

Document of  
**The World Bank**  
**FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY**

Report No: ICR00005137

**IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION AND RESULTS REPORT**

TF0A6422 and TF0A4416

ON A

SMALL GRANT

IN THE AMOUNT OF USD 0.80 MILLION

TO THE

Ministry of Oil

FOR

IRAQ EITI Implementation Support (P160274)

March 16, 2020

Energy & Extractives Global Practice  
Middle East And North Africa Region

Regional Vice President: **Ferid Belhaj**

Country Director: **Saroj Kumar Jha**

Regional Director: **Riccardo Puliti**

Practice Manager: **Christopher Gilbert Sheldon**

Task Team Leader(s): **Carlos Alberto Lopez Quiroga, Salam Falah Almaroof**

ICR Main Contributor: **Sridar Padmanabhan Kannan**

## **ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS**

<b>CPF</b>	Country Partnership Framework
<b>EITI</b>	Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative
<b>FCV</b>	Fragility, Conflict and Violence
<b>IEITI</b>	Iraq Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative
<b>MDTF</b>	Multi-Donor Trust Fund
<b>MSG</b>	Multi-Stakeholder Group
<b>PDO</b>	Project Development Objective
<b>PMT</b>	Project Management Team

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>DATA SHEET .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>II. OUTCOME .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME ..</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>V. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>ANNEX 2. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT .....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>ANNEX 3. RECIPIENT, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS.....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>ANNEX 4. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (IF ANY) .....</b>	<b>22</b>



**DATA SHEET**

**BASIC INFORMATION**

**Product Information**

Project ID	Project Name
P160274	IRAQ EITI Implementation Support
Country	Financing Instrument
Iraq	Investment Project Financing
Original EA Category	Revised EA Category

**Organizations**

Borrower	Implementing Agency
Ministry of Oil	EITI SECRETARIAT

**Project Development Objective (PDO)**

Original PDO

The project development objective (PDO) is to enhance transparency in Iraq's extractives sector through support of the government's activities on the implementation of the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI).



**FINANCING**

	Original Amount (US\$)	Revised Amount (US\$)	Actual Disbursed (US\$)
<b>Donor Financing</b>			
TF-A4416	350,000	350,000	311,460
TF-A6422	450,000	450,000	384,624
<b>Total</b>	<b>800,000</b>	<b>800,000</b>	<b>696,084</b>
<b>Total Project Cost</b>	<b>800,000</b>	<b>800,000</b>	<b>696,085</b>

**KEY DATES**

Approval	Effectiveness	Original Closing	Actual Closing
21-Feb-2017	02-May-2017	28-Jun-2019	31-Dec-2019

**RESTRUCTURING AND/OR ADDITIONAL FINANCING**

Date(s)	Amount Disbursed (US\$M)	Key Revisions
08-Dec-2017	0.05	Additional Financing Change in Results Framework Change in Components and Cost Change in Loan Closing Date(s) Change in Implementation Schedule
29-May-2019	0.36	Change in Results Framework Change in Components and Cost Change in Loan Closing Date(s) Change in Procurement Change in Implementation Schedule

**KEY RATINGS**

Outcome	Bank Performance	M&E Quality
Satisfactory	Satisfactory	Substantial



**RATINGS OF PROJECT PERFORMANCE IN ISRs**

No.	Date ISR Archived	DO Rating	IP Rating	Actual Disbursements (US\$M)
01	02-Nov-2017	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	0.00
02	21-Sep-2018	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	0.13

**ADM STAFF**

Role	At Approval	At ICR
Regional Vice President:	Hafez M. H. Ghanem	Ferid Belhaj
Country Director:	Ferid Belhaj	Saroj Kumar Jha
Director:	Riccardo Puliti	Riccardo Puliti
Practice Manager:	Christopher Gilbert Sheldon	Christopher Gilbert Sheldon
Task Team Leader(s):	Bakhtiyar Karimov	Carlos Alberto Lopez Quiroga, Salam Falah Almaroof
ICR Contributing Author:		Sridar Padmanabhan Kannan



