



Strengthening Primary Health Care for Results (P152736)

AFRICA | Tanzania | Health, Nutrition & Population Global Practice | Requesting Unit: AFCE1 | Responsible Unit: HAFH1
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2015 | Team Leader(s): Peter Okwero

Seq No: 10 | ARCHIVED on 26-Jun-2020 | ISR42419 | Created by: Peter Okwero on 16-Jun-2020 | Modified by: Peter Okwero on 24-Jun-2020

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

The Program Development Objective is to improve the quality of primary health care (PHC) services nationwide with a focus on maternal, neonatal and child health (MNCH) services.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	■ Satisfactory	■ Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	■ Moderately Satisfactory	■ Moderately Satisfactory

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The Program is in its fifth year of implementation and is on track to achieve its Program Development Objective (PDO). Four of the five PDO indicators have surpassed the end of Program targets including pregnant women attending 4 or more antenatal care visits; antenatal care attendees receiving at least 2 doses of intermittent preventive treatment for malaria; institutional deliveries; and the proportion of children 12-59 months receiving at least one dose of Vitamin A supplementation during the previous year. Similarly, seven out of thirteen intermediate results indicators have achieved annual (2019) targets. Based on a request from the Government of Tanzania, the Program was restructured to modify key Program results and Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI). The restructuring also extended the Program's Closing Date by one year, from June 2020 to June 2021.

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P152736	IDA-56430	Effective	USD	200.00	200.00	0.00	172.18	28.78	<div style="width: 86%; background-color: green; height: 10px;"></div> 86%
P152736	TF-A0261	Effective	USD	20.00	20.00	0.00	11.43	8.57	<div style="width: 57%; background-color: green; height: 10px;"></div> 57%
P152736	TF-A0270	Effective	USD	40.00	40.00	0.00	29.57	10.43	<div style="width: 74%; background-color: green; height: 10px;"></div> 74%
P152736	TF-A1567	Effective	USD	4.50	4.50	0.00	3.98	0.52	<div style="width: 88%; background-color: green; height: 10px;"></div> 88%
P152736	TF-A9831	Effective	USD	10.02	10.02	0.00	0.00	10.02	<div style="width: 0%; background-color: green; height: 10px;"></div> 0%

Key Dates (by loan)



Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P152736	IDA-56430	Effective	28-May-2015	25-Aug-2015	05-Nov-2015	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2021
P152736	TF-A0261	Effective	28-May-2015	23-May-2016	20-Jul-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2021
P152736	TF-A0270	Effective	28-May-2015	23-May-2016	20-Jul-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2021
P152736	TF-A1567	Effective	23-May-2016	23-May-2016	20-Jul-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020
P152736	TF-A9831	Effective	01-Aug-2019	01-Aug-2019	20-Sep-2019	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020

Program Action Plan

Action Description	Appoint Internal Auditor General as the independent verification entity.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
		Client	Due Date	25-Nov-2015	Completed
Completion Measurement					
Comments					

Action Description	Submit basic reporting requirements for the sector as per the HBF requirement.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
		Client	Due Date	30-Dec-2016	Completed
Completion Measurement					
Comments					

Action Description	Implement the ESSA through the following: i) Inclusion of HCWM in the CCHP ii) Monitor and report on the implementation of HCWM activities in the CCHP.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Delayed
Completion Measurement	HCWM guidelines prepared and training conducted				
Comments	While the Client appointed a Focal Person (July 2019) to oversee implementation of ESSA, general progress remains slow. These Client was advised to pay greater attention to the ESSA.				

Action Description	Review the existing procurement vetting mechanisms with a view to reducing backlog				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status



		Client	Due Date	30-Jan-2017	Completed
Completion Measurement					
Comments					

Action Description	Operationalize MSD system that issues out stock notices to facilities within one day as prescribed in the 2013 Public Procurement Regulation Act (Section 140) and the 2013 Public Procurement sub-regulations (Subsections 1 to 6).				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
		Client	Due Date	31-May-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement					
Comments					

Action Description	Conduct annual procurement audits of the program as well as Value for Money (VFM) audits by PPRA and CAG				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Submission of report				
Comments	Draft report for the value for money audit is ready and will shared with the WB by end of January 2019. The procurement audit is underway, and the report will be shared in April 2019.				

