

Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Improvement Project (DUTP)
Aide-Memoire of Implementation Support Mission of March 8-22, 2024

A. Introduction

1. From March 8 to March 22, 2024, the World Bank mission team met with representatives of the Government of Tanzania for a joint technical review of the implementation progress of the Dar es Salaam Urban Transport Improvement Project (DUTP). The Mission would like to express its appreciation to the counterpart staff of President’s Office – Regional Administration and Local Government (PO-RALG), Ministry of Works (MoW), Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS), Dar Rapid Transit Agency (DART), Public-Private Partnership (PPP) Centre, Land Transport Regulatory Authority (LATRA), and Engineer’s Registration Board (ERB).

2. The main objective of the mission was to review the project status and to explore ways for fast-tracking implementation of the core project activities. This Aide-Memoire records the major findings of the mission and agreements reached between the Government of Tanzania and the World Bank at the wrap-up meeting Co-chaired by the PS-Works and deputy PS-PORALG on March 22, 2024. The Aide Memoire contains the following annexes:

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Status of Agreed Actions of previous mission | 5. Fuel Technology for BRT Buses |
| 2. Technical Note to DART on PPP for BRT-1, 2, 3 and 4 | 6. List of persons Met and Mission members |
| 3. Fiduciary Management | 7. TANROADS Cost Forecast to completion |
| 4. Technical Summary of Site Visits | |

B. Project Data and Ratings

Key Data

IDA Financing	US\$ 450.8 m	IDA Disbursements	US\$ 238.14m (55.6%)	Counterpart Financing	US\$ 25.8m
Other Financing		Disbursement in FY24	US\$25.1m		
Board Approval Date	March 17, 2017	Effectiveness Date	June 13, 2017	Closing Date	April 30, 2026
Mission Start Date	March 8, 2024	Mission End Date	March 22, 2024	Site Visit Date(s)	March 13-21, 2024

Project Ratings

Description	Previous	Current
Progress to achieving Project Development Objective	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Implementation Progress	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Component 1: Establishment of the Third and Fourth Phases of the Dar es Salaam BRT Systems	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Component 2: Improvement of the Ubungo Intersection and Complementary Road Safety Infrastructure for the BRT-1 System	Satisfactory	Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Component 3: Institutional Strengthening and Reform, ICT Innovation, Safety Net, and Transport Studies	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Project Management	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ▼
Financial Management	Satisfactory	Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Procurement	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Monitoring and Evaluation	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Social Safeguards	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory ◀ ▶
Environmental Safeguards	Moderately Satisfactory	Satisfactory ◀ ▶

Rating Trends: ▲ Improving; ▼ Deteriorating; ◀ ▶ No change.

Key Issues:

3. **The project ratings for implementation progress and development objectives remain Moderately Satisfactory.** Although the Ubungo interchange was completed in December 2020 and the third phase of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT-3) roadworks are on track to be completed in March 2025, the implementation of BRT-4 works is delayed. The challenges in BRT-4 road works contracts include (i) delayed mobilization by the three contractors, and (ii) non availability of sites for two BRT-4 bus depots as the budget for Mbuyuni BRT depot site was yet to be released and negotiations between DART and Ubungo municipality for acquisition of 'Simu-2000 BRT depot' site were yet to be concluded. However, there is good progress on the Public Private Partnership (PPP) procurement for BRT-1 bus operator as the PPP Steering Committee has approved resumption of the stalled April 2023 contract negotiations with the previously awarded bidder with negotiations currently expected to be completed by April 30, 2024. Further, the PPP bidding strategy for BRT-2 and the contracting of the IFC for structuring PPP operations for BRT-3 and BRT-4 are both expected to be completed by April 30, 2024.

Implementation Progress:

The Public Private Partnership (PPP) for the BRT-1 System

4. **The Government has decided to resume the 2023 stalled negotiations for PPP bus operations along the BRT-1.** The PPP Steering Committee that met on March 14, 2024, approved the resumption of negotiations with the previously awarded bidder, subject to a supportive Legal opinion (clearance) by the Attorney General. However, several legal, technical, and commercial issues were identified during the mission that require proper consideration and satisfactory resolution to guarantee the effective performance of the resulting contract. The pending issues include the need to clean up the draft contract agreement by (i) deleting clauses relating to unilateral rights of the contracting authority to terminate the contract prematurely, (ii) inserting a clause enabling international arbitration of contract disputes, in line with the PPP Amendment Act, 2023, (iii) resolving and freezing the price per kilometer of operation, (iv) confirming an acceptable financing arrangement by the bidder, (v) providing a payment guarantee by the Ministry of Finance (MoF) providing assurance of payments to the operator in case the fare box is not sufficient, and (vi) confirming and verifying the preferred bidder's project implementation plan, including the schedule for bus fleet delivery and the operational plan for the first year of operations. Confirmatory due diligence on the bidder also includes assessment of the onboard ITS system and the technical fitting of the Euro IV buses with specific diesel particulate filters. DART needs to reconstitute the negotiation team to ensure it has all the relevant skills, supported by the expertise of the transaction advisors. **Actions:** *The AG's Legal Opinion was issued on March 19, 2024, therefore DART, supported by transaction advisors, agreed to resume negotiations, and conclude by April 30, 2024. It was further agreed that DART will, by April 15, 2024, share with the World Bank evidence by both parties of extending the bid validity period and extension of bidder's bid security.*

Component 1: Establishment of the Third and Fourth Phases of the Dar es Salaam BRT Systems (US\$287.10 million)

5. **The construction of BRT-3 roadworks is progressing well but requires a 12-months contract extension for completion of works.** The physical progress of the (US\$100.2m) BRT-3 road works contract is currently 42% and financial progress is 31%. The BRT-3 road works have been delayed for about 12 months, mainly due to the design changes requested by DART. The design amendments were completed by the contractor in September 2023. The major works completed include 10km concrete pavement for exclusive BRT lanes, 7.2km of bituminous base mixed traffic lanes and substructures for 21 out of 28 bus stations, and 2 out of 3 feeder stations. However, the traffic management is still challenging, with two fatal accidents recorded on January 12, 2024, and February 29, 2024, that resulted in three fatalities. The 12-month extension addendum for the works contract was sent to the World Bank in February 2024, and the review process was scheduled for completion by the end of March 2024 after receiving additional information from TANROADS in mid-March 2024. **Actions:** *It was agreed that TANROADS will (i) submit to the World Bank by April 30, 2024 the signed addendum extending the supervision consultant's contract in line with the civil works contract extension, and (ii) conduct a root-cause analysis for the fatalities and submit the report to the World Bank by April 15, 2024. TANROADS will also ensure that the contractor will by April 15, 2024, have (i) strengthened the demarcation (fencing) between active work zones, moving traffic and surrounding communities/pedestrians, (ii) install reflective (flashing) lights along the concrete*

barriers, and (iii) provide an adequate number of flagmen guiding traffic especially at all crossings. Further, TANROADS is to liaise with Tanzania Railways Corporation-TRC (through MoW and MoT) to ensure the Standard Gauge Railway (SGR) excavated tunnel crossing the BRT-3 corridor is addressed by May 30, 2024.

6. **The Design and Build procurement for construction of Gongo-la-Mboto depot for BRT-3 (US\$20m) is under procurement.** TANROADS team was addressing World Bank comments and the prequalification assessment report is expected to be re-submitted by April 5, 2024. The mission was informed that the land grievance for the site has been fully resolved with DART being allocated a 24-acre area for the depot. **Actions:** *It was agreed that the contract award for the depot will be subject to DART securing a title deed for the land expected by May 30, 2024, and that (ii) By April 30, 2024, TANROADS will include the Banana and JNIA BRT feeder stations in the bid documents for design-and-build of the Gongo-la-Mboto depot.*

7. **There are delays in the implementation of the three BRT-4 works contracts (US\$186m) that commenced on November 1, 2023.** The scope of the three contracts is as follows: (i) Lot 1 - BRT road works along the CBD-Mwenge-Ubungo; (ii) Lot 2: BRT roadworks along Mwenge-Tegeta; and (iii) Lot 3: BRT depots at Simu2000 and Mbuyuni depots and BRT terminal at Kivukoni. Although five months have elapsed since the November 1, 2023 commencement date but all three contractors are still at the initial stages of mobilization and the establishment of camps. Furthermore, the current two supervision consulting teams have not fully mobilized as key members (Resident Engineers) were yet to be mobilized to the site. In September 2023, TANROADS had submitted a request for restructuring the supervision contract from two to three teams in line with the works contract – that was commented by the World Bank on October 15, 2023, and during the mission TANROADS were yet to resubmit the proposed Addendum. **Actions:** *It was agreed that TANROADS will (i) by March 29, 2024, issue a “Notice to Correct” to each of the three contractors for them to complete mobilization of staff, equipment, materials and camp facilities (e.g. laboratory establishment for contractor and engineer) and secure an approval of a resource-based program of works by April 30, 2024; (ii) submit to the World Bank a signed contract addendum for reorganization of the supervision team by April 30, 2024; (iii) issue a “Notice” to complete mobilization of key staff to the Consultant by April 30, 2024, (iv) ensure the BRT-4 contractors secure approval of traffic management plan, E&S documents and issue contracts to all workers by April 15, 2024, and (v) liaise with designs for lower Msimbazi dredging works to ensure adequacy of Selander bridge design.*

8. **The contractor for BRT-4 depots (Lot 3) cannot be provided with possession of site as land is yet to be acquired for the project.** The land for the two BRT-4 depot is yet to be acquired as (i) although the Ubungo municipality has preliminarily agreed to allocate 39,000 m² of Simu2000 site for a BRT-4 depot, the process for relocation of the petty traders market is yet to be concluded, and (ii) although the resettlement action plan (RAP) and valuation for Mbuyuni depot site have been completed, the budgeted TZS14.5 billion is yet to be released by the government. **Action:** *It was agreed that (i) DART and PO-RALG will follow up to address Simu2000 challenges to enable the contractor to be provided with possession of site by April 30, 2024, and (ii) PO-RALG will follow up with the Ministry of Finance to ensure the compensation budget for Mbuyuni depot is released by April 30, 2024.*

9. **The preparation of the PPP for operation of the BRT-2 is in advanced stage while the contracting of Transaction Advisors for BRT-3 and BRT-4 is ongoing.** The Transaction Advisors for BRT-2 PPP operation were expected to submit the draft feasibility studies report by March 30, 2024 and shared with the World Bank by April 15, 2024, including the procurement strategy, that will be reviewed and processed for approval by PPP Steering Committee by April 30, 2024. DART have also resumed contract negotiations with the International Finance Corporation (IFC) for transaction advisory services on the BRT-3 and BRT-4 and contract negotiations will be concluded by April 30, 2024. **Actions:** *It was agreed that DART will share with the World Bank (i) the BRT-2 feasibility studies report and the detailed procurement plan by April 15, 2024, and (ii) confirmation of signing the contract with the IFC transaction advisory team for BRT-3 and BRT-4, by April 30, 2024.*

10. **The strengthening of climate resilience of the BRT-4 corridor will require addressing the flooding challenges.** The detailed engineering design for addressing flooding at the Boko-Basihaya BRT-4 section was completed in 2023. The flooding challenges would require improvement of crossing structures along the BRT-4 corridor and provision of drainage structures/channels to the ocean (about 2km from the corridor) with an estimated cost of about US\$22m. **Action:** *It was agreed that TANROADS will, by April 15, 2024, inform the World Bank of the procurement strategy for implementation of the flood control works.*

