



1. Project Data

Project ID P101336	Project Name BO Streng. Stat Capacity & Inf Based Evi	
Country Bolivia	Practice Area(Lead) Poverty and Equity	
L/C/TF Number(s) IDA-48450,IDA-54840,IDA-54850,TF-13620	Closing Date (Original) 15-Jun-2015	Total Project Cost (USD) 68,522,997.12
Bank Approval Date 13-Jan-2011	Closing Date (Actual) 14-Jun-2019	
	IBRD/IDA (USD)	Grants (USD)
Original Commitment	50,000,000.00	244,000.00
Revised Commitment	72,413,933.89	243,967.00
Actual	68,522,997.12	243,967.00

Prepared by Sengphet Lattanavong	Reviewed by Clay Wescott	ICR Review Coordinator Malathi S. Jayawickrama	Group IEGEC (Unit 1)
--	------------------------------------	--	--------------------------------

2. Project Objectives and Components

a. Objectives

The project development objective (PDO) was: “to strengthen the statistical capacity and improve the informational base of the Recipient, in order to provide quality information, as defined by its reliability, timeliness, accuracy and representativeness with the level of disaggregation necessary to support systems for planning, designing, monitoring and evaluating public programs and policies (Project Appraisal Document (PAD), p. 6).” The PDO is the same in the Financing Agreement dated March 9, 2011 and Additional Financing Agreement (AF) dated August 21, 2014. This Review will assess this PDO in terms of



three sub-objectives: (i) to strengthen statistical capacity, (ii) to improve provision of information, and (iii) to improve information quality (as defined by reliability, timeliness, accuracy and representativeness of data) to support systems for planning, designing, monitoring and evaluating public programs and policies.

b. Were the project objectives/key associated outcome targets revised during implementation?

No

c. Will a split evaluation be undertaken?

No

d. Components

Initially, the project had four components. In 2015, the AF revised the original components – a few were renamed – and corresponding commitments, and additional components were added to reflect the activities proposed under the AF (PAD, pp. 7-9; AF, p. 5).

Component 1: Updating of the Multi-Purpose Cartography (Original: US\$14.8; Revised: US\$13.6 million; Actual: Not reported). This component aimed to modernize multi-purpose cartography in the Recipient's territory. This included i) the update of the cartography of the recipient's territory; and ii) the integration of the updated cartographic material into the geographical information system (GIS).

Component 2: Economic Statistics (Original: US\$13.2 million; Revised: US\$27.2 million; Actual: Not reported). This component was originally called, "National Agricultural Census (NAC)", with an objective to finance activities to collect pre-census information from the agricultural, livestock, forestry and aquaculture establishments from all municipalities in the country. Under the AF, this activity became a sub-component. Overall, the objective of this component was expanded to incorporate complementary activities proposed under the AF. These included Economic Census (EC), Agricultural Survey (AS), and Consumer Price Index (CPI).

Component 3: Social Statistics (Original: US\$20.6; Revised: US\$ 23.9; Actual: Not reported). The original component 3 – "National Population and Housing Census" – was expanded and renamed "Social Statistics" to combine original and complementary AF activities. The original activities, such as pre-census, census and post-census of Recipient's National Population and Housing Census (NPHC); development census instrument for the collection of demographic information; prepare training materials and carry out training for operational staff; and disseminate materials, and activities under component 4 (e.g. provide support to develop new methodology to maintain the comparability with previous surveys in the Recipient's territory; expand sample size to represent departments and largest cities; and collect and process the information of the survey) became subcomponents under this component. The additional activities under the AF included Demographic and Health Survey and Household Budget Survey.

Component 4. Modernization of the Statistical System (Original: US\$1.4 million; Revised: US\$2.1 million; Actual: Not reported). The original component 4 – Continuous Household Survey – was merged under component 3 stated above. A new component 4 was added under the AF which aimed to modernize the country's statistical system. The activities included supporting: i) the design and implementation of mechanisms for the management, coordination, and dissemination of statistics of the recipient's statistical system; ii) the development of a monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system for the production and



exchange of statistics; and iii) implement capacity-building activities to statistical units to strengthen skills and statistical system.

