



Project Information Document (PID)

Appraisal Stage | Date Prepared/Updated: 23-Feb-2022 | Report No: PIDA32711



BASIC INFORMATION

A. Basic Project Data

Country Chad	Project ID P175803	Project Name CHAD Improving Learning Outcomes Project	Parent Project ID (if any)
Region AFRICA WEST	Estimated Appraisal Date 07-Feb-2022	Estimated Board Date 14-Apr-2022	Practice Area (Lead) Education
Financing Instrument Investment Project Financing	Borrower(s) REPUBLIC OF CHAD	Implementing Agency Ministry of Education and Civic Promotion, Ministry of Economy and Development Planning	

Proposed Development Objective(s)

The Project Development Objective is to increase access to primary education and the quality of teaching for literacy and numeracy, and to strengthen key management systems

Components

- Component 1: Strengthening the quality of teaching
- Component 2: Improving access to learning
- Component 3: Strengthening recruitment and financing of teachers
- Component 4: Capacity building, project management, monitoring and evaluation
- Component 5: Contingent Emergency Response Component

PROJECT FINANCING DATA (US\$, Millions)

SUMMARY

Total Project Cost	150.00
Total Financing	150.00
of which IBRD/IDA	150.00
Financing Gap	0.00

DETAILS



World Bank Group Financing

International Development Association (IDA)	150.00
IDA Grant	150.00

Environmental and Social Risk Classification

Moderate

Decision

The review did authorize the team to appraise and negotiate

Other Decision (as needed)

B. Introduction and Context

Country Context

1. **Chad is a landlocked, low-income country of 15.9 million people.** It is administratively divided into 23 regions located in three main geographical zones: a desert zone in the north, an arid Sahelian belt in the center, and a more fertile savanna zone in the south. Its gross domestic product (GDP) per capita (in constant 2010 US dollars) was US\$710 in 2019, which is lower than the average in low-income countries (US\$840) and in Sub-Saharan Africa (US\$1,590). The annual population growth in Chad is 3.1 percent. Two-thirds of the population are under the age of 25 and 77 percent live in rural areas. It is the third largest country by land mass in Sub-Saharan Africa, and it has a relatively low population density of 12.3 persons per square kilometer.

2. **The economy is dominated by agriculture and extractive industries, mainly oil.** The economy grew robustly during the period of 2010–2014 (roughly 7 percent per annum) but was hit hard by the collapse in oil prices in 2014–2015, which introduced a period of low and negative growth such that in real terms, GDP per capita in 2020 (US\$635) was less than in 2011 (US\$700).¹ Moreover, 42 percent of the population lives below the national poverty line.² While the country is slowly urbanizing (an increase of 1.4 percentage points in the past 10 years), agriculture is expected to remain the largest source of employment for the foreseeable future.

¹ World Bank (2021). World Development Indicators (database). GDP per capita (constant 2015 US\$). See <https://databank.worldbank.org/reports.aspx?source=2&series=NY.GDP.MKTP.KD&country=TCD>

² World Bank (2018). World Development Indicators (database). "Poverty Headcount Ratio at National Poverty Lines." <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SI.POV.NAHC>.



3. **The extreme vulnerability of the Chadian economy to external shocks makes it difficult to sustainably finance development, especially in the social sectors** (as social spending serves as an adjustment variable in times of economic crises). To move the country's economic growth rate from around 2 percent in 2017 to more than 8 percent per year until 2030, the country developed an Industrialization and Economic Diversification Master Plan (PDIDE) in 2020.³ This plan builds on four priority areas: governance, infrastructure, financing, and human capital.

4. **The country's Human Capital Index (HCI) has remained low during the last decade.** The HCI for Chad went from 0.29 in 2010 to 0.30 in 2020. Despite this small increase, Chad's HCI is lower than the average for Sub-Saharan Africa and for low-income countries⁴. This means that a child born in Chad today will be 30 percent as productive when she/he grows up as could be if enjoying complete education and full health. This is driven largely by the low probability of survival to age 5 (88 per 100 children born), high levels of stunting (40 percent of children), and poor enrollment and quality of education. In fact, a child in Chad can be expected to complete only 5.3 years of school by the age of 18. Factoring in what is actually learned, this is the equivalent of only 2.8 years. An additional reduction in years of schooling is expected given school closures during the COVID-19 pandemic.⁵).

5. **Chad is highly vulnerable to climatic shocks** (including prolonged droughts, yearly floods, wind erosion and desertification) which contribute to recurrent food crises and population displacements. In its western, northern and eastern provinces, temperature increases are projected to be 1.5 times higher than in the rest of the world. Chad faces severe environmental degradation, exemplified by the drying up of Lake Chad, increased desertification, declining fish stocks, disappearance of certain animal and plant species, and soil degradation. Chad's annual rainfall has increased since the 1990s. In 2020, the rainy season was marked by record rainfall in most of Chad and across the Sahel. Floods affected 20 out of 23 provinces and 388,000 people, mainly in the central, eastern and southern provinces.

6. **Chad is also subject to repeated security threats** including Boko Haram and al Qaida in the Islamic Maghreb, and is classified as a Fragility, Conflict and Violence (FCV) country. As of June 30, 2021, there were 508,307 refugees (mainly from Sudan and the Central African Republic), and 401,511 internally displaced persons.⁶ This creates additional pressure for an education system which is already under-resourced.

³ See United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (2020): <https://www.un.org/africarenewal/news/last-sprint-toward-chads-new-industrial-masterplan>.

⁴ World Bank Human Capital Project Report (2020). A child born in Chad today will be 30 percent less productive when she grows up than she could be if she were able to enjoy full health and complete education.

⁵ After the first confirmed case of COVID-19 on March 20, 2020, all schools were temporarily closed and resumed only at the beginning of the following school year in September 2020. Grades 6, 9, and 12 were the exception, as they resumed at the end of June 2020. Approximately 69,576 teachers and 3 million learners were affected (2.4 million students in primary school, 0.5 million in secondary and 40,000 in higher education).

⁶ United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), Operational Data Portal. See <https://data2.unhcr.org/en/situations>.



