



# Combined Project Information Documents / Integrated Safeguards Datasheet (PID/ISDS)

Appraisal Stage | Date Prepared/Updated: 09-Dec-2020 | Report No: PIDISDSA27796



**BASIC INFORMATION**

**A. Basic Project Data**

Country Togo	Project ID P169945	Project Name Additional Financing for Togo West African Regional Communications Infrastructure Project	Parent Project ID (if any) P123093
Parent Project Name West Africa Regional Communications Infrastructure Project - APL 2	Region AFRICA WEST	Estimated Appraisal Date 04-Jan-2021	Estimated Board Date 15-Feb-2021
Practice Area (Lead) Digital Development	Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing	Borrower(s) Togolese Republic, Islamic Republic of Mauritania	Implementing Agency Ministère de l'éducation supérieure, de la recherche scientifique et des TICs (Mauritania), Ministère des Postes, de l'économie numérique et des innovations technologiques (Togo)

Proposed Development Objective(s) Parent

The objectives of each Project are to contribute to increase the geographical reach of broadband networks and to reduce costs of communications services in the territories, respectively, of the Islamic Republic of Mauritania and the Republic of Togo.

Components

- MAURITANIA - Supporting Connectivity
- MAURITANIA - Creating an Enabling Environment for Connectivity
- MAURITANIA - Project Implementation
- TOGO - Supporting Connectivity
- TOGO - Creating an Enabling Environment for Connectivity
- TOGO - Project Implementation

**PROJECT FINANCING DATA (US\$, Millions)**

**SUMMARY**

<b>Total Project Cost</b>	11.20
---------------------------	-------



<b>Total Financing</b>	11.20
<b>of which IBRD/IDA</b>	11.20
<b>Financing Gap</b>	0.00

**DETAILS**

**World Bank Group Financing**

International Development Association (IDA)	11.20
IDA Credit	11.20

Environmental Assessment Category

B-Partial Assessment

Decision

The review did authorize the team to appraise and negotiate

**B. Introduction and Context**

Country Context<sup>1</sup>

1. The Republic of Togo (Togo) is located on Africa’s west coast and is bordered by Ghana, Benin, and Burkina Faso. Togo is home to approximately 7.8 million people. Although the poverty rate fell from 61.7% in 2006 to 53.5% in 2017, poverty and inequality remain high, particularly in rural areas where 69% of households were living below the poverty line in 2015.
2. The COVID-19 pandemic could slow the economic momentum of recent years. Togo’s economy performed well in 2019, with an estimated 5.3% growth rate that was driven by an upturn in public investment, expansion in the construction sector, and improved agricultural productivity. The services sector nevertheless remains the main engine of growth thanks to expanding port and airport operations. However, the crisis triggered by the global coronavirus pandemic is expected to lead to a decline in growth to 1% in 2020.
3. Growth prospects will be severely undermined by the duration and intensity of the COVID-19 crisis. The slowdown in global economic growth, coupled with the prevention measures for containing the virus contagion, could reduce production, domestic consumption, and exports. Revenues could plummet, whereas additional expenditures are essential to a robust health and economic response and the protection of businesses and households hardest hit by the crisis.

<sup>1</sup> Based on World Bank, Togo, Overview, November 3, 2020 ([online link](#)).



