Document of

The World Bank

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No:

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION AND RESULTS REPORT

TF0A4135

ON A

SMALL GRANT

IN THE AMOUNT OF USD (0.328.210) MILLION

TO THE

Government of Turkmenistan

FOR

Development of a National Welfare Monitoring System (P158751)
{Date}

Poverty And Equity Global Practice
Europe And Central Asia Region

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

CAPI	Computer Assisted Personal Interviewing
CEN	Country Engagement Note
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNI	Gross National Income
HBS	Household Budget Survey
ISR	Implementation Status and Results
PDO	Project development objective
PSU	Primary sampling unit
SSC	State Statistics Committee of Turkmenistan
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SEDP	Socio-Economic Development Program 2019–25
NSEDP	Turkmenistan's National Socio-Economic Development Program 2011–30

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DATA SHEET

BASIC INFORMATION

Product Information

Project ID	Project Name
P158751	Development of a National Welfare Monitoring System
Country	Financing Instrument
Turkmenistan	Investment Project Financing
Original EA Category	Revised EA Category
Not Required (C)	

Organizations

Borrower	Implementing Agency
Government of Turkmenistan	State Statistics Committee

Project Development Objective (PDO)

Original PDO

The development objective of the project is to support the Government of Turkmenistan in strengthening its national welfare monitoring system.

FINANCING

	Original Amount (US$)	Revised Amount (US$)	Actual Disbursed (US$)
Donor Financing			
TF-A4135	328,210	328,210	273,602
Total	**328,210**	**328,210**	**273,602**
Other Financing			
Borrower/Recipient	25,000	0	0
Total	**25,000**	**0**	**0**
Total Project Cost	**353,210**	**328,210**	**273,602**

KEY DATES

Approval	Effectiveness	Original Closing	Actual Closing
30-Dec-2016	20-Jul-2017	20-Jul-2019	20-Jul-2019

RESTRUCTURING AND/OR ADDITIONAL FINANCING

Date(s)	Amount Disbursed (US$M)	Key Revisions

KEY RATINGS

Outcome	Bank Performance	M&E Quality
Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Substantial

RATINGS OF PROJECT PERFORMANCE IN ISRs

No.	Date ISR Archived	DO Rating	IP Rating	Actual Disbursements (US$M)
01	15-Dec-2017	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Moderately Unsatisfactory	0.00
02	17-Sep-2018	Moderately Unsatisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	0.03

| 03 | 21-Jun-2019 | Moderately Satisfactory | Moderately Satisfactory | 0.14 |

ADM STAFF

Role	At Approval	At ICR
Regional Vice President:	Cyril E Muller	Cyril E Muller
Country Director:	Lilia Burunciuc	Lilia Burunciuc
Director:	Carolina Sanchez	Lalita M. Moorty
Practice Manager:	Luis-Felipe Lopez-Calva	Salman Zaidi
Task Team Leader(s):	Sarosh Sattar, Saida Ismailakhunova	Saida Ismailakhunova, Oraz Sultanov
ICR Contributing Author:		Saida Ismailakhunova

Context

1. **Turkmenistan is a country with unique political and economic structure in the Central Asia Region with population of 5.3 million people (2014).** Turkmenistan is an upper-middle income country with GNI per capita at US$ 8,040 (Atlas method). The country significantly relies on national resources, such as gas, and has the fourth largest gas reserves globally with exports to China, Iran and Russia among others. While expected to decline, the growth rate of GDP per capita in the last five years averaged at an impressive 10 percent per annum - one of the highest rates in the world. Rapid economic growth has not yet resulted in institutional improvements, notably the establishment of a national welfare monitoring system.

2. **The economy experienced adverse external shocks recently that affected welfare of households.** Recent decline in energy prices has led to tax revenue reductions. The government introduced utility prices increases for households, developed measures to gradually remove subsidies and to bring tariffs closer to cost recovery for selected utility services such as water and energy. The price increase implies that the population will begin paying from households' budgets for services that were formerly free. Consequently, household welfare might decrease and some groups—such as the poor or bottom 40 percent of the population—may be hurt more than others, especially, if the government has not put into place any mitigation measures. However, without microdata—especially reliable and official data, it is difficult to identify who is affected, to what degree, and how best to mitigate the burden for the vulnerable.