## I. PROJECT CONTEXT AND DEVELOPMENT OBJECTIVES

### Context

#### A. A Brief History and Context of EITI Implementation in Iraq

1. ***The World Bank Group had been supporting the implementation of EITI in Iraq (IEITI) since the country joined the initiative in 2008.*** This had been achieved by providing Technical Assistance and funding through the erstwhile EITI Multi-Donor Trust Fund (EITI-MDTF). Previous World Bank financed projects supporting EITI in Iraq were (i) “Iraq: Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative Implementation (P117511)” which was a recipient executed grant given to the Ministry of Electricity as the implementing agency; and (ii) “Iraq Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (P118292)”, which was a World Bank executed Technical Assistance.
2. ***The funding of IEITI implementation had historically been partly by the Government of Iraq, with the remaining financial support being provided by the World Bank.*** There were no other donors or development agencies that were providing financial support to IEITI. The Government of Iraq had provided from the outset of IEITI, strong political, financial, and logistical support by: (i) housing the project earlier within the Ministry of Electricity, and later the Ministry of Oil; (ii) providing the staff required to support the implementation of the project; and (iii) financially supporting outreach and dissemination events as well as training and capacity building efforts.
3. ***Support to Iraq’s EITI process is an important element of the World Bank Group’s Country Partnership Framework (CPF) for Iraq for FY 2020-2025.*** Technical assistance for the implementation of EITI in Iraq has been described as an essential complementary activity for supporting improvements in institutional capacity and governance, accountability in government-wide systems, public financial management, and transparency in the governance and operations of the oil and gas industry. These are all objectives supported by the new CPF, for which EITI implementation is an important reinforcing mechanism.
4. ***Implementation of the current project began immediately following Iraq’s suspension from EITI.*** Iraq joined EITI in 2008 and despite the unstable security environment, seven annual EITI reports (covering the period spanning from 2008 to 2015) had been published since then. However, due to significant information gaps in the previous EITI Reports published, the country was temporarily suspended from the EITI after its first EITI validation in October 2017. The country was found to have made ‘inadequate progress’ when assessed against the EITI Standard.

#### B. Project Context and Implementation

1. ***The Iraq EITI Implementation Support Project (P160274) (“Project”) was thus designed and implemented with the goal of re-invigorating EITI implementation in Iraq.*** The project developmental objective (PDO) was “to enhance transparency in Iraq’s extractives sector through support of the government’s activities on the implementation of the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI)”. The PDO was, in turn, unpacked





into two Outcome Indicators as follows: (i) enhancing transparency in Iraq's extractives sector through a reversal of the country's 'suspension' from EITI; and (ii) making IEITI implementation more sustainable through increased direct online disclosures and effective uptake of data disclosed. The Project had two components, each corresponding to one of the Outcome Indicators respectively: (i) Component 1: Enhancing Transparency in Iraq's Extractives Sector; and (ii) Component 2: Increasing Sustainability of Iraq's EITI Reporting. Outputs were delivered, corresponding to the Output Indicators and Intermediate Results Indicators, under each of the Components. Annex 1A and Annex 1 B more fully describe the relationship between the Outcome Indicators, Components, Intermediate Results Indicators and corresponding Outputs. The said annexes also describe how the Outputs reinforced the Outcome Indicators, and in turn, the PDO.

2. ***The project was restructured twice following official requests from the Government of Iraq.*** The first restructuring of the project extended the project closing date from December 29, 2017 to June 28, 2019. This first restructuring also enabled the combining of two recipient-executed Extractives Global Programmatic Support (EGPS MDTF) grants of US\$350,000 (Phase I, original), and US\$450,000 (Phase II, additional financing) respectively under the project, amounting to US\$800,000 in total. The closing date was extended to allow for the publication of an improved 8<sup>th</sup> IEITI Report, which had been delayed owing to technical difficulties in activating the Client Connection system access. This, in turn, had delayed the procurement of the consulting firm to produce the said report. The additional financing received through the restructuring also allowed for (i) support to mainstreaming EITI into existing governmental and company systems in Iraq through finalization of a scoping study, and a detailed work plan, for mainstreaming the EITI; (ii) publication of a 9<sup>th</sup> IEITI Report, covering data for the year 2017; (iii) continued capacity support to IEITI Multi-Stakeholder Group (MSG) and IEITI Secretariat, including training; and (iv) continued support for program management and operating costs until project closure. As a well-functioning national EITI secretariat is vital to supporting the implementation of the IEITI, the project throughout its lifetime also supported the procurement of consultants and partial payment of staff (the remaining portion being funded by the Government of Iraq) for the following functions: (i) Financial Officer, (ii) Accountant, (iii) Administrator, (iv) Logistics Support, (v) Translator, and (vi) Legal Consultant. The second restructuring of the project was due to strategic reasons. As a part of project supervision activities, the World Bank project team directly provided technical assistance, finalized a 'scoping study for mainstreaming EITI In Iraq', and built stakeholder capacity for implementation of IEITI. During this process, a new strategy was agreed with the IEITI National Secretariat and the IEITI MSG in order to produce a 9<sup>th</sup> IEITI report of a high quality. While a single consulting firm was contracted to develop both the 8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> IEITI Reports, it was agreed to allow for a greater time-frame between the two reports which would enable a deeper analysis of any gaps arising from the already improved 8<sup>th</sup> IEITI Report. The additional time-frame would then allow for corrective actions that would be required to address the said gaps, and to produce a 9<sup>th</sup> IEITI Report of a further higher quality. This was seen as a vital measure to enable Iraq to reverse its suspension from EITI into a compliant status following its second EITI Validation. Thus, the second restructuring extended the project without any additional financing, from its earlier closing date of June 28, 2019 to the final closing



date of December 31, 2019. The extension was in response to an official request made by the Government of Iraq through its letter dated December 26, 2018.

