

**CONCLUSION REPORT  
IMPROVING DIMENSIONS OF TEACHING, EDUCATION MANAGEMENT, AND LEARNING ENVIRONMENT TRUST  
FUND  
(ID-TEMAN TF) (P157380)**

**Government of Australia (Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade) – World Bank Trust Fund**

**TRUST FUND No. 072611**

**December 21, 2020**

## ABBREVIATIONS

ADB	Asian Development Bank
AKSI	<i>Asesmen Kompetensi Siswa Indonesia</i> (Indonesia National Assessment Program)
APBN	<i>Anggaran Pendapatan dan Belanja Negara</i> (State Budget Revenue and Expenditure)
BAPPEDA	<i>Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah</i> (Local Development Planning Office)
BAPPENAS	<i>Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional</i> (National Development Planning Agency)
BKN	<i>Badan Kepegawaian Nasional</i> (National Civil Service Office)
BKD	<i>Badan Kepegawaian Daerah</i> (Local Civil Service Office)
BOS	<i>Bantuan Operasional Sekolah</i> (School Operational Assistance Grant)
BOS Kinerja	<i>BOS berbasis Kinerja</i> (Performance-based BOS)
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
DAK	<i>Dana Alokasi Khusus</i> (Special Budget Allocation)
DAPODIK	<i>Data Pokok Pendidikan</i> (Main Source of Education Data)
DGBSE	Director General of Basic and Secondary Education, Ministry of Education and Culture
DFAT	Department of Foreign Trade and Affairs
DK Jakarta	<i>Daerah Khusus Ibukota</i> (Special Capital Region) Jakarta
EMIS	Education Management Information System
EOPO	End of Program Outcome
e-RKAS	<i>Rencana Kerja dan Anggaran berbasis elektronik</i> (electronic school planning and budgeting)
ESR	Education Sector Review
e-RKAM	<i>Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Madrasah Berbasis Elektronik</i> (Electronic School Planning and Budgeting Pilot)
FY	Fiscal Year
GOI	Government of Indonesia
HEI	Higher Education Institution
IBL	Inquiry Based Learning
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
ID-TEMAN	Improving Dimensions of Teaching, Education Management and Learning Environment
IEQ	Indonesia Economic Quarterly
IFC	International Finance Corporation
IFLS	Indonesia Family Life Survey data
IO	Intermediate Outcome
LPTK	<i>Lembaga Pendidikan Tenaga Keguruan</i> (Teacher Training institution)
LMS	Learning Management System
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MGMP	<i>Musyawah Guru Mata Pelajaran</i> (Teacher working group of junior and senior education levels)
MoEC	Ministry of Education and Culture
MoF	Ministry of Finance
MoRA	Ministry of Religious Affairs
MoRTHE	Ministry of Research Technology and Higher Education
MoABR	Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform ( <i>Kementerian Pemberdayaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi or KemenPAN-RB</i> )
NES	National Education Standards
Nota Keuangan	Financial Note
NZTE	New Zealand Trade and Enterprise
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PDO	Project Development Objective
PER	Public Expenditure Review
PISA	Program for International Student Assessment
PPPPTK	<i>Pusat Pengembangan dan Pemberdayaan Pendidik dan Tenaga Kependidikan</i> (Center for the Development and Empowerment of Teachers and Education Personnel)
PIP	<i>Program Indonesia Pintar</i> (Smart Indonesia Program)

PISA	Programme for International Student Assessment
PKG	<i>Penilaian Kinerja Guru</i> (Teacher Performance Evaluation)
PPG	<i>Pendidikan Profesi Guru</i> (Teacher Professional Education)
P3K	<i>Pegawai Pemerintah dengan Perjanjian Kerja</i> (Contract Government Employee)
RE	Religious Education
RKAS	<i>Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Sekolah</i> (School Annual Budget Plan) <i>Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Sekolah Berbasis Elektronik</i> (Electronic-School Annual Budget Plan)
RPJMN	<i>Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional</i> (Medium Term National Strategic Planning)
SABER	System Assessment for Better Education Results
SDI	Service Delivery Indicator
SKG	<i>Standar Kompetensi Guru</i> (Teacher Competency Standards)
SMK	<i>Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan</i> (vocational Secondary School)
SR	Spatial Reasoning
STR	Student Teacher Ratio
SUSENAS	Survei Sosial Ekonomi Nasional (National Social Economy Survey)
TA	Technical Assistance
TASS	Technical Assistance for Education System Strengthening
TCIE	Teacher Certification Impact Evaluation
TF	Trust Fund
TIMSS	Trends in Mathematics and Science Study
TNP2K	<i>Tim Nasional Percepatan Penanggulangan Kemiskinan</i> (The National Team for the Acceleration of Poverty Reduction)
TPG	<i>Tunjangan Profesi Guru</i> (Teacher Professional Allowance)
UKG	<i>Uji Kompetensi Guru</i> (Teacher Competency Test)
WB	World Bank
WDR	World Development Report

Table of Contents

<b>ABBREVIATIONS</b> .....	1
<b>I. INTRODUCTION</b> .....	7
<b>II. DESCRIPTION</b> .....	8
<b>A. Project Overview</b> .....	8
1. Objective.....	8
2. The ID-TEMAN Pillars .....	8
<b>III. Activity Summaries and Implementation Progress</b> .....	9
<b>Pillar 1: Support to effective teaching and learning processes, with a specific focus on teacher competencies</b> .....	9
1.6 – Landscape Survey of EdTech (MoEC) .....	10
1.7 – Gender and Social Inclusion Analysis (MoEC & MoRA). .....	10
1.8 – In-Service Teacher Training Capacity Assessment (MoRA) [formerly Teacher Workforce Management Analysis]. .....	11
1.9 – Indonesia Education Flagship .....	12
<b>Pillar 2: Support to improve the efficient delivery of education for all, with a focus on management and governance</b> .....	13
2.2 - Supporting Utilization of Transfers to Schools and Districts (MoEC) .....	13
2.3 - Support to Strengthen the Education Ecosystem in Indonesia (MoEC). .....	14
2.4 – Technical Assistance on Demand (MoEC).....	15
2.6 – Education Assessment & Financing .....	15
2.8 – Madrasah Management and Student Assessment System (MoRA).....	16
2.9 – MoEC Dapodik & MoRA Data Reliability Assessment.....	17
2.10 – DKI Jakarta Teacher Performance Pay Study of Existing Initiatives. ....	18
2.11 – Infrastructure and Learning Complements Study .....	18
<b>IV. SUMMARY OF PROGRESS</b> .....	19
<b>A. Progress Against Key Performance Indicator Targets</b> .....	19
<b>B. Summary of Progress: ID-TEMAN Lifetime</b> .....	23
<b>C. Lessons Learned / Challenges</b> .....	28
<b>D. Financial Progress</b> .....	29
<b>E. Collaboration with DFAT and DFAT-funded programs</b> .....	29
<b>F. ID-TEMAN Monitoring and Evaluation Activities</b> .....	30
<b>V. COMMUNICATIONS STRATEGY: IMPLEMENTATION</b> .....	30
<b>VI. Transition to Australia World Bank Indonesia Partnership Trust Fund (ABIP)</b> .....	35

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### PROGRESS REPORT ID-TEMAN

<b>Program Title</b>	Improving Dimensions of Teaching, Education Management, and Learning Environment (ID-TEMAN)
<b>Reference No.</b>	World Bank TF 072611 (start date: May 4 <sup>th</sup> , 2016; closing date: December 31, 2020; AUD 9,000,000; USD 6,612,000.01)
<b>Reporting Period</b>	July 1, 2019 to December 2020. This report also discusses progress throughout the lifetime of ID-TEMAN (May 2, 2016 – December 2020)
<b>Objective</b>	Contribute to strengthening the enabling environment for teaching and learning as well as governance, autonomy, and accountability of education actors at the school, local, and central government levels in Indonesia.
<b>Relevance</b>	<p>The trust fund (TF) activities are closely aligned with the objectives of the Government of Indonesia (GoI) in the education sector. On July 15, 2019, during his first speech since being re-elected as President of the Republic of Indonesia, President Joko Widodo affirmed his priority for the nation—“We want to put our priority on human capital development. Human capital development will be key to Indonesia’s future.”<sup>1</sup> As a cornerstone of human capital, education has been a central part to the Indonesian government’s development agenda.</p> <p>Over the last 15 years, Indonesia has introduced comprehensive education reforms including a constitutional mandate to allocate at least 20 percent of the annual budget to education. While this has supported increases in enrollment—including a 28% increase in senior secondary enrollment between 2010 and 2018—it has led to only minimal improvements in student learning. After experiencing improvements in all three PISA subject areas between 2012 and 2015, Indonesia’s 2018 Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) scores in Reading, Math, and Science decreased by 26 points, 7 points, and 7 points, respectively, compared to in 2015. The World Bank’s Learning Poverty Indicator also shows that 35 percent of children in Indonesia are unable to read and understand a short, age-appropriate text by age 10. Furthermore, due to school closures as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, the World Bank estimates that, on average, students have lost roughly half a year’s worth of learning between the end of March 2020 and the end of September 2020.<sup>2</sup></p> <p>There are multiple drivers of this low level of learning. These include children entering school unprepared to learn, a teacher workforce with low levels of subject knowledge and pedagogic skill, and a decentralized education system whose diverse actors have variable levels of commitment and ability to address the crisis in learning. Teachers lack essential tools for improving student learning, including a clear and focused curriculum and aligned student assessments to identify which students are not mastering the material and skills. For students who enroll in tertiary education, the programs of study are weakly aligned with job-</p>

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://www.straitstimes.com/asia/se-asia/jokowi-to-shift-focus-to-developing-indonesian-talent>

<sup>2</sup> <https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/indonesia/publication/estimates-of-covid-19-impacts-on-learning-and-earning-in-indonesia-how-to-turn-the-tide>

market needs, in part because the financing and performance metrics for the sector are not clearly focused on quality and relevance.

In light of these concerns, the Minister of Education and Culture, Nadiem Makarim, and Minister of Religious Affairs, Fachrul Razi, have both committed to undertaking key reforms to improve student learning in Indonesia. In particular, the Ministry of Education and Culture released a package of reforms titled "*Merdeka Belajar*" (Freedom to Learn) aimed at: i) providing teachers and schools with more freedom in assessing student's learning results, ii) replacing the current National Examination with a Minimum Competency Assessment/Testing and Character Survey, iii) simplifying lesson plan development (Rancangan Perencanaan Pembelajaran/RPP) to give teachers more time to prepare and evaluate the learning process instead of spending time to prepare lesson plans, and iv) increasing the flexibility of student enrollment at the school level. In reaction to the COVID-19 pandemic, both have also implemented the necessary measures and initiatives to work to ensure quality home-based learning.

To support the Government's agenda on education, this TF leveraged the WB's engagement across government to strengthen the knowledge base of the Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC) and the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MoRA). It enabled the World Bank to support the Government in identifying solutions to address education challenges and to support human capital growth, linked to economic growth and economic mobility. Improvements of teaching and learning environments and governance in basic education are essential for students to develop the knowledge and skills that will equip them for the job market and allow them to contribute to their communities and the broader economy.

**Summary of Key  
End of Program  
Outcomes (EOPO)  
Achieved**

**EOPO1: Education planning and budgeting policies are improved at the national, sub-national and school levels.** Over the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, the team realized significant progress towards EOPO 1. In particular, the team supported the design and implementation of the performance-based School Operational Assistance Grant (BOS *Kinerja*) which marks an important step towards improved planning and budgeting for results. Additionally, MoEC and MoRA are actively reforming planning and budgeting policies through the implementation of electronic performance-based school planning and budgeting systems throughout all schools and madrasas in Indonesia<sup>3</sup>. Furthermore, under the MoRA operation<sup>4</sup>, the Ministry has committed USD 31.8 million to strengthening server infrastructure, disaster recovery capacities, development of Education Management Information System (EMIS) regulations defining common identification codes, establishment of core data architecture, and more, all of which will help to improve education planning and budgeting at the national, sub-national, and school levels.

**EOPO2: Teacher governance framework and in particular, improved teacher training, deployment and accountability policies are improved.** Over the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, the team supported the Ministry of Education and Culture in its efforts to scale up its continuous professional development (CPD) program for teachers, supported the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education to reform pre-service teacher education, and provided

---

<sup>3</sup> MoEC has adopted ARKAS (*Aplikasi Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Sekolah*), a similar tool to e-RKAS (*Rencana Kerja dan Anggaran Berbasis Elektronik*), while MoRA is expanding e-RKAM (*Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Madrasah Berbasis Elektronik*)

<sup>4</sup> The MoRA operation refers to the Ministry's USD 250 million project designed to improve the management of primary and secondary education services of schools under its purview.

MoEC with key evidence as it seeks to reform teacher accountability policies. Today, in the MoRA operation, the Ministry has started to take the necessary steps to strengthen and expand access to peer working groups for teachers and education personnel, access to quality face-to-face in-service training delivered by Central and Regional training centers, and to design and develop key in-service training courses, resources, and materials in identified areas of need. Furthermore, MoRA is revising continuous professional development (CPD) modules and reviewing relevant policies to ensure that teachers, supervisors, and directors are receiving quality training, which is expected to benefit over 150,000 teachers and education personnel.

