Sierra Leone: Strengthening Entry-Level Leadership Development in the Civil Service

September 2012
Public Sector and Governance Unit
Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network
World Bank

World Bank Document
The contents of this document belong exclusively to the authors and do not necessarily represent the opinion of their affiliated organizations or member countries.
Acronyms

DPSM Department of Public Service Management
ELDP Entry-level Leadership Development Program
GoSL Government of Sierra Leone
HRMO Human Resources Management Office
IPAM Institute of Public Administration and Management
MAP Management Associates Program
MDA Ministry, Department or Agency
MoFED Ministry of Finance and Economic Development
PMF Presidential Management Fellowship
PSC Public Service Commission
PYPP President’s Young Professionals Program
SES Senior Executive Service
SLPSF Sierra Leone Public Service Fellowship
STM Service to Mauritius
UNDP United Nations Development Program
Table of Contents

Executive Summary ........................................................................................................................................... 5
1. Background .................................................................................................................................................. 9
2. GoSL Public Service Reform Agenda .......................................................................................................... 12
3. Global Good Practices ............................................................................................................................. 14
4. Program Structure ..................................................................................................................................... 15
5. Feasibility ................................................................................................................................................ 28
References ..................................................................................................................................................... 31
Annex 1: International Experience Briefs ......................................................................................................... 34
   A. Liberia .................................................................................................................................................... 34
   B. Singapore ............................................................................................................................................... 42
   C. United States ....................................................................................................................................... 49
   D. United Kingdom .................................................................................................................................. 58
   E. Nepal .................................................................................................................................................... 64
   F. Botswana ............................................................................................................................................... 72
   G. Mauritius ............................................................................................................................................... 81
**Executive Summary**

This report is the final product of a project financed by a grant from the World Bank’s Youth Innovation Fund developed in conjunction with representatives of the Government of Sierra Leone (GoSL) spanning the period December 2011-June 2012. The Bank team consulted extensively with representatives of the Public Service Commission (PSC) and the Human Resources Management Office (HRMO) during missions in December 2011 and March-April 2012 as well as subsequent communications via telephone and email. Both missions were conducted under the auspices of the World Bank operation, “Sierra Leone Pay and Performance Project,” discussions around which gave rise to the project. The report is an advisory document to assist the GoSL in advancement of its Public Sector Reform Program, particularly the initiative “Improving Productivity through Management and Pay Reforms”. It provides the PSC and HRMO with options for the design and implementation of an entry-level leadership development program (ELDP) for the civil service, currently slated for implementation in 2014 as per government timelines. This program is herein referred to as the “Sierra Leone Public Service Fellowship” (SLPSF).

The SLPSF aims to address two related issues: (i) a capacity gap among entry-level civil servants; and (ii) the need to cultivate the future leaders of the civil service. As observed by the PSC and HRMO, the most urgent capacity building need in the civil service is in the “generalist” posts, including Policy Analysts, Planning Officers, Administrative Officers, Monitoring & Evaluation Officers and Human Resources Officers.¹ These are positions that exist across all Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) and can generally be filled by civil servants with a common set of academic credentials and technical skills.² At present, recruitment to fill both the mid- and upper-level posts is ad hoc and does not constitute an organized strategy for building civil service capacity through long-term staff development.

The purpose of this document is address the identified organizational gap by offering technical guidance on the creation of a civil service fellowship that cultivates promising young professionals as future leaders. The proposed program targets university students in their final year of study and entices them to apply for graduate entry-level positions through a dedicated outreach effort and series of incentives. It selects candidates through a rigorous multi-stage assessment and matches successful candidates’ interests with the needs of the MDAs. It trains selected Fellows in core civil service knowledge as well as a range of generalist functions and technical skills. It also offers Fellows the opportunity to rotate in three different MDAs throughout the two-year period to develop a “whole of government” perspective. Throughout this initiative, the program offers Fellows access to senior Government leaders and opportunities to grow professionally building a strong foundation for a successful career as a civil servant. Additionally, the program is bolstered by a number of public relations opportunities to raise its profile and showcase its achievements to Sierra Leoneans within and outside of Government.

---

¹ The Administrative Officers encompass all those in the Administrative Cadre, including Deputy Assistant Secretary, Assistant Secretary, Senior Assistant Secretary and Permanent Secretary. Administrative Officers at the graduate entry level enter as Deputy Assistant Secretaries.
² The “common skill set” referred to was deduced by an analysis of job postings for these positions provided to the Bank team by the PSC.
The GoSL stands to benefit from this program through several channels. First, it will provide Government with a stream of highly qualified young professionals who will, upon entry, positively contribute to their MDAs. Second, it will help facilitate a more inter-connected government. The program encourages the development of a cadre of Fellows that will serve in different MDAs, sharing and sharpening technical skills with each rotation and building professional relationships across government. Third, this same cadre of graduates of the program will provide the Government with stock of highly trained professionals with a “whole of government perspective” from which to draw its future leaders.

The program offers Fellows a unique opportunity to build a sterling career in government through a variety of training and mentorship opportunities, as well as a strong possibility of accelerated promotion. It envisions the design of both a general induction to ground incoming Fellows in the core functions of government and the civil service as well as a series of function-specific trainings to ensure that each Fellow is endowed with basic knowledge of Human Resources, Monitoring & Evaluation, Policy Analysis, Planning, and the Administrative Cadre. It offers the opportunity for Fellows to conduct rotations in three different jobs, gaining first-hand experience in the variety of work the civil service undertakes. The program includes access to top government leaders – including the President (for example, via an opening reception for new Fellows), Ministers, and senior civil servants for guidance and exposure to different leadership styles. At the close of the two-year Fellowship, it offers Fellows the possibility to jump one or two grade levels depending on their performance throughout the program.

Sierra Leone is not alone in its quest to attract high quality professionals to the civil service. Many countries, both developed and developing, have instituted special programs to attract promising young professionals to public service through a series of incentives. This project includes information on similar programs in the United States, the United Kingdom, Liberia, Botswana, Mauritius, Singapore and Nepal, identifying lessons that could inform Sierra Leone’s development in this area. Some cases have a long and highly-developed structure (such as the U.K. Fast Stream, founded in the 1960s) whereas others are recently underway (such as Liberia’s President’s Young Professionals Program, founded in 2009). Civil service recruitment practices in Nepal and Botswana were also researched, and though neither has an explicit ELDP, they offer several examples of successful practices in low-income (and, in the case of Nepal, post-conflict) environments. Several salient aspects of these programs are highlighted in boxes in the main text and a full review of each country case is provided in Annex 1.

The program requires certain commitments from the Sierra Leone Government and donors for it to be successful. First, the Government must maximize the comparative advantage of public sector employment vis-à-vis its higher-paying private sector competitors. The public service is distinctively placed to attract well-qualified staff at below market rates of compensation if it can credibly link recruitment to a long term and ultimately well-compensated career. Pay need not necessarily match that of other potential employers at the time of recruitment if: (i) recruitment arrangements signal that merit and potential are the basis for postings; (ii) promotion

---

3 Mauritius’ Service to Mauritius program was founded in 2008; The United States’ Presidential Management Fellowship in 1997; Singapore’s Management Associates Program in 2002; the World Bank’s Young Professionals Program in 1963.
arrangements signal that talent and performance will be recognized; and (iii) wage profiles are structured to reflect experience and expertise, with compensation rising later in the career. The guiding principle is that, even when civil servants are paid a modest and fixed wage, they are motivated by the effect that their efforts have on their future wages and public recognition. The GoSL is underway with reforms to fulfill these conditions, and must follow through if the SLPSF is to maximize its potential. In the implementation of the SLPSF, it will be crucial for the PSC and HRMO to take leadership and obtain strong political support for the program as well as buy-in from the MDAs. Donors must also play an important role in the SLPSF. The design, implementation and financing of the training courses at the core of the Fellowship imply a significant technical and financial burden for the GoSL. The donor community has long been engaged in civil service training in Sierra Leone. This program offers a concrete opportunity for donor-supported training and technical support to feed into a long term civil service capacity building and leadership development program.

This Strategy provides a menu of options for consideration by the PSC and HRMO to implement the GoSL’s own Entry-level Leadership Development Program, focused particularly on generalists. The key recommendations for the SLPSF are the following:

1. **Eligibility:** Establish basic program eligibility criteria including parameters on age, education and citizenship.
2. **Prestige:** Give the program a high profile through a combination of outreach, media events and access to high-level officials.
3. **Gender Balance:** Encourage women to apply to the program and remove obstacles to their successful participation by making the Fellowship a gender sensitive employment option.
4. **Cyclical recruitment:** Conduct recruitment according to an annual calendar aligned with the broader GoSL budget calendar and academic calendars of local universities.
5. **Program size:** Start with 10-15 Fellows in the first year and then scale up depending on program success and funding availability.
6. **Program oversight:** Create an Advisory Board with representatives from Government, academia and the donor community and committing to regular updates to the Civil Service Steering Committee.
7. **Attracting Candidates:** (i) Conduct information sessions at local universities; (ii) Purchase newspaper and radio advertisements to ensure a greater media presence; (iii) Publish information about the SLPSF on the relevant GoSL websites.
8. **Assessment & Selection:** (i) Introduce a multiple choice exam to measure a core set of competencies necessary to be a successful civil servant; (ii) Streamline the rest of the selection process to reduce the administrative burden on the PSC.
9. **Appointment & Posting:** (i) Establish the number of openings for Fellows by compiling a list of generalist openings from the individual MDAs; (ii) Solicit candidate preferences of MDAs at the exam stage.
10. **Training & Professional Development:** (i) Design a training course to cover essential knowledge for civil servants; (ii) Formally train generalist recruits on the basic functions of all generalist jobs; (iii) Provide training courses to help develop advanced skills directly relevant to their current job; (iv) Match new Fellows with senior civil servants who agree to be Mentors; (v) Match new Fellows with junior civil servants who went
through the Fellowship; (vi) Structure the Fellowship as a two-year program comprised of three eight-month rotations; (vii) At the end of the two-year Fellowship period, the Fellow can choose his or her top MDAs for longer-term service depending on the results of the performance appraisals conducted; (viii) Give Fellows the opportunity to jump one or two grade levels at the end of the Fellowship based on performance, learning and leadership potential.
1. Background

Sierra Leone’s public sector suffered a decline between the 1960s and the early 2000s. It began in 1967 – 1985, during which period the incumbent government undermined the country’s public service capacity through autocratic and corrupt governance practices and an effort to dismantle vestiges of British colonial rule, including the legacy of national public administration. The civil war (1991-2002) further decimated the civil service. When the war ended, Sierra Leone’s public sector capacity was virtually non-existent outside Freetown. Most government infrastructure, including many administrative buildings inside and outside Freetown, was destroyed. All academic institutions, including civil service training institutes, were also either razed to the ground or badly damaged. Subsequently, as is often the case in post-conflict settings, international NGOs stepped in to provide urgent public services to the public, including most educational and health services.

Mass departure of civil servants began before the civil war and was exacerbated by the conflict. In 1991, the size of the public service had been at 74,000 public servants. In 2002, this number was reduced to about 62,000 public servants, where over a third of these personnel staffed the education sector (see Chart 1 below for 2002 status).

Chart 1: Staffing by Ministry at the end of the Civil War

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ministry</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>23,158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>5,193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>3,141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Military</td>
<td>14,033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police</td>
<td>7,451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>8,895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>61,871</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Recruiting qualified civil servants to close the capacity gap proved to be a significant challenge due to more competitive pay incentives in the private sector. Private firms offered up to three to four times more than the civil service wage rate (see Table 1 below). As a result, it became difficult to attract and retain qualified staff needed to improve the performance of the public service.

---

4 These data include military and police. Without military and police, the public service size was 40,000 in 2002.
Table 1: Civil Service Salary Benchmarking (2004)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benchmark Positions</th>
<th>GOSL Budget Annual Average</th>
<th>Benchmark 75th Percentile</th>
<th>Survey Benchmark Position Annual Median</th>
<th>Benchmark 25th Percentile</th>
<th>GOSL % of Benchmark Median</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Director</td>
<td>7,529,445</td>
<td>22,830,000</td>
<td>15,660,000</td>
<td>15,255,000</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economist</td>
<td>3,419,754</td>
<td>48,600,000</td>
<td>48,600,000</td>
<td>48,600,000</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountant</td>
<td>1,154,549</td>
<td>20,928,294</td>
<td>11,039,538</td>
<td>10,178,295</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Accountant</td>
<td>2,111,974</td>
<td>16,754,808</td>
<td>16,754,808</td>
<td>16,754,808</td>
<td>13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statistician</td>
<td>3,361,677</td>
<td>9,600,000</td>
<td>9,600,000</td>
<td>9,600,000</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Systems Analyst</td>
<td>3,419,754</td>
<td>81,000,000</td>
<td>81,000,000</td>
<td>81,000,000</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel Officer</td>
<td>1,154,549</td>
<td>8,117,916</td>
<td>8,117,916</td>
<td>8,117,916</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Today, low pay remains an impediment to effective recruitment and retention. One indication that low remuneration is a key constraint to attracting qualified staff is that entry level personnel recently recruited for certain technical positions (budget officers, internal auditors), upon being offered the post, had to be offered an average of US $1000 above the regular civil service wage (approximately US $200 monthly) to accept these positions.

Other indications that low levels of pay are a key constraint to filling technical and managerial positions include a plethora of “coping” arrangements that circumvent the low public pay scale. These include (i) well paid Local Technical Assistants (LTAs) (contract staff paid outside the civil service pay regimen) in line positions often funded by donors; (ii) the prevalence of project implementation/management units conducting important government programs that would otherwise be managed by MDAs, also donor funded; (iii) entire donor funded line agencies such as the Decentralization Secretariat; and (iv) ad hoc salary top-ups.

Challenges in recruitment have led to a depleted leadership cadre. Table 2 shows that in Sierra

---

5 The bulk of the data from this section is drawn from the Project Appraisal Document for the Sierra Leone Pay and Performance Project, World Bank Report 67447, May 2012.
6 (i) – (iii) are also referred to as the “shadow civil service”. The MoFED, has the largest number of such arrangements. A study conducted in 2008 – “Integrated Public Financial Management Reform Programme: Design of an exit strategy and arrangements for transitional development partner support for remuneration of contract PFM staff”, GHK Consultants, October 2008 – found that 64% of the professional positions in the MoFED were staffed by LTAs. While 39% of the total staff in the MoFED were LTAs they accounted for 85% of the wage bill. These arrangements may also be in part due to competition between donors, in that donors all vie for the same small group of professionals qualified to implement their projects, thus pushing up wages.
Leone today, over 87% of the personnel are in the lowest (―blue collar‖) grades 1-5. Top management grades only represent slightly over 1% of civil service employment (see Table 2). Professional and technical staff constitutes only about 11% of the total civil service workforce. Comparative numbers for professional and technical staff in Gambia (in 2007) were 26% and 14.3% in Sudan (2004). The severely low numbers in the middle/technical and senior grades is in the central bureaucracy and not with the front line staff associated with service delivery.

In addition to the low numbers of staff at the middle and senior levels, the quality of this staff is also weak. This is largely due both to the “brain drain” experienced during the civil war and occasional politically or personally motivated circumvention of merit based procedures for hiring. Furthermore, the relationship between merit and promotion is weak. Civil servants are often promoted into managerial jobs based on long service alone without any assessment of their capability to perform the job. Historically, this has happened for two reasons: Firstly, there was no information on an individual’s performance in the current job because the appraisal system had fallen into disuse; and secondly, the PSC lacked the capacity to undertake the necessary selection exercises. Promotion decisions have therefore been made by the senior management of Ministries on an ad hoc basis with the “recommendations” ratified by the HRMO and the PSC.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Grades</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
<th>% of total</th>
<th>Numbers</th>
<th>% of total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>1-5</td>
<td>13,255</td>
<td>92.2%</td>
<td>11,881</td>
<td>87.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle</td>
<td>6-10</td>
<td>995</td>
<td>6.9%</td>
<td>1,559</td>
<td>11.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>11 and up</td>
<td>134</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>14,384</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>13,617</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: (i) The figures for 2008 are from World Bank (2010): Sierra Leone Public Expenditure Review, Report Number 52817-SL, October 28, 2010; (ii) Figures for 2011 were provided to Bank staff by the MoFED in September-November 2011; (iii) Figures for both 2008 and 2011 include core civil service and health workers; (iv) grades 1-5 are the lower grades/“blue collar” workers; grades 6-10 are professional and technical staff with grade 7 as the graduate entry level; and grades 11 and up are the senior management cadre.

Table 2 and the data from the following paragraph are drawn from the Project Appraisal Document for the Sierra Leone Pay and Performance Project, World Bank Report 67447, May 2012.

According to a recent Public Expenditure Review (PER) (World Bank 2010), the comparable figure was 7% in 2008. The “civil service” in Sierra Leone includes health workers but not teachers who are included in the “public service” count but not in the “civil service”.

Figures for Gambia are from the payroll for 2007; figures for Sudan are from Background Paper for ‘Sudan: Joint Assessment Mission’, unpublished mimeo, World Bank, 2004.

For example, close to 60% of teachers hold positions between grades 6-10, i.e. are at the middle levels.

Performance management is one of the key components of the GoSL’s public sector reform program, “Improving Productivity through Management and Pay Reforms”, currently under implementation with support from the World Bank Sierra Leone Pay and Performance Project.
2. GoSL Public Service Reform Agenda

The Government of Sierra Leone, together with donors, has undertaken a serious effort to address the aforementioned issues. The overall GoSL Public Sector Reform Program (2009-2014) contains an initiative entitled “Improving Productivity through Pay and Management Reforms,” supported by projects funded by the World Bank, European Union (EU) and United Nations Development Programme. The initiative contains three key areas:

(i) **Pay reform**, designed to rationalize the civil service pay structure, increase equity among positions within the civil service and competitiveness with private sector employers;

(ii) **Recruitment and staffing**, designed to strengthen meritocratic recruitment policies and procedures and fill key vacancies throughout the civil service, as well as capacity building for the PSC;

(iii) **Performance management and accountability**, designed to strengthen Government capacity to carry out performance contracting and performance appraisal procedures, as well as to involve civil society organizations in the evaluation of Ministry-level performance.