The Project had two components, as explained below and also in Annex 1A and Annex 1 B:

3. **The Project supported Iraq from the time of its first EITI Validation results being announced (October 2017)**

1. **Component 1: Enhancing Transparency in Iraq's Extractives Sector**

(i) This component was designed to achieve the first project outcome, i.e. 'transparency in Iraq's extractives sector is enhanced through a reversal of the country's 'suspension' from EITI.' Accordingly, Component 1 had activities that corresponded to achieving the outcome indicator, i.e. 'Production and dissemination of 8th (2016) I-EITI Report', and Intermediate Results Indicators 'Familiarization on EITI Standard, 2016 for at least 50% of IEITI Secretariat staff and MSG Members' and 'Production and dissemination of 9th IEITI Report'. There had been 22 such corrective actions; IEITI had made

(ii) The following activities were planned under Component 1:

(a) In addition to capacity building workshops, a Barakat decision (Reference: 2019-56/BN-45) also specifically ordered the World Bank to lead the public stakeholder stream (IEITI MSG) members and

IEITI to engage more with private sector support for the aim of these workshops was to enhance IEITI

MSG's oversight of the IEITI process, and to enhance industry and government participation in IEITI.

**Project Development Objectives (PDOs)**

All of the above has been assessed to be of 'inadequate progress' in Iraq's first EITI Validation. The project development objective (PDO) is to enhance transparency in Iraq's extractives sector through support of the government's activities on the implementation of the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI), and by communicating global good practices in EITI implementation.

**Key Expected Outcomes and Outcome Indicators**

(b) The 8th IEITI Report (2016) and 9th IEITI Report (2017) of improved quality were to be published and disseminated as required by the EITI Standard, 2016. Of the 22 corrective actions recommended for Iraq following its first EITI Validation, 15 were due to data gaps in previous IEITI

The successful achievement of the project PDO was linked to the following key Outcomes and corresponding Outcome Indicators:

Reports. Thus, by focusing on improving the quality of the 8th and 9th IEITI Reports though technical assistance and financial support, the project aimed to reverse Iraq's suspension from EITI by demonstrating improved performance on the said corrective actions.

- 1. **Outcome 1:** Transparency in Iraq's extractives sector is enhanced through a reversal of the country's 'suspension' from EITI.
- (i) **Outcome Indicator:** Production and dissemination of 8th (2016) IEITI Report

- 2. **Component 2: Increasing Sustainability of Iraq's EITI Reporting**
- (i) Component 2 was designed in order to achieve the second project outcome, i.e. "EITI implementation and effective uptake of data disclosed."

(ii) **Outcome Indicator:** The Workplan for "mainstreaming EITI" in Iraq is adopted by the IEITI MSG. The Workplan for mainstreaming EITI in Iraq is adopted by the IEITI MSG' and the Intermediate Results Indicators 'Enhanced IEITI Website is established' and 'Scoping Study for Mainstreaming EITI in Iraq is completed'.

- (ii) The following activities were planned under Component 2:
  - (a) The establishment of an enhanced IEITI website. As a means of effectively disseminating the results of IEITI implementation, making the functioning of the IEITI MSG more transparent, and to disseminate EITI data increasingly online in a more timely manner than IEITI Reports, the project was to support the establishment of an enhanced IEITI website. The website was to be established in Arabic, with an English version also present online.

(b) Completion of a Scoping Study and Action Plan for Mainstreaming EITI in Iraq. Mainstreaming EITI refers to the concept of directly disseminating EITI data online in incremental steps, whereby the



cost of EITI reporting would reduce in the future. The data would also be provided in a more timely manner, prior to the official publication of IEITI Reports. In order to achieve this, the project was to provide technical assistance and financial support for the finalization of a scoping study and an action plan for mainstreaming IEITI. These two strategic documents would then form the basis of specific actions of IEITI towards mainstreaming the process into governmental and company systems and approaches in Iraq. The said actions would be embodied in the official annual IEITI workplans.

