



## 1. Project Data

<b>Project ID</b> P147356	<b>Project Name</b> Ethiopia Statistics for Results Project		
<b>Country</b> Ethiopia	<b>Practice Area(Lead)</b> Poverty and Equity		
<b>L/C/TF Number(s)</b> TF-17115,TF-A5617	<b>Closing Date (Original)</b> 30-Jun-2019	<b>Total Project Cost (USD)</b> 15,428,227.53	
<b>Bank Approval Date</b> 30-May-2014	<b>Closing Date (Actual)</b> 30-Sep-2019		
	<b>IBRD/IDA (USD)</b>	<b>Grants (USD)</b>	
Original Commitment	15,500,000.00	15,500,000.00	
Revised Commitment	15,428,227.53	15,428,227.53	
Actual	15,428,227.53	15,428,227.53	
<b>Prepared by</b> Igor Pejovic	<b>Reviewed by</b> Judyth L. Twigg	<b>ICR Review Coordinator</b> Malathi S. Jayawickrama	<b>Group</b> IEGEC (Unit 1)

## 2. Project Objectives and Components

### a. Objectives

The Program Development Objective (PDO) of the project was to enhance the capacity of the Central Statistical Agency at the organizational, human, and physical levels in order to produce and disseminate reliable, accessible, and timely statistics. The statement of the PDO in the Project Appraisal Document (PAD, p. 8) is the same as in the Grant Agreement (May 12, 2014, p. 5).



Although some key outcome targets were revised at a 2017 restructuring, the adjustments did not impact efficacy ratings. A split rating is therefore not performed.

**b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?**

Yes

**Did the Board approve the revised objectives/key associated outcome targets?**

Yes

**Date of Board Approval**

15-Jun-2017

**c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?**

No

**d. Components**

**Component 1: Organizational and Infrastructure Capacity Development in the National Statistical System (NSS)** (US\$4.90 million at appraisal, US\$7.80 million during Additional Financing (AF), and US\$11.90 million actual) was to improve organizational performance, staff productivity, and data accessibility by strengthening planning and physical infrastructure at the Central Statistical Authority (CSA).

Component 1 had three sub-components:

- *Organizational Strengthening*: This sub-component aimed at enhancing institutional management and logistical capacity at the CSA, through: (i) strategic planning and visioning exercises for the introduction of improved management and administration systems in the CSA, and technical assistance to strengthen the national account statistics; (ii) upgrade of office space at the headquarters; and (iii) executive development training, peer-to-peer learning, and knowledge sharing with sister institutions for CSA and NSS stakeholder staff.

- *Physical Infrastructure*: This sub-component aimed at enhancing staff productivity in the CSA by improving working conditions. It was to support construction and furnishing of four of the 25 branch office buildings that the CSA has planned to build in the next few years to introduce new work methods, organizational design and information technology (IT) systems.

- *Information and Communication Technology (ICT) Infrastructure, Systems and Tools for Data Production and Management*: The objective of this sub-component was to modernize data collection, data entry and storage, data analysis, and dissemination capacity in the CSA, accomplished through provision of a data center, video conferencing equipment and infrastructure, and the latest survey technology and institutional management tools.

**Component 2: Statistical Data Development and Management** (US\$1.5 million at appraisal, US\$3.20 million during AF, and US\$1.63 million actual) was to strengthen the quality of statistical data production, compilation, and validation, including preparatory activities and technical assistance to help undertake selected National Statistical Development Strategy (NSDS) priority surveys.

Component 2 had five sub-components:



- *Development of Business Statistics*: This sub-component aimed to strengthen the CSA's statistical capacity in the area of business statistics, which combined various resources from relevant national and regional agencies. The project was to finance: (i) the design of a comprehensive business register that integrates data sources; (ii) the pilot computerization of the register and development of mechanisms to remove duplicates; (iii) the development of bridge tables to reclassify the register entries to the International Standard Industrial Classification; and (iv) the set-up of a system that regularly updates the business register and caters to changes in the status of business entities.
- *Development of Mining, Energy, Construction, and Transport Sector Statistics*: The objective of this sub-component was to narrow the gap in data needed for national accounts. The project was to finance: (i) design of survey instruments (e.g. sampling frames, questionnaires, manuals, etc.) to help consolidate and reveal data gaps in national accounts; and (ii) training of statistical staff and officials.
- *Support for Planning and Development of the Next Agricultural Census*: The sub-component aimed to support the preparatory activities of the agricultural census in 2014-2015. It was to finance: (i) preparatory planning workshops for the next agricultural census; (ii) design of survey instruments (e.g. sampling frames, questionnaires, manuals, etc.); (iii) piloting of new methods for data collection; and (iv) research studies on "standard and non-standard" units in estimation of area and production, among other areas.
- *Improving Coverage and Quality of the Annual Agricultural Sample Survey (AGSS)*: This sub-component aimed to develop and test a survey methodology to expand the coverage of AGSS in pastoral areas (Afar and Somali regions). It was to finance: (i) piloting of new methods in selected pastoral areas; (ii) implementation of Computer-Assisted Personal Interviewing in selected AGSS enumeration areas; and (iii) field staff training.
- *Planning and Compilation of Vital Statistics*: This sub-component aimed at laying the foundation for long-term development of vital registration systems in the regions, as outlined in the approved Vital Statistics Law. The NSDS had already made plans for a review and implementation of the system by the CSA in collaboration with regional governments. This component was to finance technical assistance in the areas of instrument design and building CSA's vital statistics data management and analytical capacity.

**Component 3: Statistical Methodology, Standards and Data Quality Assurance and Information Dissemination** (US\$1.90 million at appraisal, US\$2.40 million during AF, and US\$0.41 million actual) was to promote, sensitize, and implement the Data Quality Assurance Framework Standard (EDQAF) prepared by the CSA for the NSS, and to support improvements in services for users, including dissemination of regular statistical publications produced by both the CSA and its key ministries, departments, and agencies (MDAs) as per the release calendar, and to promote statistical education of citizens and non-governmental organizations.

Component 3 had two sub-components:

- *Statistical Methodology, Standards and Data Quality Assurance*. This sub-component was to support development of the DQAF-E. It was to finance: (i) educational and outreach materials for use at the CSA training center to be set up under the project; (ii) organizing "specialized" short- and long-term educational statistical courses and study visits for CSA and partner MDA staff on select data quality assurance topics (e.g. survey methods, poverty mapping techniques, gender analysis of household surveys, data production priorities); (iii) assistance to the Household Consumption & Expenditure Survey and Welfare & Monitoring Survey; and (iv) technical assistance to improve the quality of poverty mapping and gender statistics and analysis.
- *Information Dissemination*: The aim of the sub-component was to support improvements in services for users. It was to finance: (i) stakeholder analysis, including development of a user satisfaction index, and training and communication support (e.g. via web, media, radio); (ii) upgrades to the CSA library and



open web portal, to enable civil society, NGOs, researchers, and the private sector to access the CSA and NSS data for policy making, investment decisions, or research purposes; (iii) publication of flagship statistical reports and documents produced by the CSA to build the CSA brand; and (iv) the launch of an e-CSA mobile education office by identifying and training appropriate staff, offering adequate per diems, and procuring a vehicle (air-conditioned bus or similar transport) equipped with multi-media and ICT tools, as well as relevant statistical education materials and publications, for visits to educational institutions, libraries, municipalities, Woredas, and other locations.

**Component 4: Monitoring and Evaluation** (US\$1.70 million at appraisal, US\$2.10 million during AF, and US\$1.49 million actual) was to strengthen the monitoring and evaluation capabilities of the CSA with respect to the NSDS and the project's coordination and fiduciary requirements, including Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) implementation. It was to finance consultations for the development of the next NSDS, provide technical assistance to strengthen the national account statistics, and support M&E of the country's Growth and Transformation Plan (GTP) and GTP2. The component was also to support Statistics for Results project management activities, including ESMF implementation requirements and price contingency. As part of this component, parallel financing was provided by UK Department for International Development for a period of three years to fund an in-country statistician to serve as an advisor to the Director General CSA and support work with the Donor Working Group.

**e. Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates**

The project was approved on May 30, 2014. It was to be financed through a US\$10 million grant by the Statistics for Results Catalytic Fund (SRF-CF). The project became effective on June 13, 2014. An AF from SRF-CF of US\$5.5 million was approved on February 26, 2018. Both grants were fully disbursed and closed on February 28, 2019. The borrower had no part in the financing of the project.

The project underwent three restructurings to extend the project closing date, to revise the results framework, and to reallocate funds between components due to AF. The AF helped strengthen CSA capacity in IT systems and tools for data dissemination. Component 2 was changed to support for social, poverty, and price statistics. In terms of project financing, although the AF allocated additional funds to all four components, actual spending increased only for the first component.

