



## 1. Project Data

<b>Project ID</b> P144140	<b>Project Name</b> GH eTransform Ghana	
<b>Country</b> Ghana	<b>Practice Area(Lead)</b> Digital Development	
<b>L/C/TF Number(s)</b>	<b>Closing Date (Original)</b>	<b>Total Project Cost (USD)</b> 171,689,173.87
<b>Bank Approval Date</b> 24-Oct-2013	<b>Closing Date (Actual)</b>	
	<b>IBRD/IDA (USD)</b>	<b>Grants (USD)</b>
Original Commitment	212,000,000.00	0.00
Revised Commitment	165,724,651.53	0.00
Actual	171,689,173.87	0.00

<b>Prepared by</b> Ranga Rajan Krishnamani	<b>Reviewed by</b> Avjeet Singh	<b>ICR Review Coordinator</b> Avjeet Singh	<b>Group</b> IEGSD (Unit 4)
--	------------------------------------	---	--------------------------------

## 2. Project Objectives and Components

### a. Objectives

The Project Development Objective (PDO) as stated in the Financing Agreement (Schedule 1, page 5) and the Project Appraisal Document (PAD, page 6) is:

**" To improve the efficiency and coverage of government service delivery using Information Communication Technologies (ICTs) "**.



The PDO did not change with the Additional Financing (AF) approved for the project.

**b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?**

Yes

**Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?**

Yes

**Date of Board Approval**

30-Jun-2020

**c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?**

No

**d. Components**

There were four components (PAD, pages 8 - 11):

**1. Enabling Environment for Electronic Government and Business.** The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$15.45 million. The revised estimate after project restructuring was US\$30.44 million. The actual cost was US\$36.65 million. This component planned to support policies, laws, regulations and capacity building to stimulate supply and demand for electronic services. On the supply side, the activities aimed at providing an enabling environment for digital economy and on the demand side, supporting digital platforms to create jobs and entrepreneurship. Activities in this component: (i) software and hardware for developing cloud storage; (ii) developing institutional arrangements for data protection and electronic transactions; (iii) developing policies, regulations, datasets, capacity building for data analytics and upgrading shared facilities for open data; (iv) providing grants to entrepreneurs through developing innovation hubs. (v) capacity building of regulatory institutions.

**2. Support for Upgrading National Identification System and Online Verification Services.** The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$29.15 million. The revised estimate was US\$67.97 million. The actual cost was US\$57.51 million. This component planned to provide support for developing a national identification system for developing e-government services. Activities in this component: (i) support for implementing a national electronic ID system; (ii) support to key public sector user agencies to adjust their operating processes and software systems to use e-ID services offered by the National Identification Authority (NIA) system.

**3. Component Three - Scale up of Applications to Improve Service Delivery in Priority Sectors.** The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$41.55 million. The estimate after restructuring was US\$64.05 million. The actual cost was US\$64.49 million. This component aimed to support use of ICT in the health and education sectors as well as completing the key e-applications implemented under the previously Bank-financed eGhana project.

**4. Project Management Support.** The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$7.10 million. The revised estimate was US\$8.39 million. The actual cost was US\$12.11 million. This component aimed to provide support for project coordination, fiduciary and monitoring and evaluation management.



**Contingency and provision for exchange rate losses.** The Project allocated US\$3.5 million for meeting unanticipated needs. There were no contingencies during implementation.

**e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates**

**Project cost.** The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$97.00 million. With AF, the estimate was US\$179.07million. The actual cost was US\$171.68 million.

**Financing.** The Project was financed by an International Development Association (IDA) credit of US\$97.00 million. AF of US\$115.00 million was approved on June 30, 2020 to meet the financing gap for some key activities (discussed in section eight) and adding new activities (discussed below). With AF, the total bank financing was US\$212.00 million. The amount disbursed was US\$171.68 million. US\$32.89 million of the Credit (representing 15.5% of the Bank financing was cancelled. US\$7.00 million was lost due to exchange rate changes during implementation.

**Borrower contribution.** Borrower contribution was not planned. There was no borrower contribution during implementation.

**Dates.** The Project was approved on October 24, 2013 and became effective on September 19, 2014, with a scheduled closing date of June 30, 2019. AF was approved on June 30, 2020. The Mid-Term Review (MTR) was held on November 26, 2018. The Project closed on June 30, 2024.

