

Doc
The W
FOR OFFIC

MICROFICHE COPY

Report No. 10017 MAI Type: (PCR)
HON CHAN, / X31727 / T9 007 / OEDD1

Report No. 10017

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

MALAWI

FIFTH EDUCATION PROJECT
(CREDIT 1330-MAI)

OCTOBER 23, 1991

Population and Human Resources Division
Southern Africa Department
Africa Regional Office

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

GLOSSARY

JC	Junior Certificate
MCA	Malawi College of Accountancy
MCDE	Malawi College of Distance Education
MOE	Ministry of Education and Culture
PTTC	Primary Teacher Training College

THE WORLD BANK
Washington, D.C. 20433
U.S.A.

of Director-General
Operations Evaluation

October 23, 1991

MEMORANDUM TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS AND THE PRESIDENT

SUBJECT: Project Completion Report on Malawi Fifth
Education Project (Credit 1330-MAI)

Attached, for information, is a copy of a report entitled "Project Completion Report on Malawi Fifth Education Project (Credit 1330-MAI)" prepared by the Africa Regional Office with Part II contributed by the Borrower. No audit of this project has been made by the Operations Evaluation Department at this time.

Attachment

Yves Rovani

by H. Eberhard Köpp

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORTMALAWIFIFTH EDUCATION PROJECT
(CREDIT 1330-MAI)TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page No.</u>
Preface	i
Evaluation Summary	iii
I. PROJECT REVIEW FROM BANK'S PERSPECTIVE	1
Project Identity.....	1
Project Background.....	1
Project Objectives & Description.....	2
Project Design and Organization.....	3
Project Implementation.....	3
Major Results of the Project.....	4
Project Sustainability.....	5
Bank Performance.....	6
Borrower Performance.....	8
Project Relationship.....	8
Consulting Services.....	8
II. PROJECT REVIEW FROM BORROWER'S PERSPECTIVE	9
III. STATISTICAL INFORMATION.....	12
Related Bank Credits.....	12
Project Timetable	13
Loan Disbursements	14
Project Implementation	15
Project Costs & Financing	16
Project Results.....	18
Status of Credit Covenants.....	22
Use of Bank Resources.....	23

LIST OF ANNEXES

Annex 1 -	Participants in Completion Mission.....	25
Annex 2 -	Project Completion Report (by year).....	26
Annex 3:		
Table 1.	Planned and Actual Completion of Civil Works Furniture and Equipment Procurement.....	28
Table 2.	Planned and Actual Utilization of Technical Assistance by Institution.....	29
Table 3.	Instructional Staff in Project PTTC's and Secondary Schools.....	30
Annex 4 -	Enrollment at the Malawi College of Accountancy by Type of Program 1990-91.....	31
Annex 5 -	Malawi College of Accountancy Graduate Output.....	32

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

MALAWI

FIFTH EDUCATION PROJECT
(CREDIT-1330 MAI)

PREFACE

This is the Project Completion Report (PCR) for the Fifth Education Project in Malawi, for which Credit 1330-MAI in the amount of SDR 30.9 million was approved on May 5, 1983. The Credit was closed on September 30, 1990, two years behind schedule. The last disbursement was on December 20, 1990 and the credit was fully disbursed.

The PCR was prepared by the Population and Human Resources Operations Division of the Southern Africa Department (Preface, Evaluation Summary, Parts I and III), and the Borrower (Part II).

The PCR is based, inter alia, on the Staff Appraisal Report; the Development Credit Agreement; supervision reports; correspondence between the Bank and the borrower; Progress Reports by the Borrower; internal Bank memoranda; and interviews with Bank staff and Malawi Government officials who were closely associated with the project.

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

MALAWI

FIFTH EDUCATION PROJECT
(CREDIT 1330-MAI)

EVALUATION SUMMARY

Objectives

i) The project's objectives were to meet Malawi's most pressing needs for trained manpower through: (i) improvement in the quality of primary education, (ii) expansion in the output of secondary schools, (iii) increases in the number of trained accountants and accounting technicians, and (iv) strengthening of the management of the education, training, and auditing systems. In the context of the socio-economic conditions of the early 1980's when the project was developed, these objectives were timely and consistent with the emerging government policy to invest in human resources development and skill training.

Implementation Experience

ii) The main variances between planned and actual implementation were: (a) the implementation period was lengthened from five to seven years, through two extensions of the Closing Date; and (b) four more new secondary schools were established, while only one was planned at appraisal. The extension of the Closing Date (in 1988 and 1989) enabled the Government to complete four additional secondary schools with a total of 1920 additional places. These additional facilities were financed utilizing funds accruing from the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha against the US Dollar (para 8). In view of the increased size of the project and the shortages of building materials, the time overrun of only two years, and about 11% overrun in the total project costs, was not unreasonable (para 29).

Results

iii) The project complemented and reinforced IDA's assistance under four preceding education projects. Its main thrust -- expansion of secondary schools, MCDE centers and primary school teachers -- was the same as in the previous projects. In quantitative terms, the project fully achieved its objectives, since all project institutions (secondary schools, PTTCs, MCA, MCDE centers) have already attained or exceeded enrollment targets planned during appraisal. The quality of construction of the facilities was generally good, although some of the weaknesses in the design of facilities that were financed under a previous project (for instance, excessive circulation space in the PTTCs) were repeated in this project without appropriate modification. Provisions for technical assistance and overseas training were likewise

fully utilized, or even exceeded (in the case of overseas training). However, the project had more limited success in respect to its objective of strengthening the management of education and training. The project also provided funds for two ongoing and two new studies (Table 9, Para. 33).

Sustainability

iv) Most of the project institutions (PTTCs, secondary schools and the MCA) are likely to be sustained for the foreseeable future as integral parts of the Malawi educational system. Thus the question is not whether those institutions will be sustained but at what level of quality and efficiency. The principal constraints are partly financial and partly administrative -- the Government's ability to provide an adequate level of recurrent cost support for non-salary expenditures such as for textbooks and other learning/teaching materials and equipment, as well as implementation of an effective and viable system for school maintenance and equipment repairs. The MCDE centers are in a somewhat different situation. Due to persistent shortages of self-learning materials and radio receivers, plus lack of trained teachers, the centers inevitably resort to conventional teaching methods. But because of lower quality teachers, overcrowding, shortage of instructional materials, the MCDE centers are not on the whole functioning as full-fledged distance education centers, but at best as conventional secondary schools, albeit of lower quality than the conventional schools. However, the quality of some of the MCDE Centers is being upgraded under a follow-up project (Education Sector Credit I).