**The first restructuring**, approved on June 15, 2017, extended the closing date of the initial project by 20 months, to February 28, 2019, and revised the results framework. The number of PDO-level indicators was reduced from five to four, some PDO indicators' target values were adjusted, and the target dates for the PDO and implementation progress (IP) indicators were adjusted to align with the new project closing date.

**The second restructuring**, including AF of US\$5.5 million, was approved on February 20, 2018. The project's closing date was extended by four months, from February 28, 2019 to June 30, 2019. This restructuring and AF retained the same PDO, project components, and PDO-level indicators. However, the results framework was revised to monitor progress on the scaled-up and new activities added under the intermediate indicators, and end target dates for both the PDO and IP indicators were adjusted to reflect the additional time for implementation and the new project closing date.

**The third restructuring** was approved on April 19, 2019 and extended the project closing date from June 30, 2019 to September 30, 2019. The results framework end target date was changed to align with the



project's new closing date without any change in target values.

### 3. Relevance of Objectives

#### Rationale

During project appraisal, the Government of Ethiopia (GoE) was implementing an ambitious GTP 2010/11–2014/15, which set a long-term goal of becoming a middle-income country by 2023, with growth rates of at least 11.2% per year during the planned period. To achieve the GTP goals and objectives, the GoE followed a "developmental state" model with a strong role for the government in many sectors of the economy. It prioritized key sectors, such as industry and agriculture, as drivers of sustained economic growth and job creation. The GTP identified sectoral targets and strategies to enhance economic growth and achieve medium and long-term objectives. The development strategy highlighted the importance of data to track and monitor achievement of targets underlined in the plan.

The PDO is highly relevant to the World Bank's Country Partnership Framework at project closing (CPF) (2018–2022). The objective of the CPF is to foster sustainable inclusive growth through job creation and economic transformation. The objective of the project aligns with the objectives stated in the CPF, as enhanced statistical capacity is mentioned in several places within the document (p. 42), and the CPF Objective 3.3 coincides with the project's objective. At completion, the PDO remained highly relevant and aligned to the country's development priorities, as indicated in NSDS II (2015/16 to 2019/20), which calls for improved data for policy decision making.

#### Rating

High

### 4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

#### **OBJECTIVE 1**

##### **Objective**

Enhance the capacity of the Central Statistical Agency (CSA) at the organizational, human, and physical levels in order to produce and disseminate reliable statistics

##### **Rationale**

As demonstrated in the ICR's reconstruction of the project's theory of change (p. 8, Figure 1), the project intended to provide an integrated package of support to the NSS focusing on the CSA and selected MDAs to build capacity, both human capital and physical and statistical infrastructure. It envisioned that project support



would contribute to a longer-term outcome of a strengthened NSS with an enhanced capacity to provide accessible, timely, and reliable statistics relevant for evidence-based policy making.

**Reliability.** This objective was to be achieved through short- and long-term training of CSA and NSS staff; the introduction of software, systems, and tools for data production and management; establishment of a business registry database; and the improvement of a data quality assurance framework standards through assistance and training.

### Outputs

Six new branch office buildings were made operational, achieving the target. A new conference hall and training center was established and made operational at CSA headquarters. A Statistical Business Register system was developed and made operational. The project planned to directly support eight surveys, out of which six surveys were supported. Of 534 planned female CSA and MDA staff to be trained on specialized quality assurance topics including EDQAF, survey methods, poverty mapping techniques, and the gender analysis of household surveys, the actual number of women who received training was 542, exceeding the target. Three user satisfaction survey reports were planned, and all of them were carried out. All of the planned 2,944 CSA and MDA employees who were to be trained annually on areas of organizational management, IT, and statistics received this training. Of these, 719 of the planned 765 were women.

Through the implementation of EDQAF, which was achieved, statistical information generated from line ministries is now assessed, among others, for quality, relevance, accuracy and timeliness. Furthermore, implementation of EDQAF is expected to identify the critical bottlenecks affecting the quality of data.

### Outcomes

Indicator 1: Number of key NSS members who have applied the EDQAF (Target: 5. Actual: 5). **This target was fully achieved**, as all the key members (Ministry of Agriculture, Education, Health, Road, and Water Resources) have applied the EDQAF.

