



National Targeted Programs Support Project (P159737)

EAST ASIA AND PACIFIC | Vietnam | Agriculture and Food Global Practice | Requesting Unit: EACVF | Responsible Unit: SEAAG
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2017 | Team Leader(s): Hardwick Tchale, Nghi Quy Nguyen

Seq No: 7 | ARCHIVED on 23-Dec-2021 | ISR49774 | Created by: Hardwick Tchale on 15-Dec-2021 | Modified by: Hardwick Tchale on 20-Dec-2021

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

To improve the delivery of, and access to, investments for increasing agricultural production and enhancing livelihood opportunities within the Program area.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	□ Moderately Satisfactory	□ Moderately Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	□ Moderately Satisfactory	□ Moderately Satisfactory

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

Other anecdotal evidence of the NTP PforRs impacts which will be elaborated in detail in the ICR include the following:

- **Inclusive value-chain development:** Experiences from the implementation of the NTP PforR have to some extent influenced the design and the implementation plans for the new NTPs (i.e., NRD and SEDEMA). In particular, the inclusive agricultural value-chain models under SEDEMA have benefited from the value-chain contests supported under the NTP PforR. In addition, several analytical works, such as the one on "Improving Agricultural Interventions under the new NTPs" highlighted experiences and lessons from other countries relevant to enhance agricultural and other related value-chain development among the ethnic minorities.
- **Real-time monitoring through geo-tagging:** Through NTP PforR initial technical assistance, the task team introduced the potential use of digital/ICT tools such as geo-tagging to strengthen the monitoring of project implementation in real-time. The NCO team reported that one of the project provinces has piloted this geo-tagging technology on a smaller scale. This provides the potential for scaling such technologies to improve monitoring and evaluation under the new NTPs.
- **Strengthening awareness of environmental and social safeguards:** The NTP PforR through the EoM provided clear guidelines and procedures to ensure full compliance with both environmental and social safeguards during implementation. This has helped to ensure that community sub-projects do not face any conflicts. Also, the capacity and awareness built on the importance of complying with environmental and social safeguards will continue to be helpful in the future programs, including the new NTPs.

However, the PforR also faced challenges related to delayed effectiveness, delayed allocation of the verification budgets, capacity constraints and towards the end, the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic. These are elaborated in detail in the Aide Memoire.

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P159737	IDA-61130	Effective	USD	153.00	153.00	0.00	76.79	81.63	48%

Key Dates (by loan)



Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P159737	IDA-61130	Effective	28-Jun-2017	28-Dec-2018	15-May-2019	31-Dec-2021	31-Dec-2021

DLI Disbursement

DLI ID	DLI Type	Description	Coc	DLI Amount	Achievement Status	Disbursed amount in Coc	Disbursement % for DLI
Loan: IDA61130-001							
DL#1	Prior Results Financing DLI	Issuance of P&GI for NRD&SRP-P135	XDR	14,580,000.00	Fully Achieved	14,579,999.87	100 %
DL#2	Regular	# of Participating Prov w/ NTP-SEDP IPP	XDR	10,940,000.00	Fully Achieved	10,940,000.00	100 %
DLI#3	Regular	% of Infra Inv Sub-pr in complying w/ EO	XDR	21,850,000.00	Partially Achieved	8,737,000.00	40 %
DLI#4	Regular	%increase in ethnic min&satisfied women	XDR	7,300,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DLI#5	Regular	%of Livelihood Supp Sub-pr complying EOM	XDR	21,850,000.00	Partially Achieved	7,637,000.00	35 %
DLI#6	Regular	%points increase in HHs sharew/ add'l DI	XDR	7,300,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DLI#7	Regular	#of officers at prov,dist,commune EOM tr	XDR	7,300,000.00	Partially Achieved	5,832,000.00	80 %
DL8.1	Regular	#of mon&evel framewrks dev NRD&SPR-P135	XDR	3,640,000.00	Fully Achieved	3,639,999.96	100 %
DL8.2	Regular	#of part prov w/ operational NRD-MIS	XDR	6,550,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DL8.3	Regular	#of publ accessible websitesNRD&SPR-P135	XDR	3,640,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
DLI#9	Regular	Baseline&end-line track survey NRD&SPR-P	XDR	6,550,000.00	Partially Achieved	3,275,000.07	50 %