Development of Automated Fare Collection and Intelligent Transportation Systems

11. **Development of Automated Fare Collection System (AFCS) has progressed well but division of responsibility between the consultant and DART has introduced risks for system completion.** The Consultant, GSD-Plus, is providing consultancy services for supporting the development, deployment of in-house government automated fare collection system (GOT-AFCS), testing, integration with other components, and capacity building of the DART development team. The station gates and validators for BRT-1 were contracted to M/S Trapeze and the GSD-Plus have submitted the design document for EMV¹ cards. Back-office software and the Clearing House System is to be developed by DART but has not yet been completed. **Actions:** *It was agreed that DART will, (i) by April 30, 2024, inform the World Bank on any needed additional support to complete the back-office system and its integration with the front-end system developed by the GSD-Plus, and (ii) submit to the World Bank the draft bidding documents for operation of the fare collection system by April 15, 2024.*

12. **Functional designs, specifications, and bills of quantities have been prepared for the Intelligent Transportation System (ITS); however, coordination between ITS and AFCS consultants is required.** Coordination with the AFCS consultant is required to validate assumptions on the power and communication requirements of the AFCS. **Actions:** *The World Bank team will, by April 30, 2024, mobilize a Traffic Signal Specialist to review the level of detail of the Area Traffic Control design and specifications, which was noted to be less detailed than similar World Bank projects in the region. It was also agreed that (i) DART will share with the World Bank the final design of the BRT control center by April 15, 2024, that also include an additional floor for accommodating the TANROADS BRT team, and (ii) TANROADS will exclude the ITS infrastructure at the BRT terminals and stations from the ongoing works contracts so that they are packaged separately.*

Transit Oriented Developments (TOD) and Clean Energy for BRT Buses

13. **The selection process of Transaction Advisors for structuring of a PPP package for development of two TOD hubs is at technical evaluation stage.** The procurement of Transaction Advisors for structuring a PPP for development of two hubs (Gerezani and Kivukoni) is ongoing. **Action:** *It was agreed that DART will submit to the World Bank the Technical Evaluation Report by April 15, 2024.*

14. **The BRT infrastructure is being prepared for potential use of Compressed Natural Gas (CNG) and electricity, but the operation of the BRT-1 buses will initially continue to use the originally planned Euro-IV diesel fuel.** The Euro IV standards allow much higher emissions of oxides of nitrogen (NOx) than current EU or US emission standards. Limiting particulate emissions set in the Euro IV standards could be adhered to when a diesel particulate filter is used. With these filters intact and operating, particulate emissions should be low enough so as not to be a significant health hazard. However, diesel particulate filters' self-cleaning (regeneration) mechanism requires periodic maintenance, and the filters are therefore liable to crack and disintegrate when overloaded and are expensive to replace. With a properly functioning filter, there should be no emission of visible smoke and the interior of the exhaust pipe will be clean. Any occurrence of visible smoke or the presence of soot in the exhaust pipe indicates filter failure, and the need for replacement. **Action:** *It was agreed that DART will inspect the buses on their arrival to confirm that they are equipped with these filters and confirm that the Operator has a credible periodic maintenance and replacement plan of such filters over the contract life.*

Component 2: Improvement of the Ubungo Intersection and Complementary Road Safety Infrastructure for the BRT-1 System (US\$99.90 million)

15. **The pending activity under this component is the implementation of the two BRT-1 complementary road safety works contracts that are still at mobilization stage.** These works are further to the Ubungo interchange that was completed in 2020 and their scope is as follows: Package A - widening of Ubungo-Kimara road section and ancillary works along Morogoro and Kawawa roads, and Package B - rehabilitation of a section of Obama Drive including integration of ferry access to Kivukoni bus terminal and junctions along Msimbazi street. Although the 3 months mobilization periods for Package A and B started on November 1, 2023, and January 1, 2024, respectively, the two contractors are yet to fully mobilize key staff, equipment, and materials. Further, the supervision consultant is also yet to fully mobilize key staff. TANROADS also informed the mission that some of the road links under the contract have already been implemented through Tanzania Rural and Urban Roads Agency (TARURA). **Actions:** *It was agreed that TANROADS will follow up to*

¹ The EMV means 'Europay, Mastercard, and Visa'

ensure: (i) the supervision consulting team is fully mobilized by April 15, 2024; (ii) the contractors are issued with a “Notice to correct” for mobilizing staff, equipment, materials and camp facilities by April 30, 2024, (iii) the contractors prepare an acceptable resource-based program of works and secure an approval by consultant by April 15, 2024; and (iv) all upgraded road links are excluded from the contracts through an amendment to both contracts by April 30, 2024.

Component 3: Institutional Strengthening and Reform, ICT Innovation, Safety Net, and Transport Studies (US\$38.00 million)

16. **The consultancy contract for providing technical assistance to TANROADS is ending in June 2024.** Apart from a replacement firm to be procured, TANROADS will also initiate selection of additional Individual Consultants. **Actions:** *TANROADS agreed to finalize drafting of TORs for a new technical assistance firm and launch the Expressions of Interest (EOIs) by April 30, 2024, and concurrently initiate the selection process of Individual consultants also by April 15, 2024.*

17. **The selection process for a technical assistance firm to support DART is due to be launched in April 2024.** The World Bank cleared the ToR for engaging a firm to provide full-time and on-call technical support to DART. **Action:** *It was agreed that DART will finalize the TORs and launch the EOIs by April 15, 2024.*

18. **The transformation of DART is still at the government decision-making levels of the government.** The package on the transformation of DART to an urban public transport authority is still at PO-RALG for processing for a Government decision. **Action:** *It was agreed that the final decision by the Government will be communicated with the World Bank by July 30, 2024.*

19. **Capacity strengthening of LATRA:** It was agreed that the World Bank team will, by June 30, 2024, organize a knowledge sharing brainstorming sessions on the practical experience for transformation of commuter minibus sector in selected sub-Saharan African countries and best practice examples of how other countries created cable transport system. **Action:** *LATRA will draft TORs of Individual Consultant(s) for BRT regulation, BRT licensing, and BRT fare setting by April 30, 2024.*

20. **The support for Structured Engineers Apprenticeship Program (SEAP) under the project is near completion.** So far 433 graduate engineers have benefited from the project support with 421 of them completing the course (211 male and 210 female). Out of those that completed, 199 have been registered as professional engineers (108 male and 91 female). A total of TZS 6,168,756,259 and US\$63,967 have been spent to date (2018-2023). **Action:** *Although there is good progress in addressing the recommendations of the SEAP Sustainability Report, it was agreed that the Engineers Registration Board (ERB) will continue following up to ensure all 22 recommendations get completed by August 30, 2024.*

21. **Project management and governance challenges have delayed implementation of project activities.** Apart from capacity strengthening through provision of Technical Assistance (Consultants) and provision of training through the project, a high turn-over of TANROADS and DART regular staff have impacted the project. **Actions:** *It was agreed that TANROADS and DART will by June 30, 2024, provide performance-based contracts to all regular staff working for the project to ensure transparency when they get rotated. At the same time, the World Bank team will conduct a fiduciary workshop for all technical, procurement and financial management staff of transport projects on April 15 and 16, 2024.*

Fiduciary

22. **The overall Financial Management (FM) performance rating remains Satisfactory.** The FM risk rating assigned to the project remains Moderate (M). The project is up to date in the submission of the Interim Unaudited Financial Reports (IFRs) which are acceptable to the World Bank. The total disbursements for the project to date are US\$213m equivalent to 92.2% for IDA 59570 and US\$25.1m equivalent to 12.6% for IDA 59580. The government has also disbursed to the project US\$6.4m of its US\$25.8m commitment. Overall disbursement is therefore US\$244.6m and the overall disbursement rate is 54.3%. Expenditure up to February 29, 2024, is US\$213.7m and the utilization rate is 87% of the total disbursed amount and 47% of the total loan. The budget for the current quarter is US\$66.51 million.

23. **The overall procurement performance rating remains Moderately Satisfactory.** The main challenge facing both TANROADS and DART is close monitoring of the ongoing contracts and processing of the remaining packages within the project’s extended period. This is due to the inefficiencies in processing procurement activities and delays in decision making process. Both agencies were asked to submit time-bound action plans for processing procurement activities in the previous mission, but they failed to do so. **Actions:** *Given the number of procurement packages to be processed and ongoing contracts to be supervised between now and closure of the project, it was agreed that both agencies will: (i)*

identify packages to be processed and those that are ongoing and prepare a time-bound action plan for each package and share with the World Bank by April 15, 2024; (ii) address inefficiencies and expedite decision making ensure approvals are granted timely; (iii) establish a sound management and strengthening contract management capability in the agencies; and (iv) ensure that vendors are paid timely. Annex 3 provides more details on fiduciary.

Environmental and Social Safeguards

24. **Environmental Safeguards:** Environmental, social, health and safety (ESHS) risk management for BRT-3 contract is well coordinated as reflected in the February 2024 progress report. However, there was delayed reporting of two fatal accidents. It was agreed that TANROADS will henceforth ensure (i) timely reporting of all incidents and accidents in the project areas; (ii) assign relevant and experienced ESHS staff; and (iii) enhance supervision of all contracts under BRT-4 for timely integration of ESHS risk management. The mission noted delays in the preparation of contractors' site-specific Environmental and Social Management Plans (C-ESMPs), including health and safety risk management measures, which are required prior to commencement of physical works. Apart from BRT-4 Lot 1, key ESHS staff for the other BRT-4 and BRT-1 contracts are not fully mobilized.

25. **Social Safeguards:** The BRT-4 Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) was cleared by the World Bank and disclosed by TANROADS on March 19, 2024. The Chief Valuer approved the valuation report for BRT-4 and the pending activity is the compensation fund from the MoF, along with the verification process. DART is to prepare a Temporary Relocation Plan to guide the relocation of traders at the identified Simu2000 depot site. All contractors were requested to ensure that all workers have contracts reviewed by the Government Labor Officer with signed Code of Conducts prior to work.

26. **On BRT-3, the Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) is functional, and the Contractor continues to report and work on the grievances received from both workers and surrounding communities.** TANROADS should form and make functional the internal and external grievance redress committees for BRT-4. The mission was informed that the One-Stop Center had conducted an awareness session at the BRT-3 camp in February 2024 whereby the referral pathway for Gender-Based Violence/Sexual Harassment/Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (GBV/SH/SEA) were explained to the workers. This needs to be replicated in BRT-4 and BRT-1 to ensure that workers and community understand what GBV/SH is and the reporting mechanism and referral pathways. The social safeguards remain **Moderately Satisfactory**.

Donor Coordination and Engagement with Civil Society Organizations

27. **During the mission, a Donor Coordination meeting was conducted with the French Development Agency (FDA) and Institute of Transportation Development Policy (ITDP) to discuss support for urban mobility in Dar es Salaam.** It was agreed that the development partners supporting urban mobility will continue coordinating their activities biannually.

28. **The European Investment Bank (EIB) has expressed interest in co-financing the additional financing for DUTP cost overruns.** An official request letter to EIB from the Ministry of Finance is to be shared with EIB by May 30, 2024, to enable the EIB team to participate in the forthcoming DUTP additional financing preparation mission.