Indicator 2: Percentage of users who are satisfied with official statistics methodologies as determined by the user satisfaction survey (Target: 97%. Actual: 80%). After the first restructuring, the end target value was reduced from 100 percent to 97 percent. **This target's achievement, expressed in percentage, is 82.5%.** The reason for some shortfall in this target was the preparation work for the Population and Housing Census, which was postponed several times and forced the CSA to cancel several planned activities. Even though the user satisfaction target was not met, the targeted number of agencies adopted and started applying the EDQAF manual, which is sufficient for a Substantial rating of this objective.

**The overall rating for Objective 1 is substantial.**

### **Rating**





Substantial

## **OBJECTIVE 2**

### **Objective**

Enhance the capacity of the Central Statistical Agency (CSA) at the organizational, human, and physical levels in order to produce and disseminate accessible statistics

### **Rationale**

**Accessibility.** This objective was to be achieved by supporting information dissemination and statistical awareness activities, including user satisfaction surveys, and through developing physical infrastructure (i.e. offices, conference centers, and training centers) as well as by improving the CSA online systems.

### Outputs

Six new branch office buildings were made fully operational, achieving the target. A conference hall and training center were established and made operational at CSA HQ, as planned. CSA websites were made user-friendly. Six of the planned eight video conference centers were established.

### Outcomes

Indicator 1: Percentage of users who are satisfied with the accessibility of official statistics as determined by the user satisfaction survey (Target: 97%, Actual: 80%). **This target's achievement, expressed in percentage, is 82.5%.** The shortfall was because the preparation work for the Population and Housing Census, which had been postponed several times, forced CSA to cancel several planned activities, which likely reduced the level of achievement for this indicator. The end target value was increased from 85% to 97% after the first restructuring of the project.

The activities implemented by the project contributed to an increase in the level of accessibility as more offices were built and the CSA websites were made more user-friendly, but the way in which the achievement of this objective was measured is questionable. Instead of using the user satisfaction surveys, some other methods might have been preferable, i.e. completeness of portals, etc. As this information is missing and the target for user satisfaction was only partially achieved, this objective has a Modest rating.

**The overall rating for Objective 2 is Modest.**

### **Rating**

Modest

## **OBJECTIVE 3**

### **Objective**

Enhance the capacity of the Central Statistical Agency (CSA) at the organizational, human, and physical levels in order to produce and disseminate timely statistics

### **Rationale**



**Timeliness.** This objective was to be achieved through training of CSA and NSS staff, among other things, for statistical data production; establishing and developing the Statistic Business Register; and supporting the NSDS II.

#### Outputs

Six surveys were directly supported by the project, as planned. The project also supported finalization and approval of the NSDS II. When it comes to the number of people trained 198 people were trained in areas of statistical data production, not meeting the target of 387.

#### Outcomes

Indicator 1: Percentage of execution rate of annual statistical release calendar (Target: 75%, Actual: 71%). **Target was substantially achieved by 94.7%.** Percentage of execution rate (dissemination) was analyzed through the number of activities implemented within a year. The dissemination activities included info graphic competitions and statistical awareness activities on television, radio, and other media. The preparatory activities under the planned Population and Housing Census occupied most of the CSA's resources, including the yearly activities that were planned under the annual statistical release calendar, producing the minor shortfall.

The project helped to achieve this objective with adequate activities and, despite missing the targeted number of trained staff, therefore impacting the level of capacity building achieved within the CSA, it still greatly contributed to the overall achievement of this objective through a considerably high execution rate of the annual statistical release calendar.

**The overall rating for Objective 3 is Substantial.**

#### **Rating**

Substantial

## **OVERALL EFFICACY**

### **Rationale**

At project completion, out of the four PDO-level indicators, one was fully achieved, namely number of key NSS members who have applied the EDQAF manual, and two PDO-level indicators were substantially achieved. The way in which some of the achievements were measured could have been improved by having a more precise and relevant indicator and by providing more information, thus better explaining the achievement of objectives. The user satisfaction survey could have focused more on tangible aspects related to the level of services provided by the CSA instead of measuring the target through how satisfied the users were with the official statistical methodology. Another example where the indicator should have been phrased in a way which would have assessed the target achievement is the one related to the percentage of execution rate of annual statistical release calendar. This indicator was supposed to track the progress made in terms of





increasing the CSA's capacity but measuring the achievement of this target would have been better if the number of dissemination activities was the indicator. Additionally, there were some minor and some substantial discrepancies between the planned and achieved output targets, but this did not jeopardize the overall accomplishment of objectives. The planned outputs were designed in a way which contributed to the overall achievement of objectives. In addition, the Ethiopia Statistical Capacity Index increased over the project period, from 61.11 in 2014 to 72.22 in 2018 (ICR, p. 5). With this improvement likely attributable, at least in part, to project activities, and with two objectives rated Substantial and one rated Modest,

