Report Number: ICRR0022674

1. Project Data

Project ID	Project Name
P122546	CI - Emerg. Youth Empl & Skills Dev. Pro
Country	**Practice Area(Lead)**
Cote d'Ivoire	Education

L/C/TF Number(s)	Closing Date (Original)	Total Project Cost (USD)
IDA-56080,IDA-H7340	30-Jun-2015	95,642,807.99
Bank Approval Date	**Closing Date (Actual)**	
15-Sep-2011	31-Dec-2020	

	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)
Original Commitment	50,000,000.00	0.00
Revised Commitment	99,795,935.52	0.00
Actual	95,721,418.32	0.00

Prepared by	Reviewed by	ICR Review Coordinator	Group
Denise A. Vaillancourt	Judyth L. Twigg	Eduardo Fernandez Maldonado	IEGHC (Unit 2)

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

As stated in the October 3, 2011 Financing Agreement between the Republic of Cote d'Ivoire and IDA (Schedule 1, p. 4), the project development objective (PDO) was "to improve access to temporary employment and skills development opportunities for young men and women in the Recipient's territory." The design document, Emergency Project Paper (EPP) of August 31, 2011, presented the same statement (pp. vii, 8, 24, and 35).

The PDO did not change during the project period. However, PDO-level indicators and targets were revised as a part of the project's Additional Financing (AF), approved in March 2015. Notably: (i) targets for two of the three original indicators were increased to reflect increased financing and an extended implementation period, while the value of the third original indicator remained unchanged; and (ii) a new PDO-level indicator was added to measure employment following the internship program and retooling program, to reflect an activity added under the AF, and providing a useful measure of the effectiveness of improved access to skills development opportunities. The intermediate results indicators were refined to provide better measurement of outputs and intermediate outcomes and to capture new activities. None of these changes warrant a split rating methodology.

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?
Yes

Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?
No

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?
---

d. Components
Original Components:

Project support was delivered through three components.

Component 1: Temporary Employment Opportunities (original estimate of $20 million + $15 million in AF, amounting to a revised estimate of $35 million; actual cost: $34.8 million). This component was to support transitory employment opportunities through labor intensive public works (LIPW) for unskilled/low-skilled youth in urban, peri-urban, and rural areas. The target group was composed of youth 18-30 years of age who were not enrolled in any form of education, whether formal or informal. The LIPW program also included a savings program and a basic life skills and entrepreneurship training program for participants to enhance their future employability and labor market insertion prospects. A share of the wages earned would be retained and put in a savings account for each of the beneficiaries. This was to enable them to accumulate start-up capital for potential self-employment after program completion, and thus increase sustainability beyond the project life. The basic life skills and entrepreneurship training was to be included in Component 2. The implementation of the works would be the responsibility of national roads agency (*Agence de Gestion des Routes*) and, if waste collection activities were to be performed, the National Urban Sanitation Agency (*Agence Nationale de la Salubrite Urbaine*). The project was to fund beneficiaries' wages and small tools and equipment necessary for the works (e.g., wheelbarrows and safety vests).

Component 2: Skills Development and Employment Support (original estimate of $25.0 million + $30.0 million in AF, amounting to a revised estimate of $55.0 million; actual cost: $49.2 million). This component aimed to improve youth employability by providing youth with different skills levels with a first work experience and training. Provisions included: (i) apprenticeships in micro, small, and medium enterprises in the formal and informal sectors; (ii) internships in medium and large companies in the formal sector; (iii) professional training programs of various durations in key economic growth sectors; (iv) entrepreneurship training and follow-up business development support for highly skilled graduates (e.g. In the form of business plan competitions); and (v) basic live skills and entrepreneurship training for LIPW participants. These programs aimed to reach a total of 15,000 beneficiaries over the (original) three-year implementation period. Trainees were to receive certificates upon program completion.

The apprenticeship and internship programs were already in place, executed by the National Employment Agency (AGEPE -- *Agence d'Etudes et de Promotion d'Emploi*) and the National Professional Training Agency (AGEFOP – *Agence nationale de la formation professionnelle*) and their regional structures. Business plan competitions (mostly in urban areas) supporting entrepreneurship and business development assistance for highly skilled youth had already been successfully undertaken as part of the State and Peace-Building Fund Financing Young Entrepreneurs and Urban Job Creation Project. This activity was to be implemented by competitively selected service providers with a proven track record in entrepreneurship training, already carrying out similar activities. All performance contracts financed under this component were to be established between the project implementation unit (PIU) and the service providers contracted to undertake the activities. The project was to fund training activities, training materials, and small tools and equipment needed for training.

Component 3: Strengthening Institutional Capacity (original estimate of $5.0 million + $5.0 million in AF, amounting to a revised estimate of $10.0 million; actual cost: $11.7 million. This component aimed to: (i) reinforce the capacity of selected institutions critical to project implementation and policy dialogue on youth employment and skills development; and (ii) improve the knowledge base on employment and youth. The component was to finance: (i) capacity building activities (e.g., training, South-South exchanges) for a number of public and private sector organizations experienced in and committed to the promotion of youth employment (e.g., training institutions, AGEFOP, Chamber of Commerce, private sector associations) to promote policy dialogue, planning, coordination, execution, and evaluation of job creation and skills development programs; and (ii) technical assistance with the establishment of, and support to, regional institutional structures (e.g., AGEPE regional offices); (iii) selected studies, (e.g., on the system and utilization of the training tax and the development of a sustainable funding mechanism for training, and specific professional branches); (iv) communication campaigns to increase awareness of the project among youth and other key stakeholders; and (v) financing of the PIU.

Revisions to Components

When substantial AF was approved in March 2015, project components were revised both to scale up activities and to increase the project's focus on rural areas. Changes under each component are summarized here.

Component 1 (Temporary Employment Opportunities for Youth) retained its focus on creating temporary employment opportunities through LIPW. However: (i) the geographical focus of the component shifted primarily to rural areas (around secondary urban poles), underserved by employment interventions, and where poverty was most concentrated and where a high proportion of underemployed, poorly qualified youth lived; and (ii) complementary activities to support post-LIPW employment were to be strengthened (savings, life skills training, technical and business skills, and assistance for job search and self-employment support).

