacher training institute outreach and expand its female enrollment.
11. Morocco III (FY76) -
12. Madagascar II (FY77) School supervisors would instruct teachers in use of books and upgraded Regional Education Centers would conduct in-service training.
13. Burundi I (FY77) Teacher Training School to be expanded to train practical subject teachers.
14. Malaysia IV (FY77) Establishing Education Resource Centers as the basis of a regular in-service teacher training program.
15. Bolivia I (FY77) One-month inservice courses on new curricula, materials, radio, bilingualism multigrade teaching, community development and new equipment.
16. Chad III (FY78) -



PROVISION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION IN EDUCATION PROJECTS (By Region)

REGION: (No. of Projects)	PROJECT PROVISION				PURPOSE FOR WHICH PROVISION WAS MADE												C O S T S		
	(1*)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)	(12)	(13)	(14)	(15)	(16)	(17)	(18)	(19)
East Africa (17)	17	17	10	3	8	14	1	0	3	2	13	14	3	5	6	3	401.90	173.69	43.22
West Africa (14)	11	12	6	9	3	6	1	2	10	1	7	10	3	2	3	0	309.50	71.28	23.03
E. Asia & Pacific (11)	7	9	2	5	6	9	3	2	2	1	5	7	5	6	2	0	966.98	709.51	73.31
South Asia (2)	2	2	2	2	2	1	0	0	1	0	2	2	2	0	0	2	61.62	61.18	99.30
EMENA (6)	6	6	2	1	5	3	0	0	0	0	3	2	1	0	1	0	263.21	86.45	33.0
L.A.C. (18)	18	18	9	8	14	14	3	2	10	0	14	13	12	10	5	3	523.62	341.38	65.20
T O T A L (68)	61	64	31	28	38	47	8	6	26	4	44	49	26	23	17	8	2526.83	1443.49	57.13

KEYS TO COLUMNS (1)-(19)

- |                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Buildings                       | 11. Teacher Supply                        |
| 2. Furniture, Equipment & Supplies | 12. Educational Materials & Textbooks     |
| 3. Experts                         | 13. School Management                     |
| 4. Fellowships                     | 14. Central District Management           |
| 5. Curriculum Reform               | 15. Staff Housing                         |
| 6. New Teaching Techniques         | 16. Welfare Support, Boarding/Lodging     |
| 7. Radio                           | 17. Total Project Costs (US\$M)           |
| 8. Television                      | 18. Total Primary Education Costs (US\$M) |
| 9. Research/Studies                | 19. Primary Costs as a % of Project Cost  |
| 10. Exam Reform                    |   |

PROVISION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION IN EDUCATION PROJECTS (By Region)

REGION: EASTERN AFRICA (FY)	PROJECT PROVISION				PURPOSE FOR WHICH PROVISION WAS MADE												C O S T S		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
1. Tanzania IV (73)	X	X	X			X					X						14.58	0.59	4.05
2. Ethiopia IV (75)	X	X			X	X	X					X					29.07	12.79	44.0
3. Rwanda I (75)	X	X	X		X	X				X	X	X		X			9.0	8.91	99.0
4. Sudan II (75)	X	X	X	X	X	X					X	X					18.91	9.83	52.0
5. Malawi II (76)	X	X				X					X						15.0	5.53	37.0
6. Burundi I (77)	X	X	X	X	X	X					X	X	X		X		12.51	10.0	80.0
7. Madagascar II (77)	X	X	X		X	X			X		X	X		X			19.26	19.26	100.0
8. Kenya IV (75)	X	X	X		X							X		X	X	X	31.0	12.09	39.0
9. Malawi III (79)	X	X	X			X			X		X	X				X	26.62	12.55	47.15
10. Swaziland III (80)	X	X							X		X	X			X		15.90	7.04	44.28
11. Ethiopia V (81)	X	X			X							X					53.65	8.75	16.31
12. Lesotho III (81)	X	X	X			X						X	X				13.10	6.29	48.0
13. Tanzania VII (81)	X	X			X	X					X	X	X		X		53.50	13.90	26.0
14. Botswana III (82)	X	X	X			X				X	X	X			X		30.0	23.10	77.0
15. Comoros I (82)	X	X	X	X		X					X	X			X	X	6.50	4.0	61.50
16. Uganda III (83)	X	X				X					X	X		X			34.0	14.32	42
17. Burundi III (83)	X	X				X					X			X			19.30	4.74	24.56
TOTAL	17	17	10	3	8	14	1	0	3	2	13	14	3	5	6	3	401.90	173.69	44.16

