Report Number: ICRR0023904

1. Project Data

Project ID P147924	**Project Name** GY Secondary Education Improvement
Country Guyana	**Practice Area(Lead)** Education

L/C/TF Number(s)	Closing Date (Original)	Total Project Cost (USD)
IDA-54730,IDA-68250	31-Mar-2020	21,345,509.82
Bank Approval Date	**Closing Date (Actual)**	
04-Jun-2014	30-Jun-2023	

	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)
Original Commitment	10,000,000.00	0.00
Revised Commitment	23,500,000.00	0.00
Actual	21,347,117.04	0.00

Prepared by	Reviewed by	ICR Review Coordinator	Group
Shahrzad Mobasher Fard	Salim J. Habayeb	Susan Ann Caceres	IEGHC (Unit 2)

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

According to p. 4 of the Financing Agreement dated October 10, 2014, the Project Development Objective (PDO) was to: “(i) strengthen the capacity of secondary school mathematics teachers nationwide; and (ii) increase enrollment in General Secondary Schools in targeted regions.”

During implementation, one associated outcome target was revised upward.

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?
Yes

Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?
No

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?
No

d. Components
The project comprised four components:

Component 1: Strengthen the Capacity of Secondary School Mathematics Teachers Nationwide ***(approved amount: US$1.8 million; revised amount: US$3.6 million (including US$1.8 million from additional financing); actual amount at project closing: US$7.81 million)***

The component aimed to improve the content knowledge and instructional skills of secondary school mathematics teachers, through:

1. In-service mathematics teacher training and upgrading: Carrying out the following activities: (i) a diagnostic assessment of mathematics teachers; (ii) training and workshops for master trainers to deliver in-service training to all public secondary school mathematics teachers; (iii) design, development and provision of modular, iterative, competency-based training for all secondary school mathematics teachers; (iv) distribution of mathematics teaching aids in all public secondary schools to promote the application of training in the classroom and improved student learning; and (v) development of comprehensive website for an on-line community of practice for mathematics teachers in the Recipient's territory.
2. Revising public secondary school teachers' appraisal instruments: Improve mathematics instruction through: (i) the development of specific standards for mathematics instruction; (ii) the revision of the appraisal system for secondary school teachers and school principals; and (iii) the provision of training for secondary school principals, deputy principals, and master trainers in the use of the revised teacher appraisal instruments.
3. Technology-assisted learning in mathematics: Carrying out the following activities: (i) improvement of mathematics instruction and learning through use of innovative technology, on a pilot basis; and (ii) an independent evaluation process to assess the effectiveness of different packages of tablets and on-line mathematics learning management systems for improving student learning outcomes in mathematics.

Component 2: Expansion of General Secondary School Facilities ***(approved amount: US$7.15 million; revised amount: US$18.25 million (including US$11.1 million in additional financing); actual amount at project closing: US$12.01 million)***

The component aimed to expand access to General Secondary School (GSS) services in underserved areas of Regions 3 and 4 of the Recipient, through:

1. New school construction: Construction of three new GSS (one in Region 3 and two in Region 4), pursuant to the specifications set forth in the Project Operations Manual.

2. Provision of furniture and equipment for the facilities referred to in Sub-component 2.1 above.

Component 3: Strengthen Institutional Capacity and Project Management *(approved amount: US$1.05 million; revised amount: US$1.65 million (including 0.6 million in additional financing); actual amount at project closing: US$1.52 million)*

1. Design, develop and implement a new education management information system (EMIS) to increase efficiency in education sector data management and information use for planning and policymaking.
2. Carrying out project management, monitoring and evaluation activities, including project audits.

Component 4: Contingent Emergency Response Component *(approved amount: n.a.; revised amount: nil; actual amount at project closing: nil)*

e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates

Project Cost. The parent project was approved for an amount of US$10 million. The additional financing was approved for an amount of US$13.5 million as part of the fourth restructuring on January 25, 2021. The actual amount disbursed by the project closing date was US$21.3 million. The difference between the approved amount and the actual amount disbursed is explained by fluctuations of the Special Drawing Rights (SDR) exchange rate against the U.S. dollar.

Financing. The parent project was financed through an International Development Association (IDA) credit of US$10 million (IDA-54730). The additional financing was financed through another IDA credit of US$13.5 million (IDA-68250).