Component 2 (Skills Development and Employment Support for Youth) was more effectively targeted to priority areas identified from employment data and focused on reform of technical and vocational training centers to support project implementation and sustainability. Moreover, component support for professional training programs of short duration in key economic growth sectors was dropped, and replaced with three new/revised activities:

Apprenticeships support was expanded to support dual apprenticeships (combining theory and practice), improve training institutions, and lead to professional certification. Training centers would be reformed to support the principles of autonomous management with public private partnerships to facilitate private sector participation and alignment of training with labor market needs.

Internships support was continued but with better targeting to support the successful placement of interns. About 2,000 youth were expected to benefit from the focus on unemployed graduates under 35 years of age. A new focus was also placed on retooling/reskilling/requalification of graduates with degrees in areas offering limited employment prospects. Formal professional re-training (6-12 months) in skills highly demanded by the private sector was also a focus.

Entrepreneurship and self-employment support combined entrepreneurship and basic life skills and entrepreneurship training for LIPW participants, providing a better focus on self-employment support and facilitating the transition to more productive self-employment for vulnerable populations. This included entrepreneurship training for 5,000 additional beneficiaries, with start-up funding and kits for 3,000 beneficiaries to start micro-enterprise projects.

Component 3 (Strengthening Institutional Capacity) continued to expand the knowledge base on employment and skills and accelerate and increase the range of institutional reforms adopted to promote more efficient governance of employment policy and interventions.

e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates

Cost. The original project was estimated at $50 million, of which 100 percent was to be financed by an IDA grant of SDR 31.3 million ($50 million equivalent at prevailing exchange rates). With the approval in March 2015 of Additional Financing through an IDA credit of SDR 35.5 million ($50 million equivalent at prevailing exchange rates) in support of expanded activities, the total estimated cost of the project increased to $100 million. Actual component costs were close to those estimated at the time of the AF (itemized in section 2d): 100 percent of estimate for Component 1; 89 percent for Component 2; and 117 percent for Component 3.

Financing and Borrower Contribution. The project was 100 percent financed by IDA. Data in the Bank's information system indicate that the original IDA grant was 99 percent disbursed (SDR 31.13 million out of a total of SDR 31.3 million); and the IDA credit, approved in March 2015 to provide AF, was 100 percent disbursed. The ICR (p. 52) points out that, in terms of US dollars, the project had $3.42 million in exchange rate losses. No government contribution was foreseen or provided.

Key Dates. The project was approved on September 15, 2011 and became effective three months later on December 27, 2011. The project was restructured four times, once in the context of an AF.

In March 2015, an AF exercise: added $50 million equivalent to the original $50 million parent project to scale up activities and increase the focus on deprived rural areas; modified and scaled up activities (see Section 2d. above); added a fourth PDO indicator for better measurement of outcomes; modified intermediate results indicators to reflect changes to the components; established the AF closing as June 30, 2019; and updated the disbursement estimates.

In June 2015, a restructuring of the original grant extended its closing date by 20 months (from June 30, 2015 to February 27, 2017) to allow the project to continue implementation and payment of related expenses, including a key study for a new governance framework for scaled-up activities under the AF. It also involved the allocation of unallocated funds to each of the three components commensurate with their needs.

In February 2017, another restructuring of the original grant extended the closing date by an additional four months (to June 30, 2017) to ensure full disbursement of remaining funds to pay for 800 apprenticeship beneficiaries and 300 entrepreneurship beneficiaries enrolled under the original financing, and for completion of feasibility studies on the new dual apprenticeship model and the new model for agricultural incubators.

Finally, in May 2019, a restructuring of the AF: extended the closing date by 18 months (from June 30, 2019 to December 30, 2020); and reallocated credit funds across categories. These changes accommodated: an increase in the number of LIPW beneficiaries in rural areas and the number of days per month for LIPW; a reduction (from six to four) in the vocational training centers to be rehabilitated, in light of other donor support; a reduction in the income generation activities subvention for entrepreneurship beneficiaries; and an increase in the operating costs, brought about by the extended closing date.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

The PDO is highly relevant to current country conditions. Cote d'Ivoire is transitioning away from the post-crisis environment that prevailed at the time of project design to one increasingly characterized by political and economic stability. Even with great strides in economic recovery achieved over the past several years, continued economic development and inclusive growth require the sustained revitalization of the economy and the continued provision and expansion of enhanced employment opportunities for young people. Youth continue to have the highest levels of unemployment among all age groups in Cote d'Ivoire. Many who are ready to enter the work force have low levels of education and do not have the basic knowledge and skills to fill the minimum requirements of many jobs. Even those with secondary or higher levels of education have difficulty finding employment, with mismatches between their skills and the demands and needs of the labor market. Opportunities for low skill, labor-intensive employment are limited. Access to jobs training and other supports to improve employment prospects, including the acquisition of skills and experience on-the-job through apprenticeships and internships, is limited. There is a disconnect between the supply and nature of training (including that provided in secondary schools, higher education, and technical and vocational education and training [TVET]) on the one hand, and the needs of the market (including the private sector) on the other.

The PDO is highly relevant to the current development priorities of the country. The project is highly relevant to Cote d'Ivoire's Strategic Plan for the Reform of TVET (2016-2025), which aims to increase the accessibility of jobs training and employment programs, improve the quality of training, strengthen partnerships with the labor market for professional integration of students upon graduation, and unite all stakeholders of the system around a shared vision. Its seven strategic areas of focus are: business training and professional integration partnerships; training access; training supply; skills certification; system governance; stabilization and supervision of private establishments; and system financing. The project is also highly relevant to the forthcoming National Development Plan (2021-2025), which aims to address youth employment and inclusion. The Plan aims to streamline and improve the coordination of youth interventions and includes the following employment-specific priorities: development of national entrepreneurship; better access to and completion of a two-year TVET cycle, in rural areas in particular; a stronger institutional framework to ensure a better managed and accountable system to improve internal and external efficiency of TVET; a stronger institutional framework to better monitor the National Youth Policy 2021-2025; development of programs and projects to improve youth integration into the job market; and strengthened access to decent jobs.

Moreover, the PDO continues to be highly relevant to the World Bank's Country Partnership Framework (CPF, 2016-2019), which was extended to FY2021. The CPF (as well as Cote d'Ivoire's National Development Plan) includes an important focus on Cote d'Ivoire's education system, with special attention to technical and vocational training. It highlights persistent challenges of technical and vocational training, notably: weak governance, lack of a clearly defined mission, and poor linkages with private sector stakeholders and labor market needs. Moreover, the CPF includes as part of its strategy a proposed follow-on Project, Cote d'Ivoire Youth Employment and Skills Development Project – Phase 3, which aims to build upon the successful activities and results observed under this project. Youth who are chronically unemployed continue to be at high risk of truancy and violence.