Program Action Plan

Action Description	Develop an M&E framework for NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 and roll out an MIS for NRD with financial information from TABMIS: (i) M&E Framework Submitted for NRD and SPR-P135; (ii)Operational MIS for NRD with physical and financial reporting updated quarterly				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Due Date	29-Jun-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement	M&E Framework included in the approved EoM.				
Comments	M&E Framework was developed and approved together with the EOM. There were initial challenges with the rolling out of an MIS for NRD and the link with financial information from TABMIS. However, these challenges are gradually being addressed.				



Action Description	Set up and maintain a web portal for citizen to leave feedbacks and complaints (on corruption/ procurement/program planning process). (text to be continued in comment section)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Due Date	29-Mar-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Website to record feedbacks and complaints developed.				
Comments					

Action Description	Contract a Capacity Building Program (CBP) Officer in the NRD and SPR-P135 NCOs to oversee the implementation of the CBP to support national, provincial, district and commune level training under TORs acceptable to the Bank.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Due Date	30-Sep-2020	Completed
Completion Measurement	Completed. TA provided on enhanced program planning, following quality standards for infrastructure development, agricultural value-chain development as well as enterprise and livelihood procedures, and compliance with fiduciary, ESA and governance.				
Comments					

Action Description	Enhanced Operations Manual for Planning, Infrastructure and livelihoods approved and Instructions issued for the use of the targeted Program provinces, districts and communes (text to be continued in comment section)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEM	Due Date	29-Mar-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	completed and approved.				
Comments					

Action Description	The Bank's most updated lists of debarred and suspended firms and individuals, as a complement to the national debarment list, adopted and regularly shared, coordinated and monitored by the two NCOs, (text to be continued at comment)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		MARD and CEMA	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Continuous updating being done. Updated & completed by the project closing date.				
Comments	This has been been resolved.				



Action Description	In conjunction with the enhanced operations manual, and in conformity with Vietnamese Legislation, issue community/citizen, gender-sensitive guidelines, in both a language and format understood and accessible to beneficiaries, (continue in comment)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEMA	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed
Completion Measurement	Included in the approved EOM				
Comments	Included in the approved EOM				

Action Description	Issuance of a “Voluntary Land Donation Guideline” to be included in the enhanced operations manual for adoption by the targeted Program provinces which would provide for “Voluntary Donation” (text continues in comments section)				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		MARD and CEM	Due Date	29-Mar-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Approved together with the EOM.				
Comments					

Action Description	Conduct of baseline and end-line survey for the 2 NTPs				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		MARD and CEM	Due Date	29-Nov-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Baseline survey report completed and approved. Endline survey conducted and report to be submitted by December 31, 2021.				
Comments					

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	□ Moderate	□ Low	□ Low
Macroeconomic	□ Substantial	□ Low	□ Low
Sector Strategies and Policies	□ Substantial	□ Moderate	□ Moderate
Technical Design of Project or Program	□ High	□ Moderate	□ Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	□ High	□ Moderate	□ Moderate
Fiduciary	□ High	□ Low	□ Low



Environment and Social	□ Moderate	□ Moderate	□ Low
Stakeholders	□ High	□ Low	□ Low
Other	--	□ Moderate	□ Moderate
Overall	□ High	□ Moderate	□ Moderate

Comments

The overall risk rating has improved from High (at approval) to Moderate at project closing.

