



RESULTS-BASED NATIONAL URBAN DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM - NORTHERN MOUNTAINS (P143596)

EAST ASIA AND PACIFIC | Vietnam | Urban, Resilience and Land Global Practice | Requesting Unit: EACVF | Responsible Unit: SEAU2
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2014 | Team Leader(s): Hoa Thi Hoang, Thong Trung Le

Seq No: 16 | ARCHIVED on 18-Feb-2022 | ISR49553 | Created by: Hoa Thi Hoang on 06-Dec-2021 | Modified by: Giang Thi Huong Nguyen on 05-Feb-2022

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

The proposed program development objective is to strengthen the capacity of participating Northern Mountains cities to plan, implement and sustain urban infrastructure.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	■ Moderately Satisfactory	■ Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	■ Moderately Satisfactory	■ Satisfactory

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

The Program will close on June 30, 2022 after achieving considerable results as planned. Enhanced Annual City Plans have been approved and disclosed to the public by all seven cities; asset management plans have been adopted, and local urban infrastructure sub-projects are in full service after their completion in all seven cities; and a National Urban Development Program has been adopted and its implementation in phase 2 cities commenced in 2020. The total number of people benefiting from the Program stand at 744,389 people – a number which is expected to further increase by the closing of the project. In terms of infrastructure constructed, it includes 111.877 km of new and upgraded roads, 592.9 hectares of upgraded low-income areas, and 286.3 hectares of completed resettlement areas. So far, 614,518 people have benefited from cities' primary/secondary infrastructure services, and this number is also expected to increase as remaining works are completed.

Data on Financial Performance**Disbursements (by loan)**

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P143596	IDA-54760	Effective	USD	250.00	250.00	0.00	186.80	39.40	83%

Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P143596	IDA-54760	Effective	05-Jun-2014	17-Jul-2014	30-Oct-2014	30-Jun-2021	30-Jun-2022



DLI Disbursement

DLI ID	DLI Type	Description	Coc	DLI Amount	Achievement Status	Disbursed amount in Coc	Disbursement % for DLI
Loan: IDA54760-001							
1.1	Regular	5476 DLI1.1 Enhanced Annual Clty Plans	XDR	21,357,600.00	Fully Achieved	21,357,600.00	100 %
1.2	Regular	5476 DLI 1.2 Professionally-staffed mngt	XDR	14,238,400.00	Fully Achieved	14,238,400.00	100 %
2	Regular	5476 DLI 2 Local urban infra investments	XDR	100,316,000.00	Partially Achieved	69,950,443.67	70 %
3.1	Regular	5476 DLI 3.1 Asset mngt plan & loc urban	XDR	6,472,000.00	Fully Achieved	5,158,213.00	80 %
3.2	Regular	5476 DLI 3.2 Increased annual own-source	XDR	6,472,000.00	Partially Achieved	2,323,462.00	36 %
4.1	Regular	5476 DLI 4.1 Implementation strategy NUD	XDR	4,530,400.00	Fully Achieved	3,236,021.00	71 %
4.2	Regular	5476 DLI 4.2 Prof-staffed in MOC,prep AC	XDR	6,472,000.00	Fully Achieved	5,824,843.00	90 %
4.3	Regular	5476 DLI 4.3 Completed Program Report	XDR	1,941,600.00	Fully Achieved	1,618,010.00	83 %

Program Action Plan

Action Description	1. Participating cities will maintain databases on (i) public consultation/corruption/fiduciary/procurement/ Program implementation complaints and responses to those complaints and (ii) beneficiary feedback to implementing agencies.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Databases maintained and report submitted.				
Comments	Participating cities provided report annually on maintaining databases and public consultation on program implementation complaints and responses.				

Action Description	2(a). All proposals for detailed designs, construction supervision and bids for civil works, whether below or above cost estimates, shall be evaluated; proposals and bids shall not be rejected only on the basis of minor, non-substantive deviations.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Progress reported upon in Program Report. Supervision and audits to establish actual performance.				
Comments	Program reported				



Action Description	2(b). At least 30 % of city consulting contracts for detailed designs, CSC competitively bid - to 80 % by the end of the Prog period. At least 90 % of city civil works contracts competitively bid - to 100 % by the end of the Prog period.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Progress reported upon in Program Report. Supervision and audits to establish actual performance.				
Comments	Program report submitted				

Action Description	2(c). State-Owned Enterprises dependent on Program provinces/cities/departments will be excluded from participating.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Progress reported upon in Program Report. Supervision and audits to establish actual performance.				
Comments	Program and verification reported submitted as planned.				

Action Description	2(d). Firms and individuals on the local, national or Bank debarment/suspension lists will not be allowed to participate.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Progress reported upon in Program Report. Supervision and audits to establish actual performance.				
Comments	program reports submitted				

Action Description	3. MOC will build and implement an effective internal audit function for the Program.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Internal audit report sent annually to the Bank Supervision will review quality of the internal audit process.				
Comments	Program report and internal audit report submitted				

Action Description	4. Part cities will ensure that adverse impacts are avoided/minimized and PAPs compensated so that they are no worse off. An independently verifiable mechanism will be developed to assess the market values to restore PAPs' livelihoods.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Delayed

Completion Measurement	Progress reported upon in Program Report. Supervision will review implementation quality.
Comments	all required report submitted.

