



## Vietnam Enhancing Teacher Education Program (P150060)

EAST ASIA AND PACIFIC | Vietnam | Education Global Practice | Requesting Unit: EACVF | Responsible Unit: HEAED  
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2016 | Team Leader(s): Dung Kieu Vo

Seq No: 12 | ARCHIVED on 23-Jun-2022 | ISR50998 | Created by: Dung Kieu Vo on 07-Apr-2022 | Modified by: Dung Kieu Vo on 20-Jun-2022

### Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

The project development objective is to strengthen teacher training institutions to enhance teacher and principal effectiveness through improved continuous professional development.

### Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	<span style="color: orange;">□</span> Moderately Satisfactory	<span style="color: green;">□</span> Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	<span style="color: orange;">□</span> Moderately Satisfactory	<span style="color: green;">□</span> Satisfactory

### Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The program was concluded successfully as it fully achieved both program development objectives. All six Lead Teacher Training Universities (LTTUs) achieved the Teacher Education Institution Development Index end target scores. Out of 653,360 respondents to the satisfaction survey on 2021 continuous professional development (CPD) programs, 630,393 rated the 2021 school based CPD support as satisfactory (96.5 percent).

According to the Teacher Education Management Information System (TEMIS), more than 477,000 teachers and school principals completed five CPD modules via the Learning Management Systems, and more than 30,000 core teachers and principal advisors were trained on the six CPD modules by the LTTUs to provide school based support to their peers. Forty-five (45) TEMIS reports on teachers' and school principals' performance against professional standards, CPD needs and satisfaction with CPD programs were published.

The program has disbursed 100 percent of the remaining IDA funding. MOET successfully integrated all ETEP deliverables and, together with the LTTUs, is committed to sustaining ETEP outcomes. The Government will conduct the final stakeholder workshop at the end of June 2022 and finalize the project completion report with feedback received at the stakeholder workshop.

### Data on Financial Performance

#### Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P150060	IDA-58780	Effective	USD	95.00	47.65	47.35	48.04	0.00	100%

#### Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P150060	IDA-58780	Effective	29-Jun-2016	06-Feb-2017	05-Jun-2017	30-Jun-2022	30-Jun-2022



### DLI Disbursement

DLI ID	DLI Type	Description	Coc	DLI Amount	Achievement Status	Disbursed amount in Coc	Disbursement % for DLI
<b>Loan: IDA58780-001</b>							
DLI2	Regular	SYSTEMS ARE IN PLACE	XDR	5,000,000.00	Partially Achieved	1,426,500.00	29 %
DLI3	Regular	NO OF CORE TEACHERS SELECTED N TRAINED	XDR	9,232,072.00	Partially Achieved	3,826,466.00	41 %
DLI4	Regular	NO OF CORE TEACHERS PROVIDING SBCPD	XDR	2,099,526.00	Fully Achieved	2,099,526.00	100 %
DLI5	Regular	NO OF TEACHERS SATISFIED WITH ITC	XDR	2,840,000.00	Partially Achieved	1,440,000.00	51 %
DLI1	Regular	INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITY OF LTTU	XDR	14,910,000.00	Partially Achieved	13,910,000.00	93 %

### Program Action Plan

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall develop and execute a Capacity Building Plan for the LTTUs to ensure sustainable provision of teacher school based continuous professional development support, all in form and substance satisfactory to the Association.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Technical		Client	Due Date	05-Jun-2018	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	A Capacity Building Plan developed, costed and executed (in cooperation with LTTUs).				
<b>Comments</b>	The Plan was finalized in December 2019 and was fully executed in 2021.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall carry out a study – under the terms of reference acceptable to the Association - to identify options and recommendations for financing teacher- continuous professional development.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Technical		Client	Due Date	30-Jun-2020	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Study validated by MOET				
<b>Comments</b>	The study has been conducted with the final draft report submitted to the Bank in January 2021.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall disclose information on the Program's activities to the public, including financial information throughout the implementation of the Program.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Other		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Evidence of information disclosure				



<b>Comments</b>	Information on the program's activities, including financial information, is disclosed via the PMU/ LTTUs' websites and fan page. PMU issued a guideline in April 2019 on information disclosure, among others, to be followed by PMU/ LTTUs.
-----------------	---

