

RESOURCE GUIDE FOR TEACHER PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT REFORMS



COACH TOOLS
AND RESOURCES



WORLD BANK GROUP
Education

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments.....	iii
Context and Objective.....	1
How to Use This Guide.....	1
Resource Guide.....	3
Appendix A. Public Expenditure Reviews (PERs) with Sections on Teacher Professional Development (TPD).....	11
Appendix B. Sample WBG Teaching Quality Indicators.....	14
Appendix C. List of Short-Term Consultants.....	16

Acknowledgments

The *Resource Guide for Teacher Professional Development Reforms* was led by Manal Quota and co-authored by Jayanti Bhatia. The resource guide benefitted from the inputs of Elaine Ding, Emily Gardner, Rafael de Hoyos, Ana Teresa del Toro Mijares, Ezequiel Molina, Adelle Pushparatnam, Alonso Sanchez, and Samira Nikaein Towfighian.

This resource guide is part of a series of products by the *Coach* Team. Overall guidance for the development and preparation of the guide was provided by Omar Arias, Practice Manager for the Global Knowledge and Innovation Team.

The resource guide was designed by Karim Ezzat Khedr. Alicia Hetzner was the chief copy editor. Patrick Biribonwa and Medhanit Solomon provided administrative support.

Context and Objective

Successful design and implementation of a teacher professional development (TPD) program require more than getting the technical details of an intervention right. What is required is to understand the policies, processes, actors, and institutions that may facilitate or hinder the successful design, and implementation of a TPD program. Practitioners with stronger understanding of the economic and political support for TPD reform are more likely to design and effectively implement programs that are sustainable and have stronger stakeholder buy-in. However, navigating reforms at the sector level is not an easy exercise, especially in contexts in which (a) institutions may lack clear mandates; (b) resources are constrained and not always transparently executed; and (c) actors are not working in coordination and alignment. Designed to support Task Team Leaders (TTLs) through the process of TPD reform, this Guide has two **objectives**:

1. Highlight the key stages of TPD program development and the considerations for supporting TPD reforms
2. Increase access to available resources that can support improved diagnosis, design, implementation, and evaluation of TPD Programs.

This Guide contributes to the resources available under the World Bank’s Global Platform for Successful Teachers and forms part of the package of guides developed by the Coach Program. The Coach Program is a global initiative focused on helping countries improve in-service TPD programs and systems to accelerate learning. The Guide also is a supplementary resource for the Teacher Policy Academy (TPA), an asynchronous learning platform aiming to build the capacity of practitioners implementing teacher reforms.

How to Use This Guide

The Guide can be used by TTLs at any stage of the project cycle. The guidance is particularly relevant for the TTLs conducting technical analysis for their TPD activities during the project identification and preparation stages. The Guide is organized into three stages, each outlining actions that the TTLs can take (table 1). The actions are meant to guide TTLs without being too prescriptive about the types of analyses and activities that the Task Team could conduct (box 1). Rather, the basic intentions are to identify the key processes for TPD program development success. Ideally, at minimum, the TTLs go through each stage.

Table 1. Project Stages and Types of Action

Stage 1. Diagnose
Identify the main bottlenecks inhibiting effective student-teacher classroom interactions and understand wider system-level barriers that may influence TPD program implementation.
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Become familiar with the education sector goals and strategy. Identify TPD objectives and alignment with overall education sector goals, strategies, and institutional mandates.• Review available diagnostic evidence on TPD. In contexts with limited availability of evidence-based information, conduct diagnostic assessments that will inform contextual challenges.• Assess the political economy by unpacking stakeholder priorities, institutional dynamics, and local relationships.• Assess the financial, technical, and operational resources that support the sector.
Stage 2. Design
Utilize available diagnostic analysis to design and structure a TPD program aligned with context needs and resources. The quality and implementation arrangements of the program are key determinants of success.
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Design and structure TPD programs using contextually relevant, evidence-based approaches and analyses conducted in the previous stage.
Stage 3. Implement and Monitor
Integrate the program implementation design into existing M&E functions, leveraging government capabilities and limitations for sustained implementation fidelity.
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Pilot and scale TPD program as appropriate.• Consistently engage in data collection, monitoring, and management throughout implementation to mitigate implementation challenges and to enhance decision-making.

Box 1. Types of Analyses and Activities

Guidance is proposed through actions that TTLs can take:

- **REVIEW/CONDUCT:** Depending on resources available, TTLs may want to collect and review available evidence, and as resources and time allow, conduct new analysis.
- **UTILIZE:** Resources that offer guidance or may be of value for TTLs to be aware of.
- **EXAMPLE/S:** Suggestions of the type of analysis that could be reviewed or conducted; not an illustration of what TTLs need to produce.
- **READ/WATCH:** Additional background resources.
- **CONTACT:** Specific points of contact for details.

Resource Guide

Stage 1. Diagnose

1.1 Become familiar with the education sector goals and strategy. Identify TPD objectives and alignment with overall education sector goals, strategies, and institutional mandates. Focus on:

- **Goals alignment.** To achieve sustained improvements in learning outcomes, it is critical to ensure that the goals of the TPD program align with the goals of the overall education sector in which the TPD program is situated.
- **Intra-sectoral coherence.** It is important for the TPD program to cohere with other elements of the larger education system, for example, pre-service TPD programs at teacher training colleges and universities, standards for measuring teacher performance, curriculum, assessments, textbooks, and school leadership training.