Sectoral and Institutional Context

7. **System size and coverage.** Preprimary education covers children ages 3–5, and formally lasts 3 years. In 2019/20 there were 382 preprimary schools enrolling less than 20,000 children (with a Gross Enrollment Rate (GER) of 1.1 percent).⁷ Primary education lasts 6 years, covering children ages 6–11. The primary school system in 2019/2020 encompassed 11,769 schools enrolling over 2.6 million students of which 57 percent were enrolled in public schools, 27 percent in community schools and 16 percent in private (secular and denominational) schools. The GER was 91.3 percent in 2019/20, with a substantial disparity between girls (80.4 percent) and boys (102.1 percent). According to a 2019 household survey, the Net Enrollment Rate (NER) was 43 percent.⁸ The main reason for the low NER is the proportion of children of primary-school age who had never enrolled in primary school (46.8 percent / 51.0 percent for boys and girls respectively), followed by those who had dropped out (3.5 percent / 3.3 percent). In brief, roughly half of all children of primary school age, equivalent to approximately 1.5 million children, are not at primary school. Of these, 40.0 percent attend a Quranic school.⁹ Amongst children of primary school age who never attended school, opportunity costs were cited by 27.0 percent / 26.1 percent (boys/girls); while among those who dropped out, by 49.1 percent / 33.8 percent.

8. **There are substantial disparities in enrollment by household wealth and region.** According to 2019 household survey data, the net primary attendance rate for the richest quintile (69.4 percent) was more than three times higher than for the poorest quintile (21.3 percent). The urban and rural net primary attendance rates were 63.5 percent and 38.6 percent, respectively.¹⁰

9. **About half of enrolled children complete the primary cycle, and less than one fifth of grade 6 students achieve a satisfactory level of literacy and numeracy.** The 2019/20 repetition rate in grade 1 was 17.0 percent with a steady decline by grade reaching 14.3 percent in grade 6. The drop-out rate in grade 1 was 16.7 percent; varying from 12 percent to 15.7 percent in grades 2 to 5; and reaching 24.1 percent in grade 6. According to administrative data, the primary completion rate was 44.7 percent, ranging from 7.9 percent in Barh El Gazal to 96.1 percent in N'Djamena. The completion rate was much higher for boys (52.8 percent) than girls (36.8 percent). Household survey data from 2019 indicated that the completion rate may be lower, at 27 percent.¹¹ At the end of primary, only 22.1 percent and 11.5 percent of students achieved a satisfactory level of reading and mathematics competency, respectively, according to the PASEC international learning outcomes survey conducted in 2019.¹² Learning outcomes are markedly higher in urban than rural schools; and among children in the highest socioeconomic bracket. Among primary-school age children who drop-out, 29.1 percent of boys and 24.2 percent of girls

⁷ *Annuaire Statistique Scolaire* (2019–2020). Unless otherwise indicated, all data pertaining to system characteristics are taken from this source.

⁸ MICS6-Tchad (2019). *Enquête par grappes à indicateurs multiples*, Janvier 2019. Hereafter referred to as MICS (2019). Administrative data calculates the NER at 75.4 percent.

⁹ *Enquête sur la Consommation des ménages et le le Secteur Informel au Tchad*—ECOSIT IV. Hereafter referred to as ECOSIT IV (2018–2019).

¹⁰ MICS (2019).

¹¹ MICS (2019).

¹² PASEC (2019). *Qualité des Systèmes Éducatifs en Afrique SubSaharienne Francophone. Performances et Environnement de l'Enseignement-Apprentissage au Primaire*. Hereafter referred to as PASEC (2014) or PASEC (2019), the years in which the learning outcomes surveys were conducted.



cite lack of learning as a reason. Learning Poverty (LP) is very high, at 98.0 percent, meaning that almost no child can read and understand a simple age-appropriate text at age 10. This LP level is 11 percentage points worse than the average for the Sub-Saharan Africa region and 8 percentage points worse than the average for other low-income countries.

10. **Remedial programs to help children return to school or accelerate learning are not fully functional.** There are two types of programs: a four-year non-formal basic education program which targets children ages 9–14, and an adult education program for those that are above 14 years of age. Coverage of these programs is limited, with the former operating only 23 centers with 2,126 learners.

11. **There are several proximate causes that help to explain the situation outlined thus far.**

- a. ***Learning environment:* The school network is not fully accessible and is in poor condition.** Among children of primary school age who have never enrolled, 45.6 percent /39.6 percent (boys/girls) cite school inaccessibility as a reason. For those who dropped out, the figures are 3.7 percent / 2.5 percent.¹³ Only 60.0 percent of primary schools were full cycle in 2019/20; the remaining were incomplete. In classrooms with more than 55 students, that is, in roughly half of the system’s classrooms, space constraints would not allow one to fit in sufficient furniture, even if it were available. Considering only available table-benches, there was only 1 seating place for every 4 students. Approximately 20.0 percent of available furniture was in poor condition. Only 50.0 percent of the classrooms are constructed from baked or dried bricks, with the same proportion being classified as in a bad physical state. There are on average 63 students per latrine seat. Roughly 50.0 percent schools have a water source from a tap or pump; another 45.0 percent have water brought to the school; and 4.0 percent report no access to water. Only 40.0 percent have handwashing facilities. This inadequacy of inputs is especially preoccupying given the rapid demographic growth which makes it difficult for the education system to keep up. The primary school age cohort is currently increasing by roughly 70,000 children each year.¹⁴ Assuming 40 children per classroom/teacher, there is an annual need to recruit 1,750 teachers and construct 1,750 classrooms.
- b. ***Learners:* Those that enter school are poorly prepared to learn and are taught in a language they do not understand.** Roughly 40 percent of children under five years old are either moderately or severely stunted. Despite the positive correlation of pre-primary education and primary school completion and learning, very few children access pre-primary.¹⁵ Further, children do not have resources such as books to engage with learning at home or in their communities. Once in school, the official languages of instruction are French and Arabic, though these are rarely spoken in the home. As a result, almost all children are taught in a language with which they are unfamiliar. While there are an estimated 130 national languages spoken (other than French and Arabic),¹⁶

¹³ ECOSIT IV (2018–2019).