The European Union’s Euro 10.5 million project - “Support to Civil Service Reform Programme in Sierra Leone” - supports training, rightsizing, institutional support to the Human Resource Management Office (HRMO), the PSC and other oversight institutions and for the mainstreaming of anti-corruption efforts.

Similarly, UNDP provides dedicated Technical Assistance support to the HRMO to design and implement systems and procedures for various aspects of HR management and training courses for civil servants. UNDP also supports the HRMO to improve its operational capacity and its coordination with other agencies such as the PSC, PSRU, SPU and MDAs.

The World Bank’s $17 million “Sierra Leone Pay and Performance Project” (SLP&PP) mirrors the GoSL program and supports the government’s efforts through a results-based component that rewards achievement of key milestones along the reform path and a technical assistance component that provides specific inputs and assistance for complex elements of the program. This program contains support for the PSC, including technical guidance for a redrafting of the recruitment procedures to strengthen meritocratic practices and providing for additional staffing and training to increase the PSC’s institutional capacity.

Government and donor efforts address are focused on building capacity at the middle and top levels, providing technical assistance, and financing wage bill increases and retrenchment efforts. These efforts are supported by the Recruitment and Staffing component of the World Bank’s SLP&PP. However, there is currently no program that focuses on the entry level. The following list enumerates some of the remaining challenges in recruiting and retaining quality entry level civil servants.

---

A major shortcoming in recruitment is that there is no mechanism to attract high-quality entry-level civil servants to build the service from the bottom. No program specifically targets qualified candidates graduating in relevant fields from Sierra Leone's university system. Anecdotal evidence suggests that top students are attracted by higher salaries and growth potential in the private sector or international NGOs and generally overlook a career in public service. This weakens the quality of staffs in the entry-level grades (grade 6-7) and reduces the pool of civil servants from which to choose the future middle managers and leaders of government agencies.

The lack of a robust middle and senior leadership cadre represents a challenge for retaining and grooming younger civil servants. Generally, as the civil service atrophied during the civil war, it was the most able people with marketable skills who left. With some exceptions, the civil servants remaining are those who lack the skills and competencies to find jobs overseas or in the private sector, attracted by more competitive remuneration and greater opportunities for professional growth. As the competent staff left, they have not been replaced through external recruitment. Major gaps in the management structures of most Ministries therefore emerged which have had to be filled from a depleted pool of internal candidates. Consequently, there are few senior civil servants well-equipped to push or mentor their younger colleagues. The lack of role models and mentors is a crucial demotivating factor for junior civil servants. Additionally, there is no incentive for senior civil servants to volunteer their time to help develop young staff.

Insufficient training opportunities adversely affect both performance and retention. Little training is provided to enable those promoted to perform their new responsibilities because there is no established public service management training capacity in country. The only training made available to civil service personnel is during the early months of employment soon after recruitment is completed by the PSC. However, at present, there exists no concurrent training mechanism that helps these personnel develop new skills, hone existing strengths or address technical skill gaps as they progress upwards through the civil service. As a result, many civil service managers today lack the basic skills and competencies for their jobs. Additionally, anecdotal evidence suggests that as training is one of the most attractive benefits of civil service, the lack of such opportunities reduces the incentive to stay in the service.

An overall demoralizing factor affecting all aspects of the civil service human capital development continuum is the virtual absence a public service ethic. In other countries, many civil servants are driven by a “public service ethic” which provides an intrinsic motivation for them to deliver for citizens, which is often synonymous with the prestige of working for the government. This ethos is no longer evident in Sierra Leone, where real pay levels (including salaries and benefits) have deteriorated so far that the lack of extrinsic rewards overwhelms any intrinsic factors derived from the work itself. The lack of prestige of the public service acts as a deterrent for potential civil servants who may be allured by NGOs or donors. Furthermore, there is little public recognition of civil servants’ work.

The departure of competent staff also included technical personnel. However, as the focus of this document is on generalists, this gap is not addressed by the present program in its current design.
3. Global Good Practices

The World Bank team reviewed seven international public service programs to develop “good practice” recommendations on graduate-entry level civil service recruitment and development ideas for the Sierra Leone Public Service Fellowship. Specifically, the team looked at graduate-entry level recruitment in civil service programs in Botswana, Liberia, Mauritius, Nepal, Singapore, the United Kingdom, and the United States. Most programs possessed the following traits:

- Ability to attract high-quality applicants through a combination of reasonable current compensation and strong probability of a fast-moving career with consequently enhanced lifetime benefits
- Political leadership commitment
- Administrative leadership commitment
- Synergy with ongoing civil service recruitment programs & procedures
- Patience for implementation and evaluation
- Sustainable financial, technical and administrative resources
- Conscious nurturing of public support
- High prestige

There are six features common to all programs reviewed for this Fellowship that would most benefit the Sierra Leone Civil Service, while meeting PSC and HRMO needs for recruitment, placement and development:

1. All recruitment must be based solely on merit, including educational and professional qualifications as well as competencies.
2. Recruits must be provided with substantive training opportunities to build and enhance skills needed by the Sierra Leone civil service.
3. Recruits must be subject to regular performance evaluations to determine areas for improvement and advancement.
4. Recruits must be allowed to rotate across ministries to gain a taste for several job types and work environments to best match their skills and interests for longer-term postings.
5. Recruits must receive coaching from senior staff so that they can learn key skills based on the mentor’s own professional experience and personal strengths. An alternative could also be opportunities to “shadow” selected senior staff in various ministries during rotations to learn the craft by observation.
6. The program must imply a prospect of accelerated career development.
4. Program Structure

The GoSL recognizes the need to foster talented youth in the civil service and has therefore included the establishment of an Entry-level Leadership Development Program (ELDP) in its reform efforts. Such a program would provide a recruitment stream that would develop the future leaders of the civil service. Moreover, it would recruit generalists capable of managing ministries across government and give them the opportunity to experience different work environments. In the long term, the graduates of this program would develop a holistic view of government, providing strategic leadership for their ministries in relation to the wide array of government functions. This cadre would provide Sierra Leone with a renewed “steel frame” and provide the civil service, and thus government institutions, with administrative stability from one presidential administration to the next.

The following section provides a review of current GoSL practices in recruitment and development of graduate entry generalists and a series of options for how the PSC and HRMO could implement the Sierra Leone Public Service Fellowship. Most of the recommendations are budget neutral or imply a minimal fiscal impact. They aim to provide a framework for a program in which talented young generalists are attracted to the civil service, best candidates are selected, and civil servants retained through incentives including (i) the prestige of an exclusive program (ii) special training opportunities, (iii) opportunities to rotate in different government offices, (iv) mentorship, and (v) opportunities for an accelerated career.

GENERAL ISSUES

A. Program Eligibility

Options for the SLPSF: The PSC must establish the basic application criteria for the SLPSF and include this information in its advertisements. Suggested parameters include:

- **Education level:** The candidate must have completed second class lower or division two general bachelor's degree.
- **Age:** The candidate may be no more than 35 years old (maximum age to be determined by PSC and HRMO).
- **Citizenship:** The candidate must be a citizen of Sierra Leone.

B. Prestige

Current practice: The overall GoSL civil service reform effort supported by the SLP&PP and other donor projects has as a peripheral goal to increase the prestige associated with public service, largely through a comprehensive pay reform strategy that will increase parity between public and private sector salaries.

---

14 The “steel frame” is how the civil service is referred to in India.

15 Financial incentives, such as an enhanced pay scale for Fellows, would clearly provide strong motivation for potential candidates. However, at the time of writing the present report such options were deemed by GoSL representatives as overly controversial (causing the impression of creating “haves” and “have-nots” within the civil service) and thus not considered.
Options for the SLPSF: Along with training and accelerated career development possibilities, prestige is one of the key incentives that will both attract candidates to apply for the Fellowship and keep Fellows in the civil service. A concerted effort to increase the program’s prestige both at the application stage and after induction must therefore be made. Recommendations for attracting potential candidates, including information sessions at local universities and establishing a media presence, are below in program cycle step I. Several options for maintaining prestige for Fellows after recruitment are as follows:

- **Hold an annual meeting of Fellows with the President.** An informal round-table would give the President an opportunity to meet with promising young civil servants to talk about key issues facing government, and for Fellows to have their service recognized at the highest level. This event could be covered by local media.

- **Allow Fellows to meet with the respective Ministers and Permanent Secretaries at the beginning of each rotation.** Upon joining an MDA, each Fellow would have the opportunity to meet with the MDA’s leadership to discuss his or her aspirations for the rotation as well as the current needs and challenges of the MDA.

- **Sponsor an annual meeting of current and past Fellows to discuss key issues facing Government, including the participation of select Ministers and Permanent Secretaries.** This meeting would have the goal of producing a document that could serve as a useful ingredient to policy discussions at the highest level of Government, allowing young civil servants to make a meaningful impact beyond the limited mandate of their job.

C. **Gender Equality in Recruitment and Selection**

*Current practice:* Regulation 2.6 in the Civil Service Regulations explicitly prohibits discrimination on the basis of gender in all recruitment and selection processes. The SLPSF must legally abide by this policy.

**Options for the SLPSF:**

- **Set explicit recruitment targets** based on the gender balance of graduating university students. For example, if women represent 55% of university graduates, the PSC could set a goal for 55% of new recruits to be women. Alternatively, the PSC could aim for a higher percentage of women than is present in the university population.

- **Publish actual recruitments** in the government Gazette and Government websites.

- **Monitor gender balance** at all stages throughout the process to detect if and where bias enters.
D. Cyclical Recruitment

**Current practice:** Recruitment is currently conducted on an as-needed basis and does not follow a regular annual calendar.

**Options for the SLPSF:**
- Conduct all steps along the recruitment process according to an annual calendar. While it does imply certain rigidity, following an annual calendar allows program administrators to plan in an organized fashion and for each step of the process to occur the same time each year (depending on how frequently the recruitment is open, it could occur every other year). Calendar-based recruitment will allow evaluators to compare all candidates at the same time and to maximize economies of scale in the evaluation and selection procedures. The recruitment calendar could be aligned with the other human resources components of the budget calendar (such as the manpower hearings).
- Publish the recruitment calendar. The PSC could divulge important recruitment dates (such as application deadlines) on the Government websites and in the Government gazette, thus increasing transparency regarding the process.

E. Program Size

**Options for the SLPSF:**
- The size of the first class of Fellows will depend on (i) demand from MDAs for generalists, and specifically, participants in the program; (ii) administrative capacity of the PSC and HRMO to manage the program; (iii) availability of incremental financial resources necessary to cover program costs. The class size of the closest comparator, Liberia’s President’s Young Professionals Program, varies from 12-15 each year.
- In all international cases, the ELDP is not an employment generation program. An internship program (see Box 2 on an example from Botswana) is an alternative to

---

**Box 1: Gender balance in the Nepalese civil service**

Since the early 1990s, the Nepalese civil service has taken significant steps to achieve gender balance in the institution. The Civil Service Act of 1993 offered several provisions for women, for instance raising the maximum entry age for women to 40 while it was maintained at 35 for men. The 2007 Amendment to the Civil Service Act mandated that 33 percent of positions to be filled through a separate competition for women only. Moreover, the Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare with the support of the UNDP enacted a number of other reforms such as providing gender relations classes in government-affiliated civil service training institutes, appointing gender focal points in the ministries and sponsoring a series of special coaching classes for women taking the civil service exam. The coaching classes (open only to women) provide basic information on the civil service system, examination schedules, application and evaluation processes, and are complemented by *special* coaching sessions for women to build knowledge and skills in order to increase their pass rate on the civil service exams. This is already showing some promising results with 50% women (section officers) passing a recent exam conducted by the Public Service Commission for entry in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

combine civil service recruitment with youth employment. In planning an internship program, however, the GoSL must be watchful to avoid (i) replacing civil servants with interns; (ii) overcrowding work teams and office spaces; and (iii) inflating the wage bill through excessive hiring, among other concerns.

**Box 2: Internships in Botswana**

The Botswana National Internship Program recruits recent graduates of local universities unable to find employment elsewhere. Interns are placed in ministries and state-owned enterprises for a fixed term contract generally spanning two years and a stipend of approximately US $230 (BWP 1800) per month. They enter into a written contract with the government to this effect with the option of cutting the internship short contingent upon receiving an offer of permanent employment elsewhere. Interns are placed in positions where they can gain more marketable skills and work experience to make them imminently employable.

Source: Ministry of Labor and Home Affairs, Government of Botswana.  

F. **Program Oversight**  
**Options for the SLPSF:**

- **Advisory board:** The PSC and HRMO could create of an SLPSF Advisory Board to provide oversight and technical support to the program. The Advisory Board could include representatives of the PSC and HRMO as well as the Public Sector Reform Unit, the Cabinet Secretary, and donors involved in civil service reform including the World Bank, the European Union and the United Nations Development Programme.

- **Regular reports to the Civil Service Steering Committee:** The PSC and HRMO could commit to providing regular (for example, twice annual) program updates to the Civil Service Steering Committee to keep relevant Government counterparts informed of recent developments and solicit guidance.

**PROGRAM CYCLE**

I. **Attracting Candidates**  
**Current practice:** Advertisement of vacancies is done by the PSC, HRMO and by the MDA in question. Once a vacancy is identified and a corresponding job posting (including title, description, MDA, location, competencies, grade level and number of open posts) is approved, the HRMO (with authorization of the PSC) sends the posting to the government printer for inclusion in the government gazette. When batch recruiting is conducted (for similar jobs), the vacancies are posted together. The gazette is distributed to the PSC in Freetown, PSC offices upcountry and overseas embassies. The position remains in the government gazette for one month. The MDA may conduct additional advertisement, such as via radio or newspaper, according to the funding available and the necessity to attract additional candidates. The PSC generally does not have sufficient funding to purchase radio or newspaper advertisements.
Options for the SLPSF: In order to attract the highest quality of potential generalist civil servants, advertisement for the SLPSF must (i) reach a broader base of potential applicants; (ii) target high quality potential applicants where they are likely to be concentrated; (iii) persuade potential applicants to apply. Importantly, the outreach efforts must underscore the prestige associated with the program. Several means to accomplish these goals include:

- **Conduct information sessions at local universities.** Universities such as the Institute of Public Administration and Management and Fourah Bay College produce hundreds of college graduates each year that would be well suited to join the civil service as generalists but may be unaware of the opportunities. Representatives of the PSC or HRMO could collaborate with these (or other) universities to conduct information sessions every semester to inform students about the existence of the SLPSF, application requirements and program benefits. Universities are likely to be amenable to such presentations as it may help their students obtain jobs in the civil service.

- **Purchase newspaper and radio advertisements for the program.** A greater presence in the media will help grow the body of potential applicants and, depending on the content of the advertisements, can help to increase the prestige of the program. Advertisements should emphasize that the program is (i) for a family of positions across all the MDAs, meaning that successful fellows will have an opportunity to work across government; and (ii) an opportunity to become a leader in the civil service.

- **Publish information about the SLPSF on the pertinent GoSL websites.** Information about the SLPSF can be posted, including (i) background; (ii) objectives; (iii) program structure; (iv) application requirements; (v) application procedures. Depending on the sophistication of the website, it may also allow for candidates to submit their applications online.

- **Gender perspective:** Encourage female professionals to apply by emphasizing flexibility and gender sensitive options for civil servants, including: (i) the option not to be transferred outside of a candidate’s home city (and thus be separated from their families); (ii) flexible working hours; and (iii) maternity leave.

*Calendar*: Advertise during the end of the first semester the school year (October through December).

II. **Assessment & Selection**

*Current practice:* The first-round applications solicit the following information from candidates: contact information, family states, educational achievement, computer skills, foreign languages, professional experience and references. Upon the close of the application period, the PSC collects the completed applications and forwards them to the hiring MDA. The MDA submits a list of recommended candidates back to the PSC, and then the PSC compiles a shortlist (the shortlists can occasionally be quite long, including up to 70 candidates out of a total of 100 applicants).

For positions at the graduate entry level, short-listed candidates must take a written exam administered by the PSC and undergo an interview by a panel of experts. The exam includes four to five essay questions and is graded by three or four readers who are technical experts in the

---

16 This and all following “Calendar” references suppose the following academic calendar: first semester – early October to end December; second semester – middle January to middle July.
pertinent field not in government service (though they often include retirees). The top candidates are then invited to a panel interview. The panel includes (i) an independent adjudicator (technical expert outside of government); (ii) a representative from the hiring MDA; (iii) a representative from the HRMO; (iv) at least 3 members of the PSC; and (v) the Secretary of the PSC (to supply necessary documents). The panelists assess the candidate based on a set of standard criteria provided by the PSC, including: personal attributes (5%), background/qualifications (15%), key competencies (30%), evaluation of ICT skills (25%), interpersonal relationships (10%), and current affairs (10%). The interview scores are compiled and averaged unless there is extreme dispersion among the scores given by the different panelists, in which case differences are discussed and reconciled under guidance from the independent adjudicator. Interview scores are then combined with the exam results, which are given equal weight, to identify qualifying candidates with the top combined scores.

Options for the SLPSF: The current procedures, though generally compliant with meritocratic principles, are overly cumbersome and time-consuming for the PSC and the exam graders. In order to efficiently identify the most qualified candidates for the SLPSF, the assessment procedures must (i) limit the burden placed on the PSC and external evaluators; and (ii) focus on the set of competencies, both technical and behavioral, necessary to be successful as a generalist civil servant.

- **Offer a multiple choice exam prior to the essay and interview phases to limit the candidate pool and identify those most qualified for the program.** A multiple choice exam is also far cheaper to grade than an essay exam, as all that is required is a person (or a machine) to check if the answers are correct or incorrect and compile the score. Therefore, large numbers of candidates can take the exam for a low cost. It can easily measure basic competencies such as quantitative analysis (currently entirely absent from the assessment process), verbal reasoning and reading comprehension.

- **Limit the number of candidates invited to submit essays and undergo interviews.** The PSC could consider limiting the candidates invited to submit essays to those with the top scores on the multiple choice exam. This would reduce the administrative burden on the PSC and the cost of grading. Similarly, the PSC could limit the number of candidates interviewed for each slot to a reduced number of those with the highest combined exam and essay scores. Technical competencies having been initially reviewed in the first two stages, the interviews should focus on the behavioral competencies (importantly, commitment to public service) of candidates.