Findings and Lessons Learned

v) Overall, the project was well implemented and has brought about satisfactory results. Enrollment targets were attained in all project institutions, and in the case of the MCDE centers exceeded by about 100%. Of the 21 staff-years of technical assistance provided under the project, 16.5 staff-years (or about 79%) was satisfactorily utilized. Provision for overseas training was increased during implementation by about 37% so that 71.5 staff-years were financed by the project's Closing Date, while 52 staff-years were planned at appraisal.

vi) Lessons derived from implementation of the project include the following. (a) A careful and detailed project preparation should be undertaken before a project is appraised and launched. The fact that a project contains components financed under previous projects (i.e. repeater project) is not a sufficient reason to skip the preparation phase of the project cycle. (b) The project confirms previous Bank experience that assistance for education and training should contain an appropriate balance between support for expansion of physical facilities, qualitative improvement, and institutional development. The project, concentrated heavily on expansion of physical facilities (about 86% of project cost) with only minimal assistance to improve institutional quality or to strengthen institutions in the sector. (c) When financing studies (feasibility or research-type), it is important to identify and reach agreement with the borrower as early as possible

regarding the institutions or individuals who will be assigned primary responsibility for conducting the study, the terms of reference of the studies and arrangements for reporting the results. A related lesson is that studies are likely to have a better chance of being executed if responsibility for conducting them lies with universities or research centers which normally have a comparative advantage in this regard over Government ministries and other administrative agencies. Toward the end of the implementation period, IDA and the borrower established a center for education research under the university with responsibility for all educational research, including those financed by the Bank (para 16).

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

MALAWI

FIFTH EDUCATION PROJECT (Credit 1330-MAI)

PART I: PROJECT REVIEW FROM BANK'S PERSPECTIVE

A. Project Identity

Name:	Fifth Education Project
Credit Number:	1330-MAI
RVP Unit:	Africa Region
Country:	Malawi
Sector:	Population and Human Resources
Subsector:	Education

B. Project Background

1. Sector Development Objectives. At the time the project was appraised in 1982 the Government of Malawi was acutely aware that the inadequate growth of its education system was one of the principal constraints to economic and social development. At appraisal, gross primary school enrollment ratio was about 62%, and that of secondary school was just 4%, one of the lowest in all of Sub-Saharan Africa. Outputs from agricultural, industrial, commercial and accounting institutions fell far short of manpower needs. Qualitatively too, primary education showed glaring deficiencies. Drop out and repeater rates remained high and only 23% of entering students completed primary education. Shortage of textbooks and other instructional materials, high pupil teacher ratios, lack of properly trained teachers, and old and decaying school buildings with little or no school furniture or equipment were among the factors that contributed to low educational quality. Competing demands from other sectors as well as the pressing economic difficulties of the time made it imperative for the Government to seek financial assistance from external sources for the expansion and improvement of the educational system in order to meet pressing manpower needs.

2. Policy Context: The Government's basic development strategy and priorities for the 1970's and subsequent years were set forth in a policy framework document titled The Statement of Development Policies 1971-1980. Although the Government did not prepare a policy statement for the 1980's similar to that of the 1970's, it did nevertheless produce rolling five-year development plans that focused on capital investments. In addition, the Government prepared informal documents providing revenue and recurrent cost projections. The cumulative thrust

of these various planning documents was to show projected declines in the average annual rate of growth of real GDP, from about 5.5% recorded in the 1960's and 1970's to a projected growth of only 4.8% through 1985, which was subsequently revised downward to 3% p.a. In brief, the project was initiated at a time of growing concern in government circles regarding declining economic growth rate and overall financial constraints. In spite of the Government's deliberate policy of giving higher priority to agriculture and infrastructure, the authorities were becoming increasingly aware of the need to develop the educational and training system in order to return to the relatively high rate of economic growth Malawi had enjoyed in the 1960's.

3. Linkages Between Project, Sector and Macro Policy Objectives.

The Project was largely successful in linking project, sector and macro policy objectives. It was on the whole quite successful in meeting or even exceeding its objectives of expanding output in carefully selected skill areas to meet critical labor market requirements, such as accountants, managers and auditors. The project was likewise successful in expanding and upgrading general secondary level institutions as a means of providing essential middle level manpower.

C. Project Objectives and Description:

4. Project Objectives. The project addressed Malawi's most pressing needs for trained manpower by: (a) improving the quality of primary education; (b) expanding the output of secondary level institutions as a means of providing essential middle level manpower; (c) increasing the numbers of trained accountants and accounting technicians; and (d) strengthening management of the education, training and auditing systems. The project also financed various studies in key areas such as the delivery and utilization of instructional materials including textbooks and a school mapping survey.

5. Project Components. The project included construction, furnishing, and equipping of:

(a) Three new primary school teacher training colleges at Kasasi, Kasungu and Karonga, and expansion of the existing primary school teacher training college at Bembeke, to provide for a total of about 1,560 student places, including teaching and boarding facilities, as well as staff houses;

(b) 25 new Malawi Correspondence and Distance Education Centers (MCDE) to serve about 2,960 students, renovation and expansion of MCDE headquarters at Blantyre including provision of equipment, furniture, and staff houses and construction of two staff houses at Lilongwe and Mzuzu;

(c) One new secondary school (480 places), including teaching and boarding facilities and staff houses, and renovation, expansion, furnishing and equipping of an existing secondary school at Livingstonia to increase its capacity to 480 student places; and

(d) The Malawi College of Accountancy (MCA) to provide facilities for a total of about 215 new student places, including teaching and boarding facilities as well as staff houses.

In addition, the project financed technical assistance and local as well as overseas training for the Malawi College of Accountancy, MCDE, the Auditor General's office, the Project Unit and the Malawi National Examinations Board.

D. Project Design and Organization

6. Based on the information available to the appraisal and post-appraisal missions (6/82 and 10/82), the conceptual foundation for the project was appropriate and clear. The project's central thrust, particularly expansion of secondary education, distance/correspondence education, and primary school teacher training, was in fact a continuation of the Bank's previous investment in these areas under two projects which were at the time under implementation (The Third and Fourth Education Projects -- Cr. 910-MAI and 1123-MAI, respectively). Two other projects -- the First and Second Education Projects, Cr. 102-MAI and Cr. 590-MAI, both of which were completed at the time the project was identified, had also contained financing of project elements in secondary education and primary school teacher training. Thus by focusing on these same areas, the project further complemented and reinforced MOE's efforts and achievements.

7. As stated earlier the project's timing and scope were appropriate in that it responded to clearly articulated national needs. The project was designed and appraised at a time of declining economic growth. The Government's analysis of policy options had concluded that investment in human resources development was critical to reverse the declining rate of economic growth, and that in particular it was necessary to expand the pool of secondary school graduates in order to increase middle-level manpower. Similarly, there was consensus among the authorities for expanding output of skilled manpower in selected areas such as accounting, management and auditing where there was clear shortage.

E. Project Implementation

8. Critical Variances in Project Implementation. The two factors responsible for the variance between planned and actual implementation were: (a) a two year increase in the implementation period (from 5 to 7 years), and (b) addition of 4 secondary schools, with a total of 1920 student places. This brought the total number of student places provided by the project to 2,880 compared to 960 secondary school places, planned at appraisal. IDA first agreed in 1988 to the Government's request for a one year extension in order to allow the completion of the newly added facilities. As a result of foreign exchange shortages and lack of building materials, including cement, the construction program fell behind schedule, necessitating a second extension of the Closing Date to 1990. The Government was able to finance the additional facilities as a result of the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha against the SDR. In view of the increased size of the

project and the shortages of building materials, the time overrun of only two years is not unreasonable and does manifest considerable improvement in the management efficiency of the project implementation unit.

