

Document of  
**The World Bank**  
**FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY**

Report No: ICR00005653

**IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION AND RESULTS REPORT**

TF 19124 and TF B0772

ON TWO

GRANTS

IN THE AMOUNT OF US \$44.18 MILLION EQUIVALENT  
[US \$34 MILLION FROM THE GLOBAL PARTNERSHIP FOR EDUCATION and EUR 9.11 MILLION  
FROM THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION]

TO THE

Islamic Republic of Pakistan

FOR THE

Global Partnership for Education - Balochistan Education Project  
February 28, 2022

Education Global Practice  
South Asia Region

## CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

(Exchange Rate Effective {Aug 23, 2021})

Currency Unit = PKR

---

164.43 = US\$1

---

FISCAL YEAR

July 1 - June 30

Regional Vice President: Hartwig Schafer

Country Director: Najy Benhassine

Regional Director: Lynne D. Sherburne-Benz

Practice Manager: Mario Cristian Aedo Inostroza

Task Team Leader(s): Elena Maria Roseo, Juan Baron

ICR Main Contributor: Suzana Nagele de Campos Abbott

## ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AAA	Analytical and Advisory Activities
ACS	Additional Chief Secretary
AF	Additional Financing
AGP	Auditor General Pakistan
ASER	Annual Status of Education Report
BDNA	Balochistan Development Need Assessment
BEF	Balochistan Education Foundation
BEMIS	Balochistan Education Management Information System
BEP	Balochistan Education Project
BESP	Balochistan Education Sector Plan
BHCIP	Balochistan Human Capital Investment Project
CA	Coordinating Agencies
CDD	Community Driven Development
CPF	Country Partnership Framework
CPS	Country Partnership Strategy
CSO	Civil Society Organization
CS	Community Schools
DA	Designated Account
DCO	District Coordination Office
DEG	District Education Groups
DFP	District Focal Points
DG	Director General
DNA	Damage and Needs Assessment
DFAT	Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
EC	European Commission
ECE	Early Childhood Education
EDO	Executive District Officer
EMIS	Education Management Information System
ESIA	Environmental and Social Institutional Assessment
ESMP	Environmental and Social Management Plan
ESSAF	Environmental and Social Screening and Assessment Framework
FATA	Federally Administered Tribal Areas
FM	Financial Management
FMIS	Financial Management Information System
FY	Fiscal Year
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GoB	Government of Balochistan
GoP	Government of Pakistan
GPE	Global Partnership for Education
GPS	Global Positioning System
ICR	Implementation Completion and Results Report
ICT	Information Communication Technology
IO	Intermediate Outcome

ISR	Implementation Status and Results Report
IFR	Interim Financial Report
KP	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LEG	Local Education Group
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDTF	Multi Donor Trust Fund
NER	Net Enrollment Rate
NFC	National Finance Commission
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OM	Operational Manual
ORAF	Operational Risk Assessment Framework
PAD	Project Appraisal Document
PDO	Project Development Objective
P&D	Planning and Development
PCNA	Post Crisis Needs Assessment
PGEB	Promoting Girls' Education in Balochistan
PESP	Punjab Education Support Program
PITE	Provincial Institute for Teacher Education
PKR	Pakistan Rupee
PMU	Project Management Unit
PPP	Public-Private Partnership
PTSMC	Parent Teacher School Management Committees
PSC	Project Steering Committee
RF	Results Framework
SAR	South Asia Region
SE	Supervision Entity
SED	Secondary Education Department
SERP	Sindh Education Reform Program
S&QA	Supervision and Quality Assurance
TA	Technical Assistance
TLM	Teaching and Learning Material
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WB	World Bank

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>DATA SHEET .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES.....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>A. CONTEXT AT APPRAISAL .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>B. SIGNIFICANT CHANGES DURING IMPLEMENTATION (IF APPLICABLE) .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>II. OUTCOME .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>A. RELEVANCE OF PDOs .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>B. ACHIEVEMENT OF PDOs (EFFICACY) .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>C. EFFICIENCY .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>D. JUSTIFICATION OF OVERALL OUTCOME RATING .....</b>	<b>16</b>
<b>E. OTHER OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS (IF ANY).....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME.....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>A. KEY FACTORS DURING PREPARATION .....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>B. KEY FACTORS DURING IMPLEMENTATION .....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME ..</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>A. QUALITY OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION (M&amp;E) .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>B. ENVIRONMENTAL, SOCIAL, AND FIDUCIARY COMPLIANCE.....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>C. BANK PERFORMANCE .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>D. RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME .....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>V. LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS.....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>ANNEX 2. BANK LENDING AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT/SUPERVISION.....</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>ANNEX 3. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT .....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>ANNEX 4. EFFICIENCY ANALYSIS.....</b>	<b>40</b>
<b>ANNEX 5. BORROWER, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS ...</b>	<b>42</b>



**DATA SHEET**

**BASIC INFORMATION**

**Product Information**

Project ID	Project Name
P144454	Global Partnership for Education - Balochistan Education Project
Country	Financing Instrument
Pakistan	Investment Project Financing
Original EA Category	Revised EA Category
Partial Assessment (B)	Partial Assessment (B)

**Organizations**

Borrower	Implementing Agency
Islamic Republic of Pakistan	Secondary Education Department of Balochistan

**Project Development Objective (PDO)**

Original PDO

To increase school enrollment and retention in project supported schools, with a special focus on girls participation, and to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for improved management of education.



**FINANCING**

	Original Amount (US\$)	Revised Amount (US\$)	Actual Disbursed (US\$)
<b>World Bank Financing</b>			
TF-19124	34,000,000	34,000,000	34,000,000
TF-B0772	10,175,000	10,175,000	10,175,000
<b>Total</b>	<b>44,175,000</b>	<b>44,175,000</b>	<b>44,175,000</b>
<b>Non-World Bank Financing</b>			
Borrower/Recipient	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Total Project Cost</b>	<b>44,175,000</b>	<b>44,175,000</b>	<b>44,175,000</b>

**KEY DATES**

Approval	Effectiveness	MTR Review	Original Closing	Actual Closing
18-Mar-2015	25-Mar-2015		30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021

**RESTRUCTURING AND/OR ADDITIONAL FINANCING**

Date(s)	Amount Disbursed (US\$M)	Key Revisions
01-Nov-2018	34.00	Change in Loan Closing Date(s)
22-Mar-2019	34.00	Change in Loan Closing Date(s)
25-Jun-2019	34.00	Change in Loan Closing Date(s)
15-Jul-2019	34.00	Additional Financing
28-Apr-2020	41.00	Change in Loan Closing Date(s)
31-May-2021	44.18	Change in Loan Closing Date(s)

**KEY RATINGS**

Outcome	Bank Performance	M&E Quality
Satisfactory	Satisfactory	High



**RATINGS OF PROJECT PERFORMANCE IN ISRs**

No.	Date ISR Archived	DO Rating	IP Rating	Actual Disbursements (US\$M)
01	30-Jun-2015	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	0
02	23-Mar-2016	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	8.07
03	09-Dec-2016	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	8.07
04	19-Jun-2017	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	13.07
05	19-Jan-2018	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory	14.33
06	12-Oct-2018	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	34.00
07	19-Dec-2018	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory	34.00
08	28-Jun-2019	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory	34.00
09	08-Jan-2020	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory	41.00
10	31-Aug-2020	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory	41.00
11	22-Feb-2021	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory	41.00
12	31-Aug-2021	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	44.18

**SECTORS AND THEMES**

**Sectors**

Major Sector/Sector (%)

**Education 100**

Primary Education 60

Secondary Education 40

**Themes**

Major Theme/ Theme (Level 2)/ Theme (Level 3) (%)

**Private Sector Development 20**

Enterprise Development 20

MSME Development 20





<b>Human Development and Gender</b>	<b>80</b>
Education	80
Access to Education	40
Education Financing	40

**ADM STAFF**

<b>Role</b>	<b>At Approval</b>	<b>At ICR</b>
Regional Vice President:	Annette Dixon	Hartwig Schafer
Country Director:	Rachid Benmessaoud	Najy Benhassine
Director:	Claudia Maria Costin	Lynne D. Sherburne-Benz
Practice Manager:	Halil Dunder	Mario Cristian Aedo Inostroza
Task Team Leader(s):	Umbreen Arif, Syed Waseem Abbas Kazmi	Elena Maria Roseo, Juan Baron
ICR Contributing Author:		Suzana Nagele de Campos Abbott



## I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES

### A. CONTEXT AT APPRAISAL

#### Context

- 1. At the time of Appraisal of the Balochistan Education Project (BEP, the Project) the Government of Pakistan (GoP) had introduced several key reforms to help address both economic challenges related to slow economic growth, a widening fiscal deficit, and rising inflation, as well as challenges related to internal and external security threats and natural disasters.** The reforms included the 18th amendment to the Constitution that devolved more power and responsibility to the provinces and a redefinition of the National Finance Commission (NFC) award that led to more resources for the provinces.<sup>1</sup> There were two important implications of this amendment on the education sector. First, the introduction of Article 25-A obligated the state to provide free and compulsory education to all children aged five to sixteen.<sup>2</sup> Second, provinces were given full responsibility for education planning and delivery, including development of related policies, curriculum and standards that had been responsibility of the federal government.
- 2. Pakistan had made efforts to strengthen education service delivery but was unlikely to achieve the 2015 education MDGs since service delivery had been affected by economic, political and security challenges over several years.** Public education was free, and the government provided free textbooks and incentives such as girls' stipends, school management committee grants and subsidies for private sector delivery in selected areas. Yet, participation in public sector education remained low, mainly due to the low quality of education and weak accountability mechanisms.
- 3. Balochistan was Pakistan's largest province in terms of land mass (44 percent of the territory), but the smallest in terms of population (less than 4 percent of total population). Although rich in natural resources, Balochistan had demonstrated low economic growth in relation to other provinces.** Its performance on all social indicators also lagged behind those of other provinces—Net Enrollment Rates (NER) in education were the lowest in the country, two out of five infants were not fully immunized and infant mortality was high. Although the 7<sup>th</sup> NFC award had helped improve Balochistan's fiscal situation resulting in increased spending, immediate results were elusive in view of the province's weak governance and poor human resource capacity. The province's revenue collection was very low, reflecting poor fiscal management and increasing its dependence on federal transfers.
- 4. With a widely scattered population and large porous borders with Afghanistan and Iran, Balochistan was considered a fragile context and experienced several periods of internal conflict arising from a mix of issues linked to politics, geography, religion and ethnicity, all of which were exacerbated by a lack of basic services and economic opportunities.** The security situation at the time of Appraisal was volatile, driven by terrorism, instability, and a large influx of refugees from Afghanistan. This context of instability impacted service delivery such as access to schools, and a series of natural disasters (floods and earthquakes) had added to the province's vulnerability. As a positive step towards resolving internal conflicts, a new coalition government had just been formed with representation from major ethnic groups. Balochistan was the first province to complete local body elections, and these bodies were expected to devolve political, financial and governing structure to the smallest district-level administrative unit.

<sup>1</sup> The National Finance Commission (NFC) is a constitutional body mainly responsible for distribution of tax proceeds between provinces and grant making by the Federal to the provincial governments. The 7<sup>th</sup> NFC Award increased the provincial share to 56 percent in the first year of the award and to 57.5 percent in the subsequent years.