- |                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Buildings                       | 11. Teacher Supply                        |
| 2. Furniture, Equipment & Supplies | 12. Educational Materials & Textbooks     |
| 3. Experts                         | 13. School Management                     |
| 4. Fellowships                     | 14. Central District Management           |
| 5. Curriculum Reform               | 15. Staff Housing                         |
| 6. New Teaching Techniques         | 16. Welfare Support, Boarding/Lodging     |
| 7. Radio                           | 17. Total Project Costs (US\$M)           |
| 8. Television                      | 18. Total Primary Education Costs (US\$M) |
| 9. Research/Studies                | 19. Primary Costs as a % of Project Cost  |
| 10. Exam Reform                    |   |

PROVISION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION IN EDUCATION PROJECTS (By Region)

REGION: WESTERN AFRICA (FY)	PROJECT PROVISION				PURPOSE FOR WHICH PROVISION WAS MADE												C O S T S		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
1. Ivory Coast I (FY70)	X	X	X	X		X		X	X		X	X			X		19.10	1.40	7.30
2. Nigeria III (FY73)	X	X			X				X								107.39	0.49	0.46
3. Mauritania I (FY74)	X	X	X				X		X			X	X				4.31	0.43	10.0
4. Gabon II (FY75)		X	X	X	X							X					8.08	0.28	3.47
5. Liberia II (FY76)	X	X	X	X		X		X	X	X	X	X					6.57	2.81	43.0
6. Sierra Leone II (FY76)									X								10.99	0.26	2.37
7. Congo II (FY77)	X	X	X	X					X			X					11.38	1.65	14.50
8. Chad III (FY78)	X	X			X	X			X		X						9.20	5.92	64.0
9. Mali II (FY78)									X								12.0	0.40	3.33
10. Benin II (FY82)	X	X		X							X	X					25.64	4.10	16.0
11. C.A.R. II (FY83)	X	X		X					X			X			X		12.24	6.61	54.0
12. Guinea II (FY83)	X	X		X		X					X	X	X				30.20	12.08	40.0
13. Liberia IV (FY83)	X	X		X		X					X	X		X			25.10	11.55	46.0
14. Sierra Leone III (FY83)	X	X	X	X		X			X		X	X	X	X	X		27.30	23.30	85.0
T O T A L	11	12	6	9	3	6	1	2	10	1	7	10	3	2	3	0	309.50	71.28	23.03

- |                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Buildings                       | 11. Teacher Supply                        |
| 2. Furniture, Equipment & Supplies | 12. Educational Materials & Textbooks     |
| 3. Experts                         | 13. School Management                     |
| 4. Fellowships                     | 14. Central District Management           |
| 5. Curriculum Reform               | 15. Staff Housing                         |
| 6. New Teaching Techniques         | 16. Welfare Support, Boarding/Lodging     |
| 7. Radio                           | 17. Total Project Costs (US\$M)           |
| 8. Television                      | 18. Total Primary Education Costs (US\$M) |
| 9. Research/Studies                | 19. Primary Costs as a % of Project Cost  |
| 10. Exam Reform                    |   |

PROVISION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION IN EDUCATION PROJECTS (By Region)

REGION: EAST ASIA & PACIFIC (FY)	PROJECT PROVISION				PURPOSE FOR WHICH PROVISION WAS MADE												C O S T S		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
1. Malaysia II (FY72)	X	X			X	X		X				X		X			28.45	2.28	8.0
2. Indonesia III (FY73)		X	X	X		X					X	X	X	X			39.24	39.24	100.0
3. Malaysia III (FY74)	X	X				X	X	X				X					41.40	3.35	8.10
4. Philippines III (FY76)																	51.60	13.69	26.53
5. Malaysia IV (FY74)	X	X				X					X			X			124.59	102.29	82.10
6. Philippines V (FY78)				X		X	X		X				X				3.90	3.90	100.0
7. Thailand V (FY79)	X	X		X	X		X						X	X			70.30	17.20	24.0
8. P.New Guinea II (FY81)	X	X		X	X	X				X	X	X	X	X	X		37.70	24.94	66.0
9. Philippines VII (FY81)	X	X			X	X					X	X		X			448.10	443.62	99.0
10. Indonesia X (FY82)		X			X	X						X					111.70	53.0	47.0
11. Solomon Islands (FY82)	X	X	X	X	X	X			X		X	X	X		X		10.0	6.0	60.0
TOTAL	7	9	2	5	6	9	3	2	2	1	5	7	5	6	2	0	966.98	709.51	73.37