9. Project Risks. At the time the project was launched, education's share of the government's total recurrent budget was only 11%, one of the lowest in Sub-Saharan Africa. The recurrent cost implications arising from expansion of the educational system had thus been flagged as a potential risk at the time the project was appraised. The Government had agreed to increase allocations to the sector to 14-15%, but in view of the overall economic and financial constraints facing the country at the time the project was being implemented, the Government was unable to increase budgetary allocations. Under the Second IDA Education Sector Credit, the Government has renewed its commitment to increase allocations for the sector. In view of some improvement in the economic performance of the country, the Government may be in a better position to provide the required recurrent costs.

F. Major Results of the Project

10. Project Objectives. Overall the project may be considered successful. Almost all project institutions are likely to be sustained. Its impact on institutional development, however, is limited. The project's objective to address Malawi's most pressing needs for trained manpower has been met in terms of quantitative targets. The PTTCs have virtually attained their enrollment targets, although the institutions were under-enrolled for about two years (1989-1990). The secondary schools are also operating at full capacity. The MCDE's have exceeded their enrollment targets by about 100%. Significantly, the MCA has exceeded its enrollment target: about 340 students are enrolled in Blantyre and about 210 in Lilongwe in various accountancy and management courses. Technical assistance provided under the project was almost fully utilized (87%), while the overseas fellowship and training component was exceeded by 37%. The qualitative target of the project (that of strengthening the management of the education, training and auditing systems) was met only partially. For instance, in spite of five investments (including this project) in the education sector, implemented by the same project implementation unit, the Borrower still relies heavily on expatriate staff for project implementation, particularly in regard to technical staff such as architects and quantity surveyors. Educational planning has been strengthened to some extent with the training of Malawi nationals. However, further assistance is required in this area and is being provided under a follow-up operation, the First Education Sector Credit.

11. Project Impact and Benefits. The main project elements (expansion and improvement of secondary education, primary school teacher training, correspondence/distance education) had also been assisted under four successive IDA-financed projects. Thus the project complemented and reinforced the cumulative gains achieved in those areas. The impact of the project is most likely to be greater than it would otherwise have been had the project elements been in areas different than those financed under the preceding projects.

12. The project has created over 2,000 student places in secondary schools, and another 10,000 in MCDEs, also a second-level institution. The project's impact on secondary school enrollment may be best appreciated when one takes into account that the total secondary school enrollment was only 20,000 when the project was appraised in 1982. Similarly, the project has created almost 1600 student places in PTTCs, thereby increasing the capacity of the PTTCs by almost 80%. The project's impact on educational quality at the primary school level is already beginning to be felt with the deployment of an increasing number of graduates from the project PTTC's in primary schools. The large increase in secondary school enrollment is likely to have a positive effect on the quality of post-secondary institutions (including teacher training) as these institutions will have a larger pool of applicants to choose from.

G. Project Sustainability

13. Most of the project institutions (secondary schools, primary school teacher training colleges, and the College of Accountancy) are likely to be sustained for the foreseeable future as integral parts of the Malawi education system. Thus, the question is not whether those institutions will be sustained, but at what level they will be sustained. The principal challenges for the level of their sustainability are partly administrative and partly financial; namely, whether the government will successfully implement an effective maintenance system for all educational institutions, and whether the government will be able to allocate an adequate provision for recurrent cost and maintenance. If these challenges are not met and are coupled with shortages in the supply of textbooks and other instructional materials, sustainability is unlikely to be at a high level. The MCDEs are in a somewhat different situation. These centers were originally intended to provide a low-cost alternative to conventional secondary schools, using self-learning materials supplemented by educational radio. The centers were expected to provide primary school leavers who otherwise could not get places in regular secondary schools a "second chance" to study toward a secondary school diploma. Over the years, it has become increasingly clear that the centers are unable to fully attain this objective: pass rates at JC examinations are about 10-15%, compared to over 80% at the regular boarding secondary schools. Thus only a handful of MCDE students pass the exam in one sitting and are able to transfer to regular secondary schools on completion of their studies. Because the centers lack specially trained teachers and face persistent shortages of self-learning materials and radio sets, they inevitably resort to conventional teaching methods, for which they have neither the qualified teachers or appropriate instructional materials and facilities. Further, the centers are overcrowded and staffed with teachers whose qualifications are lower than those assigned to regular secondary schools, thereby reinforcing the public's perception of the centers as less desirable options to regular secondary schools. Under the circumstances, it would be difficult to conclude that the MCDEs would be sustained as distant education centers. Rather, they are likely to serve as conventional secondary schools, albeit of lower quality than the regular secondary schools. Under a follow-up project

(Education Sector Credit II), IDA is providing assistance to strengthen the quality of instruction in the MCDE Centers.

H. Bank Performance

14. Major Strengths and Weaknesses. Bank staff contributed to the success of the project through close and supportive working relationships and professional advice. On the whole Bank staff were knowledgeable about the country's educational system as a result of close involvement in sector analysis and project development and implementation for a period of over two decades beginning with the sector work and identification of the first IDA-supported education project in 1965. Bank supervision was adequate and the missions were well-timed, with appropriate staff skill mix: 16 supervision missions were fielded consisting usually of two (and sometimes three) staff with different skills such as educators, economists and architects. Virtually all the supervision missions were combined with other tasks, such as supervision of other ongoing education projects (The Third and Fourth Education Projects), or later identification, appraisal and supervision of follow-up projects, Education Sector Credits I and II). The missions have been helpful in helping resolve critical implementation constraints, although, as noted by the Borrower (Para.21), there should have been better continuity in their composition. For instance, during the early phase of project implementation when the Government was facing an acute shortage of foreign exchange which brought about major shortages of imported building materials, thereby threatening to delay project implementation, IDA facilitated the situation by amending the Development Credit Agreement in 1986 to set up a Special Account, denominated in US dollars, in a local commercial bank with an Authorized Allocation of SDR 1.5 million. This was increased to US\$ 3.5 million in 1988, at the request of the Government. Following the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha, IDA similarly responded positively to Government's request in 1986 and 1987 to increase the number of school places financed under the project from 960 to 2,880, an increase equivalent to four new schools, each with an enrollment of 480 students. The Development Credit Agreement was amended to incorporate this increase. While these are some of the positive features of IDA's performance, on the negative side IDA has not put in place a strong local project implementation capability in spite of having already financed five major investments (including this project) and is in the process of implementing two large sector adjustment credits. Much of the technical work (such as architectural and procurement) was left to expatriates that were provided by bilateral agencies, notably DANIDA, and only modest assistance for the PIU was included in the project for the first time in the form of fellowships and technical assistance.

15. Lessons Learned. For future projects the following lessons learned from implementation of this project may be of value:

- (a) A careful and detailed project preparation should be undertaken before a project is appraised and launched. In this case the project was appraised only four months after it was identified,

and a preparation mission was not fielded. The identification mission itself was very brief: a one-person IDA mission spent a week in the field. As most of the components of the project were "repeaters", in the sense that they were included in previous Bank-assisted projects, IDA and the Government may have at the time considered it unnecessary to undertake detailed project preparation. The outcome was that the components were simply replicated without examining adequately other options such as a more cost-effective mode of training primary school teachers (this is being done now under the Second Education Credit, almost a decade later).