Component 5: Project Cross-cutting Teams (Original: US\$5.8 million; Actual: Not reported). This is a new component added under the AF with the objective of providing support to Bolivia's National Statistical Institute (INE) through technical and administrative teams, implementation and M&E for all project activities, including project audits and the design and implementation of engagement strategy.

e. **Comments on Project Cost, Financing, Borrower Contribution, and Dates**

Project Cost: Before the AF, the total project cost was US\$ 50 million as stated in the Financial Agreement (dated March 9, 2011). The AF provided additional US\$23.3 million which was approved on June 18, 2015. (ICR, para. 15, p. 8). This amount is consistent with the amount stated in the Financing Agreement (dated August 21, 2014, p. 3). The project overall cost of US\$ 72.62 million on Annex 3 is different from the amount reported on ICR Data Sheet (page 2) of US\$ 68.5 million. The ICR did not provide details on disbursements for each component.

Financing/Borrower Contribution: None.

Restructuring: The project underwent level 2 restructurings to extend the project closing date three times. Details are below.

Dates: The project closing date was changed three times. The original closing date was June 15, 2015. As part of the AF, the closing date was extended to December 15, 2017 to incorporate the new activities and be consistent with the closing date of the AF credit. The Trust Fund (TF) for Statistical Capacity Building (TF-13620) was also extended to June 15, 2017. In 2017, the AF was restructured and extended the closing date to June 15, 2018. In April 2018, the AF was restructured to extend the closing date for 12 months from June 15, 2018 to June 14, 2019 to allow the completion of activities.

3. Relevance of Objectives

Rationale

The objectives were highly relevant to the country's development agenda throughout the duration of the project from 2011 to 2019. The development of statistical capacity, M&E, and a quality information base has been consistently critical to the Government's national development agendas. In 2006, the Ministry of Development Planning (MPD) was established as part of an effort to strengthen the planning systems in the country, which includes policy design and systems for public investment and M&E, particularly for the national agenda. However, coordination among Ministries and the obligations of Government was complicated by the lack of an adequate statistical information base. This remained as one of the top priorities in the National Development Plans (PND) of 2009-2014 and 2014-2019, and Economic and Social Development Plan (PDES) 2016-20 agenda. Hence, the Bank's adopted and supported this objective under its Country Partnership Framework (CPF) with Bolivia between FY12-15 and FY16-20 – through the Strengthening Statistical Capacity and Informational Base for Evidence-Based



Planning (STATCAP) Project – to help the country maintain its path toward continued growth and poverty reduction and achieve the results anticipated under PDES 2016-2020. (CPF, 2011, p. 16-19).

Under the Bank’s CPF FY12-15, the STATCAP was aligned with results area 4: “Public Sector Effectiveness” to support the Government build institutional capacity for results-based management. (CPF, 2011, p. 23). Under CPF FY16-20, the project supports “Pillar 1 – Promote Broad-Based and Inclusive Growth” – and “Pillar 2 – Support Environmental and Fiscal Sustainability and Resilience to Climate Change and Economic Shocks.” Under Pillar 1, objective 2: “Increase Access to Selected Quality Basic Services for the Poorest Rural and Urban Communities”, the project continued its efforts to support the Government in its quest to increase and enhance the quality of coverage of basic services in rural areas, including through data gathering. The project underpinned these gaps with statistical information on gaps in access to public services (e.g. National Population and Housing Census, Agricultural Census and the Household Surveys) disaggregated by different groups, rural-urban, municipal level, and gender (CPF, 2015, p. 17 and 19).

Rating

High

4. Achievement of Objectives (Efficacy)

OBJECTIVE 1

Objective

Objective 1: To Strengthen Statistical Capacity

Rationale

The Theory of Change (ToC) cited in the Project Appraisal Document (PAD) (p. 4) is that, “by supporting the improved quality of statistical information, the project will contribute to laying a solid foundation for planning, design, monitoring and evaluation of public programs and policies,” and, “ultimately, it will promote greater transparency, accountability, and facilitate more effective strategy for the reduction of poverty, inequality, and social exclusion” (ICR, p. 6).

While this statement provided general linkages between activities and outcomes, there was an absence of reference to specific inputs, such as, recruitment of staff, provision of training, and technical assistance to achieve outcomes. These inputs, however, were discussed later in the outcome section of the ICR. A clear linkage of inputs for each component and an outline of risks and assumptions to mitigate them would have strengthened the ToC.

To support statistical capacity, the Project aimed to modernize National System of Statistical Information (SNIE) by improving management of statistics, establishing a M&E scheme to produce and exchange data, and strengthening capacity building of SNIE. The following outputs and intermediate results are listed below:

- Monitoring and Supervision System (SIMOSE) was established and functioning.