- **Alternatively, the essay exam could be administered together with the multiple choice exam to limit the number of stages in the evaluation process.** If graders’ time is a constraint, the multiple choice exams could be graded first and only the essays of the candidates with the highest scores on the multiple choice portion could be graded.

- **Limit the composition of the interview panel to representatives of the PSC, HRMO and an independent adjudicator.** Given that candidates will be recruited to work across MDAs, the panel must take a “whole of government” view, taking into account the needs of all the MDAs with vacancies.

- **Gender perspective: Have women participate in the interview process, both by providing interview questions and by sitting on interview panels.**

---

17 These percentages add to 95%. This is how they are listed on the PSC document “Interview Assessment Criteria” as of April 2012.
Calendar:
- Accept applications during the beginning of the second semester of the school year (January and February).
- Administer and grade the multiple choice exam in the middle of the second semester (March).
- Administer the essay exam 3 months prior to the end of the semester (April).
- Conduct interviews 1-2 months prior to the end of the semester (May).

Box 3: Assessment and Selection in the Fast Stream (United Kingdom)
The Fast Stream was the first Entry-level Leadership Development program, launched in the UK in the 1960s. It is an accelerated training and development program for people who have the potential to become senior managers within the UK Civil Service. Assessment and selection in the Fast Stream is extremely rigorous and competitive. The Fast Stream program employs both generalists and specialists. Those who are recruited under Graduate Fast Stream (GFS) are generalists and rest of the recruits - for example Analytical Fast Stream - are specialists. All Fast Stream applications have to go through at least four stages of an assessment process. After meeting the basic application criteria (first stage), each applicant has to pass an online verbal and math test (second stage) to move to next level. The next stage is an analytical assessment known as the ‘E-Tray exercise’ which is conducted at various regional centers across the UK. While all applicants have to sit for a second round of verbal and math exams during this stage, applicants for specialist positions (for example economist, statistician, operational research) will also have to sit for their subject specific assessment exam. Finally, the last (fourth) stage is a day-long assessment in London at the Fast Stream Center where each group of candidates is assessed by three specially selected and trained assessors who are either serving or recently retired civil servants and occupational psychologists. Some sub-streams, such as Diplomatic Service applicants, will have to go to a fifth stage which is selection by a board of judges.


III. Appointment and Posting
Current practice: Candidates apply directly for given positions within specific MDAs. There is no general recruitment that spans the whole of the civil service.

Options for the SLPSF: As the SLPSF will involve recruitment of generalists who could potentially serve in any MDA, it will be necessary to implement a process for matching candidates with vacancies in individual MDAs. Options for achieving this are as follows:
- Establish the number of openings for Fellows by compiling a list of generalist openings from the individual MDAs. When the MDAs submit their hiring requests to the HRMO, which are in turn approved by the PSC, the PSC can identify which of these openings are appropriate for the SLPSF. To begin with, the job types included are Human Resources Officers, Monitoring and Evaluation Officers, Policy Analysts, Planning Officers and the Assistant Secretaries (the graduate entry level Administrative Cadre position). The PSC could compile the list and take note of the number of open posts for each job type so that
it can pursue recruitment accordingly. Though the SLPSF would recruit a generalist cadre, the candidate profiles can be roughly tailored to meet current needs (for example, if across the MDAs there is a need for 10 Human Resources Officers and only one Policy Analyst and one M&E Officer, the PSC can select a group that favors those with stronger backgrounds for HR, cognizant that they may end up in different job types at a later stage).

- **Solicit candidate preferences of MDAs and job types at the exam stage.** Candidates could indicate their top three MDAs from a list of participating MDAs (those with graduate entry generalist openings), while being given clear notice that ultimately the needs of the service will dictate their placement. Additionally, they could list their three top job types. This will allow the PSC and HRMO to best match candidate preferences with business needs of the MDAs.

- **After the pool of candidates is selected, provide the MDAs the opportunity to prioritize their candidates.** The HRMO can provide the MDAs with a list of the selected fellows, their professional profiles and assessment results and request that they choose their top three. Based on the candidate and MDA preferences, the HRMO can complete the matching.

- **In the event of a dispute, give preference to the candidate with the higher overall score.** If the two ministries both prefer the same candidate, the candidate’s preferences can determine his or her ultimate placement.

- **Gender perspective:** Allow married women and mothers to stay in the city where their families live to prevent them from having to choose between their families and their careers.

**Calendar:** Fellows are officially appointed in June.

### IV. Training and Professional Development

#### A. Formal training

**Current practice:** There is no uniform policy for training of graduate entry recruits in the civil service. There is no official induction to acquaint new civil servants with the basic functions of the civil service, their MDA, or the specific functions of their job. Training is generally financed by donors and typically comes in the form of courses on specific topics (such as IT skills) designed for the civil service by the Institute of Continuing Education or the IPAM. The Civil Service Training College, opened in April 2012, serves as a dedicated space for training. MDAs do occasionally finance continued study at the master’s level locally, but do not have the funds to finance international programs. One of the main instruments to promote training abroad is to allow civil servants to undertake continued study (if they find their own financing) while continuing to give them a salary and to guarantee their post upon return. As reported by the HRMO, training opportunities are highly valued by civil servants and are always well attended.

**Options for the SLPSF:** Training is one of the main non-salary incentives that can be offered to potential fellows. While a minimum level of training (to be decided by the HRMO and PSC) can be obligatory for all civil servants, allowing Fellows some degree of freedom in their training courses allows them to pursue their own professional growth according to their interests and abilities. All such training can be conducted in Sierra Leone and does not require any trips
abroad. There are a variety of different types of training that can be offered at different levels of expense to the PSC, HRMO, MDAs or donors (depending on how each activity is financed):

- **General induction.** As Fellows will be recruited as a class, the HRMO can design a training course to cover essential knowledge for civil servants, potentially including: (i) the Constitution, the structure of government and general history; (ii) the functions of the civil service; and (iii) key laws, rules and regulations (see Box 4 for information on Singapore’s extensive induction practices).

- **Basic generalist training.** Following the general induction, Fellows can be given a mandatory introductory training in all the generalist fields in order to prepare them for placements in different job groups. This would serve the dual purpose of exposing Fellows to the different positions that they may eventually occupy, and preparing the entire cadre to be able to fulfill all the generalist functions at a basic level.

- **Depth training:** Fellows can be offered training courses to develop advanced skills directly relevant to their current job (for example, monitoring and evaluation officers could be offered a course in quantitative methods).

- **Gender perspective:** Guarantee access to trainings necessary for promotion for women, for example by offering courses close to their duty station so that they do not have to leave their families for extended periods of time.

- **Training quality control:** The HRMO, potentially with donor support, can designate a team to oversee (i) the content of the training programs, (ii) the quality of transmission of the trainings, and (iii) the assessments of Fellows who have completed the trainings. Based on this oversight, this team can also recommend adjustments to the changing curricula, pedagogical methods, training providers, and assessment techniques.

**Calendar:** The general induction and basic generalist training can be *required* before a Fellow assumes his or her post in June. Alternatively, the basic generalist training can be broken up into modules that can be taken at any point during the first rotation, requiring that all modules be completed before beginning the second rotation.
B. Mentorship/Shadowing

Current practice: There is no formal mentorship or shadowing program that matches junior and senior civil servants. However, it is widely recognized among senior civil servants that mentorship is key to professional growth. It one of several cost-neutral options for staff development.

Options for the SLPSF:

- Match new Fellows with senior civil servants who are pre-identified by the HRMO to be mentors. Senior civil servants can be persuaded to participate in mentorship activities with Fellows linking participation to their performance appraisal (“mentoring” is point 12 in Section 7: Competency Assessment of the HRMO’s new performance appraisal form). To avoid a conflict of interest, Mentors and Fellows should be in different MDAs. The Mentor’s role is to support the Fellow in making a career in the civil service based on his or her experience. The Mentors should be pre-identified by the HRMO as those senior civil servants who are the best examples of stellar performance and adherence to core civil service values.

- Match Fellows with high-performing senior civil servants in their MDAs for shadowing, in which the Fellow accompanies the Mentor while he or she conducts the basic functions of his or her job. The Mentors should be pre-identified by the HRMO as those senior civil servants who are the best examples of stellar performance and adherence to core civil service values.

- Match new Fellows with junior civil servants who went through the Fellowship. Beginning with the second round of Fellows appointed to MDAs, it will be possible to create a “buddy system” in which new Fellows are introduced to Fellows of previous classes. Potential activities for these Buddies include: (i) joint training opportunities for Buddies in the same job group; and (ii) regular meetings to discuss work experiences, challenges and opportunities.

---

Box 4: Training in the Management Associates Program (Singapore)

Singapore’s Management Associates Program is a competitive feeder program to the elite Administrative Service, which offers accelerated promotion schedules and salaries competitive with the private sector. Training is a central element of the MAP. New Management Associates participate in a nine-week Foundation Course designed to provide them with a “firm grounding in the values, knowledge and skills essential to assume a leadership career in the Civil Service, and to gain a deeper understanding of Singapore and ASEAN”. The course includes experiential components with operational departments, grassroots and social service organizations, as well as participation in closed-door discussions with decision makers, visits to ASEAN countries, and meetings with overseas counterparts to widen the recruits’ regional perspectives. Management Associates also participate in cross-ministry projects, and policy forums and seminars designed to improve their understanding of reasoning behind public policies.

Source: Government of Singapore
http://www.adminservice.gov.sg/MAP/TrainDev/
• Note: It will be important for the HRMO to provide close oversight of the selection of mentors and buddies, as well as their interaction with Fellows, in order to ensure that Fellows receive guidance from civil servants that best exemplify core civil service values.

Calendar: Fellows are introduced to Mentors and Buddies shortly after assuming their first post, (late June). Fellows meet with Mentors and Buddies at least once per month.

Box 5: Mentorship in the President’s Young Professionals Program (Liberia)

The President’s Young Professionals Program (PYPP) aims to identify and groom young Liberian college graduates for future government service by placing them in various government ministries under the mentorship of a high-level senior civil servant in their ministry. From recruitment to post-placement, the program has succeeded in drawing support from highest level of government. While the President’s economic advisor participates during the recruitment, President Sirleaf herself participates in the placement of candidates in various ministries. During the PYPP, Young Professionals benefit from the mentorship of individuals involved in other Liberian civil service capacity building initiatives like Scott Fellows (special assistants to Ministers or other senior officials chosen through a competitive international recruitment process), Senior Executive Service members (senior government leaders in management positions on performance-based contracts) and TOKTEN fellows (Transfer of Knowledge Through Expatriate Nationals – a program that recruits Liberians abroad to fill crucial capacity gaps in government for limited periods). Mentors provide professional guidance, support and participate in regular evaluations. Furthermore, Young Professionals report directly to the Ministers or senior staff and receive extensive training during the program. The PYPP also holds monthly dinners for Young Professionals and Scott Fellows where alumni are also encouraged to join. While the PYPP is still externally managed and funded (in part by UNDP), there has been a budgetary commitment by several Ministries recently to support the participation of several Young Professionals.


C. Experience

Current practice: New civil servants are assigned directly to specific posts within MDAs and are not given the opportunity to explore other job functions or ministries.

Options for the SLPSF: As generalists, Fellows can be offered the opportunity to explore multiple job functions in several ministries to both gain a greater sense of where they would like to build a career and develop a holistic sense of the civil service. The following option for implementing a rotational component in the Fellowship is based on that of the Presidential Management Fellowship in the United States (see Box 6).

• Structure the Fellowship as a two-year program comprised of three eight-month rotations.
For example, a Fellow may begin as a Monitoring and Evaluation Officer in the Ministry of Youth and Sport, continue as a Human Resources Officer in the Ministry of Finance, and conclude the Fellowship as a Planning Officer in Ministry of Mines. The HRMO and the MDA can conduct a performance appraisal at the end of each rotation to build a record for each Fellow.
• **Offer Fellows Work Projects.** Work projects are tasks accompanied by a learning component, including direct support from the manager, access to relevant written information, and time to reflect on the work following the completion of the task. They allow Fellows to expand their knowledge and professional abilities while contributing substantively to their ministry’s mission.

• **Incorporate self-evaluation into the performance appraisal process.** If a knowledge gap is identified by the Fellow and confirmed by the supervisor, the supervisor can direct the Fellow to written or online learning material. Depending on availability and demonstrated commitment to the job, a distance learning course (for example, in management) can be offered.

• **At the end of the two-year Fellowship period,** allow the Fellow to choose his or her top MDAs for longer-term service. At that point, the Fellow will have sufficient knowledge of the civil service to make an informed decision as to where to continue. Receiving MDAs can take performance appraisals from previous rotations (provided by the HRMO) into account when deciding whether to engage a Fellow.

*Calendar:* The first rotation begins in June (year 1); the second rotation begins 8 months later (February, year 2); the third rotation begins 8 months later (October, year 2); long-term appointment begins 8 months later (June, year 3).

### Box 6: Rotation in the Presidential Management Fellowship (United States)

The Presidential Management Fellowship (PMF) is a two-year leadership development program for the U.S. civil service made up of three separate job assignments. The candidate is recruited into the MDA of his or her interest and given the opportunity to undertake two types of rotations: (i) within the MDA, to a different department or job function; and (ii) a Developmental Assignment of four to six months. The Developmental Assignment is a full-time job outside of the Fellow’s normal duties and home office designed to challenge the Fellow with managerial and technical responsibilities necessary to obtain his or her target position. For example, a Fellow who enters the Department of Education as a Health Analyst may undertake a Developmental Assignment in a country office of the United States Agency for International Development to see how similar work is conducted in an international setting. The rotations are outlined in each Fellow’s Individual Development plan – a strategic roadmap for the two-year Fellowship also encompassing classroom training opportunities.


**V. Performance Management & Promotion**

*Current practice:* Given that the Sierra Leone civil service is transitioning to a position-based system, promotion cannot be guaranteed. The performance appraisal process, once in full use, will be used to identify capacity gaps and assess readiness for higher positions.

*Options for the SLPSF:*

- **Design a comprehensive staff development plan for fellows.** This plan would outline, for the full two years (or other time frame deemed appropriate by the HRMO): (i) formal training, (ii) mentorship and shadowing opportunities, (iii) indicative rotation assignments, (iv) Fellows’ aspirations in the program, (v) other elements as necessary.
At the end of the two-year program, give Fellows the opportunity to jump one or two grade levels based on their performance, learning, and revealed leadership potential. The PSC and HRMO can collaborate to provide Fellows with an evaluation (potentially comprised of a written exam and interview) to assess their progress during the two year Fellowship. Based on the results of the evaluation, Fellows could be given the opportunity to jump either one or two grade levels. This constitutes a significant incentive for potential candidates to apply and for Fellows to excel.

- Use performance appraisals to discuss rotation assignments and longer-term career plans. These discussions can take into account both personal preferences as well as the business needs of the civil service.
- Assign Fellows “stretch” tasks – responsibilities relevant to the next job level – based on the outcome of their performance appraisals. This would help Fellows to qualify to apply for a promotion in the future.

**Box 7: Branding in the Presidential Management Fellowship (United States)**

The PMF does not offer explicit career development opportunities beyond the three rotations offered over a two year period. It relies on its public relations campaign (via the program website, social media and outreach to universities), extensive applicant base, and rigorous, merit-based selection procedures to create a brand that helps the program’s graduates throughout their careers. The selection process involves multiple stages in which the candidate pool is reduced from tens of thousands of applicants to approximately 400 successful candidates nationwide per year through the evaluation of written materials including writing samples and a C.V., an online personality test, group exercises in which candidates are placed in teams charged with a particular problem to solve, and one-on-one interviews with senior agency staff. Graduates of the PMF are known throughout the U.S. Government as being high-quality professionals and are extremely competitive when competing for open positions. Given that the program has been in effect since the 1970s, there are a large number of former Fellows in leadership positions that recognize the importance of having gone through the program.

5. Feasibility

**Legal:** The SLPSF is designed to fit within the existing laws and regulations governing the civil service, including the Constitution and the Civil Service Code. It does not require any legal changes or amendments to the mandates of the institutions involved. Additionally, it does not require any institutional coordination not already in place (for example, communication between PSC and HRMO for hiring and between the HRMO and MDA for placement).

**Institutional:**
- **PSC and HRMO:** The largest burden for implementing the SLPSF rests with the PSC, and secondarily, the HRMO. However, the responsibilities entailed are consistent with the mandates and current work of both offices. The program is designed to imply the minimum amount of additional work required, however the burden shouldered by the PSC and HRMO will vary greatly depending on the degree of donor assistance (both financial and technical) that is provided. Nevertheless, both the PSC and HRMO are going through a period of rapid institutional change including an expansion of personnel, and in some cases, activities; the SLPSF could well be integrated into the medium-term development plans of both institutions.

- **Line ministries:** Line ministries have strong, yet mixed, incentives to support the SLPSF. They have a clear interest in acquiring high quality young staff capable of fulfilling a variety of generalist functions. Furthermore, these young staff will be well “networked” across government thanks to their relationships with other Fellows and their colleagues in previous rotations at other MDAs. Additionally, line ministries have a long-term interest in building a senior leadership cadre that can replace existing senior leaders as they retire.

**Donors:**
The SLPSF could be attractive to the international donor community in several ways: (i) it is a long term effort to build sustainable institutional capacity; (ii) it envisages a robust structure for open, merit-based recruitment; (iii) it will build a cadre of highly qualified Government counterparts with whom to engage; (iv) it will eventually translate into improved Government performance (in higher quality policies and more effective project implementation). Additionally, it provides opportunities for donor involvement to fund or support via technical assistance various components of the program, such as:

- Financing induction, basic generalist training and depth training opportunities. *This will likely be the most costly element of the program and the area where donor involvement will be most crucial.*
- Providing technical assistance to the PSC and HRMO to carry out program administration, including inter-agency coordination, provision of technical advice on program components, following up on deadlines, and facilitating discussions with political leadership to make sure the program gets the political exposure necessary to maintain prestige.
- Financing and providing technical support for program advertisement, including designing media materials and purchasing print media or radio spots.
- Qualified donor staff can volunteer to serve as Mentors to Fellows in the absence of, or in complement to, senior civil servants to fill the role.
Civil Servants:
Civil servants may have a mixed reaction to the SLPSF. Managers may welcome Fellows as contributing members to their teams. Additionally, those interested in the progress of the overall civil service may see the potential positive impact that Fellows can have. However, there may be civil servants, especially those who have recently entered at comparable levels, who feel they are in competition with the Fellows and due to this feeling, may not wish to work collaboratively with them, or worse, may actively work to impede their development. As part of the overall public sector reform communications strategy, the PSC and HRMO, together with the MDAs, can mitigate these negative reactions by emphasizing the positive benefits of the Fellowship to the civil service as an institution.