Rating

High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

OBJECTIVE 1

Objective

Improve access to temporary employment for young men and women in Cote d'Ivoire

Rationale

The theory of change presented in the ICR (p. 10) provides a good overview of the project rationale and the strong coherence between activities, outputs, and outcomes. The first component was designed to provide transitory job opportunities through a six-month cycle LIPW program for unskilled men and women 18-30 years of age and a program to encourage these beneficiaries to save part of their earnings to invest in their futures. These activities were directly supportive of the first objective of the PDO statement: to improve temporary employment for young men and women. The second project component supported three interventions all directly supporting the second objective of the PDO statement: to improve skills development opportunities for young men and women (for better employment prospects). The three interventions were: (1) apprenticeships for low-skilled youth in agriculture and non-agriculture areas, in both formal and informal sectors, and the introduction of a dual apprenticeship program in vocational training centers, designed to combine theoretical and on-the-job training; (2) reskilling internships for highly skilled, long-term unemployed youth, who lacked experience and/or whose skills and training offered limited employment opportunities; and (3) entrepreneurship and self-employment support for youth (18-34 years old), including: training, entrepreneurship start-up funding and kits, and start-up seed funding to start a micro-enterprise. The third component's activities to strengthen institutional capacity were also supportive of PDO achievement with their focus on promoting and strengthening job counseling and support services and the inclusion of monitoring and evaluation activities to enable the tracking of performance and measurement of results, and their use in learning and decision-making.

Outputs and intermediate results:

Supporting temporary employment for young men and women:

- A total of 3,631 km of roads were rehabilitated/maintained under the LIPW program, ***exceeding both the original target of 1,000 and the revised target*** of 3,537.
- The share of the total costs going to the wage bill was 56 percent in 2020, ***not reaching the original target of 70 percent, but exceeding the revised target*** of 50 percent.
- One hundred percent of the wages of LIPW participants were paid in a timely manner per six-month cycle, ***exceeding the original target of 90 percent and the revised target of 95 percent***.
- A survey conducted by the BCP-Employment Monitoring and Evaluation Unit (Office for the Coordination of Employment Programs) in 12 municipalities participating in the LIPW program under the AF found that:
    - 97 percent of the LIPW participants also attended entrepreneurship training;
    - Female participation in the 12 municipalities continuously increased: 47 percent in the first wave; 55 percent in the second wave; and 57 percent in the third and final wave;
    - 87 percent of the young people who were working after the program were involved in income generation activities.

Institutional strengthening, supporting both project objectives:

- Four tracer surveys were carried out with project support, ***fully achieving the target.*** Of these: SOFRECO (a French consulting firm) carried out two surveys; a third survey following graduates was carried out by an individual consultant; and the firm IPSOS carried out a survey on the impact of COVID, delivered in October 2020.
- Ten staff received training in impact evaluation methods, ***exceeding the target*** of 8.
- Two impact evaluations were completed, ***fully achieving*** the target.

Outcomes:

Project data quantified achievements against PDO indicators, all of which surpassed outcome targets:

- A total of 65,631 youth directly benefited from the LIPW program and the skills and entrepreneurship development support, ***exceeding the original target of 27,500 and the revised target*** of 56,922. Forty-three percent of beneficiaries were female, ***exceeding the target*** of 30 percent.
- Of the 65,631 beneficiaries, 25,777 benefitted from the LIPW temporary employment, ***double the original target of 12,500 and slightly exceeding the revised target*** of 25,175; and 39,854 benefited from skills development beneficiaries, ***exceeding the original target of 15,000 and the revised***

target of 31,747. Beneficiaries of skills development activities are broken down as follows: 4,869 internships; 1,631 participating in requalification program; 16,117 apprenticeships; and 17,237 entrepreneurships.
- A total of 2,953,933 workdays were completed under the LIPW program, ***exceeding both the original and revised targets of*** 1,650,000 and 2,679,649 workdays, respectively.

Project-financed surveys and studies provided further insight and evidence of positive outcomes and impacts for program participants:

- According to a 2014 tracer study financed by the project, employment among the LIPW beneficiaries increased from 59 to 70 percent post-program.
- A follow-up 2019 survey undertaken by external consultants showed that the first LIPW cohort had an insertion rate (share of beneficiaries who were employed following program interventions, whether self-employed or employed in formal and informal sectors) of 89 percent, and Cohort 3 had an insertion rate of 77 percent.
- The 2019 survey reported that 78 percent of beneficiaries reported savings during the program, with relatively large monthly savings, ranging from $20 to $60. The survey goes on note that, thanks to judicious investment of these savings, most employment gains were in self-employment.
- An Office for the Coordination of Employment Programs survey in 12 municipalities participating in the LIPW program under the AF also found that:
    - active employment of LIPW participants increased from 48 percent pre-program to 83 percent post-program;
    - average income of participants increased by 52 percent after switching to the program (from FCFA 28,047 to FCFA 42,603);
- A 2017 impact evaluation of the LIPW program found that participation in the program raised earnings and psychological wellbeing, both during and after program completion.
    - Post-program earnings gains were achieved primarily through more small-scale entrepreneurial activities, likely attributable to participants' success in saving part of their earnings and to the skills they developed, both with project assistance. Public works led to an increase in earnings a year after the end of the project of US$11 per month, or 12 percent more than the earnings of the control group. The increase in earnings was concentrated in self-employment, within which earnings increased by $12.40 per month, or 32 percent.
    - Changes in youth's psychological wellbeing was particularly relevant for the post-conflict setting of Cote-d'Ivoire because they pointed to potential program externalities on social cohesion. Participating youth reported feeling happy and proud, with increased self-esteem and less anger and frustration in daily life.
- Significant institutional strengthening was achieved, including:
    - Strengthened ownership and capacity at the local level, where municipalities (and the Regional Councils representing them) assumed primary responsibility for LIPW, apprenticeships, and internships derived from their local plans, and through training and acquired experience strengthened their skills in contract negotiation and management.
    - Toward the end of the project, and in the context of growing support of other partners for youth employment and skills development, the high-performing PIU provided the foundation for its transformation into a permanent Bureau of Coordination of Employment Programs (BCPE).