<sup>2</sup> Article 25-A states: "The state shall provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of five to sixteen years in such manner as may be determined by law."



5. **Balochistan's education outcomes were marked by low access (less than 40 percent of children aged 5 to 9 were enrolled in primary schools), low efficiency (late enrollments, high repetitions), and very high inequities (girls were 4.5 times more likely than males to be out of school).** The NER for both boys and girls at the primary and secondary school levels was the lowest in the country, and at least 10 percentage points lower than the national average.<sup>3</sup> A high dropout rate, especially at the lower primary level, compounded the severity of low enrollment.
6. **There were sizeable differences in school participation rates across Balochistan when disaggregated by districts, rural-urban and gender.** Gender disparities were visible in all aspects of education: the overall literacy rate was 41 percent, but only 19 percent for females; the overall primary NER for girls aged 6 to 10 was 40 percent but dropped to 33 percent in rural areas compared to a NER of 63 percent for boys in rural areas; primary NER for girls in four of the provinces' 30 districts were in the single digits; and the secondary NER for girls aged 11 to 13 in rural areas dropped to 7 percent, reflecting very low retention rates, compared to the 30 percent NER for middle school aged boys in rural areas. Low enrolment and retention were exacerbated by the security situation which precluded students, especially girls, from enrolling in school and attending classes.
7. **Access to schooling was a serious challenge given Balochistan's large, geographically dispersed area with small, sparsely populated communities. Of the province's 22,000 settlements, 40 percent did not have access to a school. Lack of access to middle and high schools was a problem, especially for girls.** The ratio of middle to primary schools was approximately 1:10, and much higher in some districts and for girls. The lack of middle and high schools for girls was cited as one of the main reasons for their dropout from schools after grade 5. Where schools were present, they were in poor physical condition, suffered from severe neglects and disrepair or lacked a building all together, lacked teaching and learning materials (TLM), and counted upon teachers that were poorly equipped to support learning outcomes. The GoP's 2013-2017 Education Sector Plan estimated that over one million children remained out of school in Balochistan. Fiscal difficulties further affected service delivery, creating a need for technical and implementation support from local stakeholders and development partners.
8. **Although most schools in Balochistan had a pre-primary classroom, a lack of adequate teaching resources characterized early childhood education (ECE).** A multi-grade approach to schools reduced the opportunities for teachers to invest the required time and effort on early grades (usually grade K through 3) as they focused more efforts on older children. Inadequate attention to children in early grades resulted in high dropouts, in addition to reducing children's potential to achieve higher cognitive, emotional, physical and social skills.
9. **The quality of education was a source of serious concern, from the learning environment, retention in school, and completion and learning outcomes, for which data was sparse. Government data revealed that only 16 out of every 100 children enrolled in primary made it to grade 10.**<sup>4</sup> Learning outcomes were also very low: in rural Balochistan, only 34 percent of children in grade 5 could solve grade 3 level math problems, and 36 percent of grade 5 children could read an Urdu story at the grade 3 level.<sup>5</sup>
10. **Improving educational outcomes in Balochistan had been hampered by institutional weaknesses, mainly due to a lack of resources, inefficient planning, lack of adequate data and its usage, and low capacity.** The Balochistan Education Management Information System (BEMIS) performed an important function of conducting the annual

<sup>3</sup> Primary education caters to students aged six to ten, middle school to students aged 11-13 and secondary school to students aged 14 to 15.

<sup>4</sup> Balochistan Education Management Information System (BEMIS) School Census Report 2012/2013.

<sup>5</sup> Annual Status of Education Report (ASER) 2012. ASER is a household survey conducted annually, and multiple rounds of sample assessments had been completed since 2008, focusing mainly in rural areas. The ASER 2012 survey was conducted in 28 of Balochistan's 30 districts, covering 16,304 households in 825 villages.



school census, but the exercise was marked with data inconsistencies and weak analysis reducing its usefulness for planning and decision making. Finally, mobility constraints faced by provincial and district staff as a result of the security situation represented a roadblock to effective planning and implementation of service delivery and led the Government of Balochistan (GoB) to rely increasingly on community involvement to help support education facilities in rural areas, particularly in areas that had become inaccessible to staff during times of conflict.

**Theory of Change (Results Chain)**

- 11. **The Project Appraisal Document (PAD) did not describe a Theory of Change.<sup>6</sup> For this Implementation Completion and Results Report (ICR), the Program’s Theory of Change is constructed ex-post and has been retrofitted from the Program’s Results Framework (RF) and its description (Figure 1).** The results chain relies on critical assumptions underlying the Theory of Change for the project’s effectiveness. Specifically, these include: (i) newly established schools will increase enrollment of girls and boys; (ii) improved teaching and TLMs in project schools, and increased availability of girls’ schools at the secondary and higher levels, will reduce dropout rates; (iii) community involvement in school selection and management will promote greater ownership and accountability; (iv) improvements in ECE will improve learning outcomes; and (v) findings from improved data availability, including from student learning assessments, will be used to improve the quality of education services.

**Figure 1: Theory of Change**

Challenges	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes (PDO)	Long-term Outcomes
Low access to schooling, especially for girls	-Carry out demand side analysis at the community level -Train ECE, primary and secondary female teachers -Engage community partnership for school management, including training -Establish schools in underutilized government buildings, community provided space or construction -Develop ECE policy, curriculum, TLM -Mechanism to improve teacher selection for early grades and simple management tools -Monitoring of project-supported schools by the PMU and Parent Teacher School Management Committees <i>-Provide transportation services for girls and female teachers</i>	-New schools established or rehabilitated -Teachers trained -Parent Teacher Student Management Committees (PTSMCs) and communities trained and engaged in school upgrading, support to teachers and school management -ECE approach implemented -Teachers held accountable for learning management in classrooms	Increased school enrollment in project-supported schools, especially for girls	Improved education outcomes, especially for girls, at the primary and secondary levels in project-supported communities in Balochistan
Few secondary schools for girls	-Develop transparent criteria-based selection of schools to be upgraded -Provide professional development to teachers to enhance pedagogical skills to teach higher grades Improve learning environment to accommodate students in higher grades Consider transportation services for girls and female teachers	-Primary girls’ schools upgraded and expanded to middle schools -Middle girls’ schools upgraded to high or higher secondary level -Professional development and improved learning environments for higher grades provided	Increased school retention in project-supported schools, especially for girls	

<sup>6</sup> According to the Operations Policy and Country Services guidelines, including the Theory of Change became mandatory for PADs as of May 2018. The Project was approved by the World Bank’s Board of Directors in June 2016.



Institutional weaknesses and lack of adequate data and its use hinder progress in education outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Strengthen quality of data collection tools and methods, improve presentation of data and train SED staff to use data for planning and decision-making</li> <li>-Introduce innovative ICT techniques for data collection and generate regular reports</li> <li>-Carry out third party validation surveys and learning assessments in basic numeracy and literacy (early grades) in project supported schools</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-Learning assessment carried out</li> <li>-Timely and reliable data collected through ICT, presented and used to support decision-making</li> </ul>	Improved management of education	
--	---	--	----------------------------------	--

**Project Development Objectives (PDOs)**

12. The Project Development Objective was to increase school enrollment and retention in project-supported schools, with a special focus on girls’ participation; and, to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education.

**Key Expected Outcomes and Outcome Indicators**

13. Key Expected Outcomes were to be measured by the following PDO Indicators:

Enrollment

- Girls enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools (baseline=0; target=48,000);
- Boys enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools (baseline=0; target=48,000);

Retention

- Student retention in project schools (baseline=0; target=80 percent);
- Girls enrolled in grades 6-10 of project-supported government schools (baseline=to be determined within first six months of effectiveness; target=2,000);

Improved Management of Education

- Regular reports generated and made public annually on selected indicators for schools (baseline=0; target=3).

The Project’s Results Framework (RF) contained nine Intermediate Outcome (IO) Indicators (Annex 1).

**Components**

The project comprised three components, as described below.

14. **Component 1: Access and Equity (Total Cost/Financing US\$23.21 million) aimed to improve access and equity of girls and boys to schooling through two subcomponents. Subcomponent 1.1: Expanding Access through Community School Mechanisms (Total Cost US\$17.41 million).** This subcomponent was designed to support the Secondary Education Department (SED) in expanding access to schooling through an improved and transparent process of school site selection with community support by: (i) confirming need and demand in communities that lacked a school facility; (ii) third party validation to ensure availability of teacher and children; and (iii) community partnership for school management. Investment for infrastructure would only be made after the school was functional for a minimum of one or two years, confirming its stability and continued availability of teachers. About 2,000 new school learning spaces welcoming both girls and boys would be made available by: (i) using underutilized existing government building; (ii) using community provided space; and (iii) constructing simple transitional learning



spaces with community partnership.<sup>7</sup> Teacher and community training for the new schools would be provided under Component 2. *Subcomponent 1.2: Support Transition to Higher Levels of Education (Total Cost US\$5.8 million)*. This subcomponent would provide funding to upgrade 50 primary girls' schools to middle schools and 10 middle girls' schools to the high or higher secondary level. It would help institute transparent criteria-based selection of schools to be upgraded, for example by upgrading only where female teacher availability was ensured through creation of positions and approvals in the budget. Girls' school upgrading would be accompanied by improved learning environments and teacher professional development to ensure adequate pedagogical skills to teach higher grades.

15. **Component 2: Quality and Increased Accountability (Total Cost US\$6.03 million)** aimed to improve the quality of teaching in early grades through the provision of simple teaching and learning management tools for teachers as well as the introduction of mechanisms to increase accountability of teaching and learning in schools under two subcomponents. *Subcomponent 2.1: Promoting Early Childhood Education through teacher training and teaching and learning materials (Total Cost US\$4.04 million)*. This subcomponent would support the implementation of the ECE approach through technical assistance for the development of an ECE policy, curriculum and TLM, and identified mechanisms to improve teacher selection for early grades. *Subcomponent 2.2: School Information collection, dissemination and use for improved planning and decision making (Total Cost US\$1.99 million)*. Diagnostic activities were planned to improve the validity of the BMIS data, collect timely and reliable information through Information Communication Technology (ICT) and improve data presentation to support decision-making. Key activities under this subcomponent included: (i) strengthening the quality of existing data collection tools and methods; (ii) training of SED staff to use data for planning and decision making; (iii) improving the presentation of data; and (iv) introducing innovative ICT techniques for data collection on selected indicators and generating regular reports. Third party validation surveys were planned for various project activities to improve information for planning and decision making. This subcomponent also contemplated a learning assessment of students in project-supported schools to establish a baseline of student learning outcomes in basic numeracy and literacy in early grade. The Project would be coordinated closely with a project financed by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) supporting student assessments and teacher professional development.
16. **Component 3: Technical assistance for improved capacity for management and monitoring (Total Cost US\$4.76 million)** aimed to support the establishment of systems and procedures for effective planning and implementation of project activities and help develop robust monitoring systems. Technical assistance (TA) would support strengthening of an existing Project Management Unit (PMU). TA would also support district education offices to implement and monitor project activities relying upon the services of district focal points that would be responsible for capacity building of communities, monitoring of project activities and coordinating with District Education staff to ensure their involvement in and endorsement of school activities. It would also help build the capacity of education officials to develop the link between access and quality and initiate a dialogue on student learning outcomes. The SED/PMU would count upon TA to develop communication strategies (on grievance redress mechanism, criteria for school selection, etc.) and action plans to ensure information sharing upstream (Provincial departments and district education departments) as well as downstream (schools and communities).