Young Professionals:
The SLPSF offers young professionals a unique opportunity to engage in a career in public service. It provides them with training, mentorship, rotations and the prestige of having participated in a selective program, preparing them for leadership in the civil service. Though the salary for Fellows will remain dependent on the salary structure of the civil service in general, the aforementioned incentives offer potential recruits new reasons to choose public service over employment in other sectors. Additionally, it builds on pre-existing incentives to become a civil servant, such as long-term stability (including the possibility of being granted tenure) and pride in serving one’s country.
References


Annex 1: International Experience Briefs

A. Liberia

I. Background

- **Liberian Civil Service**: The Civil Service Act of 1973 established the Civil Service Agency (CSA) and defined the Civil Service as comprising all government employees in the civil administration of the country, excluding elected and appointed officials as well as military and security personnel, but inclusive of teachers and health workers. The CSA manages personnel recruitment, including conducting civil service examinations. The CSA publishes position openings (including in local papers and through radio announcements), evaluates applications (usually senior members of the civil service grade examinations and make determinations), and makes final placements. Although the 1986 Constitution provided for a Civil Service Commission, it was never established. Liberia’s civil service was decimated by fifteen years of conflict and bloated by a history of appointments based on a “spoils system” of ethnicity, partisanship, nepotism and other social contacts. The institution is shallow and reaches only to the level of Director; it is subsumed by four levels of political appointees, limiting the decision-making authority, responsibility, and accountability retained by the bureaucratic and professional arm of the government. To address these historic failings, including outdated recruitment, selection, and placement rules, the Government of Liberia prepared a Civil Service Reform strategy in 2006 and established a Liberia Civil Service Capacity Building Project to implement its reform strategy in 2007. It is unclear how many of the envisioned reforms have been implemented to date, although Liberia has notably implemented a system of biometric identification documents for civil servants in order to weed out “ghost” and duplicate employees. This process, along with pay structure reforms, has greatly improved the efficiency of the Liberian civil service.

- While this brief focuses predominantly on the President’s Young Professionals Program (PYPP), there are several other specialized capacity-building recruitment programs in place, including:
  
  - **The Senior Executive Service (SES)** aims to develop a cadre of top public servants through a “surge” of capacity by recruiting 100 individuals with technical and managerial skills to the level of Coordinators, Directors, or Governance Specialists. Each candidate agrees to a three-year performance-based contract. Successful candidates are provided with intensive training in management skills and public service ethics.
  
  - **Transfer of Knowledge Through Expatriate Nationals (TOKTEN)** was designed by the government of Liberia in collaboration with the United Nations.

---

18 The Civil Service Agency announces positions to the public in waves and receives application letters and resumes. These are passed on to a professional private vetting company for assessment and evaluation. The resulting short list of candidates is reviewed by a Senior Selection Committee, comprised of two representatives from the Government of Liberia (including the Ministry or Agency benefiting from the program), two representatives of the Donor Community (usually the World Bank and USAID), and the SES Program Management Unit. The Committee makes the final selection after conducting interviews.
Development Programme (UNDP). It is intended to facilitate the recruitment of expatriate and local nationals to serve in key government capacities in order to bridge gaps in critical service areas in a sustainable manner. Professionals recruited under this program work from one to 18 months.

- **The Liberia Fellows Program (also known as the Scott Fellows Program)** chooses a limited number of Fellows through a highly competitive international selection process to work directly with Cabinet level Ministers and Senior Officials as “special assistants.” The program recruits both Liberian and non-Liberian Fellows. To date, all Liberian fellows have been recruited back to serve in the Liberian government, including in the role of Deputy Minister. While this program is conducted in collaboration with the government of Liberia, it is not a government project and is funded and managed externally. Fellows must hold either a Master’s degree with one year of relevant professional experience, or a Bachelor’s degree with at least three years of related experience.

- **Liberia Emergency Capacity Building Support Program (LECBS)** is a short-term, catalytic intervention intended to support critical functions of the Liberian government by attracting competent professionals from the Liberian diaspora to take up strategic and policy-oriented leadership positions in the Government.

- **Brief description of history of PYPP:** The President’s Young Professional Program (PYPP) was launched on August 20, 2009 by John Snow Incorporated (JSI Liberia) in collaboration with the Liberian Civil Service Agency and the Ministry of Planning and Economic Affairs as part of a broader effort to strengthen Liberia’s civil service capacity. The program aims to identify and groom young Liberian college graduates for future government service by placing them in various government Ministries under the mentorship of individuals involved in other Liberian civil service capacity building initiatives, such as the Scott Fellows and SES or TOKTEN members. President’s Young Professionals (PYPs) report directly to their assigned Minister or senior staff member. The first class of PYPs graduated in January 2012 (12 individuals). Two other groups are in progress (35 individuals). Although President Johnson Sirleaf helped to initiate the program and actively participates in the placement of candidates, it is not a government project, but is funded by outside donors. However, several PYPs who were finalists but were not initially selected for PYPP’s third class are being funded directly by the government of Liberia to participate in the program. While this is an *ad hoc* arrangement at present, PYPP has begun to work on plans to transition the program to the government fully.

- **Why is this program different from the country’s overall civil service recruitment program?** PYPP targets recent college graduates with a demonstrated interest in government service and a history of community involvement. In addition to passing the civil service examination at some point in their two-year fellowship, PYPs undergo specialized screening and interviews. PYPs work closely with top government leaders and receive individual mentorship in addition to monthly skills seminars. While PYPs are considered to be civil servants and are paid on the civil servant scale, the program is not part of the Liberian government and is externally managed and funded.
• **What about this program is relevant to the SLPSF?** The PYPP offers an actionable model of a sustainable and effective recruitment mechanism for college-educated nationals. It identifies and provides special training to young Liberians who not only provide key services to a capacity-strapped government, but also receive extensive training and mentorship that will make them effective civil servants in the future. The program also appears to be sustainable because it is in line with government pay scales, has already prompted budgetary commitments by the government, and has successfully transitioned 100 percent of its first graduating class into permanent government service.\(^{19}\)

II. Program eligibility

• **What are the main parameters for eligibility?**
  
  o **Age.** 36 years of age or younger.
  
  o **Academic Qualifications:** College degree.
  
  o **Race/Ethnicity/Gender:** PYPP makes an effort to reach out to women during recruitment, but selection is based on merit alone – there are no quotas for any group.
  
  o **Other:** Candidates must be Liberian nationals without a criminal record.
  
  o **What is the process for evaluating eligibility?** PYPP requires applicants to submit documents verifying their academic qualifications, any trainings they have completed, and any prior employment. For candidates in the final rounds, PYPP conducts a basic background check.
  
  o **What are the additional selection criteria?** Demonstrated leadership ability, integrity, honestly, and commitment to assisting with reconstructing and developing a “New Liberia”; a history of community or school service, like involvement in extra-curricular activities; strong written and verbal communication skills; the ability to receive and follow instructions; good sense of humor, open-mindedness, and respect towards authority; punctuality and reliability; commitment to learning and self-improvement; basic computer skills. Candidates must be friendly, patient, fast learners, self-starters, resourceful, organized, and able to work under pressure in a face-paced professional working environment, as well as team players able to function in diverse and challenging working conditions involving people from different cultural, ethnic, social and religious backgrounds.

III. Recruitment

• **How often are civil servants recruited?** Annually. PYPP conducts a recruitment “blitz” (described below) in order to reach all possible interested parties.

---

\(^{19}\) Three out of the twelve recent graduates are being funded by their Ministries to pursue masters degrees before they return to take up their permanent positions.
Where are they recruited from?
- Overall/regional/city-centric/ad-hoc? Nationally, including in remote areas.
- Universities/career websites/others? PYPP conducts outreach to universities, places adds in local papers, radio shows, and online, and conducts recruiting visits all over the country. The program places particular emphasis on using methods known to reach women, like women-focused radio shows.

Is there a mechanism in place to recruit women specifically to ensure gender parity in civil service? While the PYPP makes a special effort to reach women during recruitment, there are no other special measures in place. In general, the Liberia Civil Service Reform Strategy, in line with the Poverty Reduction Strategy, emphasizes incorporating measures that increase the involvement of women at all levels of government; however, de facto measures are rare.

Who is recruited: Specialists vs. Generalists? The recruitment process does not emphasize any specialty. However, the selection process considers candidates’ qualifications in the context of government needs; successful candidates possess specialized skills needed by participating Ministries.

IV. Structure

What is the nature of the legal framework governing the program? No legal framework underlies the program because it is not a government endeavor, although it is structured in order to build on other government efforts to improve recruitment of qualified individuals. The program is operated in close collaboration with the Liberian Civil Service Agency and the Ministry of Planning & Economic Affairs. The President of Liberia makes final placement decisions. These are ad hoc arrangements, although PYPs are formally considered civil servants and there is recent budgetary commitment by several Ministries to support the participation of several PYPs who would not have otherwise been admitted into the program.

What is the timeline from advertisement → examination → selection → placement? Approximately four months, two of which are dedicated to intensive outreach and recruitment.

Who pays for this recruitment program? The Hess Foundation of the United States makes the program possible with additional support from the Open Society Institute, Humanity United, Mailman Foundation, Daphne Foundation, and the Simonds Family Foundation.

What is the government’s commitment to these recruits? The government of Liberia commits to finding Ministry positions for each PYP who successfully completes the program.

What pay structure applies to these recruits? PYPs receive compensation based on the appropriate Civil Service pay grade for entry-level positions.

Do they get a higher pay rate? No.
V. Administration of the Recruitment Exam

- **Is there a filtering process to limit the number of applicants who get to take the exam/move to the next stage?** Candidates are required to submit a current CV, their most recent college transcripts, and three letters of recommendation. PYPP considers all applicants who submit the requisite paperwork. The applicants are considered by a committee comprised of the PYPP program manager and coordinator, the President’s economic advisor, and either a current or alumni fellow of the program, in addition to one or two other JSI staff. Selection is based on considering candidates’ qualifications in line with the stated needs of participating Ministries. Each candidate is interviewed in person. The committee then submits a list of finalists to the President, along with written rationales for the recommendation. The list includes individuals recommended by the committee for specific positions and five or six other top-qualifying “alternate” candidates. The President makes the final acceptance and placement decision.

- **Who administers the exam?** PYPs are required to pass the civil service examination at some point before the end of the program, although PYPP has a stated preference that candidates pass the examination before starting. The examination is administered by the CSA and is separate from PYPP programming.

- **Who funds the exam?** The CSA.

- **Who grades and scores the exam?** The CSA.

VI. Placement and Induction Procedures

- **How are recruits placed in the civil service? What factors determine which cone/MDA they go into?** Since the program began in 2009, PYPs have been placed at the JFK Medical Center, Environmental Protection Agency and the Ministries of Justice, Youth and Sports, Information, Agriculture, Education, State without Portfolio and State for Presidential Affairs, Health, Gender, Commerce, Foreign Affairs, Planning and Finance. Placement is determined by stated government needs and the President’s final assessment of the candidates’ qualifications in line with such needs. Permanent placement is generally with the Ministry where PYPs spend their two years.

- **Do recruits get a say in the selection process or is it matched to their skill-set?** Matched to skill set. Recruits are not invited to express preferences.

- **Can recruits rotate in different departments and add to skill-set and experience or just one department?** No.

- **What methods are used to assess factors that indicate leadership potential?** The national program director conducts in-person interviews with each applicant.

- **What percentage of successful candidates end up taking a position with government?** The program requires successful candidates to commit to working with the Government of Liberia upon the completion of the program. The Government of Liberia has in turn made a commitment to absorb all PYPs into
government service. All of the recently graduated inaugural PYPP class was either hired by their Ministry, or is being funded by their Ministry to pursue a Master’s degree before returning for a permanent post.

VII. Career Development

- **What is the strategy to provide the Fellows with accelerated career development opportunities?** PYPs report directly to Ministers or senior staff and receive individual mentors as well as extensive training.

- **Do new recruits get special training?** Yes. PYPs benefit from the mentorship of a Scott Fellow, or a highly placed senior civil servant in their Ministries (usually a SES or TOKTEN member). PYPP also holds monthly group training sessions on advanced computer skills, basic accounting, proposal and letter writing, meeting planning, and other topics.

- **Is there a mechanism in place for accelerated promotions/pay raises/limited-term to career position advancement?** No.

- **Is there a rotational component?** No.

- **Is there any programming (trainings, social events, etc) for the Fellows as a group?** PYPs participate in immersion excursions that take them to remote parts of the country and provide them with opportunities to meet with local government officials and tribal leaders, business owners, and civil society. PYPP also holds monthly dinners for PYPs and Liberia Fellows (alumni are also encouraged to join), which are informal opportunities to network. The PYPP in-country office also has a small budget to be used for social gatherings during festivals and other special occasions.

- **Are recruits paired with senior staff in mentorship programs?** PYPs receive a mentor for the duration of the program. Mentors provide professional guidance and support and participate in regular evaluations.

- **What incentives are used for senior staff to engage in mentorship?** None. Participation is voluntary for Fellows and is part of the job requirement for any participating senior staff.

VIII. Issues to Consider

- **Why is this program effective?** PYPP is successfully recruiting and training qualified Liberian college graduates to fill key government needs. The recruits benefit from substantial training and mentorship while developing needed skills and relationships for making positive contributions to Liberia’s government. The program has successfully transitioned its first class of PYPs to the civil service in its entirety. Moreover, because the pay structure is in line with the civil service and PYPs receive training and mentorship that complements the performance of actual government duties, PYPP shows great promise in terms of program sustainability. The Liberian government’s recent decision to fund several additional positions for runners-up in the PYPP selection process further demonstrates the positive contribution of the PYPs and the prospect for successful transition to full local ownership.
• What are some of the challenges faced by this type of program in this country? The program is funded and managed externally. While the government of Liberia collaborates with JSI, it is unclear the extent to which it would be sustainable without President Johnson Sirleaf’s specific involvement. PYPP also operates on a very small scale: 12-18 recruits each year. Last, the program makes little effort to promote participation by women, although this may be inevitable given its focus on recruiting highly qualified candidates in a country with low human capital.

IX. Key Takeaways

• What attributes of this program should be considered for the SLPSF project?
  o Emphasis on on-the-job mentorship and regular performance evaluations.
  o Immersion trips that expose participants to all parts of the country, including rural and under-served areas, as well as cultural and ethnic diversity.
  o Emphasis on extensive recruitment to identify qualified applicants.
  o Simple structure. The small size of the program may be a benefit because of the attention and support each PYP receives.

• What challenges does this program highlight for the SLPSF? This program does not have any significant challenges; it may be difficult to replicate because it is dependent on outside funding and organization. However the program director of PYPP believes that donors have been content with the program and view it as providing high returns on investment; he was unconcerned about funding in the foreseeable future. The only issues of note are as follows:
  o Little emphasis on encouraging the participation of women.
  o The program may be dependent on the personality of a sitting President, and may thus experience problems when there is a change in administration.
References
Interview with Frank DeSarbo, Program Director, PYPP, May 8, 2012.
Liberia Civil Service Act (1972).
“President’s Young Professionals Program Launched”, AllAfrica, August 21, 2009.
SJI Program Homepage: <http://www.jsi.com/JSIInternet/IntlHealth/project/display.cfm?ctid=na&cid=na&tid=40&id=6322>
B. Singapore

I. Background

The Singapore civil service is lauded for its efficiency, lack of corruption, and meritocratic recruitment. Most civil service recruitment is conducted by the Personnel Boards of specific Ministries; however, the Public Service Commission continues to manage recruitment for the Administrative Service (“the premier scheme of service” overarching the entire government) and the Auditing Service. The Public Service Commission is a cluster within the Public Service Division, which has authority over personnel management not otherwise devolved to individual ministries and sets related government-wide policies. All civil service openings are posted on the one-stop job portal (http://www.careers.gov.sg) and advertised in local papers. Recruitment is ad hoc and depends on vacancies; government websites emphasize that all qualified individuals will be accepted. The primary considerations in hiring are a candidate’s academic qualifications and relevant experience, as well as the candidate’s past track record, personal qualities (such as leadership) and overall fit to the requirements of the job and the organizational culture. A psychometric test is administered to applicants who pass the preliminary evaluation. The government offers numerous scholarships for university study to develop and recruit the best talent; scholarship recipients constitute the top academic performers and are the overwhelming majority of new civil service recruits (they commit to five to eight years of service, depending on the scholarship received). Once hired, civil servants, especially those in the Administrative Service, may generally rotate through different Ministries (in fact, this is required in the Administrative Service).

- Brief description of history of program: The Management Associates Programme (MAP) was started in 2002 as part of broader civil service reforms aimed at making the government a more competitive employer. MAP was particularly intended to expand recruitment into the elite Administrative Service. One of the MAP innovations was to provide a three to four year window for recruits to demonstrate their potential in order to improve their chances of entering the Administrative Service. Most Management Associates (MAs) are government scholarship recipients, although this is explicitly not a requirement, and the government is increasingly emphasizing recruiting from within the civil service (through nominations). Individuals who are neither scholarship recipients nor civil servants may also apply.

  - Why is this program different from the country’s overall civil service recruitment program: MAP is designed to train and prepare highly qualified individuals and is the primary route into the elite Singapore Administrative Service, which is a fast track program to become top-level managers that offers higher salaries and accelerated promotion schedules. MAP provides extensive training and mentoring, as well as an opportunity to rotate through two Ministerial positions. MAs are eligible for an additional stipend above the baseline pay for the duration of the program.

- What about this program is relevant to the SLPSF? Singapore’s civil service offers an excellent example of merit-based recruitment into a government structure
widely regarded as among the least corrupt and most effective in the world. The Singaporean Government’s emphasis on identifying and supporting young talent through early scholarships may be relevant to Sierra Leone’s efforts to improve human capacity. MAP, specifically, has been successful at enabling the Singaporean civil service to effectively compete with the private sector for top recruits, primarily by offering comparable salaries. Another aspect of Singapore’s civil service recruitment strategy worth exploring is the Government’s decision to devolve some forms of recruitment to individual ministries in order to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of the process.

