

01-Feb-2024

Dr. Kazim Niaz Secretary Ministry of Economic Affairs Government of Pakistan Islamabad

Dear Dr. Niaz:

Re: Pakistan Raises Revenue - (Credit Number 6435-PK) Amendments to the Financing Agreement

We refer to the Financing Agreement dated June 17, 2019, between the Islamic Republic of Pakistan ("Recipient") and the International Development Association ("Association"), as amended ("Financing Agreement"), for the above-mentioned Project ("Project"). We also refer to your letter dated September 13, 2023, requesting for the extension of closing date and restructuring of the Project.

We are pleased to inform you that, after due consideration, the Association agrees to your request and consequently the Financing Agreement is amended as set forth below:

1. The Annex to Schedule 2 to the Financing Agreement is amended and attached as Annex to this Amendment Letter.

2. Section III.B.4 of Schedule 2 to the Financing Agreement is amended to read as follows:

"4. The Closing Date is June 30, 2025.

Except as specifically amended in this Amendment Letter, all other terms and conditions of the Financing Agreement shall remain in full force and effect.

The World Bank will disclose this Amendment Letter and related information on this Financing Agreement in accordance with the World Bank's Policy on Access to Information. By entering into this Amendment Letter, the Recipient consents to disclosure of this Amendment Letter and related information.

Please confirm your agreement to the foregoing on behalf of the Recipient by countersigning and dating the form of confirmation set forth below and returning one fully countersigned original of this Amendment Letter to us and retaining one original for your records. Upon receipt by the Association of the countersigned original of this Amendment Letter, this Amendment Letter shall become effective as of the date of the countersignature of this Amendment Letter.

Yours sincerely, INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION

Nayy Benhassine

Najy Benhassine Country Director, Pakistan South Asia Region

CONFIRMED AND AGREED: ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF PAKISTAN

By: <u>Jugai Waz</u> Name: <u>Dr. Kazim Niaz</u>

Title: Secretary Ministry of Economic Affairs

06-Feb-2024 Date:

Cc:

Government of Pakistan:

Ministry of Economic Affairs:

Mr. Muhammad Humair Karim, Additional Secretary Mr. Adil Akbar Khan, Senior Joint Secretary Mr. Azam Khan, Deputy Secretary

Federal Board of Revenue:

Mr. Malik Amjed Zubair Tiwana, Chairman Mr. Ardsher Salim Tariq, Member (Reforms and Modernization) Mr. Khalid Jamil, Project Director PRR Ms. Sadia Akmal, Additional Program Director PRR

The World Bank:

Mr. Syed Tauqir Hussain Shah, Executive Director, Pakistan Mr. Abdelhak Bedjaoui, Alternate Executive Director, Pakistan

Annex

Disbursement	Total DLI	Disbursement Linked Results (DLR)							
Linked Indicators (DLI)	allocation, US\$	Baseline	YEAR 1 (July 1, 2019 – June 30,	YEAR 2 (July 1, 2020 – June 30,	YEAR 3 (July 1, 2021 – June 30,	YEAR 4 (July 1, 2022 – June 30,	YEAR 5 (July 1, 2023 – June 30,	YEAR 6 (July 1, 2024 – June 30, 2025)	
			2020)	2021)	2022)	2023)	2024)	50, 2025)	
1.Scope of withholding regime reduced		58 withholdi ng lines	DLR 1.1: Withholding lines in the Annual Appropriations Act have been reduced to 50	DLR 1.2: Withholding lines in the Annual Appropriations Act have been reduced to 40	DLR 1.3: Withholding lines in the Annual Appropriations Act have been reduced to 35	DLR 1.4: Withholding lines in the Annual Appropriations Act have been reduced to 30	DLR 1.5: Reducing WHT agents by 50% in at least two sectors	DLR 1.6: Reducing WHT agents by 50% in four sectors (cumulative)	
Allocated amount	\$32,000,000		\$6,736,000 Scalability: Yes \$842,000 per reduced withholding line	\$8,420,000 Scalability: Yes \$842,000 per reduced withholding line	\$4,210,000 Scalability: Yes \$842,000 per reduced withholding line	\$4,210,000 Scalability: Yes \$842,000 per reduced withholding line	\$4,212,000 Scalability: Yes \$2,106,000 per sector	\$4,212,000 Scalability: Yes \$2,106,000 per sector	
2. Transparent tax system		Aggregate tax expenditur e is published	DLR 2.1: MoF (with input from FBR) has published in the Annual Budget Statement a breakdown of detailed tax expenditures with cost and beneficiaries of each exemption and concession	DLR 2.2: MoF (with input from FBR) has published in the Annual Budget Statement a breakdown of detailed tax expenditures and evidence- based revenue forecasts	DLR 2.3 MoF (with input from FBR) has published in the Annual Budget Statement a breakdown of detailed tax expenditures, evidence-based revenue forecasts, and tax gap estimates disaggregated	DLR 2.4: MoF (with input from FBR) has published in the ABS detailed tax expenditure, and evidence- based revenue forecasts.	DLR 2.5: MoF (with input from FBR) has published in the ABS detailed tax expenditure, and evidence-based revenue forecasts.	DLR 2.6: MoF (with input from FBR) has published in the ABS detailed tax expenditure and evidence-based revenue forecasts. FBR published updated tax gap estimates disaggregated by tax instrument	