Rating
High

OBJECTIVE 2

Objective
Improve skills development opportunities for young men and women in Cote d'Ivoire

Rationale
Outputs and intermediate results:

Under the apprenticeship program (focused on hospitality and catering, transport, driving and maintaining public vehicles and equipment, agriculture, building and construction, and public works):

- A total of 16,177 youth were enrolled in the apprenticeship/dual training program, ***exceeding the target*** of 14,295.
- Female participants made up 33 percent of the participants, slightly ***exceeding the target*** of 30 percent.
- Eighty-eight percent of participants completed the apprenticeship/dual training programs, ***exceeding the target*** of 80 percent.
- Sixty-six percent of participants who completed the apprenticeship/dual training programs were employed or self-employed within six months of the date of program completion, ***almost achieving (4 percent short of) the*** 70 percent ***target.***
- A total of 10 public private joint management agreements were signed in the centers supported under the project, fully achieving the target.
- Additional achievements supporting the apprenticeship program included:
    - Support for a diagnostic study to determine how best to integrate apprenticeships into the training institutions;
    - The revision of the laws and related decrees that supported the inclusion of apprenticeships into the vocational training curriculum; and
    - Piloting the new governance structure reforms in four project beneficiary centers in Bouake (masonry and sanitary installation), Ferke (agricultural mechanics), Abidjan-Riviera (hospitality and culinary), and Abidjan-Vridi (car body painting).
    - The project also supported these four centers with capacity development and re-training of 525 teaching staff to implement the dual training program and rehabilitation of the centers.

Under the internship/retooling program:

- The project developed and delivered a retooling/requalification program, which included 52 training courses focusing on six sectors: agriculture; earth-moving and mining; hotel; mechanics and welding; information and communications technology; and electricity.
- Ninety-two percent of participants in the internship/retooling program completed the program, ***exceeding the target*** of 80 percent.
- A total of 147,736 internships/retooling weeks were provided under the project, ***falling short of the target*** of 193,342 weeks. ***However, it should be noted*** that the project target was over-estimated,

based on the assumption that all theoretical training would be 9 months in duration. In fact, programs' actual duration varied between three and nine months.

Under the entrepreneurship and self-employment program:

- A total of 3,000 income-generating or micro projects were supported by the project, fully achieving the target. These projects were provided with seed funding not exceeding $2,000, guided by approved business plans. The calls for business plans were based on local development plans or studies that identified opportunities for sustainable business projects. Eligibility required participation in programs and youth with innovative ideas and aptitude.
- A total of 17,237 youth received entrepreneurship training, achieving more than twice the target of 7,077. The breakdown of the training beneficiaries was: 13,864 for income generation activities; 2,793 for savings and loans village associations; 400 for micro and small enterprises; and 180 for incubators.
- The project supported the creation and management of the Associations of Village Savings and Credits, in which 2000 youth involved in the project participated in the regions of Kabadougou, San Pedro, Me, Belier, Bagoue, Moronou, Gbokle, Agneby-Tiassa, Haut Sassandra, and the District of Yamoussoukro. These associations provided additional access to financing, beyond the cooperative projects, to foster the rapid development of individual micro-enterprises. It was a simple savings and loans scheme, whereby 20 villagers would self select, voluntarily set up their association, put forth their own money, and lend to each other. Low-interest loans were typically used to invest in an income-generation activity. Consultants hired to set up the associations were so successful that they formed a consulting firm, and this activity will be continued and expanded in a follow-on project.
- Drawing on a project-financed feasibility study for the establishment of agricultural business incubators in five regions, the project supported two incubators: the Institute of Agricultural New Techniques in Agneby-Tissa region and the European Institute for Cooperation and Development in the Yamoussoukro District. The incubators provided intensive training and coaching for participants as well as business plan development, validation of the business plans by a board, support for opening a business account, and resources for the businesses.

Cross-program intermediate results:

- On March 16, 2020, due to COVID-19, all schools, including vocational schools, were closed, suspending theoretical and practical training for all 17 trades included in the program. After school closings, all 17 trades received on-line training through pre-recorded video clips. On May 25, schools in Abidjan and most firms reopened and thus were able to continue internships and face-to-face training. Nevertheless, BCPE decided with Agence Emploi Jeunes (executing agency) and training firms (providers) to continue online training through tools (e.g. WhatsApp) or other dedicated platforms. The focus was to pilot online training for selected trades: agricultural production, manager, dam inspector, post agent and network administration for a total of 104 beneficiaries.

Outcomes:

- Eighty-nine percent of youth participating in the apprenticeship and internship programs completed these programs by project closing, ***exceeding the target*** of 80 percent.

- Females made up 32 percent of all apprenticeship and internship program participants, ***achieving 80 percent of the target*** of 40 percent.
- Within six months of completion of the internship/retooling/requalification program, 81 percent of participants were employed or self-employed, ***exceeding the target*** of 70 percent. The results for this indicator are based on the third beneficiaries' satisfaction survey, conducted in 2019. Insertion rates broken down by gender and cohort show a consistently high rate for men and a lower starting point, but steady improvement, for women:
  - For men: 86 percent for Cohort 1; 87 percent for Cohort 2; and 82 percent for Cohort 3
  - For women: 64 percent for Cohort 1; 70 percent for Cohort 2; and 78 percent for Cohort 3
- Of all youth who were employed or self-employed within six months of completion of an internship/retooling program, 42 percent were female, ***fully achieving the target***.
- The project-financed impact evaluation, and a follow-up telephone survey conducted 18-24 months after program completion, found that young people in the treatment group (i.e., those who completed an apprenticeship program): (i) had significantly higher incomes 18-24 months after the end of the program (CFAF 9,394, or 15 percent higher wages than those in the control group who followed traditional apprenticeships); and (ii) possessed superior skills. Overall findings indicate that the program expanded access to learning, facilitated the acquisition of skills by young people, and increased the income of young people.