II. Program eligibility

- **What are the main parameters for eligibility?** All recent or soon-to-be college or master’s graduates may apply to MAP. Ministries may also nominate current public service officers. Additionally, select government scholarship recipients may join MAP directly upon graduating.
  - **Age:** Graduating from University within one year or a recent graduate; no other requirements.
  - **Academic Qualifications:** This is the primary consideration for eligibility. MAP requires excellent academic qualifications: graduating in at least the top third of their class from national universities (NUS, NTU, SMU) or a reputable overseas university.
  - **Race/Ethnicity/Gender:** Program is blind to all such characteristics.
  - **Other:** Singapore citizenship or willingness to take up citizenship.

- **Process for evaluating eligibility:** In addition to submitting an application, candidates are required to submit copies of their identity card or passport and all educational certificates. The application also asks for all prior employers, and at least two character references (preferably a past employer). Each candidate is also subject to a rigorous background check necessary to enter the civil service.

- **Additional selection criteria:** A clear passion for public service; strong intellectual and analytical abilities; demonstrated leadership qualities. In general, the Singapore civil service places a heavy emphasis on evaluating personality types, including in a group setting, and personal values.

III. Recruitment

- **How often are civil servants recruited?** Interested applicants may submit an application at any time.

- **Where are they recruited from?**
  - **Overall/regional/city-centric/ad-hoc?** Recruitment is national.
  - **Universities/career websites/others?** Vacancies are posted to the government career portal and advertised in newspapers.
- Is there a mechanism in place to recruit women specifically to ensure gender parity in civil service? No. Recruitment is based only on merit.

IV. Structure

a. **What is the nature of the legal framework governing the program?** The program was a policy decision reached by the Public Service Commission in line with its constitutionally-derived authority over civil service recruitment.

b. **What is the timeline from advertisement → examination → selection → placement?** This depends heavily on the manner of application (scholarship recipient versus internal nomination versus direct application from the outside).

c. **Who pays for this recruitment program?** Such information is not publicly available, but because the Public Service Division functions as the human resources department for the civil service as a whole, it is likely that it bears the costs. It is possible that individual ministries contribute funding for the MAs placed therein.

d. **What is the government’s commitment to these recruits?** Recruits are guaranteed jobs in the civil service, but not in the Administrative Service – only those MAs who meet all performance requirements for the Administrative Service are invited to join.

e. **What pay structure applies to these recruits?** Recruits receive remuneration in line with their position at the specific Ministry where they are placed. Please note that the Government of Singapore has emphasized benchmarking Administrative Service salaries to equivalent positions in the private sector. Performance-based bonuses are also awarded.

a. **Do they get a higher pay rate?** There is an additional MAP salary component on top of this baseline although the amount is not made public. Moreover, MAs who join the Administrative Service benefit from its higher salary rates and accelerated promotion schedules.

V. **Administration of the Recruitment Exam:** There is no examination for entering the civil service, although there is a comprehensive psychological test comprised of almost 1000 ethical questions. Merit-based selection is based on scrutinizing the academic record of the applicant. Short-listed applicants are invited for both individual and team interviews and sit the psychometric examination. The Public Service Commission is responsible for such evaluation and the ultimate selection and appointment of suitable candidates.

a. **Is there a filtering process to limit the number of applicants who get to take the exam/move to the next stage?** There is no limit to how many candidates will be considered or admitted.

b. **Who administers the exam?** The psychometric examination is administered by the Public Service Commission.

c. **Who funds the exam?** The Public Service Commission.

d. **Who grades and scores the exam?** The Public Service Commission.
e. **Is there a set of specific criteria that graders must use?** This information is not made public but has been requested by the author from the Public Service Division.

VI. **Placement and Induction Procedures**

- **How are recruits placed in the civil service? What factors determine which cone/MDA they go into?** Recruits state three Ministry preferences. If spaces are available, they are matched to their preference. If no spaces are available, recruits are asked to rank their other choices and interview with such ministries to find another match.

- **Do recruits get a say in the selection process or is it matched to their skill-set?** Recruits may express interest in particular Ministries, which will be taken into account. However, the final assignments depend on vacancies at the time of placement.

- **Can recruits rotate in different departments and add to skill-set and experience or just one department?** MAs first spend two years in one Ministry and are then posted to a different Ministry for an additional one or two years. There are four sectors to which MAs may expect to be posted: Economic, Social, Security, and Government Administration/Corporate Development/Strategic Planning. In addition to this standard rotation, MAs may participate in the Gap Year Programme that permits MAs to spend six months to a year working for a private sector organization, either locally or overseas, immediately before starting MAP.

- **What methods are used to assess factors that indicate leadership potential?** Such qualities are evaluated over the course of the entrance interviews, team exercises, and the psychometric test, as well as over the course of regular performance evaluations. Further detail is not publicly available, but has been requested.

- **What percentage of successful candidates end up taking a position with government?** This information is not publicly available, but there is an unspoken expectation that MAs will spend at least one year working for the government after the programme, although not all individuals comply. Moreover, scholarship recipients commit to five to eight years of government work as part of their scholarship bond.

VII. **Career Development**

a. **What is the strategy to provide the Fellows with accelerated career development opportunities?** MAs are screened at the end of the program, and those meeting stringent requirements are invited to join the elite Administrative Service. Others may follow a non-fast track career path within a chosen Ministry.

b. **Do new recruits get special training?** Recruits participate in a nine-week Foundation Course designed to provide them with a “firm grounding in the values, knowledge and skills essential to assume a leadership career in the Civil Service, and to gain a deeper understanding of Singapore and ASEAN.”\(^{20}\) The course includes

experiential components with operational departments, grassroots and social service organizations, as well as participation in closed-door discussions with decision makers, visits to ASEAN countries, and meetings with overseas counterparts to widen the recruits’ regional perspectives. MAs also participate in cross-ministry projects, and policy forums and seminars designed to improve their understanding of reasoning behind public policies. The offered grooming and development programs are as follows:21

i. Pre-departure Programme
ii. Mid-Course Programme
iii. Outward Bound Singapore
iv. Singapore Seminars
v. Student Exchange Programmes
vi. Foundation course
vii. Policy Forums and Seminars
viii. Overseas trips and study visits
ix. Gap Year

c. **Is there a mechanism in place for accelerated promotions/pay raises/limited-term to career position advancement?** Beyond the opportunity to join the Administrative Service and unique training opportunities and a higher pay rate, there are no additional benefits. The Administrative Service itself, because it is a fast track for promotion to top managerial positions, provides specialized training and professional development opportunities in addition to higher pay rates and accelerated promotion schedules.

d. **Is there a rotational component?** Administrative Service officers are required to rotate. The duration of the rotations increases over time. Rotation requirements for specialized posts depend on the Ministries. MAs do two rotations (see § VI. above).

e. **Is there any programming (trainings, social events, etc) for the Fellows as a group?** Most opportunities to socialize outside of trainings and related outings are *ad hoc* and planned by the MAs themselves. The MAs are invited to attend an annual dinner for the entire Administrative Service.

f. **Are recruits paired with senior staff in mentorship programs?** MAs are mentored by Administrative Service officers, who provide advice and guidance on career development and other aspects of the Service. Mentors are chosen from among more junior Administrative Service officers in order to provide MAs with career insights from individuals who have recently considered similar dilemmas. Permanent Secretaries and/or Deputy Secretaries also regularly meet with MAs to provide counsel and guidance.

g. **What incentives are used for senior staff to engage in mentorship?** No special incentives are offered; this is part of the job requirement for participating mentors.

VIII. **Issues to Consider**

---

21 Detailed descriptions of these programs are included in the MAP Factsheet, available at [http://www.pscscholarships.gov.sg/COMMON/Management+Associates+Programme+(MAP)+Factsheet.htm](http://www.pscscholarships.gov.sg/COMMON/Management+Associates+Programme+(MAP)+Factsheet.htm).
a. **Why is this program effective?** The MAP has improved the ability of the civil service to compete with private sector employers for the most talented recruits by providing qualifying individuals with training, mentorship, and a path to enter the elite Administrative Service with its higher salaries and accelerated promotion opportunities.

b. **What are some of the challenges faced by this type of program in this country?** The program may be perceived as unfair by others in the government, who do not benefit from higher salaries and face longer posting requirements. Further, because the program is so competitive, it may be damaging to the morale and internal cohesion of the civil service, as individual officers will face incentives for personal promotion rather than teamwork. Moreover, the program lacks any mechanisms to promote the participation and recruitment of women and other under-represented groups.

IX. **Key Takeaways**

a. What attributes of this program should be considered for the SLPSF project?

i. Recruitment based on academic performance;

ii. Initial training and ongoing seminars; mentorship; emphasis on career development;

iii. Regular performance evaluations;

iv. Opportunity to rotate through more than one Ministry;

v. More generally, it is worth considering other innovations of the Singaporean Administrative Service in designing the SLPSF project, for example, efforts to benchmark pay structures for top managers to the private sector, requiring officers to gain exposure to the local business environment and community organizations such as development councils, and creating less structured promotion schemes so as to avoid frustrating young and ambitious officers. The Jones (2002) article offers an excellent analysis of such reforms.

b. **What challenges does this program highlight for the SLPSF?** This program may be difficult to replicate because it is highly reliant on an excellent educational system, a vast pool of qualified recruits, and a government policy to provide scholarships to high-performing high school graduates, which in turn obligates them to enter the civil service. Moreover, because the focus of recruitment is on academic performance, which may be linked with the social status and wealth of the applicant’s family, this form of recruitment may perpetuate social inequalities and elitism. Last, there are no mechanisms in place to promote participation by women or other minorities.
References:


Interview with Lee Ting Wong, current MA, May 11, 2012.


Public Service Division <http://www.psd.gov.sg/>

Public Service Commission Scholarship <http://www.pscscholarships.gov.sg/>


C. United States

I. Background

- Brief description of history of program
  The Presidential Management Fellows (PMF) Program, initiated in 1977, is the premier program for leadership development in the U.S. Federal Service. It provides Federal government fellowships to graduate students from all academic disciplines as well as social and cultural backgrounds that hold a demonstrated interest in, and commitment to, a career in the U.S. public service. The PMF targets recent master’s graduates, and provides two years of rotational experiences in various government agencies. A four to six month developmental assignment is required during the two-year fellowship. The developmental assignments may vary from agency to agency.

- Why is this program different from the country’s overall civil service recruitment program?
  The Presidential Management Fellowship is intended to be a leadership pipeline. The program competitively attracts talent that might otherwise go elsewhere (such as the private sector). The fellowship has many stakeholders; including its current and past participants, Congress, the President, agencies that hire fellows, and the academic institutions that supply applicants.

- What about this program is relevant to the SLPSF?
  The PMF program is an excellent example of a fast track, equitable and transparent civil service recruitment program for high(er) skilled manpower with leadership qualities across all academic disciplines to help build public sector capacity across agencies in government.

II. Program eligibility

- What are the main parameters for eligibility?
  The program is open to all graduate students from all academic disciplines who expect to complete an advanced degree (master’s, law, or doctoral-level degree) from a qualifying* (accredited) college or university during the current academic year.

  * Generally, the institution must be accredited by an accrediting body recognized by the Secretary of the U.S. Department of Education or must have acquired "pre-accreditation" or "candidate for accreditation status" recognized by the Secretary of the U.S. Department of Education

  o What is the process for evaluating eligibility? (Verification of documentation, etc)
  The selection process for eligible candidates to become Presidential Management Fellows involves several steps:

  - **Application:** Graduate students submit an online application via the USAJOBS website.
  - **Nomination:** The respective graduate school must nominate applicants based on a competitive nomination process.
  - **Assessment:** OPM invites Nominees to an online, un-proctored assessment exam. The assessment includes three main components—life experiences, critical thinking skills, and writing fundamentals.
  - **Semi-Finalists:** Semi-Finalists are invited to an in-person assessment center. Based on performance here, selected Semi-Finalists become Finalists
**Finalist Selection:** Once achieving finalist status, applicants apply for positions with participating agencies in which they are interested.

**Fellowship:** Upon appointment, the Finalists status changes to Fellow.

### III. Recruitment

- How often are civil servants recruited? Annual.
- Where are they recruited from?
  - National – application open to all graduate students from accredited academic institutions.
  - Application available via [www.usajobs.gov](http://www.usajobs.gov). Academic institutions must nominate candidates based on their own selection criteria (e.g., academic standing, overall extracurricular performance, relevant professional and life experiences).
- Is there a mechanism in place to recruit women specifically to ensure gender parity in civil service? Nominations are provided by academic institutions. No formalized system overall to ensure gender parity.
- Who is recruited: Specialists vs. Generalists? Both. Finalists are placed into agencies depending on needs. Some require specialists (e.g., Accounting, Finance, Business, and Economics Information Technology, Environmental Science, Engineering, and Statistics), while others will absorb generalists (e.g., foreign policy formulation).

### IV. Structure

a. What is the nature of the legal framework governing the program?

The PMF Program has a rich history going back to 1977 when President Carter issued Executive Order 12008 establishing "The Presidential Management Intern Program." Three follow-on Executive Orders renamed and refined the program, laying out the rules by which the program would be administered by the Office of Personnel Management (OPM):

**1977, Executive Order 12008**—Established the Presidential Management Intern (PMI) Program. At this point in time, the program was exclusively targeted for management and leadership potential among students studying public management or related degrees.

**1982, Executive Order 12364**—Expanded the program to include a broader range of disciplines and limited the number of interns to 200 per year.

**1988, Executive Order 12645**—Increased the yearly limit to 400 Interns.

**2003, Executive Order 13318**—Renamed to become *Presidential Management Fellows Program*, eliminated caps on participants, and expanded participation to all federal agencies.

President Obama's December 2010 Executive Order 13562 makes additional changes to the PMF Program, which OPM is presently promulgating into revised regulations.

b. What is the timeline from advertisement → examination → selection → placement?

The PMF application/selection process is multi-tiered. It includes the Office of Personnel Management (OPM), graduate schools, and Federal agencies. The PMF Program follows an annual cycle, starting with application and nomination, followed by assessment and appointment, through training and development, then graduation and conversion or appointment to permanent...
positions. The following identifies a typical timeline for the PMF cycle; however, dates are subject to change annually.

**Application and Nomination**
- October 1 to October 15 - Open application period
- October 1 to October 31 - Nomination period of applicants by academia

**Assessment**
The following depicts a typical assessment schedule:
- January or February - OPM conducts assessments nationwide
- March - OPM announces the selection of PMF finalists

**Agency Selection**
The following depicts a typical selection schedule:
- January to March - Agencies post PMF positions in the Projected Positions System in preparation for the Spring PMF Job Fair; however, agencies can and should post positions year-round.
- February 28 - OPM removes current class’ resumes and finalists to prepare website for next class
- March - OPM makes lists of PMF finalists and their resumes available to agencies
- Mid-March to Mid-April - OPM hosts the annual job fair for agencies and PMF finalists
- Until March next year - Agencies appoint selected finalists as Fellows

Agencies have 12 months to hire Fellows from a large pool of finalists with diverse backgrounds and skills. Refer to Chapter 3 (Recruitment) and Chapter 4 (Agency Selection and Appointment).

Who pays for this recruitment program?
- OPM covers the cost for the PMF program.
- The hiring agency must submit the Fellow’s appointment fee of $6,000 to OPM within 30 days of hiring the Fellow or 2 weeks prior to the orientation session the PMF registers for, whichever is earlier.
- The $6,000 appointment fee per Fellow includes recruitment and assessment, participation in the Job Fair, an Orientation and Graduation for Fellows, as well as training and support for agencies.

What is the government’s commitment to these recruits?
- PMFs are hired for two-year fellowships, with an initial appointment at the GS-09, 11, or 12 level, and may be promoted to the GS-13 level, or equivalent.
- Grade setting is determined based on experience and education.
- PMFs are eligible for benefits and hiring incentives.
- After successfully completing the two-year program, PMFs may be eligible for conversion to a permanent Government position and further promotional opportunities.

Specifically, the hiring agency’s responsibilities towards the Fellow once hired are as follows:

---

22 [http://www.pmf.gov/media/970/agencyguide.pdf](http://www.pmf.gov/media/970/agencyguide.pdf)
- **Outline an Individual Development Plan (IDP)** with the Fellow, which serves as a strategic roadmap for the Fellow’s training and development over their 2 year fellowship.
- **Provide 80 hours of formal classroom training in each of the two years (160 hours total)** in keeping with the Fellow’s IDP.
- **Design a Developmental Assignment of 4 to 6 months** that is full-time, outside the Fellow’s normal duties and immediate office, and provides managerial or technical responsibilities to prepare the Fellow for his or her targeted position.
- **Prepare Performance Plans and Reviews** to clarify expectations and potential for advancement; Fellows must perform at least at the satisfactory level for both of the 2 years.
- If the Fellow’s performance meets predetermined expectations, **Convert the Fellow to a permanent full-time position** after certification from the agency’s Executive Resources Board (or equivalent) stating the Fellow has successfully completed the Program.²⁴

d. **What pay structure applies to these recruits?**
   - Generally, finalists are hired at step 1 of the grade to which they are appointed. Agencies have the authority, however, to set pay for new PMF appointments above step 1 of the grade based on superior qualifications of the candidate or a special need of the agency upon a finalist’s:
     1) first appointment as a civilian employee of the Federal Government; or
     2) reappointment to a GS position with a 90-day break in service.
   - The agency may determine that:
     i. the finalist has superior qualifications based on the level, type, or quality of the candidate’s skills or competencies demonstrated or obtained through experience and/or education, the quality of the candidate’s accomplishments compared to others in the field, or other factors that support a superior qualifications determination; or
     ii. the candidate fills a special agency need if the type, level, or quality of skills and competencies or other qualities and experiences possessed by the candidate are relevant to the requirements of the position and are essential to accomplishing an important agency mission, goal, or program activity.
   - In meeting the superior qualifications criteria, the finalist’s skills, competencies, experience, education, and/or accomplishments must be relevant to the requirements of the position to be filled. These qualities must be significantly higher than that needed to be minimally required for the position and/or be of a more specialized quality compared to other candidates. A finalist also may meet the special needs criteria by meeting agency workforce needs, as documented in the agency’s strategic human capital plan.²⁵

V. **Administration of the Recruitment Exam**
   a. Is there a set of specific criteria that graders must use?

Yes. The four steps – Nomination, Assessment, Semi-Finalist selection and Finalist selection – are based on competitive selection processes.

