



RESTRUCTURING PAPER  
ON A  
PROPOSED PROJECT RESTRUCTURING  
OF  
HIGHER EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN  
APPROVED ON MAY 31, 2019  
TO  
ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN  
  
EDUCATION  
SOUTH ASIA

Regional Vice President:	Hartwig Schafer
Country Director:	Najy Benhassine
Regional Director:	Lynne D. Sherburne-Benz
Practice Manager/Manager:	Mario Cristian Aedo Inostroza
Task Team Leader(s):	Tazeen Fasih, Koen Martijn Geven, Neelam Ejaz



## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AC	Affiliated college
AD	Associate degree
AU	Affiliating University
BIC	Business Incubation Center
DA	Designated Account
DAI	Degree-awarding Institutes
DLI	Disbursement-linked Indicator
EEP	Eligible Expenditure Program
ERP	Enterprise Resource Planning
ESMF	Environment and Social Management Framework
FM	Financial Management
FMS	Financial Management Specialist
FMIS	Financial Management Information System
GCF	Grand Challenge Fund
HEC	Higher Education Commission
HED	Higher Education Department
HEDP	Higher Education Development in Pakistan
HEI	Higher education Institution
HEMIS	Higher education Management Information System
ICT	Information and Communication Technologies
IPF	Investment Project Financing
ISF	Innovator Seed Fund
IUFR	Interim Unaudited Financial Report
LCF	Local Challenge Fund
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
NAHE	National Academy of Higher Education
OM	Operational Manual
PERN	Pakistan Education Research Network
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
TPV	Third Party Verification



**BASIC DATA**

**Product Information**

Project ID P161386	Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing
Original EA Category Partial Assessment (B)	Current EA Category Partial Assessment (B)
Approval Date 31-May-2019	Current Closing Date 30-Jun-2024

**Organizations**

Borrower Islamic Republic of Pakistan	Responsible Agency Higher Education Commission
--	---

**Project Development Objective (PDO)**

Original PDO

To support research excellence in strategic sectors of the economy, improve teaching and learning and strengthen governance, in the higher education sector.

**Summary Status of Financing (US\$, Millions)**

Ln/Cr/Tf	Approval	Signing	Effectiveness	Closing	Net Commitment	Disbursed	Undisbursed
IDA-64380	31-May-2019	17-Jun-2019	18-Jun-2019	30-Jun-2024	400.00	65.00	347.81

**Policy Waiver(s)**

Does this restructuring trigger the need for any policy waiver(s)?

No



## I. PROJECT STATUS AND RATIONALE FOR RESTRUCTURING

### A. Project Status

- 1. The Higher Education Development in Pakistan (HEDP) was approved on May 30, 2019.** The project is aligned with Higher Education Commission's (HEC) Vision 2025 to support interventions aimed at improving quality and relevance of second and third tier Higher Education Institutes (HEIs) and encouraging research and innovation in Tier 1 universities in the country. The strategic areas covered in the project are (i) Research and development, (ii) Improving the quality of higher education and support to affiliated colleges, (iii) Leveraging technological resources (PERN), (iv) Higher Education Management Information System (HEMIS) and (v) Capacity building of faculty and staff through the National Academy of Higher Education (NAHE). While the budgetary allocation to the Higher Education Commission (HEC) reduced in 2020 partly due to COVID, the federal government recently released supplementary grant funds amounting to PKR 2.27 billion.
- 2. The project has disbursed US\$65 million to date and is rated moderately satisfactory for progress towards achievement of Project Development Objectives (PDO).** The project has achieved some results for PBC 1, 3, 5, 8 and 9 for year 1 and 2, however these are pending reports from Third Party Verification (TPV) to receive disbursements against the achievements. There has been some delay in the hiring of the TPV firm which has only been confirmed and deployed in March 2021, leading to a significant delay in verification of attained results. The project has faced some challenges because of the COVID-19 pandemic related closing of educational institutes. The proposed restructuring aims to adjust for the unanticipated and exogenous shock to the higher education system and to help project achieve its PDO within the new and different global realities.
- 3. The COVID-19 pandemic emerged as a major challenge for Pakistan in early 2020 with education institutes being closed across the country in March for several months, briefly reopening in September, followed by closure again in November.** In response to the physical lockdown, the HEC supported universities transition to distance mode teaching and learning to the extent possible, assisted developing online learning management systems, and supported access to broadband. This massively accelerated the digital transformation of the university sector with over 100,000 university courses having been brought online, while HEC and universities moved key business processes online. While the project was able to quickly support the pivoting of higher education to online modalities, it did face several challenges on implementation of some of the activities due to COVID-19, particularly on disbursement of research grants, expansion of PERN, and twinning and trainings planned during the first couple of years of the project.

### B. Rationale for Restructuring

- 4. COVID-19 has created new challenges for the higher education sector.** The Universities in Pakistan have been compelled to adopt an online mode of education to protect their faculty members, students, and staff from the pandemic. The initial assessment carried out by the HEC reflected that most of the Universities were not well equipped to offer education through online mode. Out of 205 Universities, only 40 Universities had well established Learning Management Systems, which is a mandatory requirement for online education/blended learning. In addition, the changes across the globe with limitations on travel and in person conferences and meetings since project inception have also led HEC to realign to better respond to faculty and student needs.



5. **In response to the changing realities, the Government of Pakistan (GoP) has requested a restructuring of the Project.** The request is to (a) introduce a new component which focuses specifically on support to continued learning for all in case of unpredicted crises and university lockdowns as during COVID-19 crisis. Additionally, it supports provision of special funds to universities to increase their financial autonomy to improve quality of remote learning and support students with technological needs; and (b) redesign results framework that aligns better with the recent development at HEC and the current realities including the COVID-19 crisis.
  
6. **The proposed restructuring will also entail reallocation of funds between components to better address the on-going needs and priorities.** For instance, it adjusts certain activities under Component 2 (Supporting Decentralized Higher Education Institutes for Improved Teaching and Learning) to better respond to the needs of the affiliated college sector within the new reality; large procurements under Component 4 (Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services) are proposed to be undertaken under the IPF part of the project due to reductions in HEC's recurring budget. In addition, the restructuring will allow the HEDP to better align with the recently approved Undergraduate Policy. The overall allocation of funds for both PBC and IPF parts of the project will remain the same and funds from existing components will be reallocated to the new component, based on an assessment by HEC to better respond to the socio-economic disruptions for the sector due to the pandemic.

## II. DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED CHANGES

### C. Proposed Changes

7. **There are no changes to the Project Development Objective (PDO) of the project.**



## Project Scope

8. **The revised project scope aligns with the existing PDO.** Based on the immediate and short-term needs of the higher education sector due to the pandemic, the HEDP project will introduce another component which will address the urgent needs in the sector including those caused by the COVID-19. The new Component 6 of the project also has performance-based conditions (PBC) linked to disbursements and has US\$42.5 million assigned to it. There is a reduction in the funds allocation to component 1 from US\$126 million to US\$109.82 million due to impact on quality of research proposals for the Grand Challenge Fund (GCF) because of the pandemic related limits to accessing laboratories and events to foster partnerships. This prompted a re-assessment of targets and funds assigned to the component. An additional Rapid Research Response Grant targeted specifically towards the current pandemic is introduced in Component 1. Component 2 and 4 are proposed to be restructured to repurpose funds for Component 6. The proposed scope of Component 2, *Supporting Decentralized Higher Education Institutes for Improved Teaching and Learning*; is reduced from US\$127 million to US\$89.18 million. There are no changes to the existing activities of Component 3, *Equipping Students and Higher Education Institutions with Modern Technology*, which is an input-based component. However, some of the procurement activities under Component 4, *Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services*; have been moved to Component 3. Component 4 has thus reduced from US\$70 million to US\$35 million.
9. The project safeguards category remains B, as originally envisaged to address the environmental and social impacts. A detailed comparison of activities in the original project design with the proposed changes is provided in Annex 1. Details on changes under each component are discussed below.
10. **Component 1: Nurturing Academic Excellence in Strategic Sectors (US\$109.82 million)**

The overall objective of Component 1 remains the same with an aim to provide competitive research, innovation, and commercialization grants to researchers and potential entrepreneurs from among faculty members, current students, or fresh graduates of the HEIs. The overall target for the project is being revised and reduced as is the financing allocated to the component. In addition, a rapid research grant has been introduced which is a grant awarded competitively to researchers in order to respond to COVID-19 pandemic.
11. **Component 1 supports three types of research grants:** The Grand Challenge Fund (GCF) aims at supporting multisectoral/multidimensional collaboration between universities. The first round of call for proposals for GCF grants saw fewer than expected applications meet the award criteria. This appears to be because of limited opportunities for interaction among researchers and limited access to laboratories because of COVID-19 related lockdowns. The targets for this grant are being revised downwards to address this reality. Additionally, the Local Challenge Fund that takes into account the relevance of the research to the local community, industry and local government, is being divided into two elements: Element 1 will focus on non-research-intensive institutions under which successful projects will have a research focus on addressing Local Challenge while also building the research capacity and contributing to the research mission of the host institution; Element 2 will focus on research-intensive institutions which address a local research challenge. Together these elements will provide scope for a wider range of universities to participate and strengthen their research capacities in locally relevant socio-economic issues and/or research addressing any of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The targets under PBC 1- *Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded* and PBC 2 - *Outcomes achieved under the competitive research grants awarded under the Project* will be revised to reflect the changes above. Additional DLR has been added within PBC 1 which supports development of a central data bank on SDG related data. The SDG database is a collection of information about SDG indicators at the district level local setting. This data will enable government to understand the stage at which SDG has reached in their respective districts and municipalities and involve local academics to produce research outputs on SDG related areas. Component 1



also has an additional DLR to disburse funds to Centers of Excellence established in the country. The fund disbursement will be against a set of criteria being developed by HEC.

**12. Component 2: Supporting Decentralized Higher Education Institutes for Improved Teaching and Learning (US\$89.18 million)**

This component aims to improve the quality of education delivered by Tier 2 universities and Affiliates Colleges (ACs). It will support almost 500 public ACs and AUs in improved teaching and learning activities by (i) strengthening the college affiliation system; (ii) improving the curriculum offered in the ACs by changing the types of degrees offered; (iii) encouraging diversity among students being enrolled and linking students and graduates to employers in the area; (iv) improving the M&E of the AC system; and (v) connecting ACs to PERN. This component was supported under six PBCs, PBC 3- *Number of functional QECAC in AUs*, PBC 4 - *Improvement of Undergraduate Education – Associate Degrees*, PBC 5 - *Improvement of Undergraduate Education – 4-year Bachelor programs*, PBC 12 (previously PBC 6) - *Development and Implementation of skills courses for community colleges* and PBC 7 - *Proportion of faculty and staff trained*, and PBC 8 - *Expansion of PERN*. The HEC recently developed its Undergraduate Education Policy (UEP) 2020 which outlines a comprehensive framework for Bachelors and Associate Degree programs across Pakistan. The targets for PBC 4 and PBC 5 have been revised to ensure the planned activities will assist in its roll-out over the life of the project and adjusted for the impact of COVID-19 related impact. PBC 12 (previously PBC 6) *Development and Implementation of skills courses for community colleges* is being dropped as it is no longer relevant because skills courses will now be embedded within the reform program for undergraduate degrees at affiliated colleges.

