

IEG ICR Review

Independent Evaluation Group

1. Project Data :		Date Posted : 10/29/2012	
Country:	Rwanda		
	Is this Review for a Programmatic Series?	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No	
Series ID:			
First Project ID :	P115816	Appraisal	Actual
Project Name :	Education For All - Fast Track Initiative Catalytic Fund Bridge Grant	Project Costs (US\$M):	35
L/C Number:		Loan/Credit (US\$M):	35
Sector Board :	Education	Cofinancing (US\$M):	
Cofinancers :	Multi-donor Catalytic TF of 18 countries	Board Approval Date :	10/09/2009
		Closing Date :	06/30/2010
Sector(s):	Primary education (65%); Secondary education (30%); Pre-primary education (5%)		
Theme(s):	Education for all (100% - P)		
Evaluator:	Panel Reviewer :	ICR Review Coordinator :	Group:
Pia Helene Schneider	George T. K. Pitman	Soniya Carvalho	IEGPS1

2. Project Objectives and Components:

a. Objectives:

This one-year operation consists of a single tranche Bridge Grant to the government 's general budget. Subsequently, Rwanda was to apply for a new three-year Second Grant with an updated analytical foundation from the Education for All Fast Track Initiative Steering Committee (Program Document p. 24).

The Program Development Objective (Program Document, p. 23) is:

"to support the Government's policy reforms on Teacher Development and Management, Textbooks and Girl's Education with the overall aim to improve the quality of basic education "

b. If this is a single DPL operation (not part of a series), were the project objectives/ key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

No

c. Policy Areas:

Government policy areas supported by the Bridge Grant operation include the implementation of the Nine -Year Basic Education Policy and Strategy.

This bridge grant supported government reform efforts in the design and implementation of three policy areas : the improvement of teacher competencies, the effective and efficient procurement and distribution of textbooks, and the improvement of girls' academic performance (Program Document p. 26).

The three policy areas were:

1. **Teacher Development and Management Policy** . Improve better oversight through :
 - Adoption of teacher development and management policy to establish entity for oversight of teacher services .
 - Adoption of cost-based strategy for coordinated in-service teacher training .
2. **Effective and Efficient Procurement and Distribution of Textbooks** . Decentralize textbook selection and procurement to the schools to improve the distribution and faster availability of textbooks through :
 - Adoption of procedures for decentralized procurement and selection of textbooks following textbook policy .
 - Issuance of invitation to submit proposals of teaching material to be included in national list .
3. **Improvement of Girls ' Academic Performance** . Improve the lower attainment for girls through :
 - Adoption of girl's education policy, including Gender -specific data collection and analysis .
 - Adoption of cost-based plan to implement girl's education strategy .

d. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates:

Financing: This one-year bridge operation was a single tranche Development Policy Operation (DPO). It was funded from the Catalytic Fund Trust Fund which is the Fast Track Initiative (FTI) mechanism for the implementation of endorsed education programs. This was a bridge grant Trust Fund for 2009, and it followed-up a 2-year FTI Trust Fund of \$70 million implemented in 2007-2008. In November 2010 Rwanda was approved for a follow-up 3-year FTI Trust Fund for the period of 2010-2012.

Borrower contribution : The Bridge Grant disbursed fully to the general government budget to co-finance the implementation of the education sector strategy . The education sector is co-funded by the government and other donors who provide education budget support including DFID, AfDB, CIDA, the Netherlands and Belgium .

Dates: Disbursement suffered a seven-month delay (12/23/2009 instead of 5/29/2009) and this caused the Ministry of Finance to step in and reallocate funds to education until the Grant disbursed (ICR Annex 2).

3. Relevance of Objectives & Design:

a. Relevance of Objectives:

High

The objective of the operation, with a focus on improving quality of basic education through Government reforms in teachers, textbook procurement, and girl's education, remains highly relevant . These are crucial challenges for Rwanda in its efforts to improve quality and access to basic education, achieve universal completion of primary education, universalize nine-grade basic education, and continue addressing gender issues . The objective is in line with objectives of the poverty reduction strategy, the Growth Flagship and Vision 2020, and consistent with the fiscal framework. It supports the Country Assistance Strategy FY 09-FY12 that promotes economic transformation and growth through increasing skills, and reducing social vulnerability .

The 2008 Joint Donor and Government Review of the Education Sector identified improving the quality of basic education as a key priority, requiring that quality factors related to teacher supply and qualification, textbook procurement and distribution, and gender imbalances be addressed (Project Document p. 24).

b. Relevance of Design:

Substantial

The revised Operation Policy 14.40 requires FTI funding to be implemented as Investment Lending or as a Development Policy Loan with disbursement to the general budget . The precedent set in Rwanda was that about half of Bank support was implemented through DPOs . Based on previous experience and education budget support by other donors, the instrument choice as a DPO was appropriate in a multi -donor sector-wide approach context, where the Bank had to prepare short-time bridge funding given the unpredictability of FTI . However, an independent External Quality Review (consultants hired by FTI secretariat) and other donors recommended disbursement earmarked to the education budget, which was not an option for the Bank . Also, some donors had reservations about the choice of the DPO instruments with prior actions to be met for disbursement, and Bank procedures to follow .

