



1. Project Data

Project ID P163490	Project Name HT Rural Accessibility & Resilience	
Country Haiti	Practice Area(Lead) Transport	
L/C/TF Number(s) IDA-D3230,IDA-D6690,IDA-D9810	Closing Date (Original) 30-Jun-2023	Total Project Cost (USD) 130,539,610.40
Bank Approval Date 31-May-2018	Closing Date (Actual) 30-May-2025	
	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)
Original Commitment	138,000,000.00	0.00
Revised Commitment	130,594,989.63	0.00
Actual	130,593,636.44	0.00

Prepared by Ranga Rajan Krishnamani	Reviewed by Chikako Miwa	ICR Review Coordinator Avjeet Singh	Group IEGSD (Unit 4)
--------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------	--------------------------------

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The Project Development Objectives (PDOs) as stated in the Financing Agreement (Schedule 1, Page 4) and in the Project Appraisal Document (PAD, page 1) is similar:

- (i) Increase all-weather road access in selected sub-regions; and**
- (ii) Improve the resiliency of selected segments of the road network.**



The PDOs as stated in the Additional Financing (AF) Agreement approved on March 17, 2022.

- (i) Increase all-weather road access in selected sub-regions;**
- (ii) Improve the resilience of selected segments of the road network; and**
- (iii) To provide immediate and effective response to an eligible emergency.**

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

Yes

Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?

Yes

Date of Board Approval

17-Mar-2022

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?

No

d. Components

There were five components:

(a) Increase all-weather road access in selected sub-regions. The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$45.00 million. With AF, actual cost was US\$90.00 million. This component aimed to improve all-weather road access on the South, South-East and Nippes departments. Activities in this component included: (i) rehabilitating tertiary and rural roads (400 kilometer (Km)); (ii) building small complementary facilities, such as lighting, bus stops and safety structures; (iii) Technical Assistance (TA), training, and developing guidelines for the national all-weather rural road access program; (iv) financing local mobility plans; and (v) coastal protection and slope stabilization.

(b) Improve the resilience of selected segments of the road network. The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$22.00 million. The actual cost was US\$3.20 million. The ICR (page 36) notes that there were shortcomings in the financial reporting of allocation of funds. When the Contingent Emergency Response Component (CERC) was triggered, US\$30.00 million was reallocated from components 1 and 2 for emergency activities. Although AF 2 meant to restore the funds to these components, US\$15.00 million was improperly reflected in records and reported under component 1 in the Interim Financial Reports (IFRs). As a result, although more money was actually used for component two, only US\$3.20 million was officially reported.

This component aimed to strengthen the resilience of primary and secondary roads against climate change and extreme weather events. Activities in this component included: (i) rehabilitating bridges on selected segments; (ii) reinforcing coastal protection, hydraulic protection for bridges and slope stabilization works; (iii) financing a vulnerability study of primary and secondary roads for identifying critical points; (iv) financing



for a National Bridge Management Program; (v) a Roadmap for improving resilience of the primary network; and (vi) a Planning and Bridge Assessment and Management System.

(c) Promoting Sustainable Development. The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$3.00 million. The actual cost was US\$1.00 million. This component aimed to strengthen the institutional capacity of the Ministry of Public Works, Transport and Communication (MTPTC); Activities in this component included: (i) assistance to MTPTC on resilient transport and asset management; and (ii) sustainable urban transport policies and management through investment strategy and planning.

(d) CERC. The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$1.00 million. The actual cost was US\$30.30 million. This component planned to provide immediate assistance in the event of an eligible emergency. This component was triggered following the earthquake on August 14, 2021.

(e) Project Management. The estimated cost at appraisal was US\$4.00 million. The actual cost was US\$6.00 million. This component planned to support the MTPTC and its Central Execution Unit (UCE) through providing goods, consultant's services, training and financing operating costs.

e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates

Project cost. The estimated cost with AF was US\$138.00 million. The actual cost was US\$130.59 million.