**13. A new PBC 6 is now being introduced which supports regional hubs for the National Academy for Higher Education (NAHE).** Since the HEI sector in Pakistan comprises of over 220 institutions spread all over the provinces as well as in Islamabad Capital Territory, faculty and staff development needs to be decentralized for easy access and greater impact. NAHE will thus set up regional centers in the four provinces. As a first step these hubs will use the regional centers of HEC and augment facilities to create a vibrant capacity building hub to reach out to the dozens of HEIs in each province. Regional NAHE and the Postsecondary Education Reform Unit (PERU) will jointly develop a training curriculum targeting the needs of the provincial affiliated colleges and Affiliating Universities (AUs) in line with the new undergraduate policy. In addition, the restructuring proposes to reduce the scale of PBC 7 to focus solely on affiliated colleges and support in the implementation of the UEP 2020. PBC 8 is now being dropped from under Component 2 and shifted to the new Component 6 because of its better alignment with the new activities proposed under Component 6. With the proposed changes, the total financing for the Component 2 is now reduced to US\$89.18 million.

**14. Component 3: Equipping Students and Higher Education Institutions with Modern Technology (IDA US\$52.7 million):** This component retains its original planned activities which include (i) improving policy environment for ICT use; (ii) Enhancing PERN activities; and (iii) Expanding PERN vertically. Additionally, under the restructuring this component will also include sub-component 4.2: *Digitization of University Administration* which is now proposed as an input-based activity rather than a performance-based condition as planned in the original project design. This component now includes the procurement of the ERP and SLCS which was previously under Component 4. This subcomponent aims to help universities move to ERP solutions for automation of finance, HR and procurement activities and student lifecycle solution for automation of functions such as admissions, registrar function, alumni relations and student scholarship/aid. The HEC has also made good progress in the work to create the Higher Education Management System (including the procurement of an ERP and Student Lifecycle Solution for universities) which has gone through a lot of scrutiny. As these systems entail large procurements, PBC 9 - *Universities digitizing their administration* will be reduced and the relevant activities for digitization will be carried out under the technical assistance component, thus reducing the size of this PBC by US\$35 million. This will enable



the project to expedite large procurements through Government systems and avoid unnecessary delays and ensure availability of resources for these procurements. Based on the assessment of the procurement of the systems, the total funds assigned to this component are increased to US\$ 52.7 million.

**15. Component 4: Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services (US\$35 million)**

The objective of this component is to improve the collection and use of data for national level policy-decisions, while automating business processes in higher education institutions. This component retains the first sub-component from the original project: *4.1. HEC's Data Repository*. The Higher Education Data Repository (HEDR) was developed in March 2020 and has been used to collect data about online readiness of universities during the COVID-19 crisis. During the pandemic, the HEC also brought all its administrative systems online, resulting in a paperless office workflow. The second sub-component: *4.2. Digitization of University Administration* is being assigned as an input-based component and is moved to Component 3 for easy distinction between performance-based conditions and input-based components. Details are given in paragraph 14 above. Therefore, the Component 4 is being reduced to US\$35 million.





16. **Component 5: Capacity Building through Partnerships, Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation (US\$24.3 million)**

This component will support HEC in strengthening its core functions of regulation, capacity building, and funding of Pakistan’s higher education sector through strategic and targeted TA. In addition, it will support the TA required for the implementation of various components and subcomponents and for the achievement of results and PBCs. There is a reduction in funds allocated to this component for two reasons: firstly, because of the COVID-19 related restrictions, the planned twinning and partnership activities between Pakistan and international universities have been reduced. It is considered unlikely that intensive in person collaboration will happen till end of calendar year 2022. Secondly, the National Academy for Higher Education (NAHE) has managed to reduce costs utilizing the online and remote teaching modalities. The estimated budget needs have reduced accordingly.

17. **Component 6: Improving access and quality of remote learning and support to universities and Affiliated Colleges (US\$89 million)**

A new component is proposed to be added to help improve support to higher education institutes which have been majorly impacted by the COVID-19 crisis. There are two subcomponents which are linked to two PBCs. Subcomponent 6.1 *Use of the Special Funds for Improving Universities’ Financial Autonomy and Improving Governance* aims to support universities with emergency grants and special funds to tackle crisis situations in the future as well as the present COVID-19 crisis. It will also help develop capacity building strategy and support implementation of capacity building for university sector financial autonomy and revenue generation.<sup>1</sup> Policy guidelines will relate to endowment funds in the universities and support for improved governance utilizing latest technology. The HEC will carry out consultative sessions to develop a new framework for transfer and management of funds. All of this will be supported under the new PBC 10. Sub-component 6.2 – *Quality of remote learning* will support development of a quality assurance framework for remote learning in order to ensure standards are followed across the board. The remote learning solutions developed will enable improved student evaluation and feedback. There will be an emphasis on developing a robust student feedback mechanism because there have been clear signs of dissatisfaction from students on the support provided to them during extensive closures of educational institutes. The activities will be supported under PBC 11 – *Quality of remote learning*. Additionally, subcomponent 2.4 from the original design is now being placed under component 6 due to its better alignment with the objective of component 6. Therefore, component 6.3 is: *Connecting Affiliating Colleges to Pakistan Education and Research Network (PERN)* which is associated with PBC 8 – *Expansion of PERN*. This helps provide access to remote learning for students in affiliated colleges.

Table 1. Cost Table by Sub-component

	PBC (DLI)	Value	Original amount (US\$ millions)	Revised amount (US\$ millions)
Results Based part of the project				

<sup>1</sup> In order to achieve financial autonomy, policy guidelines will include clauses such as: the universities must ascertain their future liabilities particularly the huge liabilities of pension of its employees through Actuary study. Secondly the universities are advised to establish Office for Alumni Engagement; create and maintain database of all students and tracking their carrier growth using modern IT tools and Social Media; arrange Student’s Reunion Functions annually to solicit donations by reaching out to your key alumni.



<b>Component 1: Nurturing Academic Excellence in Strategic Sectors (Original: US\$126 million. Revised US\$109.82 million)</b>	1	<i>Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded</i>	68	65.82
	2	<i>Outcomes achieved under the competitive research grants awarded under the Project</i>	58	44.00
<b>Component 2: Supporting Decentralized Higher Education Institutes for Improved Teaching and Learning (IDA US\$127 million; Revised: US\$89.18 million)</b>	3	<i>Number of functional QECAC in AUs</i>	20	25
	4	<i>Improvement of Undergraduate Education – Associate Degrees</i>	16.5	16.5
	5	<i>Improvement of Undergraduate Education – 4-year Bachelor programs</i>	10	21
	12	<i>Development and Implementation of Skills Courses for Community Colleges</i>	16.5	0
	Revised	NAHE Regional Institutes	0	14.98
	7	<i>Proportion of faculty and staff trained</i>	14	11.70
<b>Component 4: Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services (US\$70 million; Revised: US\$35 million)</b>	8		50	
	9	<i>Universities digitizing their administration</i>	70	35
<b>Component 6: Improving access and quality of remote learning and support to universities and Affiliated Colleges (US\$89 million)</b>	8	<i>Expansion of PERN</i>	n/a	46.50
	New 10	<i>Use of the Special Funds for Improving Universities' Financial Autonomy and Improving Governance Using the Latest Technology</i>	n/a	32.5
	New 11	<i>Quality of remote learning</i>	n/a	10
<b>Investment Part of the project</b>				
<b>Component 3: Equipping Students and Higher Education Institutions with Modern Technology (IDA US\$27 million; Revised US\$52.70 million)</b>			27	52.70



Component 5: Capacity Building through Partnerships, Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation (IDA US\$50 million; Revised: US\$24.3 million)			50	24.30
	Total from PBCs		323	323
	Total with IPF		400	400

18. Revised Implementation Arrangements

There is no change anticipated in the implementation arrangement of the project. The project will continue with the arrangements specified in the original financial agreements.

19. Project Operations Manual: The project Operational Manual will be updated and revised based on the changes proposed in the restructuring paper. The project will be implemented according to the guidelines and procedures outlined in the updated OM. The OM will be updated periodically and cleared by the Bank. The OM lays out the roles and responsibilities of different stakeholders and provides details of project processes and the project cycle.

20. Social and Environmental Safeguards: There will be no change in Environment Assessment category and the project will remain as Category B, and no additional safeguards policies are triggered.

21. Results Framework: The Results Framework has been updated in line with the revised project design. There are no changes to PDO level indicators. Intermediate indicators for Components have been replaced/revised to reflect the proposed changes.

22. COVID-19 Response: The restructured project includes approximately US\$93 million in COVID-related funding which is allocated across most components, specifically, component 1, 3 and new component 6. The project components also factor in, where applicable, changes to the activities to respond to the needs of the HEC and beneficiary students arising from the disruptions caused by the pandemic including improving quality of remote learning and expansion of learning management system across universities (US\$10 million), support for hybrid mode of education through expansion of PERN (US\$46.5 million) and procedures for transfers of funds to universities from HEC to respond more effectively to COVID-19 (US\$32.5 million). The project also includes rapid research grants on COVID-19 (US\$4 million). These activities will be monitored with the Results Framework for the project. These activities support Pillar 2 - Protecting Poor and Vulnerable People and Pillar 4 - Strengthening Policies, Institutions and Investments for Rebuilding Better of the WBG COVID-19 Approach Paper by addressing the immediate needs of students due to university closure as well as developing the sector to be prepared for future shocks.