## Sectoral and Institutional Context

4. The telecommunications sector in Togo is governed under the remit of the Law on Telecommunications No. 98-005 (11 February 1998), as amended by: Law No. 2004-010 and Law No. 2004-011 (both dated 3 May 2004). Key subsequent legislation includes Law No. 2012-001 on Investment in the Togolese Republic; Law No. 2012-018 on Electronic Communications (amended by Law No. 2013-003); Law No. 2017-006 on Guidance on the Information Society; Law No. 2017-007 on Electronic Transactions; Law 2018-026 on Cybersecurity; and Law 2019-014 on the Protection of Personal Data. The sector is supervised by the Ministry of Digital Economy and Digital Transformation (MDEDT), and the Regulatory Authority for Electronic Communications and Posts (*Autorité de Régulation des Communications Electroniques et des Postes*, ARCEP).
5. The telecom market in Togo has experienced several improvements over the last few years, with the government awarding two new Internet Service Provider (ISP) licenses in 2017 and privatizing incumbent operator TogoCom in November 2019. In addition to TogoCom (the largest player in the telecommunications market in Togo, both in the fixed and mobile markets) there is only a second mobile operator (Moov, a subsidiary of Maroc Telecom), making the mobile market a duopoly. Affordability of internet service has improved but remains expensive (especially for the poorest households), and the domestic fixed broadband internet market covers less than 1.8% of the households by March 2020 (compared to 4.8% in Côte d'Ivoire and 7.7% in Senegal). Internet usage in Togo has picked up rapidly in the past few years, mainly through mobile technologies, with mobile broadband penetration more than doubling from 2016 reaching around 44% of the population in 2019. However, and despite the positive progress, this pace of growth is still not up to the government's ambition outlined in its policy statement, i.e. (i) reaching 90% of the population with access to broadband at 10 Mbps and more by 2022 and (ii) being ranked among the top ten in Africa for Digital Readiness.

## C. Proposed Development Objective(s)

6. The PDO for this Additional Financing (AF) remains the same as parent project, i.e. to contribute to increase the geographical reach of broadband networks and to reduce costs of communications services in the Republic of Togo.

## Key Results

## D. Project Description

7. The West Africa Regional Communications Infrastructure Project (WARCIP) – APL2 (the Project) – was approved by the Board on May 30, 2013 and covers both the Republic of Togo and the Islamic Republic of Mauritania. The Project Development Objective (PDO) is “*to contribute to increase the geographical reach of broadband networks and to reduce costs of communications services in the territories, respectively, of the Islamic Republic of Mauritania and the Republic of Togo.*” For the Togo portion of the Project, the IDA



Credit 52530 is of SDR 20.1 million<sup>2</sup> (US\$ 30 million equivalent at the time of the approval, and around US\$ 28.5 million equivalent at the current exchange rate<sup>3</sup>). The Togo Financing Agreement (FA) was signed and became effective on November 12, 2013 and March 31, 2014 respectively.

8. The proposed Additional Financing (AF) is in the amount of SDR 7.9 million (US\$11.2 million) to the Republic of Togo to close the cost overruns / financing gaps that have hindered the continuation of the construction of the Carrier Hotel, as well as a few other related activities that are key to strengthening the achievements of the PDO (especially to reduce costs of communications services). The AF represents an increase of 39 percent over the initial credit of SDR 20.1 million for the Togo portion of the Project. The cost allocation for the cost overrun / financing gap are:
  - a. AF of US\$ 9.7 million allocated to Component 1 to cover the financing gap faced with the selected bid for the Construction of the Carrier Hotel as well as additional related cost overruns and supervision costs;
  - b. AF of US\$ 1.0 million allocated to Component 2 to finance cost overruns and financing gaps with the provision of spectrum management equipment as well as sectoral studies such as Digital Togo Strategy 2025;
  - c. AF of US\$ 0.5 million allocated to Component 3 as a contingency budget in anticipation of potential additional minor cost overruns and/or fluctuations in the exchange rates. It will also allow for agile response through digital solutions and services to mitigate crises related to Covid-19 as they arise.
9. **Results framework.** The results framework from the Parent Project remains valid and unchanged at this time, other than an update of the results targets to reflect the new closing date (October 31, 2021) granted under the last restructuring.

## E. Implementation

### Institutional and Implementation Arrangements

10. **Project implementation arrangement:** The Project Implementation Unit (PIU), under the MDEDT has been successfully implementing the project since 2013. The Project will thus continue to be implemented by the existing, fully staffed and trained PIU and the implementation arrangements will remain the same.

## F. Project location and Salient physical characteristics relevant to the safeguard analysis (if known)

For the Togo portion of the Project, the exact site location for the Carrier Hotel and paths for civil works are already known and allocated by Ministerial Order (in French Arrêté Ministériel) 042/MEF/DGI dated April 9,

<sup>2</sup> The IDA Credit 52550-MR to Mauritania is also for SDR 20.1million and became effective on December 16, 2013.