Project financing. The project was financed by an International Development Association (IDA) Grant of US\$75.00 million. AFs of US\$30.00 million and US\$33.00 million were approved in 2020 and 2022 respectively. The total Bank financing for the project was US\$138.00 million. The amount disbursed was US\$130.59 million. US\$2.90 million of the Grant was cancelled at government request (discussed below).

Borrower contribution. Borrower contribution was not planned.

Dates. The Project was approved on May 31, 2018, and became effective on September 4, 2018. AF 1 was approved on June 18, 2020. AF 2 was approved on March 17, 2022. The Mid-Term Review (MTR) was held on November 22, 2021. The project closed on May 30, 2025.

These changes were made **with the first AF for the project, approved on June 18, 2020.**

- The scope of component one was expanded to incorporate activities from the ongoing Bank-financed Haiti Center and Artibonite Regional Development Project.
- The closing date was extended by a year from June 30, 2023, to June 28, 2024.

These changes were made **with the second AF for the project on March 17, 2022.**

- The PDO was modified to account for the activation of the CERC in the wake of August 14, 2021 earthquake, which damaged over 850 km of the road network. An additional PDO indicator was added to reflect the CERC activities.
- AF was used to replenish the financing for components one and two for financing the emergency response.
- The closing date was extended by 11 months from June 28, 2024, to May 30, 2025.



The following changes were made through a **level 2 restructuring on May 30, 2025**.

The following activities (construction of a market, maintenance center and two bridges) were cancelled. Funds for these activities (US\$2.90 million) were cancelled at government request.

Split rating. With the AFs, the scope of the project increased substantially. Therefore, this review does not use the split rating methodology to determine the outcome rating.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

Country context. With a Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of US\$1,272 and Human Capital Index (HCI) ranking of 170 out of 189 countries in 2021, Haiti is the poorest country in the Western Hemisphere. Haiti also suffers from recurrent episodes of institutional and political instability. Although growth before appraisal had reduced national poverty between 2000 and 2012, poverty was disproportionately concentrated in rural areas (with 75% of rural population classified as poor and 38% as extremely poor). Haiti is also vulnerable to natural hazards such as earthquakes and hurricanes. Haiti is classified as a Fragile, Conflict and Violent (FCV) country due to its institutional and political instability, lack of social cohesion and opportunities and weak implementation capacity.

Sector context. Roads are the main transport mode in Haiti for moving passengers and freight. However, the road network was limited to about 3,450 kilometers (km) of national roads, 1500 km of departmental roads and tertiary roads, for a territory of 28,223 km. Mobility of goods and people were constrained due to poor road conditions. In 2015, just over a third (39%) of the population lived within 2 km of all-weather road. Despite significant investments in the past decade on national roads, 50% of the national territory was poorly connected and entire regions isolated for days during the rainy season and following major storms and hurricanes. About 32% of GDP of the damages and losses were caused by hurricane Matthew. Of this 18% were in the transport sector due to the destruction of roads and bridges.

Government Strategy. The Government strategy outlined in the *Strategic Development Plan (PSDH)* prioritized, climate resilience and access to all-weather roads. The plan aimed to construct 4,000 km of roads for improving intercity and rural connectivity.

World Bank (WB) strategy. The PDOs were relevant to the WB strategy outlined in the: *Haiti Opportunities for All - Systematic Country Diagnostic (SCD, Report No 99566)* and the WBG's *Country Partnership Framework (CPF)* for FY 2025 - 2029. The SCD identified: (a) poor connectivity; (ii) extreme vulnerability; and (iii) poor transport quality, as binding constraints for reducing poverty. The PDOs were relevant to the CPF Focus Area two "*Human Capital*" and the Focus Area three of "*Resilience*". The PDOs were also aligned with the WB's global priorities highlighted in the *WB Climate Action Plan 2016 -2020* and the *Gender Strategy 2016 - 2023*, which set targets of 28% for climate-related financing and closing gender gaps as core development objectives.