**III. SUMMARY OF CHANGES**

	Changed	Not Changed
Results Framework	✓	
PBCs	✓	
Components and Cost	✓	
Disbursement Estimates	✓	
Implementing Agency		✓
DDO Status		✓
Project's Development Objectives		✓
Loan Closing Date(s)		✓
Cancellations Proposed		✓
Reallocation between Disbursement Categories		✓
Disbursements Arrangements		✓
Overall Risk Rating		✓
Safeguard Policies Triggered		✓
EA category		✓
Legal Covenants		✓
Institutional Arrangements		✓
Financial Management		✓
Procurement		✓
Implementation Schedule		✓
Other Change(s)		✓
Economic and Financial Analysis		✓
Technical Analysis		✓
Social Analysis		✓
Environmental Analysis		✓



**IV. DETAILED CHANGE(S)**

**COMPONENTS**

<b>Current Component Name</b>	<b>Current Cost (US\$M)</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Proposed Component Name</b>	<b>Proposed Cost (US\$M)</b>
Nurturing Academic Excellence in Strategic Sectors	126.00	Revised	Nurturing Academic Excellence in Strategic Sectors	109.82
Supporting Decentralized Higher Education Institutes for Improved Teaching and Learning	127.00	Revised	Supporting Decentralized Higher Education Institutes for Improved Teaching and Learning	89.18
Equipping Students and Higher Education Institutions with Modern Technology	27.00	Revised	Equipping Students and Higher Education Institutions with Modern Technology	52.70
Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services	70.00	Revised	Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services	35.00
Capacity Building through Partnerships, Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation	50.00	Revised	Capacity Building through Partnerships, Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation	24.30
	0.00	New	Improving access and quality of remote learning and support to universities	89.00
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>400.00</b>			<b>400.00</b>

**DISBURSEMENT ESTIMATES**

Change in Disbursement Estimates

Yes

<b>Year</b>	<b>Current</b>	<b>Proposed</b>
2019	0.00	0.00
2020	75,000,000.00	65,000,000.00
2021	70,000,000.00	43,630,000.00



## The World Bank

Higher Education Development in Pakistan (P161386)

2022	95,000,000.00	125,710,000.00
2023	80,000,000.00	88,420,000.00
2024	73,000,000.00	77,240,000.00
2025	7,000,000.00	0.00



Results framework

COUNTRY: Pakistan

Higher Education Development in Pakistan

Project Development Objectives(s)

To support research excellence in strategic sectors of the economy, improve teaching and learning and strengthen governance, in the higher education sector.

Project Development Objective Indicators by Objectives/ Outcomes

Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<b>Support research excellence in strategic sectors of the economy</b>							
Number of faculty and students benefiting from competitive research grants and innovator seed funds (of which females) (Cumulative) (Text)		NA		All: 100; Females: 25	All: 250.00; Females: 67	All: 350.00; Females: 105	All: 350.00; Females: 105
Outcomes achieved under the competitive research grants awarded under the project (Text)		NA	--	10 Rapid Research Grants achieve at least 50 percent of their outcome targets	(i) 32 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 30 percent of their outcome targets (ii) 10 Rapid Research Grants achieve at least 80 percent of their outcome targets	(i) 32 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 60 percent of their outcome targets(ii) 30 competitive research grants awarded in Year 3 have achieved 30 percent of their outcome targets	(i) 32 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 80 percent of their outcome targets (ii) 30 competitive research grants awarded in Year 3 have achieved 60 percent of their outcome targets



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>							
<b>Improve teaching and learning</b>							
Progress in learning achievement of AC students (Text)		NA	--	Test designed and piloted	Test administered for the first time and baseline established	--	Test administered for the second time and 5 percent increase over baseline
<b>Strengthen governance</b>							
Number of universities that have enhanced autonomy (cumulative) (Text)		--	HEC has developed and adopted criteria for granting of enhanced autonomy	--	3.00	6.00	10.00

### Intermediate Results Indicators by Components

Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<b>Nurturing academic excellence in strategic sectors</b>							
Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded (Text)	PBC 1, 1	NA	HEC has developed and adopted an Operations Manual for the Project which includes the grant funding mechanism for the Competitive Research Grants and ISF	(i) HEC has awarded 10 Rapid Research Grants related to COVID-19. (ii) HEC has awarded a total of 45 Competitive Research Grants (5 GCF Grants, 20 TTSF Grants	(i) HEC has awarded additional 60 Competitive Research Grants, over and above those awarded in Year 2 (15 GCF Grants, 20 TTSF Grants, 20 LCF Grants	HEC has awarded additional 15 ISF Grants, over and above those awarded in Years 3	HEC has an additional 15 ISF grants over and above those awarded in year 4





Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
			Grants.	and 20 LCF Grants)	and 5 CoE), (ii) HEC has awarded additional 15 ISF Grants.		
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>							
Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded to proposals with female principle investigators/ led by female recipients (Text)	NA	NA	(i)At least 10 CRGs have female principle investigators	(i) At least 10 CRGs have female principle investigators over and above the target for year 2.(ii) At least 4 additional ISF grants over and above those awarded in year 2 are led by female recipients	At least 5 additional ISF, over and above year 3 are led by female recipients		No target for Year 5
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>							
<b>Rationale:</b> <b>Number of female PI reduced in proportion to the reduction in CRGs numbers in PBC1.</b>							
Number of ORICs and BiCs performing satisfactorily (cumulative) (Text)	N/A		Revised scorecard developed for measuring performance of ORICs and BiCs	ORICs: 20 BiCs: 3	ORICs: 30 BiCs:5	ORICs: 40 BiCs:8	ORICs: 50 BiCs: 10
<b>Support to decentralized higher education institutions for improved teaching and learning</b>							
Number of functional QECAC in AUs (Text)	PBC 3, 3	NA	3.00	An additional 3 AU's over and above Year 1 have functional QECAC	An additional 11 AU's over and above Year 1 and 2 have functional QECAC	An additional 12 AU's over and above Year 1, 2 and 3 have functional QECAC	An additional 12 AU's over and above Year 1,2, 3 and 4 have functional QECAC



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<i>Action: This indicator has been Revised</i>							
Development and implementation of AD programs (Text)	PBC 4, 4	N/A	Need Assessment study for developing AD programs completed	HEC has adopted a framework for the Associate Degrees (AD) based on the needs and in accordance with international best practices	(i) HEC has adopted detailed implementation guides for the implementation and training of the AD programs.  (ii) 70 Affiliated Colleges have enrolled the first cohort of students in the undergraduate programs developed in Year 2	(i) Additional 70 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 target, have enrolled the first cohort of students in the newly developed undergraduate programs	(i) Additional 70 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 and 4 targets, have enrolled the first cohort of students in at least one of the Associate Degree programs
<i>Action: This indicator has been Revised</i>							
Implementation of 4 year Bachelor program (Text)	PBC 5, 5	NA	19 Affiliated Colleges have enrolled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program.	(i) HEC has adopted a framework for the four-year BS Degree based on the needs and in accordance with international best practices. (ii) HEC has developed an career and internship framework to be implemented by universities and affiliated colleges	(i) 40 Affiliated Colleges, have enrolled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program. (ii) 9 affiliating universities implement the career and internship framework	(i) Additional 36 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3, have enrolled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program. (ii) 10 affiliating universities implement the career and internship framework	(i) Additional 19 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3, have enrolled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program. (ii) 10 affiliating universities implement the career and internship framework



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
<i>Action: This indicator has been Revised</i>							
Development and Implementation of Skills Courses for CCs (Text)	PBC 12	NA	HEC has carried out a needs assessment study for the development of skills courses	5.00	(i) 6 CCs have implemented at least one of the courses developed in Year 2  (ii) Additional 5 courses over and above those accounted for Year 2 target, have been developed	(i) Additional 7 CCs over and above those considered for Year 3 target, have implemented at least one of the courses developed in Year 2 and 3  (ii) Additional 5 courses over and above those accounted for Year 2 and 3, have been developed.	(i) Additional 7 CCs over and above those considered for Year 3 and 4 target, have implemented at least one of the courses developed in Year 2, 3 and 4.  (ii) Additional 5 courses over and above those accounted for Year 2,3 and 4, have been developed.
<i>Action: This indicator has been Marked for Deletion</i>							
Proportion of faculty and staff trained (Text)	PBC 7, 8	NA	10% of faculty and staff of public Affiliating Universities and public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and 4-year Bachelor Programs have been trained	HEC adopts a strategy for training of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing the two-year Associate Degree Programs and Revised four-year Bachelor Programs, based on	NAHE has trained 20% of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs	An additional 30% of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associated Degrees and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and above the cumulative 20% required	An additional 30% of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and above the cumulative 50% required



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
				consultation of key stakeholders.		under Year 3 targets have been trained	under Years 3 and 4 targets, have been trained
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>							
Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning (CRI, Number)		750,000.00	825,000.00	907,500.00	998,250.00	1,098,075.00	1,207,883.00
Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning - Female (CRI, Number)		300,000.00	338,250.00	381,150.00	429,248.00	483,153.00	531,468.00
Expansion of PERN (Text)	PBC 8, 9	PERN is available to 278 institutions, of which 38 offering eduroam	(i) 75 additional higher education institutions (HEI), over and above those considered as baseline, have been connected to PERN(ii) 15 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline, offer campus-wide Eduroam.	(i) 90 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Year 1, have been connected to PERN; (ii) 15 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Year 1, offer campus-wide Eduroam.	(i) 75 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1 and 2, have been connected to PERN; (ii) 20 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1 and 2, offer campus-wide Eduroam.	60 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1, 2 and 3, have been connected to PERN.	No target for year 5. In total 300 HEIs have been connected to PERN and 50 offer campus-wide Eduroam
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>							
Proportion of women's only affiliated colleges benefiting from project interventions (Text)		Twenty-six percent of all affiliated colleges in	--	50.00	50.00	50.00	50.00



Indicator Name	PBC	Baseline	Intermediate Targets				End Target
			1	2	3	4	
		Pakistan are “women’s only”					
<b>Equipping Students and Higher Education Institutions with Modern Technology</b>							
Blended learning programs (cumulative) (Text)		--	-	--	200.00	400.00	800.00
<b>Higher Education Management Information System and Data Driven Services</b>							
Universities digitizing their administration (cumulative) (Text)	PBC 9, 10	0.00	(i) HEC has established a central Data Repository (ii) 10 universities have piloted a digitized administration.	HEC has done a pilot of 10 universities have directly fed data into HEC’s Data Repository using a web-based reporting system	HEC has produced and published an annual report using the information derived from its Data Repository	HEC has published a second annual report and a strategic plan, leveraging data from the its Data Repository	HEC has published a third an annual report using information derived from its Data Repository
<b>Action: This indicator has been Revised</b>							
<b>Capacity Building, Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation</b>							
Citizen Engagement: Stakeholder feedback survey conducted (Text)		NA	Initial survey designed and administered. Baseline satisfaction levels established		Second survey administered and satisfaction level of stakeholders increased by 5 percent over baseline		Third survey administered and satisfaction level of stakeholders increased by 10 percent over baseline