Retrofitting of the Project Indicators

29. As part of the new initiative of streamlining results monitoring for World Bank-supported projects, the existing indicator *'Percentage of population of Dar es Salaam residents with access to the city center within 60 minutes commuting period by public transport through BRT phases 1, 3, and 4 corridors'* is planned to be retrofitted to a corporate indicator *'Millions of people that benefit from improved access to sustainable transport infrastructure and services.'*

Cost Forecast to Completion

30. **TANROADS shared with the World Bank team the overall Expenditure Forecast to completion of all project activities showing an estimated cost overrun of US\$142.9m.** The estimates will be reviewed by the World Bank team and share its comments by April 15, 2024. The summary is attached as Annex 7.

Next Steps and Agreed Actions

31. The World Bank team will conduct a follow up technical mission in June 2024 to assess the status of implementation of the key agreed actions as shown in Table 1 and the next implementation support mission is planned for August/September 2024.

Table 1: Critical Agreed Actions

Actions	Responsibility	Date
New Issues and Actions Required		
Component 1: Establishment of the Third and Fourth Phases of the Dar es Salaam BRT Systems		
Resume and conclude the stalled April 2023 negotiations with the previously awarded bidder	DART	April 30, 2024.
Share with the World Bank evidence by both parties of extending the bid validity period and extension of bidder's bid security	DART	April 15, 2024
Share with the World Bank (i) the BRT-2 feasibility studies report and the detailed procurement plan by April 15, 2024, and (ii) the terms of reference for the IFC transaction advisory services for BRT-3 and BRT-4	DART	April 15, 2024
Submit to the World Bank a signed addendum extending the supervision consultant's contract.	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Conduct a root-cause analysis for the BRT-3 fatalities and submit the report to the World Bank	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
TANROADS to ensure that the contractor will (i) strengthen the demarcation (fencing) between active work zones, moving traffic and surrounding communities/pedestrians, (ii) install reflective (flashing) lights along the concrete barriers, and (iii) provide an adequate number of flagmen guiding traffic especially at all crossings.	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Liaise with TRC (through MoW and MoT) to ensure the SGR excavated tunnel crossing the BRT-3 corridor is addressed.	TANROADS	May 30, 2024
Submit to the World Bank the prequalification assessment report for Gongo-la-Mbototo depot.	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Include the Banana and JNIA BRT feeder stations in the bid documents for design-and-build of the Gongo-la-Mbototo depot	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Submit to the World Bank a copy of the title deed for the 24-acre site for the Gongo-la-Mbototo depot	DART	May 30, 2024
Issue a "Notice to Correct" to each of the three BRT-4 contractors for them to complete mobilization of staff, equipment, materials, and camp facilities.	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Secure an approval of a resource-based program of BRT-4 works	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Launch EOI for PMC to TANROADS	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Launch the selection process of Individual Consultants to TANROADS	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Submit to the World Bank a signed addendum for restructured BRT-4 Supervision	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Issue a "Notice" to complete mobilization of key staff to the BRT-4 Consultant	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Ensure the BRT-4 contractors secure approval of traffic management plan, E&S documents and issue contracts to all workers	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Liaise with designs for lower Msimbazi dredging works to ensure adequacy of Selander bridge design in the BRT-4 design	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Follow up to address SIMU-2000 challenges to enable the contractor to be provided with possession of site	PO-RALG & DART	April 30, 2024
Follow up with the Ministry of Finance to ensure the compensation budget for Mbuyuni depot is released	PO-RALG & DART	April 30, 2024
Inform the World Bank of the procurement strategy for implementation of the flood control works.	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Share with the World Bank the Feasibility studies report for BRT-2 operations	DART	April 15, 2024
Share with the World Bank confirmation of signing contract with IFC for BRT-3 and 4 operations	DART	April 30, 2024
Finalization of AFCS back-end software and clearing house system and integration with EVM and closed loop fare card systems	DART	June 30, 2024
Integration of BRT station infrastructure requirements for AFCS and ITS	DART	May 30, 2024?
Inform the World Bank on any needed additional support to the completion of the back-office system and its integration with the front-end system developed by the GSDplus	DART	April 30, 2024
Submit to the World Bank the draft bidding documents for operation of the Fare Collection system	DART	April 15, 2024
Mobilize a Traffic Signal Specialist to review the level of detail of the Area Traffic Control design and specifications	World Bank	April 30, 2024
Share with the World Bank the final design of the BRT control center that will also include an additional floor for accommodating the TANROADS BRT team	DART	April 15, 2024

Exclude the ITS infrastructure at the BRT terminals and stations from the ongoing works contracts so that they are packaged separately	TANROADS	May 15, 2024
Submit to the World Bank the TOD Transaction Advisors Technical Evaluation Report	DART	April 15, 2024
Component 2: Improvement of the Ubungo Intersection and Complementary Road Safety Infrastructure for the BRT-1 System		
Follow up to ensure the supervision consulting team is fully mobilized	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Issue the contractors with a “Notice to correct” for mobilizing staff, equipment, materials and camp facilities	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Follow up to ensure the contractors prepare an acceptable resource-based program of works and secure approval by consultant		April 15, 2024
Exclude all improved road links from the contracts through an amendment to both contracts	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Component 3: Institutional Strengthening and Reform, ICT Innovation, Safety Net, and Transport Studies		
Finalize drafting of TORs for a new technical assistance firm and launch EOIs	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Initiate the selection process of Individual consultants	TANROADS	April 15, 2024
Finalize the TORs for engaging a firm to provide full-time and on-call technical support and launch the EOIs	DART	April 15, 2024
Share with the World Bank the final decision by the Government on the transformation of DART to an urban public transport authority	DART	July 30, 2024
Draft TORs of Individual Consultant(s) for BRT regulation, BRT licensing and BRT fare setting	LATRA	April 30, 2024
Continue following up to ensure all 22 recommendations on SEAP Sustainability get completed	ERB	August 30, 2024
Provide performance-based contracts to all regular staff working for the project to ensure transparency when they get rotated. the World Bank team will	TANROADS & DART	June 30, 2024
Conduct a Fiduciary workshop for all technical, procurement and financial management staff of transport projects	World Bank	April 15 and 16, 2024
Fiduciary Management		
Conduct an internal audit review on the DUTP project and issue report	TANROADS	April 30, 2024
Submit IFR for quarter ending March 2024	TANROADS	May 14, 2024
Identify packages to be processed and those that are ongoing and prepare a time-bound action plan for each package and share with the World Bank	TANROADS & DART	April 15, 2024
Environmental and Social Safeguards		
Expedite approval of Contractors’ Site Specific Environmental Social Management Plans (C-ESMP) including health and safety risk management.	TANROADS	April 30,2024

Annex 1: Status of Critical Agreed Actions of Previous Mission

Actions	Responsibility	Date	Status
<i>Previous Issue and Actions Required</i>			
BRT-1 PPP for Bus operations: Share with the World Bank a letter from the Government clarifying on the Government way-forward decision on the PPP for BRT-1 bus operations	PS-PORALG	Nov 15, 2023	Pending. Govt position to be given by end March 2024
BRT-3 Works contract: Follow up to ensure the works program is updated by the contractor and agreed with the supervision consultant	TANROADS	Nov 15, 2023	Done
BRT-3 works contract: trigger the relevant contractual clauses if the contractor is unable to address (shipment evidence) the delays in mobilization of Bitumen for the project	TANROADS	Nov 30, 2023	Contractor mobilized bitumen adequate for ongoing activities
BRT3 supervision: Follow up with the supervision firm to ensure the Resident Engineer (RE) position that has been vacant since early August 2023 is filled	TANROADS	Nov 15, 2023	Done. The RE returned sick leave on Nov 30, 2023.
Timeline to Completion: Share with the World Bank a workplan with clear milestones to prove that all activities under DUTP will be completed within the extended implementation time requested	TANROADS	Nov 15, 2023	Done on Nov 14, 2023
BRT-3 Bus Depot: Submit to the World Bank the prequalification evaluation report for review.	TANROADS	Nov 30, 2023	Done on Jan 29, 2024, submission of the revised expected on March 22, 2024
BRT-4 Contracts: Complete due diligence process and complete the Advance Payment processing requested by the three contractors	TANROADS	Oct 30, 2023	Done. Adv. Pay issued to all BRT 4 contractors
Cost Analysis of Procurement and contract implementation Delays: conduct a desk analysis of cost of delays in the procurement and implementation of the contracts under the project	TANROADS	Nov 30, 2023	-
BRT-1 Bus operations PPP: subject to receipt of the Govt decision, with assistance of the TA, complete the updating of the RFQ, RFP and FSR and submit to the World Bank for review	DART	Nov 1, 2023	Ongoing. RFQ, RFP & FSR to be updated to suit revised PPP Act
BRT-1 Fare collector PPP: submit to the World Bank the draft bidding package for BRT-1 FC operator	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Not Done. To be shared by March 30, 2024
Short term arrangements for addressing the deteriorating services of BRT-1 operations: submit to the World bank the short-term strategy for addressing quality of service challenges	DART	Nov 1, 2023	
PPP for BRT-2 operations: Liaise with the Government and develop a strategy for operations of the BRT-2 buses.	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Ongoing
PPP for BRT-3 and BRT-4 bus operations: Liaise with the IFC advisory team (transaction advisors) and submit to the World Bank the roadmap (timeline) for processing the BRT-3 and BRT-4 PPP operations.	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Ongoing. Meeting between IFC & DART CE to be held by end of March 2024
Development of Fare collection system: complete negotiations and submit to the World Bank a draft contract for supply of Gates and Validators for review	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Done. Signed with M/s TRAPEZE SA Pty
Development of Fare Collection system: complete incorporating World Bank comments and resubmit the GSDplus contract addendum for review	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Done. Addendum signed with GSDplus
Intelligent Transportation system (ITS): conduct a workshop to share with PMC all ITS initiatives by DART, TANROADS, etc	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Done
Intelligent Transportation system (ITS): appoint two counterpart staff to guide the PMC	DART & TANROADS	Nov 15, 2023	Done, 4 TANROADS staff (1 each from ICT, BRT, RMO & Road safety)
Intelligent Transportation system (ITS): share a revised control center design in which the two floors of control center are fully completed	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Done. Pending advertisement.
Transit oriented developments (TOD): complete the incorporation of World Bank comments and resubmit the RFP for review	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Done. RFP was issued, the shortlisted firms were non-