Previous Bank Experience. The Bank has financed several projects in Haiti since its reengagement with Haiti in 2004. This current transport project was coordinated with activities financed under other ongoing



Bank-financed projects such as "*Relaunching Agriculture: Strengthening Public Services II*": "*Center and Artibonite Regional Development Project*". and "*Disaster Risk Management and Reconstruction Project*".

Relevance of PDO. The PDOs are appropriate in the country context. The PDO 1 of improving access to all-weather roads in rural areas is relevant, given the disproportionate concentration of poverty in rural areas. The PDO 2 of improving resiliency of national roads is appropriate as Haiti is vulnerable to natural disasters. The activities of institutional strengthening of transport agencies are appropriate since roads are the main transport mode in Haiti. The PDOs were aligned with Government strategy and the current Bank strategy. The relevance of the PDOs is rated as High.

Rating

High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

OBJECTIVE 1

Objective

(i) Increase all-weather road access in selected sub-regions.

Rationale

Theory of Change. The outputs such as rehabilitating tertiary roads, building complementary facilities, along with TA for a national all-weather rural access program and rural Investment and local territorial mobility plans, were likely to help in the outcome of increasing all-weather access roads. The labor-intensive activities envisioned at design could help in providing employment opportunities to Haitians in the fragile country context. The causal links between inputs, outputs and outcomes were logical. The outcomes were monitorable. The theory of change assumes that the macroeconomic and political environment continues to be stable and there are no adverse external shocks during the project period.

Outputs.

- 554 km of roads were rehabilitated under the project, exceeding the target of 480 km. This included: (i) 499 km of rural roads, exceeding the target of 430 km. and (ii) 55 km of non-rural roads, exceeding the target of 50Km. These activities were complemented by facilities such as bus stops, lighting and safety structures to enhance the safety of the road network as targeted. Beneficiary survey conducted at closure showed that 85% of the respondents confirmed a reduction of road accidents on project roads.
- Three climate informed territorial mobility plans that incorporated women's security needs were developed as targeted.
- 80% of respondents in a beneficiary survey considered that the design of investments responded to their needs, exceeding the target of 70%. 95% of the respondents were women, exceeding the target of 90%.



- 720,620 people could access regional markets within 120 minutes in selected project areas as compared to 525,000 at the baseline and exceeding the target of 660,000. 327,000 women could access obstetrical facilities within 60 minutes in select project areas as compared to 255,000 at the baseline and exceeding the target of 330,000.
- Four critical bridges were built in the Center of Artibonite Loop (CAL) region as targeted. Five spot interventions were completed to enhance all-weather and resilient connectivity in the selected sub-regions of the CAL region as targeted. One Road Maintenance Center was built in the CAL region as targeted.
- 166 people were trained within selected communities on Basic Rural Road Maintenance in the CAL region, slightly short of the target of 200. 75% of the trained people were women, exceeding the target of 35%.
- 153,590 workdays were created for 10,264 rural residents, of which 1,096 were women. There were no targets for these indicators.
- Four urban and rural markets were rehabilitated in selected sub-regions of the CAL region as targeted.
- Four urban plans were developed in consultation with local officials and stakeholders in selected sub-regions of the CAL region, exceeding the target of three plans. The Regional development dashboard with open data including spatial analysis encompassing risk and climate data was developed with local officials and stakeholders in the CAL region as targeted.
- 100% of the grievances registered related to delivery of project benefits were resolved, exceeding the target of 80%.

Outcomes. The outputs were expected to aid in increasing the share of population with access to an all-weather access roads in the selected sub-regions.

- There was substantial improvement in the Rural Accessibility Index, with 63% of the population having access to all-weather roads (living within 2 km of all-weather roads), as compared to 36% at the baseline in 2017. This exceeded the target of 55%.

Efficacy of this PDO is rated as High, as the intended outcomes were realized and most activities completed in the FCV context.

Rating
High

OBJECTIVE 2

Objective

(ii) Improve the resilience of selected segments of the road network.