The PAD contained a detailed results framework that plausibly linked the objectives, policy areas, expected outcomes and key-indicators. The policy areas with prior actions and the project objectives all emerge from recommendations made in previous analytical work (Country Status Report 2003). Exogenous factors that could affect outcome were taken into account, including an increase in capitation financing and an extension of the number of school years in basic education . Given the one-year time frame, the Government ICR considers the prior actions as appropriate, although the first was on the ambitious side .

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy):

Objective: to support the Government's policy reforms on Teacher Development and Management, Textbooks and Girl's Education to improve the quality of basic education .

It was not expected that the positive impact of the reforms supported by this Bridge Grant would be measurable within the short, one-year implementation period of the operation . Also the positive impact on the education indicators of the reforms supported by this operation cannot be distinguished from other reforms that were carried out during this operation's implementation period. However, this operation helped maintain the momentum of a successful and ambitious reform process by maintaining a strong focus on the importance of the quality of basic education, and pushing important reforms (ICR p. 10).

An adequate macro-framework was maintained during the operation . Average annual GDP growth rate for 2006-10 was 7%. Rwanda achieved 8.6% growth in 2011, exceeding the average growth for Sub-Saharan Africa of 5% (Rwanda Economic Memorandum 2012).

The operation contributed about 20% of the basic education budget which helped to maintain and implement challenging basic education reforms through the one-year bridge financing.

Objective: Improve the quality of basic education - *Substantial*

Outputs:

Teacher development and management policy

- Deputy Director-General appointed for teacher development and management under the Rwanda Education Board
- The Head of the teacher service commission (TSC) became the Deputy Director-General of the Education Board, whose law has been passed by the Government (ICR p 20).
- The Commission is establishing an electronic National Teacher Registration System and database to create a teacher profession pathway; and is designing policies and tools for Teacher Development Systems .
- Guidelines for teacher in-service training providers were developed .
- As part of teacher management policy reform the Ministry of Education announced in Oct 2010 to review salary increases and incentives, and provide better access to loans for teachers .
- The government increased the number of primary education teachers from 32,338 in 2008 to 40,299 in 2011 (World Development Indicators, WDI).

Textbook procurement to schools

- The number of trained textbook evaluators increased from 0 in 2009 to 300 in February 2010, surpassing the target of 250 evaluators. Evaluators chose 4 publishers for each subject and each grade .
- The number schools with a textbook selection committee increased from Sept 2009 to Feb 2010 as follows: (i) primary from 0 to 2,408 (100%) surpassing target of 1,926; and (ii) secondary from 0 to 1,449 (100%) surpassing target of 1,159.
- Previous monopoly for textbook procurement was replaced by 28 publishers competing for textbooks with national curriculum. Textbook procurement contracts were awarded to 13 publishers. 4 publishers were selected for each grade and subject by the 300 newly-trained textbook evaluators .
- Of 13 contracted publishers, 9 fully completed distribution to schools and 5 publishers were late. According to the ICR most late deliveries were of supplementary materials rather than core textbooks . Where publishers delivered after specified deadlines or failed to meet production standards, letters were written drawing publishers attention to contractual penalties .
- Each school made its own choice of textbooks to buy from the list of 4 for each subject and grade .

Girl's academic performance policy

- Gender sensitive core indicators were made available and were discussed during annual joint review of education sector strategy .
- Girl's education policy to improve self-esteem, and performance of rural girls in particular, were disseminated to every district. Awareness-raising workshops took place in Nov 2010 to launch implementation (ICR p. 19).

Outcomes

- 98% of schools made textbook orders on time (target 60%).
- Distribution was accurate with very few queries .
- Textbooks reached all schools for the first time; however, the ICR does not report whether faster textbook procurement had an impact on the textbook-to-student ratio.

- The primary completion rate for females (% of relevant age group) increased from 53% in 2008 to 73.8% in 2010 and for males from 49% to 65.4%, respectively (World Development Indicators, WDI). These stronger improvements compared to the target are probably due to the extension of the number of school years in basic education (from six to nine) and the consequent improvement in retention rates. It is not possible to segregate the impact of the reforms supported by the operation and the effect of the move to nine years of basic education (ICR p. 10).
- Pupil to *qualified* teacher ratio in primary schools improved from 67:1 in 2008 to 63:1 in 2009 (meeting target 65 for 2009), and dropped to 58 in 2010 (meeting target of 65). However, this was mainly a result of increasing capitation funding to schools in 2008 (co-financed by the first round of FTI Catalytic Fund that allowed the contracting of nearly 2,000 additional qualified teachers).