- The INE implemented mobile devices and software with functions enabled to provide automatic quality controls of data collection.
- The INE and Ministry of Health (MOH) established an Automated Information System of Vital Statistics (SIAHV).

Outcomes

The SIMOSE helped plan, monitor, and control the fieldwork during the implementation of statistical operations. It helped improved logistics because fieldworkers were assigned census units by the system to ensure accuracy and timeliness of data collection and verification. Since 2012, the INE adopted this system to monitor the implementation of economic and socio-demographic and health surveys. In addition, the utilization of mobile devices supported under the project to verify and adjust spatial coordinates resulted in improvements in cartographic information. (ICR, p. 51). Under the project, the SIMOSE improved the following key surveys (ICR, Annex 6, p. 55):

- **Cartographic information** was improved due to the utilization of up-to-date satellite images and on-site verification (via mobile phone devices) to update data on a regular basis. 100 percent of communities now have geo-referenced locations. Today, all statistical operations under the INE share the same cartographic information. Multipurpose cartography was utilized for sampling of all INE's censuses and surveys to verify internal consistency.
- **Economic Statistics was updated and supported the development of indicators under PND 2016-20.** For example, the National Agricultural Census 2013 (NAC-2013) was updated after 29 years with data disaggregated by province, municipality, and community. The census provided estimates of agricultural production and yields of the main crops; the construction of agriculture-husbandry series; and integrated sector and territorial plans for the construction of baselines and indicators of PDES 2016-2020. (ICR, p. 19). The National Agricultural Survey 2015 (NAS-2015) was updated after seven years with data disaggregated at the department and agro-production zone level. The New Demographic and Health Survey (EDSA) 2015-2016 was updated after 25 years and was used to develop income-based poverty and extreme poverty lines. As a result, nine departments under the Ministry of Health (MOH) have a specific poverty line and estimates to design anti-poverty policies and programs. This information updated the Consumer Price Index (CPI) 2016 which enabled Bolivia's and Peru's INE to exchange experiences in calculating CPI during a workshop in 2017. (ICR, Annex 6, p. 65).
- **Economic Census** expanded to three economic surveys on i) manufacturing, commerce and services surveys; ii) small mining and mining cooperatives; and iii) micro and small economic units. In 2018, these surveys were updated but not yet disseminated or utilized. (ICR, Annex 6, p. 60).
- **Social statistics** was updated and improved due to larger samples and greater disaggregation. The data was used to develop income-base poverty and extreme poverty lines, which were not updated in 25 years. The data was used to develop indicators on poverty, education, health, and basic services under PDES 2016-2020.

The updated statistical information under the surveys listed above produced 317 of 974 indicators for the PDES 2016-2020 as a result of project interventions.

As a result of the updated data, Bolivia's statistical capacity index (SCI) became more robust. The SCI assesses statistical production by three criteria: i) statistical methodology; ii) sources of information; and iii) periodicity and timeliness of statistics, on a scale of 0 to 100 (the maximum score). The improvements in



sources of information used and periodicity and timeliness of the statistics increased Bolivia's SCI score from 66.7 in 2010 to 70 in 2018 (ICR, para. 73, p. 37). This outcome, however, was absent from the project's results framework, which would have strengthened it.

The project also created the Census International Committee to channel technical assistance from several organizations "such as UNPFA, UNDP, and INE-Peru, Education, Colombia, and Mexico for census pilot, field work, and data processing" (ICR, p. 32).

Rating

Substantial

OBJECTIVE 2

Objective

Objective 2: To Improve Provision of Information

Rationale

The project produced the following outputs and intermediate results (ICR, p. 45, annex 1):

- "GOB has updated quality statistical information that has been disseminated widely within the Government and among the public" was partially achieved. This indicator is broad and difficult to measure, particularly on the government side. An interview with the private sectors, such as the chamber of commerce, industry, and agriculture, expressed that the CPI, ECH, and the ESs generated under the project supported their research. (ICR, p. 24).
- An interactive Geographic Information System for Development was developed and operational.
- "The National Data Archive (ANDA) Catalogue, a consolidated catalogue of metadata and micro-data, has been strengthened and expanded to cover commerce and services, small mining operations and mining cooperatives. The system is a portal that provides all the datasets from INE's statistical operations with enabled search tools to access datasets and documentation by government users and the public. (ICR, p. 45).
- 20% of "departments have updated economic information (agriculture, industry, trade and services)" fell short of the target of 100%. The recorded achievement for this indicator on the results framework (p. 40) was different from what was recorded under Annex 6 "Additional Support for PDO Achievement" which reported 100% achievement (ICR, p. 62).
- None of the "localities with population over 10,000 inhabitants have information on economic establishments", falling short of the 95% target. (ICR, p. 39). This indicator would have been the main result of the economic census included in the project. However, the Bolivian government decided to carry out several economic surveys instead of the economic census, which was very ambitious in its scope.