## B. SIGNIFICANT CHANGES DURING IMPLEMENTATION (IF APPLICABLE)

17. **The Project was restructured six times.** Of these, five were only Closing Date extensions (Table 1). The fourth restructuring in July 2019 was processed together with an Additional Financing (AF) in the amount of EUR\$9.411 million (US\$10.49 equivalent) from the European Commission approved on July 18, 2019. In addition to a Closing

---

<sup>7</sup> New schools to be constructed were mixed schools, while existing schools that were to be upgraded and expanded were girls' schools (and the teachers to be hired for these classrooms would be female).





Date extension, this restructuring also adjusted the RF and Components and Costs. The AF was approved to: (i) increase the scope of some activities to improve the Project's development impact; (ii) incorporate a limited number of new activities that complemented existing project activities (namely transportation for female students and teachers to improve school enrollment and retention for girls); and (iii) account for cost overruns experienced under subcomponent 1.2 due to higher than estimated construction costs.

### Revised PDOs and Outcome Targets

18. **The Project's PDOs were not revised.** Its Outcome Targets were revised in the July 2019 restructuring approved together with the AF to adjust relevant targets in line with scaled-up activities, implementation on the ground, and Global Partnership for Education (GPE) approved revisions as part of the restructuring:

#### Enrollment

- Girls enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools (baseline=0; original target=48,000; revised target=48,366);
- Boys enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools (baseline=0; target=48,000; revised target=19,942);

#### Retention

- Student retention in project schools (baseline=0; target=80 percent; revised target=81 percent);
- Girls enrolled in grades 6-10 of project-supported government schools (baseline=to be determined within first six months of effectiveness<sup>8</sup>; target=2,000; revised target=9,127);

#### Improved Management of Education

- Regular reports generated and made public annually on selected indicators for schools (baseline=0; target=3; revised target=no change).

Targets of several IO Indicators were also revised (Annex 1) to adjust project outputs in view of implementation experience (Section III B).

### Revised PDO Indicators

19. **The Project's PDO Indicators were not revised. Five new IO Indicators were added to the RF in the July 2019 restructuring** to capture new project activities financed by additional resources, as described below.

### Revised Components

20. **The Project's components were revised in the July 2019 restructuring to incorporate new or scale-up existing activities for which AF was being provided.** For Component 1, *new* activities included a transportation study and a small transportation pilot to provide transport services to female students and teachers who did not have easy access to existing schools due to long distances. For Component 1, *scaled-up activities* included activities to support upgrading of additional girls' schools (selected through established criteria) to higher levels of education through construction of more new classrooms in existing girls' schools, minor repairs and civil works, procurement of furniture and other school equipment, TLM, and other goods to make classrooms functional. For Component 3, *scaled-up activities* included those related to: (i) engage communities in supporting primary schools; (ii) select female teachers through test-based recruitment; and (iii) identify viable girls' schools for expansion under Component 1. Salaries of teachers recruited under the Project (focusing on Mathematics, English and Science teachers) would be funded under the Project. The AF would provide continued funding for monitoring and compliance with financing agreements in the fiduciary and safeguard areas, including third-party validation and

<sup>8</sup> Baseline data collection commenced in July 2016 and was completed by September 2016.



monitoring, internal audits, citizen engagement, awareness and advocacy activities and analysis of programs such as the transport of students and teachers. Finally, it would provide continued funding for TA covering management and monitoring of school governance, operational costs, and other project-related quality assurance activities.

**Other Changes**

**21. The Grant’s Closing Date was extended six times, for a total of two years and eight months, as follows:**

**Table 1: Closing Date Extensions**

Date	Restructuring	Closing Date	Revised Closing Date	Justification-Additional Time Required to
01/11/2018	1st	12/20/2018	03/30/2019	Finalize school construction in view of delays resulting from security concerns, remoteness, staff changes
22/03/2019	2nd	03/30/2019	06/30/2019	Finalize school construction in view of previous delays and to utilize exchange rate gains (about 3.8% in final disbursement and 6.2% for the entire project)
25/06/2019	3rd	06/30/2019	09/30/2019	Complete activities under implementation and finalize the preparation of the AF proposal
15/07/2019	4th and AF	09/30/2019	04/30/2020	Complete implementation of scaled up project and new activities
28/04/2020	5th	04/30/2020	06/30/2021	Complete activities due to delays resulting from school closures due to the COVID-19
31/05/2021	6th	06/30/2021	08/31/2021	Complete activities due to delays resulting from school closures due to the COVID-19

**Rationale for Changes and Their Implication on the Original Theory of Change**

**22. The Rationale for Changes in the July 2019 AF and restructuring described above was to reflect lessons of implementation** which revealed that: (i) The design of the simple school structures originally envisioned under the Project needed to be revised to take into account necessary climate and gender considerations (insulation from hot and cold weather, more than one classroom, WASH facilities) in order to deliver the expected impacts on access to school for girls (see para. 52), and the modified design required additional financing and time to achieve original targets, hence lower targets in number of schools to be built, and consequently decreased targets such as enrollment of boys in grades 1-5. (ii) To maximize the impact of the rehabilitation and construction of schools on access to education for young girls and their female teachers, it would be necessary to support the Government in considering transportation services to account for very long distances to schools.

**23. As highlighted above, adjustments to the RF were made to:** (i) add intermediate indicators to capture new project activities financed under the AF, and (ii) adjust relevant targets of both original PDO and IO indicators in line with scaled-up activities, implementation on the ground, and GPE-approved revisions as part of the restructuring.<sup>9</sup> The Rationale for Closing Date extensions is presented in Table 1. None of the changes had major implications on the Theory of Change (mostly scaled-up originally defined activities); the only adjustment related to introducing school transportation for girls and female teachers as an activity, as shown in italics in Figure 1.

<sup>9</sup> To set and adjust the new project targets, while considering the targets agreed with partners (both GPE and EC), the AF adjusted targets as approved by GPE (in some cases increasing them and others reducing them) and increased targets to account for the AF as per the agreement with the EC. Given this, targets in the RF were defined in the following way for each specific indicator: (i) if the GPE-revised target had been met at the time, the RF applied what had been achieved at that time plus the targets agreed with the EC, and (ii) if the GPE-revised target had not been met, the RF applied the remaining GPE target plus the targets agreed with the EC. Consistency was maintained between both what GPE had approved as a restructuring and what had been agreed with the EC.





## II. OUTCOME

### A. RELEVANCE OF PDOs

24. **The Project was and continues to be fully aligned with the World Bank Group’s FY15-FY19 Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) for Pakistan and with the twin goals of ending extreme poverty and promoting shared prosperity.**<sup>10</sup> It supports directly Results Areas 3 (Inclusion) and 4 (Service Delivery) by expanding and improving service delivery in education, with an emphasis on increasing access and retention of girls in the system. Specifically, it supports Outcome 4.3 (Increased School Enrollment and Adoption of Education Quality Assessment) and Outcome 3.2 (Reduced Vulnerability for Groups at Risk). The CPS mentions the Project specifically as an example of intervention that will help improve access, quality and learning outcomes for girls as a priority. Finally, it responds to one of the CPS’ cross-cutting themes: deepening engagement at the province level, while further clarifying the roles between the provinces and the federal government. A new CPS is currently being prepared; as it is not yet finalized, it is not possible to reference the specific Results Area and Outcomes to which the Project relates. Nevertheless, the Project’s relevance continues to be aligned with the recent Pakistan@100 report<sup>11</sup> which highlights the necessary reforms required for Pakistan to become an upper-middle-income country by 2047 and by the Government of Balochistan’s Education Sector Plan 2020-25.<sup>12</sup> Further, it is implicitly aligned with the World Bank’s assistance strategy in practice as reflected in the recent approval of the follow-on Balochistan Human Capital Investment Project (BHCIIP, para. 71).

#### Assessment of Relevance of PDOs and Rating

25. **The Relevance of PDOs is rated High.**

### B. ACHIEVEMENT OF PDOs (EFFICACY)

26. **The Achievement of the PDOs is assessed by breaking down the PDO into the following three objectives:** (i) to increase school enrollment in project-supported schools, especially for girls; (ii) to increase school retention in project-supported schools, especially for girls; and (iii) to develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education. Although the PDO has not been adjusted and PDO targets were increased, a split rating has been applied to the assessment of efficacy in view of changes (including several with targets that were reduced) to the IO Indicators in the RF in the restructuring processed together with the AF.

#### Assessment of Achievement of Each Objective/Outcome

##### ***PDO 1: Increase school enrollment in project-supported schools, especially for girls***

[PDO Indicator 1: Girls enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools](#)

[PDO Indicator 2: Boys enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools](#)

27. **Before AF/Restructuring: Modest.** By the time of the project restructuring, a total of 670 new primary schools had been established through community support (below the end target of 2,000), furniture had been provided to 743 government schools and TLMs to 790 government schools (both against a target of 2,000). A total of 1,796 teaching staff and 4,160 members of PTSMCs (Section III) had been trained, against targets of 4,000 and 10,000, respectively. Teachers were trained to use school materials properly for ECE activities and to mobilize students to utilize materials

<sup>10</sup> World Bank, World Bank’s Country Partnership Strategy for the Islamic Republic of Pakistan for the period FY15-FY19 (Report No. 84645-PK dated April 4, 2014) and the Performance and Learning Review (Report No. 113574-PK dated 2019).

<sup>11</sup> Pakistan at 100: Shaping the Future. Washington, DC: World Bank. <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/31335>



for learning activities. The PTSMCs' training contributed to ensure communities could monitor and support schools adequately and included trainings on environmental and social safeguards, among others. School enrollment of boys and girls in grades 1 to 5 increased by 17,942 and 38,366 students respectively, against original targets of 48,000 for each gender. ECE programs were established in 808 schools (against a target of 2,000). The slow progress in construction and rehabilitation in the Project's early phase was due to adjustments during implementation to the design of school buildings (Section III B) – this slow progress in turn impacted most other indicators which were dependent upon construction completion to materialize (such as the enrollment of students in the newly built/rehabilitated classrooms, the distribution of teaching and learning materials for these students, the distribution of furniture for these new classrooms, as well as the recruitment of teachers for these classrooms).

28. **After AF/Restructuring: High.** Following restructuring, significant progress was made towards increasing school enrollment, and both PDO Indicators measuring progress were exceeded.<sup>13</sup> School enrollment of boys and girls in grades 1 to 5 increased by 30,931 and 99,558 students respectively, against revised targets of 19,942 boys and 48,366 girls. The results were especially promising with relation to enrollment of girls: about 76 percent of these beneficiaries were girls compared to about 70 percent that had been targeted. The gender enrollment gap (ratio of girls to boys) in project-supported schools stood at 3.2 percent exceeding the target of 3.0 percent. These results were supported by school construction, equipment, and teacher and community training that were substantially achieved. Although achievement of associated IO Indicator targets fell slightly below target values, this implies that the Project was able to exceed expected outcomes with more efficiency (less inputs), and only with minor shortfalls due to regional security concerns making access to some school sites challenging, coupled with constraints related to the COVID-19 shutdowns (Section III). A total of 708 new primary schools were established through community support (against the target of 725), 1,186 classrooms were made functional (exceeding the target of 1,000), furniture was provided to 1,099 government schools and TLMs to 1,113 government schools (both against a target of 1,145). A total of 2,632 teaching staff and 5,927 members of PTSMCs had been trained (against targets of 2,488 and 6,365 respectively). ECE programs were established in 828 schools (against a target of 845).