---
²⁵ [http://www.pmf.gov/media/970/agencyguide.pdf](http://www.pmf.gov/media/970/agencyguide.pdf), pg 28
- **Nomination:** The Nomination Official may consist of the graduate school’s Dean, Chairperson, or Academic Program Director. Nomination Officials ensure applicants meet the Program’s eligibility and nomination criteria. The school’s competitive process must cover applicants’
  - Breadth and quality of accomplishments
  - Capacity for leadership
  - Commitment to excellence in leading and managing public policies and programs
  - Students who are eligible for veterans’ preference and qualify for school’s competitive nomination process must be nominated

Students are asked the following in the Qualification Questionnaire:
  - Personal Contact Information
  - Assessment Location and Special Accommodations
  - Indian and Veterans’ Preference Eligibility
  - Geographic Employment Preference
  - Citizenship
  - Languages (up to 3)
  - Graduate School Information
  - Graduate/Undergraduate Degrees (up to 2 each)
  - Date of Meeting Graduate Degree Requirements
  - Key Skills/Competencies
  - How Did Student Hear About the PMF Program

- **Assessment:** Nominees notified to take an online, un-proctored assessment that includes:
  - Situational Judgment Test
  - Requires applicants to indicate how they would respond in a given situation
  - Life Experience
  - Requires applicants to respond to questions regarding their training, experience, education, and life history
  - Writing Sample
  - Requires applicants to write an essay in response to a prompt or target topic
  - OPM selects Semi-Finalists based on un-proctored assessment results

- **Semi-Finalists:** Semi-Finalists will participate in a day long assessment consisting of:
  - Individual presentations
  - Group activities
  - Proctored writing exercise
  - Semi-Finalist’s participation at his/her expense
  - Finalists selected based on assessment center scores

Nominees/Semi-Finalists are evaluated on the following critical competencies:
  - Adaptability
  - Integrity
  - Interpersonal Skills
  - Motivation to Serve
  - Oral/Written Communication
Problem Solving

- OPM will select finalists based on an OPM evaluation of each candidate’s experience and accomplishments based on his/her results of a rigorous structured assessment process.
- An Assessment Study Guide will be posted on the PMF website for applicants.

VI. Placement and Induction Procedures

- How are recruits placed in the civil service? What factors determine which cone/MDA they go into? Once the Finalists are selected, they can apply for positions within the Federal government. Agencies that wish to hire PMFs then evaluate the Finalists’ qualifications and select the best fit candidate for the job. This process can be tedious, depending on agency needs and available openings.
- Do recruits get a say in the selection process or is it matched to their skill-set? It is matched to their skill set, but finalists can chose where they apply for jobs within the Federal government based on their interest as well.
- Can recruits rotate in different departments and add to skill-set and experience or just one department? Yes. A four to six month developmental assignment is required during the two-year fellowship. The developmental assignments may vary from agency to agency.
- What methods are used to assess factors that indicate leadership potential? Covered under nomination criteria.
- What percentage of successful candidates end up taking a position with government? Only about 60% of Finalists are successfully placed in a Federal civil service position every year.

VII. Career Development

- a. What is the strategy to provide the Fellows with accelerated career development opportunities? See below.
- b. Do new recruits get special training? Yes.
- c. Is there a mechanism in place for accelerated promotions/pay raises/limited-term to career position advancement? Not a formal process.
- Those finalists that become Fellows participate in developmental assignments:
  - to gain experience (either with their home agency or with a different agencies),
  - create an individualized performance plan,
  - and undergo 80 hours of formal classroom training per year—honoring their managerial and leadership skills.
- Finally, successful PMFs can convert their experience into a permanent position working for the federal government.
- d. Are recruits paired with senior staff in mentorship programs? The Fellows don’t get mentors per say. But they are assigned to a PMF supervisor who is responsible for developing each fellow’s performance plan based on the Fellow’s current position description (also in charge of training, evaluations and goal setting). This is for the duration of the fellowship.
- If Fellows want a mentor: An agency may already have a formal mentoring program; if not, Fellows may wish to identify an appropriate mentor who possesses desired skills, knowledge, and/or perspectives, and negotiate a mentor/mentee relationship with that person.\textsuperscript{26}

- Shadowing is another excellent way to meet influential people in an agency. Fellows might ask for an Agency PMF Coordinator or supervisor for help arranging to shadow a senior executive or political appointee for a day. Shadowing is an excellent way to observe how senior staff interacts at meetings and deal with crucial issues. Many are happy to help and will also take some time to discuss personal career plans.\textsuperscript{27}

e. What incentives are used for senior staff to engage in mentorship?

VIII. Issues to Consider

a. Why is this program effective?
   - It is extremely systematized and offers a great entry point into civil service – stable source of employment – at least for the first 2 years – with room for full-time employment if Fellow performs as per predetermined expectations
   - It provides an opportunity to nationally recruit talented “future leaders” (although not every fellow ends up with a leadership position) from various universities (although at present, most talent comes from east coast schools) – brain gain – more so than an ad hoc recruitment process
   - The filtering process is robust – relatively much more transparent and fair across race, ethnicity, gender etc to allow for better qualified applicants (except the current system allows for too many finalists and only 60% actually get placed in fellowships)

b. What are some of the challenges faced by this type of program in this country?

Some challenges exist:

Recruitment

• Currently the PMF is focused on disciplines which do not always align with graduates studying public service and policy
• The need of the federal government is very diverse, and the assessment process doesn’t allow for consideration of these needs.

Placements

• There have been difficulties matching finalists with agencies. Many PMF finalists do not find the jobs they are looking for, while some agencies do not find the applicants they need.
• PMF agency coordinators may need additional training. They need to work on managing expectations, as the PMF self-selects Type-A personalities who are often unsatisfied with low-level positions.
• Agencies face a consistent organizational struggle between a desire to use PMFs to augment their agency objectives, and the overall good government objective of the PMF.

\textsuperscript{26} \url{http://www.pmf.gov/media/970/agencyguide.pdf} pg 39
\textsuperscript{27} \url{http://www.pmf.gov/media/970/agencyguide.pdf} pg 41
Tracking PMFs
- Information collection—including the long-term tracking of fellows.
- There is a recognized need for more effective information gathering in order to track PMFs, monitor success, and complete an effective program evaluation. Without this information it is difficult to know how effective the program actually is for workforce development.

Expectations Management
- Some PMF’s do not have realistic expectations about their role, and expect to move into leadership positions much sooner than is realistic.
- The incoming PMFs need to have a better understanding of what they are really doing. In reality, Presidential Management Fellows are not going to be managing anything.

IX. Key Takeaways
a. What attributes of this program should be considered for the SLPSF project?
   - Assessment Test
   - Placement Process – tweak a little to let the agencies drive.
   - Training
   - Developmental Plan
   - PMF Supervisor
   - Shadowing
   - Pay grading

b. What challenges does this program highlight for the SLPSF?
   - In-person assessment center
   - Semi-finalists and finalists stages
   - Recruitment via online website
   - Rotations
   - Raising expectations too high about rate of promotions and leadership positions
   - Figure out specialists or generalists or both? (Depends a little on vacancies in agencies)
References

USA Jobs. <www.usajobs.gov>
D. United Kingdom

I. Background

• Brief description of history of program
  - In the 1960s, it was believed that civil service in the UK was deteriorating. For example, in 1963, the UK Treasury only had 19 trained economists. Fast Stream was established as a response to this perceived decline with the purpose of adding ‘new blood’ to the UK civil service.

• What about this program is relevant to the SLPSF?
  - Fast Stream is an accelerated training and development program for people who have the potential to become senior managers within the UK Civil Service. Other civil service recruitments are carried out by the respective departments in the UK while Fast Track candidates are first selected centrally and are placed in the government departments.
  - Successful candidates:
    o get entry directly at the middle manager level,
    o are provided with a senior manager as a mentor,
    o go through structured learning and development programs,
    o get the opportunity to work in a number of fields (policy development, operational delivery or corporate services) within a short span of time.

• Why we are reviewing this program in relation to the SLPSF project? What about it is relevant?
  - Fast Track was conceived when the UK was believed to be facing a missing middle and upper grade civil servant crisis. Some of the elements of Fast Stream could, therefore, be highly relevant for Sierra Leone which is grappling with the ‘missing middle’ in the civil service.
  - Fast stream could be relevant to Sierra Leone because it is a British colony and the SL public service has many similarities to the US civil service.
  - Fast Stream was also ranked top 10 in the “Times Top 100 Graduate Employers”.

II. Program eligibility

• What are the main parameters for eligibility?
  - Age: Applicants can apply until retirement age of the UK Civil service.
  - Academic Qualifications: 2:2 degree (UK University Grading) in any subject. Various sub-streams have other specific requirements. For instance, to apply for Economist Fast Stream, applicant should hold a degree with at least 50% Economics or a postgraduate degree in Economics.
  - Race/Ethnicity/Gender: There are no specific requirements or explicit diversity policies except the establishment of Northern Ireland Fast Stream for Northern Ireland. Family or ethnic background, gender, appearance, age, sexual orientation, accent, political views, religion, personal beliefs or previous employment play no part whatsoever in the decisions.
  - What is the process for evaluating eligibility? (Verification of documentation, etc): Candidate fills the online registration form where the stream (discussed below) has to be
chosen by the applicant. Upon completing the online registration, the applicant must pass the *online selection test* (verbal, numerical, competency) to move to the next stage.

- **What are the additional selection criteria?**
  - The UK Civil service seeks the following abilities in applicants: think flexibly, lead on decision-making based on evidence, proactive, build trust and develop relationships, make an impact, think innovatively, and possess a good level of self-awareness.

### III. Recruitment

- **How often are civil servants recruited?**
  - Annually but different streams have different deadlines and recruitment timelines.

- **Where are they recruited from? Overall/regional/city-centric/ad-hoc?**
  - As mentioned above, applications are submitted exclusively through the Fast Stream website. Fast Stream is open to European Economic Area (EEA) nationals (including British citizens), Commonwealth citizens, Swiss nationals or, in some circumstances, Turkish nationals.

- **Is there a mechanism in place to recruit women specifically to ensure gender parity in civil service?**
  - There is no formalized mechanism in place.

- **Who is recruited: Specialists vs. Generalists?**
  - Fast Stream recruits both generalists and specialists. Those who are recruited under *Graduate Fast Stream (GFS)* are generalists and rest of the recruits are specialists. There are at least 13 streams and sub-streams, namely:
    - Graduate Fast Stream (GFS)
    - Analytical Fast Stream (AFS): This is further divided into: Government Economic Service (GES); Government Statistical Service (GSS); Government Social Research (GSR); Government Operational Research Service (GORS);
    - Human Resources Fast Stream (HRF);
    - Technology in Business Fast Stream (TiB);
    - European Fast Stream (EFS);
    - Northern Ireland Fast Stream (NIS);
    - Department for Work & Pensions In-Service Competition (DWP);
    - Foreign and Commonwealth Office In-Service Competition (FCO);
    - In-Service Fast Stream Competition (INS)

### IV. Structure

- **What is the timeline from advertisement \(\rightarrow\) examination \(\rightarrow\) selection \(\rightarrow\) placement?**
  - Timeline varies according to streams and sub-streams. Nonetheless, the process usually takes from 7 months to 1 year which comprises:
    i. **Stage 1**: Online registration and meeting the Fast Stream eligibility
    ii. **Stage 2**: Online Test – Candidate has to pass verbal, numerical and competency exam to move to next stage.
iii. **Stage 3:** E-tray exercise (takes place at various places in the UK) – Candidates have to sit for second round of verbal, numerical and competency exams followed by real policy questions to test the ability to process work. This is conducted at various regional centers specified by the Fast Stream administration.

iv. **Stage 4:** Analytical specialist assessment – Exams specific to the applicant’s stream

v. **Stage 5:** One Day Fast Stream Assessment in London

vi. **Stage 6:** Final Selection Board (this is required only for some sub-streams like Diplomatic service)

- **Who pays for this recruitment program?**
  The initial recruitment is conducted by Fast Stream Operations, Her Majesty's Home Civil Service. Subsequently, the salaries of the candidates are paid by the department where they are placed.

- **What is the government’s commitment to these recruits?**
  - After two years, recruits have the opportunity to be considered for a promotion into Grade 7 of the UK Civil Service.

- **What pay structure applies to these recruits? Is there an explicit policy of accelerated promotion?**
  - Starting salaries usually range between £25,000 and £27,000. Pay increases are based purely on performance.
  - Compare this with the UK Civil service median salary (excluding overtime or one-off bonuses) which is £23,760.

- **Do they get a higher pay rate (within the established bands)?** No.

V. **Administration of the Recruitment Exam**

- **Is there a filtering process to limit the number of applicants who get to take the exam/move to the next stage?**
  - Upon completing the registration, applicant must pass the **online selection test** (verbal, numerical, competency) to move to the next stage (e-tray exercise).

- **Who administers the exam? Who funds the exam? Who grades and scores the exam?**
  - Fast Stream Operations, Her Majesty's Home Civil Service.

- **Who reviews the applications? Are there different reviewers at different stages?**
  - The exams before *stage 4* do not require assessors. Only at the *Stage 5* (One day Assessment in London), each group of candidates are assess by three specially selected and trained assessors. Most assessors are either serving or recently retired civil servants with significant policy or operational delivery experience. Some are qualified occupational psychologists with experience in assessing candidates for employment on the panel. The assessors will be given no information except the candidate’s name. They will not have the application form or scores from earlier stages, university attending/attended in the selection process.
VI. Placement and Induction Procedures

- How are recruits placed in the civil service? What factors determine which cone/MDA they go into? Do recruits get a say in the selection process or is it matched to their skill-set?
  - Recruits can state their preference but matching to the specific department is not guaranteed.

- Can recruits rotate in different departments and add to skill-set and experience or just one department?
  - Recruits stick to the same department during the Fast Stream but many departments also offer secondment opportunities. Therefore, during the secondment, they may spend time working in another government department, the wider public sector, Europe or, even, business or industry. However they must gain experience in at least two of the three main work areas within their department: operational delivery, policy and corporate services.

VII. Career Development

- What is the strategy to provide the Fellows with accelerated career development opportunities?
  - After the completion of Fast Track, candidates are placed at least in the Grade 7 of the UK Civil Service.

- Do new recruits get special training?
  - Yes. New recruits go through induction training. Subsequently, on the job training and other formal learning as per the need of the recruits are conducted. Trainings may be conducted within the department or by Civil Service Learning (CSL) which oversees formal training across the UK Civil service.

- Is there a mechanism in place for accelerated promotions/pay raises/limited-term to career position advancement?
  - There is no explicit strategy to provide Fast stream recruits with accelerated career paths, but the “branding” of the Fast Stream makes Fast Stream recruits competitive for promotions.

- Is there a rotational component?
  - Recruits stick to the same department during the Fast Stream and can rotate only within various units of the department they are placed. However, many departments also offer secondment opportunities to other departments or even private sector.

- Are recruits paired with senior staff in mentorship programs?
  - Yes – recruits are provided with mentors during the period of Fast Stream (two years).

VIII. Issues to Consider

- Why is this program effective?
  - Extremely competitive and prestigious program.
  - Successful in selecting high quality professionals dedicated to public service
  - Placement at Grade 7 of the UK Civil service almost guaranteed.
- Informal and Formal training opportunities.
- Opportunity to work in a number of fields in short span of time: *policy development, operational delivery and corporate services*.

**IX. Key Takeaways**

- **What attributes of this program should be considered for the SLPSF project?**
  - Prestige attached to the program
  - Designed during the time of perceived Civil service crisis
  - Selection process: successful advertisement campaigns, designing of the exams especially online and e-tray exam, various streams and sub-streams.
  - Placement: guaranteed civil service post
References
Interview with Clara Barnett, Fast Stream Stage 4 candidate, March 2012.

Fast Stream. <www.civilservice.gov.uk/faststream>

UK Civil Service. <www.civilservice.gov.uk>

Civil Service Jobs in the UK.<www.civilservice.gov.uk/jobs>

E. Nepal

I. Background

Brief description of history of program: The Nepali Civil Service in its present form has existed since 1951, when the Public Service Commission (PSC) was established. It was significantly restructured in 1992 by the new Civil Service Act, which was modernized most recently with a 2007 Amendment. Among other advances, the new Civil Service Act expanded the opportunities for lateral entry of highly qualified and experienced individuals; the 2007 Amendment furthered reforms by creating a quota system for under-represented groups, including women, lower social castes and indigenous groups, and individuals from disadvantaged geographical regions.

The civil service is divided into two main categories: the gazetted class and the non-gazetted class. The gazetted class is the officer core of the civil service, whose recruitment, transfer, promotion, and disciplinary actions are announced in the Nepal Gazette. It is divided into three classes (first through third) and a special class of the highest officers. The non-gazetted class is composed of assistant-level employees and is divided into five sub-classes. Civil service positions (except for the highest special class) are filled by a combination of open competition or promotion in one of three ways: (i) by internal competitive examination; (ii) by evaluation of competency; and (iii) by evaluation of work performance and experience. The Civil Service Act mandates quotas for the manner of appointment by class. Only ten percent of the first and second gazetted class positions are open for lateral entry. Notices for positions are posted by the PSC, which manages all recruitment and hiring, with some exceptions for the Judicial Service.

What about this program is relevant to the SLPSF? Nepal’s civil service is highly functional, especially given Nepal’s recent history of violence and low levels of development. Some of its recent innovations in seeking to promote the inclusion of under-represented groups like women, and minority groups (both ethnically and geographically) are highly relevant to the Sierra Leone context and may be an excellent model for reforms. The role of the PSC in managing civil service recruitment also merits attention.

II. Program eligibility

- What are the main parameters for eligibility?
  - Age Minimum age is 18 for non-gazetted and classless posts, and 21 for gazetted posts. Maximum entry age is 35 for men and 40 for women, with some exceptions, most notably, 45 for gazetted second and first class positions. The age bars apply only for open competition, not for individuals promoted or transferred from within the civil service. It may be worth noting that the compulsory retirement age is 58.
  