**Changes.** There were four project restructurings during the project lifetime.

The following changes were made **through the first on January 17, 2018.**

- The activity of implementing the national ID system was cancelled, due to delays in reaching agreement between the Government and the WB team on the scope of work. This activity was to be financed by the Government.
- Funds allocated for the cancelled activity were reallocated for scaling up activities such as consolidating previously dispersed activities supporting public records digitization and internet connectivity, institutional support for the Cybersecurity Emergency Response Team (CERT), higher education connectivity, automated hydromet stations, digitizing post offices and automating functions in the Ministry of Communication and Digitization (MOCD).
- The closing date was extended by eighteen months from June 30, 2019 to December 31, 2020, for completing the ongoing activities.

The following changes were made with the second project **restructuring when AF was approved on October 6, 2020.**

- The project scope in addition to extending the coverage of fiber optic backbone connectivity and support last-mile connectivity, was expanded to support the government in establishing the government cloud data center, financing digital economy studies and scaling up e- procurement and e-Justice activities. New indicators were introduced in view of the increase in scope of Project activities.
- The closing date was extended to October 31, 2023.



The following changes were made with **the third project restructuring on December 1st, 2023**.

- The safeguards classification was revised from "C" to "B" (discussed in section 10).
- The closing date was extended from October 31, 2023, to November 30, 2023.

The following changes were made **with the fourth project restructuring on December 2023**.

- US\$32.89 million of the Bank financing was cancelled to focus on the implementation of critical remaining activities.
- The closing date was extended from November 30, 2023 to June 30, 2024 for completing the ongoing activities.

**Split rating.** The PDO was unchanged, and the scope was substantially expanded with the AF for the Project. Since the overall level of ambition increased, this review is not based on a split rating of objectives.

### 3. Relevance of Objectives

#### Rationale

**Country and sector context.** Ghana was a pioneer in African telecommunicator sector reform with a competitive market leading to high mobile penetration and reduced internet costs. Ghana had also become a key hub for submarine cables, resulting in increased internet bandwidth and reduced prices. Despite these achievements in the ICT sector at appraisal, under 15% of Ghana's population were using internet and only 1.7% using mobile broadband in 2011. Ghana's fragmented ID systems hindered authentication, increased the cost of doing electronic business, and limited the government's ability to provide targeted services. The objective of improving service delivery, especially in underserved areas and enhancing trust in payment systems and electronic businesses was an important part of the government strategy.

**Government strategy at appraisal.** The PDO was well-aligned with the Government strategy articulated in the " *Shared Growth and Development Agenda* " (GSGDA 1) for 2010 - 2023. The strategy emphasized the need for economic structural transformation and specifically identified the need for improving the quality and coverage of services in the health and education sectors in underserved communities. The strategy also underscored the need for improving the enabling environment for partnerships with the private sector in the ICT sector.

**Current government strategy.** The PDO continued to be relevant with the government's development priorities reflected in the focus on ICT sector development across various government policy documents, particularly the GSGDA 11 for 2014 - 2017) and the *Consolidated Program for Economic and Social Development Policies* (CPESDP) 1 and 2, *Agenda for Jobs* (2017 - 2022) and (2021 - 2025).

**World Bank (WB) strategy.** The Project continues to be relevant to the WB strategies. At appraisal, the PDO was consistent with the Country Partnership Strategy (CPS) for 2010 - 2013 that focused on: (i) improving public institutions; (ii) fostering competitiveness and employment; and (iii) protecting the poor and vulnerable. During implementation, the PDO was consistent with the CPF for 2013 - 2016 of improving competitiveness and job creation, enhancing service delivery and strengthening transparency and



accountability and the CPF of 2019 - 2022 of fostering economic diversification, boosting human capital development and strengthening governance. The PDO was consistent with the WB's 2012 ICT sector strategy. This strategy emphasized the need for leveraging connectivity for innovation and transformation of economies.

**Current WB strategy.** The PDO is well-aligned with the WB's current strategy for 2022 - 2025. The CPF reiterated the need for enhancing private sector development and job creation and improving service delivery, as well as promoting resilient and sustainable development.

**Previous Bank experience.** The Bank had previously financed the eGhana Project in the ICT sector. This project helped in laying the Information Technology architecture and interoperability framework to ensure that the processes and operational structures in government are closely aligned to achieve greater efficiency, accountability, responsiveness and transparency.