***PDO 2: Increase school retention in project-supported schools, especially for girls***

[PDO Indicator 1: Student retention in project schools](#)

[PDO Indicator 2: Girls enrolled in grades 6-10 of project-supported government schools](#)

29. **Before AF/Restructuring: High.** Progression to the secondary level depended upon retention in project schools and the availability of secondary schools to which primary graduates could progress. A total of 95 schools were upgraded from primary to middle level (well above the original target of 50 schools), and 25 schools were upgraded from middle to the higher secondary level (well above the target of 10 schools). These schools also benefited from the furniture, TLMs and teacher training described under PDO 1. By restructuring, student retention in project schools surpassed the original target of 80 percent, reaching 81 percent. The increased enrollment (and graduation) of girls from primary together with number of schools upgraded led to increased enrollment of girls in lower secondary education: by restructuring, 3,127 girls were enrolled in grades 6-10, also surpassing the original target of 2,000 girls.
30. **After AF/Restructuring: High.** By completion, a total of 195 schools had been upgraded from primary to middle level

<sup>13</sup> Enrolment in newly established schools comprised mainly previously out-of-school children as a large number of out-of-school children was a criterium for establishment of schools in different communities as was to be detailed in their applications. It is therefore assumed that a substitution effect can be considered minimal, especially since almost 74 percent of school-aged girls, particularly in secondary, were estimated to be out of school in Balochistan.



and 25 schools had been upgraded from middle to higher secondary level, both indicators fully meeting revised targets. These schools also benefited from furniture, TLMs and teacher training described under PDO 1. Student retention in project schools surpassed its revised target of 81 percent, reaching 81.7 percent. Enrollment of girls in grades 6-10 greatly exceeded the revised target: 39,014 girls were enrolled in these grades against the revised target of 9,127 girls. This large overachievement can be explained by two factors: (i) schools selected to be upgraded (selection finalized after appraisal) was biased towards high-enrollment schools to increase the number of project beneficiaries, and (ii) a greater number of schools than originally anticipated were supported through the distribution of TLMs which also increased beneficiary numbers. The gender enrollment gap (ratio of girls to boys) in project-supported schools stood at 3.2 percent exceeding the target of 3.0 percent. The study on the provision of transportation was carried-out to collect evidence-based data to determine the viability of a transport facility to address the issue of dropouts and difficulties faced by female students and teachers due to large distances of schools from their homes. The study considered number of female students/teachers, distance of homes/residences to respective schools, and other constraints they faced. This study was to be followed by a small pilot on the provision of transportation to female students and teachers; however, the pilot had to be cancelled due to COVID-19 restrictions. The partial cancellation of this activity does not affect the achievement of the PDO which is fulfilled through other activities achieved as reflected in the PDO indicators. Funds from this activity were reprogrammed to two activities not originally contemplated but which substantiate the objective of increased retention: 1,286 schools were provided with COVID-19 sanitization supplies and 85 schools were provided with science lab equipment.

***PDO 3: Develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education***

[PDO Indicator 1: Regular reports generated and made public annually on selected indicators for schools](#)

[IO Indicator: Project reports generated on selected indicators](#)

31. **Before AF/Restructuring: Substantial.** Project progress reports were produced in the reporting quarter against the set Project Development Objectives and Intermediate Results Indicators given in the project Results Framework. The reports, which were generated regularly, also covered the progress of important immediate results indicators supporting the achievement of targets. They were made public annually on the GoB's website.<sup>14</sup> Information was being collected during the year using the real-time Education Management Information System (EMIS) and there have been improvements in the teacher recruitment process through externally administered tests used for merit-based recruitment. In a highly dispersed environment where any project would find monitoring and data collections to be challenging, the Project made progress in using technology to better monitor, collect data and facilitate supervision processes. The PMU, in coordination with donors, has developed instruments and processes to document and monitor, in real time, all project activities accurately and publish informative reports on school performance. The reports were submitted to the WB via email in the given timeline and publicized.
32. **After AF/Restructuring: High.** The establishment of the real-time school monitoring system contributed to improving the education sector's ability to monitor the quality-of-service delivery. This real-time school monitoring system was later used and continues to be used by multiple stakeholders in the education sector; indicators reported in it were designed in a way to keep track of the contribution of resources toward meeting the set targets of Access and Quality as outlined in the Balochistan Education Sector Plan 2013 - 2018. It enabled all the development actors in the province, including UNICEF, to review progress made against set targets and plan interventions accordingly. Reporting was regular and timely, with reports generated and made public annually on selected indicators for

<sup>14</sup> <http://www.gpeb.gob.pk/home/downloads>



schools; information was collected during the year using the real-time EMIS to monitor implementation progress and identify and address implementation bottlenecks. The PMU used real-time reporting through an android application from the field to the customized EMIS dashboard which proved to be a best proactive innovation for timely progress updated and decision making (Section IV). It is reported to have helped improve teacher attendance, functionalize District Education Groups/District Education Authority Forums and provided timely data for informed decision-making at the provincial level. The training of 2,632 teaching staff and 5,927 members of PTSMCs contributed to increasing the capacity of teaching staff and established an effective and efficient mechanism to improve performance and outcomes.

#### Justification of Overall Efficacy Rating

33. **Overall Efficacy is rated Substantial before restructuring and High thereafter based on the ratings described above summarized in Table 4 below.**

#### C. EFFICIENCY

34. **Economic Efficiency.** An economic analysis was not prepared either at appraisal or during preparation of the Additional Financing. For purposes of comparison (ex-ante/ex-post), this ex-post analysis has calculated economic returns that would have resulted during Project appraisal by applying estimated costs at the time and expected achievements based on targets established for the PDO Indicators. The analysis shows that the Project is expected to have generated a positive net benefit: NPV of US\$93.2 million and IRR of 18 percent based on the actual enrollment achieved by completion. This is higher than the NPVs and IRRs estimated retroactively using the PDO Indicator end targets and estimated costs established at appraisal, which produce a NPV of US\$75.5 million and an IRR of 15 percent. These significant economic gains result mainly since actual achievements in enrollment by completion substantially exceeded end targets. Annex 4 provides details of the economic analysis performed, including assumptions of benefits and costs included in the calculation.
35. **Implementation and Cost Efficiency.** The Project, including both the original GPE-funded and later EU-funded portions, was implemented over a six-year period, having fully disbursed funds under both grants. It was implemented in particularly difficult circumstances, in a vast and scarcely populated province impacted by security issues making sites inaccessible, harsh climate, poor means of communications with beneficiaries, and during a world-wide pandemic. Although the cost of school construction proved to be higher than originally estimated, that was due to school design modifications needed to ensure achievement of one of its main objectives (increase enrollment and retention with a special focus on girls) to ensure climate appropriate construction and sustainability of the investment by the Government. The Project restructuring addressed this increased cost by reducing the expected outputs of school construction/rehabilitation. Considering the Government's annual budget spending of about PKR 50 billion to cover one million children, the Project's yearly budget of about 1 billion to cover 10 percent of Balochistan's students (about 170,000) can be considered efficient as compared with Government spending norms since it represents five times less per student per year. Further, the Project was able to raise extensive community support and assistance, including the provision of available sites for construction. The Project met its objectives as measured by PDO indicators without significant delays or cost overruns. The final allocation of proceeds is provided in Table 2 below.



**Table 2: Project Costs**

Component	Appraisal	AF	Total	Actual
	US\$ million			
<b>1. Access and Equity</b>	23.21	6.50	29.71	24.48
<b>2. Quality and Increased Accountability</b>	6.03	-	6.03	8.68
<b>3. Technical Assistance for Improved Capacity for Management and Monitoring</b>	4.76	3.99	8.75	9.36
<b>TOTAL</b>	34.00	10.49	44.49	44.17 <sup>15</sup>

**Assessment of Efficiency and Rating**

36. Efficiency is rated Substantial based on the Project’s Substantial economic efficiency and its Substantial implementation efficiency.

**D. JUSTIFICATION OF OVERALL OUTCOME RATING**

37. Overall Outcome is rated Satisfactory based on the Project’s continued High relevance, its Substantial efficacy before restructuring and High efficacy thereafter, and its Substantial efficiency.

**Table 4: Overall Outcome Rating**

	Relevance of PDOs	Efficacy by Results Area	Efficiency	Overall Outcome Rating	Value of the Disbursed IDA Credit (US\$ M)	Share of Disbursement	Weighted Value	Final Overall Outcome Rating
<b>As appraised</b>	<b>High</b>	1) Modest 2) High 3) Substantial <b>Overall: Substantial</b>	<b>Substantial</b>	<b>Satisfactory</b> (5)	34.0	76.4%	(5*0.764) =3.82	3.82 + 1.42 = 5.24 rounding it to 5 = <b>S</b>
<b>After AF and Restructuring</b>		1) High 2) High 3) High <b>Overall: High</b>		<b>Highly Satisfactory</b> (6)	10.49	23.6%	(6*0.236) =1.42	

<sup>15</sup> Total project grant at the end of the project – and therefore actual project closing costs – amounted to \$44.175M instead of the figure of \$44.49 presented in the Additional Financing due to fluctuations in the exchange rate between the Euro (EU grant) and the USD.



## E. OTHER OUTCOMES AND IMPACTS (IF ANY)

### Gender

38. **The gender disparities in educational outcomes for girls in Balochistan were dire, especially in rural areas (Section I A).** To address this, increasing the enrollment and retention of girls in schools was one of the project's main goals and a major focus of the EU-funding. As described in Section II B above, by all measures the project greatly exceeded the expectations towards both of these goals. Indeed, 76 percent of newly enrolled student beneficiaries were girls and the increased enrollment (and graduation) of girls from primary together with number of schools upgraded led to increased enrollment of girls in lower secondary education (para. 29). The gender enrollment gap (ratio of girls to boys) in project-supported schools improved from 2.10 in early 2019 to 3.2 percent at completion. These results were achieved through a concerted focus of the Project's design on issues that impacted gender disparities. The criteria for school selection and construction included the availability of female teachers in the vicinity (or male teacher if no female teachers were available) and schools with high enrollment of girls would be prioritized. The school construction design and mechanisms for community engagement also prioritized improved outcomes for girls. Given security concerns, the engagement of boys and men from local community groups was expected to promote the enrollment and retention of girls, especially at the middle level, and reduce teacher turnover and absenteeism. The criteria for school construction defined among basic infrastructure the need for a boundary wall and separate latrines for girls and boys to help increase girls' enrollment and retention. Further, during implementation, supervision focused not only on ensuring progress towards gender targets, but also by implementing, monitoring, adjusting the Project and its implementation to ensure it could not only meet targets but exceed them, and identify issues and adopt measures to further strengthen results towards gender parity. Two examples are noteworthy; First, the appreciation that the school design model did not address issues regarding girls' participation (i.e., single room school, no WASH facilities or boundary wall, etc.) and the course correction to adjust the model towards a female-friendly one, even if that resulted in the construction/rehabilitation of fewer schools. Second, implementation identified the lack of safe transport of both girl students and female teachers as a constraint on their enrollment/retention and participation. Financing for the transport study was included with the AF, and the restructuring incorporated additional IO Indicators related to transport in order to monitor progress. The study was completed, stakeholders were consulted, and the analysis is available to implement a transport program—albeit small to start. Unfortunately, a pilot transport program as defined and recommended in the study was not able to be carried-out due to the lockdown in response to the COVID-19 pandemic (Section III B). Nevertheless, the Project can be considered a model with respect to its focus and impact on girls' enrollment and retention, especially in a challenging environment.