3. **Turkmenistan was the first country in the Central Asia region to adopt the Sustainable Development Goals in 2016**. **Sustainable implementation of SDGs requires a well-functioning monitoring system.** The nationalization process focused on: i) defining the SDGs relevant to Turkmenistan (national prioritization); ii) integrating the nationally prioritized SDGs into the national development plans; and iii) setting up a monitoring system to measure the progress of SDG implementation. The country established SDGs monitoring architecture, including SDG council and responsible government agencies.

4. **Turkmenistan does not participate in any international data dissemination system and has strict procedures on data and information sharing with international organizations.** In some cases, this leads to data disparities between available national statistics and international databases. The SDGs pose a huge data challenge, but also an opportunity to strengthen the national statistical capacity and improve data quality by benefitting from technical assistance and collaboration with international organizations.

5. **The country has limited international exposure and experience in establishing a monitoring system, especially in the design and collection of household income and expenditure survey data.** The country conducts periodic household surveys and produces summary tables based on such official surveys. However, this information is insufficient to monitor welfare. At the

appraisal, SSC had limited knowledge on how to measure welfare (monetary and nonmonetary) or to ensure the quality of household surveys. This is the major constraint in assessing the country's progress in achieving the SDGs and monitoring welfare of the population. The project activities were designed to reduce this gap and strengthen welfare measurement in the country.

6. **Use of data to inform public policy is underdeveloped.** The government's untargeted approach to provide basic services (i.e., education, health, and housing and public transportation) at low or no cost, is proving to be unsustainable in the current economic environment. Furthermore, until the country is able to properly measure welfare, any further distributional analysis that could inform policy or help with developing a targeted safety net will be stymied.

7. **In recent years the Bank and Turkmenistan have slowly begun to cooperate on statistical capacity development.** For example, between 2009 and 2012, Turkmenistan received a grant under the framework of TFSCB to implement a Recipient-executed project for developing a statistical master plan and get technical assistance for conducting the Living Standard Management Surveys and processing of data on the informal economy. After 2012, SSC implemented several RAS activities to strengthen its capacity in estimation of the national accounts per the SNA. However, implementation of such Recipient-executed projects was affected by the lack of recent knowledge of the fiduciary and other procedures, as well as the fact that the key staff responsible for implementation of the first TFSCB grant was no longer at the SSC.

8. **The project objective and activities were strongly aligned with the Country Engagement Note (CEN) for Turkmenistan.** In the CEN the need for advancing the agenda of the welfare measurement and statistical capacity building was prominently featured. The Bank's Executive Board noted during the discussions that the Bank needed to make a greater effort to assist Turkmenistan in measuring welfare, and using this information, to contribute to the design of specific components of the program. To support the objective of the country's and Bank's program and better formulate social policies, the Government needs to improve on its monitoring system based on household surveys to measure progress of the living standards.

9. **The project was also aligned with objectives of the Turkmenistan's National Socio-Economic Development Program 2011–30 (NSEDP) and the present Socio-Economic Development Program 2019–25 (SEDP).** The main objective of NSEDP is an increase of the population's living standard and quality of life. SEDP includes measures to ensure consistent implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The progress of SDGs and NSEDP is impossible to measure without sustainable and reliable welfare monitoring system. The project contributed to strengthening the households' welfare and labor force surveys, which are the main sources to measure changes in the population living standards and in the progress of SDGs 1 and 10. The project also contributed to the digital agenda of the country stated as a priority in "The Concept of developing the Digital Economy in Turkmenistan during 2019-25" by introducing use of CAPI for data collection.