**The eTransform project scope.** The eTransform Project aimed to support the key remaining gaps to accelerate Ghana's path to a digital and knowledge-based economy. The project interventions were expected to lead to more efficient and use of limited public resources, improve delivery of public and private services in underserved areas, enhance trust in payment systems and electronic business and complete some activities that were started with the eGhana Project. The Project was also expected to contribute to diversified employment opportunities, and a more integrated and coordinated public sector with the ability to make better policies and to respond effectively to citizens' needs using trusted systems and open data. The project scope was expanded with the AF for the project.

**Relevance of the PDO.** The PDO was important in the country context and well-aligned with the Government strategy and the current Bank strategy for Ghana. The results chain was pitched at the appropriate outcome level of improving the efficiency and coverage of government service delivery using ICT's, which in turn would contribute to improving people's lives. The relevance of the PDO is rated as High.

## Rating

High

## 4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

### OBJECTIVE 1

#### Objective

PDO 1. To improve the efficiency of government service delivery using ICTs.

#### Rationale

**Theory of change.** Activities such as providing shared infrastructure, open data capacity, innovation centers and institutional development for data protection would increase data storage, open datasets and ICT-driven entrepreneurship. Digitizing public records and establishing high-speed connectivity in government and health



institutions are likely to contribute to increasing efficiency of delivery of government services using ICT, with efficiency measured in terms of time savings associated with accessing government services and to the long-term development outcome of accelerating economic growth. The causal links between project activities (inputs), outputs and the intended outcomes are logical, and the intended outcomes are monitorable. The intended outcomes are predicated on the critical assumptions that there is sustained government commitment and stakeholder cooperation during implementation.

### Outputs.

- 477 Government institutions were provided with bandwidth when the project closed, representing 199% of the set target.
- 1,428 Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) were provided with enhanced bandwidth, exceeding the target of 240. 197 schools and health centers were provided with enhanced bandwidth, slightly short of the target of 200.
- The project financed the membership fees for the Ghana Research and Education Network (GARNET) to join the European Union (EU) AfricaConnect 2 program, as targeted. As a result, 300,000 students and teachers (of which 45% were females) gained access to enhanced bandwidth, exceeding the target of 150,000.
- 315 datasets were uploaded and available on the Portal when the Project closed as targeted.
- 19 million Births and Deaths registry (BDR) were digitized, as compared to six million at the baseline. This exceeded the target of 14 million.
- 19,526,177 records were digitized at the Registrar General's Department, as compared to nine million at the baseline, exceeding the target of 14 million.
- Seven million records were digitized in the Judicial Service of Ghana, as compared to 2,500,000 at the baseline, and exceeding the target of five million.
- 8,695,000 records were digitized in Ghana Immigration Services as compared to 2.5 million at the baseline, exceeding the target of five million.
- 55 tertiary institutions were connected to the internet with support provided to the Ghanaian Academic and Research Network (GARNET). 300,000 students and teachers benefitted from enhanced internet access under the project, exceeding its target of 150,000. 197 schools and health centers were connected out of a 200 target
- 146 schools and health centers were connected to the internet when the project closed, representing 73% of the set target.
- 1,485 teachers were trained in computer/internet aided education, exceeding the target of 1,400 teachers. Of this, 312 teachers were women, exceeding the target of 300.
- 54,607 people were trained under the project, far exceeding the target of 3,000. This included 17,189 males and 13,442 females.
- A National Cybersecurity Center, National Information Technology Agency (NITA) Security Operation Center (NITA) and an Information Sharing and Monitoring Program were established as targeted. Cybersecurity awareness campaigns and training were provided for children, public, government and businesses, as well as a 24/7 point of contact to report incidents. There were no targets for this indicator. The ICR noted that Ghana's Global Cybersecurity landscape improved. Ghana's Global Cybersecurity Index score improved since 2017 (36%) to 99% in 2024.
- Three Technology Hubs were created as targeted. The technological hubs helped in mobilizing around US\$0.54 million private sector investments.





- ICT equipment was provided to 50 Post Offices to provide e-services to citizens. There were no targets for this indicator. Ten Automatic Weather stations were installed to the Ghana Meteorological Agency as targeted to provide weather information to citizens.
- A strategic plan for an integrated eHealth system was developed under the project as targeted. Electronic Procurement System were rolled out in 870 entities. There were no targets for this indicator. The Integrated Information Management System (IIMS) was deployed in 2019 locations. There were no targets for this indicator. A modern server room was established to serve the parliamentary service and 17 out of the 20 processes were automated as targeted.
- Verification/authentication systems to established at the National Identification Authority to verify over 17 million Ghana cards, Ghana Immigration Services to issue E-visas and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs Passports.
- Three certification authorities were established, exceeding the target of one.