- (b) The project confirms that the Bank's assistance for education and training should contain an appropriate balance between support for expansion of physical facilities, qualitative improvement as well as for strengthening the system as a whole. The project focused almost entirely on expansion of physical facilities, for which 86% of project costs was allocated. Support for improving educational quality or for strengthening the system's overall capability was very limited (instructional materials accounted for about only 3% of project costs; support for strengthening management and planning of the system was even less, less than 1.5% of project costs). While the project's strong emphasis on civil works was rather typical of education projects of the period (1970s and early 1980s), a more balanced support for quality upgrading and institutional strengthening was appropriate as the weaknesses in these areas had been highlighted during project identification, and all four IDA-assisted projects that preceded it had also focused almost exclusively on expansion of physical facilities. For instance, in spite of long association with implementing IDA-assisted projects, the Project Implementation Unit still relies quite heavily on expatriate staff, particularly in regard to architects, quantity surveyors and other technical staff. Support for developing local capability in project implementation was almost negligible in the preceding four projects, and the limited assistance (overseas training) under this project was inadequate.
- (c) When feasibility or other studies on specific aspects of the sector are financed under a project, it is vitally important to identify the principal researchers/investigators and to agree with the borrower on the terms of reference for the studies and on arrangements for conducting the studies and for reporting the results. In this case two new studies were included for financing under the project, in addition to two other studies carried over from the Third and Fourth Education Projects (Cr. 910 and 1123, respectively). After persistent delays the studies were launched, but the reports have not been released, although they are reportedly available in draft. A major factor for the persistent delays in conducting the studies was that MOE did not have its own research staff to conduct the kind of survey research envisaged under the project. The lesson to be drawn from this experience is that on the whole line ministries and similar government agencies are not properly set up to undertake research as their primary function is administration rather than research, and that IDA and

the borrower should instead make arrangements with institutions that are appropriately oriented to undertake studies such as universities or university-based research centers. Toward the end of the implementation period IDA and the borrower realized the problem and using the additional funds that accrued from the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha, decided to establish a new Center for Educational Research under the University, to be responsible for all educational research.

I. Borrower Performance

16. All major credit covenants were compiled with (Table 10), although some were met only in part (e.g. appointment of administrative staff to one of the project institutions). In spite of the changes in senior management, overall the PIU performed well. The procurement section was affected most by these management changes and up to the time of the mission the records of deliveries and outstanding equipment supplies were difficult to ascertain. As in the preceding IDA-assisted education projects, the project encountered difficulties in obtaining counterpart funds on a timely basis. This was the perhaps the most notable exception to an otherwise very satisfactory borrower performance.

J. Project Relationship

17. Bank staff and officials of the Borrower involved in the implementation of the project enjoyed an amiable and highly professional working relationship. These factors contributed to the success of the project.

K. Consulting Services

18. Architectural and engineering services required for the project were limited as standardized designs prepared by the PIU were used for both the secondary schools and the MCDE centers. The designs for the PTTCs were prepared by local consultants based on the design of an existing PTTC, financed under a previous IDA-assisted project. This decision was unfortunate as the attempt to save on design fees allowed the replication of excessive circulation spaces in the three PTTCs financed under the project. The consultants performed their supervisory services adequately, but have allowed some minor defects to remain outstanding for too long; but the defects have since been corrected. Technical assistance and overseas training provision was implemented by the British Council under a contract with MOE. The British Council provided a reliable and efficient service in respect to recruitment of technical assistance staff and in placing Malawian staff in overseas educational institutions and following up their progress.

PART II. PROJECT REVIEW FROM BORROWER'S PERSPECTIVE

19. As stated in Part I, the objectives of the Project, on the whole, have been achieved, although the three teachers' colleges are slightly underutilized and the MCDE centers are over-enrolled.

20. The Bank's performance during evolution and implementation of the Project is one factor that can explain the successful completion of the Project. Among many areas in which the Bank has been useful and helpful are:

- a. During the design phase, the Bank accommodated many elements of the package proposed by the Government.
- b. Throughout the implementation phase the Bank was prompt with approvals of designs, contract awards and other matters.
- c. The most appreciable area of cooperation was in the introduction of Special Account. Before then, Credit funds were used to reimburse expenditure made by the Government. The implementation of civil works was being delayed due to the unavailability of foreign exchange for the importation of building materials. To resolve these difficulties IDA agreed to open a Special Account under which they advanced US\$ 2 million to the Government to provide foreign exchange. With quick importation of materials, civil works were speeded up and cost escalations were reduced.

However, in retrospect, there was room for improvement in the following area: there could have been continuity in the members on the supervision missions, so as to develop a more effective technical dialogue with members of PIU. A related area of concern was that the missions in some cases also came to appraise new projects, thus dividing the short, scheduled time between two equally demanding tasks. Consequently during discussions some details and explanations were sacrificed.

21. Another factor that enabled the successful completion of the Project was that the Ministry of Education and Culture, through PIU implemented the project with due diligence and efficiency. The decision by the Ministry to appoint the heads of new institutions, for example, before the completion of a building contract has indeed proved commendable and useful. The head takes part in the site meetings of the finished stages and works closely with the PIU staff, consultants and supervisors.

22. However, many lessons have been learnt for even better performance in the future. More important ones include:

- a. There were small annual allocations of development funds to educational development projects, resulting in delayed commencement of the Project because the allocated funds were spent on the completion of on-going projects. It is felt desirable, therefore, that when there are restrictions on total development

budget, not more than one IDA project should be implemented at the same time.

- b. Staff turnover, especially at senior levels, was high, and new members started performing their duties without even rudimentary training; their efficient performance being achieved through their enthusiasm which enabled them to "pick-up" skills sooner than otherwise would have been the case. It is strongly recommended that staff turnover should be minimized and there is need for specialized training for staff, especially at senior levels.
- c. There should have been more effective consultations and dialogue between the suppliers and the project institutions for example, in revising and updating lists of textbooks and equipment and in orienting the users (through workshops supplemented by manuals) on the use and maintenance of the new facilities. This area needs redressing.
- d. To facilitate quality control and guidance for the users, there should have been standard specifications and drawings for office and staff house furniture in line with the existing documentation of school furniture. This concern requires immediate attention.
- e. There were many problems associated with civil works; among them were:
 - i) two or three unsuitable sites for secondary schools were selected, for example, Euthini proved to have serious shortage of water;
 - ii) it is now evident that extensions to Bembeke and Livingstonia were more costly than to provide an equal number of student places in the form of a new college or school. However, considering Malawi's national, cultural heritage it was probably right to upgrade and expand the two institutions. But such special project components should have been brought forward to an earlier stage of the implementation and PIU should have been in a better position to undertake such projects in house;
 - iii) The civil works components of the Project were largely handled by local works professional teams, most consisting of a firm of architects as a lead consultant with PIU approved sub-consultants to cover the disciplines of quantity surveying, land surveying, the various branches of engineering and site supervision. The firms used have all been long established and experienced practices. Towards the end of the Project, it has, however, been felt that

newer consultancy firms ought to be appointed,1/ initially for smaller and less complicated projects;

- iv) on the majority of civil works contracts the implementation has been hampered by shortcomings in the performance of statutory bodies responsible for water and electricity supply. They were rather slow in providing the services;
- v) the present staff of the PIU is of the opinion that the electrical power and lighting design of the secondary schools and in particular the teacher training colleges have been too extravagant resulting in unnecessary capital costs, operational expenses and maintenance. Where possible action was taken on this issue.