**Performance-Based Conditions Matrix**

Performance-Based Conditions Matrix				
PBC 1	Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded			
Type of PBC	Scalability	Unit of Measure	Total Allocated Amount (USD)	As % of Total Financing Amount
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	68,000,000.00	0.00
Period	Value		Allocated Amount (USD)	Formula
Baseline	NA			
June 2020	HEC has developed and adopted an Operations Manual for the project which includes the grant funding mechanism for competitive research grants and Innovator seed fund grants .		1,000,000.00	N/A
June 2021	(i) HEC has awarded atleast 75 competitive research grants (25 GCF grants, 35 TTSF and 15 LCF grants); (ii) HEC has awarded 15 number of ISF grants		32,500,000.00	a. US\$21.5 million for GCF grants of which US\$8.6 million fo
June 2022	(i) HEC has awarded a total of 75 competitive research grants (25 GCF grants, 35 TTSF grants and 15 LCF grants), over and above those awarded in Year 2; (ii) HEC has awarded 15 number of ISF grants, over and above those awarded in Year 2		32,500,000.00	a. US\$21.5 million for GCF grants of which US\$8.6 million fo
June 2023	HEC has an additional 15 number of ISF grants over and above those awarded in year 2 and 3		2,000,000.00	US\$2 million of which US\$1.09 million for 8 ISF awarded and
June 2024	No target for year 5		0.00	
<b>Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.</b>				



<b>PBC 1</b>				
<i>Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded</i>				
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
<i>Intermediate Outcome</i>	Yes	Text	65,820,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
<i>Baseline</i>	NA			
<i>June 2020</i>	<i>HEC has developed and adopted an Operations Manual for the project which includes the grant funding mechanism for competitive research grants and Innovator seed fund grants .</i>		1,000,000.00	N/A
<i>June 2021</i>	<i>(i) HEC has selected and awarded 10 Rapid Research Grants related to COVID-19 [(i) \$1,200,000](ii) HEC awards competitive research grants [(ii) \$ 14,430,000 upon achieving a total of 45 competitive research grants]. These include: (a) 5 GCF grants (\$860,000 for each grant awarded to a maximum of \$4,300,000 for GCF in year 2);(b) 15 LCF-Element-1 (\$260,000 for each LCF awarded to a maximum of \$,3,900,000 for the LCF-Element 1 in year 2);(c) 5 LCF-Element-2 grants (\$650,000 for each LCF awarded to a maximum of \$3,250,000 for the LCF-Element-2 grants for year 2);(d) 20 TTSE grants (\$149,000 for each grant awarded).(iii) HEC has designed and implemented a capacity Building program for GCF, LCF-1, LCF-2, and TTSE, including tailored support for female PIs.</i>		17,630,000.00	<i>(i)\$1,200,000 for (i), (ii)\$14,430,000 for (ii), (iii)\$2,000,000 for (iii)</i>



<p>June 2022</p>	<p>(i) HEC awards competitive research grants, which includes (a) 15 GCF grants, (b) 10 LCF Element-1 (c) 10 LCF Element-2 grants, (d) 20 TTSF, (e) 5 CoE grants over and above any grants awarded in Year 2. A total of 60 competitive research grants over and above those grants awarded in year 2 of which:(a) \$12,900,000 for GCF grant of which \$860,000 for each GCF grant awarded(b) \$2,600,000 for the LCF-Element-1 grants of which \$260,000 for each LCF awarded. (c) \$6,500,000 for the LCF-Element-2 grants of which \$650,000 for each LCF awarded. (d) TTSF awarded to a maximum of \$2,980,000 for the TTSF grants in year 2 of which \$149,000 for each grant).(e) \$5,000,000 for the CoE grants, of which \$1,000,000 for each grant made to a CoE;(ii) HEC has awarded 15 ISF grants (\$1,800,000 of which \$120,000 for each ISF awarded); and(iii) HEC is continuing to implement a capacity Building program for GCF, LCF-1, LCF-2, TTSF and ISF, including tailored support for female PIs. and(iv) HEC has designed and rolled out a capacity Building program for ISF grants supporting the Business Incubator Centers (BICs), as well as for grants management and implementation. (v) HEC has created a data depositing scheme for microdata and SDG-related data involving ORICs at the university level.</p>	<p>35,780,000.00</p>	<p>(i)\$ 29,980,000, (ii)\$1,800,000, (iii) \$1,000,000, (iv)\$1,000,000, (v)\$2,000,000</p>
<p>June 2023</p>	<p>(i) HEC has an additional 15 ISF grants over and above those awarded in year 3 (\$1,800,000 of which \$120,000 for each ISF awarded)(ii) HEC is implementing and expanded a capacity Building program for ISF grants supporting the Business</p>	<p>5,800,000.00</p>	<p>(i)\$1,800,000 for (i), (ii)\$2,000,000 for (ii), (iii)\$2,000,000 for (iii)</p>





	<i>Incubator Centers (BICs), as well as for grants management and implementation. (iii) HEC has updated and maintained the data depositing scheme for microdata and SDG-related data involving ORICs at the university level.</i>			
June 2024	<i>(i) HEC has an additional 15 ISF grants over and above those awarded in year 4 (\$1,800,000 of which \$120,000 for each ISF awarded)(ii) HEC has implemented a capacity Building program for grants management and implementation. (iii) HEC has updated and maintained the data depositing scheme for microdata and SDG-related data involving ORICs at the university level.</i>			<i>5,610,000.00 (i)\$1,800,000 for (i), (ii)\$1,810,000 for (ii), (iii)\$2,000,000 for (iii)</i>
<b>PBC 2</b>	<b>Outcomes achieved under the competitive research grants awarded under the project</b>			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Outcome	Yes	Text	58,000,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
Baseline	N/A			
June 2020	No target		0.00	
June 2021	no target		0.00	
June 2022	30 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 30 percent of their outcome targets		7,250,000.00	US\$7.25 million of which US\$4.8 million upon achievement of
June 2023	(i) 40 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 60 percent of their outcome targets (ii) 30 competitive research grants		18,750,000.00	(a) US\$11.5 million of which US\$8.625 million upon achieveme



	awarded in Year 3 have achieved 30 percent of their outcome targets			
June 2024	(i) 60 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 80 percent of their outcome targets (ii) 40 competitive research grants awarded in Year 3 have achieved 60 percent of their outcome targets	32,000,000.00	(a) US\$ 20.5 million of which US\$13.66 million upon achievement	
<b>Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.</b>				
<b>PBC 2</b>	<b>Outcomes achieved under the competitive research grants awarded under the project</b>			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Outcome	Yes	Text	44,000,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
Baseline	N/A			
June 2020	No target		0.00	
June 2021	(i) (a) Adoption of system for outcome tracking and management of grants, including guidelines for results; (b) Research Grants Management System is being used to manage research grants application, award and outcomes tracking. (ii) Rapid Research Grants awarded have partially achieved the agreed outcomes (\$280,000 per Rapid research grant achieving 50 percent of their outcome targets to a maximum of \$2,800,000)(iii) HEC has disseminated key research outcomes to the academic community		5,800,000.00	(i) US\$2,000,000 for (a) and (b) (ii) \$2,800,000 for (ii) (iii) \$1,000,000 for (iii)



<p>June 2022</p>	<p>(i) 32 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 30 percent of their outcome targets including: a)\$400,000 per GCF for 4 GCF, b)\$250,000 per LCF for 12 LCF, c)\$200,000 per TTSF for 16 TTSF competitive research grants reaching 30 percent of their outcome targets)(ii) Rapid Research Grants awarded have achieved 80 percent of the agreed outcomes (\$190,000 per RRG for 10 RRGs) (iii) Research Grants Management System is being used to manage research grants application, award and outcomes tracking. (iv) HEC has disseminated key research outcomes to the academic community</p>	<p>11,700,000.00</p>	<p>(i)\$7,800,000 for (i), (ii)\$1,900,000 for (ii), (iii)\$1,000,000 for (iii)</p>
<p>June 2023</p>	<p>(i) 32 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 60 percent of their outcome targets including: a)\$275,000 per each GCF for 4 GCF, b)\$150,000 per each LCF for 12 LCF, c)\$100,000 per each TTSF for 16 TTSF competitive research grants awarded in year 2 achieving 60 percent of their outcome targets(ii) 30 competitive research grants awarded in Year 3 have achieved 30 percent of their outcome targets: a) \$400,000 per each GCF for 8 GCF, b)\$250,000 per each LCF for 12,c)\$200,000 per TTSF for 10 TTSF competitive research grants awarded in year 3 achieving 30 percent of their outcome targets.(iii) Research Grants Management System is being used to manage research grants application, award and outcomes tracking. (iv) HEC has disseminated key research outcomes to the academic community</p>	<p>14,700,000.00</p>	<p>(i)\$4,500,000 for (i), (ii)\$ 8,200,000 for (ii), (iii)\$1,000,000 for (iii), (iv)\$1,000,000 for (iv)</p>



June 2024	(i) 32 competitive research grants awarded in Year 2 have achieved 80 percent of their outcome targets a)\$250,000 per GCF for 4 GCF, b)\$150,000 per LCF for 12 LCF, c)\$125,000 per TTSF for 16 TTSF competitive research grants achieving 80 percent of their outcome targets(ii) 30 competitive research grants awarded in Year 3 have achieved 60 percent of their outcome targets a)\$275,000 per GCF for 8 GCF, b)\$150,000 per LCF for 12 LCF grants, c)\$100,000 per TTSF for 10 TTSF competitive research grants achieving 60 percent of their outcome targets(iii) Research Grants Management System is being used to manage research grants application, award and outcomes tracking. (iv) HEC has disseminated key research outcomes to the academic community	11,800,000.00	(i)\$4,800,000 for (i), (ii)\$5,000,000 for (ii), (iii) \$1,000,000 for (iii), (iv)\$1,000,000 for (iv)
-----------	---	---------------	---

PBC 3				
Number of functional QECAC in AUs				
Type of PBC	Scalability	Unit of Measure	Total Allocated Amount (USD)	As % of Total Financing Amount
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	20,000,000.00	0.00
Period	Value		Allocated Amount (USD)	Formula
Baseline	NA			
June 2020	3 AU's have functional QECAC		3,000,000.00	US\$3 million of which US\$1 million for each functional QECAC
June 2021	An additional 3 AU's over and above those counted for Year 1 have functional QECAC		3,000,000.00	US\$3 million of which US\$1 million for each functional QECAC
June 2022	An additional 4 AU's over and above those counted for Year 1 and 2 have functional QECAC		4,000,000.00	US\$4 million of which US\$1 million of each functional QECAC