**Outcomes.** The outputs described above were expected to improve efficiency of government service delivery using ICTs, with efficiency measured in terms of time savings associated with accessing government services.

- Average number of days required to process a birth/death certificate declined from 15 at the baseline to seven days, meeting the revised target of seven days.
- Average number of days required to process company registration declined from four days at the baseline to two days, meeting the target of two days.
- Eight new e-Government applications were providing service to the public when the project closed as compared to three e-Government applications, exceeding the target of seven.

Efficacy of this PDO is rated as substantial, as the outcomes were achieved or exceeded.

### **Rating**

Substantial

## **OBJECTIVE 2**

### **Objective**

PDO 2. To improve the coverage of government service delivery using ICTs.

### **Rationale**

**Theory of change.** Activities such as e-applications, e-services, weather stations and educational technology using ICT services would be likely to expand access to electronic services for citizens. These outputs are likely to contribute to improving the coverage of government service delivery using ICTs and to the long-run development outcome of accelerating economic growth. The causal links between project activities (inputs), outputs and the intended outcomes are logical and the intended outcomes are monitorable. The intended outcomes are predicated on the critical assumptions that there is sustained government commitment and stakeholder cooperation during implementation.

### **Outputs.**



In addition to the outputs described above, the following outputs were relevant for this objective.

- The new services introduced under the Project included as targeted: authentication of marriage certificate and certified copy of marriage, Search and authentication of birth certificate, authentication of Police Report and Checking exams results for Ghana Post Office.

**Outcomes.** The outputs are expected to improve coverage of government service delivery using ICTs, with coverage measured in terms of: (i) number of new e-services available to the public online: and (ii) number of teachers and students using educational portals including in rural areas.

- Sixteen new e-services were available to the public when the project closed as targeted, as compared to eight at the baseline.
- 20,245 teachers and students using education portals including in rural areas, short of the target of 40,000. This shortfall was due to the delayed deployment of portals due to changes in project scope by the Ministry of Education.

Efficacy of this PDO is rated as Substantial.

**Rating**  
Substantial

## **OVERALL EFFICACY**

### **Rationale**

Overall efficacy is rated as substantial, as most of the intended outcomes were realized.

### **Overall Efficacy Rating**

Substantial

## **5. Efficiency**

**Economic analysis.** A Benefit-Cost Ratio (BCR) analysis was conducted at appraisal and at closure. However, due to major changes in scope that took place with the AF and ten year project cycle, the methodology was not the same. Hence, this review reports the results of the BCR at closure. The project benefits were assumed to come from: (i) increase in broadband connectivity (from backbone to last mile) (ii) development of the ICT sector: (iii) Government savings; (iv) cybersecurity protection; and (v) increase in productivity due to digital training. These investments accounted for 64% of the project cost.





The broadband connectivity compared the benefits of internet penetration with the Project. The benefits to connectivity were assumed to come from increased productivity and the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) was expected to grow by 5% over a ten year period. The cybersecurity cost was estimated to decrease due to yearly cyber attacks due to strengthened capacity to prevent them. Over a 15 year time horizon, the Net Present Value (NPV) of digital skills and entrepreneurship was US\$2.43 million with an Economic Rate of Return of 21%.

**Operational and administrative issues during implementation.** The Project approved in October 2013, became effective almost a year later in September 2014, due to delays including scheduling a session in the Ghana Parliament for approval and delays in completing the Project Implementation Manual in August 2014. Changes in management and leadership in agencies resulted in delays with certifying the National Data Center (which took three years). Frequent changes in scope requirements for the education portal also delayed implementation. There were procurement delays including delays in receiving no objections from the World Bank team. There were coordination issues between agencies, particularly over right-of-way. This caused further delays during implementation.

There were cost overruns with costs of several activities (such as digitalization and ejustice) underestimated, which were covered by the AF for the Project. There were time overruns, with the closing date for both the original and the AF project, although the time overruns in the final years were exacerbated by factors outside the control of the Project (restrictions due to the COVID-19 pandemic).

Overall efficiency is rated as modest, due to the lack of a robust economic analysis and operational and administrative issues during implementation.