23. As regards to the relationship between the Bank and the Malawi Government, it was warm and effective as exemplified in the cooperation to establish the special account.

24. There were no co-financiers in this project.

1/ The consultants were selected following IDA's Guidelines for Selection of Consultants.

PART III. STATISTICAL INFORMATION

A. Related Bank Credits

Table 1: IDA CREDITS RELEVANT TO THE PROJECT

<u>Credit No. Project Title</u>	<u>Year of Appr oval</u>	<u>Purpose of Project</u>	<u>Status</u>	<u>Comments</u>
Cr.102-MAI Education I	1967	Secondary school expansion, primary teacher training, introduction of technical subjects in secondary schools	Completed 3/80	Except for introduction of technical subjects in secondary schools, the project was successfully completed. Expansion of secondary school enrollment as achieved; the primary teacher training college is operating well.
Cr.590-MAI Education II	1975	Primary teacher training, expansion of secondary education and establishment of "model" primary schools	Completed 6/82	The teacher training and secondary schools have expanded enrollment and are well managed. Replication of the "model" primary schools, however, did not take place as community participation was not organized effectively.
Cr.910-MAI Education III	1979	Expansion and improvement of primary education; expansion of primary teacher training; expansion of correspondence/distance learning facilities; establishment of Institute of Education (for teacher upgrading) and strengthening educational management and planning.	Completed 5/86	Expansion of enrollments in primary schools, primary teacher training college and distance education centers was successfully achieved. However, this objective of reducing existing disparities in primary school enrollment among the districts was not achieved.
Cr.1123-MAI Education IV	1981	Expansion of secondary education; expansion of secondary school teacher output at the University; preparation of national education plan and pre-investment studies.	Completed 12/86	Enrollment expansion in secondary schools as well as output of secondary school teachers from the University was successfully achieved. The Education Plan was well prepared and put into good use.

B. Project Timetable

Table 2: PLANNED, REVISED AND ACTUAL DATES OF PROJECT TIMETABLE

Item	Planned Date	Revised Date	Actual Date
Reconnaissance			
Mission	7/81	7/81	7/81
Identification	1/82	1/82	1/82
Appraisal	5/82	5/82	5/82
Post-appraisal	10/82	10/82	10/82
Negotiations	1/83	1/83	1/83
Post-negotiation	2/83	2/83	2/83
Board Approval	3/83	3/83	3/83
Credit Effectiveness	8/83	8/83	8/83
Project Completion	3/88	3/89; 3/90	3/90
Project Closing	9/88	9/89; 9/90	9/90

25. Comments on Timetable. At the request of the Government, the Credit Agreement was amended in 1988 to increase the number of secondary school places financed under the project from 960 to 2,880 student places. Provision of additional school places was made possible as a result of savings accruing from the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha against the SDR. In view of the anticipated delay in completion of the project as amended, the Closing Date was extended by one year from September 30, 1988 to September 30, 1989. Because of shortages of building materials especially cement and imported materials, the construction program (particularly of the newly added schools) was encountering serious delays, and this necessitated a second extension of the Closing Date to September 30, 1990.

C. Loan Disbursements

Table 3: Cumulative Estimated and Actual Disbursement
(US\$ Million)

Bank FY	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989	1990	1991
App- raisal Estimate	1.00	6.50	18.00	27.00	33.00	34.00	-	-
Actual	0.05	2.13	6.54	13.13	20.79	30.14	36.92	38.73
Actual % of Estimate	5	32	36	48	63	88	108	114
Date of Final Disburse- ment	12/20/1990							

26. Comments on Disbursements

The percentage draw down on Table 3 is based on the approximate value of the US\$ to SDR at appraisal. Because of the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha to the US\$ the historical US\$ equivalent amount of the credit was US\$38.73 million. The full value of the credit (SDR 30.9 million) was disbursed.

D. Project Implementation

Table 4: PLANNED AND ACTUAL COMPLETION DATES OF COMPONENTS

Project Components	Planned Completion	Actual Completion	Months of Delay
<u>Primary Teacher Training</u>			
<u>Colleges Civil Works</u>			
Domasi	6/87	11/87	5
Bembeke	9/86	3/90	45
Kasungu	6/87	12/88	18
Karonga	3/87	9/87	6
<u>Malawi College of Distance Education</u>			
Centers	6/87	4/86	-14
MCDE Headquarters	6/86	9/90	51
<u>Secondary Schools</u>			
Namitete	6/87	3/90	33
Livingstonia 1/	12/86	3/90	39
Chayamba	-	6/90	-
Madisi 1/	-	3/90	-
Luchenza 1/	-	7/90	-
Mchinji 1/	-	6/90	-
<u>Malawi College of Accountancy</u>			
Academic Block, Hostel, Housing	3/87	11/87	8
Office Extension 1/	-	11/90	-
Center for Educational Research 1/	-	11/91	-

1/ Additional facility, not planned at appraisal

27. Comments on Project Implementation. As a result of foreign exchange constraints, imported building materials were in short supply throughout the country, and this resulted in some delay in the construction of project facilities, particularly during the early phase of the project. However, the situation improved considerably when a Special Account, denominated in US dollars, was established in 1986 in a local commercial bank. Four more secondary schools were added to the project, utilizing additional funds accruing from the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha. Completion of these additional facilities necessitated extension of the closing date by two years, from September 30, 1988 to September 30, 1990. The MCDE centers were completed 15 months ahead of schedule; rehabilitation of the MCDE headquarters, however, experienced delays as some of the buildings that were to be rehabilitated were still in use by MOEC and were not vacated in time. Notwithstanding these delays, all project facilities were completed by the revised closing date, and at the time of the Completion Mission, most of the institutions had already been in operation by as much as three years. Furniture and equipment have been supplied to all secondary schools and PTTCs, except for some science equipment which was delivered late by overseas suppliers and was being forwarded to the project institutions at the time of the Completion Mission.

E. Project Costs and Financing

Table 5: PROJECT COSTS
(US\$ million)

Category	<u>Estimated Costs</u>			<u>Actual Costs</u>		
	Local Costs	Foreign Costs	Total Costs	Local Costs	Foreign Costs	Total Costs
Civil Works	13.54	9.80	23.34	19.34	14.04	33.43
Furniture	0.55	0.84	1.39	1.89	1.51	3.40
Equipment & Vehicles	0.19	1.67	1.86	0.18	3.77	3.95
Arch. Eng. & Auditing	0.46	0.70	1.67	1.67	1.15	2.82
Tech. Assist & Studies	0.16	1.46	1.62	0.19	2.16	2.35
Training & Fellowships	0.20	0.88	1.08	0.00	0.06	0.06
Project Administration	0.20	0.15	0.35	0.69	0.00	0.69
Unallocated	<u>6.71</u>	<u>4.49</u>	<u>11.20</u>	<u>0.00</u>	<u>0.00</u>	<u>0.00</u>
Total	22.01	19.99	42.00	23.96	22.74	46.70

28. Comments on Project Costs. Total project costs were about 11% above appraisal estimates. The cost overrun must be viewed against the additional project facilities, particularly the four secondary schools that were added during the implementation period following the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha.