Why: Taking these actions helps assess needs, identify challenges and opportunities, and navigate discussions with key stakeholders, keeping in mind sectoral priorities.

Sample Questions to Ask (In-country)	Actions to Consider/Sample Resources
<p>Are the TPD program development objectives anchored in the country's own education sector strategy?</p> <p>Were sector objectives developed using evidence from what has worked in the past? What evidence is available for TPD implementation and operational challenges?</p>	<p>Review: Sector analysis to understand sector priorities, challenges, and opportunities, along with details on targets and timeline.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education Sector Analysis Methodological Guidelines, Vol. 1, IIEP, UNESCO. • Education Sector Analysis Methodological Guidelines, Vol. 2, IIEP, UNESCO. <p>Example(s):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Country examples of Education Sector Analysis by Global Partnership for Education (GPE). • Teachers and Teaching in Sierra Leone.
<p>Which TPD programs of the government and donors are underway? Which entities are responsible for designing and delivering TPD (pre- and in-service)?</p> <p>How are TPD programs differentiated by teachers? Coaches/pedagogical leaders? School management?</p>	<p>Review: Analyze the TPD service delivery chain by mapping TPD services, service providers (public or private institutions), geographic reach, and target audience. To identify gaps and opportunities, align this mapping with intended TPD outcomes.</p> <p>Example:</p> <p>See section on Teacher Life Cycle in Tanzania Education Sector Institutional and Governance Assessment.</p>

1.2 Keep in mind wider policy challenges around how to recruit, retain, and manage teachers; review available diagnostic evidence on TPD. In contexts with limited availability of evidence-based information, conduct diagnostic assessment that will inform contextual challenges.

Why: By understanding basic teacher challenges and country contexts, TTLs will be better positioned to engage in preliminary policy discussions on TPD. TTLs can identify challenges and entryways to support the development of a TPD system that adopts the Coach Principles of tailored, focused, practical, and ongoing TPD.

Sample Questions to Ask (In-country)	Actions to Consider/Sample Resources
<p>System-Level Diagnosis</p> <p>What do student outcomes reveal about learning in country?</p> <p>Are there national teacher standards or competencies?</p> <p>Are the policy frameworks ensuring that teachers are attracted to the profession? Are the right people being recruited? Are teachers supported with effective pre-service and in-service training? Are teachers present in school?</p>	<p>Review: Available student assessments (national and international), teacher assessments, school-level assessments (school based-management practices), reports, or strategies that may be available to support analysis on learning (or learning-loss) outcomes.</p> <p>Review: Available mandates on teacher selection, recruitment, and management as well as evidence on the TPD system policies and practices, access to TPD, and quality of TPD services. Utilize existing data from sector reviews, Education Management Information Systems (EMIS), and Learning Management Systems (LMS).</p> <p>Review: Global Education Policy Dashboard (GEPD) to find out more about how this initiative tracks and monitors teaching practices and policies as well as the broader system in which these operate. GEPD collects data on learning outcomes</p>

Are teacher policies being implemented effectively? Is training managed centrally or locally?

Do teachers have equitable access to TPD opportunities? How long are teacher trainings? Do trainings include practice and/or classroom support? Are trainings relevant? Are teachers motivated to attend trainings? Do teachers have content knowledge and exhibit effective pedagogical practices?

What digital infrastructure exists?

and their drivers at three levels: practices (or service delivery), policies, and politics and bureaucratic capacity. With these data, the dashboard highlights gaps between current practice in schools and systems and what the evidence suggests would be most effective in promoting learning, while offering governments tools to help set priorities and track progress as they work to close those gaps.

Utilize:

- [GEPD Reference Guide](#) to learn more about the overall initiative and the indicators tracked.
- [GEPD Implementation Brief](#) to learn more about the steps to implement the dashboard in your setting.
- [GEPD Rollout Recording](#) to learn more about the results and the feedback received from countries and partners.
- [GEPD School Survey](#), [Policy Survey](#), and [Survey of Public Officials](#) to learn more about the questions used to collect information.

Read:

- [Learning Poverty](#) Briefs by country.
- [Measuring Changes in Teaching Practices](#) Note, which lays out a three-step process to measure teaching practices. The same instrument could be used for both diagnosis and monitoring and evaluation (M&E).

Review: Digital infrastructure to adopt technology-based solutions/strategies.

Example:

DIKSHA: Transforming India's School Education.

Contact: Halsey Rogers (hrogers@worldbank.org); Sergio Venegas Marin (svenegasmarin@worldbank.org).

Program-Level Diagnosis

Is the TPD in its current form (if any) following best practices?

Review: Key characteristics of TPD programs (for example, type of implementing organization, scale, focus, cost, duration, career growth opportunities, and follow-up supports).

Utilize:

- [In-Service Teacher Training Survey Instrument](#) (p. 30) or other diagnostic tools relevant to the context.

Contact: David Evans (devans@cgdev.org); Mary Breeding (mbreeding@worldbank.org).