### Efficiency Rating

Modest

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

\* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

### 6. Outcome

The relevance of the PDO to the Government strategy and the current WB strategy for Ghana is rated as High. Overall efficacy is rated as substantial, as most of the intended outcomes were realized. Efficiency is rated as Modest. Taking these ratings into account, overall efficacy is rated as Moderately Satisfactory.



a. **Outcome Rating**  
Moderately Satisfactory

## 7. Risk to Development Outcome

**Government commitment.** The ICR (para 64) notes that government institutions (such as the Cyber Security Authority, the National Technology Agency (NITA) involved in the project will maintain their operational structures to support ongoing projects. Likewise, the technology hubs will remain under the management of their private sector partners, having established strong local and international partnerships.

**Financial risk.** There is financial risk to the sustainability of development outcome. The ICR notes that many offered by the hubs are free, relying on grant funding. It is not clear if the hubs would have continued funding in future. The ICR also notes that government institutions maintain the systems with government funding. However, these institutions face challenges in paying for the licenses needed for operating and maintaining the electronic applications.

**Institutional risk.** There is institutional risk to the sustainability of development outcome, given the high staff turnover rates and additional capacity needs of the beneficiary institutions.

## 8. Assessment of Bank Performance

### a. Quality-at-Entry

The Bank prepared this Project base on the experiences of WB's ICT sector units in implementing ICT projects worldwide and the WB's experience with the Bank financed eGhana Project. Key lessons incorporated included: (i) recognizing the importance of setting up applications keeping in view the country's readiness in terms of policies, laws and local capabilities; (ii) need for supporting cross-sector enablers, in terms of shared infrastructure and services; (iii) ensuring that e-government solutions and platforms are part of broader reforms; and (iv) recognizing that procurement of ICT goods and services require specialized expertise in ICT. The analytical underpinnings of the Project were robust and based on the WB analytical studies on ICT projects.

The implementation arrangements were similar to the arrangements which was proven to be successful in the previously financed eGhana project. The arrangements included: (i) The Ministry of Communications and Digitization (MOCD) was overall in charge of executing the Project; and (ii) The Project Implementation Unit (PIU) was in charge of day-to-day implementation.

The Bank identified several risks, including moderate risks with stakeholder engagement, governance and the legal and regulatory environment. With mitigation measures, the Project risk was rated as Moderate at appraisal (PAD, page 15). The arrangements made at appraisal for fiduciary compliance were appropriate (discussed in Section 10).

There was a moderate shortcoming at Quality-at-Entry. One, there was a financing gap as the costs of certain key activities (such as connectivity provisions and the upscale of eprocurement) higher than



expected at appraisal. The financing gap was partly covered with the AF for the Project. and two, it is not clear if there was enough engagement with stakeholders at appraisal. Lagging stakeholder engagement caused delays during implementation of the connectivity component.

Bank performance at Quality-at-Entry is rated as moderately satisfactory.

### **Quality-at-Entry Rating**

Moderately Satisfactory

#### **b. Quality of supervision**

There were nineteen Implementation Status and Results Reports (ISRRs) over the project lifetime, implying twice a year supervision missions. The Bank was responsive to the Government's evolving needs during implementation, as demonstrated by the quick turnaround to provide AF and major restructurings. Close collaboration between the WB and MOCD helped in identifying and responding to the Government's new priorities, including vital interventions such as cybersecurity, authentication and verification systems and cloud storage solutions. Although the continuity of leadership was hampered with four task team leaders (TTLs) during the project lifetime of ten years, WB's implementation support was facilitated by the relocation of the last TTL to Accra. This helped in providing on-ground support to the implementing agency.

There were some shortcomings. First, the WB task team could have mitigated E&S risks by adequately incorporating E&S compliance during the AF. and secondly, the delays in receiving no objections from the WB team contributed to the procurement delays during implementation.

The quality of supervision is rated as moderately satisfactory.

Overall Bank performance is rated as moderately satisfactory.

### **Quality of Supervision Rating**

Moderately Satisfactory

### **Overall Bank Performance Rating**

Moderately Satisfactory

## **9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization**

### **a. M&E Design**

The PIU unit in MOCD was in charge of M&E. The M&E team at the MOCD had gained experience in working with external consultants in developing robust indicators for monitoring project performance. Even though the key outcome indicators were adequate for monitoring the PDO, there were some minor M&E design shortcomings. The ICR notes that connectivity outcomes could have been better supplemented with indicators for quality, resilience, increased international bandwidth and reduced cost per Giga bite per



second. At the PDO level, increased usage of electronic systems would have captured impact more effectively than only the service processing times. Key activities like cybersecurity were not included in the results framework.