¹⁴ World Bank (n.d.). – Health, Nutrition and Population Statistics (database). See <https://databank.worldbank.org/source/health-nutrition-and-population-statistics>.

¹⁵ The PASEC 2019 showed that children who attended preschool performed significantly better in grade 2, although effects seem to have disappeared by grade 6. A full diagnostic of the sector is needed to inform the expansion of preeschool.

¹⁶ David M. Eberhard, Gary F. Simons, and Charles D. Fennig (2009). *Ethnologue: Languages of the World*. Dallas, Texas: SIL International. See the languages of Chad, <http://www.ethnologue.com/>.



some are more common than others. In line with education law that permits the use of these languages, some have been piloted for primary school instruction for the first 3–4 years before transitioning to French or Arabic, with a positive impact upon learning.¹⁷

- c. **Financing: Education budgets are inadequate.** Public spending on education was the equivalent of 2 percent of GDP and education expenditures constituted only 12 percent of total government expenditures in 2019,¹⁸ well below those recommended by the Global Partnership for Education (5 percent and 20 percent, respectively). Education expenditures are fragile and susceptible to shocks. In 2015–2016, due to the collapse in oil prices, roughly one quarter of all primary schools closed.¹⁹ By 2017, the primary GER had plummeted to 79 percent, wiping out the gains of the previous decade.²⁰ Salaries constitute roughly 90 percent of expenditures, and contributions and grants make up about 7 percent. Only 3 percent is spent on services, goods and materials, and investments.
- d. **Teachers: The lack of resources has resulted in a system that relies heavily on community teachers (CTs.)** There is a wide variety in recruitment and salary practices. In 2019/20, 35 percent of teachers were *instituteurs*, with the remainder being CTs. *Instituteurs* (which can either be *instituteurs* or *instituteurs adjoints*) are recruited into the civil service upon ENIB graduation. They are paid on average US\$331 per month (excluding indemnities) from the government budget. CTs are hired by the community using whatever criteria and procedures they deem appropriate. Teachers are paid from different sources: 65 percent are paid by parents and the community, 26 percent by Development Partners (DPs), 8 percent by the state (categorized in the budget as subsidies), and 1 percent from other sources. There are three categories of CTs (*maitre communautaires*, MCs) that vary in their level of education and income: MC2 teachers (10,532) are ENIB graduates but not civil servants; they are paid US\$103 per month, mainly by donor partners, and may also receive supplements from the community. MC1 teachers (8,853) have no formal teaching qualifications but have undergone donor partner-financed in-service training (90 days); they are paid approximately US\$51 per month, mainly by donor partners, and again may receive community top-ups. Finally, MC0 teachers (8,882) have neither formal teaching qualification nor in-service training, and are paid about US\$14 per month by the community.²¹

12. **The teaching force is not deployed according to needs.** The overall student-teacher ratio was 55:1 in 2020, ranging from 33:1 in Borkou to 95:1 in Kanem, and being much higher in rural areas than in and urban areas (59:1 vs 50:1)²². Given that 63 percent of students are in rural areas, a need-based distribution of personnel would entail roughly the same percentage for teachers. However, only 27 percent of *instituteurs* and *instituteurs adjoints* are posted in rural areas. This is offset by a distribution

¹⁷Djarangar Issa (2011). *Évaluation de la Sous-Composante 'Enseignement en Langues Nationales*. N'Djamena : MENPC.

¹⁸ Markus Kitzmuller and Olanrewaju Kassim (2019). *Chad Public Expenditure Analysis 2019: Fiscal Space for Productive Social Sectors Expenditure*. (Washington, DC: World Bank).

¹⁹ Projet de Renforcement de l'Éducation et de l'Alphabétisation au Tchad (PREAT), Avril 2019, 12. See <https://www.globalpartnership.org/sites/default/files/document/file/2019-11-Documents-programme-preat-tchad-pme.pdf>.

²⁰ World Bank (2017). World Development Indicators(database). <https://datatopics.worldbank.org/world-development-indicators/>.

²¹ Salaries converted to US\$ at 580 FCFA/US\$.

²³ MICS 2019.



of community teachers which favors rural areas, where 65 percent of MC2, 79 percent of MC1, and 85 percent of MC0 teachers are posted.

13. **The high reliance on CTs brings instability into the system and represents an important burden for low-income families.** A 2019 survey indicated that 70 percent of school children ages 7–14 experienced classroom stoppages during the school year due to teacher absence; the other most common reason given were strikes (66 percent).²³ In fact, the government's decision to stop paying CTs subsidies in July 2014 led to the closure of more than 2,000 schools and an increase in out of school children of more than 350,000. PARSET2 funded a census of CTs and paid CTs subsidies in 2018. Thus, between 2018 and 2020, schools reopened and nearly 475,000 children returned to schools. However, the reliance on CTs represents a risk for the continuity of the education sector. Further, the payment of MC0 teachers represents a burden for poor families that might constraint enrollment. In fact, the two main school factors contributing directly to household costs are teacher remuneration and school operating costs.

14. **Human resources in primary education are not well-managed.** This is evidenced in the fact that only 20 percent of teachers are female and that the teaching force is not deployed according to needs. The overall student-teacher ratio was 55:1 in 2020, ranging from 33:1 in Borkou to 95:1 in Kanem, and being much higher in rural areas than in and urban areas (59:1 vs 50:1)²⁴. Given that 63 percent of students are in rural areas, a need-based distribution of personnel would entail roughly the same percentage for teachers. However, only 27 percent of *instituteurs* and *instituteurs adjoints* are posted in rural areas. This is offset by a distribution of community teachers which favors rural areas, where 65 percent of MC2, 79 percent of MC1, and 85 percent of MC0 teachers are posted.

15. **Financial mechanisms to pay teacher salaries need strengthening.** The reach of the banking network is such that many teachers must travel substantial (and costly) distances to receive their salary, while banks themselves face hazardous conditions in setting up decentralized pay-points. DPs that finance community teacher salaries have established mobile money systems, and there may be room for their more widespread use in areas where the banking network is poorly developed.