Action Description	5. MOC and cities develop guidelines to ensure the meaningful local consultation, including EMs and vulnerable groups. The guidelines fully operationalize existing VNese Legislation with respect to EMs through free, prior, and informed consultations.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Other		MOC and Participating Cities	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Progress reported upon in Program Report. Supervision will review implementation quality.				
Comments	report and implementation support mission				

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Low	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Macroeconomic	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Low	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Sector Strategies and Policies	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Low	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Technical Design of Project or Program	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Fiduciary	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Environment and Social	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Stakeholders	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Other	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Overall	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Low	<input type="checkbox"/> Low

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Enhanced Annual City Plans approved and disclosed to the public			
▶ Enhanced Annual City Plans approved and disclosed to the public (Number, Custom)			
Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target



Value	0.00	7.00	7.00	7.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target achieved. All enhanced annual city plans (7 plans for 7 participating cities) have been approved and disclosed to the public. All these plans will be verified by SAV. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

Asset Management Plan adopted and local urban infrastructure sub-projects in full service after comp

▶ Asset Management Plan adopted and local urban infrastructure sub-projects in full service after completion (Yes/No, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target achieved. All cities have developed asset management plans and adopted them. Local urban infrastructure sub-projects in full service after completion. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

Implementation Strategy for National Urban Development Program adopted with annual milestones

▶ Implementation Strategy for National Urban Development Program adopted with annual milestones (Yes/No, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target achieved. The implementation strategy for National Urban development Program was adopted in 2020 with phase 2 cities in Mekong Delta region. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

Total number of people benefiting from Program (disaggregated by gender)

▶ Total number of people benefiting from Program (disaggregated by gender) (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	711,699.00	744,389.00	759,300.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target underachieved as of January 2022 and is expected to be achieved by the Program closing. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

□ Number of male beneficiaries from the Program (Number, Custom Breakdown)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	380,321.00	398,261.00	384,431.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022



□ Number of female beneficiaries from the Program (Number, Custom Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	331,348.00	346,128.00	374,869.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022

Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Institutional Strengthening at the City Level				
▶ Professionally-staffed management units in place within each Participating City People's Committee (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	7.00	7.00	7.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target achieved. All 7 cities' PMUs are staffed with qualified personnel. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

Infrastructure Delivered				
▶ People benefiting from city primary/secondary infrastructure services (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	581,798.00	614,518.00	651,500.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target presently underachieved and is expected to be achieved by June 30, 2022. The result reflects people who benefited from primary and secondary infrastructure services. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			
▶ People benefiting from improved tertiary/social infrastructure services (disaggregated by gender) (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	107,969.00	107,969.00	107,800.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target exceeded. The result reflects people who benefited from tertiary/social infrastructure services. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			
□ Number of women benefiting from improved tertiary/social infrastructure services (Number, Custom Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	37,917.00	37,917.00	53,275.00



Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
<input type="checkbox"/> Number of men benefiting from improved tertiary/social infrastructure services (Number, Custom Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	70,052.00	70,052.00	54,525.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
► Ethnic Minority beneficiaries (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	20.00	29.00	14.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target exceeded. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			
<input type="checkbox"/> Male ethnic minority beneficiaries (Percentage, Custom Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	19.00	32.00	14.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
<input type="checkbox"/> Female ethnic minority beneficiaries (Percentage, Custom Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	22.00	25.00	14.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
► New and upgraded roads completed (Kilometers, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	106.63	111.87	101.90
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target exceeded. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			
► Resettlement areas completed (Hectare(Ha), Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	247.90	286.30	236.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target exceeded. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			



► LIAs upgraded (Hectare(Ha), Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	592.90	592.90	333.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target exceeded. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

Sustainability of Infrastructure				
► Increase in own-sources revenue (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	2.00	4.00	4.00	7.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target underachieved. The target reflects the following cities that showed an increase in annual own-sources revenue by at least 12% over the previous year: Bac Kan, Cao Bang, Hoa Binh and Tuyen Quang. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

National Policy, Support and Oversight				
► Professionally-staffed unit in place in MOC; and capacity support for cities provided as per Annual Capacity Development Plan (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	100.00	100.00	100.00	100.00
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target achieved. MOC is staffed as planned and Annual Capacity Development Plan implemented. A policy is in place. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			
► Completed Program report (Yes/No, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2022
Comments	Target achieved. The Program report for 2020 has been completed and verified by SAV. Information source: Program report and verification reports.			

Disbursement Linked Indicators



► DLI 1 DLI 1: Enhanced Annual City Plans approved and disclosed to the public (Outcome, 33,000,000.00, 91%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	--	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--
Comments				

► DLI 2 DLI 1.2: Professionally-staffed management units in place within each Participating City People's Committee (Intermediate Outcome, 22,000,000.00, 91%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	--	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--
Comments				

► DLI 3 DLI 2: Local urban infrastructure investments delivered as per each Participating City's approved Enhanced Annual City Plan (Output, 155,000,000.00, 55%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Date	--	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--
Comments				

► DLI 4 DLI 3.1: Asset management plan adopted and local urban infrastructure sub-projects in full service after completion (Outcome, 10,000,000.00, 74%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	No	Yes	Yes	--
Date	--	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--
Comments				

► DLI 5 DLI 3.2: Increased annual own-sources revenue in Participating Cities (Intermediate Outcome, 10,000,000.00, 33%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	203,000.00	203,000.00	--
Date	--	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--



Comments

► DLI 6 DLI 4.1: Implementation Strategy for National Urban Development Program adopted with annual milestones (Outcome, 7,000,000.00, 67%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	No	Yes	Yes	--
Date	--	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--

Comments

► DLI 7 DLI 4.2: Professionally-staffed unit in place in MOC, preparation of Annual Capacity Development Plans, and capacity building support provided to cities in accordance with such plans (Output, 10,000,000.00, 84%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	No	Yes	Yes	--
Date	--	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--

Comments

► DLI 8 DLI 4.3: Completed Program Report (Output, 3,000,000.00, 78%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	No	Yes	Yes	--
Date	01-May-2014	30-Jun-2021	19-Jan-2022	--

Comments