Rationale

Theory of change. The outputs such as rehabilitating vulnerable spots such as bridges, culverts and river crossings along primary and secondary roads and constructing drainage structures, TA for developing a National Bridge Management Program, strengthening the institutional capacity of the MTPTC for planning and



financing a pre-feasibility study for urban corridors, were likely to help in improving the resilience of selected segments of the national road network. The causal links between inputs, outputs and outcomes were logical. The outcomes were monitorable.

Outputs.

- Eight critical bridges were rehabilitated to climate-resilient standards on the primary and secondary road network as targeted.
- 124 critical spot/segments were built or rehabilitated on the primary and secondary road network, slightly short of the original target of 150. Beneficiary surveys conducted at closure indicated that 82% of respondents reported improved preparedness for natural disasters and 87% noting fewer disruptions during the rainy season.
- The Bridge Management System within MTPTC was developed and functional when the project closed as targeted.
- The road safety assessments and measures were included as part of all technical design and feasibility studies as targeted.
- The activity associated with the climate resilient and sustainable mobility roadmap and associated monitoring tool was not fully completed when the project closed.
- The road traffic database and monitoring tool could not be fully completed due to the ongoing security challenges that prevented data collection.

Outcomes. The outputs were expected to contribute to increasing the number of people living in areas who were connected to national roads that were upgraded to a climate resilient standard.

- 902,267 people were connected to national roads that were upgraded to a climate resilient standard, exceeding the target of 700,000.

Efficacy of this PDO is rated as High, as the intended outcomes were realized in an FCV context.

Rating

High

OBJECTIVE 3

Objective

(iii) To provide immediate and effective response to an eligible emergency.

Rationale

Theory of change. This objective aimed at providing immediate response in the wake of an eligible emergency. This component was triggered in the wake of the earthquake in 2021.

Outputs.

- Eight critical bridges or rehabilitated, exceeding the target of seven.



- 90 critical spots were treated, exceeding the target of 80.

Outcomes. The outputs described above were expected to increase the number of people with restored access to the road network following the earthquake.

- 422, 337 people had restored access to the road network following the earthquake, exceeding the target of 407,000.

Rating
High

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

Overall efficacy is rated as High, given that the intended outcomes were realized in an FCV context.

Overall Efficacy Rating

High

5. Efficiency

Economic analysis. A preliminary analysis was conducted at appraisal using a "framework approach", as the final road segments were to be finalized during implementation. The analysis was based on an analysis of similar roads and complementary investments in Haiti. The quantifiable benefits were expected to come from reduced vehicle operating costs (VOCs), travel time savings due to increased accessibility to markets, opportunities and health centers and reduction in traffic accidents. The analysis of similar projects suggested that the proposed project was economically viable.

An economic analysis was conducted at closure for components one, two and four activities. These activities accounted for approximately 95% of the actual cost. The project benefits were assumed to come from: (i) a reduction in climate impacts; (ii) lower road user costs due to less traffic disruptions; (iii) a decrease in the frequency of road crashes; and (iv) economic benefits of greenhouse gas emission. The net present value (NPV) at 12% discount rate was US\$32.70 million. The Economic Internal Rate of Return (EIRR) was 17.1% and the Benefit-Cost Ratio (BCR) was 1.33.

Operational Issues during implementation. The project was implemented smoothly, despite the external factors affecting the country. The average per unit cost was US\$159,000 per km for rural roads, US\$78,000 per critical spot and US\$863,000 per bridge intervened. The rural roads were rehabilitated at a lower per unit cost



than assumed at appraisal (US\$200,000/km). The 23-month extension was to accommodate the new activities added through the AFs.

Efficiency is rated as High as the project demonstrated effective use of resources in a FCV context.

Efficiency Rating

High

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate	✓	17.10	95.00 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

The relevance of PDOs is High. Overall efficacy is High, given that the intended outcomes were realized in a FCV context. Efficiency is High as the project demonstrated effective use of resources. Taking these ratings into account, outcome is rated as Highly Satisfactory.

a. Outcome Rating

Highly Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

Government Commitment. There is risk to the sustainability of development outcome, given that there may not be enough resources for maintaining the rural and national roads rehabilitated under this project. Lack of funding for maintenance could cause deterioration of the road network, especially in Haiti's disaster-prone environment. Likewise, there is risk that project's achievements in repairing health centers could be undermined by inadequate investments.

