



1. Project Data

Project ID P132216	Project Name BF - Public Sector Modernization
Country Burkina Faso	Practice Area(Lead) Governance

L/C/TF Number(s) IDA-56830	Closing Date (Original) 31-Dec-2019	Total Project Cost (USD) 41,081,602.45
Bank Approval Date 09-Jul-2015	Closing Date (Actual) 31-Dec-2020	
	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)
Original Commitment	40,000,000.00	0.00
Revised Commitment	40,000,000.00	0.00
Actual	41,081,602.45	0.00

Prepared by Hjalte S. A. Sederlof	Reviewed by Judyth L. Twigg	ICR Review Coordinator Jennifer L. Keller	Group IEGEC (Unit 1)
---	---------------------------------------	---	--------------------------------

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The Program Development Objective (PDO) for the Burkina Faso Public Sector Modernization Program (PSMP) as set out on page 4 of the Financing Agreement was *to improve selected service standards in ministries responsible for primary education, justice, labor and civil service.*

The PDO in the Project Appraisal Document had a similar formulation, albeit limiting program coverage under the operation to *"in targeted regions of the ministries."* That formulation was also used in subsequent Restructuring Papers (2019, 2020).



The new formulation was not a substantive change to the PSMP. Its introduction into the PDO only served to emphasize the pilot nature of the Program and its limited coverage of ministries and regions, with the regions chosen based on need (low levels of learning outcomes or high demand for legal services).

The PDO will be assessed on improvements in service standards in each of the sectors (education, justice, and civil service and labor). Because of a reduced outcome target for the primary education sector, a split rating is performed for that objective.

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

Yes

Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?

No

c. Components

The PDO was to be achieved through a Program for Results (PforR) operation drawn from the government's strategic ten-year plan for developing a modern performance-oriented public administration (*Plan strategique decennal de modernization de l'administration, PSDMA*). The operation included three ministries responsible for civil service and labor, primary education, and justice, respectively, and their activities in selected regions. The government viewed the operation as a pilot subsequently to be extended to other ministries with financing from other development partners.

The operation was designed to finance a set of activities to improve service standards in each of the three sectors while focusing on three results areas: improved human resource capacity and performance, including strengthening human resources; strengthened institutional capacity for policy planning, implementation, and monitoring and evaluation; and strengthened coordination capacity for public sector reforms.

The operation had four PDO indicators supported by nine Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLIs), some of which were drawn from among key performance indicators (PDO indicators and intermediate outcome indicators) included in the reform path for the PSDMA. They indicated what specific results were sought in each sector in order to achieve the PDO and provided incentives to each ministry to progress along its respective reform path by releasing funds once progress had been assessed against targets set for each DLI. The DLIs are described in Section 3b.

SIGNIFICANT CHANGES DURING IMPLEMENTATION

Two Level 2 restructurings were undertaken during implementation. During a first restructuring in March 2019, the outcome target for teachers' time on task in public primary schools was reduced from 770 hours to 700 hours, and the outcome target for share of classes reaching the 700 hours of instruction time was reduced from 80% to 40%, affecting PDO indicator 3 and DLI 6. During a second restructuring in September 2020, the target for private sector employees registered in the national security scheme was increased from 400,000 to 460,000 (DLI 4).

Other changes



Intermediate Results Indicators were updated during both restructurings, and the Program closing date was extended by 12 months (see Section 2e) during the first restructuring.

d. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates

Project Cost. Total project cost at appraisal was estimated at Euro41.15 million equivalent. Project cost at closing was estimated at Euro44.63 million.

Financing. The PforR was financed with a Euro35.8 million IDA credit

Borrower Contribution. The Borrower contribution was estimated at Euro5.35 million at appraisal. At closing it was 8.83 million

Dates. The project was approved on July 9, 2015 and became effective on February 1, 2016. The original Closing Date, December 31, 2019, was extended once to December 31, 2020, at which time the project closed.

Note. The amounts are based on an exchange rate of 1USD=Euro 0.89.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

With a new government coming into power in 2014 after almost thirty years of single-party dominance and increasing public dissatisfaction with the ruling party, the restoration of public confidence in government institutions became a major focus of policy. It is reflected in the new government's long-term public-sector modernization program, and it has been one of the pillars of the Bank's country strategy in Burkina Faso for the past decade and remains so in the most recent Country Partnership Framework for 2019-2023. The current operation draws on the modernization program, of which it forms a subset, focusing on improving the nexus between public sector performance and improvements in service standards in the three sectors listed in the PDO (civil service and labor, education, and the judicial system). The sectors were considered strategically relevant as their effective delivery could be expected to have a direct and tangible impact on public trust in government. Given its strong results orientation and built-in financial incentives, a PforR approach was chosen as the financing instrument. PforR was also considered a relevant tool in the Bank's 2013-2016 Country Partnership Strategy and its 2019-23 Country Partnership Framework (CPF) for Burkina Faso, and included in the Africa Strategy for 2019-2023; all three strategic documents note the need to build sustainable and credible institutions. The CPF emphasizes human capital development and governance/institution building, two strategic themes and focus areas in the CPF, while the Africa Strategy highlights the importance of investing in good governance by strengthening public institutions and improving public service delivery.