5. Efficiency (not applicable to DPLs):

6. Outcome:

The outcome is rated Satisfactory based on High relevance of objectives and Substantial relevance of design, and Substantial improvement in the quality of basic education .

a. Outcome Rating : Satisfactory

7. Rationale for Risk to Development Outcome Rating:

The education strategy implementation continues to be supported by the government and the donor community . However, limited basic education financing, double shifting and a reduction of subjects taught by class pose a risk to the objective of improving quality of basic education . Basic education financing is highly donor-dependent, with the grants alone contributing between 20% to 25% annually of the public basic education budget in 2007 - 2009. Increased financing for basic education is needed to ensure the implementation of the basic education reforms and address current constraints to quality including double -shifting due to a shortage of class rooms and qualified teachers, and a reduction in the number of subjects taught by class . Weak management capacity in lower administration and in some schools increases the implementation risk of the education strategy and the procurement risk for textbooks in a decentralized system .

The government is addressing these risks by implementing a broad program of interventions to improve quality of education, including the recruitment of 2,471 new teachers for primary education for the year 2010/11; construction and equipment of 2,936 classrooms for nine-year basic education; construction of 5,714 latrines (benefitting girls' education, which is one of the DPO's policy focus areas); purchase and distribution of 3,768,467 textbooks for primary and secondary education; training of 42,826 primary and secondary teachers in English language; and distribution of 68,746 laptops to schools.

a. Risk to Development Outcome Rating : Moderate

8. Assessment of Bank Performance:

a. Quality at entry:

The Bank had been the supervising entity for the previous Catalytic Fund Grant, and incorporated lessons from the previous experience in the preparation and appraisal of this bridge grant . The team responded quickly to the need for one-year bridge funding and completed appraisal within 3 months in a context of changing FTI procedure rules and new Bank rules for the preparation of recipient executed trust funds in July 2008. The time pressure caused by the compressed processing time to meet FTI deadlines seems to have limited the time to brief donors comprehensively about the DPO as an instrument . Combined with changing FTI procedures and internal Bank DPO procedures this adversely affected the perception of the Bank among donors and increased transaction costs. It also caused a delay in disbursement by more than three months . Although the Bank delivered this Bridge Grant on time, the experience of donors with the Bank 's rule changes led to the perception that the new rules affected the decision-making process among donors with minimal consultation . On the other hand, the Bank team operated under strong time pressure and had to deliver this one-year operation within few months and a limited budget, both of which may have constrained the time available to inform all donors .

The preparation included a thorough assessment of the macro, fiscal and sector context, progress made in the

education strategy, gender and social aspects, and financing modalities . Given the short time frame, the prior policy actions were realistically linked to the Government 's education sector strategy which is endorsed by all donors working in education. The indicators used to assess progress include inputs and outputs and constitute a sound results chain. While the results framework in the Project Document does not report on intermediate outcomes caused by the policy actions within the 1-year implementation time (e.g. number of text book per student, textbook procurement time, number of in -service training for teachers, percent of female teachers etc), these quality indicators were tracked during strategy implementation .

The team sought advice from an External Quality Review to strengthen the quality of the design . The Quality Review rated the design as Moderately Satisfactory including moderately unsatisfactory for funding due to a financing gap in the Government budget for the education strategy implementation, and "anemic prior actions". The recommendations could only be used to a limited extent as the Review team seems not to have fully understood the local context (DFID comments ICR p. 23).

Quality-at-Entry Rating : Moderately Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision:

Bank supervision was coordinated with development partners, and this improved coordination reduced the bureaucracy for the Ministry of Education as reported by the borrower . However, DFID identified increased transaction costs with additional demands on policy actions (ICR p 23). Although all prior actions were implemented by Sept 3, 2009, the operations only disbursed on December 23, 2009, causing the Ministry of Finance to provide short-term funding to education (at an additional cost), to ensure continued implementation of the education strategy. This delay was caused by FTI-related administration required to approve disbursement of the grant.

DFID indicated that the delay in disbursement held back some planned activities; and that M&E activities became vague after the disbursement of funds, raising questions whether enough information was available for the final completion report. However, the ICR and government both reported on progress based on indicators since the December 2009 disbursement.

Quality of Supervision Rating : Moderately Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating : Moderately Satisfactory

9. Assessment of Borrower Performance:

a. Government Performance:

The government overall maintained a prudent macro - and fiscal framework and implemented structural reforms during the economic slowdown in 2009. When the FTI disbursement was delayed by 3 months in 2009, the Ministry of Finance stepped in and allocated extra funds to education .