			responsive. To be re-advertised.
TANROADS Technical Assistance: Review the needs of core key staff proposed for short-term extension including cost consequences and share with the World Bank	TANROADS	Nov 15, 2023	Done via an Addendum 8. Renardet's contract will expire on June 30, 2024.
TANROADS TA: Submit draft TORs for review and initiate selection process	TANROADS	Nov 30, 2023	Done. Clearance to proceed issued on March 15, 2024
DART TA: Submit draft TORs for review and clearance	DART	Nov 15, 2023	Done
Updated ESIA for BRT-4: Complete the World Bank review process and share feedback with TANROADS	World Bank	Nov 15, 2023	Done
Updated RAP for BRT-4: Complete the World Bank review process and share feedback with TANROADS	World Bank	Nov 15, 2023	Done
Agreed actions prior the previous missions			
COMPONENT 1: Establishment of BRT3 and 4			
BRT-1 PPP Operations			
Gongo la Mboto depot site: Inform the World Bank on the Government allocated site for Gongo la Mboto BRT depot.	DART (PS-PORALG)	Mar 30, 2023	Done
BRT-1 Automatic Fare Collection System (AFCS): Complete the Central System Software Development	DART	Febr 28, 2023	Not Completed
BRT Bus Energy: CNG & Electricity: Establish inter-agency coordination Steering and Technical Committees and inform the Bank	DART	Dec 31, 2022	Done
BRT Bus Energy: CNG & Electricity: Recruit the individual consultant	DART	Jan 30, 2023	
COMPONENT 3: Institutional Strengthening and Reform, ICT Innovation, Safety Net, and Transport Studies			
Share with the World Bank the Concept Note for transformation of Daladalas in Dar es Salaam and Dodoma by June 30, 2023	LATRA	June 30, 2023	Done
Capacity Strengthening of DART: Nominate 7 to 8 staff to attend the Leaders in Urban Transport Planning (LUTP) training program which will be customized to four East African Cities: Dar es Salaam, Kigali, Nairobi and Kampala	DART	June 15, 2023	Past Due date
Capacity Strengthening of LATRA: Share with the Bank the strategy for addressing priority areas identified during the knowledge sharing workshop	DART/LATRA	Jan 1, 2023	
BRT GBV Impact evaluation: Finalize the initial results of Measuring the incidence and reporting of Violence against Women in Public Transport	World Bank	June 30, 2023	Done. Interventions deployed based on the initial results. endline data to be collected from April 2024
FIDUCIARY MANAGEMENT			
Complete recruitment of procurement interns	TANROADS	Feb 28, 2023	DELAYED
SAFEGUARDS			
Land scaping Plan including replanting/planting of suitable trees	TANROADS	July 15, 2023	-
Submit detailed informative ESHS progress reports	TANROADS	June 30, 2023	-
RAP Implementation: Present issues regarding the unavailability of sites for BRT-3 and BRT 4 to the Steering Committee of the project in the upcoming meeting to get resolutions and way-forward guidance	DART/TANROADS	Jan 30, 2023	Issue on site still pending.
Share with the World Bank the provisional plans: Health and Safety Management Plan (HSMP); Grievances Management Policy, Grievances Management Policy, Sexual Harassment Policy, and Community Engagement Plan	TANROADS	Mar 15, 2023	-
COMMUNICATION			
Reconstitute the crisis communication management team	DART	Dec 15, 2022	
Conduct a communication workshop with DART management	World Bank	Dec 31, 2022	DELAYED

The Public Private Partnership (PPP) for BRT-1 Bus Operation

1. **The Mission learnt that the Attorney General has approved resumption of the 2023 stalled negotiations for PPP bus operations in respect of phase one of the BRT.** The PPP Steering Committee at its meeting held on March 14, 2024, approved the resumption of negotiations with the previously awarded bidder, subject to the Attorney General's legal clearance for the same.

2. **The Mission concluded that it will be necessary to ensure all the legal, technical, and commercial issues that were not concluded at the time the earlier negotiations stopped in April 2023,** and documented below, are properly and satisfactorily resolved, to guarantee the effective performance of the anticipated contract. **The key issues** jointly identified by the World Bank and DART during the Mission are:

- ***Need to clean up the draft Project Agreement***, including by deleting clauses relating to unilateral rights of the Contracting Authority to terminate the project agreement, insertion of a clause enabling international arbitration of contract disputes, in line with the PPP Amendment Act, 2023, inclusion of a sunset date by which the Operator needs to begin bus operations with a specified minimum number of buses and a condition precedent on submission of a DART approved bus delivery schedule, reviewing provisions on condition precedent, performance failure, cure periods, remedies, step in rights of lenders, dispute resolution timeline etc.
- ***Confirming and freezing of the Per Kilometer Charge (the Price)***, to stabilize the basis for the reliable calculation and estimation of the viability gap funding requirement under the Project. DART would need to also assess the impact of any indexation provisions (for fuel price etc.) in the Agreement on the per Kilometer charge post execution of the Agreement and the resultant VGF requirements. The impact of any tax concessions for FDI based on the PPP Act amendments would also need to be considered.
- ***Confirmation of the Preferred Bidder's financing plan***, and preparation of a proper risk-adjusted internal financial model to serve as a reference tool throughout the life of the Project;
- ***Structuring and provision of a Ministry of Finance Payments Guarantee***, and
- ***Confirmation and verification of the Preferred Bidder's project implementation plan***, particularly its intended **Bus Delivery Schedule** and its **Year 1 Operational Plan**.
- ***Review all minutes of negotiations and discussions with Bidder to ensure that agreed positions are reflected in the Agreement and per Kilometer charge.***

3. **The Mission noted the necessity for DART to constitute the negotiations team with all relevant skills, including onboarding subject matter specialists from other government agencies as necessary, and involving the transaction advisors (TA) in all phases of the remaining engagements with the Preferred Bidder.** A representative of the Attorney General's Department and PPP Centre should be part of the negotiating team as well. The TA should assist DART prepare draft language for all project agreement clauses needing to be amended, negotiating positions on the outstanding commercial issues including those outlined above, and assisting DART prepare viability gap funding estimates to inform the structuring of the Ministry of Finance's guarantee required by the Preferred Bidder to achieve financial close on the Project. ***It was agreed that—***

- ***DART would invite the TA to be physically present in Dar es Salaam ahead of, and during, the anticipated renegotiations with the Preferred Bidder. Of critical importance is ensuring the TA team composition is robust: the TA international finance experts, and the TA international legal counsel, should at the minimum be the core team to spearhead the final negotiations with the Preferred Bidder.***
- ***TA and DART negotiating team to jointly prepare the comprehensive list of issues to be included in the negotiation agenda, negotiating positions and alternative positions, the preferred draft language for the preferred negotiated position for validation with the Bidder, and undertake joint preparatory activities to get the negotiating team ready to engage the Bidder.***

- **Project risk allocation matrix to be revisited** to ensure continued risk balance, including considering the contractual interfaces between the PPP Operator and other contracts along the BRT-1 (Station Management, Security Services, Fare Collection, Depot Occupation Licenses, etc)
- **TA to help DART prepare an internal financial model detailing all key financial and macro assumptions**, which should aid DART estimate the viability gap funding requirements and the carrying out of sensitivity analyses on the Per Km Price (based on revenue and cost assumptions). DART should also engage their external Financial Modeler (engaged previously) to assist in this process and interface with TA Financial modeler.
- **World Bank PPP team will be available to provide required guidance and technical assistance** in the preparation for the negotiations.

4. **Regarding further financial due diligence on the Bidder's financial plan**, it would be important for DART to have the Bidder bring their financiers for a discussion with DART with the view to confirming proper financing arrangements are getting put into place. Such a process would expose any potential challenges surrounding financing conditions that lenders may be having. The Bidder should also submit a detailed financial plan providing details of sources of equity and debt funding along with any financing terms.

5. **Regarding further technical due diligence on the Bidder, fresh due diligence on the Bidder's bus delivery schedule** (which could include a physical verification of the Bidder's strategy on placement of equipment orders, visits to the equipment manufacturer to confirm production schedules and verification of feasible number of units capable of being completed and delivered over the first 12 months of the Project), **verification of the onboard ITS on the buses to be manufactured to confirm alignment with the system being implemented on the ground, and the technical fitting of the Euro IV buses with diesel particulate filters to confirm strict compliance with Euro IV Standards** – including the Operator's maintenance plan in this regard during the life of the Project, **will be highly advisable**, and necessary, **before the contract is signed**, and both DART and TA are to make this judgment call and implement agreed actions expeditiously in order to leave nothing to chance. Such a due diligence should therefore be conducted during the month of April 2024.

6. **The Mission took cognizance of the June 2023 amendments to the PPP law which enabled the choice, under PPP contracts, of international arbitration for contractual disputes as well as extending general tax benefits available to foreign direct investments to PPP investments.** These developments directly aid in the resolution of some of the open legal questions under the draft Project Agreement. **The Mission was further informed by the DART that an extension of the bid validity period has been affected, and the Preferred Bidder had provided to the Agency an extension of its extended bid bond**, in preparation for anticipated resumption of cited negotiations. The Mission noted that attention should be paid by DART to these extensions, with the view to ensuring that adequate time is afforded the contract negotiations process during the life of the extended bid bond and bid validity, and that if further extensions are deemed necessary, these should be made before validity periods lapse, in either case, respectively. **It was agreed that DART would submit to the World Bank, by 29 March 2024, a copy of the Attorney General's legal opinion approving resumption of negotiations, a copy of DART's letters to the Preferred Bidder extending bid validity period (dated January, March and April 2024 respectively), and a copy of the Preferred Bidder's letter extending the Bidder's bid bond, together with a copy of the bid bond certificate, for the Bank's records. It was further agreed that DART will resume negotiations and aim to conclude them by 30 April 2024.**

7. **With respect to project management, the Mission noted the need for DART to establish a stronger project management and oversight function and capability to closely monitor progression and attainment of other critical dependencies on the Project**, including station management contracts, security services contract, depot occupation licenses, transitional arrangements for uDART as operator of feeder routes, contractual arrangements on the fare collection system - its installation and procurement of the fare collection operator possibly under PPP arrangements, fund management appointment, ITS system installation, control center construction and completion, and the Daladala transformation plan. **DART agreed to prepare a consolidated timeline of all such project related activities to ensure that they are in sync with the BRT Phase 1 start of operations. It was agreed that DART can onboard targeted needed experts under the Project to help it better implement these obligations.**

8. It is highly recommended that DART acts as a convener of a high-level Steering Committee comprising of, representatives of PPP Centre, Ministry of Finance, AG's Department, LATRA and TanRoads to closely monitor project

progress, escalate and resolve issues and enhance inter-agency co-operation and co-ordination on BRT project phases. This meeting can be held every two weeks based on a set agenda. The WB can attend as an observer if required.