Dates. The project was approved on June 4, 2014, and became effective on November 24, 2014. A mid-term review was held on June 12, 2017. The project closed on June 30, 2023, more than three years beyond the original closing date of March 31, 2020.

The project underwent five level 2 restructurings (including one additional financing) on May 11, 2018, February 13, 2020, September 25, 2020, January 25, 2021, and December 23, 2022:

- The first restructuring led to a change in the results framework, which included, notably, the reduction in the number of GSS being constructed and furnished under the project.
- The second and third restructurings led to a change in the loan closing dates, first from March 31, 2020, to September 30, 2020, and subsequently from September 30, 2020, to March 30, 2021. Changes in the loan closing dates were required to (i) complete the construction of the two new GSS and allow for the delivery of furniture and equipment, (ii) complete the teacher training in mathematics and administration of the final exam, (iii) accommodate the preparation of the additional financing requested by the government on June 26, 2019 (second restructuring), and (iv) allow more time to achieve the PDO and accommodate the preparation of the additional financing.
- The fourth restructuring resulted in an additional financing, a change in results framework, change in funding in components and cost, and other changes. The additional financing incorporated the following changes: (i) increased the credit amount to cover the financial gap for the construction of the two GSS due to high inflation and the depreciation of the SDR; (ii) reintegrated the construction of the third GSS and expanded the EdTech pilot for adaptive learning on tablets and introduced a

new EdTech pilot using an innovation approach to teaching and learning through smart classrooms; (iii) added a Contingent Emergency Response Component; (iv) revised the results framework, adding new indicators to reflect corporate priorities; and (v) extended the project closing date from March 30, 2021, to June 30, 2023, to allow completion of project activities .

- The fifth restructuring led to a change in the results framework and to changes in funding in components and costs.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

The PDO addressed Guyana's priority constraints in the education sector, including, notably, a greater demand for secondary level education (comprised of grades 7 to 11) than the country's public sector provision through its 110 General Secondary Schools (GSS). This resulted in the creation of 175 Secondary Departments (SD) at primary schools offering grade 7-9 level education as a temporary solution. Eighty-nine percent of secondary school students were enrolled in GSS, with the remaining 11 percent enrolled in SD. The GSS were large (600-1,000 students, on average), urban-based, staffed with trained teachers, and able to offer the full secondary school curriculum. In contrast, SD had fewer than 100 students enrolled at a SD at primary school, on average, and they could not deliver the full curriculum as they lacked qualified teachers and did not have laboratories or specialty rooms. There was a high school dropout rate in SD after the completion of grade 9 due to lack of continuity for enrolled students. Additional GSS needed to be established, particularly in regions 3 and 4, which encompassed 30 percent of the country's secondary school population and accounted for 40 percent of the country's population living in poverty. Further, there was a lack of capacity for teaching mathematics.

The PDO was aligned with the government's development priorities and the World Bank Group's strategy. One of the key priorities of the government's Education Strategic Plan (ESP) 2008-13 consisted in the attainment of universal secondary education, which was also subsequently reflected in the government's ESP 2014-18. The Guyana Country Engagement Note FY16-18 included a strategic pillar on improving education quality and social safety nets, and an underlying objective to improve the quality of education through the reform of teacher education and better service delivery. The Country Partnership Framework for Guyana for the period FY23-26 included a High-Level Outcome on improved human capital and an underlying objective of increased access to quality secondary education and TVET. The additional financing addressed the needs under the government's COVID-19 Strategic Preparedness and Response Plan, with the promotion of children's learning through online and in-classroom modalities through the provision of teacher training and technology, as well as additional facilities for the full return of students to school, identified as a key priority.

The project complemented other World Bank engagements in the education sector in Guyana. Complementary engagements included: (i) the Guyana Education Sector Improvement Project (P159519, FY17), which supported the revision of the curriculum across all grade levels, including the Grade 7 mathematics curriculum, which was relevant to this project; (ii) the Guyana Education Sector Program Project (P174244, FY21), which provided tablets and smart classrooms at the primary level and improved the transition for students from primary to the secondary level; and (iii) Education Public Expenditure Review which was intended to inform the Bank's future engagements in the education sector.

Rating
High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

OBJECTIVE 1

Objective
Strengthen the capacity of secondary school mathematics teachers nationwide.

Rationale
The theory of change held that problems with the low quality of secondary level mathematics education due to the low capacity of teachers and the lack of quality of learning materials would be addressed through continuous professional development of mathematics teachers and their assessment, and the provision of teaching and learning materials. Further, weak sector planning capacity which affect the quality of education would be addressed through the development of an open EMIS.