- |                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Buildings                       | 11. Teacher Supply                        |
| 2. Furniture, Equipment & Supplies | 12. Educational Materials & Textbooks     |
| 3. Experts                         | 13. School Management                     |
| 4. Fellowships                     | 14. Central District Management           |
| 5. Curriculum Reform               | 15. Staff Housing                         |
| 6. New Teaching Techniques         | 16. Welfare Support, Boarding/Lodging     |
| 7. Radio                           | 17. Total Project Costs (US\$M)           |
| 8. Television                      | 18. Total Primary Education Costs (US\$M) |
| 9. Research/Studies                | 19. Primary Costs as a % of Project Cost  |
| 10. Exam Reform                    |   |

PROVISION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION IN EDUCATION PROJECTS (By Region)

REGION: SOUTH ASIA  (FY)	PROJECT PROVISION				PURPOSE FOR WHICH PROVISION WAS MADE												C O S T S		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
1. Pakistan IV (FY79)	X	X	X	X	X						X	X	X			X	44.42	43.98	99.0
2. Bangladesh IV (FY82)	X	X	X	X	X	X			X		X	X	X			X	17.20	17.20	100.0
TOTAL	2	2	2	2	2	1	0	0	1	0	2	2	2			2	61.62	61.18	99.30

- |                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Buildings                       | 11. Teacher Supply                        |
| 2. Furniture, Equipment & Supplies | 12. Educational Materials & Textbooks     |
| 3. Experts                         | 13. School Management                     |
| 4. Fellowships                     | 14. Central District Management           |
| 5. Curriculum Reform               | 15. Staff Housing                         |
| 6. New Teaching Techniques         | 16. Welfare Support, Boarding/Lodging     |
| 7. Radio                           | 17. Total Project Costs (US\$M)           |
| 8. Television                      | 18. Total Primary Education Costs (US\$M) |
| 9. Research/Studies                | 19. Primary Costs as a % of Project Cost  |
| 10. Exam Reform                    |   |

PROVISION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION IN EDUCATION PROJECTS (By Region)

REGION: EMENA	(FY)	PROJECT PROVISION				PURPOSE FOR WHICH PROVISION WAS MADE												C O S T S		
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
1. Spain I	(FY70)	X	X			X												24.04	8.0	33.30
2. Iran I	(FY71)	X	X				X					X						41.66	6.74	16.20
3. Lebanon I	(FY73)	X	X			X	X						X					15.87	9.52	60.0
4. Morocco III	(FY76)	X	X	X		X								X		X		59.54	13.57	22.80
5. Tunisia III	(FY76)	X	X			X						X						27.60	19.32	70.0
6. Morocco V	(FY82)	X	X	X	X	X	X					X	X					94.50	29.30	31.0
TOTAL		6	6	2	1	5	3	0	0	0	0	3	2	1	0	1	0	263.21	86.45	33.0

- |                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Buildings                       | 11. Teacher Supply                        |
| 2. Furniture, Equipment & Supplies | 12. Educational Materials & Textbooks     |
| 3. Experts                         | 13. School Management                     |
| 4. Fellowships                     | 14. Central District Management           |
| 5. Curriculum Reform               | 15. Staff Housing                         |
| 6. New Teaching Techniques         | 16. Welfare Support, Boarding/Lodging     |
| 7. Radio                           | 17. Total Project Costs (US\$M)           |
| 8. Television                      | 18. Total Primary Education Costs (US\$M) |
| 9. Research/Studies                | 19. Primary Costs as a % of Project Cost  |
| 10. Exam Reform                    |   |

PROVISION FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION IN EDUCATION PROJECTS (By Region)