The Public Private Partnership (PPP) for Phase 2 of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT-2) system

9. **On BRT-2 PPP Arrangements, the African Development Bank is financing the physical infrastructure and associated works, while the World Bank is financing the transaction advisory mandate** for structuring the supply of buses, operations, and maintenance of the Phase 2 BRT under PPP arrangements. Construction works are nearing completion, but the PPP procurement process for the system operator is yet to start. The feasibility study for bus supply and operations, under preparation by the transaction advisor, is expected to be submitted to DART by end of March 2024, and will be subjected to review and approval under the framework of the PPP Act, by the PPP Steering Committee, by the end of April 2024. DART informed the Mission that government aims to bid out a bundled PPP contract (comprising the supply of buses, operations, and maintenance. The WB hopes such a procurement would adopt the open competitive procurement method for effective price discovery. The Mission discussed the key considerations that DART would need to consider when designing a procurement plan for the Phase 2 PPP project. ***It was agreed that DART will prepare a realistic, granular, procurement plan covering the approval of the feasibility study report as by law required, structuring of tender document package, market sounding, adequate time for the RfQ and RfP stages, with adequate time for bid clarifications and due diligence by bidders, evaluations and regulatory approvals at tender stage, contract negotiations and related governance approvals, financial close period and project delivery schedule. Such a plan will be shared with the World Bank by 29 March 2024 for the BRT-2 project for review.***

The Public Private Partnership (PPP) for Phases 3 and 4 of the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT-2) system

10. **On BRT-3&4 PPP Arrangements, the Mission noted that initiation of PPP arrangements is behind schedule.** DART is engaging with the International Finance Corporation (IFC) for potential provision of transaction advisory services to conduct a PPP feasibility study and structure a PPP operations and maintenance transaction for the BRT-3 and 4 projects. Under the Project Financing Agreement, the legal covenant tied to disbursement triggers is the launch of PPP procurement for these two phases. DART intends to resume and conclude discussions with IFC on transaction advisory services by end of April 2024. ***It was agreed that DART will provide to the World Bank a copy of the draft terms of reference for the IFC transaction advisory mandate and reconvene discussions with the IFC by 29 March 2024 with the view to concluding engagement discussions by 30 April 2024.***

Annex 3: Fiduciary Management

Financial Management

11. The IFR for quarter ending December 2023 was submitted, reviewed, and accepted by the bank. External audit was conducted by the CAG for FY 2022/23 and the audited financial statements and management letter were submitted to the bank in accordance with the provisions of the financing agreement. The project received a clean opinion. Issues were reported on the management letter relating to project progress and management, the mission urges the project to ensure all recommendations are implemented. The mission reviewed progress of internal audit, the latest internal audit report issued is for the period March 2020 to September 2022. To capture control weakness effectively, the mission recommends for the project to ensure internal audit reviews are conducted at least every six months. The project should conduct an internal audit review for the period October 2022 to date as soon as possible.

Procurement

12. The Construction of Gongo-la-Mboto Depot is the only package under process for TANROADS. Currently, TANROADS is addressing the comments provided by the Bank in the initial selection report and an invitation for the proposals is scheduled for April 2024. On the other hand, DART has nine contracts worth US\$11.9 million, still under implementation. There are two packages with an estimated cost of US\$6.2 million are yet to be initiated and one consulting services (US\$2.5 million) which is at the technical proposal evaluation.

13. Procurement Capacity of the implementing agencies: At TANROADS, frequent key staff turnover is impacting procurement capacity of the institution, which leads to delays in processing and managing procurement activities of the project. Currently, procurement function of the project is being managed by the procurement consultants because the new transferred staff to TANROADS have no experience of managing high value and complex procurements. Selection process for the Project Management Consultant (US\$2 million) to support DART in the implementation of the project activities is at EoI stage. The mission was informed that TANROADS has completed a process of hiring 59 interns out of which six have been attached to the procurement unit as part of the effort of building sustainable procurement capacity in the institution. Through the RENARDET contract, one Procurement Consultant has been attached to DART to support procurement activities. The Bank is planning to conduct a fiduciary workshop to the PIUs in the transport sector in the week of April 15, 2024.

14. Procurement Post Review (PPR): The Bank conducted a PPR for FY24 for both implementing agencies last year and the report was communicated to each entity highlighting weakness and recommendations to improve procurement performance and compliance. It was agreed that TANROADS and DART will address all recommendations before the next PPR FY25.

Annex 4: Summary of Site Visit

Construction BRT Phase 3, Lot 1: Road Works Including Bus Stations Along Azikiwe/Maktaba, Bibi Titi/Nyerere Road, Tazara/Uhuru Road and Shaurimoyo/Lindi Street

Contractor:	Sinohydro Corporation Ltd
Contract Signing Date:	March 17, 2022
Commencement Date:	August 1, 2022
Completion Date:	March 31, 2024
Contract Sum:	TZS 231,664,120,108.93 (VAT 18% Inclusive)
Engineer:	SMEC International Ltd in association with Mhandisi Consultancy Ltd & Habconsult Ltd
Site Visit Date:	March 13, 2024

1. The World Bank mission team together with TANROADS team, the contractor and supervision consultant team conducted a site visit to BRT Phase 3 ongoing construction works on March 13, 2024. The visit started at Ch. 13+400 at Airport area up to Gongo la Mboti and coming back to Uhuru Street. The following is a brief description of the site visit, and the progress of the construction works.

2. General Progress: The overall progress of works is at 42% at the end of February 2024 after revising the method of evaluation of the progress. The new method for measuring the real physical progress is taking into account all activities already performed and includes the materials on site. Delays of works have been contributed by delayed mobilization of the contractor's resources, key staff, and equipment, and lack of proper resources management. Relocation of utilities has also been progressing at a low pace. The contractor also claims that the design modifications have contributed to the delays in the construction works. The contractor has increased resources and has been working during the day and night to expedite the work.



Photo 1: CRR laid on Mixed Traffic Lane



Photo 2: Construction of Gombo La Mboti Terminal



Photo 3: G15 layer on Mixed Traffic Lane

3. Physical works: There are construction works ongoing at several locations, main works are construction of BRT lanes (rigid pavement), on which 9.15km out of the 23km has been completed, the mixed traffic lanes pavement has 7.18km of basecourse layer (DBM) completed, construction underground pipes for drainage has completed 18km out of 46km. The contractor has done concrete works to 21 bus stations up to substructure. Activities for the works are earthworks at various section, preparations for pavement concrete casting, curing concrete along the BRT lanes, setting and installation pre-cast concrete kerbs, hauling, excavations, scarifying and compactions for materials on site.



Photo 4: Sidewalks Preparation



Photo 5: DBM layer Mixed Traffic Lane



Photo 6: Curing of concrete pavement on BRT lane

4. Traffic Management: Traffic management along the 23.3 km of the construction site require strengthening. Employer and Engineer receive many complaints from road users on the traffic management. While the contract includes very good specifications for road marking, road signing and crash barriers, they are not applied because the contract does not mention whether they apply for both temporary and permanent road marking and signing. The mission could see that the devices for limiting the construction site, channelizing the traffic flows, guiding the users in all conditions including during the night are inadequate. The speed limit of 30 km/h along 23 km is not observed as the road allows higher operating speeds. The enforcement therefore requires to be strengthened especially in tight curves. There is no lighting, no flashing signs, inadequate reflected devices for the road users. Traffic management has to be strengthened for safety and guidance of road users. The Engineer has written several letters reminding the contractor on this responsibility including threatening retention of money in IPCs. Two fatal accidents have occurred in the last three months, however TANROADS were not able to report on time to the World Bank – therefore no further analysis of root causes of accidents were conducted so that lessons drawn could have been used for improvement in the traffic management. It was agreed that contractor will improve the reflective devices and install flashing lights.

5. Challenges: It has been observed that there are a lot of loose soils in the vicinity of already constructed manholes for underground drainage system, where some of the soils have found their way into manholes. The concern is the soil already inside the underground pipe may be ignored and eventually block the drainage system. The coming rains will make the situation worse. The contractor has to ensure that all the drainage system is fully cleaned before handing over the works to the client. To prevent soil running into the covered drain, contractors should complete landscaping of the area including walkways once the drainage system is completed.



Photo 7: Loose soil in the entrance of manhole

BRT-4 Package A: Lot 1 Roadworks – CBD to Ubungo through Mwenge (13.5km)

Contract:	Construction of Dar es Salaam BRT Infrastructure Phase 4 – Package A: Lot 1: Road works (13.5 km) from CBD Maktaba ya Taifa to Mwenge/Ubungo (Sam Nujoma) Including Bridge (1 Nos), Terminals (2 Nos), Bus Stations (20 Nos) & Feeder Stations (10 Nos)
Contractor:	China Geo-Engineering Corporation
Contract Signing Date:	June 30, 2023
Commencement:	November 1, 2023
Duration Date:	18 Months
Contract Sum:	TZS 174,380,157,323.0
Consultant:	Kunhwa Engineering & Consulting Co. Ltd in JV with Seoul Housing & Communities Corporation and Dongsung Engineering Co. Ltd.
Sub-Consultant:	Aqgola Engineering & Management Services Ltd.
Client:	Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS)

1. The World Bank mission team together with TANROADS team, the contractor and supervision consultant team conducted a site visit to BRT Phase 4 ongoing construction works on March 15, 2024. The following is a brief description of the meeting at Contractor's temporary campsite at Salender bridge.

2. **General Progress:** The overall progress of works is at 1% at the end of February 2024. There are no physical works started on the project site except construction of contractor's camp in Mwenge.

3. **Physical works:** No work on permanent works has started on site apart from placing concrete barrier along the road from Morocco junction to Mwenge and Mwenge to Ubungo. Existing streetlighting columns and kerbstones have been removed on section from Menge towards Ubungo including clearing of site within central median. The activities along on section from Mwenge towards Ubungo have been suspended due to incompliance with ESMP, TMP and Safety in general.

4. **Resources Mobilization:** The progress of the equipment mobilization is 20% with construction of his own camp ongoing. However, the contractor has not complied with Safeguard Tools as required by the Contract. The contractor will mobilize five of the key staff in the contract and he has request to replace the rest of the key staff. Contactor promised to mobilize all key staff before April 1, 2024. The contractor has been requested to update the work program.

5. **Traffic Management:** The contractor submitted TMP to start work on Mwenge Ubungo section. The TMP was reviewed and accepted by supervising consultant. However, during implementation, the activity of removing streetlighting columns and Kerbs tone caused a number of accidents. Consultant stopped the work. Safeguard tools were also not in place.

6. **Road Safety:** The placement and overall TMP did not adhere to the safety of the road users. The concrete barriers placed along the road did not follow basic safety procedures. The gaps between the concrete barriers are dead traps for boda-boda and Bajaj drivers. A more forgiving solution should be adopted or if concrete barriers are used, appropriate safety procedures must be used. The concrete barrier should be placed end to end, no gap between is allowed. There must be some safety zones between concrete barriers and the edge of traffic lanes. The concrete barrier should be reflective and must have light on top to illuminate the road in night-time. Sudden changes in the direction of the barriers should be avoided and speed-calming measures must be adopted.

7. **Challenges:** Main challenge is works progress and mobilization delays and Traffic Safety issues during construction. TMPs must be checked by safety auditors before being implemented.

BRT-4 Package B: Lot 2 - Road works (15.6km); From Mwenge to Tegeta (DAWASA) Including Bridges (4 Nos), Terminals (3 Nos), Bus Stations (19 Nos) & Feeder stations (5 Nos)

Contract:	Construction of Dar es Salaam BRT Infrastructure Phase 4 – Package A: Lot 2: Road works (15.6km); From Mwenge to Tegeta (DAWASA) Including Bridges (4 Nos), Terminals (3 Nos), Bus Stations (19 Nos) & Feeder stations (5 Nos)
Contractor:	Shadong Luqiao Group Co. Ltd

Contract Signing Date: June 30, 2023
Commencement: November 1, 2024
Duration Date: 18 Months
Contract Sum: TZS 193,855,936,443.00
Consultant: Kunhwa Engineering & Consulting Co. Ltd in JV with Seoul Housing & Communities Corporation and Dongsung Engineering Co. Ltd.
Sub-Consultant: Aqgola Engineering & Management Services Ltd.
Client: Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS)
Site Visit Date: March 14, 2024

8. The World Bank mission team together with TANROADS team, the contractor and supervision consultant team conducted a site visit to BRT Phase 4 ongoing construction works on March 14, 2024. The visit started at Contractor's Camp in Lugalo, then continued to End of the project at Tegeta DAWASA. The following is a brief description of the site visit, and the progress of the construction works.

9. **General Progress:** The overall progress of works is at 0% at the end of February 2024. The only activity seen is the construction of a contractor's camp at Lugalo.