Table 6: PROJECT FINANCING
(US\$ million)

	Planned	Actual
IDA	34.00	38.73
Government	<u>8.00</u>	<u>7.97</u>
TOTAL	42.00	46.70

29. Comment on Project Financing. There were no co-financiers. Actual disbursements in US\$ reflect currency fluctuation, as well as the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha against the US\$.

Table 7: ALLOCATION OF CREDIT PROCEEDS
(US\$ million)

Category	Orig.	Actual	Orig.	Actual
	Alloc.	Disburs.	Alloc.	Disburs.
	SDR	SDR	US\$	USDm
	mill.	mill.	mill.	Equiv.
1. Civil Works	16.91	21.93	18.60	27.60
2. Furniture	1.08	1.58	1.18	2.09
3. Equipment & Vehicles	1.55	3.02	1.70	3.95
4. Arch. Eng. & Auditing	0.85	1.88	0.93	2.31
5. Tech. Assist. & Studies	1.37	1.92	1.50	2.20
6. Training & Fellowships	0.89	0.05	0.98	0.06
7. Project Administration	0.26	0.46	0.28	0.52
8. Unallocated	<u>7.99</u>	<u>0.00</u>	<u>8.83</u>	<u>0.00</u>
Total	30.90	30.84	34.00	38.73
Exchange Adjustment <u>1/</u>	---	<u>0.06</u>	---	---
Total Allocated/Disbursed	<u>30.90</u>	<u>30.90</u>	<u>34.00</u>	<u>38.73</u>

1/ This amount is attributed by the Bank's Loan and Trust Department to the Exchange difference between the US Dollar equivalent at the time the funds were advanced to be the Special Account and the US Dollar Equivalent at the time the advance was documented.

30. Comments on Allocation of Loan Proceeds. The credit amount was in SDRs, and was fully disbursed. The actual disbursements in US dollar equivalent reflects currency fluctuations, as well as the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha against the dollar.

F. Project Results

Table 8: DIRECT BENEFITS OF PROJECT

Institutions/Indicators	Enrollment		1988-89	Graduates 1989-90	1990-91
	Appraisal Target	Actual (1989-90)			
a. <u>Secondary Schools</u>					
1. Madisi	480	545	NYO	NYO	250
2. Chayamba	480	540	NYO	NYO	276
3. Namitete	480	384	NYO	NYO	245
4. Mchinji	480	280	NYO	NYO	122
5. Luchenza	480	381	NYO	NYO	121
6. Livingstonia	480	494	NA	260	240
Total	2,880	2,624	---	260	1,254
b. <u>Primary T.T.C.s</u>					
1. Karonga	300	292	113	109	132
2. Kasungu	540	470	NYO	178	202
3. Domasi	540	510	458	514	509
4. Bembeke	300	282	39	98	115
Total	1,680	1,554	610	899	958
c. <u>M.C.D.E.</u>					
1. Misuku	160	254	NYO	86	100
2. Karonga	320	391	NYO	167	213
3. Chisenga	320	418	NYO	98	118
4. Nkhwawa	160	393	NYO	153	169
5. Katowo	160	330	NYO	172	183
6. Mhuju	160	206	NYO	111	136
7. Ekwendeni	320	523	NYO	253	361
8. Luwazi	320	271	NYO	116	129
9. Nkhata Bay/ St. Augustine	160	245	NYO	72	78
10. Euthini	160	228	NYO	64	101
11. Luwelezi	160	423	NYO	191	170
12. Chulu	160	324	NYO	103	111
13. Mchinji	160	181	NYO	70	116
14. Lilonwe/Tsbango	320	1,023	NYO	356	340
15. Khola	160	189	NYO	87	90
16. Nyambadwe	320	846	NYO	602	354
17. Lichenza	160	390	NYO	61	76
18. Mpassa	160	172	NYO	86	79
19. Namulenga	160	302	NYO	113	115
20. Chiringa	320	495	NYO	203	179
21. Dharap/Namiwawa	320	1,052	NYO	199	355
22. Makande	320	499	NYO	252	190
23. Thekerani	320	507	NYO	136	132
24. Luchenza	160	192	NYO	134	103
Total	5,440	9,854	---	3,905	3,998

d. Malawi College of Accountancy

1. Blantyre Campus	210	356	NA	NA	NA
2. Lilongwe Campus	---	210	NA	NA	NA
Total	210	566	150 xx	115 xx	

Fellowships

1. M.C.A.	20 s/y	26.5 s/y
2. M.C.D.E.	9 s/y	9.0 s/y
3. Auditor-General Office	6 s/y	17.0 s/y
4. M.O.E.	9 s/y	10.0 s/y
5. P.I.U.	8 s/y	9.0 s/y
Total	52 s/y	71.5 s/y

Technical Assistance

1. M.C.A.	8 s/y	8.5 s/y
2. M.C.D.E.	2 s/y	2.0 s/y
3. Auditor-General Office	3 s/y	0 s/y
4. P.I.U.	5 s/y	3.0 s/y
5. M.A.N.E.B.	3 s/y	3.0 s/y
Total	21 s/y	16.5 s/y

NOTE: NYO = Not Yet Operational x = See Annex 4 for Breakdown by type of program
 NA = Not Available xx = See Annex 5 for Breakdown by type of program
 S/Y = Staff-years

31. Direct Benefits of Project. Enrollment and outputs goals in the various project institutions have already been met, and in the case of the MCDEs, enrollment in the NCDC centers was close to 10,000 students, or almost double that of the appraised capacity of 5,600 places. In terms of output, the four PTTCs graduated 958 teachers in 1990-91, compared to the appraisal target of 780. Five of the six secondary schools were new and did not produce graduates until 1990-91. The combined output from the six secondary schools in 1990-91 was 1254. The SAR had output targets of 120 graduates for each of two of the two schools: Livingstonia, an existing school which was being expanded, and rural Lilongwe/Namitete. Actual number of graduates in 1990-91 for both schools was double the appraisal estimates (240 for Livingstonia and 245 for rural Lilongwe/Namitete). Similarly, output from the NCDCs is significant. MOE reported that the pass rate on the JCC (repeated sittings) has been rising steadily from about 16% of the candidates in 1986 to 73% in 1990. In 1990-91 the total number of NCDC output who sat for the JCC Examinations was 2,765. 73% of that would be about 2,000. The appraisal target was to double the 1981 output of 600. The institutions have thus exceeded that by over 300%, according to MOE's estimates. Details of student enrollment in the various programs of study offered by the Malawi College of Accountancy are summarized in Annex 4. With respect to graduate output, the College graduated a total of 150 graduates (1988-89) and 115 graduates in 1989-90. The breakdown by courses of study is shown in Annex 5. Both the enrollment and output figures exceed the SAR estimates. Planning and management improvement goals, as measured by specialist assistance and special training abroad, were achieved or even exceeded in the case of overseas training. 71.5 staff-years of overseas training were utilized in comparison to 53

staff-years provided at appraisal, or about 35% over the target. Savings accruing as a result of the devaluation of the Malawi Kwacha against the SDR allowed the Government to finance the additional training indicated above.