### Institutional Strengthening

39. **By putting in place a mechanism for providing real-time data, collected on the basis of ICT, the Project had a major impact on institutional strengthening of the education sector management through evidence-based decision making as described in Sections II B and IV A.** Several lessons were learned based on the use of the information provided by the data. For example, the government found that there was an important need to rationalize the use of teachers across schools to cater to the number of students enrolled in existing schools, and to support and strengthen existing schools where possible; the Borrower's Completion Report notes that a school in the rural area has 184 students with only one teacher while another in an urban area has 184 students with 24 teachers. The community-based model for supporting the establishment and management of schools provided an effective and cost-efficient basis for replicating the Project's achievements on a larger scale.





### Poverty Reduction and Shared Prosperity

40. **Although not explicitly poverty-targeted, the Project had a strong focus on poverty reduction through education in Balochistan – the least-developed province in terms of social and economic indicators among Pakistan’s four federated units.** This vast and sparsely populated province faces security challenges due in part to sharing borders with Afghanistan and Iran compounded by tribal conflict, poor infrastructure, and natural catastrophes (prolonged drought followed by flash floods), which all work to keep living standards low, with low participation in education. Balochistan has the highest proportion of poor (57 percent in 2013, compared with national average of 30 percent) and the lowest percent growth in real consumption of the bottom 40 percent (2.5 percent, compared with national average of 6.5 percent).<sup>16</sup> With an estimated Human Development Index (HDI) value of 0.391, the level of human development in Balochistan is low. Performance on social indicators is also behind that of other provinces.<sup>17</sup> Balochistan hosts around 325,000 of Pakistan’s approximately 1.4 million Afghan refugees<sup>18</sup>, of which about 47 are female and more than half (53 percent) are under 18 years of age (the Project’s target group).<sup>19</sup>

### Other Unintended Outcomes and Impacts

41. **The Project provided COVID-19 sanitation supplies to 1,286 schools and increase the scope of learning materials, including science labs, provided to students and teachers.**

## III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME

### A. KEY FACTORS DURING PREPARATION

42. **The Project was designed to support the implementation of the Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2012-2017.** The BESP was developed following a comprehensive needs assessment to identify issues and needs of the province’s education sector together with strategies and resources needed to address them. Key priorities identified in the Plan included: (i) establishment of schools; (ii) removal of bottlenecks to school availability at middle and secondary levels; (iii) institutionalization of early childhood education; (iv) capacity building of teachers; (v) increased use of data in decision making and planning; (vi) community involvement in education management; and (vii) improving the teaching-learning process. The BESP was widely consulted with stakeholders and donors through the local education group; GPE was the lead donor, followed by the EU. The Project included strong technical support to help establish efficient processes to achieve its PDO while improving the provincial government’s capacity for delivery of education.
43. **The Project’s objectives and design were directly aligned to GPE and EU priorities.** GPE stated objectives are to: (i) support education in fragile and conflict-affected states; (ii) promote girls’ education; (iii) increase basic numeracy and literacy skills in primary school; (iv) improve teacher effectiveness through training and recruitment; and (v) expand funding and support to education in GPE countries. The EU’s contribution was committed to further support implementation of the BESP with a particular focus on enhancing school access for girls.
44. **The Project’s design built upon lessons of earlier education sector projects in Pakistan in general and in Balochistan specifically: the Balochistan Education Support Project (BESP) and the Promoting Girls’ Education in Balochistan (PGEB).** Lessons from projects in other provinces included the value of using multi-layered supervision and monitoring

<sup>16</sup> Poverty headcount based on FY14 poverty line (poverty, earlier years back casted).

<sup>17</sup> Balochistan, Pakistan, Strengthening Budget Management to Improve Education Service Delivery, May 2018.

<sup>18</sup> Source: UNHCR, data as of August 31, 2021: <https://data2.unhcr.org/en/country/pak>

<sup>19</sup> Refugees in Pakistan access education and health services in the same way as other residents.



support, including third party validations and mobile technologies to support collection and analysis of information. Previous projects in Balochistan's education sector provided directly relevant lessons. The BESP aimed to promote public-private and community partnerships to improve access to quality primary education, in particular for girls. It supported delivery through a semi-autonomous financing body that partnered with communities and private entrepreneurs to increase access to education. While the model was successful in increasing enrollment, student and teacher attendance, grade completion and improvements in student learning, the main issue related to eventual recognition of the community schools by the GoB. All community schools were eventually recognized by the GoB, but there were serious delays in their recognition, rendering grade 5 graduates unable to continue education at public middle schools. The PGEB incorporated this approach of community schools while addressing this lesson through up-front recognition of community schools as government schools, hiring teachers under rules and procedure applicable to government teachers and providing supervision support to the government to better manage construction related activities. The Project continued this approach, especially since the increasing conflict and inaccessibility of certain areas in the province made access even by government officials difficult. Devolving these aspects of management and monitoring to the community level would help ensure continuity of services in security constrained areas thanks to the presence of local teachers and local support for teachers and schools.

45. **The Project's institutional arrangements were sound and built on those of the PGEB with education-related activities coordinated under the guidance of the Local Education Group (LEG) and District Education Groups (DEGs).** The project was prepared by the Secondary Education Department (SED) and was designed to be implemented by a PMU under the guidance of the Secretary of Education. The PMU established for implementation of the PGEB Project would be provided with enhanced staffing and responsibilities to provide day-to-day management and supervision, as well as coordination of activities at the provincial and district level and with District Education Officials. District Focal Points (DFPs) at the district education office would facilitate implementation at the district level. The LEG and DEGs were established to coordinate all education related activities, providing external oversight and support for implementation of the Project and for the broader BESP through the Government's efforts supported by development partners.
46. **Implementation and supervision arrangements were streamlined, clearly defined, and involved communities as relevant.** School site selection and later management counted upon community support (Section I A). The Provincial Institute of Teacher Education (PITE) would be responsible, together with SED, for developing tools to improve teaching processes, such as timetables, daily plans, sample teaching activities, assessment tools, teacher in-classroom responsibilities and multi-grade teaching mechanisms. PTSMCs would be established, trained, and engaged to monitor whether schools had a timetable, if it was followed, if the syllabus for the quarter was prepared, and if teachers had access to teaching and learning materials and these were used in the classroom, and finally to monitor teacher attendance. Third-party monitoring was to be applied as necessary.
47. **School sites were to be selected through a needs assessment and well-defined criteria, and these were revised in the restructuring to maximize project benefits.** Co-educational schools coordinated and monitored by the communities would be prioritized in communities that showed commitment to support the facilities. At appraisal, school site selection criteria included areas with (i) no school in close vicinity of the site selected; (ii) availability of female teacher in the vicinity, or male teacher if no female teachers were available; and (iii) availability of learning space (abandoned government building, community provided space) or land for transitional space. To maximize the Project's impact, criteria were modified to the following in the restructuring and AF: Schools would have at least 20 students and be located mainly in rural Balochistan. Primary schools to be upgraded to middle would be in places with an unmet demand for middle, but that offered primary education in one or more schools in the area. Schools with high enrollment for girls would be prioritized. Schools would be prioritized after a third-party validation of the sites.





## B. KEY FACTORS DURING IMPLEMENTATION

48. **The Project's risk was correctly identified as High, and its design for implementation, supervision and monitoring incorporated measures to mitigate its risks.** Stakeholder and Implementing Agency Governance risks were rated High, and Implementing Agency Capacity, Project Design and Project Delivery Monitoring and Sustainability were rated Substantial. Flexible implementation arrangements that considered access and movement restrictions, well-defined criteria for school selection, the use of innovative technologies (mobile phone, GPS devices) to collect data and aid in supervision, delivery and support mechanisms through the PTSMCs, local implementing partners, and third party monitoring, capacity building and internal and external audits and were all expected to mitigate the Project's main risks including the volatile security situation, governance and implementation capacity.
49. **The US\$34 million equivalent grant for the GPE-funded BESP was approved by the World Bank's Regional Vice President on March 18, 2015 and became effective on March 25, 2015. Throughout implementation, project ratings in Implementation Status and Results Reports (ISR) were either Satisfactory or Moderately Satisfactory.** The US\$10.18 million equivalent EU-funded AF was approved in July 2019 and became effective in August 2019. The GPE-funded project closed in September 2019, while the EU-funded portion and parent project closed on August 31, 2021.
50. **A request for restructuring, specifically a revision of end targets, was approved by GPE in February 2017, but not processed immediately in a formal restructuring in view of then ongoing discussions regarding potential additional funding.** The lengthy processing of the additional financing-cum-restructuring was the result of delays in three areas: (i) Lengthy discussions between several entities within the Government of Balochistan, the BESP PCU and the World Bank surrounding the approach to the school upgradation activity and the selection of schools to be upgraded, as well as the inclusion of a transportation activity. (ii) The Government's efforts were turned towards the preparation of public service delivery plans. (iii) These delays were further exacerbated by the national election process which took place in 2018 and related staff changes at the interim government prior to the elections. This further impacted the final selection of school sites and other internal key processes, as well as the production of the PC-1 document.
51. **Lags in construction and rehabilitation of schools, enrollment targets and other indicators in the Project's early phase were due to adjustments during implementation to the design of school buildings.** At the time of appraisal, the GoB had enacted an emergency in education and requested the World Bank's help to rapidly increase the number of schools by building simple, transitional structures. The Project's design addressed this request. During implementation, it became evident the design was neither climate considerate nor conducive to achieving the Project's objectives and had to be adjusted. The design adjustments (i.e., at least two classrooms for cultural gender privacy, WASH facilities, climate resilience) were justified since during implementation it became clear that the simple structure envisioned at design would not deliver the expected impact in terms of access to school for girls, and there was a need to incorporate higher than expected costs of weather and gender appropriate construction. Further, there were concerns over increasing the Government's liability to support such a large number of new schools. The Education Department, with WB agreement and support, changed school designs to more standardized ones with two classrooms, WASH facilities and a boundary wall, all made of concrete. The modified design generated a financial gap that was closed with the AF.
52. **At completion of the GPE-funded grant in 2019, the US\$34 million grant had been disbursed and the PDO had largely been achieved.** Although the World Bank's system does not reflect a date for the Project's Mid-Term Review, a detailed, comprehensive review was carried out from November 25-28, 2019, following the closure of the GPE funding. The findings of that review were reflected in a detailed ISR, Number 9 dated January 6, 2020. More importantly, the teams had identified lessons learned that were being incorporated into the design and implementation of the EU funding. The sustainability of activities and progress achieved had either been mainstreamed in the education sector budget



(project built and supported schools, project-recruited teacher salaries, real time school monitoring) or provided financing under EU funding.