Rating
High

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

Rationale: Achievement of the project's first objective – to improve temporary employment – surpassed expectations. The PDO targets were all exceeded. Significantly more youth benefited from the LIPW program, and females made up a larger share of program beneficiaries, than the targets set. Moreover, studies and surveys revealed a range of benefits and impacts emanating from this program, including higher levels of employment post-program, high insertion rates, significant savings achieved by 78 percent of participants, increased earnings, and improved psychological wellbeing, both during the program and post-program. Achievement of the project's second objective – to improve skills development opportunities for young men and women – also surpassed expectations. Targets for key PDO indicators (completion rates and post-program employment for apprenticeships and internships) were exceeded. Moreover, project-financed studies documented other significant benefits and impacts of the apprenticeship program, including expanded access to learning, and higher wages and higher skills levels for those completing the program, compared with a control group. Additionally, important institutional strengthening was achieved, most notably: (i) the development of a regulatory and legal framework for TVET supporting more autonomy of training centers, private sector participation, and the inclusion of apprenticeships into the vocational training curriculum; and (ii) the strengthening of monitoring and evaluation capacity, complementing the sound tracking of project data with studies and impact evaluations, facilitating a richer assessment of achievements and learning.

Attribution of outcomes to the Bank project is strong. The ICR (p. 27) notes that, at the time of appraisal, the Bank was the only development partner providing support for youth employment and skills development in Cote d'Ivoire. By 2015, when the AF was approved, other donors were involved in supporting the sector: African Development Bank, Islamic Development Bank, European Union, French Agency for Development, and the United Nations Development Program. While they did not establish a pooled fund mechanism, these development partners did align their projects with the Bank project's design, approach, and implementation structure to ensure proper coordination and alignment across efforts. The TTL and ICR Main Contributor confirmed in a 11-1-21 meeting with IEG that it was in large part the Bank's technical leadership in designing and implementing an effective approach to youth employment that attracted the support of other partners. Over and above the learning and adaptation emanating from project M&E, the Bank leveraged increased information and learning through complementary surveys and analytic work ("Cote d'Ivoire Jobs Diagnostic," 2017), which generated a stronger evidence base and improved targeting of interventions financed by the Bank under AF, as well as those of other partners.

Counterfactual. While not addressed in the ICR, the TTL and ICR Main Contributor in a 11-1-21 meeting with IEG provided the following insight about the project's counterfactual. In the absence of the Bank's project, the outcomes, as outlined in this section, would not likely have been achieved, since it was the Bank that initiated this type of support which, in turn, eventually attracted the additional support of other partners. The impact evaluation noted considerable impacts of those benefiting from the apprenticeship support, especially the dual apprenticeships (covering theoretical and on-the-job training). Compared with the control group (traditional apprentices), beneficiaries of the dual apprenticeship programs, a unique intervention supported under the project, had more significant improvements in skills, income, and productivity. Moreover, the project's support of subsidies for apprentices to offset the opportunity cost of participating (foregone income) boosted the number of beneficiaries. In the absence of the program, thus, there would have been fewer apprentices, and apprenticeships would have had lower impact. While the impact evaluation did not measure this specifically, the TTL expressed his sense that the LIPW employment opportunities had a strong impact on the social cohesion of villages whose youth benefited from temporary employment. Also, in the absence of the project it is unlikely that significant donor support would have been generated and/or that such support would have been coordinated around the highly effective approaches and institutional capacity and reform supported by the Bank. It is also unlikely that the local level initiatives and innovations to support income generation activities for youth would have been developed and supported.

Overall Efficacy Rating

High

5. Efficiency

The economic analysis undertaken at appraisal provided a strong rationale for investing in education and skills development in Cote d'Ivoire, which remained equally compelling at project closing. The analysis found that returns on an additional year of schooling are positive, and individuals with higher levels of education are more likely to engage in higher-paying economic activities. At the national level, an additional year of schooling yields a 10 percent return. The rate of return ranges from 15 percent for individuals with some primary education to 159 percent for individuals with higher education, relative to individuals with no education. The analysis also found that education is not only associated with higher wage earnings, but also increases the likelihood of wage employment and employment in sectors with higher returns and employment contracts, which offer greater job stability. Specifically, an additional year of education was noted to increase the probability of working in sectors with higher returns (industry and services) by 14 percent on average.

An end-of-project cost-benefit analysis confirmed that the project is likely to have generated substantial benefits and also to have generated reasonably high rates of return. The lower bound of the present discounted value of benefits for the overall project is estimated at $92.9 million; and the present discounted value of costs is estimated at $75.6 million, including other non-quantifiable costs. The resulting net present value of program benefits is $17.3 million. The internal rate of return (IRR) for the total project was calculated at 6.9 percent (6.3 percent for Component 1, and 9.2 percent for Component 2), higher than the IRR estimated at the AF stage. The end-of-project benefit-cost ratio was found to be 1.2 at the ICR stage. In short, although some benefits could not be fully quantifiable, the NPV of the quantifiable benefits is larger than the NPV costs, which provides convincing evidence of the viability and efficiency of project investments.

Implementation efficiency appears to be substantial, based on a number of factors. IDA funds were fully utilized, with the original IDA grant of $50 million and the additional IDA credit of $50 million, respectively, 100 percent and 99 percent disbursed. Outcome targets were exceeded, and analytic work and evaluations documented substantial, positive impacts beyond the PDO. This is particularly impressive given that the ICR reports a loss in value of the IDA funding of $3.42 million due to exchange rate fluctuations. Actual component costs remained close to original estimates. The exception was a slight overrun in the estimated cost of Component 3 to cover the incremental costs of PIU operations, due to closing date extensions. The project implementation period was extended from an initial four-year period to a ten-year period, which might be considered as an inefficiency, in and of itself. However, this extension enabled: (i) the full and efficient use of all funding (which was doubled from $50 to $100 million with the AF at the time of the original closing date); (ii) the completion of studies, surveys, and impact evaluations, which provided insights and lessons for fine-tuning this project, as well as the design of a follow-on project; and (iii) important gains in institutional strengthening.

Efficiency Rating

Substantial

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 ☐ Not Applicable
ICR Estimate		0	0 ☐ Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

The PDO was highly relevant to the current country situation, the government's development priorities, and the Bank's current strategy in Cote d'Ivoire. Efficacy is also rated as high. Achievement of both objectives embedded in the PDO exceeded expectations. PDO targets were surpassed, and analytic work (studies, surveys, and impact evaluations) corroborated outcomes and documented substantial impacts beyond the PDO statement. Project efficiency was substantial. The strong economic rationale for investing in education and skills development, the robust results of the end-of-project cost-benefit analysis, and substantial implementation efficiency all provide convincing evidence that the project was economically viable and efficient. These results point to virtually no shortcomings in the project's preparation and implementation, producing an Outcome rating of Highly Satisfactory.

a. Outcome Rating

Highly Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

Substantial institutional capacity development achieved under the project has strengthened the prospects for project sustainability. Capacity risks identified at the project's outset were mitigated through the institutional strengthening of the Regional Councils. Moreover, vocational training system capacity was improved thanks to support under the AF to the development of the regulatory framework for vocational training and the piloting of reforms. Additionally, capacity to conduct impact evaluations to improve the monitoring of progress of employment-related interventions has combined with improvements in the data system to support and encourage the use of data to inform employment policies. All of these elements of capacity strengthening contribute to the likelihood of project interventions and results being sustained in the project areas.