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall maintain a system of receiving, recording and following-up on complaints, including anonymous ones.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Other		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Log of complaints and reports.				
<b>Comments</b>	One complaint was received on January 9, 2022, via email and on January 13, 2022, by MOET's official letter relating to activity under the investment project implemented by Vinh LTTU. The complaint was fully resolved.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall maintain a database on complaints and denunciations from all the participating agencies and follows up on the resolution of those complaints and denunciations.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Other		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Database verified				
<b>Comments</b>	MOET is in charge of maintaining the database. One complaint was received on January 9, 2022, via email and on January 13, 2022, relating to activity under the investment project implemented by Vinh LTTU. The complaint was fully resolved.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall (a) review LTTUs internal audit capacity; and (b) prepare and execute – or cause to be executed - plans to build the capacity of internal audit function in LTTUs.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	05-Jun-2019	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Internal audit capacity assessed and LTTUs capacity building plans developed, costed, approved and executed (in cooperation with LTTUs).				
<b>Comments</b>	The action was completed.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall issue guidance on the performance based budgeting/allocation				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Other		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Guidance on the performance based budgeting/ allocation was issued by MOET.				
<b>Comments</b>	The action was completed.				



<b>Action Description</b>	All proposals for detailed designs, construction supervision and bids for civil works, whether below or above cost estimates, shall be evaluated; proposals and bids shall not be rejected only on the basis of minor, non-substantive deviations.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	n/a				
<b>Comments</b>	Complied, as noted in the May-June implementation completion and results report ICR mission.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall design and adopt a mechanism – satisfactory to the Association - to coordinate teacher continuous professional development initiatives and activities among teacher education providers and concerned teacher management department				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Technical		Client	Due Date	05-Jun-2018	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Issuance of a circular on teacher continuous professional development which includes the regulated coordination mechanism.				
<b>Comments</b>	Circular 19/2019/TT-BGDĐT was issued on November 12, 2019.				

<b>Action Description</b>	At least 60 percent of contracts for consultancies and 85 percent of contracts for works shall be competitively bid annually.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	n/a				
<b>Comments</b>	Complied, as noted in the May-June implementation completion and results report (ICR) mission.				

<b>Action Description</b>	No contract having cost estimate above the thresholds for using DC/SSS method set forth in the national public procurement law and regulation will be awarded on DC/SSS basis.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	n/a				
<b>Comments</b>	Complied, as noted in the May-June implementation completion and results report (ICR) mission.				

<b>Action Description</b>	Firms on the local, national, or Bank debarment list shall not be allowed to participate.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>



Fiduciary Systems		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	n/a				
<b>Comments</b>	Complied, as noted in the May-June implementation completion and results report ICR mission.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient shall develop a guideline to facilitate meaningful consultation and inform participation of beneficiary principals and teachers, including those from ethnic minorities and vulnerable groups.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Due Date	05-Jun-2018	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Formal issuance of the guideline				
<b>Comments</b>	The guideline was formally issued in November 2018.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The above referenced guideline, which will be implemented by LTTUs should fully operationalize the existing Vietnamese legislation with respect to ethnic minorities through a process of free, prior, and informed consultations.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Due Date	05-Jun-2018	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	n/a				
<b>Comments</b>	Complied, as noted in the May-June implementation completion and results report ICR mission.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient will prepare an Operational Manual.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Technical		Client	Due Date	05-Jun-2017	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	OM agreed by the Bank				
<b>Comments</b>	This action was completed.				

<b>Action Description</b>	The Recipient will execute the Operation according to the Manual.				
<b>Source</b>	<b>DLI#</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Timing</b>	<b>Timing Value</b>	<b>Status</b>
Technical		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
<b>Completion Measurement</b>	Implementation Support Missions will review implementation quality				
<b>Comments</b>	Complied with good implementation progress, as noted in the May-June implementation completion and results report ICR mission.				



## Risks

### Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	--	☐ Low	☐ Low
Macroeconomic	--	☐ Low	☐ Low
Sector Strategies and Policies	--	☐ Low	☐ Low
Technical Design of Project or Program	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Low
Fiduciary	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Moderate
Environment and Social	--	☐ Low	☐ Low
Stakeholders	--	☐ Low	☐ Low
Other	--	☐ Moderate	☐ Low
Overall	--	☐ Low	☐ Low

#### Comments

The program has ended with two program development objectives (PDO) and three out of four intermediate result (IR) indicators fully achieved. The program sustainability is likely. Therefore institutional capacity for implementation and sustainability is downgraded to Low.