ANNEX TO SCHEDULE 2

Disbursement	Total DLI			Dis	bursement Linko	ed Results (DLR	.)	
Linked	allocation,	Baseline	YEAR 1	YEAR 2	YEAR 3	YEAR 4	YEAR 5	YEAR 6
Indicators (DLI)	US\$		(July 1, 2019	(July 1, 2020	(July 1, 2021	(July 1, 2022	(July 1, 2023	(July 1, 2024 – June
			– June 30,	30, 2025)				
			2020)	2021)	2022)	2023)	2024)	
					by tax			
	***		*1* 000 000	*-	instrument	**	**	**
Allocated Amounts	\$32,000,000		\$12,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$3,000,000	\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000
2 Coordination		One data-	Scalability: No DLR 3.1:	Scalability: No DLR 3.2:	Scalability: No DLR 3.3:	Scalability: No DLR 3.4:	Scalability: No DLR 3.5:	Scalability: No DLR 3.6: FBR has
3. Coordination with Provinces		sharing	FBR has signed	FBR has	FBR has	Systematic	FBR has	harmonized the definitions
with 1 rovinces		MoU with	Data-sharing	concluded and	concluded and	(regular) and	harmonized the	of all economic activities
		FBR to be	MoUs with all	signed written	signed written	digital data	definitions of	subject to GST/GSTS
		signed by	provincial tax	agreement with	agreement with	sharing system	selected	with all 4 provinces
		KP	authorities (12)	all four (4)	all four (4)	with all	economic	-
		Revenue		Provinces on	Provinces on a	provinces	activities subject	
		Authority		immovable	method for GST	functional,	to GST/GSTS	
		with FBR		property	input	including	with all 4	
		by June 30, 2019		valuation tables	adjustments	validation of the accuracy	provinces	
		50, 2019				and reliability		
						of data		
						sent/received.		
Allocated Amounts	\$34,000,000		\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$8,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000
			Scalability: No					
4. Track & Trace		0	DLR 4.1:	DLR 4.2:	DLR 4.3:	DLR 4.4:	DLR 4.5:	DLR 4.6: At least 20%
and electronic			1 sector	2 sectors	3 sectors	4 sectors	5 sectors	increase in collection of
monitoring of production in				(cumulative)	(cumulative)	(cumulative)	(cumulative)	taxes from two sectors using electronic
Key Sectors (#								production monitoring
of sectors)								system
Allocated Amounts	\$22,400,000		\$3,200,000	\$3,200,000	\$3,200,000	\$3,200,000	\$3,200,000	\$6,400,000
			Scalability: Yes	Scalability:	Scalability: Yes	Scalability:	Scalability: Yes	Scalability: Yes
			\$3,200,000 per	Yes	\$3,200,000 per	Yes	\$3,200,000 per	\$3,200,000 per Sector
			Sector	\$3,200,000 per	Sector	\$3,200,000 per	Sector	
5 Now townsys		5,800	DLR 5.1:	Sector DLR 5.2:	DLR 5.3:	Sector DLR 5.4:	DLR 5.5:	
5. New taxpayers identified		3,800	50,000	DLR 5.2: 100,000 (in	DLR 5.5: 300,000 (in	DLR 5.4: 600,000 (in	DLR 5.5: 500,000 (in	
through			50,000	addition to	addition to DLR	addition to	addition to DLR	
automated data				DLR 5.1)	5.1 and 5.2)	DLR 5.1-5.3)	5.1-5.4)	
sharing, ICT-				,	,	,		