Read the blog: [What Can Education Systems Learn from Football?](#)

Classroom-Level Diagnosis

What is the quality of teacher-student interactions? Are students engaged and safe in classrooms?

Review: Evidence on teaching practices in the classroom through classroom observations. Countries may have their own systems for classroom observations. However, the challenge is to ensure the use of tools that focus on key teacher-student interactions that promote learning versus observation tools, which focus only on teacher compliance or structural indicators (for example, student-teacher ratio, number of available textbooks).

Utilize:

- [Teach Primary Brief](#) to learn more about the overall framework and implementation process ([Teach ECE Brief](#) available here).
- [Teach Primary Manual](#) to learn about the behavioral indicators used to capture teacher-student interactions ([Teach ECE Manual](#) available here).

Website: [Teach Primary](#), [Teach ECE](#), [Teach Secondary](#) (forthcoming).

Read the blog: [Teach: Tackling the Learning Crisis, One Classroom at a Time](#).

Contact: Teach Team (teach@worldbank.org).

1.3 Assess the political economy by unpacking stakeholder priorities, institutional dynamics, and local relationships. Particularly of interest to support TPD reforms is the need to assess challenges related to the adoption and operationalization of reforms. These are defined as:

- **Adoption of reforms.** Of interest here are the power relations, incentives, and priorities of politicians, policymakers, and key stakeholders involved in the TPD program (such as donors, education sector coordination groups, development partners, and teacher unions), which can contribute to the support and successful adoption of reforms.
- **Operationalization of reforms.** Of interest here are the local dynamics, incentives, and accountability relations among local stakeholders (including teachers, coaches, pedagogical leaders, school leaders, district officers, and parents), which can hinder or facilitate operationalization and eventually the sustainability of the reform on the ground.

Why: Strong political support for the TPD program can be a critical ingredient for success, influencing financial support for the program as well as the program's alignment with national educational policies and sector plans. It also is critical to understand the key incentives and priorities of each actor and how well they align with the goals of improved learning (WDR 2018), and what accountability mechanisms, such as rewards and penalties, can be used to influence their actions, given the multiple interests that govern their actions.

Sample Questions to Ask (In-country)	Actions to Consider/Sample Resources
<p>What does the political economy look like?</p>	<p>Review/Conduct: In-country report on political economy, if available; or execute rapid analysis as needed.</p> <p>Utilize: Problem-Driven Political Economy Analysis.</p> <p>Example: Political Economy of Education in Lebanon.</p> <p>Read the blog: Five Myths about Political Economy Analysis.</p>
<p>Who are the key stakeholders? Are their incentives sufficiently aligned with helping to build and sustain a TPD system?</p> <p>How well communicated and how much political buy-in is there for the sector's TPD objectives?</p>	<p>Review/Conduct: Stakeholder analysis for TPD actors and citizenship engagement efforts.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fact Sheet: Citizen Engagement and Stakeholder Consultation during COVID-19. • Stakeholder Analysis Guidance Note. <p>Read the blog: Understanding Learning Outcomes: Empowering Indonesian Parents to Participate in Children's Education.</p> <p>Contact: Social Safeguards Specialists and Gender Specialists assigned to the project for inputs from project social consultation.</p>
<p>How is coordination among the institutions (pre-service, in-service, curriculum, textbooks, assessments) on TPD? What are the challenges to, or opportunities for, collaboration?</p>	<p>Review: Latest guidance from public sector management on how to enhance sector coordination and the Governance and Institutions COVID-19 Response Resources.</p> <p>Examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Breaking Down Silos: Malaysia's Experience in Strengthening Inter-agency Cooperation. <p>Read the blog: The Five Drivers for Improving Public Sector Performance.</p> <p>Contact: Regional Governance Specialists working on institutional and governance assessments.</p>
<p>What development partners, or donor support is there for TPD? How is donor coordination within this area?</p>	<p>Review: Activities and connect with Local Education Groups (LEGs) and development partner groups working within the stream of TPD. Identify areas of synergy and complementarity, and ensure a common voice on TPD reforms objectives when speaking with government counterparts.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improving Teacher Support and Participation in Local Education Groups. <p>Read this short brief: At a Glance: Principles toward Effective Local Education Group.</p>

1.4 Assess financial, technical, and operational resources supporting the sector. The assessments can cover the ministry of education and other institutions (depending on government structure, for example, federal or centralized, that aid in the design or delivery of TPD.

- **Financial.** To perform their roles and responsibilities, key actors (including ministry officials, district officers, pedagogical leaders, and teachers) need financial resources, for example, for remuneration or to develop training materials that flow equitably, effectively, and efficiently. Low-resource settings with financial constraints likely will need ongoing donor support and engagement. It often is difficult to get information on program-level costs. Even when well implemented, costing analyses often are overlooked. At the national level, governments publish national statistics that provide an overview of government allocations and expenditures. To conduct financial assessments that can inform programs and policies, TTLs should work closely with the client to build the necessary trust and rationale to access financial information for programming.
- **Technical.** Human resources with the right technical expertise, for example, pedagogical experts, content developers, or data analysts, ensure that the different components of the TPD system are running effectively.
- **Operational.** An operational plan and operational capacity—institutionally, and between institutions and levels of government—are essential to mobilize the plan and help build the capacity to act and react quickly to any change that surfaces.