16. **Foundational teacher training needs to be strengthened.** A *Certificat élémentaire de fin d'études normales* (CEFEN diploma) is needed to formally qualify as a primary school teacher. It is conferred by the *Ecole Normale d'Instituteurs Bilingues* (ENIB) after successful completion of a two-year course. ENIBs are unevenly, and for the most part, inadequately funded. Most do not have their own buildings, premises are generally in poor condition, and half are overcrowded. Design and delivery of the ENIB curriculum needs to be strengthened, particularly pertaining to pedagogical approach, language and subject mastery, digital competencies, and practical training.

17. **In-service training is limited and heavily reliant upon DP financing.** Training consists of pedagogical days, which are periodically organized at the local level by the Ministry of National Education and Civic Promotion (MENPC). The trainings are designed to address, in a very short time (1–2 days), locally identified pedagogical shortcomings. Their effectiveness is not clear; they are not systematically

²³ MICS 2019.

²⁴ *Enquête sur la Consommation des ménages et le le Secteur Informel au Tchad*—ECOSIT IV. Hereafter referred to as ECOSIT IV (2018–2019).



linked to follow up exercises in-school to reinforce the training, and participant feedback suggests that they are to some extent disconnected from classroom realities. Professional development activities at school level are rare, and there is no policy framework to promote them.

18. **Systems for career advancement and continuous professional development are poorly developed and linked.** The professional standards framework requires amplification to make the progressively higher professional standards that teachers should achieve as they advance in their career more explicit. Further, assessment mechanisms need to be strengthened to better measure teacher's performance against standards. As it is, *instituteurs* have little or no incentive — whether it be status or money — to participate in in-service training or otherwise work at their own professional development. While local inspectors may occasionally observe teachers, they do not do so in a structured manner, and the feedback they give is often punitive rather than supportive. Similarly, school directors generally lack the ability and motivation to observe and mentor their teachers in a structured, standard-based manner. The situation is somewhat different for CTs, as MCO CTs are eager to complete a one-time in-service training that may qualify them for a higher MC1 salary, while MC1 teachers are incentivized to complete ENIB training.

19. **As a result, teachers have weak pedagogical skills and often do not master course content.** In a 2019 competency test, primary teachers had the second lowest score in reading comprehension among the 14 participating countries: 38 percent were at level 1 or below compared to 17 percent for all participating countries. Chad's score was also the second lowest in terms of the pedagogy of reading comprehension. There were similar weaknesses in mathematical competencies. While teachers with a university degree performed markedly better than those with a secondary diploma, there was little difference between teachers based on years of work experience.²⁵

20. **Natural disasters: Regular and sudden natural disasters weaken the education system.** The increasing intensity and frequency of floods pose a threat to community infrastructure and affects the well-being of children, impacting their access to food, health, school, clean water and sanitation, and physical and social security. For instance, many parents survived the 2020 floods in Chad by using the savings meant for their children's education. Moreover, many children were forced to start their school a year later, as their schools were occupied by displaced populations.

C. Proposed Development Objective(s)

Development Objective(s) (From PAD)

21. The Project Development Objective (PDO) is to increase access to primary education and the quality of teaching for literacy and numeracy, and to strengthen key management systems.²⁶

Key Results

- Increase in Percentage of grade 2 students who score at least 80% in literacy

²⁵ PASEC 2019.

²⁶ Key management systems refer to the management of community teachers and EMIS



- Out-of-school children of primary school age who received remedial primary education in literacy and numeracy receiving remedial education
- Students studying in new furnished classrooms with access to new latrine blocks
- Percentage of qualified primary community teachers who receive a subsidy or salary financed from the state budget



D. Project Description

22. **The proposed project will be implemented over a five-year period and will be the first education project in Chad to combine traditional investment financing with a results-based approach.** Components 1, 2 and 4 will follow a traditional reimbursement mode based on statements of expenditure upon completion of activities. The components address critical determinants of poor system coverage and efficiency, aiming to make teaching more effective in support of literacy and numeracy, to increase access to adequate learning environments, and to support project implementation. Component 3 will use a results-based financing modality to alleviate the inequitable and access-hindering burden of fees upon households, and to place community schools and teachers on a stronger and more sustainable financial basis, by incorporating community teachers into the state-funded educational system. Component 5 is a contingency emergency response component aimed at helping the government improve response times in the event of future situations in which urgent assistance is needed.

23. The project's design is attuned to the country's FCV status, principally in three areas (the final component notwithstanding). First, it seeks to strengthen local capacities to execute critical education system functions, building on what is locally available and given the precarity of state resources. In particular, component 1 supports a model of continuous professional development that is centered in the school and draws on local networks of pedagogical support; and component 2 mobilizes the community to support expanded access. Second, component 2 includes an initiative to provide accelerated instruction to primary school-age children who are out-of-school, including children who are refugees or internally displaced. Finally, the release of funds against certain performance-based condition targets (PBCTs) in component 3 will be advanced (subject to later verification), so as to alleviate constraints in the state's financial flows that might otherwise impede the achievement of results.

Component 1: Strengthening the quality of teaching (US\$44.2 million)

24. **The objective of this component is to strengthen the quality of teaching for primary students, particularly in the areas of literacy and numeracy in grades 1–3.** First, it will strengthen the preservice teacher training system. Second, it will improve the incentives, capacities and opportunities for teacher effectiveness. Third, it will make a package of reading materials available to schools and communities. The component has three subcomponents.

Subcomponent 1.1: Stronger foundations in pedagogy (US\$1.3 million)

25. **The objective of this subcomponent is to contribute to ensuring that ENIB graduates have the foundational knowledge and skills required to be effective primary teachers, particularly for grades 1–3,** through the strengthening of key aspects of the ENIB preservice teacher training system. First, the project will finance technical assistance to strengthen the curriculum, including a stronger focus on pedagogy for primary school learners, particularly in the areas of numeracy and literacy in grades 1–3, an alignment with the competency-based approach of the primary school curriculum, and an incorporation of digital competencies, ethics, inclusive education,²⁷ gender-based violence (GBV), and climate change (encompassing awareness-raising and climate change adaptation approaches and skills). Second, the project will finance the development and delivery of a training program for active ENIB instructors. The training of ENIB instructors will combine face-to-face instruction with digital formats, which will include resources made available for long-term access and reuse, especially for distance training. The program will focus on delivering the strengthened curriculum, particularly in the areas identified above, and addressing knowledge and capacity gaps that will be identified. Third, the project will finance the equipping of 5 ENIBs with 1–2 multimedia classrooms, to enable the incorporation of digital competencies into the curriculum.