## Results

### PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Strengthened teacher education institutions to enhance teacher and principal effectiveness				
► Improved performance of the six Lead Teacher Training Universities to provide CPD as measured by the Teacher Education Institutional Development Index (TEIDI) (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	Baseline established for each LTTU	Hanoi LTTU 5.35; Thai Nguyen LTTU 5.35; Vinh LTTU 5.56; Hue LTTU 5.0; Danang LTTU 5.11; HCMC LTTU 5.18.	Hanoi LTTU 5.00; Thai Nguyen LTTU 4.74; Vinh LTTU 4.88; Hue LTTU 4.95; Danang LTTU 4.88; HCMC LTTU 4.73.	TEIDI score of each LTTU increases to at least level 5 (>4.43)
Date	31-Dec-2017	31-Dec-2021	15-May-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	<b>Achieved (100 percent)</b> By May 15, 2022, six LTTUs' TEIDI scores were verified to have exceeded the end target of level 5 (i.e. over 4.43).			



► Number of teachers and principals satisfied with school-based continuous professional development (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	541,696.00	630,393.00	320,000.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	15-May-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	<b>Achieved (179 percent).</b> 630,393 teachers/ principles/ core teachers and principal advisors rated the school-based CPD in 2021 Satisfactory vs. 2021 target of 320,000. The result has been verified with initial data processing by IVA.			

### Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Improved capacity of Lead Teacher Training Universities to enhance teacher and principal effectiveness				
► Number of LTTUs that sign Performance Agreements with MOET. (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	6.00	6.00	6.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	15-May-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	<b>Achieved (100 percent).</b> Six Performance Agreement (PAs) were signed between MOET and LTTUs, and the PAs/ revised PAs were verified by the IVA.			

Development of teacher and principal training needs assessment system to informed CPD program development				
► Number of TEMIS-generated annual reports on CPD needs by DOET. (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	47.00	45.00	45.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	15-May-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	<b>Achieved (100 percent).</b> 45 reports (vs. the 2021 target of 45) were generated from the Teacher Education Management Information System (TEMIS) on CPD needs by DOET. All reports were reported to have met the quality set by the program. The result has been verified with the first draft report from IVA.			

School-based and continuous professional development for teachers and principals				
► Number of deployed core teachers and/ or principal advisors having completed different priority training modules set for the year (Text, Custom)				



	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No core teachers/ principal advisors completed any training modules	24,000 core teachers and principal advisors have completed six mandatory modules.	22,549 core teachers and principal advisors have completed six mandatory modules.	28,600 core teachers and principal advisors having completed six modules
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	15-May-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	<p><b>Partially achieved (79 percent)</b> The six LTTUs were reported to have provided training on six mandatory modules to 30,127 deployed core teachers and principal advisors, vs end target of 28,600. Based on the initial verification result, 79 percent of the end target of 28,600, or 22,549, is expected to be achieved by June 30, 2022. Final verification reports will be finalized by June 27, 2022.</p>			

Teachers and principals have access to CPD programs and resources through a ICT based system

► Number of teachers and school principals having completed different mandatory online modules of the CPD program set for the year through the Learning Management System(s) (LMS(s)) (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No teachers/ principals having completed any online module of the CPD program through the LMS(s)	519,465 teachers and school principals completed four out of five mandatory online modules and 220,469 teachers and school principals completed all five mandatory online modules through the Learning Management Systems (LMS).	477,922 teachers and school principals completed five mandatory online modules through the Learning Management Systems (LMS).	480,000 teachers/ school principals having completed five modules through the LMS(s)
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	15-May-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	<p><b>Achieved (99.6 percent).</b> 477,922 teachers and school principals completed five mandatory online modules through the Learning Management Systems (LMS) (vs. the end target of 480,000 teachers and school principals completed all five mandatory modules). The result is verified with data already processed by IVA. Final verification report will be provided by June 27, 2022.</p>			

#### Disbursement Linked Indicators

► DLI 1 Institutional capacity of LTTUs to support the new Continuous Professional Development system for teachers and principals enhanced (Output, 24,693,495.00, 43%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	From April 2021 to March 2022
Value	LTTUs have inadequate capacity to support the continuous professional development	Six out of eight LTTUs have conducted annual TEIDI-self assessments, and the MOET has published the TEIDI scores on its websites.	Six out of eight LTTUs have conducted annual TEIDI-self assessments, and the MOET has published the TEIDI scores on its websites.	Up to six LTTUs conduct an annual TEIDI assessment and MOET publishes the TEIDI scores on its website.
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	31-Mar-2022	--
Comments	<b>Achieved (100 percent)</b>			





Six out of eight LTTUs have conducted annual TEIDI self-assessments, and the MOET has published the TEIDI scores on its websites vs the period 5 target of six.  
IVA completed the final verification reports for 4 LTTUs' TEIDI self-assessment reports (Hà Nội, Huế, Đà Nẵng, Thái Nguyên). Final draft reports of the remaining two (Vinh, HCMC) will be completed by June 27, 2022.