Outputs and intermediate outcomes.

Continuous professional development.

- By June 30, 2023, 681 teachers completed at least one training course designed under the project, surpassing the target of 600 teachers. According to p. 18 of the PAD, courses would range between 4-12 days per year (up to 36 days over a three-year period) and teachers would be assessed at the end of each course. P. 15 of the ICR stated that the teachers found that the training had impressed upon them the importance of upgrading their knowledge of content and methodological approaches, leading several mathematics teachers to upgrade their qualifications at the Teaching College. The in-service teacher training supported by the project distinguished itself from the previous in-service training by: (i) developing a teacher training module that complemented teachers' pre-service and existing in-service training, offering new pedagogical tools for teaching mathematics; (ii) improved the assessment of teachers, including through the development of standards in mathematics teaching; (iii) financed mathematics teaching aids to support teaching; and (iv) created a community of practice for all mathematics teachers in the country.
- By June 30, 2023, 681 secondary mathematics teachers were observed in the classroom by master trainers and received expert feedback at least once during the project's lifetime, surpassing the target of 600 teachers. As planned (PAD, p. 18), this was based on the systematic use of a standardized classroom observation instrument, with accompanying feedback report, with the activity being conducted at a central hub.
- 417 secondary mathematics teachers were registered in the Guyanese mathematics teacher website/community of practice by September 12, 2023, falling short of the target of 600 (70 percent achievement). The website enabled mathematics teachers to access online instructional resources, share lesson plans, and exchange experiences.

- The appraisal of secondary school teachers and principals was revised by March 1, 2023, as targeted. As planned (PAD, p. 19), this included the hiring of a consultant to provide technical assistance to the Ministry of Education (MOE) to revise the appraisal of teachers and principals, with the new design being shared with the Bank for comments.
- Standards of practice for mathematics teachers were developed by March 1, 2023, as targeted (100 percent achievement). This included the hiring of a consultant to provide technical assistance to MOE to revise the appraisal of teachers and principals, with the new design being shared with the Bank for comments.
- 137 secondary school mathematics teachers were trained in using the EdTech (tablets) in pilot schools by June 30, 2023, surpassing the original and revised targets of 24 teachers and 50 teachers, respectively. As planned (PAD, p. 20), hands-on training in ICT and on how to use the different resources/devices was provided under the pilot. The target for this indicator was revised upwards with the additional financing resulting in an increase in the number of tablets and the introduction of smart classrooms, both of which necessitated a revision in the target for teachers trained.

Provision of learning kits.

- 250 secondary schools received mathematics teaching and learning kits by March 1, 2023, as targeted (100 percent achievement). According to p. 19 of the PAD, every school would receive a learning kit covering the mathematics curriculum for grades 7-11.
- There were 146,237 science, technology, engineering and math (STEM) textbooks procured by June 30, 2023, surpassing the target of 100,000 textbooks.

Institutional capacity

- A secondary EMIS was designed, developed, piloted, revised and rolled out by September 12, 2023, as targeted. P. 37 of the ICR states that the national pilot for the EMIS for primary and secondary schools was rolled out during May-September 2023, and that the EMIS was scaled up to at least 100 secondary schools. The EMIS which existed prior to the introduction of an open EMIS was paper-based and provided limited information to MOE for evidence-based policymaking. The open EMIS allowed the collection of secondary school data through tablets, facilitating the collection and reporting of data, and allowing MOE to use it more systematically for evidence-based policymaking. Further, p. 18 of the ICR states that the creation of an open EMIS supported the creation of a national EMIS policy, master implementation plan, and a structured EMIS eco-system, harmonizing data collection efforts of all arms and branches of MOE including those of school administrations.

Outcomes.

86.5 percent of secondary school mathematics teachers passed the examinations of the targeted training courses designed under the project by September 9, 2022, surpassing the target of 60 percent. Secondary school mathematics teachers were assessed at the end of each training course through examinations, classroom observations, portfolios, microteaching, etc. Teachers obtaining 60 percent or more in the summative evaluation for each course were considered passed.

Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 2

Objective

Increase enrollment in general secondary schools in targeted regions.

Rationale

The theory of change held that the problem pertaining to the limited and inequitable access to quality secondary education would be addressed through the construction of GSS, providing more places for students, along with improved learning environment. Further, weak sector planning capacity which affect education access would be addressed through the development of an open EMIS.