53. **Providing education service delivery in Balochistan presented many challenges.** With a vast land mass (over 44 percent of Pakistan’s total area) and sparse population (only 5 percent of Pakistan’s population), Balochistan’s challenges also include security issues, a harsh climate and poor means of communication with beneficiaries. The high cost of service delivery in this environment fed into the reduction in number of schools to be established in the project restructuring (from 2,000 to 725). Also in view of this, EU funding was adjusted to prioritize upgrading and rehabilitating existing schools as opposed to opening new ones. This was also justified in view of the poor state of existing school infrastructure as well as high student-to-teacher ratios in rural areas. EU funding for school construction/rehabilitation also adopted higher-cost weather and gender appropriate school construction, and more realistic implementation schedules to account for the geographical spread of construction as well as weather and security concerns.
54. **The COVID-19 pandemic impacted project activities across the province.** The Government declared a nationwide closure of all educational institutions, including public and private schools, and the postponement of all examinations through May 31, 2020 (later extended). It also announced extended lockdowns throughout the country, including Balochistan, that impacted implementation of all ongoing project activities and stalled all activities requiring a physical presence, including: (i) completion of construction on sites in remote districts that were particularly affected by COVID-19; (ii) the completion of distribution of furniture to all newly constructed schools; (iii) the finalization of the teacher recruitment process which required an in-person examination; and (iv) further collection of updated data from the then current school year that had been slowed due to school closures. Supported by the World Bank’s Task Team, the PMU worked remotely during the extended project implementation period (Section I B) to continue pursuing possible activities during the lockdown, including by adjusting procurement processes to bring them to completion.

#### IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME

##### A. QUALITY OF MONITORING AND EVALUATION (M&E)

###### M&E Design

55. **The Project had a multi-layered M&E system, and the RF was concise, well-defined, and easy to monitor in view of capacity limitations for data collection and monitoring at the time of approval.** The SED, through the PMU, was to collect information on project inputs, outputs and outcomes. The PMU’s monitoring unit, in coordination with DFPs were to have primary responsibility for providing regular information on the RF. It would rely on existing district systems for collecting data on progress and performance of project activities. An online M&E dashboard was to be developed to track project implementation progress in real time and the use of mobile technology was to be piloted for this real time data collection. Further, the BEMIS and district education offices would periodically monitor education implementation at the district level and report to SED.

###### M&E Implementation

56. **Reporting was regular and timely, with reports generated and made public annually on selected school indicators.** Information was collected regularly using the real-time EMIS to monitor implementation progress and identify and address implementation bottlenecks. The RF and targets were adjusted in a restructuring together with the approval of the AF in July 2019. The revision of end targets had been approved by the GPE on February 17, 2017, but the



restructuring was only processed in 2019 due to then on-going discussions around the potential additional financing.<sup>20</sup>

57. **The PMU utilized the services of private firms to validate information, especially for establishing the validity of the sites for new school construction.** As the mobility of monitoring officers was affected by the province’s security situation, periodic surveys and third party assessments were carried out to: (i) confirm school sites identifies for new school construction and upgrading; (ii) confirm communities selected for the establishment of community-managed government schools; (iii) conduct sample-based assessments of teacher attendance in project schools; (iv) validate enrollment data; and (v) conduct assessments of school construction activities to ensure oversight of implementation as well as availability of credible data for future planning. Reports of capacity building activities were provided by firms and government departments involved in teacher training and PTSMC capacity building.

#### M&E Utilization

58. **The establishment of a real-time school monitoring system under the Project contributed to improving the education sector’s ability to monitor quality-of-service delivery.** As described in Section II B, real-time monitoring proved to be a best practice innovation for timely progress updates and decision making. It reportedly also helped improve teacher attendance, functionalized District Education Groups/District Education Authority forums and provided timely data for decision-making at the provincial level. The decision to reduce the number of schools, while still targeting the Project’s activities on the same number of beneficiaries, was made based on information provided by the Project’s monitoring system.

#### Justification of Overall Rating of Quality of M&E

59. **Overall Quality of M&E is rated High.** This is based on the adequacy (and simplicity) of the Project’s Results Framework based on project-specific conditions (i.e., difficulties in compiling and monitoring data due to geographic, security and climatic conditions, the use of third-party monitoring), the consistency of the RF over time (adjusted only to include new indicators to reflect new AF activities and to reflect target adjustments in line with experience), the strengthening of the education systems’ real-time monitoring systems — introducing new information technology — and the use of monitoring information to feed in to project adjustments.

## B. ENVIRONMENTAL, SOCIAL, AND FIDUCIARY COMPLIANCE

### Environmental and Social

60. **The Environmental and Social Institutional Assessment (ESIA) that was prepared for the PGEB project was adapted with a brief addendum in view of the similar nature of activities to be financed and also because the PMU for the PGEB Project would be tasked to manage the Project.** The ESIA identified potentially negative environmental and social impacts, and proposed mitigation measures to address them. It ensured that protection against natural disasters were incorporated in the design of schools to be constructed and identified institutional arrangements to manage the Project’s environmental aspects, monitoring requirements, training needs and reporting and documentation requirements. The Project was classified as Environmental Category B in view of its potentially negative environmental and social impacts that were expected to be low to moderate in significance. Impacts could include soil erosion, water and soil contamination, air quality deterioration, damage to natural vegetation, and safety and health hazards for students, teachers, workers and the surrounding population. The Environmental and Social Management Plan (ESMP)

<sup>20</sup> The team noted a slight discrepancy in the dates of end targets in ISRs filed post the AF restructuring: In ISRs, “formally revised target dates” were noted as the date at which the end target was changed, vs the target-date for the achievement of these revised end targets. Final target dates have been appropriately reflected in the ICR’s Results Framework.



provided inputs for construction criteria of new schools and the need for certain basic infrastructure. The World Bank's OP/BP 4.12 (Involuntary Resettlement) was not triggered as none of the planned activities were expected to involve land acquisition or involuntary resettlement of people and/or businesses. However, the Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) required that documentation be submitted to the World Bank on details of land ownership and evidence indicating the nature of the donations, ensuring that there would be no negative livelihood impacts on any vulnerable groups and no encumbrances on land. The growing insurgency and security situation in Balochistan were expected to impact the poor, girls, women, youth and disabled, and strategies for social inclusion were identified as needed. The engagement of boys and men from local communities in the community groups was expected to promote the enrollment and retention of girls, especially at the middle level, and reduce teacher turnover and absenteeism. The ESMP's criteria for school construction defined among basic infrastructure the need for a boundary wall and separate latrines for girls and boys to help increase girls' enrollment and retention. The PMU was to strengthen its social safeguards team and arrange orientation sessions to raise awareness of social safeguards standards. The existing PMU of the PGEB Project had a detailed complaint handling system that would be used to ensure transparent processes and to ensure the inclusion of vulnerable populations including, females, disabled and individuals from ethnic minorities. An addendum to the ESMP was prepared during preparation of the AF, including requirements for evidence to document land donations, the nature of the donation, and to ensure there would be no negative livelihood impacts on vulnerable groups, as well as no encumbrances on land.

61. **The Project's institutional set-up for safeguard management performed satisfactorily and gained important expertise and experience over the years in implementing safeguard requirements.** The PMU maintained a dedicated Safeguard Officer at the project level, and engineers assigned as DFPs were responsible for implementing and ensure ESMP compliance in the field. The active participation of PTSMCs was strengthened to ensure the sustainability of post project environmental aspects (water and sanitation facilities in schools, etc.).
62. **A functional and relatively effective Grievance Redressal Mechanism (GRM) was put in place and managed by dedicated staff in the PMU.** Detailed logs have been compiled of the 101 complaints received since the beginning of the Project. Of the complaints received, 90 were resolved and the remaining 11 are pending court cases that are in the process of being addressed. Complaints were received through multiple mechanisms including phone calls, emails and letters to the PMU, the Education Department, GoB and the Provincial Ombudsman Department.

#### Fiduciary Compliance

63. **The PMU had gained valid experience in maintaining satisfactory financial management (FM) arrangements and implementing procurement following World Bank procedures through implementation of the PGEB Project.** The FM arrangements for the Project were based on the country's systems that were expected to provide reasonable assurances on the use of grant proceeds for intended purposes. However, for the Project, the PMU was required to strengthen its FM team and develop systems to manage a payroll of 4,000 teachers and to support FM capacity-building of PTSMCs. Until these systems were in place, FM risk for the Project had been assessed as Substantial. The Project's implementation reports and financial audits were unqualified and delivered in a timely manner, and there were no major issues with FM during implementation.
64. **Similarly, for procurement the PMU was to increase its capacity through contracting additional staff that would benefit from the lessons and experience of its procurement specialists.** The PITE, administratively and financially subordinated to SED, was identified as the agency responsible for capacity building, and would meet the expense of training activities through operating costs of the PMU. The Project envisaged a large spread of small civil works, mainly for upgrading middle and higher secondary schools. A Procurement Specialist and an Infrastructure Specialist worked



in tandem in the PMU performing procurement and contract management responsibilities. Design and Supervision Consultants had been engaged under the PGEB, and continued providing support for certain procurement and contract administration functions. A detailed Third-Party Validation (TPV) of physical infrastructure was carried out by the United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF) as a starting point for upgrading existing facilities. The PMU was well staffed with a Procurement Specialist with experience handling procurement under donor-funded projects and well versed with World Bank Procurement Guidelines. The PMU had sufficient experience to manage project procurement and carry-out required procurement activities in an efficient and effective manner, including through STEP.

65. **An external Fiduciary Review of the Project was carried out by external consultants in early 2021**, focusing on: (i) staffing; (ii) contract management; (iii) compliance with World Bank Procurement Guidelines; (iv) review of payments; and (v) compliance of FM procedures with World Bank guidelines. The Review identified a few minor issues, the most relevant of which relates to administrative issues related to timely payments processing and contract management.

### **C. BANK PERFORMANCE**

#### **Quality at Entry**

66. **World Bank Performance for Quality at Entry is rated Satisfactory.** The World Bank team helped prepare a project that responded to the priorities in the Government’s BESP, and to those of the GPE and EU. The Project built upon lessons and experience of previous World Bank administered multi-donor support to the province, and of previous World Bank projects, adjusting and adapting its design as relevant. Risks were correctly identified, and more importantly, the Project’s design was adjusted to mitigate the risks to the extent possible (e.g., community involvement, third party monitoring, using the existing PMU adapted to the Project’s needs, etc.). The Project’s RF was concise, streamlined, and limited to indicators that could measure progress toward its Theory of Change. Preparation was well advanced to ensure ready implementation.

#### **Quality of Supervision**

67. **World Bank Performance for Quality of Supervision is rated Satisfactory.** In a fragile context such as Balochistan, where project sites cannot be visited by World Bank staff due to security concerns and supervision must largely rely on remote mechanisms, the team was able to set-up effective and timely supervision. The supervision team helped the Government in facing the many implementation challenges in the province. It helped put implementation on a steady start, while at the same time showing willingness to adjust and adapt the Project and its design when it made sense. Most noteworthy was the decision to modify school construction standards to address gender, climate and sustainability issues even though that would mean reducing outputs (but not outcomes). The supervision team focused on monitoring and evaluation, not only for the Project purposes, but to put in place a modern, real-time system for the sector that addresses the dispersion, security, and other challenges the province faces. The Project’s ISRs were timely, comprehensive, and realistic. The team only raised the Development Objective rating once the final results became available as these were bunched in the last few months of implementation due to delays in completing construction. The team also focused early on issues of sustainability—including maintenance of schools, financing teacher salaries and other financing needs (Section IV D). Finally, the team was quick to identify lessons from the Project to both incorporate them in the AF, as well as to feed into the preparation and design of a new project (Section IV D). Project reporting was regular, timely and realistic, as were project ratings in ISRs. The World Bank’s implementation support team provided timely and effective support to the Government that helped achieve the PDO despite implementation and other challenges posed by COVID-19.