Rating



High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

Objective 1

Objective

Improve selected service standards in the civil services and labor sector

Rationale

In the civil service sector:

- The civil service information system (SIGASPE) functionality was upgraded (DLI 1) and its coverage expanded, including interfacing with other systems.
- By project closing, all civil servants in the three ministries had updated employment records and on-line access to administrative personnel files.
- Some 80 percent of civil servants in the three ministries were included in the individual employee file system, against a 70 percent target.
- Business processes and tools were improved through rehabilitation of all regional directorates of civil services, equaling the target. These measures allowed for more effective recruitment, career management, and retirement processes to be put in place.
- Strategic allocation of human resources across the country reduced new recruitment needs in the Ministry of Education by 26 percent in 2020 (ICR, para. 35).
- Entry and promotion processing of civil servants, a PDO indicator, improved beyond expectations, from a baseline of slightly over 4 percent of applicants being processed within a 28-day period, to 58 percent at program closing, compared to a target of 50 percent (PDO indicator 1, DLI 2).

In the labor sector:

Increased emphasis on a better working environment and regular labor inspections led to an increase in the number of private sector employees registered with the national social security organization, leading to an increase in the PDO indicator 2 and DLI 6 target for registered workers from 400,000 to 460,000 against a baseline of 298,000 registered workers. At closing, the actual number of registered workers had increased to 483,000.

Rating

Substantial

Objective 2

Objective

Improve selected service standards in the education sector (original targets)



Rationale

Improvements in entry and processing time in the civil service positively influenced the hiring of teachers, as noted above.

- In addition to rationalizing the need for teachers, the education system was now able to assign 100 percent of new primary school teachers to schools before the cut-off date (September 25), making them available to teach from the start of the school year; originally, a target of 75 percent had been set (DLI 3). However, the target for hiring female teachers (50 percent) was not met as it conflicted with a federal law against affirmative action in recruitment; instead, a 40 percent placement rate for female teachers was achieved.
- Monitoring of schools and teacher performance was redesigned and training of monitors upgraded. The share of schools having at least two visits per academic year by supervisors (monitors) increased from a baseline of 25 percent to 55 percent, but fell short of the target of 80 percent (DLI 5).
- The operation did not achieve its target in the education sector: at least 770 hours of instruction time annually in the target regions with 80 percent of primary school classes reaching that number. (See below concerning the revised target for this indicator.)

Rating
Modest

Objective 2 Revision 1

Revised Objective

Improve selected service standards in the education sector (revised targets)

Revised Rationale

The outcomes and intermediate outcomes in education remain, with the exception of the 80 percent of classes reaching 770 instruction hours. The indicator was revised during a first Level 2 restructuring to 40 percent of classes reaching 700 hours, including only functioning public primary schools. “Functioning” schools were ones that were open from October 1 to June 30 without any major interruptions. A target of 40 percent of such schools were to meet the 700 hour goal. That target was achieved, with 52.9 percent of functioning public primary schools reaching 700 hours of instructional time.

Revised Rating
Substantial

Objective 3



Objective

Improve selected service standards in the legal sector

Rationale

In the justice sector, the operation contributed to improving the efficiency of administrative tribunals and local departmental/district courts in the delivery of judicial services, including reduced time frames for drafting and yielding court documents.

- To achieve this, the institutional capacity of the Ministry of Justice was enhanced through digitalization – albeit only partly completed by project closing – and uniform case tracking processes for departmental and district courts (DLI 7).
- Consequently, the share of judgments issued by administrative tribunals in a 12-month period in four monitored districts reached 71 percent from a baseline of 29 percent, exceeding the target of 60 percent (PDO indicator 4(a), DLI 8).
- The share of judgments involving litigation matters issued by departmental and district courts reached 99 percent against a target of 70 percent (PDO indicator 4(b), DLI 9).

These measures were backed by a number of other initiatives: improved working conditions, trained presidents and assessors in courts at both national and sub-national levels, and on-line access to frequently applied laws.