<sup>3</sup> Although the initial amount of SDR 20.1 million has *decreased* in US\$ equivalent from US\$ 30 million equivalent at the time of the approval to around US\$ 28.5 million equivalent at the current exchange rate, it has in fact *increased* in the local Togolese currency (CFA Franc) from XOF 15 billion equivalent at the time of the approval to around XOF 16 billion equivalent at the current exchange rate.



2013. The exact itinerary of the potential terrestrial fiber optic links that may be deployed by operators to connect the Carrier Hotel is not yet known and will need to respect E&S measures in the ESMF and RPF. For the Mauritania portion of the Project, the exact site location for the Carrier Hotel and paths for civil works are already known. The national backbone to be built consists of three sections : i) Nouakchott-Atar-Choum section (568 km), with a local loop in Nouakchott of 39 km to connect to the ACE landing station and the national data center building; ii) Rosso-Boghe-Kaédi-Sélibaby-Kiffa section (749 km); iii) Aioun-Nema section (288 km). Fiber-optic cables will be siting about 1644 km following roads, with a known location of the sites of the Technical Centers and Shelters. A National Data Center will also be built near the University of Nouakchott, with a cumulative area of 4,200 m2 allocated by Ministerial Decree No. 0157/MF of January 21, 2014.

**G. Environmental and Social Safeguards Specialists on the Team**

Africa Eshogba Olojoba, Environmental Specialist  
Fatoumata Diallo, Social Specialist  
Abdoulaye Gadiere, Environmental Specialist  
Komlan Kpotor, Environmental Specialist

**SAFEGUARD POLICIES THAT MIGHT APPLY**

Safeguard Policies	Triggered?	Explanation (Optional)
Environmental Assessment OP/BP 4.01	Yes	
Performance Standards for Private Sector Activities OP/BP 4.03	No	
Natural Habitats OP/BP 4.04	Yes	
Forests OP/BP 4.36	No	
Pest Management OP 4.09	No	
Physical Cultural Resources OP/BP 4.11	Yes	
Indigenous Peoples OP/BP 4.10	No	
Involuntary Resettlement OP/BP 4.12	Yes	
Safety of Dams OP/BP 4.37	No	
Projects on International Waterways OP/BP 7.50	No	
Projects in Disputed Areas OP/BP 7.60	No	



## KEY SAFEGUARD POLICY ISSUES AND THEIR MANAGEMENT

### A. Summary of Key Safeguard Issues

1. Describe any safeguard issues and impacts associated with the proposed project. Identify and describe any potential large scale, significant and/or irreversible impacts:

From an environmental and social safeguard standpoint, the WARCIP Mauritania and WARCIP Togo portions of the projects are rated as a Category B. That is, the environmental and social impacts of the project, for the most part, are expected to be minimal, site-specific and manageable to an acceptable level. Therefore, the following Safeguards policies are triggered: OP/BP 4.01 (Environmental Assessment); OP/BP 4.04 (Natural Habitat), OP/BP 4.11 (Physical Cultural) and OP/BP 4.12 (Involuntary Resettlement).

For the Togo portion of the Project, the physical components of this Additional Financing (AF) are limited to completion of the building of the IXP/Carrier Hotel/Datacenter. It is also expected that - in case some operators may want to lay optical fiber to connect to the Carrier Hotel - potential terrestrial fiber optic links construction to follow roads already in place. The IXP/Carrier Hotel/Datacenter is built on a site allocated by Ministerial Order 042/MEF/DGI dated April 9, 2013.