Outputs and intermediate outcomes.

Physical infrastructure. Two GSS were constructed and furnished by June 30, 2023, falling short of the original target of three, but meeting the revised target of two schools. P. 11 of the ICR indicates that the downward revision in the target was needed due to (i) construction cost inflation, (ii) the depreciation of the Bank's SDR exchange rate against the U.S. dollar, (iii) MOE capacity constraints pertaining to the design and the construction of the GSS.

Some 1,800 student places were created in GSS in Regions 3 and 4 by June 30, 2023, falling short of the target of 2,600 (69 percent achievement). This achievement captures the impact of the two new GSS which were constructed and furnished under the project.

Institutional capacity. A secondary EMIS was designed, developed, piloted, revised and rolled out by September 12, 2023, as targeted. P. 37 of the ICR states that the national pilot for the EMIS for primary and secondary schools was rolled out during May-September 2023, and that the EMIS was scaled up to at least 100 secondary schools. P. 18 of the ICR states that the creation of an open EMIS supported the creation of a national EMIS policy, master implementation plan, and a structured EMIS eco-system, harmonizing data collection efforts of all arms and branches of MOE including those of school administrations.

Outcomes.

The enrolment rate of secondary students in GSS in Regions 3 and 4 increased from a baseline of 87 percent on March 31, 2014, to 94 percent by June 30, 2023, surpassing the original target of 92 percent and meeting the revised target 94 percent.

Rating

Substantial

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

Overall efficacy is rated Substantial, with efficacy on Objective 1 (Strengthen the capacity of secondary school mathematics teachers nationwide) rated Substantial and efficacy on Objective 2 (Increase enrollment in General Secondary Schools in targeted regions) rated Substantial.

Overall Efficacy Rating

Substantial

5. Efficiency

Economic efficiency. The economic analysis performed at appraisal estimated the net present value (NPV) of the project at US$6.7 million using a discount rate of 5 percent and the internal rate of return (IRR) at 9 percent. The economic analysis performed at project closing considered a different set of assumptions than the ones relied upon at appraisal with (i) the total capital cost of the project and the additional financing to be equivalent to US$22.0 million, (ii) the project implementation period to be nine rather than five years, (iii) the revised number of high school and university graduates attributable to the project, and (iv) revised project maintenance costs. The results of the economic analysis performed at project closing revealed a NPV of US$6.59 million and an IRR of 2.58 percent, which is below the social discount rate of 5 percent.

Implementation efficiency. There were considerable cost overruns in construction and significant delays related to the teacher professional development initiatives under Component 1, as well as procedures for reviewing and revising the new GSS design and in procurement under Component 2. These delays limited the amount of project financing within the context of the depreciating exchange rate of the SDR against the U.S. and inflationary pressures on the economy, ultimately leading to an additional financing being approved. The COVID-19 pandemic and its associated shutdowns constrained project implementation, resulting in reduced ambitiousness in the civil works which were planned for the construction of a third GSS.

Efficiency Rating

Modest

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal	✓	9.00	0 ☐ Not Applicable
ICR Estimate	✓	2.58	0 ☐ Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

Outcome is rated Moderately Satisfactory, with the relevance of the PDO rated High, efficacy rated Substantial and efficiency rated Modest.

a. Outcome Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

The ICR states that the risks to sustaining development outcomes are considered low, with each project components supporting institutional strengthening. Component 1 activities supported the development of instruments, approaches, cohorts of teacher trainers, regulatory bodies, and policy, and the provision of teaching and learning materials that continue to be used today. Component 2 activities supported the construction of two GSSs providing access to 1,800 school students and the design of a third GSS, with the ICR stating that design consideration pertaining to facilities, amenities, accessibility and environmental resilience now serving as a model for future construction initiated by the MOE. Component 3 activities supported the creation of an EMIUS policy, master implementation plan, and a structured EMIS eco-system harmonizing data collection efforts across the MOE and school administrations.

The key risks to sustaining development outcomes consist of teacher assessments not being adequately used to improve teacher performance, which may undermine the sustainability of development outcomes. Further, the gender strategy adopted at the additional financing stage may not adequately address the much lower secondary school enrollment rate of male students compared to their female counterparts, which may undermine the sustainability of Objective 2 (Increase enrollment in general secondary schools in targeted regions).