**Overall efficacy is rated Substantial.**

### **Overall Efficacy Rating**

Substantial

## **5. Efficiency**

The project was not amenable to financial analysis because national statistical agencies have very limited opportunities to recover the costs of data collection and analysis. National statistics are generally considered a public good and are usually financed from government revenue. The type of investments implemented by the CSA covered the essential aspect of its mandate, which is data production and dissemination. CSA had utilized 99.5% of the budget allotted for the project by the end of September 2019 (at project closing). The budget utilization shows that there was disproportionate use of funds across components compared with the initially planned budget. Some components ended up receiving far more funds whereas funds for others were reduced. ICR Annex 4 shows the actual cost of each component at project closing compared with the amount after the AF and restructuring. There were several reasons for this: some activities were ambitious, some were understated in the PAD, and others could not be implemented due to the country's regulatory framework, for example, open data portal development.

Even though there were good reasons for restructuring the project three times (to extend the project closing date, to revise the results framework, to reallocate funds between components due to AF), this still affected the efficiency of project implementation. Moreover, there were several issues that hindered project implementation. One of the biggest problems was related to the procurement process, mainly due challenges in preparing specifications, Bill of Quantities, and terms of reference for complex activities. During the meeting with the TTL he stated: During the AF preparation, a procurement capacity assessment of the CSA-PIU was carried out. The assessment found that the CSA-PIU had experience in implementing World Bank-financed projects and it is the reason why the last two branch offices were constructed in a more time-efficient and well contracted procedure." However, this should have been done before the start of the project.

There was also the issue of missing or inadequate documentation related to some decisions made during procurement processes. During the meeting between IEG and the TTL, the TTL said the following: "Procurement risk of the CSA was thoroughly assessed at appraisal and rated High in the PAD. As a result, action plans were prepared to mitigate risks. In addition, the World Bank provided periodic training to the project implementing team particularly on procurement and Financial Management. However, frequent staff turnover



due to low salary levels limited the ability of CSA-PIU to apply agreed procurement procedures and led to delays in procurement activities.”

In addition, local suppliers were sometimes slow which led to some bids being cancelled, subsequently leading to late deliveries of goods or products. According to the ICR one other issue was the shortage of foreign exchange which slowed down the procurement process. Finally, during the project period, there were mass movements and civil unrest in many parts of the country, which negatively affected the supervision of construction activities (ICR, p. 22).

Overall, when relating costs to benefits, the project received 50% more funds than had been planned, but the ambition and goals of the project did not increase commensurately. Given this consideration and the noted implementation efficiencies, **efficiency is rated Modest.**

### Efficiency Rating

Modest

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

\* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

## 6. Outcome

With the relevance of the PDO rated High, overall efficacy rated Substantial (with substantial achievement of two objectives and modest achievement of one objective), and efficiency rated Modest, the outcome of the project is rated Moderately Satisfactory, consistent with overall moderate shortcomings.

a. **Outcome Rating**  
Moderately Satisfactory

## 7. Risk to Development Outcome

There is a risk that, after project closure, there will be a financing gap in relation to repair and maintenance expenses of infrastructure investments, including the newly built six branch offices, headquarters conference



center, training center and its renovated library, and ICT improvements, as well as the regular user satisfaction surveys that had been conducted with the support of the project. Continued support for CSA will be provided through its role as a primary verification agent for the Bank's Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Services project (US\$ 600 million, 2015-2023). One other potential risk was heard from the project TTL: "However, there remain issues related to unstable connections, and further improvements in connectivity are required to make the video conferencing facilities 100% functional and reliable." This is an issue which cannot be solved quickly as the internet quality in the country is quite poor and it will mostly affect the capacity building and the share of knowledge within the CSA. As part of sustainability, Enhancing Shared Prosperity through Equitable Services (ESPES) project will continue financing CSA on indented project activities (ICR p. 26, par 86).

