

**Better Education Service Delivery for All (P160430)**

WESTERN AND CENTRAL AFRICA | Nigeria | Education Global Practice | Requesting Unit: AWCW2 (6548) | Responsible Unit: HAWE3 (9541)

IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2017 | Team Leader(s): Akiko Sawamoto, Martin Elias De Simone

Seq No: 12 | Archived on 10-Feb-2025 | ISR02916 | Created by: Akiko Sawamoto on 12-Dec-2024 | Modified by: Akiko Sawamoto on 06-Feb-2025

1. PROJECT DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVE**1.1 Development Objective**

Original Development Objective (Approved as part of Approval package on 20-Jun-2017)

To increase equitable access for out-of-school children and improve literacy in focus states, and strengthen accountability for results, in basic education in Nigeria.

Current Development Objective (Approved as part of Additional Financing package Seq. 1 on 17-Dec-2021)

To increase equitable access for out-of-school children and improve literacy in focus states, and strengthen accountability for results, in basic education in Nigeria.

2. OVERALL RATINGS

Name	Previous	Current
Progress towards achievement of PDO	● Moderately Satisfactory	● Moderately Unsatisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	● Moderately Unsatisfactory	● Moderately Unsatisfactory
Overall Risk Rating	● Moderate	● Moderate

3. KEY ISSUES & STATUS**3.1 Implementation Status and Key Decisions**

The Better Education Service Delivery for All - Additional Financing (BESDA-AF) Operation was approved by the Global Partnership for Education (GPE) Board in June 2021 and became effective in May 2022. GPE's US\$123.8 million financing will support the implementation of the government's Universal Basic Education (UBE) program in the three selected states of Nigeria: Oyo, Adamawa, and Katsina (OAK). The Federal Ministry of Education (FME) and the Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC), together with the State Ministries of Education (SME) and the State Universal Basic Education Boards (SUBEBs) in the OAK states, are implementing the BESDA-AF Operation. It seeks to expand the scope of the previous, parent BESDA Operation (2017–2022) to address infrastructure constraints, weak teaching and learning



practices, inefficient teacher deployment, and inadequate transparency in education spending in the OAK states, in line with the objectives of Nigeria's UBE program. The BESDA-AF Operation Program consists of Program-for-Results (PforR) and Investment Project Financing (IPF) components.

While a Mid-Term Review (MTR) mission is still ongoing, this Interim Implementation Status and Results Report (ISR) provides a brief summary of the progress of the BESDA-AF Operation toward achieving its Program Development Objective (PDO). A full ISR will be produced upon completion of the MTR mission in February 2025. **Under Results Area (RA) 1 (Reduction in the number of the out-of-school children) of the PforR component**, after the selection of underserved schools for the first round of school improvement grants (SIGs), 278 School Based Management Committees (SBMCs) received training on the preparation of school improvement plans. With the disbursement of SIGs of N3.5 billion, the SBMCs proceeded with renovation and construction of classroom and other school facilities to improve school infrastructure, which is close to completion. Following the school selection for the second (and final) round of SIGs and completion of training for 272 SBMCs, plans are underway for disbursement to the selected schools to commence construction and renovation. **Under RA2 (Improvement of literacy rates)**, a total of 46,000 teachers have been selected for the Structured Pedagogy Program (SSP) and 4,653 school support officers (SSOs) have been identified to provide coaching and mentorship to teachers. However, due to the delay in completing the preparatory work for the SPP under the Investment Project Financing (IPF) component, the SPP activities under the PforR component have made minimal progress. **Under RA 3(Strengthening accountability for results)**, a teacher deployment and redeployment policy was developed and approved by the Executive Governors of the OAK states. Transparency of basic education spending has increased with the publication of state-level education budget and expenditure accounts for the calendar year 2021. The deployment of newly recruited teachers to rural schools and urban schools with high pupil-teacher ratios has also been initiated in the OAK states.