**EOPO3: Policies for student learning measurement are improved.** Over the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, the team supported MoEC to reform its student assessment program in several ways, one of which includes providing technical assistance to include collaborative problem solving (CPS) into AKSI/INAP (Indonesian National Assessment Program). Additionally, the Ministry of Education’s “Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035” policy document includes the establishment of “Minimum Competency Assessment (AKM)” that measures school performance based on student literacy & numeracy, in addition to core competencies for international tests such as Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA), Trends in International Mathematics and Science Study (TIMSS), and Progress in International Reading Literacy Study (PIRLS) for grade 5, with a focus on using that information to inform instruction—a key recommendation of the Flagship report. Furthermore, MoEC and MoRA are developing a new national student learning assessment framework; this will include the development of new test items, validation of results, and the development of diagnostic tools for teachers and school directors to understand the results, all of which will be supported by the WB education team through the Australia World Bank Indonesia Partnership Trust Fund.

#### **Finances**

As of December 17, 2020, all funds within the trust fund have been expended.

#### **Communications Strategy: Development and Implementation**

During the reporting period, the World Bank team implemented communications activities in consultation with DFAT. The following includes several highlights of the activities completed under the strategy: i) The Promise of Education in Indonesia Virtual Launch to present key policy recommendations from three major ID-TEMAN reports – The Promise of Education in Indonesia (Flagship report); Measuring the Quality of MoRA’s Education Services (Service Delivery Indicator Survey); and Revealing How Indonesia’s Subnational Governments Spend their Money on Education (Subnational Education Public Expenditure Review), ii) the launch of the Flagship Overview soon after the new Government was inaugurated in November 2019, iii) publication of a Subnational Review of Gender Gaps and Children with Disabilities on gender and social inclusion, blog and presenting the findings at the INOVASI gender and social inclusion event: “Online Discussion: Inspiring Practice and Policy Support to Inclusive Learning, Especially During the COVID Pandemic”, iv) MoRA Research Series discussions on ID-TEMAN reports with representatives from the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MoRA), Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC), National Development Planning Agency (*Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional*, Bappenas) and the Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform (*Kementerian Pemberdayaan Aparatur Negara dan Reformasi Birokrasi*, Kementerian-PANRB), and iv) the publication of the EdTech landscape survey (EdTech in Indonesia: Ready for Takeoff) and an accompanying blog.

As a result of the COVID-19 pandemic, many of the dissemination events during the reporting period became virtual events. Nevertheless, the events were well attended by members of

Government and other stakeholders in the education system, all of whom were very engaged in the reports and recommendations presented.

## I. INTRODUCTION

In May 2016, the World Bank and the Government of Australia, through the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT), established the *Improving Dimensions of Teaching, Education Management and Learning Environment* (ID-TEMAN) Trust Fund (TF 072611). The Government of Australia provided the sum of AUD 9,000,000 (US\$6,612,000) for the Trust Fund. The TF builds on the World Bank's engagement across the Indonesian government and leverages our global expertise and prior analytical work conducted in collaboration with the Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC) over the last decade. The activities under the TF focus on analytical studies and technical assistance, in order to provide support and evidence-based recommendations for the government to achieve its medium-term development plan targets.

Education is a central part of the Indonesian government's development agenda and it has achieved commendable progress over the years. Since the early 2000s, Indonesia has implemented a broad range of education reforms, including decentralizing much of the education system, improving the achievement of teacher qualifications, and increasing education spending, up 200 percent in real terms from 2002 to 2018 (World Bank calculation). These reforms have expanded access to education, particularly among disadvantaged children. Since 2000, the total enrollment of students has increased by more than 10 million (25 percent), mostly in secondary education; between 2002 and 2017, enrollment of youth ages 16–18 increased from 50 percent to 71 percent.

While major progress has been made in the education sector, the sector faces important challenges in terms of providing *quality* education. According to the 2020 Human Capital Index, while an Indonesian child can expect to complete 12.4 years of school by her 18th birthday, after factoring in what children *actually* learn, expected years of learning is only 7.8 years. Additionally, the Bank's Learning Poverty indicator reveals that there is a learning crisis; 35 percent of children age 10 in Indonesia are not able to read. Confirming the overall trend, the latest 2018 PISA results for 15-year-olds show low levels of learning, and a decreasing trend compared to 2015 results. Additionally, the average national score for 12th grade students on a 100-point scale on the country's 2019 national exam, or UN (Ujian Nasional) was 50.4, below the minimum passing score of 55.

While the Government of Indonesia (GoI) continues to invest significant resources in the education sector, the efficiency of this spending needs to be improved to deliver higher levels of student learning. This trust fund enables the WB to expand the data analysis and evidenced-based policy recommendations available to the Indonesian government. With these challenges in mind, and building on the existing analytical work done by the World Bank, MoEC, MoRA and other Development Partners (DPs), the TF's activities are focused on addressing implementation challenges in the education sector, particularly those related to improved efficiency and effectiveness.

The activities mentioned in this report were conducted between July 1, 2019 and December 2020 under two pillars: (i) Pillar 1: Support to Effective Teaching and Learning, with a specific focus on teacher competencies; and (ii) Pillar 2: Support to Improve Efficient Delivery of Education for All, with a focus on management and governance.

In addition to reporting on the activities conducted in the aforementioned reporting period, this report also provides an overview of ID-TEMAN's activities according to the End of Program Outcomes (EPOOs).

Unless stated otherwise, throughout the report, the "WB team" refers to the Education team of the World Bank Jakarta office.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> While the number of team members changed over time as a function of activity needs, there were on average six World Bank staff members working on Trust Fund activities at any given time, in addition to a number of short- and longer-term specialist consultants.

## II. DESCRIPTION

### A. Project Overview

#### 1. Objective

The objective of the ID-TEMAN TF is to contribute to strengthening the enabling environment for teaching and learning and governance, autonomy, and accountability of education actors at school, local, and central government levels in Indonesia.

To track overall progress towards the objective, the World Bank measures achievement towards three End of Program Outcomes (EOPOs):

- EOPO 1: Improved education planning and budgeting policies at national, sub-national and school levels
- EOPO 2: Improved Teacher Governance Framework and in particular, improved teacher training, deployment and accountability policies
- EOPO3: Improved national-level policies for student learning measurement (student assessment and skills).

#### 2. The ID-TEMAN Pillars

To achieve its objective, two pillars of interventions are defined as follows:

- Pillar 1: Support to effective teaching and learning processes, with a specific focus on teacher competencies
- Pillar 2: Support to improve the efficient delivery of education for all, with a focus on management and governance

These pillars and sub-pillars are presented in Table 1.

**Table 1. ID-TEMAN Activities - Status Update (CRP refers to Current Reporting Period)**

Pillar 1 - Support to effective teaching and learning processes, with a specific focus on teacher competencies	Status Update
1.1 Support the strengthening of teacher continuous professional development (CPD) (MoEC) a) Strengthening of Mathematics Teacher CPD b) Strengthening of Science Teacher CPD	Completed in FY19
1.2 Support the strengthening of teacher pre-service education (MoEC & MoRTHE)	Completed in FY19
1.3 Situational analysis of teacher pre-service education (with a focus on the Teacher Professional Education or PPG ( <i>Pendidikan Profesi Guru</i> ) program <sup>6</sup> (MoEC & MoRTHE)	Completed in FY18
1.4 Implementation of Law No. 14/2005 on Teachers and Lecturer (Teacher Policies Rapid Assessment) <sup>7</sup> (MoEC)	Completed in FY18
1.5 Student Learning Profiles Study - What children learn in a year in school (MoEC)	Completed in FY18

<sup>6</sup> As regulated by the the Law No. 14/2005 on Teachers and Lecturers, pre-service teacher education consists of *Sarjana Pendidikan (S1/D4, a four-year tertiary education)* and a *one-year Pendidikan Profesi Guru (PPG)*.

<sup>7</sup> According to the agreed workplan FY17, this sub-pillar consists of two activities: (i) Rapid assessment of implementation of Teacher Law; and (ii) Integrated Teacher Professional Management System (TPMS), which covers how teacher performance and competence are integrated with their payment/salary. Please note that this activity is not implemented under this sub-pillar but it is partly covered under sub-pillar 1.1 (technical inputs for teacher competency improvements) and sub-pillar 2.3 (Kiat Guru). The results of KIAT-GURU Scoping survey would eventually inform the integration of performance management with payment system.

1.6 Landscape Survey of EdTech (MoEC)	Completed in CRP
1.7 Gender and Social Inclusion Analysis (MoEC & MoRA)	Completed in CRP
1.8 In-Service Teacher Training Capacity Assessment (MoRA) [formerly Teacher Workforce Management Analysis]	Completed in CRP
1.9 Indonesian Education Flagship	Completed in CRP
<b>Pillar 2 - Support to improve the efficient delivery of education for all, with a focus on management and governance</b>	
2.1 Efficient Deployment of Teachers Study (MoEC & MoABR)	Completed in FY18
2.2 Supporting Utilization of Transfers to Schools and Districts (MoEC)	
a) Knowledge Brief: Supporting Effective Utilization of Transfers to Schools	Completed in FY18
b) Pilot of e-RKAS, Implementation and Evaluation	Completed in CRP
c) BOS Kinerja Technical Assistance	Completed in FY19
2.3 Support to Strengthen the Education Ecosystem in Indonesia (MoEC)	
a) System Assessment for Better Education Results (SABER) tool for school autonomy and accountability	Completed in FY18
b) KIAT Guru Support (Urban Pilot)	Completed in FY19
c) Sub-national Public Expenditure Review (PER)	Completed in CRP
2.4 Technical Assistance on Demand (MoEC)	
a) Support to RPJMN	Completed in FY19
b) Sub-national Budgeting Classification	Completed in CRP
2.5 Education Information System design (MoRA)	Completed in FY19
2.6 Education Assessment and Financing	
a) Student Assessment System Capacity Building (Workshop on Collaborative Problem Solving) (MoEC)	Completed in FY19
b) Service Delivery Indicator (SDI) & Madrasah Management Study Survey (MoRA)	Completed in CRP
2.7 Review of Management of Teachers of Religion (MoRA)	Completed in FY19
2.8 Madrasah Management and Student Assessment System (MoRA)	
a) Pilot of e-RKAM, Implementation	Completed in CRP
b) Review of Islamic Higher Education	Completed in CRP
2.9 MoEC Dapodik & MoRA Data Reliability Assessment	Completed in CRP
2.10 DKI Jakarta Teacher Performance Pay Study of Existing Initiatives (MoEC)	Completed in CRP
2.11 Infrastructure and Learning Complements Study (Bappenas)	Completed in CRP

Note: FY17 refers to July 1, 2016 – June 30, 2017; FY18: July 1, 2017—June 30, 2018; FY19: July 1, 2018—June 30, 2019; and FY20: July 1, 2019 – End of Trust Fund.

### III. Activity Summaries and Implementation Progress

During the current reporting period, the World Bank team used ID-TEMAN funds to finalize remaining activities. The activities also supported continuous technical dialogue with representatives of the MoEC and MoRA as well as sub-national governments (i.e. local education offices, among others) and other concerned ministries. Below is a summary of activities and implementation progress under the ID-TEMAN TF.

Overall government engagement is very high and WB teams meet with MoEC, MoRA, MoF and Bappenas very frequently. On average, the team met with the MoEC and MoRA ministers quarterly, for roughly two hours at a time. This was complemented with regular meetings between the team and Echelon 1-3 officials on a weekly basis. Although the COVID-19 pandemic prevented in-person meetings as of March 2020, the team remained engaged with GoI counterparts through virtual meetings at the E1, 2 and 3 level. Government demand for activities is also high and as the TF closes and the World Bank office transitions to the Australia-World Bank Indonesia Partnership (ABIP), the team will work to build on the progress made under the ID-TEMAN TF.

**Pillar 1: Support to effective teaching and learning processes, with a specific focus on teacher competencies**

### 1.6 – Landscape Survey of EdTech (MoEC)

This activity was designed to better understand ICT4E (ICT for education or ‘ed tech’) firm characteristics in the Indonesian market that have high potential to contribute to improving learning outcomes, but are currently constrained due to capital, regulatory or other constraints. More broadly, the activity was also designed to describe the Indonesian ICT4E landscape in terms of products, services and market share. These education products and services may be designed for national, sub-national, school, teacher, student or parent use. In terms of government engagement, the team consulted extensively with directors at both MoRA and MoEC (Pustekkom Kemdikbud, Center for Data and Technology Ministry of Education and Culture). The directors provided key inputs during the design phase and have been highly interested in the study and its implications for policy.

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, published the [report](#) in May 2020. Preceding the publication, the WB team presented findings of the report to EdTech firms and stakeholders in October 2019; there, a lively discussion was held on the report’s initial findings, challenges, and possible solutions, many of which were incorporated into the final report. Results of the study have also been shared in other fora on an on-demand basis, for example at *EdTechAsia*’s Education Innovation Seminar on July 13, 2020 and the Beijing Education Technology Conference in November 2019.