Why: Governments need adequate financial, technical, and operational resources at the national, subnational, and school levels to successfully design, develop, implement, and evaluate TPD programs. Failure to do so at any of the levels could risk the success of the reform.

Sample Questions to Ask (In-country)	Actions to Consider/Sample Resources
<p>How is TPD financed? What sources of funding are available for TPD? Are incentives aligned with outcomes?</p> <p>Are there institutional and governance bottlenecks inhibiting implementation? What human capacity is available centrally and in intervention regions?</p> <p>Is sufficient human capacity available? Technical capacity? Pedagogical leaders? Mentors? Content developers?</p>	<p>Review: Available Public Expenditure Reviews (PERs), which assess effectiveness, efficiency, equity, adequacy, and sustainability of sector inputs; and/or Public Expenditure Tracking Surveys (PETS), which track the implementation and execution of public funds. Where not available, depending on country context and needs, country teams may choose to conduct a more focused PER on the topic of teachers and TPD.</p> <p>Review: Institutional arrangements and human capacity to identify design and implementation bottlenecks.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • List of PERs with analysis on TPD. The list is collated from the Education PER database. • WB guidance for developing PERs. • WB guidance for using PETS. • Global Platform for education finance. <p>Example:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Indonesia PER. • See sec. 4, PFM Aspects of Education Service Delivery from the Tanzania Education Sector Institutional and Governance Assessment. • Philippines PETS; Zambia PETS. <p>Read: Cost-Effective Approaches to Improving Global Learning report.</p> <p>Contact:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Education Finance Team • Financial Specialist and Procurement Specialists assigned to the project, as they may have additional country-specific insights.

Stage 2. Design

2.1 Design and structure TPD programs using contextually relevant, evidence-based approaches. Utilize the analyses conducted in the previous stages because these analyses will inform the program design (and eventually the implementation) approach.

- **Goal.** Identify clear TPD goals such as those that focus on improving student-teacher interactions through evidence-based practices for effective TPD.
- **Structure.** The program's scope depends on the intended goal and can include supporting the reform of specific aspects of the existing TPD structure (for example, strengthening existing 1-1 support); or it may include new aspects (for example, introduction of technology-based solutions). Either way, design TPD program structures that are integrated with existing TPD services and enhance existing practices and policies.
- **Content (What).** Content is the core of the design process. Selective and strategic in scope, TPD programs that focus on a targeted set of foundational teaching skills or on a specific subject and are tailored to teachers' needs can help teachers improve competence and develop proficiency.
- **Mode (How).** Program mode (example, in-person, remote, or hybrid) can impact participation during implementation so is an integral design component.
- **Frequency (How Often).** Frequency (for example, one-off, monthly, or ongoing) can make or break an otherwise good program design. For example, one-off support with no follow-up is hardly effective.

Why: It is important to identify the key design features of the TPD program and whether they are aligned with the goals of improved teaching practice and better quality student-teacher interactions and, ultimately, improved student learning outcomes. Additionally, understanding how these design features have worked or not in the past and how they measure up against the evidence on what works can yield useful insights for policy engagement on future TPD interventions.

Sample Questions to Ask (In-country)	Actions to Consider/Sample Resources
<p>What is the program goal? Intended outcome(s)? What is your theory of change?</p>	<p>Define: Intended objectives of the TPD program and how it will support overall sector goals toward improved student learning. A clear theory of change based on the global evidence can be prepared to support this process.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What Is a Theory of Change and Guidance on Building a Theory of Change – see here. • See sample here (Results Chain, p.13), here (Results Chain, p. 20), and here (Results Chain, p. 17).
<p>What different approaches from global guidance on teacher policy and/or TPD exist to help you address your challenge? How have other education systems addressed similar challenges and/or implemented similar TPD Programs?</p>	<p>Review: International and regional research and practices for delivering TPD to identify practices that can be adapted for the country context.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coach Program Overview, which lays out the four evidence-based principles of effective TPD (tailored, focused, practical, and ongoing). • World Bank TPD Repository highlights key components for TPD-focused projects both within and outside the Education GP. • Coach Repository of In-Service TPD Programs is a live library of in-service K-12 TPD programs that have been implemented at scale around the world. • Motivating Changes in Teaching Practices, which lays out 10 evidence-based strategies to design TPD programs to overcome motivational barriers. • Successful Teachers Successful Students, which lays out the vision and five key principles to support teachers. <p>Website: Coach.</p> <p>Read the blog: Global Platform for Successful Teachers.</p> <p>Contact: Coach Team (coach@worldbank.org).</p>