Action Description	Establish a PHCfoR Technical Committee and hold regular meetings to monitor implementation progress				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		Permanent Secretary	Recurrent	Quarterly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Minutes of Meetings				
Comments					

Action Description	Promote the use of performance scorecard to enhance accountability				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		RCH Director and Project Coordinator	Recurrent	Yearly	In Progress
Completion Measurement	Score Cards reports				
Comments					



Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Substantial
Macroeconomic	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Moderate
Sector Strategies and Policies	--	☐ Low	☐ Low
Technical Design of Project or Program	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Substantial
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	--	☐ Substantial	☐ Substantial
Fiduciary	--	☐ Substantial	☐ Substantial
Environment and Social	--	☐ Substantial	☐ Substantial
Stakeholders	--	☐ Low	☐ Low
Other	--	--	--
Overall	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Substantial

Comments

Overall risk rating has been changed to Substantial following revision of the rating for political and governance and technical design of project to substantial. The rating for political and governance was revised to substantial because of the increasingly centralized management of the budget and fund flow processes by MoFP, as a result both MoHCDGEC and PORALG have witnessed increased delays with release of funds, and in many instances, releases have not been made even when in the approved budget. Technical design of the Program was revised to substantial. The Program is complex in its design involving many parties (Central, Regional, District and Health Facility) and using various instruments (HBF, RBF and DHFF). This may not have been recognized initially, but with the changing governance situation, the Program's complexity has become apparent.

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

To improve the quality of PHC services nationwide with a focus on MNCH services				
▶ PHC facilities with 3- Star Ratings and Above (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	19.00	19.00	30.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2020
Comments	The indicator was not updated a the assessment was not conducted. It still however remains offtrack.			
▶ Pregnant women attending 4 or more ante-natal care (ANC) visits (Percentage, Custom)				



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	41.20	63.70	80.40	68.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
▶ ANC attendees receiving at least 2 doses of intermittent preventive treatment (IPT2) for malaria (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	42.52	81.20	87.30	80.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
▶ Institutional deliveries (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	44.72	79.20	82.60	70.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
▶ Proportion of children 12-59 months receiving at least one dose of Vitamin A during the previous year (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	51.00	100.00	100.00	90.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	30-Jun-2020
Comments				

Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Intermediate Results Indicators				
▶ Share of health in total government budget (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	8.50	8.00	9.00	9.75
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments This indicator has under-performed consistently.				
▶ Councils with unqualified opinion in the annual external audit report (Percentage, Custom)				



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	80.00	96.00	95.70	92.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
► Completion of "Star rating" assessment of PHC facilities as per the two-year cycle (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	100.00	0.00	50.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	30-Jun-2020
Comments	Star rating exercise not conducted though was planned.			
► RBF facilities receiving timely RBF payment on the basis of verified results every quarter (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	100.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Because of delays with verification, RBF payments to HF delays			
► LGAs with functional Council Health Service Boards (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	86.30	84.00	92.00	100.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
► Health facilities with continuous availability of the tracer medicines in the past year based on MoHCDGEC medicine list (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	30.60	95.90	96.30	80.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
► Health facilities with functional CEmOC (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	81.00	81.00	160.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2020



Comments	No update in December 2019. Information will be availed after verification is completed			
► Completeness of quarterly HMIS data entered in DHIS by LGA (by the end of month after quarter ends) (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	89.50	99.00	99.40	96.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
► RHMT's required biannual data quality audits (DQA) for LGAs that meets national DQA standards (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	68.00	37.00	80.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments	There has a marked drop in the indicator.			
► Completion of annual capacity building activities compared to agreed annual plans (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	50.00	37.00	90.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
► Dispensaries with skilled HRH (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	91.00	83.00	89.00	90.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
► RHMTs conduct quarterly supportive supervision visits for the LGAs that meets national supervision standards and is reported in DHIS2 (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	31-Dec-2020
Comments				
► People who have received essential health, nutrition, and population (HNP) services (Number, Corporate)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target