Political risk. There is risk to the sustainability of development outcomes, given the political instability to date and persisting insecurity and gang wars in many parts of Haiti.



8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The Bank prepared this project based on the Bank's global experience with all-weather access and lessons from transport projects in Haiti. Lessons incorporated at design included: (i) Simplifying the design and focusing on providing all-weather road access, resiliency of national roads and institutional strengthening of transport agencies, given the FCV context; (ii) focusing on limited number of geographical areas of intervention. and (iii) a flexible design including provisions for responding emergencies, given that Haiti is prone to natural hazards. The Bank prepared this project based on a 'framework' approach, by deferring the economic feasibility of the project, once the project sites were identified during implementation. The roads were to be selected on the basis of Rural Access Index (RAI) criteria.

The Project Implementation Unit (PIU) in the Ministry of Public Works, Transport and Communications (MTPTU) was in charge of implementing the project. The PIU (UCE-MTPTC) had implemented transport projects in Haiti and was familiar with the Bank's fiduciary and safeguards requirements. The implementation arrangements made at appraisal were appropriate, as project performance was not compromised by the arrangements made at appraisal.

The Bank identified several risks including substantial risks with political and governance, weak implementation capacity and fiduciary risk. Even with mitigation measures, project risk was rated as substantial at appraisal, given the FCV context (PAD, para 44). The mitigation measures were appropriate, as project performance was not undermined by the risks identified at appraisal.

The arrangements made at appraisal for safeguards and fiduciary compliance were appropriate (discussed in section 10).

Quality-at-Entry Rating

Highly Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

The Bank conducted thirteen supervision missions (both in person and virtual) during the project lifetime. These missions helped in identifying and resolving bottlenecks. The project benefitted from the field presence of a multi-disciplinary team throughout implementation, with few turnovers. This enabled regular dialogue with the Government. The supervision team aided in identifying issues and timely adapting to crisis situations (such as the 2021 earthquake). This supported smooth implementation on the ground. The supervision team aided in clarifying the minor shortcomings in M&E through the project restructurings. During implementation, the Bank secured five trust funds totaling US\$1.70 million. This assisted in effective oversight. The support provided by the supervision team aided in safeguards and fiduciary compliance (discussed in section 10).

Overall Bank performance is rated as Highly satisfactory.



Quality of Supervision Rating

Highly Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating

Highly Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The M&E framework was robust, with clear objectives, comprehensive indicators and explicit responsibilities. The key outcome and intermediate indicators were specific, measurable and appropriate for monitoring project performance (discussed in Section four). The original indicators were adequate, although some could have more clarity on the definition and methodology. These indicators were rectified through the AF1. At design, a dedicated monitoring and evaluation staff of the PIU was overall in charge of M&E. The key outcome and intermediate indicators were appropriate for monitoring project performance.

b. M&E Implementation

The ICR (para 58) reports that M&E implementation was consistent. Data was collected regularly and field missions enabled close monitoring, even in hard-to-reach areas. The project adapted to security and logistical challenges by hiring local staff. Although there was incomplete data archiving, these issues did not deter effective monitoring. New indicators were added appropriately when the CERC component was triggered. Given that most activities were identified during implementation rather than at appraisal, the project proactively used its restructuring to revise definitions and providing detailed methodologies for data collection.

c. M&E Utilization

M&E data were utilized to inform project restructurings (such as activating CERC after the earthquake). M&E findings were used to inform project adjustments and prioritize actions. The quality of the intended outcomes was reinforced through beneficiary surveys.

Overall M&E is rated as Substantial.

M&E Quality Rating

Substantial

10. Other Issues



a. Safeguards

The Project was classified as a Category B (Partial Assessment) project. Four safeguard policies were triggered at appraisal (PAD, page 4): Environmental Assessment (OP/BP 4.01); Natural Habitats (OP/BP 4.04); Physical Cultural Resources (OP/BP 4.11); and Involuntary Resettlement (OP/BP 4.12).