REGION: LAC  (FY)	PROJECT PROVISION				PURPOSE FOR WHICH PROVISION WAS MADE												C O S T S		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19
1. El Salvador II (FY74)	X	X			X	X					X	X			X		24.25	18.23	75.20
2. Peru I (FY74)	X	X		X	X	X											40.0	6.05	15.13
3. Brazil II (FY75)	X	X	X	X	X				X		X		X	X			58.70	12.29	21.0
4. Dom. Republic II(FY75)	X	X				X			X		X		X	X	X	X	13.54	1.35	10.0
5. Haiti I (FY76)	X	X	X	X		X			X		X				X		6.48	5.30	82.0
6. Nicaragua II (FY76)	X	X				X			X		X	X	X				19.80	8.28	42.0
7. Bolivia I (FY77)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X		X	X		X			21.40	19.60	91.60
8. Paraguay III (FY77)	X	X	X	X	X							X		X			17.38	11.47	66.0
9. Haiti II (FY78)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X			12.67	7.86	62
10. Honduras II (FY78)	X	X			X	X					X	X	X	X			7.60	5.89	77.50
11. Barbados I (FY79)	X	X			X	X					X	X	X				14.50	7.30	50.0
12. El Salvador IV (FY79)	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X			X	X	X	X			33.60	28.30	84.0
13. Trin&Tobago III(FY79)	X	X											X			X	54.30	16.80	31.0
14. Brazil IV (FY80)	X	X	X		X	X			X		X	X	X	X		X	91.40	91.40	100.0
15. Paraguay IV (FY81)	X	X	X		X				X		X	X	X	X	X		28.38	21.84	77.0
16. Colombia IV (FY83)	X	X	X	X	X	X					X	X	X	X			36.23	36.23	100.0
17. Guatemala III (FY83)	X	X			X	X			X			X					33.45	33.45	100.0
18. Haiti III (FY83)	X	X			X	X			X		X	X	X		X		9.94	9.74	98.0
TOTAL	18	18	9	8	14	14	3	2	10	0	14	13	12	10	5	3	523.62	341.38	65.20

- |                                    |   |
|------------------------------------|---|
| 1. Buildings                       | 11. Teacher Supply                        |
| 2. Furniture, Equipment & Supplies | 12. Educational Materials & Textbooks     |
| 3. Experts                         | 13. School Management                     |
| 4. Fellowships                     | 14. Central District Management           |
| 5. Curriculum Reform               | 15. Staff Housing                         |
| 6. New Teaching Techniques         | 16. Welfare Support, Boarding/Lodging     |
| 7. Radio                           | 17. Total Project Costs (US\$M)           |
| 8. Television                      | 18. Total Primary Education Costs (US\$M) |
| 9. Research/Studies                | 19. Primary Costs as a % of Project Cost  |
| 10. Exam Reform                    |   |

IMPLEMENTATION TIME PERFORMANCE ON SELECTED PROJECTS  
(PRIMARY EDUCATION COMPONENTS)

Project	Time Originally Allowed for Completion (in Years)	Actual Time Used or Most Recent Estimate of Time Needed (in Years)	Difference (in Years)	% Difference
Malaysia II (FY72)	2.5	6.5	4.0	160
Lebanon I (FY73)	Unsettled country conditions			
Mauritania I (FY74) (experiment)	3.0	5.0	2.0	67
Malaysia III (FY74)	2.5	9.2	6.7	260
Rwanda I (FY75)	5.5	7.5	2.0	36
Ethiopia IV (FY75)	6.3	6.3	-	-
Brazil II (FY75)	4.5	8.4	3.9	87
Malawi II (FY76)	2.5	5.75	3.25	130
Tunisia III (FY76)	Considerably modified during implementation			
Liberia II (FY76)	3.0	6.25	3.25	108
Morocco III (FY76)	4.0	7.1 (est.)	3.1	78
Madagascar II (FY77)	4.8	6.5	1.8	42
Burundi I (FY77)	5.3	6.4 (est.)	1.0	19
Malaysia IV (FY77)	3.8	7.9	4.1	108
Bolivia I (FY77)	4.6	7.6 (est.)	3.0	65
Chad III (FY78)	Unsettled country conditions			
Barbados I (FY79)	5.0	6.0 (est.)	1.0	20
Malawi III (FY79)	4.5	6.0 (est.)	1.5	33
El Salvador IV (FY79)	Unsettled country conditions			
Bangladesh IV (FY80)	Too early for useful data. Disbursements lag 33%			
Lesotho III (FY81)	Too early for useful data. Disbursements lag 33%			
<b>Total</b>	<b>61.8</b>	<b>102.4</b>	<b>40.6</b>	<b>66</b>
<b>Average</b>	<b>4.12</b>	<b>6.83</b>	<b>2.71</b>	