## 8. Assessment of Bank Performance

### a. Quality-at-Entry

The project design reflected the strong interest and commitment of the government (including the CSA, MDAs, and NSS members) to improve the provision of reliable and timely statistical data. The project was strategically relevant as it was aligned with the GTPII priorities and was closely related to the goals outlined in the World Bank's 2013–2016 Country Partnership Strategy. Its design aimed to support NSDS I, which was expected to provide the relevant indicators to be used in formulating, updating, monitoring, and evaluating the strategies and targets of the country's social and economic development programs. Therefore, the project design reflected the government's strong interest and commitment to address the demand for statistical information in the country. The technical design of the project was based on a detailed institutional analysis of CSA and the related entities comprising the NSS. The Bank's procurement and technical experts reviewed specifications for construction works, purchase of computing and communications equipment, business process re-engineering plans, and human resource training needs. However, they failed to consider frequenting staff turnover due to low salaries, as well as the lack of capacity within the PIU.

However, the project may have benefited from a more detailed and precise results framework that clearly reflected the outputs of the project (to measure the project's progress) including its immediate, short-term, and long-term outcomes. Additionally, during the initial year, the project encountered start-up challenges related to procurement planning, the setup of the Project Implementation Unit (PIU), and internet connectivity (ICR, p. 21). There were also delays in site allocation for the construction of the first four new branch offices.

### Quality-at-Entry Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

### b. Quality of supervision

Supervision of the project was instrumental in the achievements that the project made by closure. All three restructurings and AF were necessary to help achieve the project objectives. The Bank's technical



specialists who helped design the project continued supporting the project to ensure timely completion of ICT, physical infrastructure, and capacity improvement tasks, and their successful implementation to support statistical data production and dissemination (ICR p. 25, par 79). However, the ICR doesn't present any evidence to support such a claim. The team provided hands-on support by sharing knowledge on how similar project activities are generally managed in Ethiopia and other countries. For example, info-graphic competitions were started in Ethiopia, learning from a similar dissemination activity conducted in Rwanda. Introduction and implementation of ICT in survey activities were also conducted through strong World Bank guidance and support. The World Bank ensured that project implementation was carried out according to the project specifications spelled out in the project funding agreements. As evidenced by Implementation Status and Results Reports (ISRs), the World Bank team conducted regular supervision missions and made efforts to resolve many of the issues following project implementation delays while correctly identifying the need to revise the results framework to improve the recording of project accomplishment and tracking of project progress. Most of the World Bank team was present in the country and therefore was able to provide continuous, timely support and follow up with project implementation (ICR, pp. 25-26). The TTL gave some additional information related to the issue of construction works and administrative work accompanying those works: "The World Bank assessed the performance of CSA-PIU and recommended mitigation for challenges that kept arising during the construction implementation. The technical team frequently visited construction sites and provided technical operational recommendations on next steps for administration. However, the low capacity of contractors and contractors not delivering as promised is a country wide problem and persisted throughout the project's duration, without this being related to PIU capacity. Changing contractors in the middle of a construction could have extended the project's duration and risk of a worsened delivery. Low salary of the project management team also led to staff turnover, leading previously hired procurement specialists to change positions when they receive a better paying contract elsewhere. The World Bank team should have prepared for this scenario before the beginning of the project so that this issue could be avoided. The strong follow-up and assistance of the World Bank team helped the client alleviate most of the construction challenges that arose during construction. All branch offices were finally delivered on time, and all new buildings are now operational."

### **Quality of Supervision Rating**

Satisfactory

### **Overall Bank Performance Rating**

Moderately Satisfactory

## **9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization**

### **a. M&E Design**

Some of the indicators in the original results framework lacked baseline data and/or realistic targets. As a result, it was difficult to monitor project implementation progress in the early stages of the project. After the first project restructuring, PDO and IP-level indicators had clear target values and M&E became more systematic. Despite the fact that the project went through three restructurings some of the indicators remained inadequate in terms of how well they could track the achievement of the objective, and they should have been phrased differently.



CSA was the responsible institution for M&E, and its key staff, as well as MDA statisticians, had good professional and analytical capacity. When it comes to the issue of causation between the project's activities, outputs, and outcomes, the M&E design was adequate.