A persistent risk to development outcomes is the country context of continuing political tension and conflicts between rival groups. During the past decade, poor education outcomes, combined with relatively high unemployment and poverty, have made Cote d'Ivoire's young people, who make up a large segment of the total population, particularly susceptible to ongoing political tensions. In order to mitigate these ongoing risks, the country will need to continue to nurture and support more productive employment throughout the economy, including the large number of self-employed, informal workers in the agriculture and services sectors.

The ability to mitigate this political risk is highly linked to the challenges of assuring both the technical and the financial sustainability of these various employment and skills development programs. In the medium-term, during a time when the programs will be refined and further expanded, the Bank is providing continued technical and financial support to the labor sector. This support includes the preparation of a follow-on Emergency Youth Employment and Skills Development project to continue successful activities under this recently closed project, continue the learning and policy reforms, and expand coverage to regions that were not previously supported. Additionally, the Bank is financing several other operations that will contribute to improved competitiveness, supporting value chains that would create more and better jobs, and to increased access to financing for underserved farmers and firms. All of these complementary operations stand to increase and/or alter the skills needed in the job market and employment opportunities available to young Ivoirians.

8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The original project design was well aligned with the government's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (2009-2015), which had been adjusted, post-crisis, to jump-start basic social services delivery and critical infrastructure rehabilitation in the aftermath of the short civil war. Its design as an emergency operation was highly appropriate for providing a quick response to the country's post-crisis needs, thus contributing to peace-building and reconciliation efforts. The project's theory of change was sound and evidence-based. Design quality was enriched by careful consideration of peer reviewers' recommendations and internationally recognized research that establishes the critical role of job creation for vulnerable youth in post-conflict recovery efforts. The AF built on the strengths of this design and both refined and expanded its scope, and was aligned with the Strategic Plan for the Reform of TVET (2016-2025). For both the original and revised designs: (i) risks and activities for their mitigation were appropriately identified; (ii) relevant technical expertise was brought to the design process; and (iii) project preparation benefited from a highly collaborative and consultative process with the government.

Environmental and social safeguards and fiduciary aspects were well-prepared, in accordance with Bank guidelines. Project M&E was extremely well prepared, not only with a well developed results framework and well-chosen, measurable indicators, but also with the vision and foresight to generate supplemental information (both quantitative and qualitative) through the conduct of studies, surveys, and impact evaluations. Implementation arrangements were also sound, built from a baseline of no PIU, and reflected the right choices and strategies for: recruitment of qualified staff; capacity building; the right institutional home (Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs and Solidarity Cabinet) and oversight arrangements (a technical steering committee with wide representation of stakeholders); and building national and local-level ownership.

Quality-at-Entry Rating

Highly Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

Rooted in the strong M&E design and its successful implementation, the Bank's supervision was focused on development impact. Supervision missions systematically documented project progress in aide-memoires, back-to-office reports, and the internal reporting system, drawing on project data, complemented by data and information emanating from the studies, surveys, and evaluations. This information kept Bank management well informed of progress and provided the foundation for the ICR. Additionally, during a period overlapping with project implementation (2013-2017), the Bank became engaged in analytic work supporting the jobs agenda, including technical support to national employment surveys, analysis of new sources of employment data, and facilitation of policy dialogue on employment. This analytic work filled critical information gaps and informed the following key strategic documents of the Bank: Systematic Country Diagnostic, Country Partnership Framework, and the 2015

Economic Update focused on the topic of employment. It also culminated in the production of a “Jobs Diagnostic Report” in 2017, which serves as an important reference for investments in the jobs sector.

Missions were conducted semi-annually and were properly staffed with education and labor market specialists, fiduciary staff, and consultants. In between formal semi-annual missions, the in-country team of the Bank had the relevant technical expertise to provide consistent supervision and to support the government and its various implementation units. Throughout the project’s life, the Bank team addressed the various implementation challenges that arose (e.g., regional capacity constraints, COVID-19 pandemic, among others) proactively, and collaboratively with the government, to find solutions that would not compromise the integrity of project design. In this vein, the Bank worked with BCPE and other responsible agencies to provide strong support to address implementation delays related to capacity constraints, including training, technical assistance, guidance, follow-up, and even a revision and piloting of the TVET regulatory framework. The Bank’s capable in-country presence and engagement with the government was a strong contributing factor in the capacity development of implementing agencies.

The Bank’s supervision teams consistently reported on financial management, procurement, and safeguards progress and compliance, which were monitored regularly, and worked with the PIU and other implementation agencies to build their capacity in these critical areas. The Bank’s agreement to grant the government’s requests for project extensions enabled the completion of the project as designed, and the institutionalization of many activities.

Quality of Supervision Rating

Highly Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating

Highly Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The project’s theory of change was sound, based on in-country and global evidence, with the links between the inputs, outputs, and intermediate outcomes both logical and plausibly supportive of a clearly stated PDO. The results framework provided good measures of the project’s performance and outcomes. The PDO-level indicators and intermediate outcome indicators, as presented in the EPP, were appropriately chosen, clearly defined, measurable, and reflective of the results chain, with intermediate results indicators capturing components’ contributions to outcomes. Baselines and achievable targets were set for each indicator. Revisions to the results framework at the time of Additional Financing refined measurement of an unchanged PDO, reflected the changes and additions to the project components, and improved the articulation and measurement of intermediate outcome indicators to better capture institutional strengthening.