To date, the WB team has used the report’s findings and recommendations to advise the Government of Indonesia and evidence of uptake is already available, especially given the shift to home-based learning as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. One clear finding in the report was that comprehensive online learning was not feasible even for students with high-speed internet connections and relevant devices during COVID-related school closures. This became a key data point for the team’s recommendation to MoEC to initiate Educational TV programming, which was eventually implemented. In early April 2020, MoEC began working with TVRI (Indonesia’s public television network) to air full-day education programs titled *Belajar dari Rumah* (Study from Home).<sup>8</sup>

Furthermore, the report and its findings have already and will continue to have an impact on World Bank operations. The EdTech study supported the design of the World Bank’s operational pipeline, while also directly informing the proposed research agenda of the WB for the EdTech sector for FY20-22, as well as the Country Private Sector Diagnostic of the WB and IFC (2019). Additionally, the team is using the report’s findings to design the impact evaluation of online teacher training funded by the Australia-Indonesia World Bank (ABIP) Trust Fund, along with World Bank and other resources. Going forward, the team will continue to engage with stakeholders on this topic to maximize the impacts of the report’s findings and recommendations.

### 1.7 – Gender and Social Inclusion Analysis (MoEC & MoRA).

This activity aimed to promote equality and inclusion in education-sector operations as there is limited high-quality evidence on issues of gender and children with disabilities in Indonesia’s education system. To accomplish this, the WB team assessed the gaps in enrolment and performance based on gender and disability in Indonesia. The analysis used existing datasets including the National Social Economic Household Survey (Susenas), National Labor Force Survey (Sakernas), Indonesia Family Life Survey (IFLS), Dapodik, EMIS, and the 2010 Population Census to collect gender-disaggregated data on student enrollment rates and the composition of teacher and administrative staff workforce. Additionally, the team conducted field visits to districts in East Java and South Kalimantan in October 2018 to interview local government education officers, MoRA provincial-level and district-level education officers, and school and *madrasah* principals in an effort to uncover drivers of gender differences, as well as issues of social inclusion. Interviews were also held with officials from MoEC, MoRA, and the Ministry of Women’s Empowerment and Child Protection (one official from each Ministry).

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, finalized and published the [report](#) in June 2020 as a Working Paper under the World Bank’s Open Knowledge Repository. A [blog post](#) titled “Gender and

---

<sup>8</sup> <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2020/04/10/covid-19-tvri-to-air-educational-program-to-help-students-learn-from-home.html>

Education in Indonesia: Progress with more work to be done” was also written and published on the World Bank website ([Bahasa version](#)). The team plans to present the findings and recommendations from this report at an INOVASI-hosted event on gender and disability in December 2020.

Thus far, the World Bank has used findings from the report in high-level policy dialogue with MoEC and MoRA. In terms of direct impact, the findings and data from the report have directly informed the WB’s MoRA operation, as well as provided a baseline towards gender-related targets. More specifically, the early findings from the report helped the team to design a gender-specific component of the operation which aims to expand the pool of female candidates eligible to apply for director positions, supporting improved gender equity at key management levels. This expansion is expected to benefit roughly 350 female public-school director candidates, representing a significant increase from the current number of female participants for such training. While the exact number of women participating in training for director candidacy is not tracked by MoRA, the Pusdiklat report providing preparatory training for 90 director candidates in 2018 noted that fewer than one-third were women. In September 2020, findings of the report were also used to inform the gender-focused group discussion on the requirements and qualifications of madrasah principal candidates.

### **1.8 – In-Service Teacher Training Capacity Assessment (MoRA) [formerly Teacher Workforce Management Analysis].**

The purpose of this activity was to assess in-service training institutions and programs for *madrasah* teachers, directors, and supervisors in public and private schools of MoRA, as these groups currently have limited access to quality in-service teacher education and capacity building. This activity was intended to inform the development of MoRA’s fully-fledged capacity building plan for teachers, directors, and supervisors working under the Ministry (from both public and private institutions). GoI counterparts for this assessment include the Guru dan Tenaga Kependidikan (GTK) Directorate within MoRA and Pusdiklat (agency responsible for in-service teacher training under MoRA).

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, finalized the report after presenting draft results to GTK and Pusdiklat in late 2019, and then published the [report](#) in June 2020. Findings of the report were again presented at a virtual event hosted by MoRA in early June; participants of the event included officials from the GTK Directorate, Pusdiklat, KSKK Directorate, Bappenas, and members of the development community.

Findings of the report have directly informed the ‘Realizing Education’s Promise’ operation, particularly Component 3: Continuous professional development for teachers and education personnel of MoRA schools. This component is financing the expansion of opportunities for teachers and education personnel to participate in in-service training, in addition to improving the quality of training and strengthening the regulatory environment around its implementation. Overall, this component is expected to support training for over 150,000 teachers and education personnel, which includes directors and supervisors of MoRA schools. To ensure strong impact of the report and the operation, the WB team has secured two years’ worth of funding under ABIP to run technical and capacity-strengthening workshops to support MoRA.

There is evidence that the Government of Indonesia is implementing reforms directly in line with the report’s recommendations. Early evidence of improved teacher training can be seen in revisions to the CPD modules by GTK that consider recommendations made. Review of relevant policies has also begun that should lead to policy changes during the WB MORA project, which will strengthen the Teacher Governance Framework. Although the project is in its early phases of implementation and despite the disruptions caused by COVID-19, there is clear planning evidence to indicate that MoRA will scale up its CPD models significantly; the Ministry is, for example, already exploring greater use of blended and online learning to mitigate the effects of COVID-19.

Going forward, the WB team will provide ongoing supervision of, and technical support for, implementation of the MoRA project, which will help to ensure the continued uptake of the report’s key recommendations.

## 1.9 – Indonesia Education Flagship

The Indonesian Education Flagship report synthesized existing research from the World Bank, development organizations including DFAT partners, local experts and institutions and new analyses, and provides policy implementation recommendations to improve the performance of the Indonesian education system. It followed the WDR 2018, “Learning to Realize Education’s Promise” and the regional flagship, “Growing Smarter: Learning and Equitable Development in East Asia and the Pacific.” To complete this activity, the team consulted extensively with development partners including UNICEF, INOVASI, DFAT, and several others.

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, launched an overview of the [report](#) in November 2019 at the Ministry of Education and Culture. Taking place soon after the second inauguration of President Jokowi Widodo and the Cabinet in late October, the timely event allowed the WB team to immediately inform and influence new policymakers. The overview was launched by the World Bank’s Global Director of Education and involved a lively discussion on key findings with MoEC’s Head of Bureau of Research and Development, the Director General of Early Childhood Education and Community Education, and the Director General of Teachers and Education Personnel. The event was attended by 146 stakeholders including development partners and government officials of MoRA, MoEC, and Bappenas, in addition to generating top-tier media coverage (15 news articles)<sup>9</sup>. After the event, policy recommendations from the Overview were provided and discussed directly with the Minister of Education and Culture, as well as the Minister of Religious Affairs in their meetings with the World Bank Global Director for Education, to help inform their initial strategies.

The team also presented the full version of the Flagship [report](#) at the World Bank’s Virtual Launch: The Promise of Education in Indonesia in November 2020. The two day event garnered roughly 700 participants and 600 live stream viewers, including government officials from the Ministry of Education and Culture, Ministry of Religious Affairs, Ministry of Finance, National Development Planning Agency, Coordinating Ministry for Human Development and Cultural Affairs, and Ministry of Home Affairs from across Indonesia from both central and subnational levels. Both Minister Nadiem Makarim and Minister Fachrul Razi attended the event, and the event generated top-tier media coverage (42 media articles)<sup>10</sup>.

Thus far, findings of the report and its recommendations have provided key inputs into other WB analytic activities and operations, while also serving as a key reference for government officials and stakeholders. More specifically, findings and recommendations from the Flagship were used in the team’s [Turning the Tide paper](#), which outlines the impact of COVID-19 on the education sector in Indonesia. Furthermore, the Flagship is also helping to drive the formulation of the education section of the forthcoming World Bank-Indonesia Country Partnership Framework. The Government of Indonesia has also acknowledged the impact and usefulness of the report, as evidenced by comments made by both Minister Nadiem and Ministry Razi:

Minister Nadiem: “Thank you to the World Bank for the report. This is an amazing report. I’ve read it all. There’s a lot of good input, more insights, some of which have already been included in our plans. We will continue to study the report and its recommendations and see which we can implement.”

Minister Razi: ““I would like to give the highest appreciation to the World Bank for their contribution through various studies and various research to provide input, and even criticisms and corrections to our Government to help us in our effort to realize the promise of education.”

The Ministry of Education and Culture has included several of the Flagship’s recommendations in its Peta Jalan Sistem Pendidikan, or “Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035”, policy document, which sets the major objectives for the government in education; prior to the release of the policy document, the WB team discussed these recommendations extensively during its engagement with MoEC officials. Examples of Flagship recommendations in the policy document include:

---

<sup>9</sup> Media links sent to DFAT on November 25, 2019.

<sup>10</sup> Media links sent to DFAT on December 11, 2020.

- **Student Assessment.** The Flagship recommends the Government to “Implement a national assessment in 4th or 5th grade to provide information to the district and central government about student learning outcomes in primary school” focused on literacy and numeracy and other core competencies. This major recommendation is reflected in the Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035 policy document, which includes the establishment of “Minimum Competency Assessment (AKM) that measures school performance based on student literacy & numeracy, core competencies for international tests such as PISA, TIMSS, and PIRLS” for grade 5, with a focus on using that information to inform instruction. Implementation of this has already begun by both MoEC and MoRA, with direct technical support from WB teams financed by ID-TEMAN. This support has included inputs into sampling design, question design, and results analytics preparation.
- **Teacher Recruitment/Quality of Pre-service.** The Flagship recommends the Government to “Strengthen recruitment processes for all teacher types to ensure only the highest qualified candidates work with children” and specifically “Subject knowledge of the subject(s) to be taught can be one of the main requirements for teachers hired into new and vacant PNS posts.” The Roadmap for Indonesian Education identifies a new “Entrance Exam” with four components including a “Content Exam” which will explicitly test subject knowledge of aspiring teachers for the subjects to be taught. MoEC DG of teachers has repeatedly cited WB evidence in the formulation of the teacher recruitment reform, and reform is expected to be rolled out in the next six months.
- **Technical and Vocational Education and Training.** The Flagship recommends the Government to “Increase learning for employment” with the high-level recommendation to “Establish a governance structure to guide the overall skills development system with strong participation of the private sector. This structure can set priorities in terms of labor market needs and future expectations.” The Roadmap for Indonesian Education has the high-level goal of “Vocational education collaboration model that includes 'marriage' with industry/world of work” and describes a labor-market information system tool to be designed together with entrepreneurs and industry associations.

Going forward, the team will continue to ensure uptake of recommendations in the Flagship report by continuing to use it as a key reference document when engaging with the Government and other relevant stakeholders, given its very comprehensive analysis of the Education sector. Already, it has been an often-cited source in high-level meetings with government at the Ministerial and Echelon 1 and Echelon 2 levels, for policy advice and data.

**Pillar 2: Support to improve the efficient delivery of education for all, with a focus on management and governance**

## **2.2 - Supporting Utilization of Transfers to Schools and Districts (MoEC)**

The activities under this pillar involve technical support to link education-related inter-governmental transfers (e.g., BOS - School Operational Assistance and Infrastructure DAK - Special Allocation Fund) to schools meeting the national education standards, in addition to the tracking of such transfers.

### ***2.2b – Pilot of e-Planning and Budgeting System (e-RKAS), Implementation and Evaluation***

This activity involved piloting, implementing, and evaluating the e-Planning and Budgeting System (e-RKAS) under MoEC. Reforming the current RKAS (school annual budget plan) development systems to the electronic performance-based school planning and budgeting (e-RKAS – *elektronik-Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Sekolah*) is expected to improve the ease of use for schools and increase coordination across levels to better track education spending. The system also provides increased transparency at the local, provincial and central level of government to monitor the school planning, budgeting, and reporting process. This approach was first developed in Surabaya through the self-initiative of the local Education office (*Dinas Pendidikan*) and in DKI

Jakarta with the support of the World Bank. The team's main counterparts for this activity are the Directorate General of Basic and Secondary Education for the development of the e-RKAS application, and district and provincial Education Offices for the implementation of the e-RKAS pilot.

In this reporting period, the WB team finalized and published the [e-RKAS evaluation report](#). The report examines the successes and challenges of the process of scaling up the e-RKAS system, with the goal of helping MoEC to better understand what behavior changes are required in order to effectively implement the system. The report also analyzes which models for delivering assistance have the best results in terms of uptake and use. Overall, the evidence is not yet strong enough to conclude that the pilot is successful. There are still various implementation challenges that need to be addressed, and an additional evaluation in the future may help to determine the effectiveness of the tool.

