PLACING LEARNING AND SKILLS BACK ON THE RIGHT TRACK

BRAZIL POLICY NOTES

THE WORLD BANK
IBRD • IDA | WORLD BANK GROUP

www.worldbank.org

DEC 2022
Why does Talent matter?
Four facts:

1. Brazil loses enormous talent due to unideal education and health conditions
   - According to the Human Capital Index (HCI), an average Brazilian born in 2019 will achieve 60% of their full potential by age 18.

2. Talent is regionally concentrated within Brazil
   - There are spatial clusters of low human capital in the northern regions and clusters of high human capital in southern regions.

3. Talent is also unequally developed between race and gender groups
   - Men have systematically lower human capital than women.
   - Afro-descendants, men and women, have lower expected productivity than whites.

4. Talent is mainly associated with education
   - More than two-thirds of all the variation in the municipal HCI 2019 is due to education.

The Geography of Human Capital in Brazil
The Human Capital Index at municipal level (2019)

Education as Leverage
What predicts the variation in Human Capital Index (2019) within regions?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>% education</th>
<th>% child survival</th>
<th>% health</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South</td>
<td>61.8%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>31.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Northeast</td>
<td>77.5%</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>18.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North</td>
<td>72.3%</td>
<td>9.7%</td>
<td>18.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center-west</td>
<td>67.3%</td>
<td>9.2%</td>
<td>23.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast</td>
<td>63.5%</td>
<td>8.0%</td>
<td>28.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

More than two-thirds of the variation in HCI is explained by education.
How has COVID-19 been affecting the talent development in Brazil?
Four facts:

1. Brazil had a setback to HCI levels before 2009 because of the COVID-19 pandemic

2. Almost two-thirds of the HCI loss is estimated to be driven by the learning losses
   - Household income shocks and the lack of engagement in remote learning may have pressured school-age children to leave school and decreased the quality of learning.

3. The estimated time for recovery ranges between 10 and 13 years.
   - If Brazil maintains the same pace of growth seen during pre-pandemic periods (2007-2019). In other words, Brazil will only reach the 2019 HCI levels in 2035.

4. The silent crisis in Education requires urgent action
   - Because the impacts of COVID-19 on HCI have been largely through education, learning recovery and acceleration should be a priority in the coming years in Brazil.
What is the status of education in Brazil?

TO DEVELOP TALENTS

I Early Childhood Education
II Primary and Lower Secondary Education
III Upper Secondary Education
IV Tertiary Education
V Transition to the Labor Market
1. Low coverage, even before COVID-19

Brazk is far from reaching the ECD target of 100% 4-5 years old at school and 50% 0-3 years old at school by 2024, as established by the National Education Plan. The COVID-19 pandemic pushed the target farther away: before the pandemic, Brazil had 84% of children aged 4-5 in school, while 31% of 0-3 years old. In 2021, Brazil had 76% and 28%, respectively.

2. Low quality

Over one-third of daycare and preschool classes have curricula and pedagogical practices below regular standards. Infrequent class’s activities with play, theater, dance, and music contribute to the low quality.¹

3. Pressure of public provision and risk of low quality due to the COVID-19 pandemic

Almost 600 thousand children left private early childhood schools after the pandemic. Research shows that pre-school students performed systematically worse in all cognitive dimensions after the pandemic. The loss is higher for pre-schools with lower socioeconomic status.²

¹ Fundação Maria Cecília Souto Vidigal, Laboratório de Estudos e Pesquisas em Economia Social, Itaú Social, Movimento Bem Maior (2022)
² Fundação Maria Cecília Souto Vidigal (2021)
Primary and Lower secondary education (Ensino Fundamental)
Even before COVID-19 there were challenges

1. 46 percent of children in Brazil can not read and understand a simple text by age 10.
14 (out of 16) states in Northeast and North have more than half of children which are not able to read and understand a simple text by age 10.