The M&E design had two essential and complementary components. First, it was designed to monitor and report on progress in achieving the targets of the PDO indicators and intermediate results indicators, through regular routine collection of project data, monitoring, and reporting by the PIU. Second, the systematic tracking of project performance and outcome data was complemented by beneficiary surveys, tracer studies, and impact evaluation, which generated additional insight and information, both qualitative and quantitative. These surveys, studies, and evaluations: (i) improved the availability of employment data for the national employment statistics system; (ii) nurtured and supported a better understanding of the impact of project interventions; and (iii) developed the evaluation capacity of staff of the PIU and of the Ministry of State of Labor, Social Affairs and Solidarity. The inclusion of three M&E-related intermediate outcome indicators, tracking tracer surveys, and impact evaluations placed emphasis on their importance for institutional strengthening.

b. M&E Implementation

All of the indicators in the results framework were tracked regularly, and the performance and outcome data were updated on a timely basis for supervision missions, including the mid-term review. During the project period, four tracer studies were carried out. These studies collected data on beneficiary satisfaction of the various programs: LIPW, internships, apprenticeships, and entrepreneurship. Impact evaluations were also undertaken to provide rigorous evidence on the effectiveness of core activities related to LIPW, apprenticeships, and basic self-employment. These studies provided significant value added to the monitoring of routine project data to measure performance and outcome indicators, and were used extensively in the assessment of efficacy. All three M&E-related intermediate outcome targets were achieved: (i) all four targeted tracer surveys were conducted; (ii) more staff than targeted (10 versus 8) were trained in impact evaluation methods; and (iii) the two planned impact evaluations were completed. Geo-enabling Methods of Monitoring and Supervision was piloted in 10 regions, with 339 coordinates collected and mapped. The pilot was still ongoing at the project's closing. Additionally, the BCPE started implementation of a geo-located monitoring system of the project beneficiaries. The TTL specified that this system supports the mapping of project beneficiaries to provide a notion of the project's reach.

c. M&E Utilization

Data on project performance and outcome served to update the results framework on a regular basis. It thus served as a regular tool for monitoring project performance and was key in informing the end-of-project evaluation. The tracer studies provided more reliable data on national employment and were used by the national employment statistics system for sector-wide information and monitoring. Impact evaluation data have been used to inform the government and the World Bank of the impact of the various programs supported by the project. Data, information and analysis generated by the extensive M&E activities supported under the project have also been used to inform the design of the follow-on Emergency Youth Employment and Skills Development project, and relevant programs of the government. Additionally, the geo-located monitoring system data were provided to the BCPE, which is using this data to prepare an analytical report.

M&E Quality Rating

High

10. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

At the design stage, the project was rated as Category B, triggering the Bank's operational policy OP/BP 4.01, "Environment Assessment," in light of the potential adverse environmental and social impacts associated with the LIPW activities. The project also triggered OP/BP 4.12 Involuntary Resettlement, with the EPP's caveat (p. 69) that the need for involuntary resettlement or land acquisition in specific subproject areas would only be known during project implementation, when site-specific plans are available. Two frameworks, an Environmental Social Management Framework (ESMF) and a Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), were thus prepared to assist the PIU in: screening all the LIPW subprojects for their likely social and environmental impacts; identifying documentation and preparation requirements; and prioritizing the investments. Because the project was processed under the Rapid Response Emergency OP/BP 8.00, disclosure of social and environmental safeguards instruments was deferred to six months after project effectiveness. Both the ESMF and the RPF were received within this timeframe and disclosed on August 1, 2012 in the World Bank InfoShop and in-country. At the time of the AF in 2015, the safeguards category remained the same, since no significant changes were made to project activities. The ESMF and RPF were updated and disclosed in the World Bank InfoShop, respectively on February 12, 2015 and February 11, 2015.

Safeguards were supervised and monitored on a regular basis throughout project implementation, consistently receiving ratings in the satisfactory range (satisfactory and moderately satisfactory). Additionally, formal safeguards assessments carried out during the project period prompted recommendations and actions suggested by the teams. These assessments identified a number of weaknesses: (i) limited mechanisms for managing complaints and accident incidences; (ii) delays in the regular transmission of environmental reports; and (iii) difficulties in establishing a payment mechanism to facilitate access to health services for LIPW beneficiaries, in case of accidents. In 2018 the project developed and finalized a grievance redress mechanism (GRM) and distributed the information to the public. Grievances can be lodged through social networks, emails, and regular mail. There was evidence of grievances received, and monthly reports were filed on the complaints and their resolutions. The GRM will be enhanced during the follow-on project, and there will be continued outreach to the public to increase awareness of the GRM system.

The TTL confirmed in a 11-1-21 exchange with IEG that the project completed mitigation activities and that the PIU consultant was effective in carrying out his work. The TTL also noted that the PIU has recently increased its safeguards staffing to two specialists (one each for environmental and social safeguards) for the follow-on youth employment and skills development project.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

Financial Management

During project design, a financial management assessment was undertaken to appraise project arrangements and their compliance with Bank policy OP/BP 10.02 on Financial Management (FM) and with the FM manual dated March 1, 2010. A number of measures were identified to ensure adherence to minimum Bank requirements, notably: (i) recruitment and training of an FM expert to work in the PIU and adequate staffing of the FM unit within the PIU; (ii) recruitment of an internal auditor to strengthen the internal control system; (iii) purchase and installation of a computerized accounting system for the PIU; (iv) establishment of a procedure manual for project administration and FM; and (v) recruitment of an external auditor. Additionally, in keeping with Ministry of Economy and Finance's instruction 192, a public accountant and financial controller were also to be assigned to the project by the ministry. FM risks were assessed as high due to the country's post-crisis context, deterioration of governance and transparency, and their negative impacts on controls, budget execution, and disbursements.

The ICR reports FM performance ratings in the satisfactory range throughout project implementation, thanks to a strong FM team in place and the PIU's regular submission of unaudited interim financial reports of acceptable quality. Audits were submitted to the Bank in compliance with the Financing Agreement, all of them unqualified throughout the project period. A total of 13 audit reports were delivered. The BCPE's integrated financial management system, SIGFIP, was used for the project. The Bank held capacity development workshops for PIU FM staff and regional staff to help with implementation of FM requirements. All resources were fully accounted for at the project's closing. There were exchange rate losses of $0.2 million from the original project and $3.42 million from the AF, and there were $0.06 million in unused funds.

Procurement

At the time of project design, a national procurement capacity building program was being implemented at central and decentralized levels, and an electronic system for collecting and disseminating procurement information and monitoring procurement statistics had been set up. While a procurement capacity assessment could not be carried out due to country circumstances (and no PIU yet established), the Bank proposed the following risk mitigation measures to meet the minimum requirement of a procurement unit: (i) the hiring of two procurement specialists; and (ii) the purchase of necessary equipment.