Under the IPF component, a series of activities laid the groundwork for the SPP, including (i) developing student assessment items, teacher training modules, lesson plans, and teacher guides; (ii) conducting training for SSOs selected by each state to serve as master trainers for subsequent cascaded training; and (iii) procuring an EdTech firm to develop a digital platform for implementing the SPP. To date, a total of 160 SSO master trainers from Oyo and Adamawa States have been trained. The subsequent cascaded training of SSOs has also been completed in Oyo and is currently underway in Adamawa. Content development for the SSP, including teaching modules and guides for teachers, has been completed and its curation in digital format is currently underway in coordination with an EdTech firm contracted to develop a portal to facilitate the digitized SSP using tablets to be distributed to 60,000 teachers. However, due to supply chain issues and shipping delays, the procurement of the 60,000 tablets has been significantly delayed (they did not arrive until mid-January 2025). To facilitate teacher familiarization with the SPP prior to the distribution of tablets loaded with digitized content, the printing of a printed set of teacher modules and guides aligned with the electronic content is underway, followed by SPP training for master teacher trainers who will cascade the training in each of the OAK states. In addition, in order to expedite the verification of results for Years 2, 3, and 4 before the Program closes in October 2025, the procurement of an independent verification agent (who will conduct verifications on a rolling basis) is underway and is expected to be completed by April 30, 2025.

4. DATA ON FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE



4.1 Disbursements (by loan)

Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
TF-B6224	Effective	123.80	123.80	0.00	29.10	94.70	<div><div></div></div> 23.50%
IDA-60960	Closed	33.00	29.40	3.24	29.97	0.00	<div><div></div></div> 100.00 %
IDA-60950	Closed	578.00	565.64	2.91	576.86	0.00	<div><div></div></div> 100.00 %

4.2 Key Dates (by loan)

Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval	Signing	Effectiveness	Orig. Closing	Rev. Closing
IDA-60950	Closed	20-Jun-2017	29-Sep-2017	22-Jan-2018	31-Oct-2022	31-Dec-2022
IDA-60960	Closed	20-Jun-2017	29-Sep-2017	22-Jan-2018	31-Oct-2022	31-Dec-2022
TF-B6224	Effective	24-Mar-2022	24-Mar-2022	24-May-2022	31-Oct-2025	31-Oct-2025

4.3 Program Action Plan

Action Description	OAK states: Adoption of computerized accounting system.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Client	Due Date	31-Oct-2021	Completed
Completion Measurement	Software purchased and deployed.				
Comments	The 3 OAK states have completed this.				

Action Description	UBEC will assign at least one internal auditor to conduct ex-post systemic and risk-based audits of the Program and report quarterly to the UBEC Executive Secretary and the Federal Ministry of Education Permanent Secretary				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Client	Due Date	30-Jun-2020	Completed
Completion Measurement	Internal Auditor assigned.				



Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.
----------	---

Action Description	Progressively clear backlog of UBEC's unaudited financial statements				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	UBEC financial statement audits completed				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	Mainstream open contracting across Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC) interventions				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Open Contract deployed.				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	Apply service standards for submission of Withdrawal Applications and timely transfer of states' share of financing proceeds to states through Government processes for results achieved by the states under the disbursement-linked indicators				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Timely transfers of DLIs funds to states.				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	Conduct post-procurement review of State Universal Basic Education Boards (SUBEBs) on a rotational basis				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Post-review conducted.				



Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.
----------	---

Action Description	Operationalize fraud and corruption/complaints redress mechanism				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Client	Due Date	22-Jan-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Fraud and corruption/complaints redress mechanism established.				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	Prepare and mainstream environmental and social guidelines based on national and state laws and regulations as well as good international practice on land acquisition, grievance redress mechanisms, and measures for environmental and social management				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems	NA	Client	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Environmental and Social guidelines developed				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	Conduct Universal Basic Education program evaluation through independent consultancy				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical	NA	Client	Due Date	31-Dec-2020	Completed
Completion Measurement	UBE program evaluated.				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	Conduct annual monitoring of progress on environmental and social issues				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems	NA	Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Safeguards monitoring conducted.				



Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.
----------	---

Action Description	Establish a communication plan for stakeholder engagement and comply with requirements on proactive information disclosure from the Freedom of Information Act				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical	NA	Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Communication plan established and implemented.				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	Procurement monitoring with the use of procurement planning cycle and periodic procurement audit				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems	NA	Government	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Period audits conducted.				
Comments	This corresponds to the parent project, not this additional financing, which is different in its scope and implementation arrangements.				