Value	0.00	58,115,170.00	64,486,447.00	30,000,000.00
Date	28-May-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	30-Jun-2020
Comments				
<input type="checkbox"/> Number of children immunized (Number, Corporate Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	6,802,958.00	8,869,047.00	10,000,000.00
Date	28-May-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	30-Jun-2020
<input type="checkbox"/> Number of women and children who have received basic nutrition services (Number, Corporate Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	42,435,178.00	45,016,138.00	10,000,000.00
Date	28-May-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	30-Jun-2020
<input type="checkbox"/> Number of deliveries attended by skilled health personnel (Number, Corporate Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	8,877,034.00	10,601,262.00	10,000,000.00
Date	28-May-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2019	30-Jun-2020

Disbursement Linked Indicators

▶ DLI 1 DLI 1: Recipient has completed foundational activities (Output, 35,000,000.00, 40%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020-21
Value	No	Yes	Yes	--
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	--
Comments	<p>DLI 1 RESULTS Update as of December, 31 2018. 5 Completed/Achieved (DLR 1.1, 1.2; 1.3; 1.4; 1.5). 1 Partially completed/Partially Achieved (DLR; 1.6) DETAILED ASSESSMENT: 1. A 5year capacity building plan for the program has been completed. 2. Data Quality Audit tool prepared: COMPLETED. National DQA guidelines and tool have been developed, tested and disseminated to all 26 regions in the country has been done. Dissemination to the second administrative level – 184 local government authorities is done. 3. Financial instructions for health facility accounts prepared and disseminated to all LGAs: COMPLETED. Financial Management Guidelines for Public Health Facilities have been developed and disseminated. 4 Verified baseline data (for 2014) and targets for performance indicators: COMPLETED. Report is available. 5 List of operational health facilities and GPS locations prepared: COMPLETED (7,356 facilities have been mapped which includes public, private and faith-based organizations). The data are publicly available at www.hfrportal.ehealth.go.tz. 6.a Completion of BeMONC and CeMONC assessment in the five BRN RMNCAH regions: COMPLETED. 6.b Eight selected health centres in the five BRN RMNCAH regions meeting CeMONC standards: ACHIEVED. Target: 8; Actual:8. 6.c At least 70 percent of health centres in the five BRN RMNCAH regions meeting BeMONC standards: PARTIALLY ACHIEVED. Target: 70%; Actual: 54% (Source: Star rating reassessment).</p>			



--

► DLI 2 DLI 2: Recipient has achieved Program annual results in institutional strengthening (Process, 65,000,000.00, 69%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020-21
Value	No	No	No	--
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	--
Comments	<p>DLI 2 RESULTS Update is as of December 2018. All 6 Completed/Achieved (DLR 2.1; 2.2; 2.3;2.4;2.5;2.6). DETAILED ASSSSMENT: 1. Share of health in total budget increased to 9.5%. 2. Percentage of council whose annual comprehensive Council Health Plan (CCHP) passes the first round of assessment: ACHIEVED. Target: 80%; Actual: 83.7%. 3. Action Plans of Audits of PORALG and MOH received within 2 months of the official release of the controller and Auditor General(CAG) report: ACHIEVED, Action plans shared by both MOH and PORALG. 4. Percentage of PHC facilities with bank accounts opened according to guidelines from Ministry of Finance and Planning (MOFP)/CAG: ACHIEVED. Target: 100%; Actual: 100%. 5. Percentage of annual employment permits for PHC staff given to the 9 critical regions: ACHIEVED. 6. Percentage of completion of "Star Rating Assessment" of PHC facilities: COMPLETED. Target: 100%; Actual: 100%.</p>			

► DLI 3 DLI 3: PHC facilities have improved maternal, neonatal and child health services delivery and quality as per verified results and received payments on that basis each quarter (Intermediate Outcome, 81,000,000.00, 37%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020-21
Value	0.00	1,724.00	1,724.00	--
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	--
Comments	<p>As of December 31, 2018 1,724 facilities in eight regions (Mwanza, Shinyanga, Pwani, Tabora, Kagera, Kigoma, Geita and Simiyu) out of 9 planned regions are now implementing RBF.</p>			