Rating

Substantial

Rationale

Overall Efficacy Rating

5. Efficiency

Efficiency Rating



a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

The objectives were strongly aligned with country and government priorities, and with Bank strategy. They directly supported government’s underlying efforts to increase trust in government, essentially by strengthening the nexus between public sector performance and improvements in service standards, targeting three crucial areas (see also Section 3a). The DLIs all directly supported improvements in the three key areas listed in the PDO, with the exception of one DLI in the education sector, where the original target embedded in the DLI was set unrealistically high given what was known about the school calendar. Outcome targets were in most cases successfully achieved, with the exception of the main education target, where performance was rated modest under the original outcome targets (under which approximately 80 percent of funds were disbursed), and substantial under the revised outcome targets. Overall, relevance and efficacy are both rated substantial, but with moderate shortcomings in the achievement of outcome targets for the education services objective under the majority of disbursements. Given these moderate shortcomings, Outcome is rated moderately satisfactory.

a. Outcome Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

The operation introduced significant improvements into the Burkinabe administration, albeit so far only into a limited number of public agencies, and with some risk to sustainability, especially at decentralized levels where capacity may be weak. In addition, the administration also faces economic challenges and the challenge posed by COVID-19, as well as security risks from insurgent groups, although the latter may still be moderate. Mounting insecurity is reflected in growing numbers of internally displaced people, and the absence of holistic crisis response plans (ICR, page ix). Still, the operation also includes elements of reduced risk: government continuity has been improved by reforms that have advanced interconnections between regional and central administrations; the government intends to extend the reform to other ministries with the help of financing from other donors; and there are two follow-on Bank projects: a local government support project (P120517) is building resilience at the local level, as is a governance and citizen engagement project (P155121) that is helping digitalize public financial management systems.



8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The operation drew on the country's strategic ten-year plan, the PSDMA, and focusing on three results areas that had a direct and tangible impact on service delivery. It also drew on prior Bank experience with public sector reform in Burkina – in civil service reform and primary education, and to some extent on a background review it had undertaken of the justice sector. . The use of a PforR approach with DLIs was to provide incentives to each participating sector ministry to progress on reform towards sought-for service standards (PDO results) or achieving them. results. Program design incorporated lessons from earlier public sector reform efforts, which facilitated designing objectives that were realistic and still ambitious. It also recognized the pilot nature of the operation, with an inclusive process of consultation with relevant stakeholders and a focus on public services that were strategically relevant to rebuilding public trust in the government. Implementation arrangements drew on existing structures, and M&E was straightforward. The risk assessment was thorough and included mitigation measures that drew on the experience of earlier projects in determining project risk. The results framework and the DLI matrix were coherent. However, the “instruction time” indicator target, key to measuring achievement of the education objective, was set too high for several reasons: the school calendar did not support a 770-hour instruction cycle, and external circumstances (security) also played a part. The target would have to be subsequently adjusted. Moreover, a sufficient distinction was not made between the PSDMA and the sub-set of activities covered by the operation to permit an accurate determination of project costs. Finally, project design introduced a target of 50 percent for female teachers, which could not be met due to existing legislation against affirmative action.

Quality-at-Entry Rating Moderately Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

Program implementation was facilitated by a task team leader and key members of the team being posted in Ouagadougou and being involved throughout implementation. Implementation support missions, including headquarters staff, occurred twice a year. Serious challenges to successful implementation did develop starting in 2016, as the security situation in parts of the country deteriorated and the COVID-19 pandemic arose. Nevertheless, the project was brought to a satisfactory outcome (i.e. meeting its objectives) with timely advice and day-to-day field-level support, including the two restructurings in 2019 and 2020 that helped smooth implementation.

Quality of Supervision Rating Satisfactory



Overall Bank Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

A sound M&E design informed progress in implementing the operation as well as the PSDMA more generally, but did not sufficiently distinguish between spending under the operation and broader PSDMA spending, introducing uncertainty into the cost estimates for the operation. A comprehensive results framework, with PDO and intermediate level indicators that specified baselines and targets where appropriate, provided the basis for monitoring the operation as well as the PSDMA more generally. All PDO indicators were raised to DLIs; they were defined and measurable and capable of being objectively verified. Each indicator had annual targets and a protocol for verification and assessment of progress. Monitoring of the indicators in the results framework was conducted annually, ensuring effective tracking of progress so that corrective measures could be taken to ensure achievement of DLIs.

b. M&E Implementation

M&E was managed by a Permanent Secretariat responsible for overall coordination of M&E for the PSDMA. The Permanent Secretariat systematically collected, verified, and analyzed data, and provided continuous supervision of program implementation. Specific actions were taken to enhance the government's M&E system in education, notably to improve the M&E mechanism for monitoring teachers' instruction time by introducing a more teacher-inclusive mechanism to monitor hourly volume of teaching.

c. M&E Utilization

The M&E system informed operation-related decisions, especially during the mid-term review and the two restructurings. More generally, it provided means to build modern and accountable administration by expanding on the pilot experience under the PSMP to other sectors. Follow-up Bank-funded projects will draw on this experience to build local government and introduce the digitalization of public financial management systems. The ICR does draw attention to some lapses in implementation, notably where information provided by the M&E system could have been used more readily for course corrections, especially on the lack of progress on gender indicators.