Subcomponent 1.2: Increasing teacher effectiveness for literacy and numeracy in grades 1-3 (US\$41.5 million)

26. **The objective of this subcomponent is to increase teacher effectiveness for literacy and numeracy in grades 1–3,** through reforms to the system for continuous professional development (CPD) and the language of instruction. In particular, the subcomponent will support: (a) strengthening of existing policies linking CPD and career



development; (b) developing and cataloguing of content for CPD, linked to professional standards; (c) designing and delivering a local-level CPD program, involving capacity building of teachers, school directors and pedagogical support staff; (d) supplying digital tools and materials in support of effective pedagogy; and (e) scaling-up of the use of mother-tongue instruction.

27. **To reinforce the system for CPD, the project will finance technical assistance to strengthen existing policy, content and procedures in order to better link CPD and career development,** and provide greater incentives for teachers to engage effectively with in-service training and other professional development opportunities. This will entail developing a set of graduated professional standards that teachers will be expected to achieve through professional development activities, linking these to existing civil service categories and grades, and strengthening the evaluative criteria and instruments used to determine eligibility for promotion. The technical assistance will include the development of a range of policy and implementation options, including costs and financial mechanisms, as well as institutional and capacity requirements. The project will also finance a series of workshops for decision-makers and other stakeholders, with a view to developing a consensus on reforms the government can support.

28. **The project will finance technical assistance to develop and catalogue new or extant in-service training content, linked to the professional standards.** This will enable teachers to identify the resources they require more easily and policy makers to identify the gaps in training content. New content development will focus on literacy and numeracy for grades 1–3; it will be informed by findings of a baseline evaluation of teaching-learning practices, using a validated classroom observation instrument (see component 4), as well as closely coordinated with the in-service training supported under this component (see paragraph 24). Importantly, the project will revise existing scripted lessons for literacy and numeracy in grades 1–3 to ensure that they are high-quality and aligned with students' abilities. The technical assistance will also incorporate content on both adaptation and mitigation of climate change into existing CPD trainings. This would include learning and teaching local impacts of climate change, flood response, water conservation, and energy conservation techniques. To complement the activities under the COVID-19 response project and to enhance the resilience of the system, the project will finance digitalization of the content, which will be made available on-line. Content will also be loaded onto existing digital devices (tablets and computers) in the 80 department centers responsible for the in-service training of primary teachers (CDFCEP). The project will finance (a) the purchase of digital devices for those centers that are not adequately equipped to conduct pedagogical days; (b) technical assistance to strengthen the design of CDFCEP pedagogical days and other local in-service training opportunities, through the development of schedules and methodological approaches that align with evidence from pedagogical research on effective training; (c) capacity building of CDFCEP staff so that they can train teachers or climate change-induced emergencies, such as cyclones, hurricanes, and flash floods, as a part of the pedagogical days.

29. **The project will finance the development and introduction of a model that promotes CPD at the school level.** In particular, it will finance technical assistance to develop a model which uses a valid approach and instrument to measure teacher practices, identify areas in need of strengthening, and provide continuous feedback; and which can be linked to local inspection and in-service training services. The project will finance training on how to implement the model for 90 percent of viable²⁸ public and community schools, covering grades 1–3 teachers, school directors and the local pedagogical support staff visiting the schools. School directors and teachers will be trained to use the tool to perform regular classroom observations for grades 1–3, and provide feedback and mentoring, among other things. Local officials will be trained to perform regular classroom observation using the instrument, to provide tailored and actionable feedback to teachers during their regular visits, and to guide teachers and directors for mutual coaching in between the local officer visits, as well as to aggregate findings from classroom observations to provide focus and

²⁷ This also includes inclusive pedagogies such as Universal Design for Learning principles in the Convention of the Rights of the Persons with Disabilities.

²⁸ Viable schools are defined as those that include at least grades 1–3 and have a school building.



material for local pedagogical days. Usage of the tool and execution of the follow-up activities will be encouraged through the revised professional standards and performance evaluative criteria that will be linked to promotion, as mentioned above.

30. **The design of the training content will be informed by the baseline evaluation of teaching-learning practices** (see component 4). In addition to digital skills, ethics, GBV, FCV sensitivity, climate change, inclusive education and safe schools, trainings will focus on the following three areas: (a) *key teaching-learning practices*, including formative assessments to identify children falling behind and at risk of dropping out; the use of detailed lesson plans with lesson scripts aligned to the curriculum, and when relevant, the development and adaptation of teachers' own lesson plans; (b) *classroom management techniques*, including training on managing large or multi-grade class groups, rotating students using the covered spaces to be provided under subcomponent 2.2, and leveraging student peer instruction; and (c) *creation of a pedagogical culture at school and local levels*, including (as elaborated in the previous paragraph) classroom observation and feedback by directors, inspectors, educational facilitators (*animateurs pédagogiques*), and other teachers.

31. **The project will finance digital tools and materials for schools participating in the CPD training**, such that there is one digital device (tablet) per teacher of grades 1–3 and one each for the school director, inspector and *animateur pédagogique* attached to the school, as well as solar charging capacity for schools without electricity. Even for the schools with electricity, there will be a push toward promoting energy efficiency. The digital devices will be preloaded with content related to the training and CPD activities at school.

32. **The project will finance the introduction of mother-tongue instruction** in national languages which have already been successfully piloted,²⁹ and for which teaching-learning materials (including textbooks) and teacher-training resources are available. Covering 1,200 schools with teachers who master the national language, the project will finance the aforementioned training to be extended to include how to introduce mother-tongue instruction, as well as the printing and delivery of the necessary mother-tongue teaching-learning materials such as textbooks and teacher's guides. The project will also finance communication activities to explain to communities and local authorities the rationale of mother tongue instruction, particularly its use as a transition language to enable their children to master French and Arabic. The introduction will be planned so as to start in grade 1 and continue as the cohort progresses through the primary cycle, such that the transition is largely complete by grade 4.