June 2023	An additional 5 AU's over and above those counted for Year 1, 2 and 3 have functional QECAC	5,000,000.00	US\$5 million of which US\$1 million of each functional QECAC
June 2024	An additional 5 AU's over and above those counted for Year 1,2, 3 and 4 have functional QECAC	5,000,000.00	US\$5 million of which US\$1 million of each functional QECAC

**Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.**

<b>PBC 3</b>				
<i>Number of functional QECAC in Affiliating Universities (AUs)</i>				
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
<i>Intermediate Outcome</i>	Yes	Text	25,000,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>	<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>		<b>Formula</b>
<i>Baseline</i>	NA			
<i>June 2020</i>	<i>3 AUs have functional QECAC (US\$1,000,000 for each functional QECAC)</i>	3,000,000.00		<i>(i)\$3,000,000 for (i), (ii)\$3,000,000 for (ii)</i>
<i>June 2021</i>	<i>(i) An additional 3 AUs over and above those counted for Year 1 have functional QECAC (\$500,000 for each functional QECAC)(ii) HEC has conducted a needs assessment and strategy for reorganization of university-level QECs in which QECACs are embedded.</i>	3,100,000.00		<i>(i)\$1,500,000 for (i), (ii)\$1,600,000 for (ii)</i>
<i>June 2022</i>	<i>(i) An additional 11 AUs over and above those counted for Year 1 and 2 have functional QECAC (\$500,000 for each functional QECAC)(ii) Pilot has been conducted in which 5 universities have implemented the reorganization of QECs.</i>	6,500,000.00		<i>(i)\$5,500,000 for (i), (ii)\$1,000,000 for (ii)</i>
<i>June 2023</i>	<i>(i) An additional 12 AUs over and above those counted for Year 1, 2 and 3 have functional</i>	6,200,000.00		<i>(i)\$4,200,000 for (i), (ii)\$2,000,000 for (ii)</i>



	<i>QECAC (\$350,000 for each functional QECAC)(ii) 20 universities have implemented the reorganization of QECs</i>			
June 2024	<i>(i) An additional 12 AU's over and above those counted for Year 1,2, 3 and 4 have functional QECAC (\$350,000 for each functional QECAC)(ii) 20 additional universities over and above those implementing the reorganization of QECs in year 4 have implemented the reorganization of QECs.</i>			<i>6,200,000.00 (i)\$4,200,000 for (i), (ii)\$2,000,000 for (ii)</i>
<b>PBC 4</b>	<b>Development and implementation of AD programs</b>			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	16,500,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
Baseline	N/A			
June 2020	HEC has carried out a needs assessment study for developing AD programs		500,000.00	US\$2.5 million of which US\$0.5 million for each Associate De
June 2021	5 Associate Degree programs have been developed by HEC in accordance with international best practices		2,500,000.00	US\$2.5 million of which US\$0.5 million for each Associate De
June 2022	(i) 60 Affiliated Colleges have enrolled the first cohort of students in at least one of the Associate Degree programs developed in Year 2; (ii) Additional 5 Associate Degree programs, over and above those accounted for Year 2 target, have been developed by HEC in accordance with international best practices		4,300,000.00	US\$4.3 million of which: (a) US\$30,000 for each Associated C



June 2023	(i) Additional 70 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 target, have enrolled the first cohort of students in at least one of the Associate Degree programs developed in Years 2 and 3; (ii) Additional 5 Associate Degree programs, over and above those accounted for Years 2 and 3 targets, have been developed by HEC in accordance with international best practices	4,600,000.00	US\$4.6 million of which: (a) US\$30,000 for each Associated C
June 2024	(i) Additional 70 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 and 4 targets, have enrolled the first cohort of students in at least one of the Associate Degree programs developed in Years 2, 3 and 4; (ii) Additional 5 Associate Degree programs, over and above those accounted for Years 2, 3 and 4 targets, have been developed by HEC in accordance with international best practices	4,600,000.00	US\$4.6 million of which: (a) US\$30,000 for each Associated C

**Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.**

<b>PBC 4</b>	<b>Improvement of undergraduate education – AD programs</b>			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	16,500,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
Baseline	N/A			
June 2020			0.00	
June 2021	(i) HEC has launched a sector-wide consultation of undergraduate programs and has adopted an		6,000,000.00	(i) \$3,000,000 for (i) (ii) \$3,000,000 for (ii)



	<i>undergraduate education policy. (ii) HEC has adopted a framework for the Associate Degrees (AD) based on the needs and in accordance with international best practices</i>		
<i>June 2022</i>	<i>(i) HEC has adopted detailed implementation guides for the implementation and training of the AD programs. (ii) 70 Affiliated Colleges have enrolled the first cohort of students in the undergraduate programs developed in Year 2 (\$35,000 for each Affiliated College that has enrolled the first cohort of students in the newly rolled out Associate Degree program)</i>	<i>5,600,000.00</i>	<i>(i) \$ 3,150,000 for (i) (ii) \$2,450,000 for (ii)</i>
<i>June 2023</i>	<i>(i) Additional 70 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 target, have enrolled the first cohort of students in the newly developed undergraduate programs (\$35,000 for each Affiliated College that has enrolled the first cohort of students in the new Associate Degree program).</i>	<i>2,450,000.00</i>	<i>(i) \$2,450,000</i>
<i>June 2024</i>	<i>(i) Additional 70 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 and 4 targets, have enrolled the first cohort of students in at least one of the Associate Degree programs (\$35,000 for each Affiliated College that has enrolled the first cohort of students in the newly Associate Degree program)</i>	<i>2,450,000.00</i>	<i>(i) \$2,450,000</i>





PBC 5		Implementation of 4 year Bachelor program		
Type of PBC	Scalability	Unit of Measure	Total Allocated Amount (USD)	As % of Total Financing Amount
Intermediate Outcome	No	Text	10,000,000.00	0.00
Period	Value		Allocated Amount (USD)	Formula
Baseline	NA			
June 2020	19 Affiliated Colleges have enroled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program		1,875,000.00	NA
June 2021	Additional 19 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 1 target, have enroled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program		1,875,000.00	NA
June 2022	Additional 19 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Years 1 and 2 targets, have enroled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program.		1,875,000.00	NA
June 2023	Additional 19 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Years 1, 2 and 3 targets, have enroled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program.		2,187,500.00	NA
June 2024	Additional 19 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Years 1, 2, 3 and 4 targets, have enroled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program.		2,187,500.00	NA
<b>Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.</b>				



<b>PBC 5</b>				
<i>Implementation of 4 year Bachelor program</i>				
<i>Type of PBC</i>	<i>Scalability</i>	<i>Unit of Measure</i>	<i>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</i>	<i>As % of Total Financing Amount</i>
<i>Intermediate Outcome</i>	<i>No</i>	<i>Text</i>	<i>21,000,000.00</i>	<i>0.00</i>
<i>Period</i>	<i>Value</i>		<i>Allocated Amount (USD)</i>	<i>Formula</i>
<i>Baseline</i>	<i>NA</i>			
<i>June 2020</i>			<i>0.00</i>	<i>NA</i>
<i>June 2021</i>	<i>(i) HEC has adopted a framework for the four-year BS Degree based on the needs and in accordance with international best practices(ii) HEC has adopted detailed implementation guides for the implementation and training of the BS programs. (iii) HEC has developed a career and internship framework to be implemented by universities and affiliated colleges</i>		<i>9,000,000.00</i>	<i>(i) \$3,500,000 for (i) (ii) \$3,500,000 for (ii) (iii) \$2,000,000 for (iii)</i>
<i>June 2022</i>	<i>(i) 40 Affiliated Colleges, have enrolled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program (with \$70,000 for each affiliated college enrolling the first cohort of students). (ii) HEC has carried out a gap analysis of internship, career and placement offices to determine the support required by higher education institutions (iii) 9 affiliating universities implement the career and internship framework (with \$150,000 per affiliating university implementing the guidelines)</i>		<i>5,150,000.00</i>	<i>(i) \$2,800,000 for (i) (ii) \$1,000,000 for (ii) (iii) \$1,350,000 for (iii)</i>
<i>June 2023</i>	<i>(i) Additional 36 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3, have enrolled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor</i>		<i>4,020,000.00</i>	<i>(i) \$2,520,000 for (i) (ii) \$1,500,000 for (ii)</i>



	<i>Program (with \$70,000 for each affiliated college enrolling the first cohort of students).(ii) 10 affiliating universities implement the career and internship framework (with \$150,000 per affiliating university implementing the guidelines).</i>		
June 2024	<i>(i) Additional 19 Affiliated Colleges, over and above those considered for Years 3 and 4 targets, have enrolled the first cohort of students in a 4-year Bachelor Program (with \$70,000 for each affiliated college enrolling the first cohort of students).(ii) 10 affiliating universities implement the career and internship framework (with \$150,000 per affiliating university implementing the guidelines).</i>	2,830,000.00	(i) \$1,330,000 for (i) (ii) \$1,500,000 for (ii)

<b>PBC 6</b>	<b>Establishment of Regional NAHE Centers</b>			
--------------	---	--	--	--

Type of PBC	Scalability	Unit of Measure	Total Allocated Amount (USD)	As % of Total Financing Amount
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	14,980,000.00	0.00
Period	Value		Allocated Amount (USD)	Formula
Baseline	NA			
June 2020			0.00	
June 2021	(i) HEC adopts a Framework for Establishment of Regional NAHE Centers at Provincial Head Quarters, (ii) HEC through NAHE has developed a program based on consultations for a system of capacity building and leadership training for female HEC and university managerial and mid-level administrative staff		3,500,000.00	(i) \$2,000,000 for (i), \$1,500,000 for (ii)



June 2022	(i)HEC has established a regional center of the National Academy for Higher Education in at least two provinces, based on consultations with key stakeholders.(ii) HEC and the regional NAHE center have conducted a study of the professional needs of university faculty in the two provinces (\$ 0.5 million for one province study). (iii) Regional NAHE and PERU together develop a training curriculum targeting the needs of the provincial affiliated colleges in line with the new undergraduate policy(iv) HEC through NAHE has established a system of capacity building and leadership training for female HEC and university managerial and mid-level administrative staff	6,480,000.00	(i) \$ 2,000,000 (ii) \$ 1,000,000 for (ii), (iii) \$2,000,000 for (iii), (iv) \$1,480,000 for (iv)
June 2023	(i) Establishment of NAHE regional center in all provinces (with US\$1 Million for each NAHE Regional/Provincial center), (ii) HEC and the regional NAHE center have conducted a study of the professional needs of university faculty in at least two further provinces (with \$0.5 million for each study conducted), (iii) HEC through NAHE conducts regular capacity building and leadership training for female HEC and university managerial and mid-level administrative staff	4,000,000.00	(i) \$2,000,000 for (i), (ii) \$1,000,000 for (ii), (iii) \$1,000,000 for (iii)
June 2024	(i)Regional NAHE centers have organized outreach events in all four provinces (with \$ 0.25 million for each outreach event in the provinces).	1,000,000.00	(i) \$1,000,000 for (i)
<b>Action: This PBC is New</b>			