<p>What structure is best suited for the context?</p>	<p>Review: Existing country practices and identify entry points for enhancing or reforming existing TPD services for teachers.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Structuring Effective One-to-One Support for teachers and accompanying PPT. • Structuring and Supporting School- and Cluster-Based Continuous Professional Development and accompanying PPT. • Structuring Effective Group Training and accompanying PPT. <p>Contact: Respective Note authors. See table C1 for STCs with experience in TPD.</p>
<p>What should coaching sessions comprise? In what pedagogical practices should teachers be trained?</p>	<p>Review: Extent to which TPD systems enable for focused learning opportunities,</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implementing Effective One-to-One Support for teachers and accompanying PPT (forthcoming). • Foundational Teaching Skills Guide, which outlines the importance of using focused approaches to TPD and suggests steps to help teachers develop foundational pedagogical skills. <p>Contact: Tracy Wilichowski (twilichowski@worldbank.org).</p>
<p>Is instructional leadership present at the school to foster improvements in teaching practices? Are teachers evaluated to identify areas to improve?</p> <p>How should teachers be trained on new pedagogical practices?</p> <p>How should coaches/pedagogical leaders be trained to provide tailored, focused, practical, and ongoing support?</p>	<p>Review: Existing roles of public sector educators and existing evaluation systems that may or may not incentivize focus on improved instructional practice.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Foundational Teaching Skills Training Package. • Training of Coaches Training Package. • Teacher's Guide Diagnostic Tool, which assesses the quality of teacher's guides and provides recommendations to improve them. <p>Read:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The School Leadership Crisis, Part 1: Making Principals Work for Schools. • The School Leadership Crisis, Part 2: From Administrators to Instructional Leaders. • Blog: Breaking Old Habits and Adopting New Ones: How to Change Teaching Practice When Change Is Hard. <p>Contact: Elaine Ding (eding@worldbank.org); Ana Teresa del Toro Mijares (adeltoromijares@worldbank.org).</p>
<p>Are remote or hybrid approaches used for teaching, learning, TPD, or coaching? How can technology be leveraged to support TPD?</p>	<p>Review: International and regional research and practices for delivering technology-based TPD to identify practices that can be adapted to the country context.</p> <p>Utilize:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Technology for Teaching (T4T) Approach Note, which provides guidance on technology-based global strategies to enhance teaching practices. The Note also features case studies from 10 T4T champions selected from 435 TPD programs from 80 countries/LMIC contexts. • Technology for TPD Navigation Guide: A Summary of Methods, which summarizes evidence on designing and implementing six common methods to deliver technology-based TPD. These methods are coaching, communities of practice, digital resources for learning, digital resources for teaching, instructional tips and strategies, and modeling best practices. • EdTech Toolkit for Remote Learning and other accompanying resources, which include Guidance Notes and knowledge packs including response to COVID-19. • EdTech Toolkit Knowledge Packs on Learning Management Systems and Teachers' Skills and Skills Frameworks for Remote and Blended Learning.

Read:

- Lessons learned on [Technology-Supported TPD in Developing Countries](#).

Watch:

- [Event Recording: Technology and Teacher Professional Development](#).

Contact: Manal Bakur N. Quota (mquota@worldbank.org); Cristobal Cobo (ccobo@worldbank.org).

Stage 3. Implement and Monitor

3.1 With a clear TPD program design, move to the next stage of implementation by piloting, and scaling as appropriate.

- **Pilot.** If possible, even before piloting, practitioners can pre-test a TPD program design and assess for implementation fidelity, quality, beneficiary experience, and process to identify early-stage implementation issues. With added due diligence, pilots can yield better results and present stronger potential for scale-up.
- **Scale and Sustain.** An intervention can be designed and implemented well at the pilot stage but still face the risk of failure when scaled up ([Bold and others 2013](#)). Scaling up and sustaining a reform requires various resources and discussions, including thinking about the costs and capacity for not only rolling out the TPD program but also sustaining it in the future years.

Why: Even if the program is well resourced, it is important to ensure that the program is being implemented with fidelity and that key actors are performing their roles as intended. Using clear roles and responsibilities, well-designed incentives, and accountability mechanisms, coupled with data from an effective monitoring and evaluation system, can improve implementation fidelity.

Sample Questions to Ask (In-country)

What are the best practices for piloting, scaling, and sustaining programs?
How can you measure implementation fidelity?

Actions to Consider/Sample Resources

Utilize:

- [Framework for Measuring Fidelity of Implementation](#) in educational interventions.
- [Fidelity Criteria: Development, Measurement, and Validation](#).
- [Effective Coaching of Teachers: Fidelity Worksheet and Rubric](#).

Example:

Coach Spotlight series:

- [Tusome Early Grade Reading Activity](#).
- [Read India](#).
- [Acompañamiento Pedagógico Multigrado \(APM\)](#).
- [Un Buen Comienzo \(UBC\) Program](#).
- [Northern Education Initiative Plus \(NEI+\)](#).

How can you scale up TPD practices?
How can you ensure sustainability of practices?

Review: [Effective TPD Using Technology Guidance Note](#), which presents a framework for scaling quality TPD practices through technology-based solutions.

Example:

- [Videos](#) of programs from the [Teachers for a Changing World](#) campaign co-launched by World Bank and HundrED.
- [70 to 700 to 70,000: Lessons from the Jamaica Experiment](#).
- [Translating Research on Effective Teaching to Action: Evidence from Gambia and Guinea-Bissau on bundled interventions to support teachers](#).
- [Teacher Tech Summit: Scaling Quality Education in LatAm \(4:22:52\)](#)

Read:

- Blog: [What Scales in Global Education?](#)
- Blog: [Embracing EdTech: Four Critical Questions Answered through a Rapid Prototype Programme on TPD](#).

3.2 Consistent data collection, monitoring, and management are needed throughout implementation as the means to mitigate implementation challenges and enhance decision-making.