The basic education reforms are an integral part of the government's reform program, highlighting strong ownership. The reforms were supported with increased government funding to basic education, elimination of school-fees for the first 9 years, and a cost-based approach to strategy development and related resource allocation. As is highlighted in the CSR (p146), Rwanda allocated nearly 49 percent of its recurrent education budget to primary education in 2008, which is similar to the average in other African countries and the EFA -FTI indicative framework benchmark of 50 percent. The GoR efforts to implement the nine-year basic education policy resulted in substantial investments in lower secondary education, which is also a part of basic education . Currently, expenditures on basic education amount to 67% of total public education spending (Joint Review of Education Sector, 2011/12 budget).

Government Performance Rating : Satisfactory

b. Implementing Agency Performance:

The Ministry of Education implemented prior actions to continue education reforms with a small number of staff and weak capacity at the lower administration level . However the ICR (p. 14) notes that its leadership of the preparation process was less than optimal which was to a large extent due to the agency being forced to adjust in a short term to new procedures enforced by the Bank and FTI . The Ministry of Education, in collaboration with DFID, successfully applied for a FTI-CF follow-up Trust Fund of \$70 million for 2010-13 (approved in Nov 2010) to continue support basic education . The Ministry of Education also maintains a database to monitor indicators and evaluate progress with the education strategy implementation which provided important information on progress since the closure of this operation .

Implementing Agency Performance Rating : Moderately Satisfactory

Overall Borrower Performance Rating : Moderately Satisfactory

10. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization:

a. M&E Design:

The M&E design is in line with the country’s Common Performance Assessment Framework endorsed by the Government and donors. Given that data are available, additional output and outcome indicators could have been included in the operation’s results framework in the Project Document and the ICR since the 1-year operation supported the implementation of an ongoing strategy . The Task Team provided this additional information .

b. M&E Implementation:

The Education MIS was rolled out in 2009 to collect school- and college-based data for the education strategy implementation. The Government collected gender-specific data and used this information in monitoring and evaluation.

c. M&E Utilization:

Education data were used to discuss strategy progress during the annual Joint Review of the Education Sector, by-monthly education sector cluster group meetings, and during the annual Joint Budget Sector Review . While the Government in its contribution to the ICR reports several relevant output indicators, DFID indicates that M&E activities slowed down after disbursement .

M&E Quality Rating : Substantial

11. Other Issues

a. Safeguards:

No safeguard policies were triggered .

b. Fiduciary Compliance:

An audit of the Ministry of Education in December 2007 by the Auditor General was qualified . The Ministry of Education started to address these weaknesses, including lapses in compliance with laws and procedures, weaknesses in control over payments, bank accounts and assets, and in the implementation of previous audit recommendations. The Ministry is now participating in a general Public Financial Management reform . The impact of this participation on improving the Ministry’s financial management systems was not discussed in the ICR .

c. Unintended Impacts (positive or negative):

d. Other:

12. Ratings:	ICR	IEG Review	Reason for
--------------	-----	------------	------------

			Disagreement / Comments
Outcome:	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Risk to Development Outcome:	Moderate	Moderate	
Bank Performance :	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
Borrower Performance :	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Implementing Agency performance was moderately satisfactory; according to the IEG/OPCS harmonized evaluation criteria, when government performance and implementing agency performance are both in the satisfactory range, overall borrower performance is the lower of the two.
Quality of ICR :		Satisfactory	

NOTES:

- When insufficient information is provided by the Bank for IEG to arrive at a clear rating, IEG will downgrade the relevant ratings as warranted beginning July 1, 2006.
- The "Reason for Disagreement/Comments" column could cross-reference other sections of the ICR Review, as appropriate.

13. Lessons:

Lessons as identified in the ICR :

Allow more time for teams to adapt to changes in Operational Policy rules in a multi -donor context . In this case, the team was under pressure to prepare and deliver a one-year operation on time and adjust the operation to new rules for FTI. More time should be given in a multi-donor context to the dissemination and implementation of rule changes to ensure all partners endorse the new rules .

A sector-specific FTI focal person could improve sector -wide collaboration . FTI operations involve heavy donor collaboration which justifies an FTI focal point for the Africa education sector .

Outcome indicators still should be reported even for single tranche DPOs . Although this was just a one-year DPO with a single disbursement, it still supports the implementation of an ongoing sector strategy which collects outcome indicators.

Decentralizing textbook procurement can substantially reduce procurement time and stock -outs. This operation found that a web-based system to handle all book orders from schools catalyzed the process .

14. Assessment Recommended? Yes No

15. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The Bank ICR is comprehensive and is complemented by valuable information provided by the Government and by DFID. It reports the achievement of the objectives . The ICR provides good quality analysis and explains implementation issues in a concise way . The ICR is internally consistent and outcome driven . The relevant indicators are report; however given that the data were available, the ICR could have included additional output and outcome indicators in the operation's results framework .

a.Quality of ICR Rating : Satisfactory