Theory of change

10. **The project aimed to strengthen capacity of SSC to monitor welfare in the country**. Households' budget survey and labor force survey data is the main source of information to measure welfare changes at regular basis and a key element of the welfare monitoring system. The system to monitor effectively welfare consists of several stages: data collection, data processing, data production, and data dissemination in line with the international best practice.

11. Alignment with international standards required assisting SSC in improvement of household survey questionnaire, consumption and income data collection, and adaptation of international good practice in measuring welfare (including non-monetary aspects such as access to services and employment). By working on the main aspects of welfare statistics, SSC upgraded its current household survey instrument to measure and monitor welfare more effectively.

12. **In the long-term**, the project supports the Government of Turkmenistan in building SSC that is capable and has capacity to provide policy makers with timely data and advice for evidence-based decision-making, measure progress in achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), and monitor welfare.

Project Development Objectives (PDOs)

13. **The development objective** of the project was to support the Government of Turkmenistan in strengthening its national welfare monitoring system

Key Expected Outcomes and Outcome Indicators

Key Outcome

14. The project was designed to reach several key outcomes. The following outcomes "unpack" and separate for individual assessment multiple outcomes "packed" in the PDO.

1) SSC capacity to collect welfare data is strengthened
2) SSC capacity to measure welfare and SDGs -1 and 10 is strengthened
3) SSC capacity to process and produce welfare indicators and SDGs -1 and 10 in line with international standards is strengthened

Summary of high-level outcome indicator

15. **The outcome indicator to develop a methodology for welfare measurement in Turkmenistan was successfully achieved.** The Methodology is aligned with international standards to measure welfare. Intermediate results indicators for tracking progress towards achieving the project's development objective were detailed in Annex 1.

Components

16. **The design and implementation of the project was funded by the Trust Fund for Statistical Capacity Building (TFSCB) with the total amount of US$328.210.** The project components supported the implementation of the following five components outlined below.

Component 1 - Welfare estimation. This component supported a range of activities, including review of baseline status of the welfare measurement system in SSC and training of SSC staff in SPSS Programming of welfare estimates.

Component 2 - Strengthening survey implementation. This component supported the revision of the household survey with a focus on (i) the questionnaire to ensure that adequate data are collected to help with the measurement of welfare, especially for the Sustainable Development Goals 1 and 10, (ii) the sampling and weights, and (iii) the implementation and supervision.

Component 3 - Sampling methodology. This component supported review of current sampling and weighting practices and trained the SSC experts working on the Household Budget Survey (HBS) and the Labor Force Survey (LFS) on how to draw a sample, address non-responses, and estimate weights.

Component 4 - Adoption of computer assisted personal interviewing (CAPI). This component supported assessment of SSC to implement CAPI, as well as hands–on training on fundamentals of implementing CAPI for official household survey.

Component 5 – Project management. This component funded incremental operational cost of project implementation.

II. OUTCOME

Assessment of Achievement of Each Objective/Outcome

17. **The PDO is well-aligned with national development plans for welfare statistics and its role in SDGs monitoring.** The project was designed to support the Turkmenistan's National Socio-Economic Development Program 2011–30 (NSEDP), the Socio-Economic Development Program 2019–25 (SEDP) and the Concept of developing the Digital Economy in Turkmenistan during 2019-25 and aimed at upgrading the quality of welfare statistics.

18. **The project design consisting of five components and a set of activities was consistent with the PDO.** Activities supported under the project enabled SSC to advance in collection and production of welfare statistics. It also helped SSC build on enhancement of professional capacity, which is essential in moving forward with the activities covered by the project less extensively.

19. **Most of the targets set by the project and described in the Results Framework (see Annex 1) have been met.** The PDO level results indicator – development of Welfare measurement methodology – was achieved. Intermediate results indicators reached targeted values.