Within the Additional Financing (AF) for the Togo portion of the Project, the environmental and social risks and potential negative impacts associated to the expected activities are deemed low, site-specific and manageable to an acceptable level. However, the following safeguards policies triggered under the parent project remain relevant: OP/BP 4.01 (Environmental Assessment); OP/BP 4.04 (Natural Habitat); OP/BP 4.11 (Physical Cultural); and OP/BP 4.12 (Involuntary Resettlement). In addition, the advocated provisions described in the prepared E&S Instruments of the parent project are applicable for the carrier hotel remaining activities: RPF and ESMF (march 2013), ESIA/ESMP (march, 2019) and a GRM (august 2018). Additional E&S instruments will be prepared to manage the negative environmental and social impacts coming mainly from the potential laying of additional fiber optic (in case some operators may want to lay optical fiber to connect to the Carrier Hotel) based on the ESMF and RPF provisions. The potential environmental and social impacts from the building of the terrestrial fiber optic links are likely to be small-scale and site-specific and thus easily remediable and reversible. As sites of this operation are not yet known, the accurate estimate of the number of people who will be affected is not feasible at this stage. Therefore, specific ESIAs with ESMPs when the detailed technical studies are available will confirm the project impacts to the land acquisitions and the number of population affected by the project in compliance with the principles and procedures agreed within the approved RPF. Applying the COVID19 restriction measures in the project activities is recommended.

For the Mauritania portion of the Project, negative environmental and social impacts of the project come mainly from the laying of the fiber that could lead to: soil erosion (especially in dune areas); soil and water pollution; loss of vegetation (tree felling); the disruption of life (waste from work), of socio-economic activities and livelihoods located on the way (workshops, garages, shops, etc.); disturbance of traffic; noise; dust; risk of accident and the generation of waste; risks of land acquisitions, occupation of private land; possible destruction of crops (in the areas of Rosso, Boghé, Kaédi, Selibabi, Kiffa and Nema), but also the risk of vandalism and social frustration when local workforce is not used. The potential environmental and social impacts are likely to be small-scale and site-specific and thus easily remediable and reversible. The main activity of the project likely to cause resettlement is essentially the temporary disturbance linked to the excavation for laying underground fiber optics along the roads (and rail at Choum on the Nouadhibou-Zouerate line) on the different backbone links. The census carried out under RAP study found that there



are no persons and property affected by the project eligible for compensation or resettlement. The national backbone does not need land because the paths followed avoid as much as possible private areas and use easements on existing roads which are often wide and open. Solutions have been proposed for paths involving the positioning of the cable relative to the side of the roads (right or left position) which can greatly reduce the negative effects of the cable route, especially as the roads are generally not congested. The technical building Datacenter will be located in a site adjacent to the area of the New University of Nouakchott. It is not necessary to expropriate for its construction because the land belongs to the state. Negative impacts for the IXP/Carrier Hotel/Datacenter are limited to risks of accidents during the works and the works wastes.

2. Describe any potential indirect and/or long term impacts due to anticipated future activities in the project area:

N/A

3. Describe any project alternatives (if relevant) considered to help avoid or minimize adverse impacts.

N/A

4. Describe measures taken by the borrower to address safeguard policy issues. Provide an assessment of borrower capacity to plan and implement the measures described.

For the Togo portion of the Project, the Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) and a Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF) have been prepared and disclosed in Togo and on the World Bank's web site on March 2013. An ESIA/ESMP has been prepared on March 2019. The ESIA measures are under implementation until the end of the project where an audit will be realized. No resettlement plan has been prepared. However, in accordance with the guidelines of the approved RPF, the construction site of the Carrier Hotel has been allocated by Ministerial Order 042/MEF/DGI dated April 9, 2013. Before the site land was formally assigned to the project, the site was assigned to an NGO. There is no information on the potential need to compensate the NGO relating to this land assignment; the supervision mission on June 2020 highlights this fact and recommends the documentation and archiving of all the information on this process. To date, information received by the PIU confirm that: (i) the land assigned for the construction of the Carrier Hotel remains a state land (in French "parcelle de réserve administrative"); (ii) the land was assigned for the construction of the Carrier Hotel by the Ministerial Order 042/MEF/DGI; and (iii) the Ministerial Order 042/MEF/DGI states (Article 1) that the previous assignment of the land to an NGO is null and void as the NGO was required to put the land into operation within 24 months and it did not do so. The site was also occupied for productive purpose by security guards from a telecommunications company who were able to harvest the crops before the right of way was released for the start of work. A GRM is in place since august 2018 but not operationalized yet: it needs to be updated and implemented during the AF.