REASONS FOR DELAYS IN IMPLEMENTING PRIMARY EDUCATION COMPONENTS

Type of Problem Projects*	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	TOTAL
A. Weaknesses in Project Management		X	X	X					X	X		X		X		X	8
B. Site Selection or Acquisition	X		X			X				X		X	X				6
C. Financial Problems						X				X	X	X		X	X		6
D. Shortage of Building Materials				X					X		X	X				X	5
E. Delays in Building Designs			X			X					X		X				4
F. Delay Recruiting Architect				X		X	X			X							4
G. Delays Preparing Tender Documents	X								X	X	X						4
H. Borrower Bureaucracy-Processing Claims				X						X	X			X			4
I. Government Reluctance to Proceed with Item as Designed								X	X					X			3
J. Government Education Policy Change				X		X								X			3
K. Slow or Non-Performance of Building Contractor			X										X				2
L. Difficulty with Self Help							X									X	2
M. Delay Recruiting Technical Assistance		X															1
N. Delay Procuring Equipment			X														1
O. Difficulty with so Large a Project																X	1
TOTAL OF INCIDENCE	2	2	5	5	0	5	2	1	4	6	5	4	3	5	1	4	54

\* The numbers given at the head of each column refer to projects listed in sequence as follows:  
 1. Malaysia II, FY72; 2. Mauritania I, FY74; 3. Malaysia III, FY74; 4. Rwanda I, FY75;  
 5. Ethiopia IV, FY75; 6. Brazil II, FY75; 7. Malawi II, FY76; 8. Tunisia III, FY76;  
 9. Liberia II, FY76; 10. Morocco III, FY76; 11. Madagascar II, FY77; 12. Burundi I, FY77;  
 13. Malaysia IV, FY77; 14. Bolivia I, FY77; 15. Barbados I, FY79; 16. Malawi III, FY79.

IMPLEMENTING EDUCATION PROGRAMS

(i) A few observations are possible on certain projects which are either at an advanced implementation stage or completed.

(ii) Malaysia II and III (FY72 and FY74). The Project Completion Report for Malaysia II observed that the Curriculum Development Center (CDC) financed by this project was functioning well. The appraisal mission had reduced the proposed size of the building by 20%; the Borrower had built 28% more area than agreed; yet the building was now too small for its 151 professional staff, twice the number envisaged at appraisal. The CDC had an impressive record of work in curriculum development, research, in-service training and educational leadership in general. The other project element of relevance to primary education was educational broadcasting, with primary education accounting for about one half of the educational broadcasting services provided. Broadcasting services were described in the Completion Report as having succeeded in widening the horizons of students, helping to build national unity, promoting social development, and supporting science and mathematics teaching. Supervision Reports for Malaysia III noted that broadcasts were reaching some 421,000 children--400,000 by radio and 21,000 by television.

(iii) Mauritania I (FY73). This project contained an experimental study exploring the use of Koranic schools to teach literacy and numeracy. Assistance was provided for an expert to coordinate the experiment which was to have been conducted by the National Pedagogical Institute (IPN), for instructional materials and for radio support to assist in this experiment. The technical assistance expert was recruited; however, the selection was inappropriate since the expert was a former Roman Catholic European priest and so hardly a good basis for securing the confidence of the Mauritanian Islamic community. However, when responsibility for the Koranic schools was shifted from the Ministry of Primary Education and Religious Affairs to the Ministry of Islamic Affairs, the link between the study and the IPN (which came under the Ministry of Education) was weakened and the IPN played no part in the study. This effectively nullified hopes of substantial local involvement. Schools were selected, some selected Koranic teachers were given a crash course to help them teach arithmetic, teaching materials were prepared and arithmetic textbooks were used in the schools. Arithmetic is being taught still in some of these schools, enough to suggest that the idea of using Koranic schools to teach arithmetic is realistic. Nevertheless, as there was no built-in evaluation of the experiment, although evaluation was required under the Credit Agreement, the results are unclear. The study did not win the crucially important support of the Islamic authorities and it lost much of its value with the deletion of the radio component in 1978.

(iv) Rwanda I (FY75). The project provided (a) 150 workshops (increased to 250 during project implementation) to help introduce a more "practical" curriculum and (b) a building, equipment and a supply of paper

for a printshop for textbooks. Syllabi were prepared for the practical subjects. Teacher training was considered of mixed quality. The print shop was put into operation.