Environmental Assessment, Natural Habitats and Physical Cultural Resources. The activities were expected to be small to medium scale, with no significant or irreversible adverse environmental impacts. The Natural Habitats safeguards was triggered as a precautionary measure. The safeguards on Physical Cultural Resources was triggered to address "chance finds". An Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) was prepared and publicly disclosed at appraisal to address these safeguards (PAD, 65).

Overall environmental safeguard performance was rated as Satisfactory (ICR, para 61), Site specific Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMP) were developed during implementation. A significant incident resulting in a fatality occurred in October 2021, when a truck engaged in loading operations experienced brake failure and struck a nearby child. Following this, the implementing agency a corrective action plan, which was executed satisfactorily.

Involuntary Resettlement. The project activities could involve land acquisition and resettlement. A Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF) was prepared and publicly disclosed at appraisal to address these issues (PAD, para 65).

Overall social safeguard performance was rated as Satisfactory (ICR, para 61). A Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) was developed and publicly-disclosed during implementation. There were no outstanding land acquisition or resettlement issues when the project closed.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

Financial Management (FM). The Bank carried an FM assessment to assess the FM arrangements of the implementing agency. The agency had experienced staff who had experience with implementing financial management.

FM was rated as Moderately Satisfactory during implementation (ICR, para 62). There were moderate shortcomings in FM in the initial years due to delays in revising procedure manuals and incomplete asset inventories. These were rectified. The ICR does not provide information on whether the timelines for project external audits were adhered to and whether the audits were unqualified. There were no ineligible expenses during implementation.

Procurement Management. The Bank carried a procurement assessment to assess the procurement arrangements of the implementing agency. The agency had experienced staff, with experience in WB's procurement procedures.

Procurement performance was rated as Satisfactory during implementation (ICR, para 62). Although there were some delays in the initial years, these were resolved. There was no mis-procurement.



c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

There were no unintended impacts.

d. Other

Not applicable.

11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Highly Satisfactory	Highly Satisfactory	
Bank Performance	Highly Satisfactory	Highly Satisfactory	
Quality of M&E	Substantial	Substantial	
Quality of ICR	---	High	

12. Lessons

The ICR draws the following main lessons from the experience of implementing this project.

1. Targeted support and adaptive strategies can help in improving rural connectivity and transport infrastructure resilience, even in FCV settings. This project had a simple design, prioritizing investments with immediate benefits and maintaining contingency plans to ensure continuity during crises. The project also adopted flexible frameworks to adjust to evolving conditions and relied on experienced Project Implementation Units (PIU) with proven track records.

2. Continued sector engagement can raise the potential for success in FCV settings. Since reengaging with Haiti in 2004, the Bank has consistently financed transport projects. This project was the sixth in the sector. The lesson is such engagement can help in proactively incorporating lessons learned and designing projects with a mid-term vision.

3. The framework approach can help in enabling flexibility and adapting interventions to local needs, especially in FCV settings. In this project, priority regions and broad intervention types were identified during preparation, while specific allocations and activities were selected using a participatory approach. This approach ensured that interventions were targeted where they would have the greatest impact and allowed adjustments for unforeseen events like natural disasters or shifting security conditions.



4. Labor-intensive works in transport projects can become a vehicle for cohesion, job creation and income generation in vulnerable communities. This is especially so in fragile settings, where lack of social cohesion and lack of employment opportunities are primary drivers of fragility and conflict.

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The ICR is well-written, concise with the main body of the text adhering to the recommended page length. The theory of change articulated in the text clearly shows the clear causal links between project activities (inputs), outputs and the intended outcomes. The ICR explicitly states the assumptions underlying the theory of change. The evidence and analysis are adequate for assessing project performance by drawing on material from beneficiary surveys. The ICR draws good lessons from the experience of implementing this project.

a. Quality of ICR Rating

High