The project implementation team for Togo includes an E&S specialist hired in 2018. His capacities on E&S risks management have been enhanced during World Bank's regular activities to enhance clients mainly PIU capacities.

For the Mauritania portion of the Project, the safeguard documents (ESMF and RPF) have been prepared, validated by the Government and disclosed in Mauritania, in the World Bank's Infoshop and on the WARCIP Project website on march 2013. An ESIA/ESMP and RAP has been prepared on December 2014. Memorandums of understanding for collaboration have been signed with the Directorate of Environmental Control (DCE) and the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development (MEDD) to monitor the implementation of the ESIA measures.

The project Mauritania portion of the Project has developed a GRM in May 2019. A Grievance Mechanism Committee is in place and the process is as follows: complaints are received and dealt with first through amicable settlement in urban areas by the municipality (town halls) and in rural areas by village group leaders. In the event of a disagreement,



the file is forwarded to the UGP WARCIP; in the absence of an agreement, the court is referred. Six complaints were received, resolved and documented since the project implementation. A case of non-compliance with the standards and working conditions (Health, Safety) of a subcontractor had been found during a supervision mission. A diagnostic mission was carried out and discussions with the company resolved the problem and employment contracts were established for all workers.

The project implementation team for Mauritania includes an E&S specialist hired since the beginning of the project. He is in charge of coordinating the implementation, the monitoring (control and audit) of social and environmental aspects and be an interface between the project, local authorities and other stakeholders.

5. Identify the key stakeholders and describe the mechanisms for consultation and disclosure on safeguard policies, with an emphasis on potentially affected people.

For the Togo portion of the project, key stakeholders of the project consulted during project preparation and implementation of the parent project have included elected local governments, operators including Togo Télécom, Togo Cellulaire (both called today TogoCom), and Moov, the Ministry of Post and Telecom, the Ministry of Environment, the ANGE (Agence Nationale de Gestion de l'Environnement), businesses, civil society in the three potential sites for the carrier hotel (Afidényigba site, new Presidency site and Cacavelli site, all in the Capital city) and the current site of the Carrier Hotel.

During the implementation of activities for the Togo AF, the PIU will continue the consultations with key stakeholders and get their participation to the project activities. A focus will be done to protect potentially affected persons including vulnerable groups. It is also expected that - in case some operators may want to lay optical fiber to connect to the Carrier Hotel - operational instrument to properly manage E&S risks and impacts during this AF will be prepared, consulted upon, validated, approved and disclosed both within the country and on the World Bank's web site prior to the commencement of potential laying of fibre optics cables.

For the Mauritania portion of the Project, key stakeholders for consultation include current inhabitants (where applicable), Line Ministry in charge of Environment and Sustainable Development, the Line Ministry MDEFPNT (Ministère d'État à l'Éducation nationale, chargé de l'Emploi, de la Formation Professionnelle et des Nouvelles Technologies), the APAUS (Agence de Promotion de l'Accès Universel aux Services), businesses and civil society. Stakeholders were interviewed in the project target areas during field visits made by the consultants working on the environmental and social safeguards. All the key actors, called to play a part in this process, have been consulted and informed. The potentially affected persons have been consulted as well and their view was take into account the environmental and social documents The environmental and social quitus on the project documents was given by the DCE on 9 April 2015. The ESIA/ESMP and the RAP were published in a local newspaper in the affected areas of the project. The DCE conducts regular community awareness and consultation sessions under his MoU. During the implementation, the implementing agencies carried out public consultations with key stakeholders.