10. **Resources Mobilization:** The contractor has not mobilized any key staff to date as he has submitted request to replace all the key staff in the contract. This request has not been approved by TANROADS.

11. **Challenges:** The area is normally flooded during the rainy season. The client informed the meeting that the feeder station will be at the same level as the current road so it will be elevated from flooding. The supervisor presented the proposed solution although it was not clear how it was going to impact people's houses on the downstream side. The drainage solution proposed is not part of the current contract so far. Further concerned was raised on the recent observed flooding at Africana. TANROADS informed the mission team that the design has taken care of the problem.

BRT-4 Package B: Lot 3 Buildings – Mbuyuni Depot, Simu 2000 depot and Kivukoni Terminals

Contract: Construction of Dar Es Salaam BRT Infrastructure Phase 4: Package B: Lot 3: Building – Mbuyuni Depot, Simu 2000 Depot & Kivukoni Terminal.
Contractor: China Communication Construction Company
Contract Signing Date: June 30, 2023
Commencement: November 1, 2023
Duration Date: 18 Months
Contract Sum: TZS 60,984,151,987.00
Consultant: Kunhwa Engineering & Consulting Co. Ltd in JV with Seoul Housing & Communities Corporation and Dongsung Engineering Co. Ltd.
Sub-Consultant: Aqgola Engineering & Management Services Ltd.
Client: Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS)
Status: Mobilisation period ended on 1st November 2023
Equipment mobilization to date is 5%
Progress on permanent works 0%
Only Kivukoni site was handed to the Contractor.
Site Visit Date: 15 March 2024

1. The sites at Mbuyuni and Simu 2000 are yet to be in possession as informed by the clients. The finalizing former, PAPs under RAP are being finalized while for the later site, discussions on acquisition and development plans are being held. Following World Bank concerns on delayed commencement of all the projects and pending advance payments to be affected, the agency is advised to sort out the issue and facilitate the contract execution to catch up with time targets.

2. **General Progress:** The overall progress of works is at 0% at the end of February 2024. The contractor has been stopped because of the incompliance of Safeguard Tools. The contractor has been handed over only the Kivukoni Terminal's site while DART is working on the ownership of the land of Mbuyuni and Simu2000 sites.

3. **Physical works:** The contractor has cleared the site at Kivukoni site.

4. **Resources Mobilization:** The contractor's progress of the equipment mobilization is 5% with mobilization period ended on January 31, 2024.

BRT 1 - Road Safety strengthening along BRT- 1 Corridor, Package A: Widening of Ubungo Kimara Road Section and Package B: Rehabilitation of a section of Obama Drive Including Integration of Ferry access to Kivukoni Bus terminal and Msimbazi Road

Contract: Package A: Widening of Ubungo Kimara Road Section

Contractor: Sichuan Road and Bridge (Group) Corporation, SRBG

Contract Signing Date: June 30, 2023

Commencement: November 1, 2023

Duration Date: 18 Months

Contract Sum: TZS 83,894,252,608.00

Contract: Package B: Rehabilitation of a section of Obama Drive Including Integration of Ferry access to Kivukoni Bus terminal and Msimbazi Road

Contractor: Shichuan Road and Bridge (Group) Corporation

Contract Signing Date: June 30, 2023

Commencement: January 2, 2024

Duration Date: 12 Months

Contract Sum: TZS 19,826,338,900.00

Consultant (Package A& B): Soosung Engineering Co. Ltd in JV with Shinsung Engineering Co. of Korea in association with Afrisa Consulting Ltd of Tanzania

Client: Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS)

Site visit Date: March 19, 2024.

5. The signed contract for design and supervision by Soosung included the supervision of a single construction contract. This construction has now been split into 2 packages. The related contract amendment has not yet been issued. A single Engineer with a single Resident Engineer will supervise both construction contracts and are in place. Some team members will supervise both contracts while others will be allocated for the supervision of a single contract. Various key staffs are not yet on the site. Mobilization of key staffs and equipment is strongly delayed for both construction packages (10% of equipment on site for package A and 30% for package B). The Engineer has issued a notice to correct for package A on 10th March 2024 requesting the hiring of key staffs in accordance with the contract and a revised work program (the proposed one presently shows a completion date later than contract requirement).

6. The contractor of package A has implemented blocks of concrete for traffic diversion without the permission of the Engineer and therefore has been asked to remove them. The mission considers these blocks should not be considered as crash barriers but constitute safety hazards. The traffic engineer of the supervision who is also in charge of road safety should undertake a road safety audit of the various phases of the traffic management plan. Along package A, some roads in the vicinity of the BRT line which were planned under the contract have already been constructed by other agencies. These roads can be dropped from the contract or replaced by some other similar roads.

1. The mission was informed that deployment of CNG and battery-electric buses previously planned for Phase 1 of the BRT is no longer intended, as it would complicate negotiations with ENG, and that the buses would instead have diesel engines meeting Euro 4 emission standards. This is regrettable, as the Euro IV standards allow much higher emissions of oxides of nitrogen (NOx) than current EU or US emission standards.

2. The limit on particulate emissions set in the Euro IV standards is strict enough to require the use of a diesel particulate filter. With these filters intact and operating, particulate emissions should be low enough as not to be a significant health hazard. It is strongly recommended that DART inspect the buses on their arrival to confirm that they are actually so equipped. Furthermore, diesel particulate filters have somewhat complex self-cleaning (regeneration) mechanism, require periodic maintenance, are liable to crack and disintegrate when overloaded, and are expensive to replace. Therefore, continued vigilance will be needed to ensure that the bus operator properly maintains and replaces the filters when necessary. It should be noted that, with a properly functioning filter, there should be no emission of visible smoke and the interior of the exhaust pipe will be clean. Any occurrence of visible smoke or the presence of soot in the exhaust pipe indicates filter failure, and the need for replacement.

3. With the clean fuels no longer contemplated in Phase 1, the Mission understands that the planned recruitment of consultants for the Development of Specification and Cost Estimates for Refueling and Recharging Systems of Compressed Natural Gas and Battery-Electric Buses for the bus depots of the different phases will no longer occur. Instead, it is understood that the relevant TOR are being provided to the design-build contractor for Phase 3, and the design consultants for the remaining phases. The mission is unclear on whether consultants will still be recruited to design and specify the clean fuel infrastructure at the Phase 2 Mbagala depot. It is also unclear whether the existing contractors will perform all the tasks specified in the TOR for each phase. Specifically, who will be responsible for:

4. Detailed cost analysis by explicitly doing the following:

- (a) Preparing investment and operation costs for the interconnection Natural Gas pipeline infrastructure, CNG stations, and CNG buses for each BRT depots; and
- (b) Preparing investment and operation costs for the TANESCO power infrastructures, including substation and transmission line from existing tapping substation and BE buses.

CNG and BE fleet analysis and fueling/charging arrangements.

- (c) Determine the bus fleet size, technical characteristics, pricing, potential bus suppliers, operating patterns, refuelling/recharging requirements, and estimated investment and operating costs of the proposed CNG and BE bus fleets for Phases 1 and 2;
- (d) Analyse the energy consumption of CNG or electricity per bus per kilometre;
- (e) Assess and determine an optimal CNG fueling mechanism in depots;
- (f) Assess and determine an optimal charging mechanism for BE buses in depots;
- (g) Assess and determine optimal backup power supply in depots;
- (h) Analyze and compare the costs of running buses using CNG against BE under actual considerations,

Undertake energy demand analysis during the current and next 25 years for the BRT system as currently planned, by:-

- (i) Conducting demand analysis and load forecasting for the complete BRT system, comprising all planned depots, including the BE electric charging system and CNG refuelling system;
- (j) Estimating the CNG demand by the BRT bus fleet during the current and each of the next 25 years; and
- (k) Estimating the electricity demand for BE bus charging in the BRT bus fleet during the current and each of the next 25 years.

As well as

- (a) Building the capacity of the Technical Committee by gaining the experience of successful countries with projects that use CNG and BE in buses;
- (b) Providing the experience of countries that have succeeded in projects that use CNG and BE in public transport buses; and
- (c) Proposing, coordinating, and providing the cost of training programs for the client's operations and maintenance team to be conducted in other successful countries with projects that use CNG and BE in buses.

The mission requests clarification on these matters, and a timeline for recruitment of the consultants in the event that this is still contemplated for any of the phases.

Annex 6: Persons Met and Mission Members

Persons Met

Name	Ministry/Organization	Title
Adolph Ndunguru	PO-RALG	Permanent Secretary
Rogatus Mativila	PO-RALG	Deputy Permanent Secretary
Gilbert Mwoga	PO-RALG	Director of Infrastructure Development
Aisha Amour	Ministry of Works	Permanent Secretary
Ludovic James Nduhiye	Ministry of Works	Deputy Permanent Secretary
Alois Matei	Ministry of Works	Director of Roads & For Permanent Secretary
Silvester T. Haonga	Ministry of Works	Ag. AD RR
Liberatha R. Alphonce	Ministry of Works	AD UR
Gladness Kitaly	Ministry of Works	Engineer
Rahma Mwinyi	Ministry of Works	Engineer
David Kafulila	PPP Centre	Executive Director
Dr. Aloyce Masanja	PPP Centre	PE
Edwin Kachenje	PPP Centre	FMO
Alfred Misana	PPP Centre	Economist
Mohamed Besta	TANROADS	Chief Executive
Musa M. Kaswahili	TANROADS	Ag. DPC
Ephatar Mlavi	TANROADS	Ag. Chief Executive
Japherson N. Nnko	TANROADS	DPR
Francis Mwasota	TANROADS	IDA Projects Coordinator
Barakaeli Mmari	TANROADS	Project Manager - BRT
Frank Mbilinyi	TANROADS	PM
Jackline Ringo	TANROADS	Environmental Officer
Winston Senyaeli	TANROADS	SWO
Juma Mshawa	TANROADS	Project Engineer
Sarah Ngailevanu	TANROADS	QS/GS
Rehema Shabenga	TANROADS	Counterpart Engineer
Elirehema Mwashwa	TANROADS	APM
Immanuel Kinanilo	TANROADS	HE-BRT
Leocard Sikambale	TANROADS	APM-P4
Richard McCaffrey	TANROADS	PMC
Charles Swai	TANROADS	Environmental Consultant
Josephine Zimba	TANROADS	ESE
Mwanaisha Rajab	TANROADS	Engineer
Dhahiri Msemo	TANROADS	M&E
Mariam Lugeto	TANROADS	COE-BRT
Deodath Kimario	TANROADS	Environment Officer
Rotson Kabalika	TANROADS	APM-BRT3
Isareba Wambura	TANROADS	Ag. PM-DFP
Moses Mwasaba	TANROADS	MPDFP
Felix Kijeyo	TANROADS	Procurement Engineer
Patrick Shilogile	TANROADS	ICT Officer