Outcomes

The Geographic Information System for Development provided the government and general public with online access to geo-referenced information from National Population and Housing Census (NPHC) 2012 and NAC-2013. The system has been boosted as a result of enhanced access to micro-data



and stronger documentation practices (e.g. ANDA Catalogue) that complies with international standards. Currently, 22 datasets, including virtual maps, have micro-data which are publicly available for use and download. The provision of information has shifted from traditional, printed publications to access online at: < <https://www.ine.gob.bo/> >. At project closing, some surveys such as “quarterly survey of small mining and mining cooperatives” were still pending to be shared online. For some data, the ICR highlighted that the public can submit a request for the actual database using Retrieval of Data for Small Areas by Microcomputer (REDATAM). However, it is unclear of the turn-around period after making a request (ICR, p. 66).

Rating
Modest

OBJECTIVE 3

Objective

Objective 3: To Improve information quality

Rationale

Outputs and Intermediate Results:

The project produced the following outputs and intermediate results (ICR, Annex 1, p. 44-42):

- “100% of physically demarcated as well as non-demarcated areas have updated cartographic information.” It was used in preparing NPHC-2012 and NAC-2013 as planned.
- “The list of Agricultural Production Units (UPAs) at the municipal level was completed” as planned.
- 96% of dwellings were included in NPHC-2012, exceeding the 90% target.
- “100% of the departments have representative information on living standards.” This exceeded the 90% target.
- “100% of departments have updated information on agricultural production and its destination.”
- “Nine capital cities, El Alto and rural areas have updated information on household incomes and structure of expenditures”, achieving the target.
- “At least 30 public statistical units and enterprises, at the national and subnational level, of the country’s Statistical System apply standardized methods of production of data developed by INE” achieving the target. However, this indicator is also difficult to measure as the information regarding “apply standardized methods of production of data” was unavailable.

Outcomes

Overall, the STATCAP improved the quality of the country’s informational base. To assess accuracy, reliability, timeliness, and representativeness of nine statistical operations produced under STATCAP, an assessment was conducted using criteria score of 1 – 4 (lowest to highest) (ICR, p. 15).

- *Quality:* Seven of the nine operations have been improved because of the use of satellite images from base maps, Google Maps, and Bing to provide up-to-date satellite images.



- *Accuracy* was improved due to the use of more robust sampling generated from the multipurpose cartographic information and use of administrative registries. On-site verification as part of fieldwork of all INE statistical operations is also available to verify data.
- *Reliability* was improved due to new technologies (e.g. mobile devices with embedded quality control functions for data collection and data entry).
- *Timeliness* was improved. The generated data are up-to-date due to the application of satellite images and on-site verification of geo-references. However, some statistical data performance was inconsistent. For example, the ECH is implemented any time between four months to two years.
- *Representativeness*: The data generated under STATCAP improved significantly due to expanded sample sizes and scope (i.e. number of variables). However, some indicators were omitted. For example, the Demographic and Health Survey 2016 didn't include the maternal mortality indicator because they considered that the methodology and the sample size to calculate this indicator in previous surveys, were not adequate, and as a result the Government is conducting a separate study on maternal health.

In addition, the ICR highlighted that these improvements are reflected in the Global Open Data Index (GODI), a crowd-sourced database, created by the Open Knowledge Foundation to measure the content and level of openness of data. Bolivia's GODI improved from 28 percent in 2015 to 30 percent in 2016. The ranking also improved from #98 to #53 between 2014 and 2016. The data on national maps, administrative boundaries, and national statistics were supported under STATCAP. These systems contributed to improving the following statistical data from 2015 to 2016 as listed below:

- National maps improved from 70 percent to 80 percent in 2016.
- National statistics improved from 50 percent to 65 percent in 2016.
- Administrative boundaries data is rated at 80 percent in 2016. There was no baseline data provided

The data is available at: 2015 (<http://2015.index.okfn.org/place/bolivia/>); 2016 (<https://index.okfn.org/place/bo>).