### III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME

#### II. OUTCOME

##### Assessment of Achievement of Each Objective/Outcome

1. The project PDO was unpacked into the following Outcomes: (i) transparency in Iraq's extractives sector is enhanced through a reversal of the country's 'suspension' from EITI; and (ii) EITI implementation in Iraq is made more sustainable through increased direct online disclosures and effective uptake of data disclosed.
2. Both the Outcome Indicators, and their associated Intermediate Results Indicators were achieved satisfactorily, as also explained in Annex 1A and 1B.
3. Outcome 1, i.e. 'transparency in Iraq's extractives sector is enhanced through a reversal of the country's 'suspension' from EITI' was achieved completely and successfully. Iraq's suspension from EITI, which was declared in October 2017 following its first EITI validation, was reversed to 'meaningful progress with considerable improvements' in October 2019 following Iraq's second EITI validation. The outcome was linked to the following Outcome Indicator: (i) production and dissemination of 8th IEITI Report (2016); and to the following Intermediate Results Indicators: (i) familiarization on EITI Standard, 2016 for at least 50% of IEITI Secretariat staff and MSG Members; and (ii) production and dissemination of 9th IEITI (2017) Report. Both the Outcome Indicator as well as the Intermediate Results Indicators were successfully achieved as follows:
  - (i) Training and Capacity Building Workshops were successfully delivered. Three workshops were delivered in total, jointly by the World bank team and the International EITI Secretariat (Oslo). Two of them were held in Dubai (July 2018 and September 2018); and a third in Baghdad (July 2019). The entire IEITI MSG and National Secretariat staff were trained on the EITI Standard, 2016. Moreover, the participation of industry and government representatives in the IEITI MSG was also improved. Industry and government participation was evaluated to be 'meaningful' during Iraq's second EITI validation, improving from the earlier rating of 'inadequate'. IEITI MSG's oversight of the Iraq EITI also improved and was evaluated to be 'meaningful' from the earlier assessment of 'inadequate'. Thus, the target under Intermediate Result Indicator (i) was achieved.
  - (ii) The 8th IEITI Report (2016) and 9th IEITI Report (2017) of improved quality were published and disseminated as required by the EITI Standard, 2016. The improved quality of these reports, among other things, enabled Iraq to reverse its suspension from EITI (decided in Iraq's first EITI validation) into



‘meaningful progress with considerable improvements’ during Iraq’s second EITI validation. Thus, the Outcome Indicator (i) and Intermediate Results Indicator (ii) were also both completely achieved.

4. Outcome 2, i.e. ‘EITI implementation in Iraq is made more sustainable through increased direct online disclosures and effective uptake of data disclosed’, was achieved completely. An enhanced IEITI website has now been established which disseminates the minutes of IEITI MSG meetings and several vital IEITI documents directly online. Effective uptake of IEITI data was also ensured- the IEITI initiative, following the close of this project, is now being supported as a part of the World Bank’s ‘Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq (P170704)’ project. Data from IEITI, and the IEITI process, is now being used to support the PDOs and activities of the said World Bank-EU funded project. IEITI implementation has been thus made more sustainable and mainstreamed as a part of the broader governance reform efforts in Iraq. Elaborating further, this Outcome was unpacked into the following Outcome Indicator: (i) the Workplan for “mainstreaming EITI” in Iraq is adopted by the IEITI MSG; and the following Intermediate Results Indicators: (i) enhanced IEITI Website is established; and (ii) scoping Study for Mainstreaming EITI in Iraq is completed. The intermediate results indicators were completely achieved with the establishment of the enhanced IEITI website with the capacity to host multimedia, disclosable IEITI Multi Stakeholder Group documents, data, and news items on IEITI for direct online dissemination. The Arabic version of the website is well curated and effectively used to store and disseminate information. However, utilization of the English version of the website has remained sparse. The website is available here: <http://ieiti.org.iq/>. Thus, the intermediate indicator (i) was fully achieved. A Scoping Study for Mainstreaming EITI in Iraq was also completed directly by the World Bank as a part of project supervision efforts. The study, and its findings, have informed the approach towards embedding “mainstreaming” as an integral part of Project activities through increased online disclosures, including through the IEITI website and other Iraqi government websites. The study informed the “workplan for mainstreaming EITI in Iraq”, which is currently a flexible approach under implementation rather than a frozen document as originally envisioned during Project design, owing to the much-deteriorated security situation in Iraq towards Project closing. Thus, the Outcome Indicator (i) and Intermediate Indicator (ii) were both achieved, albeit through a modified approach.

### Overall Outcome Rating

1. The Overall Outcome Rating of the Project is ‘Satisfactory’ (S). Both project Outcomes were achieved completely and successfully.
2. Outcome 1, i.e. ‘transparency in Iraq’s extractives sector is enhanced through a reversal of the country’s ‘suspension’ from EITI’, was fully achieved. Iraq in its second EITI Validation achieved ‘*meaningful progress with significant improvements*’, having achieved satisfactory progress on 10 of its corrective actions and ‘meaningful progress’ against 12. The country’s earlier suspension from EITI following its first EITI validation, and its corresponding finding of ‘inadequate progress’ were thus reversed. The Output Indicator and two Intermediate Results Indicators associated with this Output were also satisfactorily achieved, as explained above and in Annex 1A and 1 B.
3. Outcome 1, i.e. ‘EITI implementation in Iraq is made more sustainable through increased direct online disclosures and effective uptake of data disclosed’ was fully achieved. An enhanced IEITI website has now been established which disseminates the minutes of IEITI MSG meetings and several vital IEITI documents directly online. Effective uptake of IEITI data was also ensured- the IEITI initiative, following the close of this project, is now being supported as a part of the World Bank’s ‘*Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq*



(P170704)' project. Data from IEITI, and the IEITI process, is now being used to support the PDOs and activities of the said World Bank-EU funded project. IEITI implementation has been thus made more sustainable and mainstreamed as a part of the broader governance reform efforts in Iraq. The Output Indicator and two Intermediate Results Indicators associated with this Output were also satisfactorily achieved, as explained above and in Annex 1A and 1 B.