Samwel Nyari	TANROADS	RSME
Catherine Sanga	TANROADS	Accountant
Bahati Juma	TANROADS	Accountant
Beatrice Kasongwa	TANROADS	Accountant
Jackson Kulangwa	TANROADS	EE
Juma Mtazi	TANROADS	OS
Fatna Mchana	TANROADS	RMA
Maria Silayo	TANROADS	Procurement Officer
Niyindora Burushwa	TANROADS	RMA
Sabina Lister	TANROADS	PS
Daudi Mwaituka	TANROADS	HR Trainee
Petty Gama	TANROADS	PS-BRT
Winfrida Barakwa	TANROADS	OMS
Mariam Kikasah	TANROADS	Procurement Trainee
Abdalrazak Kachwamba	TANROADS	Project Engineer
Elisha Ruboha	TANROADS	Project Engineer
Juma Mshewa	TANROADS	Engineer
David Mwakabole	TANROADS	Project Engineer
Flora Burton	TANROADS	PE
Azimina Mushi	TANROADS	Assist
Mwanaisha Jambira	TANROADS	Accountant
Abdalla Kidela	TANROADS	Accountant
Gibson Mwaya	TANROADS	Principal Social Welfare Officer
Arthur Mtafya	TANROADS	Social Specialist
Immanuel Kinanilo	TANROADS	Engineer
Habibu Suluo	LATRA	Director General
Johansen Kahatano	LATRA	Director Road Transport Regulation
Ezekiel Emmanuely	LATRA	Office in Charge - Dodoma
Abdallah Mhagama	LATRA	Land Transport Regulatory Officer
Athumani J. Kihamio	DART	Chief Executive, CEO
Fanuel Kalugendo	DART	Director Transport Development, DTD
Deusdedity Casmir	DART	Director Finance, DF
Dr. Philemon Mzee	DART	Director Operations & Infrastructure
Domina Madeli	DART	Head of Legal Services, HLS
Eliakim Samuel	DART	Head of Procurement Management Unit, HPMU
Eliphas R. Mollel	DART	DHRA
Ng'wanashigi Gagaga	DART	Director ICT
Ismaily Shekibu	DART	Director Security
Mohamed Kuganda	DART	Traffic Management & Control Manager
Albina John	DART	Principal Environmental Engineer
Nason Bwatota	DART	Town Planner
Mouston Mwakyoma	DART	Resettlement Specialist
Kituja Mashango	DART	Environmental Engineer
Ami Srivastava	DART	Bus Operation Expert

Ahmed Wamala	DART	Transport Engineer
Dickens Claud	DART	ICT Officer
Deus Ndomba	DART	ICT Officer
Maryam Lusewa	DART	ICT Officer
Eliud Tibalila	DART	ICT Officer
Deo Felix	DART	ICT Officer
Hassani Halfani	DART	Assistant procurement and supplies officer
Bernard Kavishe	ERB	Registrar
Veronica Ninalwo	ERB	AR-PDA
Paul Bilakaye	ERB	AR-FA
Elizabeth Mark	ERB	RO-ERB
Abraham Kaaya	ERB	Training Officer II
Prof Bwire Hannibal	UDSM	M&E Consultant Team Leader
Anthony Kigombola	UDSM	M&E Consultant Software Expert
Jaqueline E. Masaki	UDSM	M&E Consultant ITS Expert
Julian M. Ijumulana	UDSM	M&E Consultant GIS Analyst
Lucas Ochieng	SMEC	The Engineer
Eric Chatwin	SMEC	Resident Engineer
Hendrish Nyange	SMEC	Highway Engineer
Ndyetabura Hamisi	SMEC	Electrical Engineer
Seif R. Seif	SMEC	Utilities Engineer
Bahati Mbambe	SMEC	Quantity Surveyor
Joel Jonja	SMEC	Topographical Surveyor
Emanuel Uroki	SMEC	Traffic Engineer
Joel Malilo	SMEC	Asst. Traffic Engineer
Shabani Marijani	Mhandisi Consultancy	Environmentalist
Yohane Faustine	Mhandisi Consultancy	Structural Engineer
Violeth Muganda	Mhandisi Consultancy	Drainage Engineer
Chrispin Mwansanga	Mhandisi Consultancy	Sociologist
Seleman Hamduni	Mhandisi Consultancy	Material Engineer
Godwishes Gibson	HabConsult Ltd	Architect
Ashery M. Kasese	KUNHWA	Contract Specialist
Sebastian Bebwa	KUNHWA	Land Surveyor
Samwel Robert	KUNHWA	Inspector of Works
Rashid Khamsini	KUNHWA	Consultant
Kim Cheon Bae	KUNHWA	Highway Engineer
Alex H. Charles	KUNHWA	Assistant Surveyor
Eng. Ally Lusesa	KUNHWA	Inspector
Engelbert Lipambila	KUNHWA	Architect
Oswald Modu	KUNHWA	Architect
Joseph Tango	KUNHWA	Quantity Surveyor
Flavius Matata	KUNHWA	Traffic Engineer
Phillip Mbuligwe	KUNHWA	Environmental Expert

Humphrey G. Shoo	KUNHWA	Road Safety Engineer
Elizabeth Temu	KUNHWA	Sociologist
Charles Swai	KUNHWA	Environmental Consultant
Dominica Chrispin	KUNHWA	Assistant Road Safety Engineer
Ntuah Nzaga	KUNHWA	Assistant Surveyor
Chizenga Isa	AFRISA	Managing Director AFRISA
Zwelankhe Mnisi	AFRISA	Highway Engineer
Renatus Makoye	AFRISA	Land Surveyor
Augustiono Joram	AFRISA	Material Technician
Daniel V. Chamlonde	AFRISA	Land Surveyor
Sin Kil Kang	Soosung Engineering	Engineer's Representative BRT 1
Duruyu	SRBG	Contractor's Representative BRT1 Package A
Ma Ding	SRBG	Highway Engineer
Flavius Matata	SRBG	Traffic Engineer
Mishi Suyya	SRBG	Human Resource
Rahima Waziri	SRBG	Health & Safety Expert
Yu Fei	SRBG	Equipment Engineer
Maxmilian Ngulu	SRBG	Material Engineer
Chen Xingtao	SRBG	Highway Engineer
Wang Shifeng	SRBG	Land Surveyor
Pan Jianguang	CRSG	Contractor's Representative BRT1 Package B
Damary Mafuru	CRSG	Health & Safety expert
Nathalia Nkya	CRSG	Social Expert
Said Joseph Sulley	CRSG	Materials Engineer
Sain Young	CRSG	Assistant Manager
Guo Kim	SinoHydro	Contractor's Representatives BRT3 Lot 1
Emmanuel Fungo	SinoHydro	Traffic Engineer BRT3 Lot 1
Zhang Cheng	SinoHydro	Chief Engineer BRT3 Lot 1
Albert Mwauzi	SynoHydro	Asst. Traffic Engineer
Saliim B. Mchomvu	SynoHydro	Safety Expert
Mkunde Feruzi	SynoHydro	Environmentalist
Lina Kimaro	SynoHydro	Sociologist
Kwigema Malishee	SynoHydro	Gender Expert
Ceo Yong	SynoHydro	Business Manager
Paulo Simba	CGC	Assistant Environmentalist
Shabani Yahya	CGC	Contractor's Team
Njeri Mburu	CGC	Traffic Engineer
Elizabeth Shauri	CGC	Human Resources Management
Kayonko Juma	CGC	Environmental Expert
Zhao Quan Wang	CGC	Works Manager
Qiun Huo	CGC	Contractor's Team
Wang Qiang	CGC	Assistant Manager
Wang Wenbing	CGC	Chief Engineer
Huang Kang	CGC	Commercial Manager

Xu Hui	CGC	Project Manager BRT 4 Lot 1
Liu Yanxin	SDLQ	Quantity Surveyor
Zhang Xi Zhong	SDLQ	Works Manager
Fa Xiaolu	SDLQ	Contractor's Team
Xu Jian Hoo	SDLQ	Contractor's Team
Zhao Chunxiao	SDLQ	Assistant
Koen Van Baekel	Rebel Group	PPP Expert
Nicholas Wakley	Rebel Group	Financial Advisor
Nicholas Zervos	Rebel Group	Legal Advisor
Clara Mramba	Velma Law	Legal Expert
Lameck Justus	Velma Law	Legal Expert
Fabio Gordilo	GSDplus	ITS Consultant
Maikoll Rodriguez	GSDplus	AFCS Front-end & Software Developer
Miguel Lopez Rodriguez	IDOM	Project Manager
Matthieu Bommier	French Development Agency	Infrastructure Development Officer
Chris Kost	ITDP	Africa program Director
Claire Birungi	ITDP	Transport Systems Manager
Gashaw Aberra	ITDP	Active Mobility Manager
Shauri Shau	ITDP	Country Manager
Maureen Kinyua	ITDP	Urban Planning Manager

Mission Members

Name	Title	Specialization	Unit
Yonas E. Mchomvu	Senior Transport Specialist (TTL)	Transport	IAET1
Fang Xu	Senior Transport Specialist (Co-TTL)	Transport	IAET1
Raymond Mbishi	Senior Procurement Specialist	Procurement	EAER
Nathan Tuimising	Senior Public private Partnerships Specialist	PPP	IPGPP
Naima Besta	Senior Social Development Specialist	Social	SAES2
Jane Kibbassa	Senior Environmental Specialist	Environment	SAEE2
Julia Bucknall	Senior Adviser	E&S Safeguards	AFEES
Henry A.N. Onyango	Senior Environmental Specialist	Environment	AFEES
Waruna Rajapaksa	Public private Partnerships Consultant	PPP	IAET1
Jean-Marie Braun	Transport infrastructures Consultant	Highway Engineer	IAET1
Abiyu Berlie	ITS Specialist	ITS	SAES2
Christopher Weaver	Clean Energy Consultant	Air pollution and clean energy	IAET1
David Ingham	Urban Transport Consultant	Urban	IAET1
Olivia Rutashobya	Financial Management Consultant	Financial Management	EAEG1
Ignace Mchallo	Environmental Consultant	Environmental Safeguards	SAEE2
Elhanan Lema	Transport Engineer and Planner Consultant	Transport	IAET1
Anna Munyagi	Transport Consultant	Transport	IAET1
Gladness Rwejumura	Transport Analyst	Transport	IAET1
Imma Killasama	Program Assistant	Operations	AECE1
Florence K. Masai	Program Assistant	Operations	AFEES
Humphrey Edison	Occupational Health and Safety Consultant	OHS	AFEES
Philemon Mchihyo	Transport Intern	Transport	IAET1
Eric Mulinge	Transport Intern	Urban Planner	IAET1

Annex 7: Expenditure Forecast to Completion of DUTP Activities

ANALYSIS OF DUTP COST OVERRUN										
GRAND TOTAL (IN USD)										
(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E)	(F)	(G) = (E)+(F)	(H)	(J) = (G)+(H)	(K) = (J) - (D)	(L)
	Project Component/ Activity	Contractor / Consultant	Credit (PAD) Amount (USD)	Original Contract Amount (USD)	Addendum Amount (USD)	Revised Contract Amount (USD)	Estimated Addition/omission to Complete (USD)	Total Amount Required to Completion (USD)	Variation to Credit (PAD) Amount (USD)	Remark/Status
	Component A	Various	287,100,000	315,502,584	5,566,095	321,068,679	34,636,136	355,704,815	-68,604,815	Mainly BRT Phase 4
	Component B	Various	99,900,000	138,899,022	24,834,012	163,733,034	-541,580	163,191,454	-63,291,454	Mainly Widening of Ubungo-Kimara Section
	Component C	Various	38,000,000	8,061,622	13,257,653	21,319,275	27,728,830	49,048,104	-11,048,104	Mainly Project Implementation Support Services
	Grand Total		425,000,000	462,463,228	43,657,761	506,120,988	61,823,386	567,944,374	-142,944,374	