Table 9: PROJECT STUDIES

	Purpose as Defined at Appraisal	Status	Impact of Study
1. The use and effect of Primary School Textbooks	To evaluate benefits derived from textbooks provided under previous and on-going projects	Not completed; data collection and analysis has been done	Too early to determine impact
2. Tracer studies of Graduates of Secondary and Higher Level Institutions	To assess manpower needs as input to development of National Education Plan	Study not yet completed	Too early to determine impact
3. Cost effectiveness of primary school self-help construction program	To assess self-help building program supported under a previous IDA-financed project	Completed in draft	Too early to determine impact
4. Secondary School Mapping Study	To determine the extent for reducing the need for secondary school boarding facilities	Completed in draft; awaiting clearance by authorities	Too early to determine impact

32. Comments on Studies Components. The project included the financing of two studies that were carried over from the Third and Fourth Education projects (Cr. 910-MAI and Cr. 1123-MAI, respectively). These on-going studies included an assessment of the use and effects of primary school textbooks and a tracer study of graduates of secondary and higher education institutions assisted by IDA under previous projects. In addition, the project included two additional studies. The first was an evaluation of the cost-effectiveness of the self-help school construction program assisted under the Third Education project. The second was intended to determine to what extent boarding facilities could be eliminated or at least reduced through new admission policies as well as through school location mapping. Partly because detailed terms of reference had not been agreed during project preparation and appraisal, and also because researchers had not been identified sufficiently in advance, the studies encountered delays. At the time of the Completion Mission, as indicated in Table 9, drafts of the studies

had been submitted to MOEC officials, but not officially released for public dissemination. Towards the end of the implementation period, IDA concluded that completion of such studies would require full-time researchers, and utilizing funds accruing from the depreciation of the Kwacha, financed the construction of a facility to house a new Center for Educational Research (CER). The Center will be part of the University's Faculty of Education, and will be responsible for all educational research including those financed under IDA-assisted Education projects, including the two follow-up projects (Education Sector Credit I and II.)

G. Status of Credit Covenants

Table 10: COMPLIANCE WITH CREDIT COVENANTS

Section/Covenant		Status of Compliance
3.01	(i) Maintain PIU with responsibilities in Schedule 3	In full compliance
3.01	(ii) PIU employs Project Manager, a senior architect, a senior procurement officer and a financial controller, all qualified and experienced, and supporting staff	In full compliance
3.02	(a) Borrower employs consultants and experts whose qualifications, experience, and terms of conditions of employment shall be satisfactory to the Association	In full compliance
3.02	(b) Prior to carrying out the studies, furnish to the Association terms of reference, cost estimates and timetables	In full compliance
3.04	(d) Borrower prepares completion report	Government prepared Part II of Completion Report
3.06	Borrower prepares a plan for training of Staff of the project Teacher Training Colleges	Partially met. Plan was prepared, but training of TTC staff did not take place
3.07	Borrower appoints to MCC a deputy principal and five additional specialists	Partially met. Deputy Principal and 2 specialists were appointed
3.08	Borrower appoints an audit specialist for the Audit General's Office	Partially met. Overseas fellowships were provided as well as short-term specialist services
3.09	Borrower furnishes a plan for training of Malawian accountancy teachers	In full compliance
3.10	Borrower reviews with the Association the annual education budget proposals	Partially met. Annual draft budgets were reviewed on somewhat <u>ad hoc</u> basis
4.01	(c) Borrower prepares annual audit reports	All reports were prepared and submitted, but this was not done always within the 6 month period required in the Credit Agreement

H. Use of Bank Resources

Table 11: STAFF INPUTS BY STAGE OF PROJECT CYCLE IN STAFF WEEKS

Stage of Project Cycle	Planned		Revised		Final	
	HQ	Field	HQ	Field	HQ	Field
Through Appraisal	14.4	4	14.4	4	14.4	4
Appraisal--Board Approval	42.1	10	42.1	10	42.1	10
Board Approval-Effectiveness	7.0	-	7.0	-	7.0	
Supervision	61.2 (5 years)		73.5 (6 years)		85.7 (7 years)	

33. Staff Inputs. Staff-input for early stages of the project up to appraisal was rather light (about 14 s/w only). As reflected in Table 12 on Mission Data, a project preparation mission was not fielded. Only 4 months elapsed between project identification mission in January, 1982 and appraisal in May, 1982. As the project was essentially a "repeater" project IDA, and the borrower may have considered it adequate to appraise the project, skipping the preparation phase. On the other hand, the project was closely monitored and supervision missions were fielded regularly (at least twice a year); close to 86 staff-weeks were utilized for supervision in the course of a seven year implementation period.

Table 12: MISSION DATA BY STAGES OF PROJECT

Mission	Month/ Year	No. of Persons <u>a/</u>	Staff Weeks in Field	Performance Status by Activity <u>b/</u>			
				G	P	M	F
Pre-Identif.	7/81	3 (E,EP,A)	6				
Identif.	1/82	1 (EP)	1				
*Prep.	-	-	-				
Appraisal	5-6/82	5 (EP,E,A,NFE,AS)	20				
Post-Appr.	10-11/82	2 (EP, E)	4				
Post-Appr.	2/83	2 (EP, A)	<u>2</u>				
		Total	<u>33</u>				
Spn. I	10/83	2 (E, A)	1.5	1	1	1	2
Spn. II	3/84	2 (E, A)	2.0	2	1	2	2
Spn. III	9-10/84	3 (E, ED, A)	3.0	2	1	2	2
Spn. IV	7/85	2 (A, OA)	2.0	1	2	1	2
Spn. V	2-3/86	3 (E, ED, A)	3.0	1	1	1	2
Spn. VI	6/86	3 (E, EP, A)	3.0	1	1	1	3
Spn. VII	12/86	3 (E, E, A)	2.0	1	1	1	2
Spn. VIII	4/87	2 (E, OA)	2.0	1	1	1	1
Spn. IX	8-9/87	2 (E, TE)	2.0	1	1	1	1
Spn. X	3/88	4 (E, E, TE, E)	3.0	1	1	1	3
Spn. XI	10/88	5 (E, E, A, A, ED)	2.5	2	1	1	3
Spn. XII	2-3/89	3 (E, TE, A)	3.0	2	2	1	3
Spn. XIII	10/89	2 (E, E)	3.0	2	2	1	2
Spn. XIV	2/90	1 (E)	0.5	2	2	1	1
Spn. XV	6/90	3 (ED, ED, A)	2.5	2	3	1	1
Spn. XVI	10/90	3 (E, ED, A)	<u>2.0</u>	1	1	1	1
		Total	37.0				

* Project preparation was undertaken by the Government and reviewed by the Bank's appraisal mission in May, 1982.

a/ A = Architect; AS = Accounting Specialist; E = Economist; EP = Educational Planner; ED = Educator; TE = Technical Educator; NFE = Non-Formal Education Specialist; OA = Operations Assistant.

b/ G = General Status; P = Procurement; M = Management; F = Financial.