### Other Outcomes and Impacts

1. **Several datasets required for transparent oil and gas sector governance in Iraq were revealed for the first time in the IEITI (2016 and 2017) reports.** In 2016, the oil and gas sector accounted for 99 percent of export values, 96 percent of government revenues, and almost 30 percent of gross domestic product at a time when the average oil prices were the lowest in more than a decade. These figures remain about the same over the past decade, revealing the extent to which the national economy is exposed to the volatility of the commodity price cycle and contributing to a weakening of fiscal resilience. Thus, transparent and accountable governance of the oil and gas sector through meaningful IEITI disclosures is vital for good governance in Iraq. The project, through support to IEITI and the data disclosed thereby, had the following other positive impacts:
  - (i) Greater clarity about the legal framework has been facilitated. With no unified law governing the oil and gas sector, it is subject to multiple regulations and frameworks. The most recent EITI report offers clarity to stakeholders about vital aspects of sector governance, such as data regarding licensing, revenue sharing and allocation mechanisms, revenues collected, the roles and functions of state-owned enterprises (SOEs), and the relationship of SOEs with government ministries. Most importantly, coordinates of oil and gas operations in Iraq have been publicly disclosed for the first time. The EITI quality assurance mechanisms add veracity to the data disclosed, now available in consolidated form for stakeholder use.
  - (ii) Citizen engagement has been enhanced, and conflict mitigation has been supported. Given the sector's economic importance, the role of data disclosed through EITI in enhancing citizen confidence in sector governance cannot be understated. During violent protests in April 2018 over oil revenue distribution, data disclosed through EITI served as a ready source of information for public engagement. Data from EITI reports were publicized through local radio stations. They served as proof to address popular misconceptions, especially regarding employment levels of Iraqis in the oil and gas sector. Under the 'Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq (P170704)' project, the annual Citizen's Budget of Iraq for the year 2018, which was publicly disseminated, included a chapter that presented the main findings of Iraq's EITI report (2016). While the citizen's budget shares details and plans on a forward-looking basis, Iraq's EITI reports provided an evidence-based look at the sector's past performance. This interlinkage between budget projections and past performance in Iraq's most vital sector will further inform citizens about governance performance.
1. A deteriorating security situation in Iraq towards the project closing meant that the activities relating to 'mainstreaming' IEITI had to be modified. A flexible approach was required to achieve the PDO.
2. Limited capacity in the IEITI National Secretariat meant that more funding than initially allocated had to be used for capacity and institutional support- around 31% more than the original allocated costs. The limited capacity also resulted in delayed procurement and issues in financial management, both of which were nevertheless remedied with support from the Project Management Team (PMT).
3. The PMT was decentralized to the World Bank Country office in Baghdad to provide improved and continuous implementation support to the IEITI National Secretariat. The Co-TTL, Financial Management Specialist and Procurement Specialist were all based in Baghdad, with expert technical assistance provided from the World





Bank Headquarters. This operating structure helped address capacity limitations in the IEITI National Secretariat effectively.

#### IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME

1. Bank Performance is rated as 'Satisfactory'. The project had been rated as 'Moderately Satisfactory' in its two Implementation Status and Results Reports due to delays in procurement and issues in financial management. However, these were successfully addressed by the recipient with advice from the PMT. There are currently no qualified or overdue audits, and the Interim Unaudited Financial Reports were submitted on time and in line with the World Bank's procedures.
2. The quality of the Bank's technical advisory is reflected in the favorable EITI Board decision to reverse Iraq's suspension from EITI into 'meaningful progress with considerable improvements'. The EITI Board decision also specifically commended the role of the World Bank in "mainstreaming EITI" in Iraq and recommended that IEITI work more closely with the World Bank's ongoing Public Financial Management reform efforts in Iraq. The said decision is available here: <https://eiti.org/board-decision/2019-56>.
3. There are no foreseeable risks to the development outcomes identified. Support to implementation of IEITI has now been moved to the World Bank-EU funded '*Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq (P170704)*' project. Data from IEITI, and the IEITI process, is now being used to support the broader PDOs of the project. IEITI implementation has been thus made more sustainable and mainstreamed as a part of the broader governance reform efforts in Iraq.