After the team's successful implementation support in Surabaya and DKI Jakarta, in addition to the partly online RKAS system in Gunung Kidul, MoEC and MoHA requested WB advice on how to implement a nationwide system. In 2018, MoEC developed ARKAS, a modified version of e-RKAS, that could be scaled nationwide, including in areas with either no or low internet connectivity. Then, in 2019, MoHA introduced a fully online application named *Sisystem Informasi Pengelolaan BOS* (SIPBOS or BOS management information system), which allows subnational governments and schools to plan, monitor, and report BOS expenditures. Furthermore, due to its success for MoEC schools, MoRA has now adopted a similar tool, e-RKAM (*Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Madrasah Berbasis Elektronik*) for madrasahs under its management.

While school officials agreed that using e-RKAS would lead to more timely school development, greater ease in determining activities and setting priorities, more accurate budgeting, and more transparent financial reports, they also reported several implementation challenges regarding training and complexity of the system. Going forward, the team plans to disseminate findings of the report to MoEC, MoRA, and MoHA, and other relevant stakeholders in January 2021.

## 2.3 - Support to Strengthen the Education Ecosystem in Indonesia (MoEC).

The goal of this sub-pillar is to strengthen the education ecosystem in Indonesia.

### *2.3c – Subnational Public Expenditure Review (PER).*

The objective of this study was to identify how districts and provinces invest education resources, and whether they look for synergies in the use of resources from different sources. In Indonesia, districts and provinces manage 63 percent of the broad education budget and 90 percent of the MOEC system-related education budget. Nonetheless, there is little systematic knowledge on how districts and provinces use these resources due to lack of alignment in financial reporting (an issue which is being addressed through activity 2.4b, described below).

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, finalized and published the report in September 2020. In May 2020, the team also presented the report's key findings and recommendations to DFAT and implementing partners including INOVASI, TASS, KOMPAK, and Prospera. In November 2020, the team then presented the Subnational PER report to officials at the Ministry of Finance, and at the World Bank's Virtual Launch: The Promise of Education in Indonesia.

To date, several findings of the study have been used as inputs to the Education Public Expenditure Review chapter in the [Spending for Better Results report](#) published in June 2020. Recommendations from this report as well as the Education Public Expenditure Review chapter have supported the government in its policy decisions—in the proposed RAPBN 2021 released by the Ministry of Finance in August 2020, the government included various mechanisms to strengthen the accountability of subnational expenditures and has implemented performance-based budgeting for subnational transfers.

## 2.4 – Technical Assistance on Demand (MoEC).

The aim of this sub-pillar is to provide continuous and on-demand support to MoEC’s objective of efficient delivery of 12 years of quality education.

### *2.4b – Sub-national Budgeting Classification*

For this activity, the WB Education team collaborated with the WB Governance team to provide analytical support for improved education budget classification and chart of accounts. Specifically, the team analyzed the Ministry of Home Affairs’s (MOHA) new Chart of Accounts (CoA) regulation as promulgated in PerMenDagri 90 of 2019 (PMD 90/19) and its perceived impact on districts. This activity was initiated after a preliminary assessment of the regulation revealed that despite the overwhelming comprehensiveness of the new CoA, various issues were apparent.

During the current reporting period, the team interviewed government officials at MoEC, in addition to conducting key informant interviews with government officials from Bogor and Semarang to gather initial thoughts on MoHA’s new regulation and perceived impacts. Additionally, the team conducted a review of international “best practices” and experiences for CoAs. Findings and recommendations from the analysis were then compiled and included as part of the Subnational Public Expenditure Review (activity 2.3c).

Going forward, the key findings and recommendations derived from this activity will be key to advising MoEC as it seeks to analyze fiscal priorities of subnational governments. The information will also help MoEC to work together with MoHA to improve the CoA regulation such that it is not only comprehensive, but also provides valuable information for local governments and policymakers. Additionally, the report’s key findings will help the World Bank’s Governance team advise MoHA on its efforts to standardize subnational budget classification and chart of accounts, to ultimately improve quality of spending at the subnational level. The team looks forward to consulting with KOMPAK and PROSPERA in this area to maximize coordination and impact on this important multi-ministry issue, through various channels including the Basic Education Working Group (BEWG) and other meetings.

## 2.6 – Education Assessment & Financing

### *2.6b. Service Delivery Indicator (SDI) & Madrasah Management Study Survey*

This activity aimed to provide an overall assessment of the efficiency and effectiveness of *madrasahs* and schools of other religions under MoRA using two different, simultaneously implemented, tools: The World Bank SDI<sup>11</sup> and the Development - World Management Study Survey (D-WMS). The SDI examines teacher practices, teacher knowledge, student learning levels and education management practices in approximately two hundred and fifty MoRA *madrasahs*, public and private, as well as a comparator set of MoEC public schools and non-Islamic schools. Meanwhile, the D-WMS assesses the quality of management of *madrasahs* and schools throughout Indonesia. This study added modules to include an assessment on household socioeconomic background, parental motivation concerning school choice, and the socioemotional learning of children.

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, finalized and published the [report](#) in November 2020. The report was then launched at the World Bank’s Virtual Launch: The Promise of Education in Indonesia.

---

<sup>11</sup> More information on the SDI tool is available at <http://datatopics.worldbank.org/sdi/>.

To date, the activity has already had a significant impact on the World Bank's operations and other analytical work for MoRA and MoEC, and has generated a significant amount of information on the overall education system in Indonesia. For example, the high-quality data collected from both the SDI and D-WMS surveys has allowed the team to conduct key econometric analysis for the Infrastructure and Learning Complements study (activity 2.11), as well as the World Bank's analysis on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on learning in Indonesia, highlighted in the report titled "Estimates of COVID-19 Impacts on Earning and Learning in Indonesia: How to Turn the Tide." The data generated from the surveys made the analyses possible.

Going forward, the team plans to continue to disseminate key findings and recommendations from the report, as well as use the rich data from this activity to inform future operations and analytical work. Furthermore, once anonymized, the data will be shared with the Government of Indonesia and made available for public use. The team plans to encourage the Government to use the data for informed decision making and to consider implementing an additional SDI survey round in several years to measure progress and impact.

## 2.8 – Madrasah Management and Student Assessment System (MoRA).

### *2.8a – Pilot of Madrasah e-Planning and Budgeting System (e-RKAM).*

This activity involved supporting the development and pilot of an electronic madrasah planning budgeting tool (e-RKAM) for MoRA. More specifically, the team has supported MoRA in organizing multiple training workshops at the national, provincial, and district level, selecting areas for the pilot, introducing the system to selected madrasahs, and providing technical assistance as needed.

Throughout this reporting period, the team continued to support MoRA in managing the e-RKAM pilot. Specific activities included assistance to integrate the e-RKAM application into EMIS, to help ensure that all reporting is in line with BOS guidelines, and to standardize the unit cost of goods and services catalog. While MoRA had initially planned to implement e-RKAM in 17,000 madrasahs by the end of 2020, the COVID-19 pandemic has limited such efforts. As a result, by the end of 2020, roughly 3,000 madrasahs have been trained on how to use e-RKAM.

To date, the impact of this activity has been significant. As a result of the team's support for this pilot and the related e-RKAS pilot with MoEC, MoRA has formally targeted the national implementation of e-RKAM in all madrasahs in Indonesia by 2022, as part of the MoRA operation (Component 1). Under the operation, MoRA has committed USD 125 million to implement e-RKAM, and another USD 35.7 million to train schools, districts, provinces, and the national government to analyze and report data based on e-RKAM.<sup>12</sup>

Going forward, the WB education team will continue to support MoRA in implementing e-RKAM, with the support of the Australia-World Bank Indonesia Partnership (ABIP) TF.

### *2.8b – Review of Islamic Higher Education.*

Conducted at the specific request of MoRA, this activity involved a review of higher education under MoRA's authority to understand: i) current external and internal quality assurance mechanisms of Islamic Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) with a focus on a proposal to establish an independent accreditation agency for Islamic study programs; ii) funding mechanisms for Islamic HEIs within the overall higher education financing framework, including those under MoRTHE's and other line ministries' supervision; iii) policies on autonomy of

---

<sup>12</sup> For further details, please refer to the MORA Operation documents: <https://projects.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/project-detail/P168076?lang=en>

selected public Islamic HEIs compared to policies on autonomous HEIs under MoRTHE; iv) taking into account recent lessons on consolidation of private HEIs by MoRTHE, regulations on private Islamic HEIs and potential approach for consolidation and closure of poor performing institutions; and v) a literature review on graduate tracer surveys that can be relevant for MoRA. The team consulted extensively with the Director of Islamic Higher Education and the Directorate General for Islamic Education and their staff members at MoRA for interview and to gather key input in 2018 and 2019.

During the current reporting period, the team finalized the report in December 2020. Also, in the reporting period, the team organized a consultation workshop on the report in November 2019 to validate findings and policy recommendations.

Findings of the report contributed to MoRA's submission of a Tertiary Education project to BAPPENAS's Blue Book. The Blue Book, also known as the "List of Medium-Term Planned External Loans" (*Daftar Rencana Pinjaman Luar Negeri Jangka Menengah*), is a five-year plan document for external loans and provides guidelines to line ministries, agencies, local governments, SOEs, and development partners in preparing projects. Titled "Improving Quality, Relevance, and Capacity of Islamic Higher Education," the project is planned to be implemented by the Directorate Islamic Higher Education and the Directorate General of Islamic Education across all 34 provinces in Indonesia. The objective is as follows:

*"This project aims to improve the quality of learning and the relevance of Islamic Higher Education, by increasing the institutional capacity of Islamic higher educations, improving competence of faculty members by using ICT in learning, and improving access to and quality of ICT learning infrastructures. This is aligned with the 2020-2024 strategic planning of DG Islamic Education, Ministry of Religious Affairs which aims to increase productivity of lecturers in the Islamic higher education and prepare graduates with comparative advantage of international-standard learning."*

## 2.9 – MoEC Dapodik & MoRA Data Reliability Assessment.

The data reliability assessment was designed to compare the reported data in DAPODIK (MoEC) and MoRA data systems to observed data in schools (e.g. number of students, teachers). This is an essential determination as this data is linked to fiscal transfers including BOS, as well as enrollment figures and sector planning activities including infrastructure investments. This work has been the focus of another DFAT funded project - TASS (Technical Assistance for Education System Strengthening)<sup>13</sup> – and the WB worked with them to maximize collaboration.

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, finalized the report and will publish it shortly. A dissemination event for the report also took place in June 2020; participants of the event included officials from the GTK Directorate, Pusdiklat, KSKK Directorate, Bappenas, and members of the development community.

To date, findings and recommendations from the report have been used as inputs to improve the quality of education data management, a key component of the MoRA operation. The data systems-related component (component 4.1) is focused on establishing standard processes to handle diverse kinds of structured and unstructured data from different sub-systems, and to integrate them in a way that allows for efficient analysis. It also involves designing and implementing a streamlined data-sharing model across the respective data systems, underpinned by common unique identifiers for institutions, teachers, and students to ensure that data are comparable and that there are no duplicate records. The WB team has worked to disseminate the findings to

---

<sup>13</sup> TASS is supporting MoEC to conduct analyses of Dapodik data; this includes projecting the number of teachers needed, calculating school infrastructure maintenance and development costs, and other analyses related to planning overall strategic targets.

MoEC in parallel, interacting with Echelon 1, 2 and 3-level officials related to the ministry's data and information systems management.

#### 2.10 – DKI Jakarta Teacher Performance Pay Study of Existing Initiatives.

The DKI Jakarta teacher performance pay study was designed to identify both individual and group behavioral changes of the beneficiaries (teachers, principals, supervisors) of program implementation, and provide detailed information about the process of implementation including good practices and challenges. This is essential information to enable the World Bank to understand and to advise the national government on their plans to scale-up teacher performance-based pay. During discussions of performance-based pay and related incentives for teachers, policy makers often brought up the DKI experience, but were sometimes unable to agree on the design of the incentive or its impacts, since little had been published.

In this reporting period, the WB team, supported by ID-TEMAN funds, finalized the report in August 2020 (for internal use only). Some of the report's key findings include: a) most teachers, vice-principals, and principals are aware of, and understand, the policy on performance incentive allowance; b) teachers, as a whole, view the incentive scheme positively since they perceive that it serves to increase school discipline, motivates them to improve competency, and supports a competitive spirit; and c) there is no significant difference in the amount of allowance received by teachers and principals.

#### 2.11 – Infrastructure and Learning Complements Study

Initiated at the end of calendar year 2019 at the request of the Ministry of Religious Affairs and Bappenas, the study was designed to (i) examine how school infrastructure and learning complements could be better utilized to promote student learning in Indonesian schools and (ii) to help relevant ministries make more informed decisions about investments in school infrastructure and learning complements. The team collaborated with DFAT's Indonesia's School Children program (INOVASI) to identify eight schools for the study. Government counterparts for the study included Bappenas (Deputy Minister for Human Development, Community and Culture and Director for Religion, Education and Culture) as well as MoEC and MoRA.