**B. Disclosure Requirements (N.B. The sections below appear only if corresponding safeguard policy is triggered)**

**Environmental Assessment/Audit/Management Plan/Other**

Date of receipt by the Bank	Date of submission for disclosure	For category A projects, date of distributing the Executive Summary of the EA to the Executive Directors
-----------------------------	-----------------------------------	--



14-Jan-2013	20-Mar-2013		
<p><b>"In country" Disclosure</b>  Mauritania  12-Mar-2013  Comments</p> <p>Togo  19-Mar-2013  Comments</p>			
<p><b>Resettlement Action Plan/Framework/Policy Process</b></p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td>Date of receipt by the Bank 26-Feb-2013</td> <td>Date of submission for disclosure 20-Mar-2013</td> </tr> </table>		Date of receipt by the Bank 26-Feb-2013	Date of submission for disclosure 20-Mar-2013
Date of receipt by the Bank 26-Feb-2013	Date of submission for disclosure 20-Mar-2013		
<p><b>"In country" Disclosure</b>  Mauritania  12-Mar-2013  Comments</p> <p>Togo  19-Mar-2013  Comments</p>			
<p><b>C. Compliance Monitoring Indicators at the Corporate Level (to be filled in when the ISDS is finalized by the project decision meeting) (N.B. The sections below appear only if corresponding safeguard policy is triggered)</b></p> <p><b>OP/BP/GP 4.01 - Environment Assessment</b></p> <p>Does the project require a stand-alone EA (including EMP) report?  Yes</p> <p>If yes, then did the Regional Environment Unit or Sector Manager (SM) review and approve the EA report?  Yes</p> <p>Are the cost and the accountabilities for the EMP incorporated in the credit/loan?  Yes</p>			



**OP/BP 4.04 - Natural Habitats**

Would the project result in any significant conversion or degradation of critical natural habitats?

No

If the project would result in significant conversion or degradation of other (non-critical) natural habitats, does the project include mitigation measures acceptable to the Bank?

No

**OP/BP 4.11 - Physical Cultural Resources**

Does the EA include adequate measures related to cultural property?

Yes

Does the credit/loan incorporate mechanisms to mitigate the potential adverse impacts on cultural property?

Yes

**OP/BP 4.12 - Involuntary Resettlement**

Has a resettlement plan/abbreviated plan/policy framework/process framework (as appropriate) been prepared?

Yes

If yes, then did the Regional unit responsible for safeguards or Sector Manager review the plan?

Yes

Is physical displacement/relocation expected?

Is economic displacement expected? (loss of assets or access to assets that leads to loss of income sources or other means of livelihoods)

**The World Bank Policy on Disclosure of Information**

Have relevant safeguard policies documents been sent to the World Bank's Infoshop?

Yes

Have relevant documents been disclosed in-country in a public place in a form and language that are understandable and accessible to project-affected groups and local NGOs?

Yes



### All Safeguard Policies

Have satisfactory calendar, budget and clear institutional responsibilities been prepared for the implementation of measures related to safeguard policies?

Yes

Have costs related to safeguard policy measures been included in the project cost?

Yes

Does the Monitoring and Evaluation system of the project include the monitoring of safeguard impacts and measures related to safeguard policies?

Yes

Have satisfactory implementation arrangements been agreed with the borrower and the same been adequately reflected in the project legal documents?

Yes

### CONTACT POINT

#### World Bank

Tounwende Alain Sawadogo  
Senior Digital Development Specialist

#### Borrower/Client/Recipient

Togolese Republic  
Cina Lawson  
Minister

Islamic Republic of Mauritania  
Dr. Mohamed Lemine OULD DHEHBY  
Director General of Planning

#### Implementing Agencies

Ministère de l'éducation supérieure, de la recherche scientifique et des TICs (Mauritania)  
Mr. SALIHI  
Director of Telecommunication and PIU deputy Coordinator  
msalihi@gmail.com

Ministère des Postes, de l'économie numérique et des innovations technologiques (Togo)  
Atafeitom Tagba  
Chief of Staff



**FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT**

The World Bank  
1818 H Street, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20433  
Telephone: (202) 473-1000  
Web: <http://www.worldbank.org/projects>

**APPROVAL**

Task Team Leader(s):	Tounwende Alain Sawadogo
----------------------	--------------------------

**Approved By**

Safeguards Advisor:	Nathalie S. Munzberg	21-Dec-2020
Practice Manager/Manager:	Michel Rogy	21-Dec-2020
Country Director:	Coralie Gevers	22-Dec-2020