### **b. M&E Implementation**

The ICR (para 53) noted that M&E implementation was satisfactory. The Results Framework effectively captured progress towards the PDO. Timely tracking and submission of semi-annual reports submitted to the Bank and stakeholders helped in refining project scope and setting targets during AF. The ICR notes that M&E was particularly strong for Tech Hubs, tracking job creation and gathering feedback from beneficiaries. However, there was no strong justification for target revisions during the last restructuring, as the project scope remained unchanged.

### **c. M&E Utilization**

The ICR (para 54) noted that the Project's results were released on a regular basis and assessed against the established targets. Proactive stakeholder engagement ensured comprehensive data collection and dissemination and the achievements were regularly communicated through the e-Transform Newsletter.

Overall M&E is rated as substantial, due to the minor shortcomings in M&E design and implementation.

### **M&E Quality Rating**

Substantial

## **10. Other Issues**

### **a. Safeguards**

The Project was classified as a Category C (no assessment) under the WB safeguard policies at appraisal. With the AF for the Project, the Project was classified as a Category B (partial assessment) Project. Two safeguard policies were triggered: Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01) and Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP 4.12).

**Environmental Assessment and Involuntary Resettlement.** The adverse environmental impacts (such as due to e-waste management and occupational health and safety, and economic losses from business displacement) were expected to be site-specific and minor. A Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) was prepared and publicly disclosed to address environmental and resettlement issues.

There were delays with environmental compliance during implementation due to the need for vendors to secure environmental permits, lack of resettlement clauses in contracts and late hiring of the E&S specialists. The ICR noted that safety compliance was inconsistent, as site visits revealed lapses despite



warning signs. The ICR noted that the WB could have incorporated E&S compliance at earlier stages during AF.

**b. Fiduciary Compliance**

**Financial Management (FM).** The Bank conducted a FM assessment of the PIU at the MOCD at appraisal. The assessment concluded that the FM arrangements were satisfactory and the FM risk was rated as moderate.

The FM was rated as moderately satisfactory (ICR, para 57). The ICR noted that annual external reports were generally satisfactory, though there were delays in implementation. Delays in internal approvals within MOCD also hindered fund access and project implementation.

**Procurement Management.** The Bank conducted a procurement assessment at appraisal. The MOCD had executed previous Bank-funded projects and was familiar with the Bank's procurement policies and procedures. The procurement risk was rated as Moderate at appraisal.

The procurement management was rated as moderately satisfactory (ICR, para 58). Although the procurement process was generally acceptable, it faced challenges during implementation, such as longer-than- expected evaluation and post-review clearance times. There were complaints over a few large procurements, and in January 2024, the WB Integrity Vice Presidency initiated an investigation into last-minute connectivity due to integrity concerns.

**c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)**

There were no unintended impacts.

**d. Other**

---

**11. Ratings**

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
Bank Performance	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
Quality of M&E	High	Substantial	There were minor M&E design shortcomings.
Quality of ICR	---	Substantial	



## 12. Lessons

The ICR draws the following main lessons from the experience of implementing this Project, with some adaptation of language.

**1. Flexible design may help in adapting to the government's evolving needs, especially in rapidly evolving ICT projects.** The later inclusion of components such as cybersecurity, authentication and verification systems, cloud storage and expanded connectivity to many government institutions in this project, resulted in significant positive outcomes for the beneficiary institutions. These adjustments ensured that the project remained relevant to the government agenda throughout implementation.

**2. Strong stakeholder engagements in the early stages of design can help in mitigating project risks.** The lesson from this project is that continuous and proactive consultation with affected communities can help in mitigating risks and that future projects should leverage robust stakeholder engagement strategies that includes early consultation, ongoing updates and feedback mechanisms to ensures community involvement.

**3. Given rapid changes in technology in the ICT sector and the cost of licenses may help in ensuring long-term sustainability of e-government applications.** The discontinuation of the e immigration activity, which could have continued to generate positive outcomes, was due to the system becoming obsolete. The lesson is that permanent licenses and sufficient government budgetary allocations need to be secured for the sustainability of applications.

## 13. Assessment Recommended?

No

## 14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The ICR is clear, well-written and more or less, adheres to the recommended length. The theory of change articulated in the text clearly shows the causal links between the project activities (inputs), outputs and the desired outcomes. The analysis and evidence provided in the text is sufficient for evaluating project performance. The ICR draws reasonably good lessons from the experience of implementing this ICT project.

One minor shortcoming is that the text contains abbreviations and acronyms which are not spelled out in the data sheet.

### a. Quality of ICR Rating

Substantial