PBC 7		Proportion of faculty and staff trained		
Type of PBC	Scalability	Unit of Measure	Total Allocated Amount (USD)	As % of Total Financing Amount
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	14,000,000.00	0.00
Period	Value		Allocated Amount (USD)	Formula
Baseline	NA			
June 2020	10% of faculty and staff of public Affiliating Universities and public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs have been trained		1,750,000.00	Upon achievement of at least 50% of the target, US\$175,000 f
June 2021	An additional 20% of faculty and staff of public Affiliating Universities and public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and above the 10% required under Year 1 target, have been trained.		3,500,000.00	Upon achievement of at least 50% of the target, US\$175,000 f
June 2022	An additional 20% of faculty and staff of public Affiliating Universities and public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and above the cumulative 30% required under Years 1 and 2 targets have been trained.		3,500,000.00	Upon achievement of at least 50% of the target, US\$175,000 f
June 2023	An additional 20% of faculty and staff of public Affiliating Universities and public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associated Degrees and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and		3,500,000.00	Upon achievement of at least 50% of the target, US\$175,000 f



	above the cumulative 50% required under Years 1, 2 and 3 targets have been trained		
June 2024	An additional 10% of faculty and staff of public Affiliating Universities and public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and above the cumulative 70% required under Years 1, 2, 3 and 4 targets, have been trained	1,750,000.00	Upon achievement of at least 50% of the target, US\$175,000 f

*Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.*

<b>PBC 8</b>		<i>Proportion of faculty and staff trained</i>		
<i>Type of PBC</i>	<i>Scalability</i>	<i>Unit of Measure</i>	<i>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</i>	<i>As % of Total Financing Amount</i>
<i>Intermediate Outcome</i>	Yes	Text	11,700,000.00	0.00
<i>Period</i>	<i>Value</i>		<i>Allocated Amount (USD)</i>	<i>Formula</i>
<i>Baseline</i>	NA			
<i>June 2020</i>			0.00	
<i>June 2021</i>	<i>HEC adopts a strategy for training of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing the two-year Associate Degree Programs and Revised four-year Bachelor Programs, based on consultation of key stakeholders.</i>		500,000.00	\$500,000
<i>June 2022</i>	<i>NAHE has trained 20% of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs (with \$140,000 for each percentage point of staff).</i>		2,800,000.00	\$ 2,800,000



June 2023	An additional 30% of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associated Degrees and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and above the cumulative 20% required under Year 3 targets have been trained (with \$140,000 for each percentage point of staff).		4,200,000.00	\$ 4,200,000
June 2024	An additional 30% of faculty and staff of public Affiliated Colleges implementing New Associate Degree Programs and Revised (4-year) Bachelor Programs, over and above the cumulative 50% required under Years 3 and 4 targets, have been trained (with \$140,000 for each percentage point of staff)		4,200,000.00	\$ 4,200,000
<b>PBC 8</b>	Expansion of PERN			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	50,000,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
Baseline	PERN is available to 278 institutions, of which 38 offering eduroam			
June 2020	(i) 75 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline, have been connected to PERN; (ii) 15 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline, offer campus-wide Eduroam; and (iii) 21 HEIs have established smart classrooms		12,900,000.00	US\$12.9 million of which: (a) US\$140,000 for each additional
June 2021	(i) 90 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Year 1, have been connected to PERN; (ii) 15 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as		15,250,000.00	US\$15.25 million of which:



	baseline plus those required in Year 1, offer campus-wide Eduroam; and (iii) 26 additional HEIs, over and above those required in Year 1, have established smart classrooms		
June 2022	(i) 75 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1 and 2, have been connected to PERN; (ii) 20 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1 and 2, offer campus-wide Eduroam; and (iii) 23 additional HEIs, over and above those required in Years 1 and 2, have established smart classrooms.	13,450,000.00	US\$13.45 million of which:
June 2023	60 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1, 2 and 3, have been connected to PERN.	8,400,000.00	US\$140,000 per additional HEI connected to PERN up to US\$ 8.
June 2024	No target for year 5	0.00	

**Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.**

<b>PBC 9</b>	<b>Expansion of Pakistan Education Research Network (PERN)</b>			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
<i>Intermediate Outcome</i>	Yes	Text	46,500,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
<i>Baseline</i>	<i>PERN is available to 278 institutions, of which 38 offering eduroam</i>			
<i>June 2020</i>	<i>(i) 75 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline, have been connected to PERN (with \$140,000 for each additional HEI</i>		<i>11,850,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 11,850,000</i>





	<i>connected to PERN);(ii) 15 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline, offer campus-wide Eduroam (with \$90,000 for each additional HEI offering campus-wide Eduroam).</i>		
<i>June 2021</i>	<i>(i) 90 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Year 1, have been connected to PERN (with \$140,000 for each additional HEI connected to PERN); (ii) 15 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Year 1, offer campus-wide Eduroam (with \$90,000 for each additional HEI offering campus-wide Eduroam).</i>	<i>13,950,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 13,950,000</i>
<i>June 2022</i>	<i>(i) 75 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1 and 2, have been connected to PERN (with \$140,000 for each additional HEI connected to PERN); (ii) 20 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1 and 2, offer campus-wide Eduroam (with \$90,000 for each additional HEI offering campus-wide Eduroam)</i>	<i>12,300,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 12,300,000</i>
<i>June 2023</i>	<i>(i) 60 additional HEIs, over and above those considered as baseline plus those required in Years 1, 2 and 3, have been connected to PERN (with \$140,000 per additional HEI connected to PERN up to \$8,400,000).</i>	<i>8,400,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 8,400,000</i>
<i>June 2024</i>	<i>No target for year 5</i>	<i>0.00</i>	



PBC 9		Universities digitizing their administration (cumulative)		
Type of PBC	Scalability	Unit of Measure	Total Allocated Amount (USD)	As % of Total Financing Amount
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	70,000,000.00	0.00
Period	Value		Allocated Amount (USD)	Formula
Baseline	0.00			
June 2020	(i) HEC has established a central data repository; and (ii) 10 universities have piloted a digitized administration.		14,000,000.00	(a) US\$ 7 million upon the establishment of HEC's central da
June 2021	(i) Universities have directly fed data into HEC's Data Repository using a web-based reporting system (ii) Additional 10 universities, over and above those counted in Year 1, have piloted the digitized administration		14,000,000.00	(a) US\$ 7 million upon the verification of data being fed di
June 2022	(i) HEC has produced and published an annual report using the information derived from its Data Repository (ii) Additional 10 universities, over and above those counted in Years 1 and 2, have migrated their administration to a digitized system.		14,000,000.00	(a) US\$ 7 million upon publication of HEC's annual report; a
June 2023	(i) HEC has published a second annual report and a strategic plan, leveraging data from the its Data Repository (ii) Additional 10 universities, over and above those counted in Years 1, 2 and 3, have migrated their administration to a digitized system.		14,000,000.00	(a) US\$ 7 million upon publication of HEC's second annual re
June 2024	(i) HEC has published a third an annual report using information derived from its Data Repository (ii) Additional 10 universities, over and		14,000,000.00	(a) US\$ 7 million upon publication of HEC's third annual rep



above those counted in years 1, 2, 3 and 4, have migrated their administration to a digitized system

**Action: This PBC has been Revised. See below.**

<b>PBC 10</b>		<i>Universities digitizing their administration (cumulative)</i>		
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
<i>Intermediate Outcome</i>	<i>Yes</i>	<i>Text</i>	<i>35,000,000.00</i>	<i>0.00</i>
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
<i>Baseline</i>	<i>HEC has designed the data repository. HEC has identified the universities that will digitize their administration and mapped the functions that will be digitized.</i>			
<i>June 2020</i>	<i>HEC has established a central data repository</i>		<i>7,000,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 7,000,000</i>
<i>June 2021</i>	<i>A pilot of 10 universities have directly fed data into HEC's Data Repository using a web-based reporting system</i>		<i>7,000,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 7,000,000</i>
<i>June 2022</i>	<i>HEC has produced and published an annual report using the information derived from its Data Repository</i>		<i>7,000,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 7,000,000</i>
<i>June 2023</i>	<i>HEC has published a second annual report and a strategic plan, leveraging data from its Data Repository</i>		<i>7,000,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 7,000,000</i>
<i>June 2024</i>	<i>HEC has published a third an annual report using information derived from its Data Repository</i>		<i>7,000,000.00</i>	<i>\$ 7,000,000</i>



<b>PBC 10</b>	Use of the Special Funds for Improving Universities' Financial Autonomy and improving governance using the latest technology			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	27,500,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
Baseline	Limited financial autonomy and management of universities.			
June 2020			0.00	
June 2021	(i) HEC adopts an emergency response (SOPs) and funds transfers policy guidelines ; (ii) HEC organizes fundraising framework and a capacity building strategy for university revenue generation and financial management, based on consultations with the university sector; and(iii) HEC transfers emergency funds to universities		5,000,000.00	(i) \$2,500,000 (i), (ii) \$2,500,000 for (ii) (iii) \$5,000,000 for (iii)
June 2022	(i) HEC adopts a framework for financial autonomy and financial management at universities (ii) HEC transfers funds to universities that have participated in the new framework (with \$100,000 for each university under (ii) that received funds under this scheme). (iii) HEC implements a capacity building program for universities on financial management and fundraising.		9,500,000.00	(i) \$3,000,000 for (i), (ii) \$5,000,000,for (ii), \$1,500,000 (iii)
June 2023	(i) HEC transfers funds to universities that have participated in the new framework (with \$100,000 for each university under (i) that received funds under this scheme). (ii) HEC		6,500,000.00	(i) \$5,000,000 for (i), (ii) \$1,500,000 for (ii)