Procurement was consistently rated satisfactory in the project's internal reporting system. The World Bank provided procurement training to the PIU to ensure compliance with Bank guidelines. Moreover, the PIU demonstrated a high level of competency in working with the regions and service providers to ensure that the high volume of contracts were signed and executed at the regional level. In 2020, the PIU migrated to the Bank's Systematic Tracking of Exchanges in Procurement (STEP), with procurement activities included in the STEP platform. Procurement plans were updated regularly and submitted to the Bank, and were always of good quality.

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

At the project's outset (2011), the Bank was the only development partner actively supporting for youth employment and skills development. Four years later, at the time of AF approval, five additional donors were supporting this sector and aligned their projects with the Bank project's implementation structure (see Attribution paragraph in Section 5). In the context of this expanded interest and support, the government, with the World Bank's support, elevated the status of the PIU to the level of a bureau (Bureau of Coordination of Employment Programs), which now focuses on the sector-wide program and coordinates all related investments to ensure overall coherence and alignment of efforts. The BCPE staffing includes a program coordinator and a deputy coordinator. This has been a highly successful initiative by the government to build institutional capacity for ensuring program coordination and donor collaboration for the sector.

The focus of project support under the AF shifted to include rural areas and the deconcentrated management of activities. This prompted a greater role for municipalities and Regional Councils (RCs), which represented municipalities, as they became responsible for the implementation of LIPW activities, selected from their own local development plans in collaboration with the relevant technical ministries. This approach sought both to promote local ownership and to build local planning and management capacity. Thanks to project-related capacity building activities, RCs were able to negotiate contracts for the LIPW, internship, and apprenticeship activities. Beyond project expectations, by project closing, RCs set up a guarantee fund of $0.7 million to support income generation activities for local youth and signed Memoranda of Understanding with microfinancing institutions to provide better access to credit for these activities.

d. Other

The project’s focus on gender was strong. Relevant indicators were gender disaggregated, ensuring continued efforts to improve gender equity. Half of all jobs within the LIPW program were reserved for women. In the 12 municipalities supported under the AF, female participation increased from 47 percent in the first wave to 57 percent in the third and final wave, and the insertion of women after their completion of internship programs increased from 64 to 78 percent between 2014 and 2018. Overall, participation of women in programs supported under the project reached 43 percent. There are still challenges, however, with TVET programs being still primarily geared toward urban areas and boys. The new Bank-supported Youth Employment and Skills Development Project is designed to consolidate and further expand gains in gender equity.

11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Satisfactory	Highly Satisfactory	Project efficacy is rated high, as most targets and accomplishments exceeded expectations.
Bank Performance	Satisfactory	Highly Satisfactory	The project's M&E, beyond the collection of project data on relevant indicators, included tracer surveys, studies, and impact evaluations that provided an enhanced assessment of project performance, outcomes, impacts, and lessons. Complementary analytic work in the jobs sector enhanced the

			targeting of interventions and policy dialogue.
Quality of M&E	Substantial	High	See above.
Quality of ICR	---	High	

12. Lessons

The following lessons are a subset of the seven relevant and insightful lessons presented in the ICR, some slightly reworded by IEG to be more succinct:

- Jobs and skills development projects can be remarkably successful in post-conflict countries, especially when project designs adapt to a changing country environment and the flexibility of World Bank support and procedures are fully exploited. In this project, the original design accommodated the country's immediate post-conflict needs and evolved, with AF and an extended implementation period as the country emerged from the post-conflict situation, to include a focus on rural areas and more capacity and institution building at central, regional, and local levels.
- Labor-intensive public works programs that include training and savings opportunities are important for providing economic integration of vulnerable groups and can be effective in raising their earnings, improving their psychological wellbeing, and improving their post-program employment prospects.
- Entrepreneurship training and seed funds are critical for new entrepreneurs to begin and sustain their businesses. During this project, individual savings, though substantial, were not sufficient to fund income generation initiatives completely. However, as a complement to individual savings, the development of a competitive seed funding mechanism to support good business plans and the proactive role of Regional Councils working with local financial institutions proved to be effective.
- Two factors can make critical contributions to the success of internship and apprenticeship programs: (i) payment of participants to offset their indirect/opportunity costs and compensation of companies for taking the participants on board; and (ii) the undertaking of impact evaluations and tracer studies to assess program effectiveness, inform needed adjustments, and document the usefulness of the programs for participants and companies.
- Ensuring the existence of a sound regulatory framework is essential for addressing systems weaknesses, which in this case were undermining the potential of the vocational education and training system. Systems reform undertaken under the AF significantly enhanced capacity, including private sector participation and the introduction of a dual apprenticeship program, combining theory with on-the-job experience.

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

Quality of Evidence. Thanks to the high-quality design and implementation of M&E, the ICR's evidence base was strong, drawing on project data and trends on relevant indicators, and complemented with quantitative and qualitative data generated through project-financed tracer studies, surveys, and two impact evaluations.

There is one caveat to an otherwise excellent presentation of evidence. The data labeled as baselines, presented in the Efficacy section of the main text and in Annex 1 (Results Framework), were actually documenting the progress at the time of the AF (3+ years into project implementation). The original baselines established in the EPP should have been cited. Additionally, all of the targets in the Results Framework were presented as original targets, with the column for formally revised targets left blank. The original targets, as set in the EPP, should have been put under the original targets column, and the revised targets established at the time of AF under the revised targets column.

Quality of Analysis and Results Orientation. The ICR effectively used the wide array of data and information generated by the strong M&E to triangulate evidence and develop a rich analysis of the project's performance and outcomes, and some insights about its impact. The analysis also featured additional information and insights, both in well-placed footnotes and in the main text, about underlying factors facilitating or constraining performance and outcomes. The analysis was well built around the project results chain, giving the ICR a strong results orientation.

Quality of Lessons. Lessons presented were grounded in the ICR's evidence and analysis and highly relevant to the challenges of youth employment and skills development in a fragile, post-conflict country context. They were both insightful and practical.

Internal Consistency/adherence to guidelines. The ICR was internally consistent and respectful of the guidelines. A small caveat is that on page 2 of the ICR, in the financing section, the original project cost and original financing were shown as $100 million, but the original estimate and original financing were both $50 million. It was only under the Additional Financing, approved in March 2015, more than four years after approval of the original project, that an additional $50 million grant was approved.

a. Quality of ICR Rating

High