Subcomponent 1.3: Supporting literacy acquisition (US\$1.4 million)

33. **The objective of this subcomponent is to support literacy acquisition** by delivering reading materials to children in preschool to grade 3, and encouraging teachers, parents and other community members to support children's learning at school and at home. The project will finance technical meetings to identify open-source titles and, when necessary, the versioning or creation of new storybooks or story cards. It will also finance the printing and delivery of these reading materials to schools covered by subcomponent 1.2. For children who have not yet entered school, reading materials will involve story cards or storybooks. For children in grades 1–3, the supplementary reading materials will be a set of books or an anthology, starting with grade 1 readers and including progressively more challenging books suitable for students in grades 2–3. One set will be provided to each school along with guidance for the teacher on how to use them. These books will be made available for both in school and home use. For children who benefit from the expansion of mother tongue instruction, reading materials will be in mother tongue. For the rest of the children, reading materials will be in French and Arabic. All reading materials will be selected with attention to gender representation (ensuring the inclusion of positive role models for girls and avoiding gender biases) and disability inclusion (combatting disability stereotypes and stigma). A digital version of the materials will be loaded onto the digital devices provided under subcomponent 1.2 and will be made available online. The project will also finance a social

²⁹ National languages include the following: Mada, Arabe Tchadien, Massa, Moundang and Sar.



mobilization campaign explaining the benefits of reading, providing guidance for community members and/or caregivers to engage with children’s learning, and encouraging the community to go to the school and borrow books.

Component 2: Improving access to learning (US\$49.5 million)

34. **The objective of this component is to equitably increase access to learning.** The project will support initiatives in three main areas. First, the project will finance basic and accessible school infrastructure. Second, it will leverage existing schools to expand meaningful access by financing covered spaces to accommodate children in overcrowded classrooms. Third, it will finance training and teaching-learning materials to increase access to foundational instruction at the right level, for out-of-school primary-age children and primary students who are at risk of dropping out. The proposed activities under this component will be carried out to bolster long-term resilience to risks posed by natural events and disasters, climate change, and health shocks such as COVID-19.

Subcomponent 2.1: Improving learning environments (US\$38.9 million)

35. **The objective of this subcomponent is to equitably increase access to quality and inclusive learning environments,** including for refugees, internally displaced children, and children with disabilities. In 485 communities in the poorest urban and rural areas (190 urban and 295 rural), the project will finance three furnished, equipped, disabled-accessible, eco-sensitive classrooms; disabled-accessible and gender-sensitive latrines with hand-washing facility; and a water point (provision of WASH facilities). These classrooms will be equipped to mitigate risks posed by climate change and natural hazards, including having strategically sited rooms that can serve as shelters in times of crises. In approximately 15% of the selected schools, the project will also finance the construction of office space for the Director and teachers. Selection criteria for communities will include: (a) no school in durable materials or a school that is dilapidated beyond repair; (b) a community teacher or a commitment to hire one; (c) an above-average student/classroom ratio; (d) an above average girls/boys enrollment ratio; (e) an agreement to maintain and clean the school as per commitments to be elaborated in the Project Operations Manual, as well as to build a low-cost fence around the perimeter of the school grounds; and (optionally) (f) a school with an incomplete primary cycle due to lack of space. In urban areas, the project will finance and contract construction, while in rural areas, the project will finance a lower-cost community-based model developed under a previously World Bank-financed operation (P132617). The project will finance capacity building for those rural communities implementing the community-based model. The project will construct only in existing schools that are free of squatters. The buildings will be designed and oriented on sites to ensure climate-resilient design measures, such as structural strengthening, rainwater harvesting and recycling in water-scarce areas, drainage improvement for flood control, use of weather-resistant material, and so forth. The project will also finance activities to sensitize the schools on gender-based violence (GBV), climate change mitigation and adaptation, on disease control and prevention, and good hygiene practices during and after the crisis as well as ways to ensure safety for all.

Subcomponent 2.2: Expanding opportunities for students to learn (US\$10.6 million)

36. **The objective of this subcomponent is to increase access to opportunities for learning.** Expanded class spaces will be financed by the project to alleviate the constraint of overcrowding for approximately 4,000 communities with a public or community school that has student–classroom ratios in excess of 55:1. The schools will be selected according to criteria elaborated in the Project Implementation Manual (PIM). These covered spaces will be used during school hours to accommodate a portion of children in overcrowded classrooms, particularly those in grades 1–3, to study, practice peer instruction, and do learning exercises, all as assigned by the teacher and under the supervision of a community resource person. Such covered spaces will consider climate hazards and evacuation procedures in choice of the site on the school grounds. The resource person will be an individual designated by the community, who will receive a performance-based reward financed by the project and work under the guidance of the teacher and school director.



37. **Increased access to foundational instruction.** In approximately 2,000 public and community schools in areas with relatively high proportions of primary school-age out-of-school children (OOSC), the project will support the design and introduction of a 'right-level' instructional model. The schools will be selected according to criteria elaborated in the PIM. The project will finance technical assistance to develop and implement the model, including the training and teaching-learning materials; the training of two teachers per school; the printing and delivery of required teaching-learning materials; and performance-based awards to teachers. The instruction will be targeted at children (of primary-school age) in the school catchment area (including refugees, internally displaced, and children with disabilities) who are returning to school or entering at an age that no longer enables them to integrate directly into grade 1; the model also seeks to enroll children who are at risk of dropping out. Instruction will be provided by the teachers either during the shift when they are not teaching or on weekends. The instruction will be based on an accelerated curriculum targeting foundational competencies, and will use a 'right-level', graduated approach, whereby children are initially assessed, placed in a group at their level, tutored on the material to master, given exercises to complete, and then periodically assessed to determine when they can move onto the next level. In brief, children will progress at their own pace through the curriculum until they can be integrated into the regular classroom or access other forms of education. The project will finance social mobilization campaigns to encourage participation in these educational opportunities. The program will also raise the awareness/skills of the OOSC to understand and cope with climate change risks.