2. Low learning performance and high inequality within students in the same classes.
In 9th grade, only 18% have adequate learning in Mathematics. Moreover, there are students with up to 6 years of learning difference in mathematics in the same classroom.

3. The Pandemic exposed digital cracks
Schools in Brazil were closed for long periods during the pandemic, with unequal and low student engagement in remote learning. The digital gap hampered the hybrid learning mitigation strategy: 61% of the state’s schools have connectivity for students, and only 24% of the municipal’s schools have internet access.

4. Earlier grades have suffered at most from COVID19
International evidence (from United States to Mexico, and Uganda) shows earlier grades had larger absolute learning loss than older ones. In São Paulo, while a student from 9th grade had a setback equivalent to levels eight years before in Mathematics, this setback to 5th grader student was equivalent to 14.
Upper Secondary Education (Ensino Médio)

1. Upper secondary have higher rates of dropout and repetition than other than other grades

   This outcome may be the result of a process of disengagement of students from school.

2. An attractive curriculum was not implemented yet

   States have adopted upper secondary reform, which includes a new flexible and attractive curriculum, but the COVID-19 pandemic has delayed its implementation.

3. Coverage of full-time school is still low

   Although all states have full-time school implementation plans approved by MEC, the coverage of full-time school is still low (13.8% in 2020).

---

Dropout and Repetition Rates for Brazilian Public schools
Source: Estatística da Educação Básica (INEP, 2021)

- Dropout rate
- Repetition rate

---

Percentage of Upper Secondary Students enrolled in Full-Time School
Observatório do Plano Nacional de Educação

- 2011: 2.8%
- 2012: 3.7%
- 2013: 4.7%
- 2014: 6.3%
- 2015: 6.7%
- 2016: 6.7%
- 2017: 8.4%
- 2018: 10.3%
- 2019: 11.7%
- 2020: 13.8%
Tertiary Education (Ensino Superior)

1. Non-completion of graduate courses

Only 40% of the incoming graduate students in 2011 completed their course within ten years. 37% of students drop from their courses within the first three years. Students that successfully graduate do it between the fourth and fifth year of the course.

2. COVID-19 led a substantial reduction in access and increased dropout in tertiary education

In 2020 there was a 10% drop in enrollments in private institutions and a 40% drop in overall new enrollments. The little experience with virtual and hybrid tertiary education could have contributed to the increase in non-enrollment in tertiary education.

3. Small proportion of students in STEM careers

Only 25% of graduate students are in STEM related fields. Overall, tertiary education have low articulation between supply and national and/or labor market priorities.

Tertiary Education Enrollment per Field

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>NE 2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Natural Sciences and related</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>25.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Science and related</td>
<td>18.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>15.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering and related</td>
<td>5.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture and related</td>
<td>4.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business, adm and law</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, welfare and services</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts and humanities</td>
<td>2.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BRAZIL POLICY NOTES 2022 | Placing learning and skills back on the right track
Transition to the labor market

1. The share of youths (15 – 29 years old) that are not studying or in employment is rising

26% of Brazilians aged 15 – 29 were not studying or working in 2020. The youth are at risk of disengagement with education and employment, harming human capital utilization.

2. Difficult transition to the labor market.

The amount of Human capital accumulated by the age of 18 is largely unutilized in the labor market. This problem is exacerbated for women.

3. COVID-19 caused substantial disruption in job markets

The pandemic called attention to the importance of digital skills, as the digital economy has boomed, and remote work has become more prevalent.
What are the World Bank recommendations?

I. Early Childhood Education
II. Primary and Lower Secondary Education
III. Upper Secondary Education
IV. Post Secondary Education
Even before preschool, there is a need to foster early childhood stimulation. Establish practical plans to improve parent-child quality interactions. Home-based programs operate in this direction.

Increase coverage and foster quality. Increase coverage through public and private partnerships. Improve quality through cooperation between states and municipalities to foster ECE quality provision.

Establish quality assessment routines. It is needed to set a framework for quality assessment, while also referencing standards to be reached to guarantee a minimum reference for performance.