#### V. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **EITI is best implemented in the context of broader governance reforms, especially when the share of the extractives sector's contribution to the economy is very large, such as in Iraq.** Efforts to improve data collection, reporting, and systematization are best accompanied by wider administrative and institutional reforms. Where reforms are ongoing, the leveraging of data through EITI can add tremendous value. Data can be used to accelerate reforms, improve administrative efficiency, and inform governance decisions. However, in the absence of reforms, only limited improvements can be made. The value added of the data systems would be limited, and data gaps would likely remain. This was the case with regard to this project, where once EITI implementation as associated with wider PFM support and governance reforms, the performance of the IEITI and quality of IEITI reports improved tremendously.
2. **Addressing capacity constraints require operating on scale.** Standalone small grants of the World Bank sometimes have operating costs similar to large grants or IDA projects in a Fragile, Conflict and Violence Affected (FCV) countries. This is due to the large level of support required to address capacity and logistical issues in such contexts. Maximizing operating efficiency will require operating on scale in such contexts, i.e. implementing EITI as a part of a larger governance or sector support project. Decentralization of operational management might also be required, depending upon the level of capacity constraints faced.
3. **Flexibility in project implementation is essential to achieving PDOs in FCV countries.** The security situation is often fluid in an FCV context. Achieving the PDO and outcome indicators might sometimes mean modifying the project deliverables during implementation, such that intermediate results indicators are achieved even though not strictly as per project design. In this project, the component with regard to mainstreaming IEITI, which was also commended by the EITI Board during its decision to reverse suspension of Iraq from EITI, could not have been implemented if the PMT had constrained itself to the original project design in a rapidly



deteriorating security situation.



ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS

A. RESULTS INDICATORS

A.1 PDO Indicators

Objective/Outcome: Transparency in Iraq's extractives sector is enhanced through a reversal of the country's 'suspension' from EITI.

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Production and dissemination of 8th (2016) I-EITI Report	Yes/No	N 24-Jan-2017	Y 21-Feb-2017	Y 17-Jun-2019	Y 25-Dec-2018

Comments (achievements against targets):

An improved IEITI Report (2016) was published in December, 2018, disclosing extractives (oil, gas and mining) sector data for the year 2016. The report was of improved quality, having addressed several existing data-gaps, and also making several first time disclosures. Among other aspects of IEITI implementation, this report, published within timelines required by the EITI Standard, 2016, was instrumental in reversing Iraq's suspension from EITI into 'meaningful progress with considerable improvements' subsequent to the country's second validation. The entire EITI Board Decision reversing Iraq's suspension from EITI is available here: <https://eiti.org/board-decision/2019-56>

Objective/Outcome: EITI implementation in Iraq is made more sustainable through increased direct online disclosures and effective uptake of data disclosed.





Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
The Workplan for "mainstreaming EITI" in Iraq is adopted by the IEITI MSG	Yes/No	N 04-Dec-2017	Y 21-Feb-2017	Y 26-Jun-2019	Y 31-Dec-2020

**Comments (achievements against targets):**

The project supported 'Mainstreaming' of IEITI into government and company systems, as an approach to address 'corrective measures' recommended from Iraq's first validation under the EITI Standard, 2016, as well as to leverage IEITI to better support sector development goals. This approach aimed to support partial systematization through online disclosures of some IEITI data sets, and improved use of EITI data for extractives sector governance.

Successful implementation of this approach was supposed to help the project achieve beyond the PDO; it was to be measured by two outputs- a scoping study for mainstreaming EITI into Iraq, and a workplan comprising of agreed upon actions for implementing the options provided by the mainstreaming scoping study.

While the scoping study was successfully completed and delivered as a world-bank executed activity, the workplan which was recipient-executed, could not be completed separately on paper owing to a severely deteriorated security situation in Iraq towards project closing. This restricted movement, stakeholder consultations, and communications. However, many elements of the scoping study, which was communicated, discussed and agreed upon with the IEITI MSG and National Secretariat during a workshop held in Baghdad (July 1-3, 2019) were implemented even in the absence of the finalized detailed workplan, such as the direct online disclosure of financial statements of oil and gas sector SoEs on their websites (in Arabic), and monthly direct disclosures of Iraq's oil export volumes and revenues by the State Oil Marketing Company (SOMO). Effective uptake of data disclosed through IEITI has also commenced, with IEITI data being used to support the PDOs of a larger World bank EU project titled 'Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq (P170704)', which aims to strengthen public financial management in Iraq. Elements of the 'mainstreaming workplan' had also been embedded in a consolidated manner into Iraq EITI's annual Workplan, 2019.

Thus, even though this deliverable could not be completed as originally planned, it was embedded into other deliverables under the project. The PDO was achieved, and Iraq's suspension from EITI was reversed to 'meaningful progress with considerable improvements' following the country's second validation under the EITI Standard, 2016, based on both the improved processes associated with IEITI, as well as improved data disclosures through EITI - from the IEITI Report, 2016, as well as direct online disclosures.