Disbursement	Total DLI	Disbursement Linked Results (DLR)							
Linked Indicators (DLI)	allocation, US\$	Baseline	YEAR 1 (July 1, 2019 – June 30, 2020)	YEAR 2 (July 1, 2020 – June 30, 2021)	YEAR 3 (July 1, 2021 – June 30, 2022)	YEAR 4 (July 1, 2022 – June 30, 2023)	YEAR 5 (July 1, 2023 – June 30, 2024)	YEAR 6 (July 1, 2024 – June 30, 2025)	
based Business Intelligence and other measures									
Allocated Amounts	\$32,500,000		\$1,500,000 Scalability: Yes \$1,500,000 per 50,000 new taxpayers	\$3,000,000 Scalability: Yes \$1,500,000 per 50,000 new taxpayers	\$6,000,000 Scalability: Yes \$1,000,000 per 50,000 new taxpayers	\$12,000,000 Scalability: Yes \$1,000,000 per 50,000 new taxpayers	\$10,000,000 Scalability: Yes \$1,000,000 per 50,000 new taxpayers		
6. Risk-based audit		Risk- based audits piloted in one FBR office.	DLR 6.1: FBR has adopted a regulation on risk-based selection of audit cases, limiting audit cases selected without the risk- based system to 10% of total audits subject to clearance by the Member Audit	DLR 6.2: FBR has restructured its Audit Wing to include a Compliance Unit (selection of cases) and Audit Unit (conduct of tax audits)	DLR 6.3: FBR has completed at least 15 comprehensive field audits of Large Taxpayers for cases selected by the risk-based selection tool and monitored by the Compliance Unit through AMIS with associated reports submitted to FBR management	DLR 6.4: FBR has completed at least 25 additional comprehensive field audits of Large Taxpayers for cases selected by the risk- based selection tool and monitored by Compliance Unit through AMIS with associated reports submitted to FBR management	DLR 6.5: FBR has completed at least 45 additional comprehensive field audits of Large Taxpayers FBR and at least 15 issue- oriented audits for cases selected by the risk-based selection tool and monitored by Compliance Unit through AMIS with associated reports submitted to FBR management		
Allocated Amounts	\$40,000,000		\$6,000,000 Scalability: No	\$7,000,000 Scalability: No	\$8,000,000 Scalability: No	\$9,000,000 Scalability: No	\$10,000,000 Scalability: No		