Improve teacher-child quality interactions. Improve teachers’ quality through pre-service and in-service training and strengthen the leadership skills in ECE centers.
Basic education: Recommendations to return and retain children at school

Active Search of students that dropped out from school. Expand implementation of community agents in charge of tracking students out of school.

Early Warning System
Map of dropout risk and implementation of personalized treatment for students at high risk while they are still at school.

Integration of data system
Integrate student data to track students out of school.

Monetary benefits to vulnerable students
Offer scholarships to vulnerable students conditioned on school completion;
Expand cash transfers conditioned to schools’ attendance (Bolsa Família Program/Auxílio Brasil).

Socioemotional skills
Introduce social and emotional skills in the school curriculum. Academic evidence shows that socioemotional skills can prevent schools drop out.
Basic education: Recommendations to improve learning

- **Personalized Tutoring**: Group students according to learning levels and teach with adequate school content.

- **Hybrid learning**: Expand internet connectivity, provide computing devices for vulnerable students, and enhance digital skills should be on the same list of priorities.

- **Upper secondary school reform**: Establish a more flexible curriculum, strengthen the focus on socioemotional skills, and implement full-time school. Additionally, students who opt for a technical track can replace some of the traditional subjects with technical courses and internships.

- **Teach & Coach**: Create classrooms’ observation of the core competencies. Provide teacher training in essential pedagogical skills, easily applied in the classroom.
Post secondary education: recommendations

1. To enhance the labor market skills, there is a need to build strategically diverse systems with articulated trajectories (i.e., integration of university, technical and professional schools, and short time course).

2. Use of technology in higher education to create resilience and advance the development of students’ digital skills, use cutting-edge technology in their research, and develop technologies as part of their research and development activities.

3. Foster short courses (2-3 years) which are job market-oriented, with a diploma of technical, professional technical, technologist or specialist, and with possible continuation toward a bachelor’s degree program.

4. Technical and vocational education and training (TVET) can be a quick response for the mismatch between higher education and the skills demanded in the labor markets (e.g., the scarcity of STEM professionals).

- APPLICABILITY: an education that is useful and relevant
- EQUITY: Everyone must have access
- DIVERSITY: Ensuring that everyone has the same opportunities regardless of gender or socioeconomic status
- FLEXIBILITY: across the full range of higher education options
What has the World Bank been doing?
Brazil Human Capital Review

The report measures the expected productivity in each municipality in Brazil and recommends policies to recover and foster the human capital after the COVID-19 Pandemic.

National Quality Preschool program

The Bank supported the design of a program to strengthen the monitoring and evaluation, teachers' professional development, and leadership skills of ECE.

Result-based Financing

The Bank is supporting the FUNDEB report designing the mechanism of incentive and promoting cooperation policies between states and municipalities under the ICMS cota-part program.

Inclusion of Afro-descendants in Education

The report examines the factors behind the disparities in school achievement among African descendants and other Latin Americans and brings recommendations for building inclusive education systems.
Projects

01
Recovering Learning Losses from COVID-19 in Pandemic

Project focused on North and Northeast states to recover the learning losses through early warning system, improved connectivity, personalized tutoring, socioemotional program. The project approval in the Senate of Brazil is pending.

02
Support to Upper Secondary Reform

The project was restructures to address the COVID-19 response and disbursed 131 million to support the mitigation measures of COVID-19, the expansion of full-time school, revision of the state curriculum, and technical assistance to the states.

03
Mato Grosso Resilient, Inclusive, And Sustainable Learning

The Bank is preparing a 100 million project with the objective of support strengthen the state to improve schools’ learning environments, pedagogical practices, and system management.

04
Income Support Projects

Supporting Bolsa Familia/Auxílio Brasil reform to retain students and promote graduation through cash transfers.

05
Support for Human Development in other subnational projects

Salvador, Rio Grande do Norte, Piauí, Acre, Tocantins, Alagoas.
Thank you!

www.worldbank.org