During this reporting period, the WB team conducted a mixed methods study, which examined how school infrastructure, particularly libraries and science laboratories, and learning complements could be better utilized to promote student learning in Indonesian schools. The quantitative analyses composed of descriptive and comparative analyses of madrasah infrastructure and a multivariate analysis of madrasah infrastructure and student achievement, while the qualitative component involved semi-structured phone interviews with principals, teachers, librarians, and parents from 20 madrasah and non-madrasah schools. The 20 schools came from a total of 6 provinces (Bali, Banten, East Java, East Nusa Tenggara, Jakarta, and North Kalimantan) and included a mix of variations: education level (primary, junior secondary, and senior secondary), location (rural and urban), and operation (10 schools operating under MoRA and 10 under MoEC). The report was finalized in August 2020, and the results and findings were shared with the MoEC Directorate General of Teachers and his staff.

The findings of the [report](#), published in December 2020, will inform the project activities under Components 1 and 4 of MoRA operation. Component 1 (Nationwide implementation of electronic school-based performance budgeting system and grants to schools) supports, inter alia, the measurement of the achievement of the National Education Standards (NES) for MoRA schools; Component 4 (Strengthening of systems to support quality improvement) involves, among others, financing the strengthening of MoRA data systems, including EMIS. Two of the major findings-(i) a disconnect between pedagogical and infrastructural quality assurance mechanisms and (ii) limited availability of data related to the quality and use of physical school infrastructures and learning complements-underscored the need for more streamlined and strengthened quality assurance mechanisms. These findings and recommendation will be integrated into Components 1 and 4 by: (i) ensuring the monitoring and assessment of infrastructures and relevant assets as part of quality assurance visits and (ii) collecting a more comprehensive set of data related to infrastructure and learning complements.

Regarding government uptake, the standardization of documenting and submitting photographic evidence has been included in the business requirements document for the new EMIS, which is expected to help schools record and verify the actual conditions of their school infrastructure and learning facilities more accurately and effectively. MoECs' lead advisors for assessment design have also requested more information on the key findings and recommendations from the report to help inform their work related to school learning environments and accreditation.

#### IV. SUMMARY OF PROGRESS

##### A. Progress Against Key Performance Indicator Targets

In March 2018, the WB team developed a Theory of Change model (TOC) in consultation with DFAT, which includes the following three agreed-upon End of Program Outcomes (EOPOs):

- EOPO 1: Improved education planning and budgeting policies at national, sub-national and school levels
- EOPO 2: Improved Teacher Governance Framework and in particular, improved teacher training, deployment and accountability policies
- EOPO3: Improved national-level policies for student learning measurement (student assessment and skills).

In the reporting period, several of the TF's activities made significant progress towards the three End of Program Outcomes (EOPOs) as shown in Table 2 below.

**Table 2. ID TEMAN End of Program Outcomes (EOPOs), Intermediate Outcomes (IOs), and Outputs**

EOPOs	IOs	Outputs
1. Improved education planning and budgeting policies at national, sub-national and school levels	IO1: National, sub-national, and school stakeholders are actively reforming planning and budgeting policies.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Ministry of Education has incorporated several of the Flagship's recommendations regarding student assessment, teacher recruitment/quality of pre-service training, and technical and vocational education and training, into its "Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035" policy document.</li> <li>• While MoRA had initially planned to implement e-RKAM in 17,000 madrasahs by the end of 2020, the COVID-19 pandemic has limited such efforts. As a result, by the end of 2020, roughly 3,000 madrasahs have been trained on how to use e-RKAM. MoRA has formally targeted the national implementation of e-RKAM in all madrasahs in Indonesia by 2022 as a result of the WB team's support for this pilot and the related e-RKAS pilot with MoEC.</li> <li>• Inspired by the e-RKAS pilot, MoEC and MoHA have developed <i>ARKAS</i> and <i>SIP BOS</i>, respectively, which support electronic performance-based school planning and budgeting, even in areas with poor internet connectivity.</li> </ul>

EOPOs	IOs	Outputs
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Key findings from the Subnational Budgeting Classification activity is providing the Governance team at the World Bank and MoHA to improve its regulations on expenditure reporting, to ensure that it is not only comprehensive, but also provides valuable information for local government and policymakers.</li> <li>• Data and findings from the MoEC Dapodik &amp; MoRA Data Reliability Assessment, as well as the Infrastructure and Learning Complements Study is supporting both MoRA and MoEC to reform their policies on planning and resource allocation to improve the quality of schools and learning for students in Indonesia. Through its operation, MoRA has committed USD 31.8 million to strengthening server infrastructure, disaster recover capacities, development of EMIS regulations defining common identification codes, establishment of core data architecture, and more.</li> </ul>
<p>2. Improved Teacher Governance Framework and in particular, improved teacher training, deployment and accountability policies</p>	<p>IO2.1: MoEC is scaling up the improved CPD model</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In recent months, MoEC has identified teacher training as a priority among its key policy reforms and this is clearly stated as a goal in the Ministry’s Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035” policy document: “Teacher training based on practice” and “Improve the quality of teachers and school principals: improve recruitment systems, improve the quality of training, assessment, and develop community/learning platforms.” Building off the engagement and knowledge derived from Activity 1.1: Support the strengthening of teacher continuous professional development (CPD), completed in the previous reporting period, the WB team has discussed potential strategies regarding this reform as part of its broader dialogue with MoEC officials.</li> </ul>
	<p>IO2.2: MoRA is actively reforming teacher governance policies including teacher accountability policies</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Madrasah Management Study Survey, Review of Management of Teachers or Religion, and Review of Islamic Higher Education have all provided key policy inputs for MoRA to reform teacher governance policies. MoRA has taken into consideration these inputs and have committed to making key reforms to improve teacher governance policies in the MoRA operation. Several examples include:</li> </ul>

EOPOs	IOs	Outputs
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Strengthening and expanding access to peer working groups for teachers and education personnel</li> <li>○ Expanding access to quality face-to-face in-service training delivered by Central and Regional training centers</li> <li>○ Design and development of key in-service training courses, resources, and materials in identified areas of need.</li> <li>● The In-Service Teacher Training Capacity Assessment’s findings and recommendations are being used by MoRA. As of September 2020, MoRA is revising CPD modules and reviewing relevant policies to ensure that teachers, supervisors, and directors are receiving quality training; this is aligned with the report’s recommendations and is expected to benefit over 150,000 teachers and education personnel. MoRA is also focusing on improving the overall Teacher Governance Framework, as suggested by the Assessment.</li> </ul>
	<p>IO2.3: MoEC and MoRTHE are actively reforming Preservice Teacher Professional Education Program (Pendidikan Profesi Guru, PPG) policies</p> <p>*In the previous report period, Preservice Teacher Professional Education was under the responsibility of the Ministry of research, Technology and Higher Education (MoRTHE). This has now become the Ministry of Research and Technology / National Research and Innovation Agency.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● Key findings and data from the Service Delivery Indicator and Madrasah Management Survey is providing relevant ministries with key information on knowledge gaps among the teacher workforce. This in turn will allow policymakers to make informed decisions to reform the pre-service teacher program.</li> </ul>
	<p>IO2.4: MoEC is actively reforming teacher accountability policies</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● MoEC is working to improve teacher accountability policies, which can be seen in its Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035 policy document. Findings from ID-TEMAN survey provided inputs to KIAT Guru Phase 2 pilot design. Since mid-2019, the pilot has been implemented in 410 remote primary schools. In these schools, teachers and parents act upon joint agreements to improve learning environments at school and at home, and teacher remote area allowance is paid based on teacher’s presence in school. Early findings from</li> </ul>

EOPOs	IOs	Outputs
		<p>monitoring data indicate learning outcome of Phase 2 schools match those from Phase 1 schools, especially in schools where implementation is supported more strongly by village government and with limited external facilitation. This indicates the capacity building needed to kickstart change at the local level, along with holding schools to stronger external accountability. Today, MoEC continues to develop reforms on how teacher professional allowance can improve teacher performance. The Bank will continue to provide evidence-based policy recommendations and technical assistance, supported by USAID Local Solutions to Development Trust Fund until mid-2022.</p>
<p>3. Improved national-level policies for student learning measurement (student assessment and skills)</p>	<p>IO3.1: Gol is actively reforming student assessment</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Ministry of Education’s “Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035” policy document includes the establishment of “Minimum Competency Assessment (AKM) that measures school performance based on student literacy &amp; numeracy, core competencies for international tests such as PISA, TIMSS, and PIRLS” for grade 5, with a focus on using that information to inform instruction. This is currently being implemented and is a key recommendation of the flagship report.</li> </ul>
	<p>IO3.2: Gol is actively aligning SMK to labor market needs</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Ministry of Education has incorporated the Flagship’s recommendations on technical and vocational education and training, into its “Roadmap for Indonesian Education 2020-2035” policy document.</li> </ul>
<p>4. Mainstreamed EOPO</p>	<p>Gender equality and engagement of private sector.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The team has a gender expert that has supported the mainstreaming of gender in ID-TEMAN. Furthermore, the team works very closely with gender advisors on the Social Development team, as well as the global Education Gender Focal Point.</li> <li>The Gender and Social Inclusion Analysis report is one of few comprehensive studies on the subject in Indonesia. The team plans to share extensively the key findings and recommendations of the report, and to use them to inform operations and dialogue with government counterparts.</li> <li>The WB team engaged with EdTech firms to discuss the Landscape Survey of EdTech report, its findings, challenges, and possible solutions.</li> </ul>

## **B. Summary of Progress: ID-TEMAN Lifetime**

Since its inception on May 4th, 2016, the ID-TEMAN trust fund has since achieved its objective: to contribute to strengthening the enabling environment for teaching and learning as well as governance, autonomy, and accountability of education actors at school, local, and central government levels in Indonesia. This achievement was made possible as the trust fund's activities were continually developed, implemented, evaluated, and aligned to support the Government of Indonesia's goals in the education sector and to ensure sustainability of investments and outcomes. One key example to highlight this includes the expansion of trust fund activities of year 1 from only supporting the Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC), to the development of activities to also support the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MoRA). As a result, in 2019 MoRA committed USD 250 million, through a World Bank operation, to undertake a significant set of education-related reforms in the areas of budgeting, student assessment, continuous professional development for teachers, and strengthening data systems. This commitment highlights the impact of ID-TEMAN not only in terms of generating key evidence and recommendations for reform, but also in terms of implementation.

The following provides a more detailed explanation of the impact and achievements of ID-TEMAN towards the three End of Program Outcomes EOPOs and intermediate outcomes as discussed with DFAT.

Please note that FY17 refers to July 1, 2016 – June 30, 2017; FY18: July 1, 2017—June 30, 2018; FY19: July 1, 2018—June 30, 2019; and FY20: July 1, 2019 – End of Trust Fund.

### **EOPO 1: Improved education planning and budgeting policies at the national, sub-national and school levels**

#### **IO 1. National, sub-national, and school stakeholders are actively reforming planning and budgeting policies**

As a result of the WB's activity on supporting effective utilization of transfers to schools and districts, with support of ID-TEMAN funds, the Government of Indonesia initiated and is currently in the process of reforming planning and budgeting in schools all throughout the country. In FY17, the team undertook a review of BOS and DAK programs and identified opportunities to link transfers to schools to achieve the Minimum Service Standard (MSS) and the National Education Standard (NES). From this review, which collected data from 116 schools across 13 provinces and 13 districts, the World Bank was able to identify challenges in the implementation of performance-based school planning and budgeting, as well as policy recommendations to address them. Over the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, the World Bank has then been able to advise the Government of Indonesia and to ensure uptake of the recommendations as evidenced in the following areas:

- A.) The implementation of the performance-based School Operational Assistance Grant (Bantuan Operasional Sekolah Kinerja, BOS Kinerja) in the Ministry of Finance's Financial Note (Nota Keuangan) and the 2019 Fiscal Year State Budget Revenue and Expenditure (APBN). Throughout FY18 and FY19, the WB team supported the design of BOS Kinerja, an initiative to link BOS with several measurements of performance aimed at motivating schools to improve performance. Specifically, the team advised the Government on the program design, school selection criteria, implementation mechanism, and international experience in the implementation of performance-based incentives in other countries at the end of the reporting period. The technical support included modeling multiple variables and selection criteria which directly and positively influenced the final policy design. Today, BOS Kinerja is provided, on top of the regular BOS, to top-performing schools in Indonesia.
- B.) The adoption of e-Planning and Budgeting System (Rencana Kegiatan dan Anggaran Sekolah berbasis elektronik, e-RKAS) by the Ministry of Education and Culture (MoEC). Starting in May 2017 (FY17), the WB team provided technical assistance to MoEC as it piloted the e-RKAS in Central Java and Bali provinces,

Gorontalo and Sidrap districts, and Mojokerto municipality. Specifically, the World Bank provided support to the subnational governments' education offices to develop action plans and in FY18, held a workshop which invited stakeholders from all pilot areas to identify and discuss challenges related to e-RKAS implementation throughout all levels of government. Additionally, the team has produced an evaluation report of e-RKAS, which provides key findings and recommendations on how MoEC can improve the effectiveness of the tool. These have been shared previously and the team plans to continue advising the Ministry as it works to reform school planning and budgeting policies.