## A.2 Intermediate Results Indicators

**Component:** Enhancing Transparency in Iraq's Extractives Sector

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Familiarization on EITI Standard, 2016 for at least 50% of IEITI Secretariat staff and MSG Members	Percentage	0.00 24-Jan-2017	50.00 21-Feb-2017	50.00 03-Jun-2019	100.00 31-Dec-2019

**Comments (achievements against targets):**

Through two workshops, held in July, 2018 and September, 2018 in Dubai; and a workshop held in July, 2019 in Baghdad, the entire IEITI MSG and National Secretariat staff were trained on the EITI Standard, 2016. The Workshops were jointly delivered by the World Bank and International EITI Secretariat (Oslo).

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Production and dissemination of 9th IEITI (2017) Report	Yes/No	N 04-Dec-2017	Y 21-Feb-2017	Y 26-Jun-2019	Y 31-Dec-2019

**Comments (achievements against targets):**

An improved IEITI Report for the year 2017 was developed and published in a timely manner, in December 2019. Along with the IEITI Report for the year 2017, the IEITI also submitted vital datasets for the years 2016 and 2017 in excel format, titled 'summary datasheet 2.0', as optionally required by the



International EITI Secretariat. The summary datasheet has yielded itself to data analyses by various agencies, including the World Bank's Governance Practice, for Public Financial Management support to Iraq under the follow-up project supporting IEITI titled 'Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq (P170704)'. The several first-time disclosure of Iraq EITI through the IEITI Reports and online have been specifically commended by the International EITI Board in its Board Decision reversing the suspension of Iraq from EITI into 'meaningful progress with considerable improvements', available here: <https://eiti.org/board-decision/2019-56>.

**Component:** Increasing Sustainability of Iraq's EITI Reporting

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Enhanced IEITI Website	Yes/No	N 24-Jan-2017	Y 21-Feb-2017	Y 05-Sep-2018	Y 31-Dec-2019

**Comments (achievements against targets):**

The establishment of an enhanced Iraq EITI (IEITI) website was supported by the project. The website now has the capacity to host multimedia, disclosable IEITI Multi Stakeholder Group documents, data, and news items on IEITI for direct online dissemination. However, while the Arabic version of the IEITI website is well curated and effectively utilized, the uptake of the English version has remained sparse. The website is available here: <http://ieiti.org.iq/>.

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Scoping Study for Mainstreaming EITI in Iraq is completed	Yes/No	N 04-Dec-2017	Y 21-Feb-2017	Y 26-Jun-2019	Y 31-Dec-2019



**Comments (achievements against targets):**

A scoping study for 'mainstreaming IEITI' was completed, and communicated to the IEITI National Secretariat and IEITI Multi-Stakeholder Group as a part of the supervisory activities of the World Bank team at the beginning of the project. The study, and its findings, have informed the project's approach towards embedding 'mainstreaming' as an integral part of project activities including through improved IEITI Reports, increased online disclosures through Iraqi government websites, and most importantly effective communication of EITI data for developmental support programs by partners such as the EU, and other World Bank projects such as the 'Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq (P170704)'.

**Unlinked Indicators**

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Work Plan for mainstreaming EITI in Iraq is created and communicated to IEITI MSG	Yes/No	N 04-Dec-2017	Y 19-Feb-2018	Y 26-Jun-2019	Y 31-Dec-2019

**Comments (achievements against targets):**

The 'workplan for mainstreaming EITI in Iraq', following the second Implementation Status Report for the project dated 21 September, 2018, was moved from an intermediate output to a PDO level output. For more details, kindly refer to it under the PDO level outputs.



B. ORGANIZATION OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PDO

<b>Objective/Outcome 1:</b> Transparency in Iraq's extractives sector is enhanced through a reversal of the country's 'suspension' from EITI.	
Outcome Indicators	1. Production and dissemination of 8th (2016) I-EITI Report
Intermediate Results Indicators	1. Familiarization on EITI Standard, 2016 for at least 50% of IEITI Secretariat staff and MSG Members 2. Production and dissemination of 9th IEITI (2017) Report
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 1)	<p>1. <b>Component 1: Enhancing Transparency in Iraq's Extractives Sector</b></p> <p>1.1. <i>Training and Capacity Building Workshops were successfully delivered.</i> Three workshops were delivered in total, jointly by the World bank team and the International EITI Secretariat (Oslo). Two of them were held in Dubai (July 2018 and September 2018); and a third in Baghdad (July 2019). The entire IEITI MSG and National Secretariat staff were trained on the EITI Standard, 2016. Moreover, the participation of industry representatives in the IEITI MSG was also improved. Industry participation was evaluated to be 'meaningful' during Iraq's second EITI validation, improving from the earlier rating of 'inadequate'. Thus, the target under Intermediate Result Indicator 1 was achieved.</p> <p>1.2. <i>The 8th IEITI Report (2016) and 9th IEITI Report (2017) of improved quality were published and disseminated as required by the EITI Standard, 2016.</i> The improved quality of these reports, among other things, enabled Iraq to reverse its suspension from EITI (decided in Iraq's first EITI validation) into 'meaningful progress with considerable improvements' during Iraq's second EITI validation. Thus, the Outcome Indicator 1 and Intermediate Results Indicator 2 were both completely achieved.</p>