20. **Project's high-level achievements and intermediate outcomes can be summarized as follows:**

21. **The project strengthened capacity of SSC to measure SDGs.** According to the special decree on implementation of the SDGs in Turkmenistan the State Statistics Committee is responsible for the

development of methodologies, collection and processing the statistics data for the SDGs. The Decree established the national architecture for monitoring SDG implementation in the country. The project developed welfare measurement methodology for Turkmenistan aligned with international standards. Moreover, the new questionnaire for the households' survey was developed to ensure better monitoring of SDGs and to allow the survey to capture progress of SDGs based on household responses. SSC staff received experience and exposure to existing SDG monitoring and tracking systems in other countries, during study tours to Moldova and Armenia.

22. **An operational Manual, on welfare measurement in Turkmenistan, was developed under the project.** The operational manual and the welfare measurement methodology in it, is used by the Department of Statistics and Household Analysis for a methodology for calculating the SDG indicators approved by the Methodological Council of SSC in November 2019. The manual is aligned with international methodology for welfare measurement and uses a sample from an actual database to showcase calculations of welfare aggregates, welfare lines, consumption, and other categories. The database used, both in the training process and in the preparation of the operational manual, was identical to the structure of an actual Turkmenistan database of the annual sample survey of household budgets. This was done to simplify the implementation process and ensure sustainability of the project's output. The operational manual includes: (i) calculations and syntaxes that allow characterization of levels of households incomes, expenditures, personal consumption, changes in the structure of income and consumer spending by various population groups; (ii) identification of differences in these levels depending on the family composition, population differentiation by level of income, expenditure, and consumption. The manual can be used specially for practical calculation of SDGs 1 and 10.

23. **The household survey questionnaire was revised under the project to ensure that sufficient data is collected to measure well-being in line with Sustainable Development Goals 1 and 10 and international practice.** The new survey tool includes a basic questionnaire, a household diary (parts 1 and 2), and guidelines for interviewers. The development of new questionnaires was based on the experience of CIS countries, in particular Armenia and Moldova. The new questionnaire paid particular attention to coverage of SDG indicators and included new sections on employment, health and living standards. The draft questionnaires and guidelines for interviewers were tested during a pilot survey of 30 households in the city of Ashgabat and the Akhal region and amended after the fieldwork. According to the SSC report a new household survey questionnaire is to be finalized in 2020 and introduced in 2021.

24. **SSC capacity was strengthened in use of SPSS for household survey data cleaning, validation, processing, estimation and calculation of welfare indicators, production of output tables for data users and analytical tools for welfare analyses.** Particular attention was paid to practical exercises using SPSS, focused on calculation of welfare aggregates and poverty assessment in accordance with international methodology and practice. During four hands-on training sessions, the SSC staff improved their knowledge and developed skills in measurement of welfare aggregates and poverty lines using SPSS software as well as in calculation of SDGs 1 and 10.

25. **Adoption and use of electronic data collection in the pilot enhanced timeliness of data collection, and preparation.** CAPI technologies were successfully tested for data collection of the Labor Force Survey. The pilot in Ashgabat implemented CAPI using the Survey Solution software within 30 households. The SSC conducted the pilot using consulting services and tablets purchased under the project.

26. **Capacity and skills of SSC staff was developed to use CAPI for data collection and preparation.** IT, Labor force, and household survey departments were trained to conduct surveys using tablets. This included activities such as, survey administration, diagnosis, data correction, approval, management, and transferring data using the Survey Solution software. The software was chosen among other CAPI tools based on competitive advantages and requirements suitable for Turkmenistan. The pilot among [30] households was successfully conducted during [May] 2019. The full cycle of data transfer from entering household data using a tablet in the field to its aggregation to the dataset and uploading it in the server was successfully tested. SSC staff was also trained to explore and download data in various formats of statistical packages with detailed information about the collected data. Conducting surveys using CAPI significantly speeded up data entry, its transfer and processing, and also reduced time spent on the survey. The CAPI technologies also made it possible to correct errors in data entry in a timely manner right after an interview with a household. The pilot using CAPI showed that the time spent to collect information, enter, send, check, make corrections and process reduced from approximately two months using paper questionnaire, to the same day of data collection.