Rating

Substantial

OVERALL EFFICACY

Rationale

The STATCAP enhanced INE's efficacy and efficiency production processes. A few targets fell short and a few were difficult to measure. However, the data generated under the project contributed to the improvement of Bolivia's statistical capacity to support evidence-based planning, design, implementation, and M&E of public policies and programs at both the sectoral and aggregate levels. These improvements stem from the utilization of SIMOSE to monitor data collection, utilization of mobile devices with embedded capability to automatically input data and perform verification, improved organization and management process, and better trained personnel for fieldwork and logistics. At the sector level, cartography,



socioeconomic and population data supported the development of indicators under PND 2016-2020. At the aggregate level, the STATCAP operation supported the development of the Comprehensive Planning System of the Plurinational State, including the establishment of performance indicators of M&E for measuring the implementation of programs over the 2016-2020 period.

Overall Efficacy Rating

Substantial

5. Efficiency

The efficiency is rated Substantial due to the reduction of production costs that was observed. The sample size for ECH-2018 was 30 percent more than the predecessor survey. However, the production cost was 11 percent lower. (ICR, p. 23). The more streamlining of statistical operations, the less labor would be needed, which will ultimately result in additional savings for the government.

It was observed that the utilization of mobile devices substitutes for the use of paper, decreased time for data collection and filing, and improved data quality due to the automatic features available on the device.

While the sample size and questionnaires increased, the number of interviewers required to collect data decreased by 35 percent and the number of supervisors decreased by 28 percent between 2012 and 2018. (ICR, p. 51).

Efficiency Rating

Substantial

a. If available, enter the Economic Rate of Return (ERR) and/or Financial Rate of Return (FRR) at appraisal and the re-estimated value at evaluation:

	Rate Available?	Point value (%)	*Coverage/Scope (%)
Appraisal		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable
ICR Estimate		0	0 <input type="checkbox"/> Not Applicable

* Refers to percent of total project cost for which ERR/FRR was calculated.

6. Outcome

The outcome of the project is rated Satisfactory despite a few shortcomings on the measurability. The project’s results framework included a few indicators that were difficult to measure, such as “statistical



information dissemination widely within the Government” and “statistical units and enterprises apply standardized methods of production of data.” In addition, several achievements generated by the project were absent from the results framework, which could have strengthened it if incorporated. However, the analysis on “Additional Support for PDO Achievement” (ICR, Annex 6, p. 55) substantiates the project’s overall achievements. Table 6 on the ICR page 18 also provides an overview of the improvements on a few surveys generated under the project.

The IEG finds that the improvement in ranking of Bolivia’s GODI or SCI cannot provide a direct linkage to the project. The ranking presented by GODI is based on the “openness” of government data, which is defined by “open data and content can be freely used, modified, and shared by anyone for any purpose.” (www.opendefinition.org). The ranking could change due to the performance of other surveys. The project experienced a few shortcomings that caused minor delays in the implementation that required extended time to complete. Accounting the High rating for relevance, Substantial for efficacy and Substantial for efficiency produced an outcome rating of **Satisfactory**.

a. Outcome Rating

Satisfactory

7. Risk to Development Outcome

Despite the government’s commitment to modernizing and advancing national statistical information, the risk to development outcome is rated Substantial due to the political economy of the country. The government has shown commitment and support to the project to a certain extent, but the challenge remains in regards to the sustainability of the statistical system and capacity. Currently, there is no guaranteed budget or law for statistical capacity. The NSS ruling Statistical Law (approved in 1976) currently has “no regulations for relevant topics such as data access, infractions, statistical quality control, statistical coordination, personal data anonymization, or how-to certify statistics as official data.” (ICR, para 101, p. 33). The INE – under this project – developed a participatory National Strategy for Statistical Development (NSDS), which included clear roles for statistical producers, developed a new draft Statistical Law, and prepared costs plan. However, the approval of the law remains a challenge to consolidate a national statistical strategy and involvement of other essential statistical partners, such as the Ministry of Planning, to prepare a funding strategy covering prioritized data needs. The ICR noted that a new Law of the Plurinational Statistical System (PSS), which is currently under consultation, will strengthen INE’s coordinating role for the PSS and establish a framework and financing mechanism for the provision of resources. However, this process has been delayed due to the political upheaval from the resignation of President Morales in early 2019.