M&E Quality Rating

Substantial

10. Other Issues



a. Safeguards

Throughout implementation, social and environmental systems were rated Satisfactory in all but one ISR (dated April 2020). At that time, the task team alerted the government to the need to proceed with compensation and resettlement measures for people affected by the extension of the buildings of the administrative court of Ouagadougou. Timely resolution of complaints/grievances was monitored. Furthermore, in light of ongoing civil works in Ouagadougou and Bobo-Dioulasso, the Bank recommended monitoring of the compliant execution of Environmental and Social measures and actions in accordance with the Environmental and Social Management Plan, as well as the site closure and rehabilitation plan, until the completion of civil works.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

Financial management. Throughout implementation, fiduciary systems were rated Satisfactory in all ISRs, except one. The fiduciary rating was downgraded to Moderately Satisfactory once in August 2018 because of anomalies in the external auditor report. The anomalies included a low budget execution rate in 2016 and inadequate proof of receipts or justifications for some expenses that were redressed, and hence the rating was upgraded again. Overall, the operation complied with the World Bank's financial management policies. All financial management and audit reports submitted were unqualified and in accordance with all World Bank requirements.

Procurement. Compliance with the Program's procurement procedures was Moderately Satisfactory. Procurement was rated Satisfactory during the program implementation period. However, several procurement shortcomings were identified. These included: (a) delays in acquisitions and deliveries; (b) delays in drafting and validating Terms of Reference; and (c) questions on whether the Program should have its own Procurement Specialist vs. relying on the Ministry's procurement team. The World Bank team intensively monitored compliance with the Program's procurement procedures. By the end of the Program, the procurement plan execution rate was 86 percent. Despite these shortcomings, contracts were awarded in accordance with the stipulations of competition documents and after confirmation of the qualifications of successful candidates.

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

None noted.

d. Other

The operation had two gender indicators (as intermediate outcome indicators): share of female teachers hired each year, and share of direct project beneficiaries who were female. The former, which was contrary to Burkinabe law against affirmative action, was not achieved – the outcome was lower than the baseline - and the latter was only partly achieved, as it was influenced by the former.



11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	A main objective - the quality of education - seen as a binding constraint to development in Burkina Faso, was only partly achieved. The rating is further influenced by the uncertainty surrounding project costs.
Bank Performance	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	The partial achievement of the education objective reflected insufficient analysis in designing the main education-related indicators. The rating is further influenced by the uncertainty surrounding project costs.
Quality of M&E	Substantial	Substantial	---
Quality of ICR		Substantial	---

12. Lessons

Several lessons are drawn from the ICR.

Public administration reforms are likely to be more effective when situated in a longer-term perspective. In this operation, the PSMP's longer-term strategic planning provided a perspective on reform that allowed it to introduce results-based interventions that, through their outcomes, were likely to encourage and facilitate further reforms.

Good understanding of context and a gradual approach to change can enhance outcomes, especially in an uncertain environment of fragility, conflict and violence . The operation was adapted: rather than initiating major restructurings, adding new activities, or extending the operation, the Bank team moved to close it and develop a new operation.

A dedicated Treasury Special Account (TSA) can serve as a strong fiduciary risk mitigation measure for PforRs. The TSA was instrumental in securing PSMP's resources and protecting them from reallocation, which can be a risk for PforR funds that are fungible in the state budget and therefore can be diverted to national emergencies.

In discussing lessons of experience, the ICR could have been more specific than was the case. Building public trust was a strong motivating factor behind project design – and a political necessity for the new government that was seeking to build public confidence in it by strengthening institutions. The program sectors were chosen as weak performing ones and ones with a direct and tangible impact on the public.



13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The ICR provides a thorough description of the project and its key achievements and challenges. The report presents the storyline well, including a useful Executive Summary. The discussion is sufficiently results-oriented and highlights specific project experiences to provide enough substance to allow assessment of the results and ratings of the operation. The ICR could be clearer regarding how the pilot experience under the project was subsequently utilized, and the indicator tables should have acknowledged the reduced PDO level indicator 3. The ICR also contains gaps and errors in reporting of project costs.

a. Quality of ICR Rating Substantial