Component 3: Strengthening recruitment and financing of teachers (US\$43.0 million)

38. **This component aims to strengthen the recruitment and financing of teachers.** The release of funds under this component will be contingent upon the government taking steps to integrate community teachers onto the state payroll; and finance the payment of monthly subsidies to community teachers. The objectives of the component will be achieved through performance-based conditions (PBCs). The release of US\$42 million will be linked to two PBCs:

- PBC 1 (five performance-based condition targets, PBCTs): Primary community teachers are integrated onto state payroll.
- PBC 2 (five PBCTs): Primary community teachers' subsidies are paid from state budget.

39. **In both cases, the recurrent expenditures financed by World Bank funds are incremental and transitional and are supported by the project to provide for stability to the education system in a FCV context.** In the case of integrating community teachers onto the state payroll, these will become an addition to the public teaching cadre and the World Bank funds will support their salary for one year only, after which their salaries will be financed from the government budget. The monthly subsidies will be provided on a transitional basis to qualified primary school teachers who have not previously been financed by the government; the proportion of the subsidies financed from World Bank funds will diminish throughout the project while the proportion financed by government will increase, such that by the end of the Project the government will become financially responsible for all the teachers on the subsidy registry.

40. PBC 1 has three activities. First, the government will develop and approve a strengthened primary teacher recruitment policy, as well as a budgeted plan for its implementation. The policy/plan will include among other things: (a) a five-year target to recruit into the civil service no less than 2,000 qualified and eligible primary community teachers (of which 1,000 female) who will be identified from a census-based registry; (b) a posting strategy that prioritizes rural communities in need and takes into account the local mother tongue; and (c) the recruitment of more female teachers. Second, the MENPC will regularly conduct a census of all teachers working at community schools. The census will gather and digitize all relevant data pertaining to the teacher to constitute a personnel dossier as per state norms, and will result in an officially recognized registry of community teachers. It will also enable the MENPC and the government to screen the community teaching personnel for eligibility to be recognized as a teacher in a public school. Third, the government will recruit on a merit basis no less than 400 community teachers into the civil service each year,



integrate them onto the state payroll and pay them their salary and indemnities; of the cumulative total of 2,000 such teachers, not less than 1,000 will be female. Under this PBC, the World Bank funds will finance salaries (including indemnities) for 400 teachers per year, equivalent to one year's salary for the cohort recruited each year, while the government will finance from its own resources the salaries (including indemnities) of these teachers in their second and subsequent years. This PBC is linked to five PBCTs that pertain to the approval of a policy and budgeted plan, and to the merit-based recruitment and payment of community teachers (category 2) as public-school primary teachers.

41. **PBC 2 has three activities.** First, the government will develop and approve a policy and budgeted plan to use state funds to fully finance a monthly subsidy to all community teachers (category 2) identified on the aforementioned registry, until they are integrated into the civil service. Second, community teachers (category 2) will be paid a monthly subsidy as long as they remain unintegrated into the civil service. Finally, the government will strengthen the mobile money subsidy payment system managed by APICED and use it to provide information and quality assurance for the payment of subsidies. This will build on the innovations and lessons learned under the World Bank-financed Education Sector Reform Project Phase 2 (ESRP-II), ensuring the functioning and maintenance of the system, as well as systematic checks on personnel lists and the receipt of salaries. The government will also enhance data recovery and backup systems to prevent data loss in the event of natural disasters. Under this PBC, the World Bank funds will finance a portion of the subsidies necessary to pay the community teachers; in year 1 the project will finance 80 per cent of the total amount required and subsequently reduce the percentage financed such that by year 5 the project finances 20 per cent of the subsidy bill. The government will use its own resources to finance the percentage of the subsidies not covered by World Bank funds. This PBC is linked to five PBCTs that pertain to the approval of a policy and budgeted plan, and the regular payment of subsidies.

Component 4: Capacity building, project management, monitoring and evaluation (US\$13.3 million)

42. **The objective of this component is to strengthen and support capacities and systems** to achieve the PBCTs and ensure that corporate safeguards and fiduciary requirements are respected, key departments at MENPC have critical equipment and materials to implement and monitor the project activities, and activities and results are monitored, reported, evaluated and verified.

Subcomponent 4.1: Technical assistance and institutional capacity strengthening (US\$6.7 million)

43. **The subcomponent will finance technical assistance and capacity building** (including IT equipment and materials) for implementing institutions responsible to achieve PBCs. In particular, for PBC1 the technical assistance and capacity building will support the: (i) development of a recruitment policy; (ii) design and implementation of a mechanism to recruit qualified community teachers into the civil service on the basis of merit; (iii) implementation of a community teacher census and establishment of an official registry of community teachers; and (iv) creation of a digital personnel dossier for each community teacher on the registry. For PBC2, the subcomponent will support the strengthening of the mechanisms to monitor and assure quality regarding the payment of a monthly subsidy to community teachers.

44. **The subcomponent will also finance technical capacity strengthening and critical equipment and materials** to ensure that relevant MENPC departments are able to implement and monitor other project activities effectively. First, the department in charge of the education management and information system (EMIS) will be supported to introduce decentralized data collection/entry. The project will finance digital devices for local officials, which will be used for direct data entry and forwarding; while the project will finance technical assistance and equipment for the EMIS department at central level to enable the reception, analysis and reporting of locally provided data. Second, the project will finance technical assistance for the department for human resources to strengthen and make better use of its database. Third, the project will finance technical assistance and equipment to build the capacities of the learning



assessment unit to measure, analyze and report on learning. Finally, the project will finance the installation of an intranet at the MENPC to connect all departments at the central level.

Subcomponent 4.2: Project management, monitoring and evaluation (US\$6.6 million)

45. **This subcomponent will finance monitoring, research and evaluation activities.** All training activities will be monitored during delivery, covering participation, logistics and quality. Monitoring of civil works and the installation of covered spaces will include third-party site monitoring, combined with community monitoring using technology (such as tablets and smartphones) to provide regular, real-time updates on progress. The same technology will be deployed to support the remote iterative beneficiary monitoring of other project activities, including school- and local-level activities to promote effective pedagogy, the use of covered spaces, remedial teaching of children returning to school, and the availability of textbooks and supplementary and at-home reading materials. The number of children with disabilities that are beneficiaries of the project will also be monitored. The project will also finance research to: (a) assess system coverage and performance, including at least one national sample-based survey of learning outcomes; (b) better understand and address the scope and causes of children being out of school; (c) learn about the quality of Early Childhood Education (ECE) which will provide information for the revision of the preschool program and its alignment with the primary education curriculum, and for the establishment of minimum quality standards in this subsector; (d) understand the forms and practices of Quranic schools, and how these might become partners of the education system to promote literacy and numeracy; and (e) shed light on other topics relevant to the government's education strategy, as needed. All research will be published and discussed at public forums, with a view to develop a consensus around measures to strengthen the education system.