<b>Objective/Outcome 2:</b> EITI implementation in Iraq is made more sustainable through increased direct online disclosures and effective uptake of data disclosed.	
Outcome Indicators	1. The Workplan for "mainstreaming EITI" in Iraq is adopted by the IEITI MSG
Intermediate Results Indicators	1. Enhanced IEITI Website is established 2. Scoping Study for Mainstreaming EITI in Iraq is completed
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome 2)	<p><b>1. Component 2: Increasing Sustainability of Iraq's EITI Reporting</b></p> <p>1.1. <i>An enhanced IEITI website has been established through Project support.</i> The website now has the capacity to host multimedia, disclosable IEITI Multi Stakeholder Group documents, data, and news items on IEITI for direct online dissemination. The Arabic version of the website is well curated and effectively used to store and disseminate information. However, utilization of the English version of the website has remained sparse. The website is available here: <a href="http://ieiti.org.iq/">http://ieiti.org.iq/</a>. Thus, the intermediate indicator 1 was fully achieved.</p> <p>1.2. <i>A Scoping Study for Mainstreaming EITI in Iraq was completed.</i> The study, and its findings, have informed the approach towards embedding "mainstreaming" as an integral part of Project activities through increased online disclosures, including through the IEITI website and other Iraqi government websites. The study also strategized and facilitated effective uptake of EITI data for developmental support programs by partners such as the EU, and other World Bank projects such as the 'Strengthening PFM Oversight and Accountability Institutions in Iraq (P170704)'. The study informed the "workplan for mainstreaming EITI in Iraq", which is currently a flexible approach under implementation rather than a frozen document as originally envisioned during Project design, owing to the much-deteriorated security situation in Iraq</p>



	<p>towards Project closing. Thus, the Outcome Indicator 1 and Intermediate Indicator 2 were both achieved, albeit through a modified approach.</p>
--	--



**ANNEX 2. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT**

<b>Components</b>	<b>Amount at Approval (US\$M)</b>	<b>Actual at Project Closing (US\$M)</b>	<b>Percentage of Approval (US\$M)</b>
Support to mainstreaming EITI into broader sector governance	0.13	.00	0
EITI Report production, including consultants services to prepare the report, data collection, dissemination, stakeholder workshops and consultations	0.40	.36	90
Capacity support to IEITI MSG and IEITI Secretariat, including training	0.19	.25	131.57
Outreach and Public Data: Enhancement of IEITI website, including design of an online interactive web portal	0.02	.02	100
Program Management and Operating Costs, including stationary, transportation, telecommunication etc.	0.06	.06	100
<b>Total</b>	<b>0.80</b>	<b>0.69</b>	<b>86.25</b>





### **ANNEX 3. RECIPIENT, CO-FINANCIER AND OTHER PARTNER/STAKEHOLDER COMMENTS**

The following are verbatim comments from Mr. Alaa Mohie El-Deen, National Coordinator, Iraq EITI, who was the head of the project implementing agency at the Government of Iraq:

“The grant EGPS Grant to Iraq is now closed. I would like to thank the World Bank and all donating countries who supported the implementation of EITI in Iraq. Their support alongside with the support of Iraqi government, both financial and technical, helped greatly the work of IEITI National Secretariat. The IEITI National Secretariat has been able to encourage and urge new entities to implement EITI in Iraq.

The World Bank played a significant role in the process of implementing EITI in Iraq. The expertise existing in the WB teams added to our own, which had significant positive impact when dealing with financial and technical matters.

However, within such great assistance laid long chains of procedures which led to some challenges. Some of the challenges were related to the STEP and Client Connection systems. However, the Procurement Team of WB and the staff of IEITI National Secretariat managed together to dissolve any obstacle faced through emails, phone calls and training. For the Client Connection System, the *pari-passu* (the 40% and 60% ratio) was difficult to process. However, our team collaborated with the WB team to make all things clear and make the process motion smoothly.

Finally, I’m grateful to everyone who participated, whether verbal or physical, in facilitating the flow of the EGPS Grant and any tasks related there to. This was a great opportunity to meet and be acquainted with amazing people with their great knowledge and experience.”



#### **ANNEX 4. SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS (IF ANY)**

1. International EITI Board's decision on Iraq's second EITI validation, available at: <https://eiti.org/board-decision/2019-56>
2. Iraq EITI Report, 2016, available at: <https://eiti.org/document/2016-iraq-eiti-report>
3. Iraq EITI Report, 2016, available at: <https://eiti.org/document/iraq-2017-eiti-report>