	implements a capacity building program for universities on financial management and fundraising.			
June 2024	(i) HEC transfers funds to universities that have participated in the new framework (with \$100,000 for each university under (i) that received funds under this scheme). (ii) HEC implements a capacity building program for universities on financial management and fundraising.		6,500,000.00	(i) \$5,000,000 for (i), (ii) \$1,500,000 for (ii)
<i>Action: This PBC is New</i>				
<b>PBC 11</b>	<b>Quality of remote learning</b>			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	10,000,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>		<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>
Baseline	No standards for quality or quality assurance framework of remote learning and student learning experiences			
June 2020			0.00	
June 2021	(i) HEC adopts a quality assurance framework for remote learning, including a student feedback mechanism for all online learning, which is included in the Open and Distance Learning Policy. (ii) HEC assigns a division within its organizational structure with monitoring and support of remote learning efforts, which includes capacity building for HEC staff working on remote		4,000,000.00	(i) \$ 2,000,000 for (i); (ii) \$2,000,000 for (ii);



	learning as well as technical support to universities to strengthen the quality of remote learning.			
June 2022	(i) HEC implements a quality assurance framework for remote learning, including a student feedback mechanism for all online learning, as part of the Open and Distance Learning Policy.	2,000,000.00	(i) \$2,000,000	
June 2023	(i) HEC has evaluated the framework for remote learning and integrated lessons learned into a revised framework, as part of the Open and Distance Learning Policy.	2,000,000.00	(i) \$2,000,000	
June 2024	(i) HEC has implemented the revised framework for quality assurance for remote learning, as part of the Open and Distance Learning Policy.	2,000,000.00	(i) \$2,000,000	
<b>Action: This PBC is New</b>				
<b>PBC 12</b>	<b>Development and Implementation of Skills Courses for CCs</b>			
<b>Type of PBC</b>	<b>Scalability</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Total Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>As % of Total Financing Amount</b>
Intermediate Outcome	Yes	Text	16,500,000.00	0.00
<b>Period</b>	<b>Value</b>	<b>Allocated Amount (USD)</b>	<b>Formula</b>	
Baseline	NA			
June 2020	HEC has carried out a needs assessment study for the development of Skills Courses.	500,000.00	NA	
June 2021	HEC has developed 5 Skills Courses	2,500,000.00	US\$2.5 million of which US\$0.5 million for each Skills Cours	



June 2022	(i) 6 Community Colleges have implemented at least one of the Skills Courses developed in Year 2; (ii) HEC has developed additional 5 Skills Courses, over and above those accounted for Year 2 target	4,300,000.00	US\$4.3 million of which: (a) US\$0.3 million for each Communi
June 2023	(i) Additional 7 Community Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 target, have implemented at least one of the Skills Courses developed in Years 2 and 3; (ii) HEC has developed additional 5 Skills Courses, over and above those accounted for Year 2 target.	4,600,000.00	US\$4.6 million of which: (a) US\$0.3 million for each Communi
June 2024	(i) Additional 7 Community Colleges, over and above those considered for Year 3 and 4 targets, have [implemented] at least one of the Skills Courses developed in Years 2, 3 and 4; (ii) HEC has developed additional 5 Skills Courses, over and above those accounted for Years 2, 3 and 4 targets.	4,600,000.00	US\$4.6 million of which: (a) US\$0.3 million for each Communi
<b>Action: This PBC has been Marked for Deletion</b>			

**Verification Protocol Table: Performance-Based Conditions**

<b>PBC 1</b>	Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded
<b>Description</b>	HEC will develop the operations manual for the project which includes the implementation mechanism for all the components including the grant funding mechanism for competitive research grants and Innovator seed fund grants, acceptable to the Bank. The operations manual will be approved by the steering committee to be adopted under the project. Number of grants under the Grand Challenge Fund, Technology Transfer Support Fund, Innovative Seed Fund and Local Challenge Funds will be awarded in line with the grant funding mechanism, including share of grants that have female principle investigators and share of ISF that are led by female recipients as included in the grant funding mechanism.



<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	Third party verification (TPV) agency in Year 2-4, year 1 DLR verified by WB
<b>Procedure</b>	HEC will provide Bank (i) approved operations manual; (ii) the list of grants awarded, including information on number on female principle investigator/ recipients; (ii) letter of Agreements signed under the Grand Challenge Fund, Technology Transfer Support Fund, Innovative Seed Fund and Local Challenge Funds. (iii) TPV agency will verify the information provided by HEC by randomly selecting 25% of the grants in Years 2-4; (iii) HEC will submit to the Bank evidence regarding achievement of the target (along with the verification of results from Years 2-4
<b>PBC 1</b>	Number of Competitive Research Grants and Innovator Seed Fund grants awarded
<b>Description</b>	HEC will develop the operations manual for the project which includes the implementation mechanism for all the components including the grant funding mechanism for competitive research grants and Innovator seed fund grants, acceptable to the Bank. The operations manual will be approved by the steering committee to be adopted under the project. Number of grants under the Grand Challenge Fund, Technology Transfer Support Fund, Innovative Seed Fund, Local Challenge Funds-Tier 1, Local Challenge Funds-Tier 2, Center of Excellence Grants and Rapid Research Grants will be awarded in line with the grant funding mechanism, including share of competitive research grants awarded to female principle investigators and share of ISF awarded to female recipients as defined in the grant funding mechanism.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	Third party verification (TPV) agency in Year 2-4, year 1 PBC and year 5 PBC verified by WB
<b>Procedure</b>	HEC will provide Bank (i) approved operations manual; (ii) the list of grants awarded, including information on number on female principal investigator/ recipients; (ii) Grant Agreements signed under the Grand Challenge Fund, Technology Transfer Support Fund, Innovative Seed Fund, Local Challenge Funds tier 1 and 2 and Rapid Research Grants. (iii) TPV agency will verify the information provided by HEC by randomly selecting 25% of the grants in Years 2-4; (iv) HEC will submit to the Bank evidence regarding achievement of the target (along with the verification of results from Years 2-4).
<b>PBC 2</b>	Outcomes achieved under the competitive research grants awarded under the project
<b>Description</b>	Competitive research grants include the Grand Challenge Fund, Technology Transfer Support Fund and Local Challenge Funds. The DLI supports the implementation of competitive research grants. Outcomes will include, scientific





	communications, presentations at conferences, working papers, journal articles, reports, monographs, patents, copyrights and/or related rights, trademarks, prototypes and other research product assessed by independent reviewers. Achievement will be measured against the progress made on outcome targets as per the letter of agreement signed between HEC and the awardee. Outcome target % needs to be achieved for each grant.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	Third party verification
<b>Procedure</b>	(i) Evidence regarding achievement of outcome targets for all grants will be collected and reported by HEC; (ii) TPV agency will verify the information provided by HEC by randomly selecting 50% of the grants in Years 3, 4 and 5; (iii) HEC will submit to the Bank evidence regarding achievement of the target (along with the verification of results from Years 3, 4 and 5).
<b>PBC 2</b>	Outcomes achieved under the competitive research grants awarded under the project
<b>Description</b>	Competitive research grants include the Grand Challenge Fund, Technology Transfer Support Fund, Local Challenge Funds Element 1 and 2, Center of Excellence Grants and Rapid Research Grants. The PBC supports the implementation of competitive research grants. Outcomes will include, scientific communications, presentations at conferences, working papers, journal articles, reports, monographs, patents, copyrights and/or related rights, trademarks, prototypes and other research product assessed by independent reviewers. Achievement will be measured against the progress made on outcome targets as per the letter of agreement signed between HEC and the awardee. Outcome target percent needs to be achieved for each grant. Research Grants Management System means a software system that allows the tracking of deliverables of the research projects supported under the project.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	Third party verification
<b>Procedure</b>	(i) Evidence regarding achievement of outcome targets for all grants will be collected and reported by HEC; (ii) TPV agency will verify the information provided by HEC by randomly selecting 50% of the grants in Years 3, 4 and 5; (iii) For Rapid Research Grants results achieved from a random selection of 50% of the grants awarded will be verified by the TPV in year 2 of the project ; (iii) HEC will submit to the Bank evidence regarding achievement of the target (along with the verification of results from Years 3, 4 and 5)



<b>PBC 3</b>	Number of functional QECAC in AUs
<b>Description</b>	The project will support creation of a unit within the QEC unit in each AU. The units will be fully integrated in the structure of the QECs. "Functionality" is defined as (i) staffed by a team of 2 or 3 regular administrative staff; (ii) the involvement of the units in the activities aimed at supporting public ACs as per the specified ToRs approved by the AU Vice Chancellor, including regular monitoring of colleges as per the quality assurance criteria defined by HEC.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC, HED and AUs
<b>Verification Entity</b>	Third party verification in all years
<b>Procedure</b>	TPV agency will verify (i) the existence of QECAC with dedicated staff; (ii) functionality
<b>PBC 3</b>	Number of functional QECAC in Affiliating Universities (AUs)
<b>Description</b>	The project will support creation of a unit within the QEC unit in each AU. The units will be fully integrated in the structure of the QECs. "Functionality" is defined as (i) staffed by a team of 2 or 3 administrative staff; (ii) the involvement of the units in the activities aimed at supporting public ACs as per the specified ToRs approved by the AU Vice Chancellor, including regular monitoring of colleges as per the quality assurance criteria defined by HEC. The needs assessment of QEC reorganization
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC, HED and AUs
<b>Verification Entity</b>	Third party verification in all years
<b>Procedure</b>	TPV agency will verify (i) the existence of QECAC with dedicated staff; (ii) functionality
<b>PBC 4</b>	Development and implementation of AD programs
<b>Description</b>	Curricula for Associate Degree programs will be developed in accordance with international best practices. International best practice includes close consultation with experts drawn from the industry and community in the curricula development. The AD programs will follow a semester/ credit system and will be implemented in selected ACs. In the first year, a needs assessment study for identification and development of programs will be completed. The needs assessment study will look at the needs of the population and global trends to identify the subject areas. In the following years, the AD



	programs will be developed and implemented in selected public ACs. Implementation means that the first cohort is enrolled in at least one program developed in the previous years during the project life.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	WB for Year 1 and 2 and TPV agency for Year 3, 4 and 5
<b>Procedure</b>	In year 1, HEC will share the need assessment report with the Bank. In Year 2, 3, 4 and 5, HEC will provide Bank evidence on the list and details of programs developed. In Year 3,4 and 5, TPV agency will randomly select 20% of ACs to verify implementation of the revised curricula of the AD program.
<b>PBC 4</b>	Improvement of undergraduate education – AD programs
<b>Description</b>	Curricula for Associate Degree programs will be developed in accordance with international best practices. International best practice includes close consultation with experts drawn from the industry and community in the curricula development. The AD programs will follow a semester/ credit system and will be implemented in selected ACs. In the first year, a needs assessment study for identification and development of programs will be completed. The needs assessment study will look at the needs of the population, demand in the labor market, and global trends to identify the subject areas. In the following years, the AD programs will be implemented in selected public ACs. Implementation means that the first cohort is enrolled in at least one program developed in the previous years during the project life.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	WB for Year 1 and 2 and TPV agency for Year 3, 4 and 5
<b>Procedure</b>	In year 2, HEC will share the consultation report and the undergraduate education policy with the Bank. In Year 2, 3, 4 and 5, HEC will provide Bank evidence on the list and details of programs developed. In Year 3,4 and 5, TPV agency will randomly select 20% of ACs to verify implementation of the revised curricula of the AD program.
<b>PBC 5</b>	Implementation of 4 year Bachelor program
<b>Description</b>	HEC periodically revises the curriculum in line with HEC’s standard operating procedures for curriculum revision. The indicator will support the roll-out and implementation of the 4-year Bachelor program, of which some will be revised curriculum and some will be newly developed, in selected ACs. Implementation means that the first cohort is enrolled in at least one of the 4-year Bachelor program.



