



<b>1. Project Data:</b>		<b>Date Posted :</b> 08/15/2002	
<b>PROJ ID:</b> P004392		<b>Appraisal</b>	<b>Actual</b>
<b>Project Name:</b> Pg-education Development	<b>Project Costs (US\$M)</b>	51.3	48.7
<b>Country:</b> Papua New Guinea	<b>Loan/Credit (US\$M)</b>	35	22
<b>Sector(s):</b> Board: ED - Secondary education (53%), Primary education (22%), Adult literacy/non-formal education (10%), Vocational training (10%), General public administration sector (5%)	<b>Cofinancing (US\$M)</b>	0	6.7
<b>L/C Number:</b> L3537			
	<b>Board Approval (FY)</b>		93
<b>Partners involved :</b> Australia	<b>Closing Date</b>	12/31/1997	12/31/2001
<b>Prepared by :</b>	<b>Reviewed by :</b>	<b>Group Manager :</b>	<b>Group:</b>
Helen Abadzi	Jorge Garcia-Garcia	Alain A. Barbu	OEDST
<b>2. Project Objectives and Components</b>			
<b>a. Objectives</b>			
The project was to assist the government in implementing its education sector policies and investment plans to: (a) increase access to upper secondary education through expanding enrollments in grades 11 and 12 and in the business studies course and through repair of school facilities; (b) improve educational quality through expanding the supply of textbooks, strengthening school inspection and guidance and improving school libraries; and (c) strengthen institutional management through the appointment and training of regional planning and management advisors and policy studies to develop strategies to improve the cost-effectiveness of education, increase educational opportunities for girls and strengthen teacher education.			
<b>b. Components</b>			
The project was mainly focused on secondary education but was also to assist primary, vocational, business education, and higher education. It financed civil works, equipment, furniture, fellowships, and technical assistance for project implementation and policy studies.			
<b>c. Comments on Project Cost, Financing and Dates</b>			
The project received extensions totaling four years and closed on December 31, 2001. Objectives and components were revised in 1995 to accommodate emergency school reconstruction after a volcanic eruption. An initial higher education component was deleted when the Asian Development Bank expressed interest in lending for higher education.			
<b>3. Achievement of Relevant Objectives:</b>			
Objectives were partly achieved. Access to upper secondary education was increased substantially, and schools increased their building and maintenance activities. The achievement of quality objectives is dubious, partly because textbook distribution was more limited than expected, particularly for secondary education. Student-teacher ratio in secondary education remained very high (120:1) and actually increased (157:1).			
<b>4. Significant Outcomes/Impacts:</b>			
1. Upper secondary enrollments more than tripled, exceeding a targeted 76% increase and reaching 8552 students or 335% over the baseline of 1965 students. However, female participation rose only from 29% to 36% for this level of education.			
2. The project provided about 3 million textbooks, though students obtained only half the textbooks they were supposed to have received.			
3. Provincial development education plans were produced through Australian technical assistance. Studies were carried out, but few of their findings were put to use.			
4. School libraries acquired large numbers of auxiliary materials.			
<b>5. Significant Shortcomings (including non-compliance with safeguard policies):</b>			
Business education through distance learning was not achieved, partly because consultants left without completing			

the work and partly because there were more suitable private -sector courses available . The curriculum department was not institutionally strengthened, as it should have been . The project was overly complex and ambitious for a country with weak and deteriorating capacity . Dependence on expatriates for implementation was high . Its four-year implementation period was also unrealistic . Bank supervision was inadequate due to limited staffing of supervision missions and technical assistance gaps in the early years . Lengthy delays in procurement resulted from procurement disputes and Bank remedies that the government could not easily fulfill . Lack of counterpart funds hampered implementation, and components were delayed particularly in construction and maintenance . Implementation activities took place intermittently, task teams changed frequently, yet Bank management did not focus on the problematic delays .

6. Ratings :	ICR	OED Review	Reason for Disagreement /Comments
<b>Outcome :</b>	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Objectives were partly achieved;but without the budget support of the Bank and AusAid, the increase in coverage and the distribution of textbook would not have taken place or would have had lower outcomes.
<b>Institutional Dev .:</b>	Substantial	Modest	Important areas such as curriculum and textbook development were not strengthened institutionally.
<b>Sustainability :</b>	Highly Unlikely	Unlikely	The all-important instructional inputs are unsustainable, but library materials and buildings may be more so . Nevertheless, the lack of budget makes education inputs in general unsustainable .
<b>Bank Performance :</b>	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
<b>Borrower Perf .:</b>	Unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	
<b>Quality of ICR :</b>		Satisfactory	

**NOTE:** ICR rating values flagged with '\*' don't comply with OP/BP 13.55, but are listed for completeness.

### 7. Lessons of Broad Applicability:

- Borrower commitment is essential for implementation . Repeated starts and stops of project activities discourage borrower staff and contribute to diminished implementation outcomes .
- Implementing staff may have networks of connections and obligations that conflict with their project -related obligations . Often, these people are hard to remove . The Bank should ascertain before agreeing to the employment of project directors that they can be replaced in their role easily and quickly (even if they retain their position in the public sector).
- In countries with a difficult implementation record, the Bank should undertake new education projects only if it can afford to supervise them often and satisfactorily .
- When supervision resources are insufficient to cover all components of an ambitious project, task managers should avoid covering all components and focus on those that are most relevant for the success of the project .
- When preparing projects, the Bank should make an intensive effort to identify clear benchmarks and indicators at the start in order to make it easy for the implementing agency to assess whether implementation is working well .

**8. Assessment Recommended?**  Yes  No

**Why?** Project is part of a cluster and in an under-audited country .

### 9. Comments on Quality of ICR:

The ICR is very thorough and frank . However, too many details and equal emphasis on all components and sub-components make it difficult to understand the relative importance of its components .