### **b. M&E Implementation**

The PIU regularly produced progress reports summarizing recent developments, including information on budget, capacity building, data production and dissemination, and procurement and financial management (ICR p. 21, par 59). However, these reports were not a part of the ICR and no link with them was made. Such reports emphasized key implementation challenges and provided status updates on all issues, recommendations, and progress on actions agreed at previous implementation support missions through ISRs and aides-memoire.

### **c. M&E Utilization**

Project M&E data and analysis was used to adjust the project at the first restructuring and the AF.

### **M&E Quality Rating**

Substantial

## **10. Other Issues**

### **a. Safeguards**

As the environmental and social impacts of the proposed project activities were insignificant, the project was rated Category B for environmental purposes. The project entailed the construction and rehabilitation of select CSA offices and, in this respect, triggered World Bank safeguard policy OP/BP 4.01 on Environmental Assessment. Only a few (about four) CSA branch offices were constructed, and they had moderate office space requirements (e.g. for about 15 professionals and 70 other staff members). To ensure the minimization of any negative impacts, the CSA prepared an Environmental and Social Management Framework. Among other things, an environmental clause for construction contractors was annexed with the construction contract agreement and signed by the contractors, so that the guideline could be legally binding and so that the constructors could take mitigation measures as per the environmental clause. The branch offices regularly monitored the implementation of mitigation measures. However, the contractors did not formally report to the branch offices about actions taken in compliance with the requirements of the environmental clause. No occupational health or safety incidents and no outstanding environmental safeguards issues were reported or recorded during the implementation of the project. Therefore, overall social safeguard implementation and compliance was rated Satisfactory in the ICR (p. 23).



**b. Fiduciary Compliance**

The information provided in the ICR on fiduciary issues is incomplete, particularly regarding financial management dimensions. The ICR mentions that there were five external audit reports produced (ICR, p. 14), but it does not say whether they were qualified. In a meeting between IEG and the project TTL, the TTL said: “Audits were periodically conducted, and the project was audited five times over the period. The auditors in the final audit also issued a clean report, and the copy of that report together with the management report was duly submitted to the World Bank Country Office by the Central Statistics Office.”

There were moderate procurement challenges, as outlined in Section 5.

**c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)**

None reported.

**d. Other**

-

**11. Ratings**

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Two objectives were substantially achieved, one was modestly achieved, and efficiency was modest.
Bank Performance	Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	Quality at Entry was Moderately Satisfactory and Supervision was Satisfactory.
Quality of M&E	Substantial	Substantial	
Quality of ICR	---	Modest	

**12. Lessons**

The lessons in the ICR (pp. 26-27) are deemed appropriate and precise.

a) Having client commitment, ownership, and accountability around a strengthened NSS is key for the achievement of results. The CSA has demonstrated a high level of commitment to statistical development. In this case, there was: (a) a continued understanding of project objectives and support for its success, related decision making, and management of the project; (b) a clear understanding of how the project was helping in development of the institution; and (c) a deeper





knowledge of the broad sector reform process.

b) Without proper follow-up and oversight of achieved project results, there is risk to their sustainability. Risks might be a consequence of insufficient government funding after the project completion, lack of facility maintenance, inadequate or no professional training for staff, etc.

In addition, IEG lists these closely related lessons:

a) Having a significant presence of the World Bank team in the country in which a project is being implemented greatly contributes to the success of a project.

b) The capabilities and experience of any institution responsible for the implementation or organization of some activity need to be assessed beforehand in order to avoid any issues that might hinder the achievement of objectives. In this case, the PIU had insufficient experience in managing procurement processes.

c) If any project outcome targets or objectives depend on the quality of internet connection, this needs to be taken into account, and measures should be taken to either increase internet quality or find a way to work around the issue. In this case, the poor internet connection greatly affected staff training and slowed down procurement processes. The issue of internet speed and reliability is of particular importance for projects in developing countries.

### 13. Assessment Recommended?

No

### 14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The ICR is clearly written and concise. It is candid and critical. However, it fails to mention and address some of the critical aspects of the project. The discussion on the assessment of the achievement of outcomes is too short, as is the discussion on efficiency. The ICR does not mention the quality of the evidence and whether it is sufficient to assess the achievement of objectives. It also fails to give a detailed account of the causes behind some of the issues related to procurement procedures and construction works. Additionally, more detail would have been preferable when it comes to fiduciary matters. The project received AF in order to scale up project activities, but the ICR does not state which specific activities were scaled up. Due to these shortcomings, the ICR quality is rated Modest.

#### a. Quality of ICR Rating

Modest