The latest IMF Article IV staff report (p. 22, 25) states that while the quality and quantity of macroeconomic data in Bolivia are generally sound, some data is not subject to regular and timely publication. The report also points out that the policy of indexing the national wage bonus (Aguinaldo) to the rate of GDP growth risks politicizing the release of national accounts statistics and could affect confidence in the integrity of official statistics. The Government has agreed to adopt one of the Fund’s Data Dissemination Standards to address these issues and to enhance data transparency.



8. Assessment of Bank Performance

a. Quality-at-Entry

The Bank's leading role in the Latin America and Caribbean (LAC) region in strengthening National Statistical Systems and in promoting results-based management for development informed this project. In Bolivia, the Bank's previous active involvement through the Team for Statistical Development in the formulation and implementation of their National Strategic Plans for Statistical Development (PENDES) placed the Bank in a good position to respond to the GoB's objectives. The project was informed by the PENDES to increase the coordination of producers and users of statistics, mainly around the needs of the National Development Plan. The GoB established the INE to facilitate the planning and formulation of evidence-based policies. The INE has been the main producer and repository agency for the country's statistical information. Hence, the Bank took on a pragmatic approach to involve with INE director to ensure Government's ownership.

Despite the Bank's active engagement in statistical systems in LAC, the design of the PDO was complex. The results framework was hindered prior to improvements made during the AF by some weak indicators to monitor progress as discussed in efficacy section. For example, the PDO included objectives to provide quality data, but the indicator to measure this was absent. After the AF, the project included and emphasized the adoption of dissemination mechanisms and tools to make the data available to wider users. However, some indicators could have been better articulated.

Quality-at-Entry Rating Moderately Satisfactory

b. Quality of supervision

The quality of supervision is rated Satisfactory due to a close cooperation between the Bank and client. The project was led by two Task Team Leaders, one of whom was based in the country which provided continuity to work closely with INE. Missions were conducted semi-annually or more often, particularly during the early years and the last year of implementation. Between regular supervision missions, there were several technical missions. Bi-weekly video-conferences and daily virtual follow-up with the client were conducted. Experts from other groups at the Bank and other institutions were engaged in providing extensive technical support, particularly for NPHC-2012. The ICR highlighted that there were well-documented supervision missions and the midterm review which served as important mechanisms for the M&E of the STATCAP operations (ICR, para. 79, p. 28). The project produced 10 Aide Memoires and 16 implementation status reports.

In 2017, high staff turnover in the project implementation unit caused some delays in procurement for some activities. New staff with limited knowledge of World Bank procedures, however, received training on the job. In 2018, the Systematic tracking of Exchanges in Procurement (STEP) was implemented. With



tremendous support to capacity building and training, this resulted in better management of consultancy contracts and procurements. However, these attributes were not captured in the results framework.

Quality of Supervision Rating

Satisfactory

Overall Bank Performance Rating

Moderately Satisfactory

9. M&E Design, Implementation, & Utilization

a. M&E Design

The results framework mainly tracks outputs rather than outcomes and the language of the PDO was unclear. For example, it stated, “to provide quality information, as defined by its reliability, timeliness, accuracy and representativeness with the level of disaggregation necessary to support systems for planning, designing, monitoring and evaluating public programs and policies.” The “level of disaggregation” was unclear whether it referred to sex-disaggregated or subnational. Clear definition of level of disaggregation would have permitted a strengthening of the results framework.

Several weaknesses are depicted in key performance indicators, and intermediate outcome indicators. The only key performance indicator – “The GoB has updated quality statistical information that has been disseminated widely within the Government and among the public” – was broad and difficult to measure. Also, this dimension was not captured in the PDO. Measures to capture access to data and with whom the data should be shared were absent. This aspect could have been strengthened by breaking it down by different surveys, e.g. NPHC-year, ECH-year, and list of key government agencies the data was shared with.