8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The PDO was of strategic relevance to the country and sectoral contexts, being aligned with the government's ESP and the Bank-supported strategy. The design approach was also appropriate as it was based on good practices of in-service teacher training and incorporated pilots to test new ideas (such as the ICT-assisted learning). Implementation and M&E arrangements were adequate.

The MOE was identified as the implementing agency for the project, with the ministry encompassing significant experience implementing externally financed projects by the World Bank, the Inter-American Development and Education for All Fast Track Initiative. The Chief Education Officer of the MOE was charged with the technical responsibilities for implementation. The Planning Unit of the Ministry of Education was charged with the fiduciary responsibilities of the project, with the Unit already handling all financial management and procurement related matters pertaining to the Improving Teacher Education

Project and the University of Guyana Science and Technology Support Project (P125288) which was still being delivered at the time of appraisal.

A Project Coordinator was hired and stationed at the MOE's Planning Unit. The core responsibilities of the Project Coordinator consisted of: (i) managing, monitoring, and coordinating project implementation, including work planning, procurement, accounting, disbursement, and financial management; (ii) reporting on project implementation progress to the MOE's Chief Planning Officer; (iii) supervising agreed work plans with the technical leads for each subcomponent; and (iv) coordinating implementation across MOE departments. The Project Coordinator was also charged with preparing/consolidating information for Quarterly and Annual Progress Reports. The existing fiduciary staff in the MOE Planning Unit managing other Bank-financed projects were also charged with similar responsibilities linked to this project. One project engineer was also hired to enhance the technical capacity of the MOE to supervise the design, implementation and supervision of civil works activities.

There were moderate shortcomings in the quality-at-entry. The ICR (p. 23) reported that there was inadequate preparation of some activities, such as for the construction of GSS and training design which subsequently resulted in delays, and also resulted in other implementation challenges, particularly with the EdTech pilot. The ICR reported issues with PIU staffing readiness. Concerning risks, the ICR reported that, while the overall risk assessment was generally adequate, the risk analysis in the PAD understated the risks associated with procurement processes and procedures involved in civil works and the construction of GSSs under the project (ICR, p. 22).

Quality-at-Entry Rating
Moderately Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision
The Bank provided adequate supervision of the project, with supervision missions being held every six months, which identified and resolved problems and which were well documented through Implementation Supervision Reports and aide-memoires. The posting of a Resident Representative in Guyana since 2022 also supported Bank supervision.

The depreciation of the SDR against the U.S. dollar and COVID-19 pandemic-related shutdowns resulted in a financing gap which needed to be financed through additional financing, as well as implementation delays. A number of implementation challenges faced by the project and subsequent delays could have been prevented by proactive supervision and had the project closed as originally planned in March 2020, COVID-19 related issues would have been avoided.

There were minor shortcomings in quality of supervision. The Bank Team did not illustrate a theory of change in the additional financing. While a new gender indicator was incorporated at the additional financing stage to monitor progress in gender inequity in secondary school enrollment, the gender strategy could have been better documented and expanded upon. The Bank later clarified that competing priorities related to the COVID-19 pandemic and construction delays limited the development of gender strategies at the regional level to increase boys' school enrollment. And while some school directors developed gender strategies which they applied to their respective schools, this experience could have been better documented by the Project Implementation Unit and the Bank such that lessons learned may be applied to

other schools. The Bank further added that re-enrollment efforts following the COVID-19 pandemic were not gender-specific and that in hindsight, the Bank may have supported a gender enrollment strategy, as well as the need of making context specific efforts to increase enrollment. This lesson was reflected in the Human Capital Project (P177741), which specifically addresses demand-side constraints to male student participation.

Quality of Supervision Rating
Moderately Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating
Moderately Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design
The objectives were clearly stated. The indicators in the results framework adequately measured progress toward the achievement of the PDO, with results indicators being well defined, having clear baselines and targets, being guided by a sound measurement methodology, data source, and frequency, and with the entity charged with the collection responsibility being identified at appraisal. The theory of change was not presented in the PAD as this was not a requirement at the time of appraisal. P. 7 of the ICR, however, constructed the theory of change implicit in the project (ICR, p. 7).