27. **Development of sample frame and weights will help to improve data quality.** Identification of sampling frame and weights was one of the most significant challenge SSC faced at the time of appraisal. Two alternative options for constructing a sample was developed under the project: for existing questionnaire and for new one. The first sampling method included selection of 150 PSUs, which were then systematically divided into two subsamples (S11 and S12) with 75 PSUs in each. The first sampling method takes into account that there are some differences in terms of questions in each month of the quarter in HBS, therefore, it is necessary to interview each sample household every month of the quarter to obtain complete quarterly information. The second sampling method is developed for the new HBS questionnaire which have the same questions in each month of the quarter. This will allow for cross-sectional surveys using different households as respondents. According to the second sampling method 225 PSUs systematically divided into three subsamples (S21, S22 and S23) of 75 PSUs in each.

28. **A training plan, comprising local and international training, was fully implemented improving human capacity.** A total of 30 people, including supervisors and Ashgabat interviewers received training and improved professional knowledge in welfare measurement, SPSS programming, and data collection using CAPI. Staff from regional statistical offices received local trainings in such key areas as data collection and methodology for calculation of living standards indicators, CAPI implementation for household budget and labor force surveys. These learning opportunities were particularly important in improving SSC staff capacity, since SSC's own budget has only a limited allocation for staff learning activities. Two representatives of the Households survey department

exchanged their experience and learned from Moldova and Armenia on how to implement SDG monitoring, as well as development of a new questionnaire for welfare measurement.

29. **The project was successful in terms of advancing a dialogue on benefits of household survey data for policy making.** The project significantly contributed to the capacity of the SSC in conducting field work using CAPI technologies, data processing and analysis of household and labor force surveys. While unit level data have not been shared, the experience showed that cooperation between the World Bank and SSC is both possible and desired by SSC.

Overall Outcome Rating

30. Overall outcome is assessed at moderately satisfactory level.

31. **The targets set by the project and described in the Results Framework (see Annex 1) have been fully met.** The PDO level results indicator development of the welfare measurement methodology was achieved. The intermediate results indicators reached targeted values.

Justification of Overall Outcome Rating Moderately satisfactory

32. **The project has achieved its listed outcome, supported changes in data collection of households and labor survey data and their respective methodologies to track SDGs.** Project objective and design remained substantially relevant. All indicators were achieved, and activities were fully delivered. The funds, however, were not fully utilized due to country limitations for foreign currency payments. Based on the above and risks for sustainability related to internet connectivity, the project deserves a "moderately satisfactory" overall outcome rating. The rating is in line with the latest ISR rating, which was upgraded in comparison to earlier ISR ratings to reflect significant progress in disbursement and implementation of activities starting from July 2019.

Other Outcomes and Impacts

33. **The project provides a good basis for future development of SSC organization into a new technological environment, which is a country priority under the digitalization initiative.** In the long-term, the project has contributed to the development of e-data collection system. In particular, better data from the SSC will allow for better use of data in policy planning and accelerated development. The necessary infrastructure for implementing SDGs 1 and 10 monitoring is now in place, which includes methodological constructs in line with international standards and practices.

34. **The project also provided good experience to SSC in implementing World Bank's Recipient-executed projects.** The Project implementation helped SSC familiarize with the international good practice of financial management and procurement of goods and services, which the Bank follows and expects adherence from grant-recipient countries The SSC is now familiar with procurement

procedures and the requirement for sound financial management of projects. It would now be able to implement such projects within the agency.