► DLI 4 DLI 4: LGAs have improved annual maternal, neonatal and child health services delivery and quality as measured by the LGA Balance Score Card . (Outcome, 80,500,000.00, 52%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020-21
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	--
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	--
Comments	<p>DETAILED ASSESSMENT: This is the 4th year of measuring this DLI the aggregated indicator is calculated and measure against 2018 targets. Below is an update on the DLI sub-indicators as of December 31, 2018. 1. Percentage of pregnant women attending four or more antenatal care visits (ANC4): ACHIEVED: Target: 50%; Actual: 63.70%. 2. Proportion of mothers who received 2 doses of intermittent preventive treatment (IPT2) for malaria during last pregnancy: ACHIEVED. Target: 70%; Actual: 81.20%. 3. Percentage of institutional deliveries: ACHIEVED. Target: 73%; Actual: 79.20%. 4. Percentage of women of reproductive age (15-49 years) using modern family planning methods: PARTIALLY ACHIEVED: Target: 36%; Actual: 35.4% 5. Percentage of pregnant women who receive adequate quantity of iron and folate tablets during their current ANC visit: ACHIEVED: Target: 46% Actual: 76%</p>			



- 6. Proportion of children 12-59 months receiving at least one dose of Vitamin A supplementation during the past year: ACHIEVED. Target: 100%; Actual: 100%.
- 7. Percent of PHC facilities with "3 stars" rating or higher: PARTIALLY ACHIEVED. Target: 35%; Actual: 19%.
- 8. Number and percentage of Public primary health facilities with at least one skilled staff: ACHIEVED. Target: 77% Actual: 83%
- 9. Percentage of PHC facilities with continuous availability of 10 tracer medicines (medicines, vaccines, medical devices) in the past year: ACHIEVED. Target: 87% Actual: 96%
- 10. Percentage of LGAs with functional Council Health Service Boards (meeting quarterly): ACHIEVED. Target: 82% Actual: 84%
- 11. Percentage of completeness of quarterly DHIS 2 entry by LGA (MTUHA phase one forms by Day 30 after the end of each quarter): ACHIEVED. Target: 97%; Actual: 99%
- 12. Percentage of LGAs with unqualified opinion in the external audit report. ACHIEVED. Target: 84%; Actual: 90%. ACHIEVED.

► DLI 5 DLI 5: Regions have improved annual performance in supporting PHC services as measured by Regional Balance Score Card. (Outcome, 3,010,000.00, 51%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020-21
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	--
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	--
Comments	DLI 5 RESULTS; 1 Not achieved (DLR 5.1). 1 achieved (DLR 5.2). DETAILED ASSESSMENT: DQA training has been done to all regions throughout the country. 5.1. RHMTs required biannual data quality audits (DQA) for LGAs that meets national DQA standards. NOT ACHIEVED. Baseline: 0%; Target: 60%; Actual:20% . 5.2. RHMT's Required annual supportive supervision visits for LGAs that meets national supervision standards. ACHIEVED. Target: 100%; Actual 100%			

► DLI 6 DLI 6: MoHCDGEC and PO-RALG have improved annual PHC service performance as measured by National Balance Scorecard (Process, 6,400,000.00, 57%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020-21
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	--
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	--
Comments	DLI 6. RESULTS Update is as of December 31, 2018. 1 Completed/Achieved (DLR 6.3). 2 Partially completed/Partially achieved (DLR 6.2 & 6.4). 1 Not achieved/completed (DLR6.1) DETAILED ASSESSMENT: 6.1 Average of LGA performance score: NOT COMPLETED. Target: 80%; Actual: 53%. 6.2. Average of Regional performance scores: PARTIALLY COMPLETED. Target: 80% Actual: 70%. 6.3. Percentage of unsupported expenditure in MOH/PORALG in their annual audit. ACHIEVED. Target: 0%; Actual: 0.1%. 6.4. Percentage of LGA's receiving CHF matching funds: PARTIALLY COMPLETED. Target: 57%; Actual: 55%			

► DLI 7 DLI 7: Completion of annual capacity building activities at all levels as per the agreed annual plans. (Process, 15,000,000.00, 50%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2020-21
Value	No	No	No	--
Date	25-Aug-2015	31-Dec-2018	31-Dec-2018	--



Comments

The Capacity Building Plan (under DLI #1) has been implemented as agreed in the plan as of May 31, 2018