<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV agency for Year 1-5
<b>Procedure</b>	In Year 1-5, TPV agency will randomly select 25% of ACs to verify implementation of the 4-year Bachelor curricula for the respective programs.
<b>PBC 5</b>	Implementation of 4 year Bachelor program
<b>Description</b>	HEC periodically revises the curriculum in line with HEC's standard operating procedures for curriculum revision. The indicator will support the roll-out and implementation of the 4-year Bachelor program, of which some will be revised curriculum, and some will be newly developed, in selected ACs. Implementation means that the first cohort is enrolled in at least one of the 4-year Bachelor program.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	WB for Year 2 and TPV agency for Year 3, 4 and 5
<b>Procedure</b>	In Years 2-5, HEC will share evidence with the Bank. In Year 3-5, TPV agency will randomly select 25% of ACs to verify implementation of the 4-year Bachelor curricula for the respective programs.
<b>PBC 6</b>	Establishment of Regional NAHE Centers
<b>Description</b>	Regional NAHE centers will be provincial branches of the National Academy of Higher Education. These will contribute to the implementation of the overall program, liaising with provincial higher education departments and universities and colleges in the provinces. The provincial centers will organize trainings, outreach events and studies to assess and cater to the needs that vary across provinces.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in Years 2-5
<b>Procedure</b>	TPV will (i) verify the creation of NAHE regional centers and outreach to university and departmental staff in the provinces.



<b>PBC 7</b>	Proportion of faculty and staff trained
<b>Description</b>	Training in management, teaching and learning assessments for AD and 4-year Bachelor program will be provided for faculty and staff in selected public AUs and public ACs offering AD and 4 year Bachelor programs. In the first year training will be provided by AUs. In the later years when NAHE is functional, training will be provided to master trainers by NAHE. The master trainers will impart training to other faculty through their AUs’.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC, HED, NAHE and AUs
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in all years
<b>Procedure</b>	(a) On an annual basis, HEC will collect information and report to the Bank (i) from AUs and HED, the number of faculty in colleges and proportion trained, and (ii) from the AUs or NAHE, the list of trainings and number and name of faculty trained. (b) TPV will verify the training and the number of faculty trained from a random sample of 5% in each year.
<b>PBC 8</b>	Proportion of faculty and staff trained
<b>Description</b>	Training in management, teaching and assessments for AD and 4-year Bachelor program will be provided for faculty in selected public AUs and public ACs offering AD and 4 year Bachelor programs. The training will be taken on by NAHE in collaboration with PERU specifically based on the strategy of training faculty and staff developed in 2021. Training will be provided to master trainers by NAHE. The master trainers will impart training to other faculty through their AUs’.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC, HED, NAHE and AUs
<b>Verification Entity</b>	World Bank for year 2, TPV in years 3-5.
<b>Procedure</b>	(a) On an annual basis, HEC will collect information and report to the Bank (i) from AUs and HED, the number of faculty in colleges and proportion trained, and (ii) from the AUs or NAHE, the list of trainings and number and name of faculty trained. (b) TPV will verify the training and the number of faculty trained from a random sample of 5% in years 3-5.
<b>PBC 8</b>	Expansion of PERN
<b>Description</b>	Measures the number of public institutions that are connected to PERN, number of institutions that have a campus-wide network offering free WiFi to all students as well as institutions with smart classrooms. Smart classrooms includes eclassrooms and elearning through which students can study virtually with access to all learning materials.



<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	PERN network usage statistics
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in Years 1-4
<b>Procedure</b>	Annual reports from HEC on PERN connectivity, eduroam and smart classrooms. TPV in all years will randomly select 20% of institutions to verify PERN connectivity, eduroam and smart classrooms, respectively. In addition, in the years 3 and 5, TPV will conduct user satisfaction about PERN and campus network.
<b>PBC 9</b>	Expansion of Pakistan Education Research Network (PERN)
<b>Description</b>	Measures the number of private & public institutions that are connected to PERN, number of institutions that have a campus-wide network offering free WiFi to all students. 'Institutions' can include separate physical sites of a single university, as long as these sites are at least 2 kilometers apart from each other (and for which a separate fiber-optic connection will be needed).
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	PERN network usage statistics
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in Years 1-4
<b>Procedure</b>	Annual reports from HEC on PERN connectivity, eduroam and smart classrooms. TPV in all years will randomly select 20% of institutions to verify PERN connectivity, and eduroam respectively. In addition, in the years 3 and 5, TPV will conduct user satisfaction about PERN and campus network.
<b>PBC 9</b>	Universities digitizing their administration (cumulative)
<b>Description</b>	HEC data repository means a portal that acquires data from universities and uses the same for data-driven decision making and predictive analysis. Established means that the data repository is collecting and storing data. Web-based reporting means that universities can access a web-portal to directly input the data, that this data will be automatically validated and fed into the HEC Portal. 'Digitized university administration' means that universities have an ERP with minimal functions (HR, accounting, budgeting and procurement) as well as a student lifecycle solution to manage student administration (enrolment, course participation, grades and transcripts, completion). Piloted means that universities have received the system, have used it for administrative purposes, have shared feedback on bugs, or features to be deleted or added. Migrated means that the core functions of the administration fully use the digital system, without needing paper for these



	functions to be executed. Strategic plan means a document that sets out strategic directions for the university sector in Pakistan, based on evidence and input from key stakeholders (universities, employers, faculty and students).
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in all years.
<b>Procedure</b>	TPV will (i) verify the establishment of data repository; (ii) report on piloting in Year 1 and 2 will be done by a consultant or consultancy firm with expertise in digital administration and will include surveying institutions, HEC project staff, and experts. (iii) TPV in Year 2 of web-based reporting system will verify that it functions, and survey the users of the portal; (iv) TPV in Year 3,4 and 5 will verify the migration to digitized systems; (v) HEC will provide evidence in regard to publication of annual reports in years 3, 4 and 5.
<b>PBC 10</b>	Universities digitizing their administration (cumulative)
<b>Description</b>	HEC data repository means a portal that acquires data from universities and uses the same for data-driven decision making and predictive analysis. Established means that the data repository is collecting and storing data. Web-based reporting means that universities can access a web-portal to directly input the data, that this data will be automatically validated and fed into the HEC Portal. Evidence: Pilot reports that summarizes the experience of the universities, with bugs found, and features to be added or removed. Third party validation of pilot report to document lessons learned for the sector as a whole in third year. Third party validation of web-based reporting system and HEC data repository in third year. Database content of HEC data repository will be detailed in the operations manual in agreed format. Annual report with key data on higher education in Pakistan, published on the website of HEC. Strategic plan that uses data from the system to set out HEC strategic direction for the five years beyond the project, published on HEC website
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in all years.
<b>Procedure</b>	TPV in Year 1 will verify the establishment of data repository. TPV will in Year 2 (i) report on piloting to be done by a consultant or consultancy firm with expertise in digital administration and will include surveying institutions, HEC project staff, and experts and (ii) web-based reporting system will verify that it functions, and survey the users of the portal; (v) HEC will provide evidence in regard to publication of annual reports in years 3, 4 and 5



<b>PBC 10</b>	Use of the Special Funds for Improving Universities' Financial Autonomy and improving governance using the latest technology
<b>Description</b>	The emergency response and transfers policy (SOPs) sets out how universities can receive transfers from HEC to respond more effectively to COVID, and can cover areas such as (i) additional technology needs for universities, (ii) funds for helpdesk and other support to faculty, (iii) other discretionary spending for universities that are agreeable to the Bank. The framework for financial autonomy and financial management covers (i) the principles and responsibilities of public universities with regards to financial management, (ii) the rules under which public universities can hold assets, raise revenues, and utilize revenues, (iii) audit processes for financial management of public universities, (iv) resource mobilization strategies to increase the funds at public universities' disposals, and (v) annual targets for resource mobilization.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in Years 1-5
<b>Procedure</b>	TPV will (i) verify the transfers to the universities in line with the SOPs; (ii) HEC will provide evidence implementation of and lessons learned from financial management and fundraising by universities.
<b>PBC 11</b>	Quality of remote learning
<b>Description</b>	This PBC supports the development of a quality assurance framework (QAF) for remote learning. The QAF is a document that forms part of the Open and Distance Learning Policy of the HEC. This builds on lessons learned from remote learning by the entire higher education sector during the period of school and university closures as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. HEC will assign tasks of monitoring and support of remote learning and capacity building of its own staff to a division within its existing organizational structure and strengthens the capacity of that division with relevant and skilled staff.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC and universities
<b>Verification Entity</b>	TPV in years 2-5
<b>Procedure</b>	TPV in years 2,3 and 5 to verify the adoption and implementation of the quality assurance framework for remote learning. In year 2, HEC to provide evidence of the adoption of the quality assurance framework, to be verified by TPV. In year 3 TPV





	firm will verify the implementation of the framework. In year 5 TPV firm will verify the implementation of revised framework and the support provided to universities to improve the quality of remote learning.
<b>PBC 12</b>	Development and Implementation of Skills Courses for CCs
<b>Description</b>	Bridge/ semester courses focusing on market driven technical skills will be developed and implemented in selected community colleges. The needs assessment study will look at the needs of the population to identify the courses with a specific focus on technical/ vocational courses. The needs assessment study will look at the needs of the population and global trends to identify the subject areas. Implementation of courses means that at least one course developed in the previous years during the project life will be offered to students enrolled in the final year in the CCs.
<b>Data source/ Agency</b>	HEC
<b>Verification Entity</b>	WB for Year 1 and 2 and TPV agency for Year 3, 4 and 5
<b>Procedure</b>	In year 1, HEC will share the need assessment report with the Bank. In Year 2, 3, 4 and 5, HEC will provide Bank evidence on the list and details of courses developed. In Year 3,4 and 5, TPV agency will randomly select 20% of CCs to verify implementation of the courses

---