### Justification of Overall Rating of Bank Performance

68. **Overall World Bank Performance is rated Satisfactory, as it provided strong support in designing and implementing the Project and bringing it to a successful completion.**

#### D. RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME

69. **Risk to Development Outcome is rated Modest.** The Project's objectives continue to be a priority for the Government as reflected in its Balochistan Education Sector Plan 2020-25. The SED has integrated all project schools within the mainstream of its education sector. Under the GPE Project, salaries of all teachers recruited have been paid by the SED since July 2018, and the 200 female teachers recruited under the AF from the EU are being hired and integrated at the Department level. The GoB has adopted the real time school monitoring mechanism developed under the Project and has allocated budget for it over the next four years. Finally, activities implemented and capacity built under the Project will be provided with continued funding and TA under Component 2 of the Balochistan Human Capital Investment Project for which IDA financing totaling SDR26.4 million (US\$36 million equivalent) was approved on June 23, 2020.<sup>21</sup> Component 2 of that project was designed to improve utilization of quality education services among children, especially girls, by increasing access to quality education services and strengthening education sector stewardship. Project activities are being implemented in selected refugee hosting districts in Balochistan, namely in Chagai, Pishin, Quetta, and Kila Abdullah. These are among the most disadvantaged population groups in the province as many of them are located in low-income and hard-to-reach areas. Component 2 is also supporting interventions to improve quality of learning by taking concrete steps to encourage the students to employ their analytical abilities, provide a comprehensive teacher training program to help teachers create a classroom environment conducive for learning across the province, and increase institutional capacity to manage the education system, thereby improving the quality of primary and secondary education. The Project's PMU is also coordinating activities under the BHCIP Project.

#### V. LESSONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

70. **The implementation of Projects in fragile contexts can produce notable results if the project is focused, streamlined and realistic by design, has effective systems to mitigate risks and monitor simple to collect information, and has the flexibility built-in to learn-by-doing and respond to fluid implementation realities.** Projects in dispersed and difficult environments should be straightforward in design, have simple but strong monitoring arrangements, and realistic implementation schedules that can be extended as needed based on challenges incurred. They should also be agile in their ability to adjust implementation approaches as lessons are learned. In this sense, the Project revealed important lessons, some of which influenced the design of the AF, and others that have been incorporated in the design and implementation of the BHCIP. The Project's design was streamlined, addressing only the major identified issues: access, retention, and institutional capacity for implementation.

71. **Real-time monitoring systems, based on simple and accessible technologies, can be instrumental in difficult, dispersed environments which cannot be accessed due to security reasons.** The Project highlighted the benefits of using a real-time school monitoring mechanism to monitor implementation progress remotely to help identify and address implementation bottlenecks in inaccessible areas through an android application from the field to a customized management information system dashboard. The dashboard will continue to be used in the BHCIP project and by

<sup>21</sup> IDA financing comprises a Credit in the amount of SDR15.4 million (US\$21 million equivalent), including SDR11 million (US\$15 million equivalent) from the IDA 18 Refugee Sub Window for Refugees and Host Communities and a Grant in the amount of SDR11 million (US\$15 million equivalent) also from the from the IDA 18 Refugee Sub Window for Refugees and Host Communities.





education stakeholders in the sector. As a corollary, where data collection is challenging, the Project's Results Framework should rely on simple to collect yet diversified indicators that help monitor the project's progress along its results chain. The Project's Results Framework was solid and only adjusted once during the six and a-half year implementation period, and then only to include new indicators to monitor newly introduced activities. The only recommendation would be to introduce more diversification of the Intermediate Outcome indicators; several of the Intermediate Outcome indicators in the Project's Results Framework were interdependent (i.e., were dependent on completing construction) and led to a "bulking" of results towards the latter stages of implementation, which could have (but did not) resulted in delayed realization that the Project would not achieve its objectives.

72. **The Project revealed that when school access is very low, the state of existing school infrastructure is poor, and student-to-teacher ratios are high, as is normally the case in rural areas, the priority for projects should be to support, strengthen and rehabilitate existing schools rather than open new schools to facilitate sustainability.** This lesson was applied in the design of the AF which focused on expanding and rehabilitating existing schools. Also, schools in climate-harsh areas should be built following higher-cost weather and gender appropriate construction to ensure the objectives, especially as it pertains to gender equity. This lesson was implemented early on in the project and is now being followed in construction financed under the BHCIP project. Finally, decisions on new construction especially in previously underserved areas can bring new issues (e.g., distance, transportation, safety) that may impact the achievement of objectives.
  
73. **Where capacity of the teaching force is limited, Initial training to improve teacher qualifications is needed to kick-off project implementation, but cannot be a one-off event.** This is especially true in contexts where teachers do not benefit from continuous institutional training and support. In these situations, a program of ongoing in-service teacher training should be developed and implemented to supplement the initial training needed to enroll students and get schools up-and-running. This is an important lesson learned by the Project that will be implemented in the BHCIP Project and future engagements. In addition, the recruitment of new teachers should be conducted using pre-existing merit-based approaches to increase the initial skill-level of the force and ensure equity. Project-supported recruitment of teachers used an independently conducted examination to select teachers, and equity biases in the application process were reduced by making examinations free. While this lengthened the selection process and entailed large number of applicants to treat, it was an important step towards increasing the skill-level of the teaching force at entry.



**ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS**

**A. RESULTS INDICATORS**

**A.1 PDO Indicators**

**Objective/Outcome:** To increase school enrollment and retention in project supported schools, with a special focus on gi

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Girls enrolled in grades 1-5 of project supported government schools	Number	0.00	48000.00	48,366.00	99,558.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Boys enrolled in grades 1-5 of project supported government schools	Number	0.00	48000.00	19,942.00	30,931.00
		30-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					





Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Girls enrolled in grades 6-10 of project supported government schools	Number	0.00	2000.00	9,127.00	39,014.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021

Comments (achievements against targets):

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Student retention in project schools	Percentage	0.00	80.00	81.00	81.70
		07-Jul-2014	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021

Comments (achievements against targets):

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Regular reports generated and made public annually on selected indicators for schools	Number	0.00	3.00		3.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020		24-Aug-2021

Comments (achievements against targets):



## A.2 Intermediate Results Indicators

Component: Component I: Access and Equity

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of new primary schools established through community support	Number	0.00	2000.00	725.00	708.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021
Comments (achievements against targets):					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of schools upgraded from primary to middle level	Number	0.00	50.00	195.00	195.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021
Comments (achievements against targets):					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of schools upgraded	Number	0.00	10.00	25.00	25.00



from middle to high/higher secondary level		01-May-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					
<b>Indicator Name</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Original Target</b>	<b>Formally Revised Target</b>	<b>Actual Achieved at Completion</b>
Number of female students and female teachers provided with transport	Number	0.00 01-Mar-2019	700.00 31-Aug-2021		0.00 24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> This activity was cancelled due to COVID-19 restrictions.					
<b>Indicator Name</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Original Target</b>	<b>Formally Revised Target</b>	<b>Actual Achieved at Completion</b>
Number of classrooms made functional	Number	0.00 01-Mar-2019	1000.00 31-Aug-2021		1,186.00 24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					
<b>Indicator Name</b>	<b>Unit of Measure</b>	<b>Baseline</b>	<b>Original Target</b>	<b>Formally Revised</b>	<b>Actual Achieved at</b>



				Target	Completion
Number of classrooms (that have been made functional) provided with furniture	Number	0.00 01-Mar-2019	1000.00 31-Aug-2021		1,226.00 24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Improved management and planning of transportation services	Text	No study has been conducted evaluating the planning for the provision of transportation services  01-Mar-2019	Study and recommendations for the provision of transportation services is carried out, and small pilot responding to local needs carried out  31-Aug-2021		Study and recommendations for the provision of transportation services is carried out. Pilot not carried out.  24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b> Small pilot was cancelled due to COVID-19 restrictions.					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
----------------	-----------------	----------	-----------------	-------------------------	-------------------------------



Gender enrollment gap in project-supported schools	Number	2.10 01-Mar-2019	3.00 30-Apr-2020		3.20 24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					

**Component:** Component II: Quality and Increased Accountability

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of government schools to which furniture (incl blackboard) is provided	Number	0.00 01-Apr-2015	2000.00 30-Apr-2020	1,145.00 31-Aug-2021	1,099.00 24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of schools to which TLM kits provided	Number	0.00 01-Apr-2015	2000.00 30-Apr-2020	1,145.00 31-Aug-2021	1,113.00 24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					



Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of government schools in which ECE program established	Number	0.00	2000.00	845.00	828.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					

**Component:** Component III: TA for improved capacity for management and monitoring

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of PTSMC members trained in targetted project schools	Number	0.00	10000.00	6,365.00	5,927.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	30-Jun-2020	24-Aug-2021
<b>Comments (achievements against targets):</b>					

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of teaching staff trained in the project specific schools	Number	0.00	4000.00	2,488.00	2,623.00
		01-Apr-2015	30-Apr-2020	31-Aug-2021	24-Aug-2021



Comments (achievements against targets):

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
School information collected and reports generated on selected indicators	Number	0.00 01-Apr-2015	11.00 30-Apr-2020		11.00 24-Aug-2021

Comments (achievements against targets):



**B. KEY OUTPUTS BY COMPONENT**

<b>Objective/Outcome 1 - Increase school enrollment in project-supported schools, especially for girl</b>	
<b>Outcome Indicators</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. PDO Indicator 1: Girls enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools</li> <li>2. PDO Indicator 2: Boys enrolled in grades 1-5 of project-supported government schools</li> </ol>
<b>Intermediate Results Indicators</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. IO Indicator: Number of new primary schools established through community support</li> <li>2. IO Indicator: Number of government schools to which furniture (including blackboard) is provided</li> <li>3. IO Indicator: Number of schools to which TLM kits provided</li> <li>4. IO Indicator: Number of government schools in which ECE program established</li> <li>5. IO Indicator: Number of PTSMC members trained in targeted project schools</li> <li>6. IO Indicator: Number of teaching staff trained in the project specific schools</li> <li>7. IO Indicator: Number of female students and female teachers provided with transport</li> <li>8. IO Indicator: Number of classrooms made functional</li> <li>9. IO Indicator: Number of classrooms that have been made functional provided with furniture</li> <li>10. IO Indicator: Improved management and planning of transport services</li> <li>11. IO Indicator: Gender enrollment gap in project-supported schools</li> </ol>
<b>Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 1)</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 99,558 girls enrolled in grades 1-5 in project-supported schools</li> <li>2. 30,931 boys enrolled in grades 1-5 in project-supported schools</li> <li>3. 708 new primary schools established through community support</li> <li>4. Furniture provided to 1,099 government schools</li> <li>5. TLMs provided to 1,113 government schools</li> <li>6. ECE programs established in 828 schools</li> <li>7. 5,927 PTSMCs members trained in targeted project schools</li> <li>8. 2,632 teaching staff trained in project-supported schools</li> <li>9. 1,186 classrooms made functional</li> <li>10. 1,226 classrooms provided with furniture</li> <li>11. Study and recommendations for the provision of transportation services carried out</li> <li>12. Improved gender gap in project-supported schools</li> </ol>