► DLI 2 Systems are in place to:(i)measure whether teachers/principals meet new professional standards;(ii) track & record evaluations of CPD programs;(iii) record assessments CPD needs of teachers/principals (Output, 16,487,091.00, 0%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	From April 2021 to March 2022
Value	Existing systems to assess teacher and principal CPD needs are not aligned with requirements of the fundamental and comprehensive education reform (FCER) nor adequately inform the development of CPD programs.	47 TEMIS -generated CPD annual reports were published.	45 TEMIS -generated CPD annual reports were published.	Up to forty-five DOETs publish a TEMIS-generated CPD annual report for its respective province. The annual reports present trends on professional standards, beneficiary assessments of CPD programs and assessments of CPD needs of teachers and principals. MOET establishes an in-house Teacher Education Management Information System (TEMIS) that: (i) tracks teacher and principal professional standards rating; (ii) records beneficiary evaluations of CPD programs and interventions; and (iii) records teacher and principal CPD needs.
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	31-Mar-2022	--
Comments	<p><b>Achieved (100 percent)</b> 45 TEMIS reports were generated vs the period 5 target of 45. The July 2021 mission acknowledged the fact that the MOET, by Decision No.2164/QĐ-BGDĐT, dated 29 June 2021, decided to cancel the development of the MOET in-house TEMIS, given the remaining time for ETEP implementation is too short to have such a system developed within the program timeframe, and given MOET has already had a plan to develop an Information and Communication Technology (ICT) master plan for the sector which shall include the development of the teacher and principal education management information system. The assessment of the DLRs under the disbursement linked indicator (DLI) #2, achieved in period 5, has taken into account this cancellation. Funding relating to this DLR of the MOET in-house TEMIS was already cancelled in April 2022. The result is verified with the first draft report by IVA. Final verification report is expected by June 27, 2022.</p>			



► DLI 3 Number of core teachers and principal advisors selected and trained to provide systematic face-to-face school based CPD to teachers and principals (Output, 14,242,800.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	From April 2021 to March 2022
Value	A corps of trained school-based specialists that provide systematic face-to-face school-based CPD to teachers and principals does not exist.	24,000 (including approximately 21,500 core teachers and 2,500 principal advisors) have been trained on six mandatory modules.	25,600 core teachers and principal advisors have been trained on six mandatory modules.	LTTUs provide basic training to 25,000 core teachers and 3,600 principal advisors
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	31-Mar-2022	--
Comments	<p><b>Partially achieved (89 percent)</b> 30,127 deployed core teachers and principal advisors vs. the period 5 target of 28,600 were trained with six CPD modules of 1,2,3,4,5, and 9. However, given the past/ ongoing verification results, only 89 percent of the period 5 target, or 25,600, is expected to be achieved. The result is partially verified. Final verification report is expected by June 27, 2022.</p>			

► DLI 4 Number of core teachers and principal advisors providing school-based continuous professional development to teachers and principals (Output, 10,168,614.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	From April 2021 to March 2022
Value	A corps of trained specialists that provide systematic fact-to-face school-based CPD to teachers and principals does not exist.	13,785 (including 13,689 core teachers and 87 principal advisors) have provided school-based CPD to teachers and principals.	28,288 core teachers and principal advisors have provided school-based CPD to teachers and principals.	Up to 25,000 core teachers and 3,600 principal advisors provide school-based continuous professional development to teachers and principals during period 5, as per their individual annual plan.
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	31-Mar-2022	--
Comments	<p><b>Partially achieved (98.9 percent)</b> 28,288 core teachers and principal advisors provided school-based peer support vs. the target of 28,600 . The result is verified with first draft verification report by IVA. Final verification report is expected by June 27, 2022.</p>			

► DLI 5 Number of teachers and principals who are satisfied with ICT-based interactive CPD services provided under the program (Output, 6,231,069.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	From April 2021 to March 2022
Value	0.00	541,696 teachers and principals are satisfied with ICT-based interactive CPD services provided under the program	608,000 teachers and principals are satisfied with 2021 ICT-based interactive CPD services provided under the program	Up to 320,000 teachers and principals are satisfied with ICT-based interactive CPD services
Date	30-Jun-2016	31-Dec-2021	31-Mar-2022	--



**Comments**

**Achieved (190 percent)**

608,000 teachers and principals are satisfied with ICT-based interactive CPD services provided under the program vs the period 5 target of 320,000.

The result is verified with data processing by IVA. Final verification report is expected by June 27, 2022