The results framework was appropriately revised to reflect changes induced by the additional financing at the fourth restructuring. Data gaps related to Bank corporate concerns related to climate change, gender, citizen engagement and the corporate results indicator on the number of students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning (including gender-disaggregated data) were incorporated at the fourth restructuring, resulting in five new indicators being added to the results framework.

b. M&E Implementation
The MOE's Planning Unit was charged with the M&E implementation. Quarterly and annual progress reports were shared with the Bank which, in addition to monitoring progress on results framework indicators, also reported on Grade 9 and Caribbean Secondary Examinations Certificate Mathematics exam results and dropout rates. Progress toward the achievement of project outcomes was also assessed during implementation supervisions missions which included the Bank supervision team and the MOE's Planning Unit, with the results being reported in the 17 Implementation Status and Results Reports and interim aide-memoires. The roll-out of the open EMIS at the end of the project supported the Planning Unit's M&E capacity.

c. M&E Utilization

The project's results measured through the M&E framework supported project management and evidence-based policymaking. The pilot EMIS deployed in some schools allowed corrective measures to be undertaken with, for example, the additional financing leading to the procurement of STEM textbooks such that students could continue to learn independently from home in the aftermath of the COVID-19 pandemic given that a significant portion of students lacked access to IT equipment and connectivity at home. P. 25 of the ICR states that the first phase of the national rollout of the open EMIS was underway at project closing.

M&E Quality Rating

Substantial

10. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

The project was classified as Category B for Environmental Assessment. The project triggered environmental safeguard OP/BP 4.01 (Environmental Assessment) due to the construction of GSS under Component 2 activities. The environmental assessment revealed that environmental impacts would be relatively minor and localized, and that they could be mitigated using standard methods. The additional financing resulted in additional safeguards indicators being added to meet Gender and Citizen Engagement requirements.

Problems pertaining to social safeguards were observed, with one of the two GSS contractors (i.e., the Good Hope contractor) failing to develop an action plan to improve safety on school construction sites, resulting in workers incurring foot injuries and a fractured arm at the Good Hope site. Further, neither one of the sites complied with COVID-19 health and safety requirements, such as providing protective equipment. The government ultimately terminated the contract with the contractor at the Good Hope site due to its failure to maintain a security review and delays in the construction process. All of the ISRs rated overall safeguards in the satisfactory range, except for the February 16, 2021, ISR which rated it Moderately Unsatisfactory. The overall ISR rating for safeguards as recorded in the Operations Portal was Moderately Satisfactory.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

Annual audit reports, which were released on time, did not reveal any significant irregularities. Reporting standards and protocols were considered adequate, and interim unqualified financial reports were submitted to the Bank promptly and followed the prescribed procedures.

There were delays in procurement processes in the early stages of implementation despite the fact that p. 26 of the ICR noted that the PIU procurement staff were competent and followed the Bank's procurement procedures. The Periodic Procurement Risk Assessments conducted by the Bank did not flag any non-compliance issues necessitating the Bank's intervention. ISRs rated performance on financial management and procurement in the satisfactory range during the project implementation period.

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

None noted.

d. Other

None noted.

11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
Bank Performance	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderate shortcomings on quality-at-entry and implementation pertaining to the lack of preparation of some project activities, the inadequate assessment of some risks, and the lack of a gender and context-specific strategy to increase boys' school enrollment. A number of the implementation challenges faced by the project and subsequent delays could have been prevented by proactive supervision by the Bank.
Quality of M&E	Substantial	Substantial	
Quality of ICR	---	Substantial	

12. Lessons

The ICR (pp. 28-30) offered several lessons and recommendations, including the following lessons restated by this ICR Review:

1. Project implementation that is guided by a clearly defined theory of change and measurable PDO level indicators and intermediate results indicators can support progress toward the achievement of objectives.

2. Project implementation can be supported by the various stakeholders agreeing on project requirements prior to project effectiveness. In this project, delays in approving revisions to training modules and revisions to school designs led to delays in the initial stages of implementation; and
3. Close collaboration between the Bank and client countries on addressing challenges pertaining to civil works can allow implementation challenges to be resolved expeditiously such that the implementation calendar is respected. In this project, construction delays led to significant cost overruns, which limited the amount of financing available.

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The **quality of analysis** was good, with activities linked to outputs and outcomes through a credible theory of change, supporting the ICR's **results orientation** quality. **Lessons were based on evidence and analysis**, appropriately responding to the specific experiences and findings of the project. The ICR did not report whether the project complied with the Bank's safeguards and fiduciary policies.

a. **Quality of ICR Rating**
Substantial