<b>Objective/Outcome 2 - Increase school retention in project-supported schools, especially for girls</b>	
Outcome Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. PDO Indicator 1: Student retention in project schools</li> <li>2. PDO Indicator 2: Girls enrolled in grades 6-10 of project-supported government schools</li> </ol>
Intermediate Results Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. IO Indicator: Number of schools upgraded from primary to middle level</li> <li>2. IO Indicator: Number of schools upgraded from middle to high-higher secondary level</li> <li>3. IO Indicator: Number of female students and female teachers provided with transport</li> <li>4. IO Indicator: Number of classrooms made functional</li> <li>5. IO Indicator: Number of classrooms that have been made functional provided with furniture</li> <li>6. IO Indicator: Improved management and planning of transport services</li> <li>7. IO Indicator: Gender enrollment gap in project-supported schools</li> </ol>
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 2)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 81.7% Student retention in project schools</li> <li>2. 39,014 girls enrolled in grades 6-10 of project-supported government schools</li> <li>3. 195 schools upgraded from primary to middle level</li> <li>4. 25 schools upgraded from middle to higher secondary level</li> <li>5. 1,186 classrooms made functional</li> <li>6. 1,226 classrooms provided with furniture</li> <li>7. Study and recommendations for the provision of transportation services carried out</li> <li>8. Improved gender gap in project-supported schools</li> </ol>
<b>Objective/Outcome 3 - Develop mechanisms for information collection and use for the improved management of education</b>	
Outcome Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. PDO Indicator 1: Regular reports generated and made public annually on selected indicators for school</li> </ol>
Intermediate Results Indicators	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. IO Indicator: Project reports generated on selected indicators</li> </ol>
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 3)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. 11 project reports generated on selected indicators</li> <li>2. Real-time reporting on indicators through an android application from the field to the customized EMIS dashboard</li> </ol>



**ANNEX 2. BANK LENDING AND IMPLEMENTATION SUPPORT/SUPERVISION**

**A. ASK TEAM MEMBERS**

<b>Name</b>	<b>Role</b>
<b>Preparation</b>	
Umbreen Arif, Syed Waseem Abbas Kazmi	Task Team Leader(s)
Rehan Hyder	Procurement Specialist(s)
Akram Abdelaziz Hussein Mohame ElShorbagy	Financial Management Specialist
Ahmad Jawad Asghar	Team Member
Umar Nadeem	Team Member
Muqaddisa Mehreen	Social Specialist
Aristeidis Panou	Team Member
Huma Ali Waheed	Team Member
Mohammad Omar Khalid	Social Specialist
Javaid Afzal	Social Specialist
Olav Rex Christensen	Team Member
Chau-Ching Shen	Team Member
Shahzad Sharjeel	Team Member
Amna W. Mir	Team Member
Anwar Ali Bhatti	Team Member
<b>Supervision/ICR</b>	
Elena Maria Roseo, Juan Baron	Task Team Leader(s)
Rehan Hyder	Procurement Specialist(s)
Akmal Minallah	Financial Management Specialist
Zulqarnain Iqbal Malik	Team Member



Maryem Rahim	Team Member
Khine Thwe Wynn	Environmental Specialist
Babar Naseem Khan	Social Specialist
Ayesha Tabassum	Team Member

**B. STAFF TIME AND COST**

Stage of Project Cycle	Staff Time and Cost	
	No. of staff weeks	US\$ (including travel and consultant costs)
<b>Preparation</b>		
FY16	0	0.00
FY17	8.225	59,871.42
FY18	0	1,050.81
FY19	2.075	17,118.75
FY20	0	27.14
<b>Total</b>	<b>10.30</b>	<b>78,068.12</b>
<b>Supervision/ICR</b>		
FY15	3.325	7,778.28
FY16	41.445	179,045.77
FY17	29.064	141,129.78
FY18	19.782	102,822.01
FY19	19.288	118,606.34
FY20	16.295	103,736.05
<b>Total</b>	<b>129.20</b>	<b>653,118.23</b>



**ANNEX 3. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT**

<b>Components</b>	<b>Amount at Approval (US\$M)</b>	<b>Actual at Project Closing (US\$M)</b>	<b>Percentage of Approval (%)</b>
Component I: Access and Equity	29.71	24.48	82
Component II: Quality and Increased Accountability	6.03	8.68	144
Component III: TA for improved capacity for management and monitoring	8.75	9.36	107
<b>Total</b>	<b>44.49*</b>	<b>44.17*</b>	<b>96</b>

\*Total project grant at the end of the project – and therefore actual project closing costs – amounted to \$44.175M instead of the figure of \$44.49 presented in the Additional Financing due to fluctuations in the exchange rate between the Euro (EU grant) and the USD.



ANNEX 4. EFFICIENCY ANALYSIS

1. The economic analysis indicates that the project has generated large positive net benefit, Net Present Value (NPV) of US\$93.2 million and an Internal Rate of Return (IRR) of 18 percent based on the actual results achieved and costs by completion.
2. The Project’s economic impact is estimated as the increased lifetime labor earnings of the beneficiary students affected by the Balochistan Education Project. The analysis estimates the net present value (NPV) of the expected economic benefit and the cost of direct project beneficiaries. Three major benefits are generated from the following beneficiaries – (i) primary graduates who would not have enrolled in the newly established schools in the absence of the project, ii) primary graduates who would not have enrolled in schools without rehabilitation of classrooms, and iii) the female graduates from secondary schools who would not have had opportunity to enroll in higher grades without upgradation of schools.

**Cost benefit analysis (CBA)**

3. At appraisal, an economic analysis was not conducted. At completion, the economic analysis is conducted based on the actual achievement of the PDO Indicators, and these economic gains are compared to the economic gain with end targets set at appraisal.
4. *Benefits:* Two main channels of benefit streams are quantified: (i) *increased* number of girls and boys graduated from primary schools (grade 5) in newly established schools and in schools with rehabilitation, and (ii) *increased* number of girls graduated from secondary schools (grade 10) during the project period. The analysis assumes the youngest cohort at the end of the project continues education upto grade 5 or grade 10 with 80% of completion rate.
5. *Costs:* The cost includes the project cost (US\$44.49 million) and does not account for the opportunity cost of education given the young age of beneficiaries. It includes 4 additional years of teacher salaries of newly established schools and upgraded schools after the end of the project in order to account for the youngest cohort to graduate from the newly established schools and upgraded schools.

**Table 1.** Basic Assumptions and Input Parameters

Description	Values used	Note/Source
Enrollment		Actual enrollment numbers in newly established schools, upgraded schools and project supported schools (data source: Project Management Unit)
Completion rate	80%	PDO in Result Framework
Active working years (years)	30	From age 15 to 45
Wage differential between the not educated and the primary graduates (grade 5)	10,564 PKR for girls; 42,437 PKR	Annual earnings of adults with no education and with primary schooling based on PSLM 2019-20; They are adjusted for employment



	for boys	rates in each education level
Wage differential between primary graduates (grade 5) and secondary graduates (grade 10)	43,812 for girls	Annual earnings of female adults with primary education and with secondary education based on PSLM 2019-20; They are adjusted for employment rates in each education level
Long term inflation rate (%)	8.4%	The average of the past 30 years (Source: World development indicators)
Long term interest rate (%)	11%	Source: Trading economy
Exchange rate (US\$/PKR)	0.0057	As of Jan 7, 2022

6. **Economic efficiency:** An economic analysis was not prepared either at appraisal or during preparation of the Additional Financing. For purposes of comparison (ex-ante/ex-post), this ex-post analysis has calculated economic returns that would have resulted at appraisal by applying estimated costs at the time and expected achievements based on targets established for the PDO Indicators. The analysis shows that the project is expected to have generated a large positive net benefit: NPV of US\$93.2 million and IRR of 18 percent based on the actual enrollment achieved by completion. This is higher than the NPVs and IRRs estimated retroactively using the PDO Indicator end targets and estimated costs established at appraisal, which produce a NPV of US\$75.5 million and an IRR of 15 percent. This increase in economic gains results mainly since actual achievements in enrollment by completion exceeded end targets.

**Table 2.** NPV and IRR at appraisal and completion

	End target at appraisal	Actual achievement at completion
NPV	US\$ 75.5 million	US\$ 93.2 million
IRR	15%	18%



## **ANNEX 5. BORROWER, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS**

**The following comments were received by Mr. Abdul Rauf, Secretary of Education, Secondary Education Department, Government of Balochistan on February 16<sup>th</sup> 2022:**

“The Education Sector of Balochistan has been improving in different areas for the last 7 to 10 years due to various donors timely funds and technical assistance, more than before. Global Partnership for Education-GPE, European Union-EU and World Bank Group have been major donors.

However, the idea of development of Balochistan Education Sector Plan-BESP (2013-2018) was one of the major milestones towards identifying and analyzing the real situation of Education Sector in Balochistan.

The BESP well envisaged the solutions to the problems identified in the situation analysis given the expected budget. This helped the donors contribute into the problem areas with the specific contribution in the planned matrices.

This is highly appreciated the way this contribution substantially improved the education sector’s Access and Equity, Quality, Capacity Building, Governance and Accountability through opening of new schools primary schools, upgradation of schools from primary to middle and middle high in remote area of the province, establishing the Real Time Schools Monitoring mechanism which still continues on appreciable note and the response & prevention to the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020 and 2021.

Despite the unavoidable COVID pandemic lockdown during the BES project implementation, the World Bank technical assistance team provided well timely assistance which helped complete the project in time, given the project duration was already decreased from 30<sup>th</sup> Dec, 2021 to 30<sup>th</sup> June, 2021. The PMU team is equally appreciated for the implementation of the project during the lockdown.

I congratulate the entire PMU and World Bank teams on successful completion of the project and looking forward the same support, and commitment for the future endeavors.”

**The following comments were received by Mr. Saeed Agha, Project Director, BESP PMU, Secondary Education Department, Government of Balochistan on February 17<sup>th</sup> 2022:**

“Access and quality are two varying issues faced by Education Sector in Balochistan. A province with the largest area and lowest economic indicators. Literacy rate stands abysmally low at 44% with the female at only 27%. Similarly, the HDI is at 4.0 suggesting that future workforce's productivity is only 40% of the potential productivity it could have if with the current situation of education and health sector.

The Balochistan Education Sector Plan was a major milestone toward outlining and ascertaining the future course of action wherein the Balochistan Education Project and Balochistan Education Support contributed toward achieving the targets set in the Sector Plan. The project focused all the lagging areas to creating the opportunities of access to quality education while strengthening the existing system to improve governance.



Establishment of new schools, upgrading into next level while inducting 1493 teachers and introducing a real time monitoring system for evidence based decision making were few of the key achievements under these projects which greatly helped the Government of Balochistan introducing improvement in the Education Sector.

We look forward to the future collaborations with the World Bank to invest in Balochistan for the continuous sectoral improvement in Balochistan.”