  - Academic Qualifications Required qualifications are position-dependent and published in the National Gazette with the position description. For gazetted second and first class positions, the minimum requirement is a Master’s Degree relevant to the position plus professional experience (five years for second class,
and seven years for first class). For candidates with a Ph.D., the required work experience is reduced by two years. Candidates with a B.A. certification may apply for gazetted third class positions.

- **Race/Ethnicity/Gender** 45 percent of posts to be filled through open competition are filled through a separate competition for the following minority groups: between only women (33% of accepted candidates), Adiwasi/Janjati (indigenous peoples – 27%), Madhesi (22%), Dalit (lower caste – 9%), disabled individuals (5%), individuals from “backward area” (4%). These groups also have lower requirements for duration of service before they may be considered for promotion.

- **Other** Disabled and geography (see above). Candidates are also expected to speak both Nepali and English. Nepali citizenship is required. Persons with prior convictions for offenses “involving moral turpitude” are ineligible for civil service.

- **What is the process for evaluating eligibility? (Verification of documentation, etc)** Submission of certified copies of educational qualifications to the PSC is required. Individuals qualifying for posts set aside for minority groups are required to present additional documentation as enumerated in Civil Service Rule 14(4). Candidates must take the qualifying examination, at which point they are ranked based on their scores. Candidates for non-technical positions must take a preliminary examination before they qualify for the written examination and interview. The PSC maintains a registry of candidates who are not offered a position based on their scores and any temporary positions in the civil service that become available are filled from this list in order of merit.

- **What are the additional selection criteria?** Leadership qualities, interpersonal skills, and the ability to handle stress.

### III. Recruitment

- **How often are civil servants recruited?** There is an annual preliminary examination, usually around July or August. Candidates who pass the preliminary examination may apply for positions that open up. The PSC publishes vacancy announcements in its weekly bulletin in the National Gazette, a government-owned newspaper widely distributed in all of Nepal’s districts, as well as in the *Gorkhapatra*, a national daily newspaper. Individuals applying through the minority competition and individuals applying for technical posts do not have to take the preliminary examination when it is required for others.

- **Where are they recruited from?**
  - **Overall/regional/city-centric/ad-hoc?** Nation-wide, with some quotas in place for under-represented regions. The PSC has regional centers in most (possibly

---

28 This quota system was implemented as of 2006-2007. See Civil Service Rules, 2050 (1993) (Amended by Seventh Amendment); Civil Service Act, 2049 (1993) (Amended by Second Amendment).
all) zones of Nepal where candidates for non-gazetted positions may be tested. Candidates for gazetted positions may only take their examinations at the center in Kathmandu.

- **Universities/career websites/others?** Newspaper announcements and the PSC website. Private civil service exam coaching centers offer intensive examination preparation.\(^{31}\)

- **Is there a mechanism in place to recruit women specifically to ensure gender parity in civil service?** Yes, 33 percent of positions to be filled through open competition for marginalized groups (45% of the total open competition allocations) are reserved for women since the 2007 Amendment to the Civil Service Act. The civil service also provides accelerated promotion schedules\(^{32}\) and has a higher maximum entry age threshold for women. Probation periods for new hires are also shorter for women – six months, as compared to a year for men. Moreover, the government has sponsored a series of counseling/orientation workshops in order to encourage greater participation by women. The workshops were put on by the Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare (MWCSW) with outside funding; they provided information about the civil service system, examination schedules, and the application and evaluation processes. The MWCSW also conducts coaching sessions for the examination for women in order to improve their knowledge and skills. Last, the Nepali civil service has enacted a number of other reforms in order to promote women’s participation, including appointing gender focal points in ministries, requiring gender sensitization during orientation for targeted groups, family-friendly transfer, childcare allowances, and even paternity leave.

- **Who is recruited: Specialists vs. Generalists?** Anyone qualified to fill the position based on the posted requirements may apply. Candidates applying for non-technical (administrative) positions must pass a preliminary test, which is followed by written exams and an interview. The administrative service has four sub-divisions: general administration, accounts, revenue, and foreign service. The latter two sub-divisions have separate examinations.\(^{33}\) Those applying for technical positions do not have to sit the preliminary examination.

### IV. Structure

a. **What is the nature of the legal framework governing the program?** The Nepali Constitution places responsibility for civil service recruitment and appointment, as well as transfers and promotions, with the PSC. The Ministry of General Administration (MoGA) is also responsible for leading, enhancing, coordinating and implementing reforms related to the civil service. MoGA determines vacancies to be filled and forwards the list to the PSC for recruitment and hiring. The new Civil Service Act dictates rules applicable to the civil service and was enacted in 1992 under the democratic Constitution of 1990. It has since been amended twice, most

---


recently in 2007. The Civil Service Rules of 1993 further expand on the Civil Service Act. They have been amended eight times, most recently in August of 2010.

b. **What is the timeline from advertisement → examination → selection → placement?** The timeline for outside recruits appears to vary from four to six months (not counting the preliminary examination process, which can add as much as a year), but may sometimes be longer, depending on the position. The timeline for internal recruitment is similar, although may be as short as three months in some instances.

c. **Who pays for this recruitment program?** Funding for recruitment activities is centrally allocated by the PSC.

V. **Administration of the Recruitment Exam**

a. **Is there a filtering process to limit the number of applicants who get to take the exam/move to the next stage?** For posts with a high number of candidates, there is an additional preliminary examination to screen out some of the candidates before the main examination.

b. **Who administers the exam?** The PSC, also known as the *Lok Sewa Aayog*. Old exams are made publicly available for preparation purposes.

c. **Who funds the exam?** The PSC.

d. **Who grades and scores the exam?** The PSC, which maintains a “pool of experts and specialists” for this purpose. They are generally outside “subject experts” like lecturing staff at the national university. An electronic barcode is put on each exam answer sheet by the PSC before it is checked by experts or specialists.\(^{34}\)

e. **Is there a set of specific criteria that graders must use?** The PSC has adopted a “multi-blind” system in order to ensure fairness – the officials involved in proctoring the exams, checking answer sheets, and conducting interviews and written examinations are kept anonymous from one another. Each examination response is read by three different examiners, each of whom assigns a score based on a set of criteria; the score ultimately assigned is an average of the three.

VI. **Placement and Induction Procedures**

- **How are recruits placed in the civil service? What factors determine which cone/MDA they go into?** Candidates apply for specific positions in one of the different sections of the service, which are: Economic Planning and Statistics, Engineering, Agricultural, Judicial, Foreign Service, Administration, Audit, Forestry, Miscellaneous, and Education. It is possible to transfer between the sections, but this is extremely rare. Some sections are more competitive than others, especially Administration, which sees the highest number of candidates.

- **Can recruits rotate in different departments and add to skill-set and experience or just one department?** Civil employees may seek promotions or transfers between

\(^{34}\) *See Public Service Commission Act, 2066 (2010).*
sections. They are required to rotate geographically in order to gain “experience of different geographical regions of the country.”\(^{35}\) Only one such rotation is required within a period of ten years; rotations are generally approximately two years in length. There is some indication in the literature that rotation requirements are not always honored, especially because the point system used for determining performance for the purposes of promotion does not value geographic experience highly.\(^{36}\)

- **What methods are used to assess factors that indicate leadership potential?** Rule 91(4) of the Civil Service Rules, 2050 (1993) states that leadership evaluations are made on the basis of, *inter alia*, “progress of annual programmes of the organization led by the civil employee, capacity of policy analysis, capacity to take leadership in discharging functions, capacity to make decision[s], satisfaction of the service recipients, progress of settlement of irregular amounts, irregular amounts indicated in the annual report of a constitutional body, group work style, professional sensitivity, inter-personal relation[ships] and constructive and creative reforms made in the body in which he or she is serving.

VII. **Career Development**

a. **Do new recruits get special training?** Individuals hired for gazetted positions undergo Basic Administrative Training at the Staff College at Jawalakhel (3-6 months) at some point in their service. Such training is required for promotions and covers both academic and practical subjects, ranging from economics, administration and communication, to skills-based training in leadership, conflict resolution, negotiation, and problem solving. Non-gazetted hires receive in-service training. The Rules also entitle civil service employees who have served the government for at least three years to a study leave for a maximum period of three years during their service period, to be extended by two years if the Government of Nepal finds this to be necessary. Such study must be useful and necessary to the employee’s work. An employee on leave receives full salary if the study is one that is requested by the Government, but not if it is “on personal effort.” The Rules also permit civil servants to apply for leave to serve in a national or international organization if such experience would be useful to the government of Nepal. Such leave may be granted for a maximum of five years. Employees who receive leave are required to return to the civil service for a duration dependent on the duration of leave.

b. **Is there a mechanism in place for accelerated promotions/pay raises/limited-term to career position advancement?** There is no “fast track” program. However, employees who have served in a particular class for five years or longer (this duration is decreased for under-represented groups, see § II. above) may sit for competitive

---

\(^{35}\) Civil Service Act, 2049 (1993), ¶ 18.

\(^{36}\) According to the Civil Service Act, 2049 (1993), ¶ 24 (Amended by the Second Amendment), for promotions based on work efficiency, a civil service employee will be evaluated based on a 100-point system, as follows: 40 points for a work performance evaluation, 30 marks for seniority, 12 marks for educational qualifications, 16 marks for service in a geographical region, and 2 marks for training. Different point amounts are allocated depending on the region where an individual serves, see ¶ 24(C), but the difference in points between desirable and difficult postings is not more than 2.5 points.
examinations to be promoted. Promotions may take as long as ten to twelve years otherwise.

c. **Is there a rotational component?** See § VI. above.

d. **Are recruits paired with senior staff in mentorship programs?** There are no formal mentorship programs within the civil service.

VIII. **Issues to Consider**

a. **Why is this program effective?** Nepal faces many challenges, including ethnic tensions and a fragile peace. In spite of this, the Nepal Public Service Commission is viewed as strong, independent, and reasonably free of political interference; and Nepal’s civil service is reasonably professional and competent. The enacted laws provide for an impartial, independent and fairly managed civil service, although their *de facto* application has lagged somewhat. Of particular note is Nepal’s focus on recruiting women into the civil service, which appears to be paying off, as the number of candidates and hires has risen. The explicit quota system for disadvantaged social groups and remote regions, which also addresses service delivery problems due to language barriers in parts of the country that do not speak Nepali, is another positive feature.

b. **What are some of the challenges faced by this type of program in this country?** The reality of Nepal’s civil service has somewhat lagged behind its progressive legislation. There is a widespread perception that the Nepali civil service is highly politicized, bloated, and ineffective. Civil servants complain that the new evaluation criteria lack transparency, creating a pervasive fear of discrimination. Additionally, frequent reforms, including numerous changes of leadership in the PSC and MoGA, have created administrative confusion. Last, recent amendments provide for an opportunity of self-defense in disciplinary actions. While this is a positive development in some ways, many caution that it has resulted in a lack of accountability such that it is nearly impossible to remove ineffective civil servants.

IX. **Key Takeaways**

a. **What attributes of this program should be considered for the SLPSF project?**

   i. The role of the PSC.

   ii. The gender quota and related programs to encourage women to join the civil service, including gender-sensitivity training for high-level managers and officers, especially ones with policy-making authority.

   iii. The ethnic and geographical quotas.

   iv. Workshops and other outreach for under-represented groups.

   v. Detailed description and rubric for conducting employee evaluations.

b. **What challenges does this program highlight for the SLPSF?** MoGA and the PSC have seen a lot of turnover in leadership, hampering the implementation of
reforms and proper functioning of the civil service. Numerous rounds of reforms in Sierra Leone may create similar confusion and inefficiency.

i. Lack of transparency in the evaluation process.

ii. Appeal mechanisms against disciplinary action that make the removal of ineffective civil servants difficult, hampering organizational effectiveness.
References


Interviews with Mr. Ananda Sharma, First Secretary, Embassy of Nepal (May 3, 2012; May 14, 2012).


F. Botswana

I. Background

Brief description of history of program:

The Botswana Civil Service program in its present form pre-dates Botswana’s independence from the British Empire in 1966. It began originally as the Public Service Commission (PSC) and later in 1986 became the Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM). It was significantly restructured in 1998 by the new Public Service Act (1998), with certain important amendments added in 2000. One of the amendments was a key milestone for gender advancement in civil service; sexual harassment was officially recognized as misconduct.

Currently all Civil Service recruitment, development and training is guided by The New Public Service Act 2008 that commenced on the 1st May 2010. The most notable feature of this act is that performance progression in civil service positions is now based on competencies rather than on the number of years in service. It also reduced probation period for all public service employees from 2 years to 6 months.\(^{37}\)

A large push for these changes in civil service legislation has come from the implementation of Vision 2016. As Botswana celebrates 50 years of independence in 2016, this document lays out a blueprint for government accomplishments in various public service fields. One of its seven pillars focuses on improving public service productivity and delivery. The improved legislation with its various provisions along with an implementation of a Performance Management System for civil servants is part of the plan to achieve this goal.

The public service sector in Botswana accounts for about a third of the total employment and the central government is the single largest employer in the country.\(^{38}\)

There are four types of appointments to the Public Service in Botswana:
1) Permanent and pensionable appointments, which form the bulk of the employees
2) Contract appointments which cover expatriates and Permanent Secretaries
3) Appointments secured by the constitution like those of the judges, the Attorney General, the Auditor General, etc.
4) Non-pensionable appointments.\(^{39}\)

What about this program is relevant to the SLPSF?

Although Botswana does not have a dedicated civil service program like the SLPSF project, the country’s impressive growth post its independence can be directly attributed to a strong and efficient government and civil service. From its status as one of the poorest nations in Africa at the time of its independence to its transition to a middle income country with improving human development indicators, there are many lessons to be learned. Similar to Sierra Leone, Botswana


was a British colony. Both countries gained independence in the 1960’s and their civil service has been built upon a foundation of the British administrative tradition.

II. Program eligibility

- What are the main parameters for eligibility?

  - Age
  
  Any high school graduate (age 18 and above) is eligible for employment in the civil service. All employees are required to retire at the age of sixty (60) years. The DPSM also offers a voluntary retirement program for employees aged 45 and upwards in order to create more opportunities for younger civil servants.

  - Academic Qualifications
  
  Required qualifications are position-dependent and published along with the position description.

Race/Ethnicity/Gender

There are no special allowances made for any particular race, ethnicity or gender in recruiting for the civil service.

However, although Botswana is a parliamentary democracy, The Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) has been in power since the first elections were held in 1965. The BDP is led by a small group of elites from the Setswana community. There is a large overlap between where the bureaucracy and the ruling party have meshed in the civil service. To avoid any potential legalities of discrimination, the Botswana civil service makes allowances for indigenous tribes; if they seek employment with the government, the eligibility standards (education, experience etc.) are relaxed at the discretion of the hiring officer.

- What is the process for evaluating eligibility? (Verification of documentation, etc)

Candidates need to possess the following:

1) Certified copy of valid identity card (Omang)
2) Valid identity card (Omang)
3) Certified copy of degree certificate
4) Certified copy of diploma qualification
5) A complete curriculum vitae
6) Driver’s license (where applicable)
7) Work experience references (where applicable)

---

40 http://www.rrojasdbank.info/devstate/Botswana.pdf
o What are the additional selection criteria?
Teamwork, Service Excellence, Integrity and Transparency are some of the qualities desired in potential employees.

III. Recruitment

- How often are civil servants recruited?
Civil servants are recruited on an ad hoc basis. The DPSM creates and maintains an ‘Establishment Registry’ which details the various positions within the Botswana civil service. It then allocates a specific number of officers at each position/level that a particular ministry is entitled to have on its roster of staff. Based on this number (which changes every time the Establishment Registry is updated), recruitment is conducted. Once recruited, civil servants are on a probationary basis for a minimum period of 6 months and based on satisfactory performance made permanent offers.

The DPSM also recruits on an ongoing basis for the Botswana National Internship Program. This is a unique program targeted at recent graduates of local universities who are unable to find employment elsewhere. These graduates are placed in various ministries and private organizations in which the government has a stake, for a fixed term contract (two years) and a small stipend. They enter into a written contract with the government to this effect with the option of cutting the internship short contingent upon receiving an offer of permanent employment elsewhere. Interns are placed in positions where they can gain more marketable skills and work experience to make them imminently employable.

Interns are eligible for an allowance of P2000.00 on monthly basis as follows; P1800.00 payable monthly to the intern and P200.00 retained and payable at the end of the internship. Accommodation, meals and transportation are not provided.

The primary objective of this program is to solve the problem of high unemployment amongst young graduates in the country rather than create a leadership pipeline for the civil service.

- Where are they recruited from?
  - Overall/regional/city-centric/ad-hoc?
Candidates are recruited on a nation-wide basis with some recruitment made internationally. Botswana is one of the few nations with expatriate civil servants on its roster. This can be traced to the early days of its independence from the British Empire, when local talent lacked the necessary education and skill sets to be absorbed into such positions. Botswana’s civil service up until the 70’s was predominantly white (British) and there were no educational institutions that could cater to the needs of the state. The first generations of Botswana’s public servants were mostly educated abroad at the University of Botswana, Lesotho and Swaziland. These young graduates were placed in civil service positions based on
the virtue of their educational attainment irrespective of whether they possessed any other qualifications required for the position. This necessitated the hiring of expatriates to fill niche positions requiring highly specialized skillsets.

- **Universities/career websites/others?**

  The DPSM conducts information sessions at the local universities for graduate students in their last year of studies. The students are asked to “enlist” with the DPSM and those who choose to register are guaranteed some position after graduation.

  Open positions are also advertised in the Botswana Gazette and on the online job portal of the government website.

- **Is there a mechanism in place to recruit women specifically to ensure gender parity in civil service?**

  There are no specific allotments for gender based recruitment. However, all female officers are entitled to full pay for up to 12 weeks for three confinements (pregnancies.) This includes officers on both probationary period and contract terms.

- **Who is recruited: Specialists vs. Generalists?**

  Recruitment is position dependent.