- C.) Nation-wide implementation of Rencana Kerja dan Anggaran Sekolah Penerima BOS di bawah Kemenag Berbasis Elektronik (e-RKAM). In FY18, the World Bank team supported education officials from the Ministry of Religious Affairs to develop and implement a plan to roll out e-RKAM to all MoRA schools in Indonesia. Specifically, the team supported MoRA to conduct training-of-trainers for MoRA provincial and district teams to pilot the tool in 30 madrasahs in Jombang district and 30 madrasahs in DI Yogyakarta, in addition providing on-going technical assistance to train central government officials. As a result of the team's support for the pilot and the related e-RKAS pilot with MoEC, MoRA committed to spending USD 125 million, through the WB operation, on the national implementation of e-RKAM in all primary and secondary schools under MoRA that received BOS by 2022. As a result, schools will be able to improve their planning and budgeting, and data collected by e-RKAM will enable the monitoring and provision of support for frontline service providers at the district, provincial, and central levels.

## **EOPO 2: Improved Teachers Governance Framework and, improved teacher training, deployment and accountability policies**

### **IO 2.1: MoEC is scaling up the improved CPD model**

Since the beginning of ID-TEMAN, the WB team worked closely with the Directorate General for Teachers and Education Personnel (MoEC) to provide technical advice on the Ministry's efforts to improve continuous professional development (CPD). Specifically, starting in FY17, the team provided technical inputs to strengthen the capacity of the Center for the Development and Empowerment of Teachers and Education Personnel (*Pusat Pengembangan dan Pemberdayaan Pendidik dan Tenaga Kependidikan, PPPPTK*) Mathematics and Science in the mastery of Spatial Reasoning (SR) and Inquiry Based Learning (IBL) concepts, respectively. In FY18, the team hosted a workshop for teams/lecturers of PPPPTK and participants from teacher training institutes (Lembaga Pendidikan Tenaga Keguruan, LPTK) to develop model lesson plans, teacher learning modules, and a learning management system. Additionally, the team provided technical support to the Ministry as it implemented a mini pilot to test the full cycle of CPD in Central Java in May 2018. In FY19, the team supported PPPPTK to launch e-Pensa, an online learning system for spatial reasoning as well. All support to MoEC through these activities adopted a consultative and participatory approach to ensure ownership of the discussions held and increase the likelihood of adoption of the recommendations and ideas.

Today, both MoEC and MORA are continuing to evaluate and implement strategies to improve teacher training; as a result of the WB team's efforts under ID-TEMAN in supporting CPD, the team has been requested to continue to support the Government on this agenda through ABIP. In particular, the team will design and conduct an impact evaluation of online teacher training in Indonesia, which is of key importance due to the COVID-19 pandemic. As the pandemic has demonstrated the importance of online learning modalities, the overall goal of the activity is to inform policies and programs that aims to upgrade teacher skills through both in-person and online in-service training.

### **IO 2.2: MoRA is actively reforming teacher governance policies including teacher accountability policies**

Building on activities initiated by the World Bank team, with the support of ID-TEMAN funds, the Ministry of Religious Affairs is actively improving teacher governance through reforming continuous professional development for teachers and education personnel. Initiated in FY18, activities included: i) In-Service Teacher Training Capacity Assessment, ii) the Service Delivery Indicator Survey, iii) Madrasah Management Study Survey, and iv) Review of management of teachers and supervisors of religion. As a result of these activities throughout the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, the World Bank team has been able to help build MoRA's understanding of the challenges and opportunities of its education system and has provided recommendations for key reforms. In 2019, MoRA took these recommendations and committed to several reforms relating to teacher governance through its project with the World Bank. These include:

- 1.) Strengthening and expanding access to peer working groups for teachers and education personnel
- 2.) Developing, piloting, and rollout of in-service training delivered by the Central and Regional Training Centers
- 3.) Designing and implementing key in-service training courses, resources, and materials in identified areas of need
- 4.) Capacity strengthening of key education personnel including core teachers, librarians, laboratory assistances, inclusive education teachers, and more.

Altogether, MoRA is expected to train over 150,000 teachers and education personnel from primary to senior secondary levels of MoRA schools.

### **IO 2.3: MoRTHE is actively reforming PPG policies**

Throughout the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, the team supported MoRTHE to actively reform pre-service Professional Teacher Education (PPG) policies. In FY17, the team conducted a situational analysis of pre-service teacher education for MoRTHE. After several technical and policy discussions with officials from MoRTHE, MoRA, MoEC, and teacher training institutions (LPTKs), the team produced a set of briefs and reports to describe the current state of the pre-service teacher education system, challenges faced by its stakeholders, as well as recommendations to improve its implementation and effectiveness.

Upon reviewing the recommendations, MoRTHE officials requested the support of the WB team to improve the PPG implementation manual. MoRTHE then selected twelve LPTKs throughout Indonesia to implement the improved manual. In October 2018, with the support of the HEAD foundation and coordination by DFAT and the World Bank, representatives from the twelve LPTKs participated in an immersion program in Singapore. There, they learned about how the Singaporean government conducts teacher pre-service education and about what could be improved for Indonesia. More specifically, participating LPTKs learned about Singapore's overall PPG program management, structure, content, and delivery, in addition to how the designated teacher training institute of Singapore (NIE) implements, monitors and evaluates its primary, mathematics and science teacher education programs at NIE Singapore. Representatives from the LPTKs used their experience to develop a plan for an improved PPG model that synthesizes best practices and lessons learned from the immersion program.

Today, while no longer supported by ID-TEMAN funds, the LPTKs are building off the knowledge gained through this activity and are continuing efforts to improve the strengthening of teacher pre-service education. The Directorate General of Learning and Student Affairs (DGLSA) of MoRTHE, now a part of MoEC, is currently working to ensure that its 45 designated training institutions are of high-quality; the PPG implementation manual that the WB team provided inputs to will help to ensure this.

### **IO 2.4: MoEC is actively reforming teacher accountability policies**

MoEC is currently developing reforms on how teacher professional allowance can improve teacher performance and accountability, with support from the World Bank. Findings from the ID-TEMAN survey provided inputs to KIAT Guru Phase 2<sup>14</sup> pilot design, and since mid-2019 the pilot has been implemented in 410 remote primary schools. In these schools, teachers and parents act upon joint agreements to improve learning environments at school and at home, and teacher remote area allowance is paid based on teacher's presence in school. Early findings from monitoring data indicate learning outcome of Phase 2 schools match those from Phase 1 schools, especially in schools where implementation is supported more strongly by village government and with limited external facilitation. This indicates the capacity building needed to kickstart change at the local level, along with holding schools to stronger external accountability. MoEC initially planned to pilot this approach in 50 secondary schools in urban areas using teacher certification allowance in 2020. However, the COVID-19 pandemic situation required them to shift budget allocated for this activity. Nevertheless, MoEC continues to develop reforms on how teacher professional allowance can improve teacher performance. The Bank will continue to provide evidence-based policy recommendations and technical assistance, supported by USAID Local Solutions to Development Trust Fund until mid-2022.

### **EPO3: Improved national-level policies for student learning measurement (student assessment and skills)**

#### **IO 3.1: GoI is actively reforming student assessment**

With the support of the WB team since the beginning of the ID-TEMAN trust fund, MoEC has continued to undertake reforms to improve student assessment. In FY17, the World Bank collaborated with MoEC's Balitbang/Research and Development team and Education offices on a study to (i) identify learning profiles for Indonesia by examining what skills children learn in a year in school at different grade levels, (ii) analyze the causes of 'slow learning', and (iii) identify policy options on what can be done to improve student learning and teacher quality. This study, the first known systematic analysis of Indonesian student learning profiles, identified significant challenges including overall low achievement of essential skills for future learning.

The study then led to MoEC's request for support to improve its student assessment system; in response, the World Bank team conducted a workshop in FY19 for both MoEC and MoRA officials on collaborative problem solving (CPS) as it had planned to incorporate CPS into the curriculum and AKSI/INAP (Indonesian National Assessment Program), a survey-based assessment for grade 10, in 2020. As a result of the workshop, MoEC allocated a total of IDR 250 million (USD 17,500) in research grants for 2 universities (Statistics Department of Bogor Agricultural Institute/IPB and Indonesia University of Education/UPI), which built a prototype of CPS test items for junior and senior secondary level. These test items were piloted in AKSI 2020.

While MoEC has since embarked on a new set of reforms for student assessment with its new Minister, the evidence and knowledge generated by the above-mentioned activities have put the World Bank in a strong place to support the Ministry. Already, the team has been requested to provide technical assistance to support MoEC on the development of test items, validation of results, and development of diagnostic tools for teachers and school

---

<sup>14</sup> An evaluation of KIAT Guru Phase 1 conducted by the World Bank revealed that all three mechanisms—social accountability mechanism, school accountability mechanism combined with pay for performance mechanism based on teacher presence, and school accountability mechanisms combined with pay for performance mechanism based on a broad measure of the quality of teacher service performance—led to positive and statistically significant results. The impact evaluation attributed the success of the interventions to four key elements: (a) increasing parental awareness of learning outcomes and their involvement in improving learning; (b) keeping teachers accountable through a few simple and objective performance evaluation indicators; (c) actively engaging external stakeholders in supporting, monitoring, and evaluating education service delivery; and (d) paying teacher allowance based on objective performance indicator.

directors. After the closing of ID-TEMAN, the team will continue to support MoEC on this agenda with the support of ABIP.

As a result of MoRA's involvement in the CPS workshop, in addition to broader engagement by the World Bank team, supported by ID-TEMAN, MoRA is also reforming its student assessment system. In 2019, MoRA committed USD 32.05 million to the implementation of a national, census-based student assessment in the 4th grade. The assessment, which will cover 100 percent of the roughly 580,000 4th grade students, builds on MoEC's AKSI program and will help to identify low-performing areas and schools in specific subjects. Testing at the 4th grade will provide teachers and other stakeholders with the essential data to understand how effective their classroom practices are at the primary levels and to plan systematic improvements to such practices.

### **IO 3.2: GoI is actively aligning SMK to labor market needs**

Using inputs from the WB's study on SMKs supported by ID-TEMAN, the World Bank Social Protection and Jobs (SPJ) team is currently working with the Coordinating Ministry of Economic Affairs to develop an operation with the objective of enhancing the capacity of the Indonesian skills development system; this will include supporting the roughly 14,000 SMKs to be aligned to labor market needs. Starting in FY17, the WB team conducted a study to identify the relationship between SMKs and the private sector, gathering information from 15 high-performing institutions. In FY18, detailed findings and recommendations to build upon these successful examples, as well to improve the performance of other SMKs, were then shared with stakeholders in MoEC. Since then, the team has used these findings and recommendations to support the World Bank SPJ team in developing its operation. While still in development, several recommendations from the activity may be included in the final operation. These include:

- i.) Development of "employment" centers with employment counsellors
- ii.) Employment of industry-based professionals to operate SMKs
- iii.) Implementation of regular student tracers of SMK graduates to assess employability

### **Mainstreamed EOPOs: Gender Equality and Engagement of Private Sector**

Throughout the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, gender equality was emphasized as an important factor in GoI policy reform. In all workshops and training events, the team worked to ensure that both genders were equally represented. The team also undertook a study on gender and social inclusion in education in Indonesia to highlight the progress and challenges the country faces in prioritizing and realizing gender equality and social inclusion. And the results of such efforts have been positive. In the "Realizing Education's Promise" project, MoRA has shown its recognition of the gaps between males and females and has committed specific actions to address it. In particular, MoRA is committed to ensuring that at least 350 female candidates are provided professional development and considered for the position of school director, and thus improving gender equity in management-level positions. Currently, while women make up about 52 percent of MoRA teachers, they only represent 22 percent of school directors (MoRA PAD).

Engagement of the private sector was explored into two areas through the support of ID-TEMAN: through exploration of private sector entities engaged by SMKs, in addition to the EdTech survey conducted by the team. It was determined that engagement of the private sector by SMKs have significant room for improvement and this will be addressed by the WB Social Protection and Jobs team as they work with the Government of Indonesia on its skills development agenda. In regard to the EdTech survey, the team's study on the industry and its key players has resulted in a strong understanding of the major supply- and demand-side constraints firms face in expanding the benefits provided by online learning. The team also discussed recommendations with MoEC officials on what can be done to leverage technology to boost student learning in Indonesia.

### C. Lessons Learned / Challenges

Throughout the lifetime of ID-TEMAN, the World Bank deepened its engagement with the Ministry of Education and Culture and the Ministry of Religious Affairs, among other Ministries, and significantly expanded its work program of analytical activities, pilots, and technical support. While the team overall successfully implemented activities under ID-TEMAN, several challenges did arise; by working effectively and efficiently, the World Bank team was able to address and resolve the issues presented by these challenges. Below is a summary of several challenges and resolutions:

1. Challenge #1: As the 2019 Indonesian Presidential Elections approached, the World Bank Jakarta office decreased the public dissemination of communications-related materials, limiting the full implementation of the communications strategy during FY19.