The intermediate outcome indicators did not include measurable results on newly added components. Other than the representativeness of data (e.g. geographical coverage), other dimensions (e.g. reliability, timeliness, accuracy) were not systematically captured in the results framework. There were no indicators to measure modernization and statistical capacity either.

b. M&E Implementation

The results framework was improved under the AF with the introduction of four additional monitoring indicators, including external evaluations on quality and perception surveys of the economic and social statistics produced under STATCAP. However, the response rate was low.

c. M&E Utilization

The M&E system was not designed to inform decision-making within the project. The system was largely output-driven.. As the ICR pointed out, a more structured approach toward external evaluation



would have been beneficial. The perception surveys and focus groups for AS and EDSA provided users' preferences and satisfaction rating in terms of access and quality of data. However, the response rate was low between 4-6 percent of registered users. (ICR, p. 29). This would have provided another layer of in-depth assessment of the quality of the statistical data produced and identify areas for improvement and institutional learning.

M&E Quality Rating

Modest

10. Other Issues

a. Safeguards

The project triggered the Indigenous Peoples Policy (OP/BP 4.10) as the project implementation included the presence of indigenous peoples (IPs) in Bolivia. The INE frequently engaged with IPs to respond to cultural and diversity issues. For field workers, speaking indigenous languages was required. A strategy for engagement with IPs was developed and integrated in the Operations Manual to guide statistical activities.

b. Fiduciary Compliance

The financial management (FM) assessment of INE found the FM arrangements were adequate and reporting were timely. The INE had a strong financial and administrative team with relevant expertise due to past experiences in implementing World Bank-financed projects. However, the operation was highly dependent on the availability of qualified staff. Although the reorganization of project staff negatively affected the FM function, the project was able to provide timely and reliable information for management and monitoring purposes. In addition, annual financial audit reports were delivered to the Bank on time.

Procurement experienced brief delays due to government staff reorganization in 2017. In some cases, the terms of reference of consultants were not shared with the World Bank for review. The situation improved when the Systematic Tracking of Exchanges in Procurement was established in 2018. This system improved the control of contracts and stored files and records digitally. The Bank team's significant effort to train INE's staff improved during the last year of project implementation. For example, INE's procurement unit was able to conduct complex procurement processes, such as international competitive bidding. Procurement reviews and audits were conducted throughout the implementation period.

c. Unintended impacts (Positive or Negative)

None

d. Other



11. Ratings

Ratings	ICR	IEG	Reason for Disagreements/Comment
Outcome	Satisfactory	Satisfactory	
Bank Performance	Moderately Satisfactory	Moderately Satisfactory	
Quality of M&E	Modest	Modest	
Quality of ICR	---	Substantial	

12. Lessons

The following are key lessons from the ICR:

1. **The PDO definition needs to be clear.** The results framework under this project did not fully support the PDO. A clear objective is critical to translate to effective indicators to measure outcomes.
2. **Utilization of technology for data collection requires an assessment of the adaptability of local knowledge.** As discussed in Section 5, field personnel required considerable training to ensure proper use of mobile devices to enable collection of quality data.

13. Assessment Recommended?

No

14. Comments on Quality of ICR

The quality of this ICR is rated Satisfactory. The narrative supported the ratings and openly discussed shortcomings of the project, such as the limitations of the project’s results framework. Despite the weak results framework, the ICR provided an explicit analysis on the achievements of the PDO on Annex 6. The ICR explicitly outlined the project’s ToC to underline the project’s intended logic. However, the ICR interpreted the PDO by introducing new concepts, such as dissemination, accessibility and documentation. Although the PDO statement was deemed “unclear” and “ambitious”, the assessment of a PDO should be based on its original statement to comply with the ICR guideline, and most importantly, to ensure the meaning of the PDO is not altered.

Despite a detailed overview of the project, there were a few shortcomings in the completeness of data and information. While the ICR highlighted that the project was implemented during a period of political stability (ICR, p. 11), the recent political turmoil – though it occurred around the time of project closing in June 2019 – could threaten some project achievements going forward. Some information regarding the impact from political



uncertainty would have strengthened the ICR and overall outlook on the sustainability of project's achievements. A recorded achievement for an indicator on the results framework (p. 40) was different from that recorded under Annex 6 "Additional Support for PDO Achievement" (p. 62) which reported 100% achievement. Other minor shortcomings included the absence of reporting of actual disbursement costs for each component. Annex 3, "Project Cost by Component," showed the revised amount per each component as shown on Table 3 (page 9) instead of actual disbursement cost per each component. Lastly, there is a minor correction to be made on the reference tables in paragraph 35. It should refer to Table 5, not 6.

a. Quality of ICR Rating
Substantial