PROJECT COMPLETION REPORT

MALAWI

FIFTH EDUCATION PROJECT
(CREDIT 1330-MAI)

Participants in Completion Mission

International Development Association

Mulugeta Wodajo, Senior Educator
Jack Bynoe, Architect (Consultant)

Ministry of Education

Dr. G.G.Y. Mgomozulu	Deputy Secretary for Education
Mr. E.Y. Ngaye	Chief Education Officer (Planning)

Project Implementation Unit

Mr. F. H. Masumbu	Project Manager
Mr. Vincent Gondwe	Deputy Project Manager
Mr. John Upton	Quantity Surveyor
Mr. Peter Creaser	Project Architect
Mr. Anders Grum	Project Architect
Mr. Felix Tontahola	Procurement Officer
Mr. Jackson Malapula	Asst. Procurement Officer

Project Institutions

Mr. A. Colombo	Principal, MCDE
Mr. David Warr	Advisor, MCDE
Mr. D.C. Manda	Principal, MCA
Mr. Neesan J. Ronan	Advisor, MCA
Mr. L.H. Myirenda	Principal, PTTC, Damasi

PROJECT COMPLETION PROJECT

MALAWI

FIFTH EDUCATION PROJECT
(CREDIT 1330-MAI)

(By year)

1. December 31, 1983 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
2. June 30, 1984 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
3. October 24, 1984 First Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training, British Council
4. December 31, 1984 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
5. January 6, 1985 Second Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training, British Council
6. June 30, 1985 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
7. December 31, 1985 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
8. June 30, 1986 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
9. July, 1986 Fourth Six-Monthly Report, Technical and Training, British Council
10. September, 1986 Fourth Quarterly Report, July-September, 1986 by J. D. Upton, Quantity Surveyor, Project Implementation Unit, IDA Education Project Unit
11. January, 1987 Fifth Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training, British Council
12. June 30, 1987 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
13. September, 1987 Sixth Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training, British Council

14. December 31, 1987 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
15. December 31, 1987 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
16. December 31, 1987 First Half-Yearly Report on Studies and Research Component of Fifth Education Project by M. Mundangepfupfu, Ministry of Education and Culture, Planning Division
17. January, 1988 Seventh Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training, British Council
18. June 30, 1988 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
19. December, 1988 Eighth Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training, British Council
20. December 31, 1988 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
21. December, 1989 Ninth Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training
22. June 30, 1990 Half-Yearly Report, Ministry of Education and Culture, Project Implementation Unit
23. May, 1990 Tenth Six-Monthly Report, Technical Assistance and Training, British Council

**Table 1: PLANNED AND ACTUAL COMPLETION OF CIVIL WORKS,
FURNITURE AND EQUIPMENT PROCUREMENT**

Institution Building	Civil Works		Completion Dates			
	Planned	Actual	Months Delay	Planned	Actual	Months Delay
Primary Teacher Training College:						
Domasi	6/87	11/87	5	7/86	3/90	42
Kasungu	6/87	12/88	18	7/86	3/90	42
Karonga	3/87	9/87	6	7/86	3/90	42
Bembeke	9/86	3/90	45	7/86	3/90	42
Malawi College of Distance Education:						
MCDE Centers						
MCDE Headquarters	6/87	4/86	-14	12/86	4/87	4
Secondary Schools:						
Namitete	6/87	3/90	33	12/86	7/90	42
Livingstonia	12/86	3/90	39	12/86	7/90	42
Chayamba <u>1/</u>	-	6/90	-	-	7/90	-
Madisi <u>1/</u>	-	3/90	-	-	7/90	-
Mchinji <u>1/</u>	-	6/90	-	-	7/90	-
Luchenza <u>1/</u>	-	7/90	-	-	7/90	-
Malawi College of Accountancy						
Classrooms & Dorms	3/87	11/87	8	3/87	9/87	6
Office Extension <u>1/</u>	-	11/90	-	-	-	-
Center for Educational Research <u>1/</u>	-	11/90	-	-	-	-

Note: 1/ New Institutions that were added during Implementation Period.

Table 2: PLANNED AND ACTUAL UTILIZATION
OF TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE BY INSTITUTION
(Staff Months)

<u>Institution</u>	<u>Technical Assistance</u>			<u>Fellowship Training</u>		
	<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>% Diff- erence</u>	<u>Planned</u>	<u>Actual</u>	<u>% Diff- erence</u>
Malawi College of Accountancy	96	102	117	240	318	132
Malawi College of Distance Education	24	24	100	108	108	100
Auditor General's Office	36	0	0	72	204	190
Ministry of Education - Planning Unit	-	-	-	108	120	110
Project Implementation Office	60	60	100	96	108	110
Malawi National Exams Board	<u>36</u>	<u>36</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>-</u>
Total	252	222	87	624	858	138

Table 3: INSTRUCTIONAL STAFF IN PROJECT PTCS AND SECONDARY SCHOOLS

Institution	Teacher (1989/90)
Primary Teacher Training College:	
Karonga	21
Kasungu	31
Domasi	29
Bembeke	19
Secondary Schools:	
Madisi	12
Chayamba	17
Namitete	15
Mchinji	14
Luchenza	16
Livingstonia	23

Annex 4 Enrollment at the Malawi College of
Accountancy by Type of Program 1990-91

<u>Programme</u>	<u>Blantyre</u>	<u>Lilongwe</u>	<u>Totals</u>
Professional Accountant			
Level 3	12	-	12
Level 2	53	28	81
Level 1	45	22	67
Technician Accountant			
Level A	90	51	141
Level B	48	20	68
Certificate in Accounting	44	58	102
Certificate in Business Computing	30	20	50
Certificate in Financial Management	15	-	15
Course is Planned to Commence in			
Post-Graduate Diploma in Accounting & Finance	19	11	30
	-----	-----	-----
Totals	356	210	566
	-----	-----	-----

Annex 5 Malawi College of Accountancy
Graduate Output

<u>Year</u>	<u>1981</u> <u>/82</u>	<u>1982</u> <u>/83</u>	<u>1983</u> <u>/84</u>	<u>1984</u> <u>/85</u>	<u>1985</u> <u>/86</u>	<u>1986</u> <u>/87</u>	<u>1987</u> <u>/88</u>	<u>1988</u> <u>/89</u>	<u>1989</u> <u>/90</u>
Diplomate Accountant	6	6	7	24	28	19	17	21	25
CPA Malawi- Level 1	11	3	2	10	19	30	23	28	6
CPA Malawi- Level 2	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	5	7
CPA Malawi- Level 3	0	0	0	0	0	3	4	8	8
Certificate in Accounting	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	79	48
Certificate in Business Computing	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	11
Certificate in Financial Management	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	10
Post- Graduate Diploma in Accounting & Finance	-	-	-	-	-	-	8	9	-
Totals	17	9	9	34	47	53	45	150	115

Notes:

1. The Certificate in Accounting Program commenced in September 1988.
2. The Certificate in Business Computing commenced in February 1989.
3. The Certificate in Financial Management Program commenced in July 1989.
4. The Post-Graduate Diploma in Accounting & Finance commenced in September 1987.
5. In the case of CPA (Malawi) the students sit the ACCA Examinations in June and December each year.
6. In the case of the Diplomate Accountant Program, students sit examinations in June and December each year.
7. The results for academic year 1989/90 are not yet complete as we await the results of the December 1990 Examination diet.