### IV. Structure

a. **What is the nature of the legal framework governing the program?**

  In Botswana, the DPSM is entrusted with the entire spectrum of civil service activities; from recruitment to retention and retirement. It is mandated to ensure “that the overall Public Service integrity, morale and productivity remain very high”

  Using the guidelines laid out in The New Public Service Act 2008, the DPSM performs the following functions:

  - Develops policies and provides overall leadership on personnel administration
  - Interprets and applies the provisions of the Public Service Act
  - Reviews personnel administration policies and gathers feedback from ministries and via research to ensure effectiveness
  - Ensures welfare of civil service staff
  - Develops a code of conduct and investigates breach of policy by staff
  - Public Service Performance Appraisal and developing sound career plans
  - Develops salary structure and developing, administering and coordinating policy governing public service terminal and retirement benefits

---

41 Interview with Mr. Michael Moleleke, First Secretary of Economic Affairs at the Embassy of Botswana in Washington, DC
42 IBID
What is the timeline from advertisement → examination → selection → placement?
An advertised position takes about two months to be filled, but this is dependent on several circumstances that are not outlined clearly.44

b. What pay structure applies to these recruits?

The Botswana Public Service Act of 1998 is silent as to the details of salary, although section 38 (entitled “Miscellaneous”) permits the President to make regulations for the better carrying out of the purposes and provisions of the Act. A centralized body, the Salary Review Commission, envisages the setting of remuneration.

Another notable feature for salary structure is the base salary competitiveness for senior employees. The government ensures that the base salary (minus allowances and bonuses) for senior civil servants is similar to the salaries of employees at an equivalent position in private sector organizations in which the government has a stake. (For example, mining and water delivery are privatized but the government owns a large stake in both.)45 This leads to a reduction in senior staff attrition by reducing employee flight for monetary reasons.

In 2000, the top salary level in Botswana was estimated at about US$40,235 per annum.46 Certain positions come with the following Fringe Benefits:

- Free accommodation
- Voluntary Medical Aid contributions scheme (50% government subsidy for all ranks and employee pays the other 50 %)
- Compulsory Pension Fund Contribution Scheme (Government pays 15 % of basic salary and employee 5 % of basic salary)

V. Placement and Induction Procedures

- How are recruits placed in the civil service? What factors determine which cone/MDA they go into?

Candidates apply for specific positions in one of the different sections of the service based on openings.

VI. Career Development

a. Do new recruits get special training?

Every civil servant gets a two to three week induction/training within their first year of joining the public service. This induction is carried out at the local Institute of Development Management, in conjunction with the DPSM.

45 Interview with Mr. Michael Moleleke, First Secretary of Economic Affairs at the Embassy of Botswana in Washington, DC
Public officers are also encouraged to undertake part-time studies in their spare time, with reputable institutions, in fields relevant to their work. Conditional upon successful passing of their exams, they are reimbursed these educational expenses.

In addition, the DPSM also conducts in-house training. It receives technical assistance for Public Service human resource development from a number of international development partners including:

- Australia
- Government of the People’s Republic of China
- Commonwealth Secretariat
- Indian Technical and Economic Cooperation-(ITEC) & Special Commonwealth Assistance for Africa Programme-SCAAP
- Japan International Cooperation Agency-JICA
- Malaysia Technical Cooperation Programme-MTCP
- Singapore Cooperation Programme Training Awards-SCPTA
- Swedish International Development Agency-SIDA

b. **Is there a rotational component?**

While there is no pre-defined rotational component in any of the civil service positions, inter departmental transfers are highly encouraged. Those interested in transferring to another Ministry/department are eligible for applying to open positions within their department of interest. They route these applications through their current supervisor who acts as a mentor/liaison between the applicant and the new department of choice. If the new department accepts the application, it will convey its answer through the supervisor to the applicant. This encourages transparency and reduces inter-departmental poaching.

c. **Is there any programming (trainings, social events, etc.) for the Fellows as a group?**

The government of Botswana has approved the strategy for productivity improvement in the public service based on the Singapore model of Work Improvement Teams (WITS.) Work Improvement Teams (WITS) are a group of civil servants or other public officers from the same unit, irrespective of divisional status, who meet regularly to:

- Identify, examine, analyze and solve problems pertaining to work in their division/unit.
- Identify and implement improvement measures.

2-15 members can form a team.

d. **Are recruits paired with senior staff in mentorship programs?**

There is no official provision for mentoring programs.

VII. **Issues to Consider**
a. Why is this program effective?

The Botswana Civil service has come a long way from its post-independence beginning. From a lack of local talent due to lack of educational institutions in the country to its current civil service capacity, Botswana has achieved a lot. Its unique mix of specialized expatriate civil servants and locals has increased the effectiveness of its civil service by allowing appointments based on skill sets rather than just nationality.

b. What are some of the challenges faced by this type of program in this country?

The African Competitiveness report (Department of Public Service Management 1998, p.117) indicates that Botswana’s civil service was rated 15th, out of a total of 23 African countries that have been surveyed by the World Economic Forum. This means that although the overall position was 3 out of 23 African countries (the best after Mauritius and Tunisia), the civil service as one of the determinants of this position did not perform well.

Some of the major challenges that Botswana faces in this regard and can be extrapolated to other countries are as follows:

1) Training and development in the public service has been characterized by corruption and nepotism. There is also a lack of training and development policies and procedures.

2) Training initiatives not aligned with the strategic objectives of the department or ministry) and planning in the public service is not aligned with budgeting processes.

3) Lack of accountability for senior management has led to decreased productivity.

4) The civil service has been too large and bloated leading to inefficiency

VIII. Key Takeaways

a. What attributes of this program should be considered for the SLPSF project?

1) Botswana’s strategy to “enlist” students in their final year of studies can create a very useful database for any project. Conducting information sessions and collecting student CV’s will provide an invaluable internal database of highly qualified individuals who might not get selected for a fast track program but who can fill other positions within the civil service.

2) Creating a well-defined Performance Management System (PMS) along the lines of Botswana’s new PMS. The PMS allows promotions and pay rises to be tied to merit and accomplishment of goals rather than seniority. The defined structure of the PMS system reduces the risk of bias.

3) Competitive salary structure that is aligned with private sector pay scales.


48 IBID
b. **What challenges does this program highlight for the SLPSF?**

1) Poor leadership and mentoring due to lack of defined guidelines and incentives.
2) An increase in scope and size of project to the point of inefficiency.
3) Lack of information accessibility.
References


Interview with the First Secretary of Economic Affairs, Mr. Michael K. Moleleke at the Embassy of Botswana in Washington, DC on 05/20/2012.


G. Mauritius

Background

I. Brief description of history of program:

The origin of the Mauritian Civil Service goes back to the period of French Colonial rule (1715–1810), and the establishment of a Provincial Council, with the Governor as Head and a few employees of the French East India Company assisting in the administration of the island. Over the years the Council expanded and decentralized units were created in the districts. In 1810, with a British takeover, a 158 year long colonial rule led to the establishment of the British administrative tradition on the island. When the island gained independence in 1968, a British official was still the Head of the Civil Service; it was meant to act as a guarantee to the minority groups that their interest would be safeguarded during the transitional period.49

One of the key features of civil service in Mauritius is the establishment of an Independent Public Service Commission post-independence. This commission guarantees that a fair deal is accorded to persons from all groups in the society, in terms of recruitment, promotion, disciplinary action and general HR issues. Appointments to the civil service are of two types:

a) Administrative cadre

b) Workmen’s cadre

Within each cadre, there are several different types of appointments: permanent, fixed term, part-time and temporary.

Service to Mauritius Programme (STM):

The STM is a unique initiative by the government of Mauritius to attract young talent to the civil service. Applications are invited from suitably qualified candidates who wish to be enlisted as Interns to serve various ministries & departments under the “Service to Mauritius (STM) Programme” for a period of 1 month to 2 years, renewable for up to one additional year. The main objectives of this program are:

- To attract the best and brightest young minds to spend some time in the Public Service;
- To enable young people to contribute their knowledge;
- To attract resources for a well-defined task to deal with shortage of skills;
- To provide an opportunity to graduates to gain some work experience.50

II. What about this program is relevant to the SLPSF?

The Mauritian Civil Service has demonstrated a pattern of political neutrality and managerial competence, which is highly attention worthy. The Civil Service has a well-established and

50 http://www mauritius-embassy.de/MOFEDProgramme.pdf
transparent policy for the recruitment of staff. The STM program is also similar in many ways to the SLPSF program and can be drawn upon for lessons and examples.

III. Program eligibility

- What are the main parameters for eligibility?
  - Age
  For most civil service positions, candidates over the age of 18 years are considered eligible. For administrative positions, no person shall be allowed to join the public service over the age of 40 years, except with the authority of the Senior Chief Executive. For positions in the Workmen’s Group, the age ceiling is 48 years.
  
  STM: Candidates who are under 45 years of age by the closing date for the submission of applications are eligible for the program.

  - Academic Qualifications
  
  STM: A university degree with at least upper second division (UK system) from a top University or equivalent (international applicants e.g. a 3.2 GPA from a top US University) and in top 10 of their class (applicants in Mauritius). As an alternative, certification by the Department Head or University Administration that the student graduated in the top third of the class (international), or top 10 (Mauritius), as the case may be. The top third ranking (international)/top ten (Mauritius) would apply to either a first degree or a graduate degree. Holders of professional qualifications in engineering, architecture, IT, accounting and finance or any related fields could apply.

  - Race/Ethnicity/Gender
  
  The civil service in Mauritius is one of the most representative in the world with defined quotas for all minorities (as per the Public Service Commission guidelines.) To quote one example, the judges of the Supreme Court represent all the existing communities as well as a balance in terms of gender. The Public Service Commission itself has members that represent all ethnic groups in society to avoid patronage of any particular group.

  - What is the process for evaluating eligibility? (Verification of documentation, etc)
  Candidates are expected to provide the following documents:
  - Letters of recommendation (where applicable)
  - Degree certificate(s)
  - A completed application form
  - National Identity Number (where applicable)
  - Copy of Birth Certificate

  - What are the additional selection criteria?
IV. Recruitment

- **How often are civil servants recruited?** Civil servants are recruited on an ad hoc basis as and when positions open up. The STM program recruits annually but the time period of recruitment varies each year. Some of the STM applications are also accepted on a rolling basis.

- **Where are they recruited from?**
  - **Overall/regional/city-centric/ad-hoc?**
    Most of the civil service recruitments are made from all over the country. The STM recruits from top universities in the country as well as internationally.
  - **Universities/career websites/others?**
    Open positions are advertised via the Ministry of Civil Service and Administration Reform website as well as in leading newspapers across the country. The STM program recruits candidates from top graduate programs but no specific on campus recruitment is conducted.

- **Is there a mechanism in place to recruit women specifically to ensure gender parity in civil service?**
  All female permanent employees and those who have been in service for a period of more than one year are entitled to paid maternity leaves for a twelve weeks for up to three confinements (pregnancies.) Both male and female officers, who have been in at least 12 months continuous service, are also granted adoption leave on production of documentary evidence.
  Apart from benefits, every effort is made to ensure equality in access to education and training to women throughout their lifetime. The senior-most officers holding posts of Permanent Secretary and above are fairly representative of the various communities on the island. Most remarkable is the fact that among the last six officers appointed to act as Permanent Secretaries, five are women. This shows how through education, training and proper career development, serious efforts are being made to ensure a proper gender balance in the Mauritian Civil Service.

- **Who is recruited: Specialists vs. Generalists?**

  **STM:** The STM program is open to generalists looking to gain experience in specific positions. Certain allowances in terms of requirements are made for candidates possessing specialized degrees like engineering.

  For other civil service positions, recruitment is position dependent. Most of the positions in the Administrative cadre are open to generalists while those in the Workmen’s cadre look for specific skillsets.

V. Structure
a. **What is the nature of the legal framework governing the program?**

All decisions pertaining to employment in the civil service are made by the Independent Public Service Commission as per section 88 of the Constitution in Mauritius. The PSC determines the procedure to be followed in dealing with applications for appointments to the public service, including the proceedings of any selection board appointed by the Commission to interview candidates.

*STM:* The Ministry of Civil Service and Administrative reform acts as the chief recruiting liaison between the various ministries and candidates.

b. **What is the timeline from advertisement → examination → selection → placement?**

*STM:* After the advertised deadline has passed, candidates are shortlisted based on an internal scoring system. The selection panel includes staff from the Ministry of Civil Service and Administrative Reform as well the Ministry which is hiring. Once shortlisted, candidates are called for an interview. However, there may not be any interview when the match between candidate and the requirements of the Ministry is clear. Once a pre-selection has been made, the candidate will need to finalize administrative arrangements including remuneration with the Human Resource Section and work program with the assigned Directorate/Division/Section. If no match is found on work program, the candidate may be referred to an alternate Directorate. Candidates, if selected, will have to assume duty within two weeks after the final offer has been made.

Applications are also accepted on an ad hoc basis for a starting date that is up to one year away from when the candidate would be available and candidates are encouraged to give at least 6 months’ notice where possible before candidate plans to start if made an offer.

c. **Who pays for this recruitment program?** *STM:* The Service to Mauritius Programme is financed by the Government of Mauritius.

All other civil service positions are paid for by the department where the position is based.

d. **What is the government’s commitment to these recruits?**

*STM:* The STM program appointments are for a period of 1 month to 2 years, renewable for up to one additional year. There is no guaranteed civil service position post internship.

For all other civil service positions, appointments to pensionable offices on permanent terms are subject to a 12 month probation period.

e. **What pay structure applies to these recruits?**

*STM:* Interns enlisted under the "Service to Mauritius Programme" are eligible for an all-inclusive monthly allowance as follows:
Under Graduates: Rs. 12,500 – 30,000

Masters: Rs. 20,000 – 45,000

Ph.D.: Rs. 32,500 – 62,000

Post-Doctoral: Rs. 45,000 – 85,000

The all-inclusive allowance is based on the qualification and experience of the candidates. Typically an offer is made at the entry level, however, subject to written evidence (pay slip or tax return or equivalent document), alternative offers or current pay can be matched up to the maximum in the range.

The Government of Mauritius will also refund 50% of the travel costs subject to an upper limit equivalent to US $2000 to foreign recruits provided all documentary evidences are produced.

VI. Administration of the Recruitment Exam

a. Is there a filtering process to limit the number of applicants who get to take the exam/move to the next stage?

Only those candidates that match all the requirements of the position and whose applications are selected by a majority of the recruitment panel make it to the next round.

VII. Placement and Induction Procedures

• How are recruits placed in the civil service? What factors determine which cone/MDA they go into?

STM: Candidates may be interviewed over the telephone or in person but selection may not require interview when the match between candidate and the requirements of the position is clear. The selection exercise will be conducted by a panel of staff from hiring department and the Ministry of Civil Service and Administrative Reforms. After the ‘Pre-Selection’ stage, a final offer is only be made on the basis of an agreed work program with the relevant unit. In this process, typically, preference is given to those willing to serve for a minimum of three months. In general a longer period of service is preferred to a shorter one.

• Do recruits get a say in the selection process or is it matched to their skill-set?

STM: The application form requires the candidate to indicate their top three areas/departments of interest in order of priority and give reasons for their preference. While this does not guarantee a placement in department of choice, it facilitates the decision making.

• Can recruits rotate in different departments and add to skill-set and experience or just one department?
Recruits are committed to the department they get placed into for the entire duration of their internship. There is no rotational component involved.

VIII. Career Development
a. Do new recruits get special training?

In Mauritius, a strategy for civil service training has been put in place since Independence in 1968. The training organized is meant mostly for general service staff, clerical, secretarial and administrative classes while training for certain technical grades is organized by respective Ministries.

Apart from short term training, other programs to gain additional education/skillsets are offered to all permanent employees. Each trainee is required to enter into a bond stating that upon completion of the course will be required to serve for a minimum period of -

(a) three years if the training is of 12 months duration or less;
(b) five years if the training is of more than 12 months duration but up to 36 months;
(c) seven years if the training exceeds 36 months.

STM recruits and officers on probation are not offered any specialized training opportunities other than ad hoc training they might receive on the job.

b. Is there a mechanism in place for accelerated promotions/pay raises/limited-term to career position advancement?

c. Is there a rotational component?

There is no rotational component to the STM program.

d. Is there any programming (trainings, social events, etc.) for the Fellows as a group?

In each ministry and department a senior personnel officer is responsible for identifying training needs. The Ministry for Civil Service Affairs and Administrative Reform is responsible for the preparation of training strategies and programs.

e. Are recruits paired with senior staff in mentorship programs?

The STM interns generally report to either the Director or the Head of the department they have been assigned to. This reporting structure allows for informal mentoring of the interns by the senior civil servant. However, there is no defined program for mentorship.

f. What incentives are used for senior staff to engage in mentorship?
There are no formal mentoring opportunities for senior staff.

IX. Issues to Consider

a. Why is this program effective?

While achieving a high level of gender and ethnic representation in the civil service, Mauritius has members who have also demonstrated an appreciable level of technical competence and an appreciation of the requirements of modern governance.\(^5\)

b. What are some of the challenges faced by this type of program in this country?

One of the challenges to the STM program is the lack of a comprehensive career trajectory. Interns are not guaranteed a “fast track” into civil service leadership programs not offered permanent positions based on performance. This can lead to a higher rate of attrition amongst interns as well affect performance and motivation.

The STM program also does not have a defined recruitment timeline. Recruitment months differ from year to year making it difficult for potential candidates to account for the recruitment schedule in their planning.

There is no formalized mentoring process for the new recruits making each interns experience dependent on the department they’ve been assigned.

X. Key Takeaways

a. What attributes of this program should be considered for the SLPSF project?

The STM program hires on the basis of merit and excellence instead of just considering nationality. By opening up positions to international candidates, Mauritius attracts global talent and creates a civil service that is competent and non-partisan. The SLPSP project should consider hiring international candidates.

The appointment of an independent body (The Public Service Commission) that oversees all aspects of civil service recruitment can lead to a transparency and accountability.

b. What challenges does this program highlight for the SLPSF?

- Lack of clear trajectory for program candidates
- A variable recruitment schedule
- Lack of mentoring leading to differing quality of program experience

References


Government of Mauritius Public Service Commission application form.
<http://www.gov.mu/portal/goc/psc/file/New-PSC%20Form%207.pdf>

Government of Mauritius
<http://www.gov.mu/portal/site/MOFSite?content_id=6b760809a5f6b110VgnVCM100000a4a8c0RCRD>