35. **No negative unintended outcomes were observed**

III. KEY FACTORS THAT AFFECTED IMPLEMENTATION AND OUTCOME

36. **The project experienced significant delays in effectiveness and hiring of a project assistant, which significantly slowed down project implementation process.** The project became effective on July 20, 2017, while a project management group was created on December 1, 2017. Thus, the project "effectiveness date" in reality was delayed by nearly six months. The process of tender issuance and hiring for an assistant consultancy was done over a 2-month period (initial TOR received for review on October 9, 2017 and the contract was signed on December 1, 2017). The candidacy of a project assistant to perform fiduciary duties, was approved by the Vice-Prime minister. Heavy process of clearances for this position implied challenges in termination of the contract, when the expected functions were not carried out at the appropriate level of competence. The contract with the assistant was terminated in accordance to article 13 "Termination of the contract", sub-paragraph "a". Later, fiduciary functions were carried out by the Project Coordinator with the support from the Bank's team. Those factors significantly slowed the progress of the project and reflected at the "moderately unsatisfactory" rating of the progress toward project PDO and implementation in December 2017 in ISR.

37. **Limited capacity of the client in implementing Recipient-executed projects and their limited knowledge of financial management and of Bank's procurement procedures, slowed down the procurement process under the project.** Slow procurement process impacted the "moderately unsatisfactory" rating of the progress toward project PDO and implementation given in ISR in July 2019. The procurement for the project included mostly hiring consultants and a limited number of procurement packages. The tender process and hiring took significant time for the SSC. The action plan was developed under the project to speed up the procurement process after July 2019 project progress assessment. Procurement and financial management functions were carried out by SSC with day-to-day support from the Bank's team.

38. **The project faced challenges in payments due to country limitations to conduct payments with suppliers in foreign currency.** Due to those limitations the project could not utilize savings for further use of CAPI technologies. Additionally, some activities such as pilot using CAPI had to be conducted later than scheduled originally.

39. **Overall, during the project implementation, the FM arrangements established by the SCC for the Project were assessed as moderately satisfactory.** These arrangements included budgeting and planning, accounting and financial reporting, internal controls, staffing of FM function and flow of funds.

40. **The project was in compliance with the FM conditions of the Grant Agreement** including timely submission of semi-annual Interim Unaudited Financial Reports (IFRs) acceptable to the Bank. Permanent exception of audit requirement was granted for the Project; thus, no audit report is required for the Grant.

41. The Procurement Post Review of the project rated the procurement process under the project as **moderately satisfactory**. Procurement activities under the project were completed before the project closing date.

IV. BANK PERFORMANCE, COMPLIANCE ISSUES, AND RISK TO DEVELOPMENT OUTCOME

Bank Performance

42. **The World Bank team involved in the project preparation and implementation process made for a good mix of prior experience in implementing similar projects, substantial country experience, good project management skills and strong leadership to support the project.** The Bank team liaised closely with the client and actively monitored project implementation, which allowed the Bank team to act proactively and highlight potential implementation risks and propose possible solutions. Both project co-TTLs was based in the field – this allowed for more frequent interactions with the client, reduced response time, allowed for better synergies with other parts of the Bank program and reduced language barrier. At the client's request, the Bank team also provided substantial support in planning, designing and implementing content activities.

Bank Performance in Ensuring Quality at Entry

43. **The Bank team worked closely with the client in developing the design of the project to align with the country's reform priorities in national statistical development and fit it in national programs guiding the reform agenda.** Taking into consideration that the client had limited previous experience in preparing and implementing lending projects, the World Bank team provided extensive support to SSC team in preparing project documentation at each step of the project preparation process. The composition of the Bank team working on the project ensured the compliance with the Bank policies and procedures.

Quality of Supervision

44. **The quality of supervision was maintained at the adequate level throughout the project implementation.** The number of team members involved in the supervision, including two TTLs, FM specialist, local procurement specialist, remained stable and allowed to perform supervision activities in a timely manner, provide prompt advice and assistance to SSC in resolving urgent or pending issues.

Risks for sustainability

45. **Limited access to internet and poor connectivity might raise issues with data transfer for further CAPI implementation in the whole country.** Survey Solutions CAPI requires a network infrastructure for transferring data from supervisors and interviewers to the central office and back. Two options for implementation of the network protocol were proposed to SSC under the project:

1. *Data transmission based on mobile telecommunication networks (3G, LTE)*. This option assumes the presence of mobile Internet on tablets to transfer data from interviewers to the headquarter server and vice versa. Supervisors and Central Offices can access data from the local area network (LAN) through a regular network router using a cable or WiFi connection.