(v) Malawi II (FY76). The Project Completion Report notes that (a) the practical subjects were introduced and (b) apart from a shortage of qualified female teachers of home craft, the teachers were well trained and supplied, (c) the supply of teaching materials for these classes was sporadic, (d) the program is so expensive that countrywide replication is not possible. Nevertheless, substantial progress was made. Enrollment targets were surpassed and examination results were said to have improved. The schools function well as standard primary schools. But there is under-utilization of "practical" facilities.

(vi) Liberia II (FY76). This project aimed at modest improvements in primary education rather than a full-scale reform. These efforts included strengthening testing, curriculum development, teacher training, educational publishing and administration as well as constructing some primary (community) schools. The community school program was carried out with the construction of 46 schools instead of the planned 50. The evaluation of the community school program was built into the project but never completed. The Completion Report notes, however, that there was a shortage of teachers, equipment and instructional materials for the practical subjects and that these schools therefore function along traditional lines. An important limitation related to textbook production. The Borrower decided during implementation not to proceed with the project intention to strengthen the existing printing unit. At one stage the Borrower considered constructing a new building to house the unit and at another stage using the proposed resources to create a Government Printing Office. Eventually nothing was done. The intended employment of writers under the project to prepare textbooks was abandoned and so the textbook supply never materialized. It is not quite clear what developed in regard to test construction and curriculum development in support of primary education. Some work was carried out but results appeared to be well below appraisal expectations.

(vii) Tunisia III (FY76). This project had the objective of introducing a more practical primary school curriculum by exposing children of Grades V and VI to manual work--Initiation aux Travaux Manuels (ITM). This had been experimented with over a very short period (2-3 years) with help from UNICEF and ILO, but it was not clear at appraisal that the Government as a whole was interested in its generalization throughout the system. After some years of inaction on implementing the project, the Government requested its revision and the ITM program was modified. The new curriculum has been introduced but has not as yet been thoroughly evaluated. The draft Project Completion Report comments in favorable terms about the ITM program--the beneficial effect of practical activities on learning in general, the better liaison with vocational training, maintenance of school plant, positive teacher attitudes and productive income-earning activities organized by the schools. Indeed there appeared to be some risk of over emphasizing production and not treating it as a vehicle for education.

(viii) Morocco III (FY76). According to a draft Project Completion Report dated December 30, 1983, the practical subjects have been introduced in the project under a new curriculum, designed with the assistance of a Unesco expert, in which handicraft is done in Grades 1-3 and horticulture, home economics and wood and metal work in Grades 4-5. In addition, mathematics and science teaching has been strengthened. The practical activities are seen purely as an aid to learning, promoting motivation to learn, observation, analysis, self expression, self discipline, curiosity and appreciation of the environment. Funds for the generalizing of the curriculum beyond the project schools however, have not so far materialized and there are problems with the supply of teachers competent in the practical subjects.

(ix) Burundi I (FY77). The primary education elements in this project included (a) 100 multi-purpose learning centers (primary schools with facilities for practical subjects) and (b) expansion of the textbook production unit and provision of paper for printing textbooks. The school garden was intended to be an income-producing venture conducted by a school cooperative and assisted by the parent-teacher association. As of December 1982, some 47 centers had been built and were in operation. Cost overruns had precluded attainment of the full target. Practical subject teachers had been trained. About 370,000 of the planned 680,000 textbooks had been produced and 190,000 had been distributed to the schools. Double shifting and automatic grade promotion were being introduced.

(x) Bolivia I (FY77). The project supported an ambitious reform and expansion effort in the Aymara-speaking plateau region near La Paz. Apart from adding practical subjects, the aim was to introduce bilingual education (Aymara and Spanish) in the first three grades, revise the school calendar to take account of agricultural cycles, conduct a campaign to encourage retention of girls in schools and prepare curricula and learning materials. It was viewed as an experiment which could be replicated if found feasible. Implementation of items relating to curriculum development, instructional materials and teacher training proceeded. With a change in Government, however, the bilingual program was dropped in favor of teaching purely in Spanish. Another change of Government has reversed that policy and the materials prepared in Spanish must now be redone in the two languages. The change in the school calendar was prepared but not introduced. Low attendance rates for girls still persist. The targets for book production were scaled down.