46. **There will be five evaluations financed by the project.** First, learning achievements and the effectiveness of the in-service training program will be evaluated using baseline and endline observations of classroom and pedagogical support practices; the baseline will also be used to help design the program. Second, an evaluation of the effectiveness of the covered spaces will be conducted using a difference-in-difference method that compares baseline and endline learning achievements among a control and treatment group. Third, the mother-tongue instruction intervention will also be evaluated using a similar method. Fourth, the project will evaluate the remedial teaching program as well, using project data on participation, promotion and integration. Finally, there will be an overall project evaluation. Some of the quantitative studies might be coupled with qualitative ones as deemed necessary.

47. The subcomponent will also finance project operating costs, including personnel and technical assistance for the Project Coordination Unit (PCU), equipment, and supervision as well as incremental operating costs of MENPC departments responsible for implementation.

Component 5: Contingent Emergency Response Component (CERC) (US\$0 million)

48. **In accordance with OP 10.00, paragraphs 12 and 13, a no-cost CERC is included to help improve response times should a situation arise where urgent assistance is needed.** The CERC allows for rapid reallocation of project proceeds in the event of a future natural or man-made disaster or crisis (including health crisis such as COVID-19 outbreaks) that has caused or is likely to cause a major adverse economic and social impact. This component will have no funding allocation initially. In the event of a future emergency, it could be used to draw resources from the unallocated expenditure category and allow the government to request the World Bank to recategorize and reallocate financing from other project components to cover emergency response and recovery.



Legal Operational Policies

Triggered?

Projects on International Waterways OP 7.50

No

Projects in Disputed Areas OP 7.60

No

Summary of Assessment of Environmental and Social Risks and Impacts

E. Implementation

Institutional and Implementation Arrangements

49. **The project will be implemented over a five-year period by the ministry in charge of primary education (MENPC) with technical support from a PCU.** The General Secretary (SG), who is the second-in-command of the MENPC, will oversee and facilitate overall project implementation and will assist in project coordination across ministries and agencies. The project management structure, which builds on the existing government structures, will comprise a fully dedicated PCU.

50. **Project Steering Committee (PSC).** A PSC, chaired by the Minister in charge of primary education (MENPC), or his/her representative, will be responsible for project oversight, for providing guidance and ensuring coordination and synergy among all parties. The PSC will review and approve the proposed annual project work plans and budget, developed and consolidated by the PCU, including those of relevant ministries and agencies. The PSC will also review project progress and performance and ensure implementation of corrective actions to resolve emerging issues. The PSC membership will include key ministers (or their representatives) who have a role in supervising operations in their respective ministries, including the MENPC, the Ministry of Economy, Development Planning and International Cooperation (MEPDCI), the Ministry of Finance and Budget (MFB) and the Ministry of Public Service, Employment and Social Dialogue (MFPECS). Other concerned ministries, agencies, and civil society organizations will also be invited to participate. The PCU coordinator will assume PSC secretarial duty.

51. **Project Coordination Unit (PCU).** The envisaged institutional framework is designed to promote efficiency, learning, transparency, good governance, and effective information sharing, as well as to strengthen the reform system in the education sector. The SG of the ministry in charge of primary education (MENPC) will oversee and facilitate overall project implementation and assist in project coordination across ministries and agencies. To ensure smooth project implementation and coordination, a PCU, headed by a project coordinator for the Chad Improving Learning Outcomes Project (CILOP), will be established within the MENPC and will be responsible for project planning, execution, and management, as well as coordination across relevant directorates and units responsible for components and subcomponents. Under the overall guidance and oversight of the PSC, the CILOP project coordinator will be responsible for the project management and coordination and will act as secretary of



the PSC. He/she will be hired to assist in the implementation of a project team consisting of a financial management (FM) specialist, a procurement specialist, an M&E specialist, two safeguards,³⁰ a civil engineer, a training specialist, PBCs expert and an accountant. The coordinator will also monitor the activities carried out by the program technical units within the ministries concerned.

52. **Guidelines for project implementation and capacity strengthening.** The following two manuals will further elaborate the design and implementation arrangements of the project. The PIM, which will be adopted during negotiations, will detail the organizational and technical procedures that will govern and guide implementation, specifying roles and responsibilities of all actors involved in implementation, including environmental and social safeguards management, M&E, and the Grievance Redress Mechanism. The second manual is the Consolidated Procedures Manual (administration, finance, and accounting). This manual, which governs ongoing education projects and was recently validated by the government, will specify the administrative, financial and accounting, and disbursement mechanisms and protocols.

CONTACT POINT

World Bank

Harisoa Danielle Rasolonjatovo Andriamihamina
Senior Education Specialist

Zacharie Ngueng
Education Specialist

Borrower/Client/Recipient

REPUBLIC OF CHAD

Implementing Agencies

Ministry of Education and Civic Promotion
Mahamat Seid Farah
Directeur Général de l'Education
mahamatseidf@yahoo.fr

Ministry of Economy and Development Planning
Nassour Bahar Mahamat ITNO

³⁰ CILOP will use the same internal auditor as the PARTSET2, PDCEJ and COVID-19 education response project.



Directeur Général du Ministère de l'Economie, de la Planific
itno004@gmail.com

FOR MORE INFORMATION CONTACT

The World Bank
1818 H Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20433
Telephone: (202) 473-1000
Web: <http://www.worldbank.org/projects>

APPROVAL

Task Team Leader(s):	Harisoa Danielle Rasolonjatovo Andriamihamina Zacharie Ngueng
----------------------	--

Approved By

Practice Manager/Manager:		
Country Director:	Rasit Pertev	24-Feb-2022