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Improved Program Planning and Governance				
▶ Number of participating provinces with an NTP-SEDP integrated planning process (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	18.00	18.00	18.00
Date	28-Jun-2017	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	As confirmed through the first verification report.			
Increased Access to Program Investments				
▶ Share of households with additional diversified income sources (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	60.00	0.00	84.90	80.00
Date	28-Jun-2017	30-Oct-2020	31-Dec-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	This result has been estimated through the endline survey. The estimate controlling for COVID-19 impact is 24.9% above the baseline. However, when COVID-19 impact is taken into account the estimate is 6.95% above the target.			
Increased Access to Program Investments				
▶ Share of ethnic minorities and women satisfied with access to, and quality of community assets or services for increasing agricultural production and livelihoods. (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	40.00	40.00	59.10	60.00
Date	31-Aug-2018	30-Oct-2020	31-Dec-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	This will be measured during the end line survey to be conducted this year (2021). The estimate verified at the end of the project is 19.1% above the baseline.			



Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Improved Program Planning and Governance				
► Issuance of Policy and Guidance instruments for the NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 that include PforR agreed planning, technical and implementation improvements/reforms (Text, Custom) (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	None	2 Decisions issued for implementation of NTP-NRD and NTP-SPR issued in August and Sept 2016	2 Decisions issued for implementation of NTP-NRD and NTP-SPR issued in August and Sept 2016	Two decisions issued for NTP-NRD and NTP-SPR
Date	30-Jun-2016	28-Mar-2019	28-Mar-2019	30-Aug-2016
Comments	Achieved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			
► Issuance of Policy and Guidance instruments for the NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	28-Mar-2019	28-Mar-2019	30-Aug-2016
Comments	Achieved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			
► Number of targeted Program provinces with plans prepared in a participatory manner (bottom-up) with community involvement with effective consultations of ethnic minorities and women (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	18.00	18.00	18.00
Date	30-Jun-2016	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Confirmed through the first verification.			

Improved quality of program investments				
► Issuance of enhanced operations manual for socio-economic infrastructure for both the NTP-NRD and SPR-135 (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	None	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	One comprehensive enhanced operations manual with several volumes issued
Date	31-Aug-2016	28-Mar-2019	28-Mar-2019	30-Jun-2018
Comments	Achieved. EOM finalized and cleared during the first ISM. GoV have also issued their approval/clearance note on the EOM.			



► Percentage of infrastructure investment sub-projects implemented in compliance with the enhanced operations manual (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	73.00	73.00	90.00
Date	31-Aug-2018	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	This is confirmed as per the first verification report.			
► Issuance of ed standardized procedures for scaling up climate-resilient livelihood and enterprise support established for both the NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 informed by value chain analysis (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	None	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	Enhanced Operations manuals being drafted and finalized	One comprehensive enhanced operations manual with several volumes issued
Date	31-Aug-2016	28-Mar-2019	28-Mar-2019	31-Oct-2017
Comments	Reported as achieved as part of the EoM and to be verified as part of the first verification currently underway.			
► Percentage of livelihood support subprojects implemented in compliance with the enhanced operations manual (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	90.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	To be verified as part of the first verification currently underway.			

Increased Access to Program Investments				
► Percentage of spending linked to value-chain based and climate-resilient livelihood investments (separately for NRD and SPR-P135) (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	68.00	68.00	30.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Verified through the first verification process.			

Improved Program Monitoring and Management				
► Number of officers at the provincial, district, commune and village-level trained in the use of the enhanced operations manual (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	39,948.00	39,948.00	50,000.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2020



Comments	Verified achievement.			
► Number of monitoring reports submitted to the NTP steering committee with updated information on end of year implementation status and reporting of Program impacts at completion (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	6.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2021
Comments	Achieved.			
► Number of monitoring and evaluation (M&E) frameworks developed for NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Oct-2017
Comments	Achieved.			
► Number of participating provinces with an operational NRD-MIS web-based platform, including semi-annual reports with physical outputs and financial information from TABMIS (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	18.00	18.00	18.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	31-Dec-2019
Comments	Yet to be verified during the second verification exercise to be conducted from March to June 2021.			
► Number of publicly accessible websites publishing semi-annual reports on physical progress and financial information on NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2020
Comments	Achieved.			
► Baseline and end-line tracking survey for NRD and SPR-P135 (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	1.00	2.00	2.00
Date	31-Aug-2016	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2021	31-Aug-2021
Comments	Baseline survey report finalized and approved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA. The endline survey has also been conducted.			