- **Collect, analyse, and disseminate data.** TPD programs need to collect learning-focused data, for example, through classroom observation tools such as [Teach](#) or [Stallings](#); or use assessment data from local, regional, or international assessments, if available, to guide and disseminate key information to relevant stakeholders.
- **Monitor.** Monitoring implementation fidelity and progress toward desired outcomes can help guide a TPD program toward its set goal or course correction, as required.
- **Evaluate.** Both mid-line and end-line evaluations facilitate learning and can improve strategy, initiative, or program.

Why: A data system is only as good as how well it is used to inform decisions. Tight feedback loops between data on implementation and outcomes, and decision-making can offer opportunities for course correction, provided decision-makers have the will and capacity to use such data.

Sample Questions to Ask (In-country)

What data relating to TPD are collected and how often? Who collects the TPD data; and how, and where are they stored?

How to ensure feedback loops whereby M&E data are used to inform program design and implementation in an iterative manner?

Actions to Consider/Sample Resources

Review: Guidance on M&E including setting up indicators and selecting an observation tool.

Review:

- [Monitoring and Evaluation Technical Guidance Note](#) and accompanying PPT, and [Indicator Sheet](#), which give an overview of how to design effective M&E practices for TPD.
- [Impact Evaluation in Practice](#), 2ed ed.

Utilize:

- Guidelines on establishing a numerical indicator to measure teaching practices through classroom observation tools, and benchmarking this indicator to track changes in teaching practices over time ([here](#)).
- Compilation of recent WBG Teaching Quality Indicators in PADs.
- Classroom observation tools such as [Teach](#) or [Stallings](#); or use assessment data from local, regional, or international assessments.
- [Capturing Cost Data](#), which lays out guidance on how to collect data to measure the cost of interventions.
- [SIEF](#) (WBG Strategic Impact Evaluation Fund) resources on measurement.

Appendix A. Public Expenditure Reviews (PERs) with Sections on Teacher Professional Development (TPD)

“Public expenditure reviews are one of the World Bank’s core diagnostic tools for informing various stakeholders about the state of education financing in a country. Such reviews assess the efficiency, effectiveness, and equity of expenditures on education and their adequacy and sustainability relative to the country’s educational goals. They review not only public spending, but also private and donor spending” (World Bank Group 2017).

Table A1. List of PERs with Sections on TPD

Country	Scope and Objectives of the PER	TPD Challenge Addressed in the PER	Relevant Chapters/Pages
1. Kingdom of Lesotho (P160784)	The report provides an assessment of Lesotho’s expenditure patterns from 2011/2012-2015/16 and recommendations on how to achieve universal compulsory lower basic education by 2020, while accounting for fiscal constraints	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of TPD Programs on the Foundational Skills of Reading, Writing and Arithmetic at the Primary Level • Dearth of trained teachers on the New Curriculum 	Page 66- Page 11 , <i>Human Resources in Education</i> 68 , <i>Section 85, 93</i>
2. Madagascar (P147611)	The report provides an analysis of the education sector expenditure and recommendations to improve its overall efficiency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of Pre-Service and In-Service TPD Programs for Community Teachers 	Page 14-15 (also refer to Table 4)
3. Nigeria (P153070)	This report aims to address issues pertaining to access, equity and quality in Nigeria’s education sector by adopting a governance and finance framework, and provides recommendations to tackle these key challenges.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of Induction Programs for newly hired teachers • Ineffective In-service TPD programs • Lack of Incentives for participating in TPD 	Page 27 , <i>Training and Professional Development</i> Page 110-113 , <i>Establish a clear and systematic HRM System</i>
4. Indonesia (P122984)	This report analyzes the effects of Indonesia’s governance and financing system on access and quality in the education system. Additionally, it also looks at the consequences of “20 percent” education budget rule.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No Significant Impact of Teacher Certifications on Student Learning Outcomes/ Quality of Teacher Certification Programs 	Page 71-74 , <i>Teacher Certification and Learning Outcomes</i> Page 91 , <i>Improving the Teacher Certification Program</i>
5. Indonesia (P106349)	This report analyzes education sector expenditures at the district level in Indonesia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teacher qualifications at the primary level often fail to fulfill Ministry Regulation No. 19/2005, which requires teachers to have a bachelor degree 	Page 38-39 Page 55 <i>Teacher Qualifications</i>
6. Cambodia (P162321)	This report examines the flow of funds by identifying resource use and leakages within the system. It also analyzes the the efficiency of frontline service delivery	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Pre-Service and In-Service Training Programs 	Page 14-15 , <i>Teachers</i> Page 51 , <i>Section 124</i>