Component A - Establishment of 3rd & 4th Phase of the BRT System

(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E)	(F)	(G) = (E)+(F)	(H)	(J) = (G)+(H)	(K) = (J) - (D)	(L)
	Project Component/ Activity	Contractor / Consultant	Credit (PAD) Amount (USD)	Original Contract Amount (USD)	Addendum Amount (USD)	Revised Contract Amount (USD)	Estimated Addition/omission to Complete (USD)	Total Amount Required to Completion (USD)	Variation to Credit (PAD) Amount (USD)	Remark/Status
	Comp. A - Establishment of 3rd & 4th Phase of the BRT System									
A.1	Establishment of BRT Phase 3 Infrastructure									
A.1.1	Implementation of BRT Phase3 trunk corridor - Lot 1 (Roads Works)	M/S SINOHYDRO	143,200,000.00	100,186,044.98	0.00	100,186,044.98	5,009,302.25	105,195,347.22	18,004,652.78	Estimated Addition is for foreseen additional price escalation, assumed 5%
	Implementation of BRT Phase3 trunk corridor - Lot 2 (Buildings)	To be procured		0.00	0.00	0.00	20,000,000.00	20,000,000.00		Estimated based on BRT2 Depot
A.1.2	Design review and supervision of BRT Phase 3, LOT 1: Roadworks	M/S DOHWA	3,000,000.00	5,031,416.83	0.00	5,031,416.83	(4,564,121.79)	467,295.04	(121,720.17)	The Contract was terminated
	Supervision of BRT Phase 3, LOT 1: Roadworks	M/S SMEC		2,654,425.14	0.00	2,654,425.14	0.00	2,654,425.14		On going
A.1.3	Design review and supervision of BRT Phase 3 building works	M/S UNITEC	2,000,000.00	427,517.39	80,998.91	508,516.30	0.00	508,516.30	1,491,483.70	Supervision not yet started pending procurement of contractor
	Subtotal A.1		148,200,000.00	108,299,404.33	80,998.91	108,380,403.25	20,445,180.45	128,825,583.70	19,374,416.30	
A.2	Establishment of BRT Phase 4 Infrastructure									
A.2.1	Implementation of BRT Phase 4, Lot 1: Roadwork	M/s China Geo Engineering Copr		75,163,861.00	0.00	75,163,861.00	0.00	75,163,861.00		
A.2.1	Implementation of BRT Phase 4, Lot 2: Roadwork	M/s Shandong Luqiao Group Co. Ltd.	92,900,000.00	83,558,563.00	0.00	83,558,563.00	0.00	83,558,563.00	(92,108,696.00)	Credit amount in the PAD was underestimated; Works not started; Contracts to be signed by 30 June 2023
A.2.1	Implementation of BRT Phase 4, Lot 3: Buildings	M/s China Communication Construction Co. Ltd		26,286,272.00	0.00	26,286,272.00	0.00	26,286,272.00		
A.2.2	Design of BRT works	M/S KUNHWA	4,500,000.00	2,013,453.00	998,191.50	3,011,644.50	0.00	3,011,644.50	(4,604,869.50)	Contract Signed but the work is yet to start. The cost estimate is per contract value
	Supervision of BRT works	M/S KUNHWA		6,093,225.00	0.00	6,093,225.00	0.00	6,093,225.00		Contract Signed but the work is yet to start. The cost estimate is per contract value
A.2.3	ESIA and preparation of RAP for BRT phase 4	M/S NIMETA	500,000.00	126,246.89	76,700.00	202,946.89		202,946.89	297,053.11	Contract signed May 2020, work is on-going
A.2.4	Travel Demand Update entire BRT System (Phases 1 - 6)	M/S LOGIT		592,134.00	0.00	592,134.00	0.00	592,134.00	(592,134.00)	Completed
	Subtotal A.2		97,900,000.00	193,833,754.89	1,074,891.50	194,908,646.39	0.00	194,908,646.39	(97,008,646.39)	
A.3	Preparation for Operations of the BRT system									
A.3.1	Transaction advisory contracts for structuring of the operation, establishment of the minibuss (Daladala) cooperatives, companies,franchises, and procurement of operators for BRT	Rebel Group and Velma KPMG	8,000,000.00	1,328,414.83 1,939,638.05		1,328,414.83 3,538,762.00	1,328,414.83 5,478,400.05	6,806,814.88	1,193,185.12	Contract with KPMG was terminated. DART is in the process of hiring a new consultant
	Subtotal A.3		8,000,000.00	3,268,052.88	3,538,762.00	6,806,814.88	0.00	6,806,814.88	1,193,185.12	
A.4	Upgrading of the Fare collection System and Improving Traffic Management along the BRT Corridors									
A.4.1	Traffic study, design and construction supervision of corridorwide traffic signal system ITS master plan for the city and sub-plan for the corridors and design of the traffic control center		1,000,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1,000,000.00	1,000,000.00	0.00	
A.4.2	Design and supervision of construction of the traffic control center at Kariakoo		500,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	290,000.00	290,000.00	210,000.00	
A.4.3	Construction of the Control Center		4,000,000.00				4,000,000.00	4,000,000.00	0.00	Based on information provided by DART
A.4.4	Supply and installation of the ITS along the BRT corridors and the traffic control center	M/S Idom Consulting Engineering	9,500,000.00	2,807,730.42	0.00	2,807,730.42	6,400,955.58	9,500,000.00	0.00	
		Simen Johann Andersen		291,314.00	0.00	291,314.00				
		M/S GSD PLUS		1,230,890.00	871,443.00	2,102,333.00		2,102,333.00		
		Softnet Technologies Ltd.		1,032,323.77		1,032,323.77		1,032,323.77		
A.4.5	Supply and installation of additional AFCs along BRT phase 3 and 4 corridors including smart cards	M/s Trapeze South Africa (PTY) Ltd Dai Nippon Printing Co. Ltd	3,000,000.00	4,338,153.62 400,960.00		4,338,153.62 400,960.00	0.00	4,338,153.62 400,960.00	(4,873,770.40)	
	Sub total Component A.4		18,000,000.00	10,101,371.82	871,443.00	10,972,814.82	11,690,955.58	22,663,770.40	(4,663,770.40)	
A.5	Improvement Support for Intergrated Transit-Oriented Development along the BRT Corridors									
A.5.1	Design of land use intergration with the BRT system along the BRT corridors		1,500,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	1,500,000.00	
A.5.2	Transaction advisory services for structuring of a PPP deal and procurement of a private investor (s) for selected hubs		2,500,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	2,500,000.00	2,500,000.00	0.00	Based on information provided by DART
	Sub total Component A.5		4,000,000.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	2,500,000.00	2,500,000.00	1,500,000.00	
	Contingencies		11,000,000.00			0.00	0.00	0.00	11,000,000.00	
	Sub total Component A		287,100,000.00	315,502,583.92	5,566,095.41	321,068,679.33	34,636,136.03	355,704,815.37	(68,604,815.37)	

Component B: Improvement of the Ubungo Intersection and Complementary Road Safety Infrastructure for the BRT Phase 1 System

(A)	(B)	(C)	(D)	(E)	(F)	(G) = (E)+(F)	(H)	(J) = (G)+(H)	(K) = (J) - (D)	(L)
	Project Component/ Activity	Contractor / Consultant	Credit (PAD) Amount (USD)	Original Contract Amount (USD)	Addendum Amount (USD)	Revised Contract Amount (USD)	Estimated Addition/omission to Complete (USD)	Total Amount Required to Completion (USD)	Variation to Credit (PAD) Amount (USD)	Remark/Status
B	Component B: Improvement of the Ubungo Intersection and Complementary Road Safety Infrastructure for the BRT Phase 1 System									
B.1	Subcomponent B.1: Upgrading the Safety of the Ubungo Intersection and Integration of the BRT Corridor with Ubungo Up-country Bus Terminal									
B.1.1	Civil works for the Ubungo intersection, link road, and up-country bus terminal	M/S CCECC	81,000,000	80,960,517	23,918,655	104,879,172	0	104,879,172	-23,879,172	The original design was amended to enhance road users' safety and hence the cost being higher than originally planned
B.1.2	Design review and supervision of construction of the Ubungo intersection, link road, and up-country bus terminal	M/S DASAN	5,000,000	3,754,037	0	3,754,037	-528,133	3,225,904	-995,823	
		M/S LEPOROGO		2,769,919	0	2,769,919	0	2,769,919		
B.1.6	Technical Audit for phase 1 works contract	M/S KAPSEL		328,250	0	328,250	0	328,250	-328,250	One-off activity and it's completed
	Sub total Component B.1		86,000,000.00	87,812,723.22	23,918,655.36	111,731,378.58	(528,132.94)	111,203,245.64	(25,203,245.64)	
B.2	Road Safety Strengthening along the BRT Corridor and Kimara-Mbezi Feeder Section									
B.2.1	Design and supervision of construction of NMT infrastructure (Kibo-Kimara), Kivukoni-Ferry terminal link, improvement of right-turning junctions, improvement of Kimara-Mbezi traffic, and road safety infrastructure	M/S SOOSUNG	1,500,000	301,834	87,368	389,202	0	389,202	344,238	Design Complete; Supervision is pending Works Contract
		M/S SOOSUNG		766,560	0	766,560	0	766,560		Design Complete; Supervision is pending Works Contract
B.2.2.1	Construction of NMT infrastructure (Ubungo-Kimara) and road safety - Package A	M/s Sichuan Road & Bridge (Group) Corp. Ltd	6,500,000	36,224,700	0	36,224,700	0	36,224,700	-37,741,107	The work scope of work was changed to fit with development of 8-lanes highway to Kibaha. The contract negotiations are complete. The contract will be signed on or before 30 June 2023.
B.2.2.2	Construction of NMT infrastructure Kivukoni-Ferry terminal link, improvement of right-turning junctions, improvement of Kimara-Mbezi traffic, and road safety infrastructure - Package B	M/s China Railway Seventh Group Co. Ltd		8,016,407	0	8,016,407	0	8,016,407		
B.2.3	Contract for performance-based management and maintenance of the BRT corridor	Mohammed Builders Ltd	3,000,000	4,637,011	0	4,637,011		4,637,011	-1,637,011	
B.2.4	Supervision of performance-based maintenance of the BRT corridor	Bene Consult Ltd	500,000	351,986	0	351,986	148,014	500,000	0	Financed by Road Funds
B.2.5	Desilting Msimbazi River & Maintenance of BRT 1 infrastructure	M/s MILEMBE	0	462,836	710,744	1,173,580	-161,461	1,012,120	-1,012,120	Completed
B.2.6	Consultancy Services for Checking the Contractor's Value Engineering for the Construction of Ubungo Interchange	M/S ARUP	0	324,965	117,244	442,209	0	442,209	-442,209	Completed
	Sub total Component B.2		11,500,000.00	51,086,298.68	915,356.96	52,001,655.64	(13,446.91)	51,988,208.73	(40,488,208.73)	
	Contingencies		2,400,000			0.00	0.00	0.00	2,400,000.00	
	Sub total Component B		99,900,000.00	138,899,021.90	24,834,012.32	163,733,034.22	(541,579.85)	163,191,454.37	(63,291,454.37)	