Action Description	OAK states: improving the complaint handling mechanism.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems	NA	OAK states	Due Date	31-Dec-2021	Completed
Completion Measurement	Complaint handling mechanism improved.				
Comments	GRMs are functional across states.				

5. KEY DATES

Key Events	Planned	Actual
Approval	20-Jun-2017	20-Jun-2017



Effectiveness	22-Jan-2018	22-Jan-2018
Mid-Term Review No. 01	14-Apr-2020	05-Aug-2020
Operation Closing/Cancellation	31-Oct-2025	

6. SYSTEMATIC OPERATIONS RISK-RATING TOOL

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Last Approved Rating ISR Seq. 011 - 09 May 2024	Proposed Rating
Political and Governance	●	● Moderate	● Moderate
Macroeconomic	●	● Moderate	● Moderate
Sector Strategies and Policies	●	● Low	● Low
Technical Design of Project or Program	●	● Moderate	● Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	●	● Moderate	● Moderate
Fiduciary	●	● Substantial	● Substantial
Environment and Social	●	● Moderate	● Moderate
Stakeholders	●	● Moderate	● Moderate
Overall	●	● Moderate	● Moderate



7. RESULTS

7.1 PDO Indicators by PDO Outcomes

Increase equitable access for out-of-school children in focus states								
Indicator Name	Baseline		Actual (Previous)		Actual (Current)		Closing Period	
	Value	Month/Year	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value	Month/Year
Reduced number of out-of-school children in focus states, by gender (Number)	0.00	Dec/2015	924,590.00	31-Dec-2020	924,590.00	31-Dec-2020	1,300,000.00	Oct/2022
Increased number of students attending basic education (Number)	15,600,000.00	Jun/2016	25,112,024.00	31-Oct-2022	25,112,024.00	31-Oct-2022	21,300,000.00	Oct/2022
Increased number of students attending non-formal basic education (in traditional Islamic schools) (Number)	0.00	Sep/2020	3,232,755.00	31-Oct-2022	3,232,755.00	31-Oct-2022	2,000,000.00	Oct/2022
Increased number of students attending non-formal basic education in non-formal learning centers (Number)	0.00	Sep/2020	986,530.00	31-Oct-2022	986,530.00	31-Oct-2022	1,000,000.00	Oct/2022
OAK states: Number of students from underserved communities with access to schools and adequate learning conditions for basic	0.00	Dec/2021	0.00	01-Mar-2024	195,540.00	01-Jan-2025	200,000.00	Oct/2025



education (disaggregated by gender) (Number)								
Number of boys (Number)	0.00	May/2022	0.00	01-Mar-2024	98,941	01-Jan-2025	100,000.00	Oct/2025
Number of girls (Number)	0.00	May/2022	0.00	01-Mar-2024	96,599	01-Jan-2025	100,000.00	Oct/2025
Improve literacy in focus states								
Indicator Name	Baseline		Actual (Previous)		Actual (Current)		Closing Period	
	Value	Month/Year	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value	Month/Year
Improved literacy rates in focus states, by state (Percentage)	0.00	Dec/2015	29.10	31-Oct-2022	29.10	31-Oct-2022	4.00	Oct/2022
OAK: Number of teachers receiving individualized report on how to improve their teaching practice based on their interactions with school pedagogical support officers & results of student assessment (Number)	0.00	Dec/2021	0.00	01-Mar-2024	0.00	01-Jan-2025	36,000.00	Oct/2025
Strengthen accountability for results in basic education in Nigeria								
Indicator Name	Baseline		Actual (Previous)		Actual (Current)		Closing Period	
	Value	Month/Year	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value	Month/Year
Publicly disclosed Universal Basic Education program strategic plan reflecting annual progress reports and program evaluation findings (Yes/No)	No	Dec/2015	No	31-Oct-2022	No	31-Oct-2022	Yes	Oct/2022