Resolution: Despite this challenge, the team was able to adapt and focus on other aspects of its communications strategy throughout the FY. This resulted in the following highlights: i) the launch of quarterly ID-TEMAN newsletter in English, ii) the development of an ID-TEMAN brochure in English and Bahasa, iii) a blog on e-RKAM and e-RKAS which was shared via the World Bank Asia Pacific Twitter handle, the ID-TEMAN newsletter and the World Bank Indonesia newsletter, iv) consultations and outlines for a World Bank flagship report on education in Indonesia, and v) a professional photography field visit during the Service Delivery Indicators Survey to capture photographs for future SDI-specific communications, as well as general photographs of children learning for the upcoming flagship report and general project communications.

2. Challenge #2: Minor delays in finalizing reports

Resolution: With an intensive workplan, combined with on-demand technical assistance to the Ministry of Education and Culture and the Ministry of Religious Affairs, in addition to internal staffing changes, the team experienced a few delays in finalizing reports. To minimize the negative effects of such delays, the team maintained constant communication and updated relevant government stakeholders with key findings and recommendations as they developed. By the closing of ID-TEMAN, all reports were finalized and made available to the public.

3. Challenge #3: Ability to pivot and adapt

Resolution: The ability of the program to pivot and adapt to include support to the MoRA resulted in a project and strong engagement with our counterparts. At the beginning of ID-TEMAN in FY16, the team focused its activities on supporting the MoEC. However, by early FY19, the team was able to pivot and expand its engagement with education officials at MoRA. This support allowed the team to focus on a range of activities including an in-service teacher training capacity assessment, a review of teachers and supervisors of religion, implementation of the Service Delivery Indicator (SDI) survey and more. Through this engagement, the team was ultimately able to develop a USD 250 million project to support the Ministry, titled "Realizing Education's Promise: Support to Indonesia's Ministry of Religious Affairs for Improved Quality of Education."

4. Challenge #4: Disruptions caused by the COVID-19 pandemic

Resolution: Despite the COVID-19 pandemic and resulting closure of schools that disrupted planned school visits, the team was able to quickly adapt and leverage other options to deliver, with quality, the infrastructure

and learning complements study. In mid-March 2020, on exactly the day before the team’s consultants were scheduled to conduct field visits and interviews in East Java, Bali, and East Kalimantan, the World Bank country office announced a ban on all work-related travel. The field visits and interviews had been carefully planned for weeks and were critical for gathering key data for the study. Without the option to visit schools and make observations in person, the team quickly adapted and leveraged several other options for data collection including: i) phone calls to interviewees, ii) requests to local education officials for photographic evidence of school infrastructure quality, and iii) extensive infrastructure- and learning-related data collected from the Service Delivery Indicator (SDI) survey a few months prior. By pivoting to these other sources of data, the team was able to conduct the necessary analysis for the study and deliver a quality product on time. In another example of adaptation and flexibility, the team was able to successfully conduct a launch of three major deliverables: i) Revealing How Indonesia’s Subnational Government Spend Their Money on Education, ii) Measuring the Quality of MoRA’s Education Services, and iii) The Promise of Education in Indonesia in November of 2020 completely on-line.

#### D. Financial Progress

##### Disbursement, Allocation and Use of Resources of ID-TEMAN (in US\$)

As of December 17, 2020, all funds within the trust fund have been expended.

Over the lifetime, the World Bank has also leveraged other financial resources including its own internal Bank Budget, funding from the Government of New Zealand – New Zealand Trade and Enterprise (NZTE) (roughly USD 85,000 in FY19) for support on designing options for a comprehensive data management system for MoRA’s education system, and funding from the Human Capital & Education for Asian Development (HEAD) Foundation to send representatives from teacher training institutions (LPTKs) to Singapore to learn how the National Institute of Education conducts pre-service teacher training.

Total Amount Received USD	Total Amount Spent USD	Funds Committed USD	Expenditure (as a percentage of the total TF amount)
\$6,612,000.01	\$6,612,000.01	0	100%

#### E. Collaboration with DFAT and DFAT-funded programs

Throughout the reporting period, the ID-TEMAN team collaborated with other DFAT-funded programs in Indonesia through meeting monthly with the Development Partners Basic Education Working Group and also through joint engagement of several activities. Specific activities include the following:

- *Gender and Social Inclusion Analysis:* The team consulted with UNICEF for inputs to the study
- *Indonesia Education Flagship:* The team met with INOVASI and UNICEF to discuss inputs
- *MoEC Dapodik & MoRA Data Reliability Assessment:* The team met with TASS to discuss its ongoing work to support MoEC to conduct data analyses of Dapodik data
- *Infrastructure Complements Study:* The team worked closely with INOVASI to identify schools in East Java, North Kalimantan, and East Nusa Tenggara to be included for the study.
- *MoRA Project – Continuous Professional Development:* The team worked with INOVASI and TASS to support MoRA in the selection, development and improvement of teacher training curricula.

Additionally, the team regularly engaged with DFAT. In addition to communicating as needed, the team sent monthly reports to DFAT through email to provide updates on the program’s activities and had informal monthly

meetings. The team also benefited from the support of DFAT. Most notably, DFAT's suggestion to include MoRA as a partner enabled the World Bank to generate extensive knowledge regarding the education system under MoRA and to ultimately develop the Realizing Education's Promise operation for the Ministry. Furthermore, DFAT provided extensive and insightful feedback on all draft reports, in addition to facilitating feedback from other DFAT-funded programs engaged in relevant areas; such feedback and inputs into the reports helped the team to improve the quality of many reports. Finally, DFAT's suggestion to have report dissemination events led to multiple large and significant events that gathered hundreds of education stakeholders to take part in learning more about Indonesia's education system and discussing reforms for improving student learning outcomes throughout the whole country.

## **F. ID-TEMAN Monitoring and Evaluation Activities**

To measure progress towards outcomes in ID-TEMAN's Theory of Change as well as to inform reporting to stakeholders, the team implemented, when possible, several monitoring and evaluation methods and tools to support the collection of data and information. These include the following:

### *Monitoring Methods*

- Activity Tracker: internal monitoring tool used to track regular updates on the activities, their statuses, relevant outputs/deliverables, timeframes, resources allocated, accountability of funds, and risks or comments that may be useful for internal coordination and management purposes
- Influence Log: tool designed to document meetings, workshops, media, and other evidence of influence
- Activity Progress Report/Completion Summary: World Bank internal monitoring tool that reports on trust fund activities. The report includes brief activity descriptions, the development objectives, deliverables, timeline, and budget, and results and assessments

### *Evaluation Methods*

- Significant Policy Change: technique/process designed by Clear Horizon to capture, measure, and report on instances of policy change and understanding the contribution of ID-TEMAN to these changes.
- Stakeholder/Key Informant Interviews: semi-structured interviews that include questions to guide identification of the most important program-specific changes from the perspective of key stakeholders
- Monthly Outcome Journals: brief monthly reports that describe changes seen in the program's stakeholders
- Performance Assessment Framework (PAF) Report: annual reports submitted to DFAT Indonesia to provide information on overall results and performance across Australia's aid investments in Indonesia

## **V. COMMUNICATIONS STRATEGY: IMPLEMENTATION**

During the reporting period, the WB team executed its communications strategy with three objectives in mind: (i) Increase awareness of ID-TEMAN policy recommendations amongst decision-makers and influencers; (ii) Increase accessibility and visibility for ID-TEMAN/World Bank education research and activities in Indonesia, including recognition for DFAT's role; and (iii) Promote further two-way dialogue on education with policymakers, with the overall goal of influencing policy reform to improve education outcomes.

In addition to the direct outreach to policy makers detailed in other parts of the report, the World Bank team used dissemination events, media outreach, blog posts, videos and newsletters to contribute to the policy impact of its activities. For specific details of these impacts, please refer to the activities discussed previously in the report.

Overall, ID-TEMAN communications activities throughout the lifetime of the TF brought about greater policy discussion on several issues. For example, large events such as the FY17 “Learning for All” conference with MoEC and DFAT and launches including the FY20 Virtual Launch: Promise of Education and the FY19 Flagship Overview launch brought together stakeholders from all over the education sector to discuss key challenges and opportunities for reform. These large events were significant as they allowed the team to convene high-level decision makers across key ministries at the central level, partners from other non-government organizations, academia and in some cases significant participation from subnational governments, who are critical to ensuring policies adopted at the central level are implemented. The larger events have also helped to draw wider public attention to these issues, through media coverage in top-tier media outlets, videos, and social media. Additionally, participation in events such as the Indonesian Economic Quarterly launch in June 2018 and the Indonesia Development Forum in July 2018 allowed the WB team to share key findings to those beyond the education sector. Other smaller events, which focused on government participation, such as the MoRA Research seminars, provided an opportunity for in-depth, and often technical, conversations with policy makers on ID-TEMAN research and recommendations. Furthermore, the launch of the ID-TEMAN webpage offers a centralized location for the team’s products to be easily accessible beyond the life of the TF.

In FY20, the following communications activities helped to achieve the objectives of ID-TEMAN’s communications strategy:

#### Dissemination Events / Seminars:

- *Virtual Launch: The Promise of Education in Indonesia (November 2020)*. The high-level event involved the launch of three key reports: Improving Outcomes through Improved Spending (Subnational Public Expenditure Review), Measuring the Quality of Education Services in Indonesia (Service Delivery Indicators Survey & Madrasah Management Study Report), and The Promise of Education in Indonesia (Education Flagship).
- *Promise of Education in Indonesia (Indonesia Flagship) Overview Launch (November 2019)*. Hosted at MoEC, the event included the World Bank’s Global Director of Education, DFAT Minister Counsellor for Governance and Human Development (Australian Embassy Jakarta), and several key government policymakers including MoEC’s Head of Bureau of Research and Development, the Director General of Early Childhood Education and Community Education, and the Director General of Teachers and Education Personnel.
- *MoRA Research Seminars (June 2020)*. Taking place over two days, this event involved three different seminars focused on discussing the findings and recommendations for the following publications: i) Institutional Capacity Assessment of MoRA In-Service Teacher Education, ii) An Independent Verification of Education Sector Data in Indonesia, and iii) Policy Note: Management of Teachers and Supervisors of Religion in Government Schools in Indonesia. Participants for the seminar included, government officials from MoRA, Bappenas, MoEC, and MoABR, members of the Association of Islamic Teachers and Non-Islamic Teachers (*Asosiasi Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam (PAI) dan Asosiasi Guru Non Islam*), World Bank staff, and representatives from development partners including DFAT, INOVASI, TASS, Tanoto Foundation, and Putra Sampoerna Foundation.
- *EdTech in Indonesia – Ready for Take-off (EdTech Landscape survey) event with EdTech firms (October 2019)*. The initial findings from the report were presented to over 30 representatives from EdTech firms. This was followed by a lively discussion on the report’s initial findings, challenges, and possible solutions. The final report and recommendations were shared with these stakeholders via email along with a blog.

#### Publications and Blog Posts / Newsletters:

The below publications/blogs/newsletters were published on the World Bank website, and linked to the [ID-TEMAN page](#) so they can be easily found and accessed in the future. In addition, when appropriate, these were promoted on the World Bank’s Twitter and Facebook channels as well as through World Bank external and internal newsletters. In addition, the ID-TEMAN team contributed articles to the Mitra Pendidikan COVID-19 newsletter.

- *Publications:*
  - [The Promise of Education in Indonesia \(Flagship Overview/Consultation Edition, Full Report, and Summary in Bahasa\)](#)
  - [EdTech in Indonesia – Ready for Take-off](#) (including blog post)
  - [Inclusion in Indonesia’s Education Sector: A Subnational Review of Gender Gaps and Children with Disabilities](#) (published as part of the World Bank Policy Research Working paper series<sup>15</sup>, including blog post)
  - [Institutional Capacity Assessment of MoRA In-Service Teacher Training](#)
  - [Management of Teachers and Supervisors of Religion in Government Schools in Indonesia: Policy Note](#)
  - An Independent Verification of Education Sector Data in Indonesia Policy Note
  - [Improving Outcomes through Improved Spending](#) (Subnational Public Expenditure Review)
  - [Measuring the Quality of Education Services in Indonesia](#) (Service Delivery Indicator (SDI) & Madrasah Management Study Report)
  - Review of Islamic Higher Education (link forthcoming)
  - [Infrastructure, Learning Complements, and Student Learning: Working Together for a Brighter Future](#)
  - [Leading Schools Digitally: Evaluation of the Electronic School Planning and Budgeting System \(e-RKAS\) in Indonesia](#)
  - Setting up a Teacher Incentive System: The Case of DKI Jakarta (DKI Jakarta Teacher Performance Pay Study of Existing Initiatives) (internal report not for publication)
- Website pages
  - [The Promise of Education in Indonesia](#)
  - [Revealing How Indonesia’s Subnational Governments Spend Their Money on Education](#)
  - [Measuring the Quality of MoRA’s Education Services](#)
- *Blog Posts / Newsletters:*
  - [ID-TEMAN News \(Edition 1\)](#)
  - [ID-TEMAN News \(Edition 2\)](#)
  - [ID-TEMAN News \(Edition 3\)](#)
  - [ID-TEMAN News \(Edition 4\)](#)
  - [COVID-19 and learning inequities in Indonesia: Four ways to bridge the gap](#) (posted on World Bank social media channels)
  - [Indonesia’s education technology during COVID-19 and beyond](#) (posted on World Bank social media channels)
  - [Gender and Education in Indonesia Blog](#)
  - [A major shift in how Indonesia’s schools and madrasahs approach planning and budgeting](#)
- Videos
  - [The Promise of Education in Indonesia](#)
  - [Janji Pendidikan Indonesia](#)
  - [Measuring the Quality of Education Services in Indonesia](#)
  - [Indonesia Subnational Public Expenditure Review in Education](#)

---

<sup>15</sup> The World Bank Policy Research Working Group series aims to showcase research with wide applicability across countries or sectors. Apart from being available on the World Bank website, these papers are also auto-fed to two external databases: the Social Science Research Network (SSRN, <http://www.ssrn.com>) and Research Papers in Economics (RePEc, <http://repec.org>).