Disbursement Linked Indicators



► DLI 1 Issuance of the Policy and Guidance Instruments for the NRD and SPR-P135 (Output, 20.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	2.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	28-Mar-2019	28-Mar-2019	--
Comments	Prior action, done already. Notification of achievement submitted to the Bank.			

► DLI 2 Number of Participating Provinces with an NTP-SEDP integrated planning process (Intermediate Outcome, 15.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	18.00	18.00	18.00
Date	--	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			

► DLI 3 Percentage of Infrastructure Investment Sub-projects implemented in compliance with the Enhanced Operations Manual (Intermediate Outcome, 30.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	73.00	73.00	90.00
Date	--	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			

► DLI 4 Percentage points increase of ethnic minorities and women satisfied with access and quality of community assets or services for increasing agricultural production and livelihoods (Outcome, 10.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	19.10	20.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2021	--
Comments	This has been verified through the endline survey.			

► DLI 5 Percentage of Livelihood Support Sub-projects implemented in compliance with the Enhanced Operations Manual (Intermediate Outcome, 30.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	68.00	68.00	90.00
Date	--	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			



--

► DLI 6 Percentage points increase in the share of households with additional diversified income sources (Outcome, 10.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	0.00	24.90	20.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2021	--
Comments	Verified by the endline survey. This controls for the effect of COVID-19 related impacts.			

► DLI 7 Number of officers at the provincial-, district-, commune- and village-level trained in the use of the Enhanced Operations Manual (Output, 10.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	39,948.00	39,948.00	50,000.00
Date	--	19-Nov-2020	19-Nov-2020	--
Comments	Verified achievement.			

► DLI 8 Development of an M&E framework for NTP-NRD & SPR/P135 and roll out of an MIS for NRD with financial information from TABMIS with program information published online via public disclosure portal (Intermediate Outcome, 19.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Reported as achieved. Notification submitted to the Bank and cleared in April 2020. Allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			

<input type="checkbox"/> DLI 8.1 Number of monitoring and evaluation (M&E) frameworks developed for NTP-NRD and SPR-P135 (Intermediate Outcome, 5.00, 0%) Unit of Measure: Number Indicator Type:				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Achieved and allocated amount disbursed as part of the first WA.			
<input type="checkbox"/> DLI 8.2 Number of participating provinces with an operational NRD-MIS web-based platform including semi-annual reports with physical outputs and financial information from the TABMIS (Intermediate Outcome, 9.00, 0%)				



Unit of Measure: Number				
Indicator Type:				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	18.00	18.00	18.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	30-Jun-2020	--
Comments	Not yet achieved. Reported as achieved, but to be verified through the second verification.			

<input type="checkbox"/> DLI 8.3 Number of publicly accessible websites publishing semi-annual reports on physical progress and financial information on NRD and SPR-P135 (Output, 5.00, 0%)				
Unit of Measure: Number				
Indicator Type:				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	2.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Oct-2020	30-Oct-2020	--
Comments	Not yet achieved. Reported as achieved but needs to be verified during the second verification.			

► DLI 9 Baseline and end-line tracking survey for NRD and SPR-P135 (Output, 9.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2021
Value	0.00	1.00	2.00	2.00
Date	--	30-Jun-2020	31-Dec-2021	--
Comments	Baseline report finalized and approved. Endline survey has been conducted.			