7. Philippines (P46303)	This report examines the efficiency of education sector expenditure and identifies weakness in governance, with the aim of increasing overall effectiveness of education spending	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Elementary and High School Teachers • Duration and Frequency of In-Service TPD Programs • Weak Implementation System to Identify TPD Needs 	Page 39-49 <i>Policy Note 2: Developing a Proficient & Motivated Teacher Workforce</i> Page 51-52: <i>Policy Directions for Strengthening Systems to Support Teacher Development</i>
8. Thailand (P146230)	This report highlights strengths and weaknesses of Thailand's education sector, and provides strategies for closing the attainment gap between various socioeconomic groups, with the aim of improving learning for all	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of Qualified Teachers in Small and Remote Schools 	Page 42, <i>Improving Teaching Resources for Small and Remote Schools</i>
9. Kazakhstan (P146496)	“This report analyses the effectiveness of the Kazakh school system and identifies policy areas with potential efficiency gains or requiring further public investment”	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Absence of a Framework for Teaching Standards • Quality of Pre-Service and In-Service Programs 	Page 87-89, <i>The Teaching Workforce</i> Page 111-115, <i>“Significant Inefficiencies Hamper the Management of Human Resources”</i> Page 126-131 <i>“Improve the Management of Human Resources to Raise the Quality of Teachers & School Leaders”</i> Page 151-153, <i>“Professional Development Opportunities for teachers & School Leaders”</i> Page 177-178 <i>“Policy Recommendations: Make Professional Development a More Regular Practice for Teachers”</i>
10 .Jordan (P148394)	This report examines basic system attributes such as class-size, enrollments and student-teacher ratios, as well as public education spending & provides recommendations for improving student learning outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of alignment between TPD Programs and the Performance Based Accountability System 	Page 49-50 <i>“Motivating Teachers to Perform”</i>
11. Yemen (P147059)	This report provides an overview of Yemen's education sector, its challenges and provides recommendations to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the system	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Pre-Service and In-Service TPD Programs 	Page 70-78, <i>“Quality and Availability of Teachers”</i>
12. Bangladesh (P102544)	This report consists of policy notes that focus on access, equity, education quality and skills development in Bangladesh's education sector and suggests policy directions based on the key findings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Pre-Service and In-Service TPD Programs 	Page 69-76, <i>“Teacher Characteristics”</i> Page 100-102, <i>“Enhance Policy Measures to Address Teacher Performance & Motivate Them”</i>
13. Sri Lanka (P133742)	“The objective of this report is to analyze the state of early childhood education (ECE1) provision and the policy framework for delivering ECE in Sri Lanka, and suggest policy options for the future”	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Early Childhood TPD Programs 	Page 25, <i>“Teacher/Educator Quality”</i> Page 28-29, <i>Section 72-75</i>

14. Sri Lanka (P118851)	This report focuses on governance and delivery of education services with a focus on language, mathematics and science education and provides policy directions for the future	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Pre-Service and In-Service TPD Programs 	Page 45-48 <i>"Teacher Management & Development in a Decentralized System"</i>
15. Sri Lanka (P102566)	This report focuses on Sri Lanka's higher education sector, outlining key challenges, and steps policymakers can take to improve higher education provision	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of TPD in Higher Education Institutions 	Page 32-36 , <i>"The Central Role of Skilled & Experienced Staff"</i> Page 46 <i>"The Way Forward-Section 3.64"</i>
16. Maldives	This report provides an overview of general education in Maldives and strategies for improving service delivery in the country	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A high proportion of Untrained Primary School Teachers • High Dependence on Qualified Expatriate Teachers 	Page 15-22 , <i>"Enhancing the Skills & Performance of Teachers"</i>
17. Oman (P115645)	This report concentrates on pre-tertiary education and examines aspects of <i>access to education, quality of learning, teachers and teaching methods, relevance of education to the labor market, and the financing and management of the education system.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality of Pre-Service and, Teacher Induction Programs 	Chapter 5 , <i>"Teachers and Quality of Education"</i>

Appendix B. Sample WBG Teaching Quality Indicators

Table B1. Sample WBG Teaching Quality Indicators

PAD	Result-level PDO indicator	Indicator used -- full description
Guyana Education Sector Improvement Project (PAD2052)	"PDO 2: Increase in the percentage of pilot school teachers meeting standards in student-centered teaching practices." (38)	"This indicator will assess the implementation of student-centered teaching practices through classroom-observations that will be developed during the project implementation. A pilot version of the observation instrument and the standards will be available in 2017. The baseline will be established in 2018."
Tanzania Secondary Education Quality Improvement Project (PAD3378)	"Improvement in classroom teaching practice in government secondary schools through regular in-service teacher training" (56)	"Improvements in teaching practices will be considered achieved if 60% of observed teachers, who participated in training, show improvement according the approved module-specific observation tools." (70)
Nagaland: Enhancing Classroom Teaching and Resources (PAD3805)	"b) Improvement in teaching in selected school complexes" (14)	"A validated tool for evaluating in-class teaching practice will be used. It will be applied to a sample of teachers in each of the school complexes selected for support under NECTAR. Ratings on each dimension of the tool will be summed to generate an overall teaching quality score for each teacher" (42)
Lao PDR Global Partnership For Education III: Learning and Equity Acceleration Project (PAD3966)	"Percentage of mathematics and Lao Language grade 1-3 teachers with improved teaching practices as measured by a high inference tool (Percentage)" (37)	"As measured through an enhanced version of current classroom observation tools. In particular, the classroom observation tool has to ensure alignment to the teaching standards and international best practice. This is not a cumulative indicator." (42)
Improving The Quality Of Initial and Primary Education In Uruguay Project (PAD2084)	"PDO1. Increase in the teaching practices score in FTS based on class observation." (41)	"This indicator will assess teaching practices through classroom-observations that will be developed/adjusted by INEED. It will cover key dimensions of the training including: instructional and socioemotional support, active teaching techniques, and class-organization. A pilot version of the observation instrument will be available in 2017. The instrument will cover at least a representative sample of FTS (and possibly all FTS). Targets represent percentage increases over mean baseline results (TBD in 2017)." (41)
Third Punjab Education Sector Project (PAD1641)	"Quality score of primary teaching-learning practices" (25)	"A score that measures the quality of teachinglearning practices at the primary level. The quality of practices is scored based on data derived from an observation format that covers different domains of teaching-learning practice, such as classroom organization, instructional support, and emotional support. The practices observed are those known to be related to student learning." (25)
Afghanistan EQRA Project (PAD2466)	"Improved teaching quality rating based on classroom observations" (48)	"2019: Evidence demonstrating that baseline data on teaching quality is collected on a target sample of teachers. This will include measuring classroom performance as the average rating in five instructional practice dimensions (time on learning, lesson facilitation, check for understanding, feedback, and critical thinking) on a scale from 1 to 5 using the TEACH classroom observation tool. It will also comprise assessments of subject knowledge of mathematics and language for Grades 3 to 6. The baseline indicator will be a composite score combining teaching quality (weighted 70%) and content knowledge (weighted 30%)." (48)