### Media Coverage:

The team focused its media outreach around the launch of key publications.

- The Promise of Education in Indonesia Overview Launch: Covered by Tier 1 news websites such as KOMPAS, Detik and Tribunnews, as well as Antara News (a government news agency which other outlets pickup news from). The coverage focused on: the findings from the Promise of Education Overview and issues that speakers from the event touched on (assessment, teacher training etc.), as well as learning poverty.

Tier 1		
1	Antara	<a href="#">Bank Dunia: Sepertiga lebih anak-anak Indonesia alami learning poverty</a>
2	Antara	<a href="#">Australia berkomitmen dukung pendidikan berkualitas di Indonesia</a>
3	Antara	<a href="#">Kemendikbud: Perlu asesmen terkait data learning poverty di Indonesia</a>
4	Antara	<a href="#">Kemendikbud pastikan pelatihan guru berbasis zonasi berlanjut</a>
5	Berita Satu	<a href="#">Di Kemendikbud, Direktur Bank Dunia Ingatkan 5 Pilar Majukan Pendidikan</a>
6	Kompas	<a href="#">Krisis Dunia Pendidikan, Satu Pesan dari Bank Dunia</a>
7	Kompas	<a href="#">Jalan Panjang Indonesia Mengentaskan Nalar Membaca yang Rendah</a>
8	Kompas	<a href="#">Pemerintah Mesti Pastikan Guru Berkualitas Tersebar di Indonesia</a>
9	Kompas	<a href="#">Sepertiga Anak Usia 10 Tahun Indonesia Tak Mampu Baca dan Pahami Cerita Sederhana</a>
10	Liputan6	<a href="#">Wawancara Eksklusif BankDunia: Jangan Sampai Anak Berbakat Tak Sekolah Akibat Miskin</a>
11	Liputan6	<a href="#">Wawancara Eksklusif Bank Dunia: Antara Karakter Indonesia dan Pendidikan Finlandia</a>
12	Republika	<a href="#">Kemendikbud Kembangkan Asesmen Kompetensi Siswa</a>
13	TribuneNews	<a href="#">Bank Dunia Berikan Delapan Rekomendasi untuk Peningkatan Pendidikan Indonesia</a>
14	The Jakarta Post	<a href="#">Enrollment up but educational outcomes remain low in Indonesia: World Bank</a>
Tier 2		
15	Moeslim Choice	<a href="#">World Bank dan Menag Bahas Pengembangan SDM Unggul Madrasah</a>
16	JituNews	<a href="#">World Bank Bertemu Menteri Agama, Dukung Pengembangan SDM Unggul Madrasah</a>
17	TimesIndonesia	<a href="#">World Bank Gagas MEQR Untuk Tingkatkan Mutu Madrasah</a>

- The World Bank's Virtual Launch: The Promise of Education generated significant media coverage Indonesian from Tier 1 and Tier 2 news outlets, as well as two international websites/blogs.

Tier 1		
1	Antara	<a href="#">Bank Dunia: Pemda hanya alokasikan 2,6 persen untuk PAUD</a>

2	Antara	<a href="#">Laporan Bank Dunia sebut siswa Indonesia masih sedikit tertinggal</a>
3	Berita Satu	<a href="#">Bank Dunia Apresiasi Kemajuan Pendidikan Indonesia</a>
4	Kompas	<a href="#">12 Rekomendasi Bank Dunia untuk Pendidikan Indonesia</a>
5	Kompas	<a href="#">Pandemi, Tantangan Pendidikan di Indonesia Semakin Rumit</a>
6	Kompas	<a href="#">Asesmen Nasional 2021 Dinilai Masih Butuh Banyak Pengembangan</a>
7	Kompas	<a href="#">Menag: Layanan Pendidikan Berkualitas Mutlak dan Harus Diperjuangkan</a>
8	Liputan6	<a href="#">Bank Dunia: Siswa Miskin Makin Tertinggal Akibat Pandemi COVID-19</a>
9	Liputan6	<a href="#">Anggaran Pendidikan RI Kebanyakan untuk Gaji Guru, Kualitasnya?</a>
10	Pikiran Rakyat	<a href="#">Mendikbud Akui Telah Terjadi Penurunan Kualitas Pembelajaran Akibat Pandemi</a>
11	Pikiran Rakyat	<a href="#">Menurut Bank Dunia, Pelajar di Indonesia Masih Tertinggal di Pelajaran Matematika</a>
12	Pikiran Rakyat	<a href="#">Noah Yarrow Sebut Siswa di Indonesia Sedikit Tertinggal</a>
13	Pikiran Rakyat	<a href="#">Akses Siswa Terhadap Buku Mata Pelajaran Masih Rendah, DPR: Ini Jadi PR Besar Pemerintah</a>
14	Pikiran Rakyat	<a href="#">Menag Fachrul Razi Ingin Percepat Transformasi Digital Madrasah</a>
15	Republika	<a href="#">Bank Dunia: Siswa di Indonesia Sedikit Tertinggal</a>
16	Republika	<a href="#">Menag: Transformasi Digital Madrasah Perlu Dipercepat</a>
17	The Jakarta Post	<a href="#">In Indonesia, sizeable budget not translating into quality education: Report</a>
<b>Tier 2</b>		
18	Borneo News	<a href="#">Mendikbud: Penurunan Kualitas Pembelajaran Tidak Hanya di Indonesia</a>
19	Berita Media	<a href="#">Menag : Transformasi Digital Madrasah Harus Dipercepat</a>
20	Cendananews	<a href="#">siswa-indonesia-sedikit-tertinggal-dalam-penguasaan-mapel</a>
21	Era.id	<a href="#">Nadiem Sebut Asesmen Nasional Tak Bisa 'Dibimbelkan'</a>
22	Harianinhuaonline	<a href="#">Nadiem : Asesmen Nasional Tidak Bisa “Dibimbelkan”</a>
23	Headtopics	<a href="#">asesmen-nasional-2021-dinilai-masih-butuh-banyak-pengembangan</a>
24	Indonesia Inside	<a href="#">Mendikbud: Penurunan Kualitas Mutu Pembelajaran Tak Hanya di Indonesia, tapi Juga di Dunia</a>
25	Kemenag	<a href="#">Menag: Pendidikan Memutus Matarantai Kemiskinan dan Keterbelakangan</a>
26	Kaldera News	<a href="#">Duh, Tingkat Pembelajaran Siswa Indonesia 1,5 tahun di Bawah yang Diharapkan</a>
27	Matain	<a href="#">Bank Dunia: Pemda Alokasikan 2,6 Persen Anggaran untuk PAUD</a>
28	mbsnews	<a href="#">MAS MENTERI: KUALITAS PEMBELAJARAN SELAMA PANDEMI CORONA</a>
29	Radar Cirebon	<a href="#">Bank Dunia Sebut Siswa Indonesia Tertinggal dalam Penguasaan Mata Pelajaran</a>
30	Radar Pekalongan	<a href="#">Waduh, Bank Dunia Sebut Siswa Indonesia Tertinggal dalam Penguasaan Mata Pelajaran</a>
31	Radar Banyumas	<a href="#">Siswa Indonesia Tertinggal</a>

32	Telaah.id	<a href="#">Bank Dunia: Pemda Alokasikan 2,6 Persen Anggaran untuk PAUD</a>
33	TimesIndonesia	<a href="#">Menag RI: Pendidikan, Cara Terbaik Memutus Rantai Kemiskinan dan Keterbelakangan</a>
34	UINjkt	<a href="#">Gaji Guru di Indonesia Tinggi, Bagaimanakah Kualitasnya?</a>
35	MalangTerkini	<a href="#">Menurut Bank Dunia, Pelajar di Indonesia Masih Tertinggal di Pelajaran Matematika</a>
36	KebumenTalk	<a href="#">Selama Pandemi Covid-19, Kualitas Pendidikan Indonesia Menurun</a>
37	Okezone	<a href="#">Madrasah Perlu Mempercepat Transformasi Digital</a>
38	KalbarOnline	<a href="#">Menag Sebut Kemiskinan Bisa Dicegah dengan Pendidikan yang Baik</a>
39	JurnalIslam	<a href="#">Pendidikan Dinilai Mampu Putus Rantai Kemiskinan</a>
40	Lingkar Madiun	<a href="#">Asesmen Nasional 2021, Mendikbud: Guru Harus Bisa Diagnosa Kompetensi Siswa</a>
<b>International</b>		
41	Modern Diplomacy	<a href="#">Creating a 21st Century Education System</a>
42	India Education Diary	<a href="#">Creating a 21st Century Education System: Three New Reports Address Indonesia's Learning Poverty and Inequality</a>

Additionally, the team produced an [op-ed](#) under Kompas titled “Melindungi Masa Depan Anak-anak Indonesia.”

#### VI. Transition to Australia World Bank Indonesia Partnership Trust Fund (ABIP)

With the conclusion of the ID-TEMAN Trust Fund and transition to the Australia World Bank Indonesia Trust Fund, the World Bank Education team has implemented plans to ensure that the significant progress and achievements attained through the support of ID-TEMAN will continue to be advanced. Activities carried out by the team under ABIP will focus on the theme of “Accelerating Human Capital Development,” as well as gender equality.

The following outlines the Education team’s largest activities under ABIP and explains how each build off the progress and achievements attained under ID-TEMAN:

- **Developing a new National Student Assessment Learning Framework:** Under this activity, the team will work with MoEC and MoRA to support the development of a new national student learning assessment framework. This will include advising both ministries on areas including development of test items, validation of results, and development of diagnostic tools for teachers and school directors to understand the results, while also providing them with options for actions to improve learning outcomes. Similar to the activity mentioned above, this activity also builds off the team’s work under activity 2.6a “Student Assessment Capacity building,” directly supporting ID-TEMAN’s End of Program Outcomes 3 (EOPO 3): Improved national-level policies for student learning measurement (students assessment and skills).
- **Deepening MoRA's Education Reform Program:** This activity will focus on supporting MoRA’s education reform program under the current “Realizing Education’s Promise: Support to Indonesia’s Ministry of Religious Affairs for Improved Quality of Education” operation. The key goal of this activity to provide technical support and capacity strengthening to MoRA to achieve its reform program goals in various areas

including student assessment, teacher training, promotion of gender equality, non-public madrasah regulation and education data system management, all of which builds upon the extensive work completed under the ID-TEMAN TF. Additionally, the team will support MoRA's pandemic response through technical assistance. An expected outcome of this activity is also the achievement of "increased access of females to school director candidate training," a key impact initiated by Activity 1.8 – In-Service Teacher Training Capacity Assessment.

- Designing tertiary performance measurement system and performance-based fiscal transfer program: This activity will support the development of a higher education quality measurement system built for Indonesian tertiary education institutions, based on global experience and lessons learned. The team will also develop detailed, customized policy options for performance-based financial transfers to universities under both MoEC and MoRA. This activity builds directly off of the engagement and knowledge generated from Activity 2.8 – Review of Islamic Higher Education.
- Impact Evaluation of Online Teacher Training in Indonesia: This activity is an impact evaluation of the feasibility, effectiveness, and cost-effectiveness of using scalable online approaches to teacher training in Indonesia. The overall goal of the activity is to inform policies and programs that aim to upgrade teacher skills through in-service training. The ultimate objective is to find effective and cost-effective strategies to improve the learning outcomes of Indonesian students in order to accelerate human capital development— and to find strategies that might work despite COVID-19. More generally, COVID-19 pandemic has demonstrated the importance of online learning modalities in the resilience of the education system to natural disasters. This activity builds off of the work and knowledge generated from activity 1.6 – Landscape Survey of EdTech and activity 1.8 – In-service Teacher Training Capacity Assessment.