Number of States developing and issuing need-based teacher deployment policy (Number)	0.00	Dec/2021	3.00	01-Mar-2024	3.00	01-Jan-2025	3.00	Oct/2025
OAK states: Number of states publishing education expenditures including SUBEB program expenditures and outputs (Number)	0.00	Dec/2021	3.00	01-Mar-2024	3.00	01-Jan-2025	3.00	Oct/2025

7.2 Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Increase equitable access for out-of-school children in focus states								
Indicator Name	Baseline		Actual (Previous)		Actual (Current)		Closing Period	
	Value	Month/Year	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value	Month/Year
Number of traditional Islamic schools and non-formal learning centers receiving government support for improving WASH facilities (Number)	0.00	Dec/2020	4,700.00	30-Jun-2022	4,700.00	30-Jun-2022	2,000.00	Oct/2022
Number of schools receiving grants for improving student attendance (Number (Thousand))	0.00	Dec/2020	13,500.00	30-Jun-2022	13,500.00	30-Jun-2022	20,000.00	Oct/2022
OAK states: Number of states conducting school infrastructure audit and	0.00	Dec/2022	3.00	01-Mar-2024	3.00	01-Jan-2025	3.00	Oct/2025



developing school network of all Primary and Junior Secondary schools (Number)								
OAK states: Number of SBMCs in underserved communities receive infrastructure improvement grants (Number) DLI	0.00	Dec/2022	150.00	25-Mar-2024	278.00	01-Jan-2025	550.00	Oct/2025
OAK states: Number of States completing community mapping of access to basic education for children with special needs (Number)	0.00	Dec/2022	0.00	25-Mar-2024	2.00	01-Jan-2025	3.00	Oct/2025
Improve literacy in focus states								
Indicator Name	Baseline		Actual (Previous)		Actual (Current)		Closing Period	
	Value	Month/Year	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value	Month/Year
Schools adopting primary 1-3 intensive literacy programs in focus states (Number)	0.00	Dec/2015	25,577.00	30-Jun-2022	25,577.00	30-Jun-2022	20,000.00	Oct/2022
Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning (Number)	0.00	Dec/2015	10,500,000.00	30-Jun-2022	10,500,000.00	30-Jun-2022	6,600,000.00	Oct/2022
Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning (Female) (Number)	0.00		1,650,000.00		1,650,000.00		3,300,000.00	
Teachers recruited or trained (Number)	0.00	Dec/2015	190,000.00	30-Jun-2022	190,000.00	30-Jun-2022	60,000.00	Oct/2022



Number of teachers trained (Number)	0.00	Dec/2015	54,722.00	31-Oct-2022	54,722.00	31-Oct-2022	60,000.00	Oct/2022
OAK states: Number of teachers completing relevant training to enhance and reinforce their curriculum knowledge and pedagogical skills (Number) DLI	0.00	Dec/2022	0.00	25-Mar-2024	0.00	01-Jan-2025	48,000.00	Oct/2025
	Comments on achieving targets		Number of teachers completing at least three training modules relevant to their teaching					
Strengthen accountability for results in basic education in Nigeria								
Indicator Name	Baseline		Actual (Previous)		Actual (Current)		Closing Period	
	Value	Month/Year	Value	Date	Value	Date	Value	Month/Year
System of national learning assessment developed and implemented (Yes/No)	No	Dec/2015	Yes	11-Dec-2019	Yes	11-Dec-2019	Yes	Oct/2022
Number of large scale assessments of student learning in primary/junior secondary education (Number)	0.00	Jun/2016	1.00	24-Mar-2022	1.00	24-Mar-2022	4.00	Oct/2025
Total states implementing and publishing the Annual School Census (ASC), verified by school-based management committees (SBMCs) (Number)	0.00	Dec/2015	37.00	30-Jun-2022	37.00	30-Jun-2022	37.00	Oct/2022
	Comments on achieving targets		Several states conducted analogue data collection of the annual school census but the data has not been submitted to FME for consolidation. Borno state has initiated digital data collection and this good practice has been shared with the remaining states,					
Total states completing state basic education plan and progress report on Universal Basic Education program implementation, approved	0.00	Dec/2015	37.00	30-Jun-2022	37.00	30-Jun-2022	37.00	Oct/2022
	Comments on achieving targets		All states have prepared the state education sector plans. UBEC will need to review and approve these plans.					



by Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC) (Number)								
Publicly disclosed Universal Basic Education program annual progress report (Yes/No)	No	Dec/2015	Yes	30-Jun-2022	Yes	30-Jun-2022	Yes	Oct/2022
Universal Basic Education program evaluation and report completed (Yes/No)	No	Dec/2015	Yes	30-Jun-2022	Yes	30-Jun-2022	Yes	Oct/2022
OAK states: Number of states establishing learning assessment system (Number)	0.00	Dec/2022	0.00	01-Mar-2024	0.00	01-Jan-2025	3.00	Oct/2025
OAK states: Number of Teachers redeployed from schools with PTR below 30 to schools with PTR above 70 by LGA or number of new teachers recruited to rural schools with PTR above 70 (Number) DLI	0.00	Dec/2022	1,264.00	25-Mar-2024	2,000.00	01-Jan-2025	5,000.00	Oct/2025
	Comments on achieving targets		1,880 and 120 teachers have been redeployed in Katsina and Oyo states, respectively.					
OAK states: Number of States conducting digital data collection on students, teachers and schools (Number)	0.00	Dec/2022	1.00	25-Mar-2024	2.00	01-Jan-2025	3.00	Oct/2025

7.3 Disbursement Linked Indicators (DLI)



PBC Name		Baseline	Actual (Previous)		Actual (Current)		Closing Period
			Value	Date	Value	Date	
1:Reduced number of out of school children in Focus States, by gender (Number)	Value	0.00	924,590.00	31-Dec-2020	924,590.00	31-Dec-2020	
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		0.00
DLI allocation			174,600,000.00				
2:Schools adopting Primary 1-3 intensive literacy programs in Focus States (Number)	Value	0.00	25,577.00	30-Jun-2022	25,577.00	30-Jun-2022	20,000.00
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		45,000,000.00
DLI allocation			120,000,000.00				
3:Improved literacy rates in Focus States, by Focus State (Percentage)	Value	0.00	2.00	31-Dec-2020	2.00	31-Dec-2020	
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		0.00
DLI allocation			47,700,000.00				
4:Total Focus States implementing and publishing the Annual School Census (ASC), verified by SBMCs (Number)	Value	0.00	37.00	30-Jun-2022	37.00	30-Jun-2022	165,000.00
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		5,500,000.00
DLI allocation			16,000,000.00				



5:Total Focus States completing Focus State basic education plan and progress report on UBE program implementation, approved by UBEC (Number)	Value	0.00	37.00	31-Dec-2020	37.00	31-Dec-2020	37.00
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		5,550,000.00
DLI allocation			24,420,000.00				
6:Number of traditional Islamic schools and non-formal learning centers receiving government support for improving WASH facilities (Number)	Value	0.00	4,700.00	31-Oct-2022	4,700.00	31-Oct-2022	
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		80,000,000.00
DLI allocation			142,300,000.00				
7:Number of schools receiving grants for improving student attendance (Number (Thousand))	Value	0.00	13,500.00	31-Oct-2022	13,500.00	31-Oct-2022	
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		25,000,000.00
DLI allocation			53,000,000.00				
	Value	0.00	150.00	25-Mar-2024	150.00	25-Mar-2024	3.00



8:A1: OAK state infrastructure budget allocated to underserved communities to improve learning conditions in primary education and improve access to junior secondary education (Number)	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		1,500,000.00
DLI allocation			1,500,000.00				
9:A2 OAK states: Structured Pedagogy Program for Effective Teaching (Number)	Value	0.00	0.00	25-Mar-2024	0.00	25-Mar-2024	0.00
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		0.00
DLI allocation			0.00				
10:A3.1 OAK states: Improved Teacher Deployment (Number)	Value	0.00	1,264.00	25-Mar-2024	1,264.00	25-Mar-2024	3.00
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		1,500,000.00
DLI allocation			1,500,000.00				
11:A3.2 OAK states: Improved Transparency of Education Spending (Number)	Value	0.00	3.00	25-Mar-2024	3.00	25-Mar-2024	3.00
	Allocated Amount	0.00			0.00		1,500,000.00
DLI allocation			1,500,000.00				