2. *Data transfer based on WiFi access points.* Implementation does not require internet connection for tablets in this case. Supervisors and Central Office can access data via the internal LAN through a cable connection to the router. The router, in turn, provides both a WiFi connection and a cable connection. WiFi connections are used by tablet PCs to transfer data to the server. The second option was used by SSC for the pilot.

Both options, however, require stable connectivity to WiFi or to mobile in the Central Office and in regional statistical offices to synchronize collected data. Lack of connectivity might increase risks on the sustainability of this activity.

46. **Despite the relatively small grant size for the project, too much time was spent on internal governmental clearances, which took about 6 months to effectively start the project.** Additionally, staff rotation at different levels also substantially delayed project implementation. The experience under this engagement shows that for projects of a technical assistance nature with a substantial focus on capacity building and knowledge transfer and with little or no procurement of goods, a Bank-executed mode should be recommended to ensure efficient and faster implementation.

47. **Programs in Turkmenistan can hardly be monitored toward achieving the Bank's twin goals of poverty reduction and shared prosperity because microdata is not available.** Although the project made progress in developing the welfare measurement methodology and raised capacity of SSC to estimate welfare aggregates and respective welfare indicators, the microdata was not shared with the Bank. The operational guidelines were developed using a sample dataset given by SSC to conduct this activity. The dataset has the same structure as an actual dataset. SSC staff will need to use an operational manual and apply it

to an actual dataset in order to estimate welfare indicators and SDGs. This will require SSC to correct any notifications (warnings or error messages), which the syntax file may give due to its use now with a different dataset. It was suggested to SSC to conduct this exercise during the life of the project, but it did not materialize due to SSC's lack of support.

48. **Improvement in data collection and quality to measure welfare and living standards requires further alignment of methodologies and definitions with international standards.** For example, although SSC approved the methodology for welfare measurement, an actual change of the questionnaires will need to have a proper recoding of syntaxes using a new data structure.

49. **To use microdata in policymaking will require significant increase of institutional capacity, including in universities, as well as the development of necessary skills to effectively work with microdata, to analyze policies and to use data for planning and operations.** In addition, openness and transparency in data in compliance with governmental laws are required. For example, other projects funded by UN showed that the 2012 Population and Housing Census was conducted in line with international standards, but the results have never been released and made public

V. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS

50. **Although the budget of this project was small, time needed for supervision from the Bank team was close to that for bigger projects in the region.** Low statistical capacity and lack of experience in Implementing Recipient-executed projects, required close day-to-day supervision and assistance from the Bank team. Given that the TFSCB TF did not cover supervision expenses for this project, such expenses on supervision of project implementation, were covered by the CMU allocations and Central Asia Poverty and Equity program. Taking into account significant time needed to advise on procedures and overall capacity building of the client, Recipient-executed projects in Turkmenistan will require a separate budget for its supervision.

51. **Operations in countries with foreign currency restrictions require special attention and close supervision from the Bank's teams**. Restrictions on foreign currency operations put significant challenges for implementation of the project activities which might lead to delays in implementation and even cancel activities.

52. **The ownership of the project is a key factor leading to success of the project**. Frequent changes in the leadership of the implementing agency might lead to delays in the project implementation.