Disbursement	Total DLI	Disbursement Linked Results (DLR)						
Linked	allocation,	Baseline	YEAR 1	YEAR 2	YEAR 3	YEAR 4	YEAR 5	YEAR 6
Indicators (DLI)	US\$		(July 1, 2019	(July 1, 2020	(July 1, 2021	(July 1, 2022	(July 1, 2023	(July 1, 2024 – June
			– June 30,	– June 30,	– June 30,	– June 30,	– June 30,	30, 2025)
			2020)	2021)	2022)	2023)	2024)	
7. GST filing		Online	DLR 7.1:	DLR 7.2:	DLR 7.3: Single	DLR 7.4:	DLR 7.5: Single	DLR 7.6: Single portal
simplification		filing	Standardized	Single portal	portal rolled out	Single portal is	portal	automatically calculates
		available	GST/GSTS tax	for filing and	to remaining	fully rolled out	automatically	and enables GST refunds
		on FBR	return form	paying GST	provincial GSTS	covering all	calculates input	to taxpayers
		website.	agreed through a	and GSTS is	authorities with	other sectors	adjustments to	
			memorandum of	piloted with	the same sector	for FBR and 4	all tax authorities	
			understanding between FBR	FBR and at least one	as piloted (total 4 provincial GSTS	provincial GSTS		
			and the	provincial	authorities).	authorities.		
			Provincial Tax	GSTS authority	autiontics).	autionnes.		
			Authorities	(covering at				
			responsible for	least one				
			collecting GSTS	sector).				
Allocated Amounts	\$41,600,000		\$6,000,000	\$6,000,000	\$10,800,000	\$12,800,000	\$3,000,000	\$3,000,000
			Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No
8. Goods		65%	DLR 8.1:	DLR 8.2:	DLR 8.3:	DLR 8.4:	DLR 8.5:	DLR 8.6:
declarations			55%	45%	40%	35%	30%	25%
going through								
the red and yellow channels								
at the border								
Allocated Amounts	\$40,000,000		\$10,000,000	\$10,000,000	\$5,000,000	\$5,000,000	\$5,000,000	\$5,000,000
The curcu The curcu	\$ 10,000,000		Scalability: Yes	Scalability:	Scalability: Yes	Scalability:	Scalability: Yes	Scalability: Yes
			\$ 1,000,000 per	Yes	\$ 1,000,000 per	Yes	\$ 1,000,000 per	\$ 1,000,000 per one (1)
			one (1)	\$ 1,000,000 per	one (1)	\$ 1,000,000 per	one (1)	percentage point reduction
			percentage point	one (1)	percentage point	one (1)	percentage point	
			reduction	percentage	reduction	percentage	reduction	
				point reduction		point reduction		
9. FBR Core		3 business	DLR 9.1:	DLR 9.2:	DLR 9.3:	DLR 9.4:	DLR 9.5:	
Business		processes	FBR has (i)	FBR has	FBR has	FBR has	FBR has	
Processes simplified and		mapped (exports,	appointed a chief information	completed 14 additional steps	completed 16 additional steps	completed 15 additional steps	eliminated and replaced	
automated		transit,	officer, or	under the	under the	under the	previously	
aatomateu		transship	assigned the	Business	Business	Business	paper-based	
		ment)	functions of this	Process	Process	Process	processes with	
		/	position to a	Improvement	Improvement	Improvement	the newly	
			senior level	*	•	-	automated	

Disbursement	Total DLI			Dis	bursement Linke	ed Results (DLR	.)	
Linked	allocation,	Baseline	YEAR 1	YEAR 2	YEAR 3	YEAR 4	YEAR 5	YEAR 6
Indicators (DLI)	US\$		(July 1, 2019	(July 1, 2020	(July 1, 2021	(July 1, 2022	(July 1, 2023	(July 1, 2024 – June
			– June 30,	– June 30,	– June 30,	– June 30,	– June 30,	30, 2025)
			2020)	2021)	2022)	2023)	2024)	
			officer (ii)				business	
			assigned full-				processes	
			time staff from				created under the	
			inland revenue				Business Process	
			and customs to				Improvement	
			the Business					
			Domain Team; and (iii)					
			completed three					
			(3) steps under					
			the Business					
			Process					
			Improvement					
Allocated Amounts	\$35,500,000		\$8,000,000	\$7,500,000	\$8,000,000	\$8,000,000	\$4,000,000	
			Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	
10. Organizational		FBR does	DLR 10.1:	DLR 10.2:	DLR 10.3:	DLR 10.4:	DLR 10.5:	
effectiveness		not	KPIs for the	FBR has	FBR has	FBR has	FBR has	
and		publish	FBR are	published an	published six-	published six-	published six-	
transparency		regular	approved by the	annual report	monthly report	monthly report	monthly report	
		reports on	government and	on the KPIs	within two (2)	within two (2)	within two (2)	
		KPIs, so no details	published	within three (3) months of the	months of the end of the	months of the end of the	months of the end of the	
		of FBR		end of the	second quarter	second quarter	second quarter	
		performan		fiscal year	and an annual	and an annual	and an annual	
		ce are		niseur yeur	report on the	report on the	report on the	
		available			KPIs within	KPIs within	KPIs within	
		to the			three (3) months	three (3)	three (3) months	
		public			of the end of the	months of the	of the end of the	
					fiscal year	end of the	fiscal year	
						fiscal year		
Allocated Amounts	\$10,000,000		\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000	\$2,000,000	
			Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: No	Scalability: Yes	
							US\$ 1mn each	
							report published	