Ghana Accountability For Learning Outcomes Project (PAD3320)	<p>"Increased percentage of targeted schools with teaching practices meeting inspection standards (percentage point increase from baseline)" (58)</p>	<p>"Percentage point increase from baseline (to be determined in 2020) in percent of targeted schools with "good" inspection score (averaged score of 3 or higher, averaged across Math and English lessons observed)" (58) "This data will be collected through flash surveys conducted over a period of no more than one month in a sample of targeted schools. At least one Math and one English lesson will be observed in each school sampled." (58)</p>
Ghana Global Partnership For Education Fund Grant Project (72949-GH)	<p>"Teachers trained under the project in deprived districts who obtain satisfactory rating or higher in the SBI/CBI Lesson Observation Sheet for (a) lesson planning (b) teaching methodology c) classroom organization and management" (32)</p>	<p>"Teachers trained under the project in deprived districts who obtain satisfactory rating or higher in the SBI/CBI Lesson Observation Sheet for (a) lesson planning (b) teaching methodology c) classroom organization and management" (32)</p>
Tuvalu Learning Project (PAD3593)	<p>"Number of teachers using satisfactory play-based pedagogical practices in ECCE centers" (42)</p>	<p>"As measured through a classroom lesson observation tool" (42)</p>
	<p>"Number of teachers implementing Tuvalu Reading Program (TRP) explicit instruction approach satisfactorily in Years 1-3" (44)</p>	<p>"As measured through a classroom lesson observation tool" (42)</p>
Cambodia: Second Education Sector Support Project (PAD519)	<p>"Percentage of primary teachers applying effective EGRA teaching methods as defined by classroom observation criteria" (23)</p>	<p>"Percentage of primary teachers applying effective EGRA teaching methods as defined by classroom observation" (23)</p>
Lao PDR: Second Global Partnership For Education Project (PAD1055)	<p>"Percentage of Grades 1 and 2 teachers in pilot schools who show improvement in teaching practices (measured through objective classroom observations)" (21)</p>	<p>"Percentage of Grade 1 and 2 teachers in pilot schools who show improvement in teaching practices⁴⁵ (measured through objective classroom observations)" (25); "Classroom observations. The classroom observation tool to assess the change in teaching practices will be based on existing tools, adapted to the Lao context. These tools measure different dimensions of teaching practices, such as: (i) teacher's knowledge of the concepts to taught, (ii) competence to classroom instruction to maximize time-on-task, (iii) content/skill-specific instructional routines in terms of their type, frequency and quality, among others⁵¹. The MoES will review different classroom observation tools to develop and pre-test an instrument suitable to observe teacher-student interactions around reading development in Lao PDR." (30)</p>

Appendix C. List of Short-Term Consultants

Table C1. List of Short-Term Consultants

Last Name	First Name	Based in (Country)	Email Contact	Areas of Expertise
Alvi	Hafsa	Pakistan	hafsa.alvi91@gmail.com	Coach Series
Arenge	Gabrielle	UK	ga359@cam.ac.uk	Coach: Facilitating Effective 1-1
Bhatia	Jayanti	India	jbhatia2@worldbank.org	1. Coach Series 2. Technology for Teachers (T4T)
Khurana	Aishwarya	USA	akhurana1@worldbank.org	Coach: School-and Cluster-Based CPD
Mahajan	Laura	USA	laura.mahajan@matcheducation.org	Coach: Foundational Teaching Skills Guide
Paredes	Diana	Peru	dianaparedesv@gmail.com	Coach: Group Training
Popova	Anna	USA	apopova@stanford.edu	Coach: Structuring Effective 1-1
Shivaji Patil	Aishwarya	USA	apatil3@worldbank.org	Technology for Teachers (T4T)

Note: Please reach out to the Teachers' Thematic Group for a detailed list of consultants with experience on teacher policy-related areas.

Access Coach Tools
and Resources 