ANNEX 1. RESULTS FRAMEWORK AND KEY OUTPUTS

A. RESULTS INDICATORS

A.1 PDO Indicators

Objective/Outcome: National welfare monitoring system of Turkmenistan is strengthened

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Developed methodology for welfare measurement	Text	No methodology.	Welfare measurement methodology developed.	Methodology developed.	A current welfare estimation methodology is reviewed. A manual for welfare measurement methodology is developed and approved by the State Statistical Committee
		16-Nov-2016	20-Jul-2019	20-Jul-2019	19-Dec-2019

Comments (achievements against targets):

A.2 Intermediate Results Indicators

Component: 1 - Welfare estimation

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of SSC staff trained in SPSS	Number	0.00 16-Nov-2016	0.00 20-Jul-2019	10.00 20-Jul-2019	11.00 19-Jul-2019

Comments (achievements against targets):
All staff of respective departments were trained

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Number of staff trained in measuring welfare	Number	0.00 16-Nov-2016	0.00 20-Jul-2019	6.00 20-Jul-2019	11.00 19-Jul-2019

Comments (achievements against targets):
All staff of respective departments were trained

Component: 2 - Strengthening survey implementation

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
New HBS questionnaire completed	Text	None	New HBS Questionnaire developed	Questionnaire developed and completed	A new questionnaire is developed. The questionnaire allows to measure SDGs. New questionnaire was successfully tested and completed during the pilot in Ashgabat and Ahalsk veloyat (region) among 30 households.
		16-Nov-2016	19-Jul-2019	19-Jul-2019	15-Jun-2019

Comments (achievements against targets):

Component: 3 - Sampling methodology

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
New approach to address non-response; new weights estimated	Text	No	New weights estimated.	New weights estimated.	A new sampling frame and weights calculation is developed. The sampling frame focused on reduction

				of respondents burden and reduces number of visits of each household from 12 to 4. Methodology to calculate new weights is developed and addresses non-response issue.
	16-Nov-2016	19-Jul-2019	19-Jul-2019	15-Jun-2019

Comments (achievements against targets):

Component: 4 - Adoption of computer assisted personal interviewing

Indicator Name	Unit of Measure	Baseline	Original Target	Formally Revised Target	Actual Achieved at Completion
Pilot of CAPI completed for 30 households	Text	None	Pilot completed for 30 households.	Pilot completed for 30 households.	New technologies (tablets) to collect the labor force survey data were successfully tested using the Survey Solution software. A pilot for questionnaire in accordance to the ILO standards was successfully

					conducted for 30 households in Ashgabat and Ahals veloyat
		16-Nov-2016	19-Jul-2019	19-Jul-2019	15-Jun-2019
Comments (achievements against targets):					

B. ORGANIZATION OF THE ASSESSMENT OF THE PDO

Objective/Outcome	
Outcome Indicators	1. Developed methodology for welfare measurement
Intermediate Results Indicators	1. Number of SSC staff trained in SPSS 2. Number of staff trained in measuring welfare 3. New HBS questionnaire completed 4. New approach to address non-response; new weights estimated 5. Pilot of CAPI completed for 30 households
Key Outputs by Component (linked to the achievement of the Objective/Outcome)	1.All staff of respective departments trained in measuring welfare. Capacity of SSC to measure SDGs is strengthened. 2.The new household survey questionnaire was developed to ensure that sufficient data is collected to measure well-being in line with Sustainable Development Goals 1 and 10 and international practice. 3. All staff of respective departments of SSC trained in SPSS. SSC capacity was strengthened in use of SPSS for household survey data cleaning, validation, processing, estimation and calculation of welfare indicators, production of output tables for data users and analytical tools for welfare analyses 4. Pilot of CAPI completed for 30 households. Adoption and use of electronic data collection in the pilot enhanced timeliness of data collection, and preparation. 5. Capacity and skills of SSC staff was developed to use CAPI for data collection and preparation. 6. New approach to address non-response; new weights estimated. Development of sample frame and weights will help to improve data quality

ANNEX 2. PROJECT COST BY COMPONENT

Components	Amount at Approval (US$M)	Actual at Project Closing (US$M)	Percentage of Approval (US$M)
Component 1. Welfare estimation	0	.07	0
Component 2. Strengthening survey implementation	0	.06	0
Component 3. Sampling methodology	0	.09	0
Component 4. Adoption of computer assisted personal interviewing	0	.07	0
Component 5. Project Management	0	.04	0
Total	**0.00**	**0.33**	**0.00**