Public Disclosure Authorized

Bangladesh Strengthening PFM Program to Enable Service Delivery (P167491)

SOUTH ASIA | Bangladesh | Governance Global Practice | Requesting Unit: SACBD | Responsible Unit: ESAG2 | IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2019 | Team Leader(s): Winston Percy Onipede Cole, Nazmus Sadat Khan

Seq No: 7 | ARCHIVED on 20-Jan-2022 | ISR49919 | Created by: Winston Percy Onipede Cole on 03-Jan-2022 | Modified by: Winston Percy Onipede Cole on 13-Jan-2022

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

The Program Development Objective (PDO) is to improve fiscal forecasting, budget preparation and execution, financial reporting and transparency to enable better resource availability for service delivery in selected Ministries, Departments, and Agencies.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	Satisfactory	Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	□Satisfactory	□Satisfactory

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

Despite the challenges imposed by the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic with series of lockdowns, the Program is making progress. Key progress to date with 51 percent disbursement ratio are: (i) the macro-forecasting model will improve the realism of the budget with more attainable revenue projections and spending estimates; (ii) Debt Bulletin is now periodically published to improve debt transparency; (iii) publication of budget execution reports; (iv) the reduction of three to one month for release of budget from departments to frontline service delivery units will improve budget execution for critical services to the citizenry; (v) 100 percent electronic funds transfer (EFT) to pensioners; (vi) approval of State-owned Enterprises (SOE) Independent Performance Evaluation Guideline that will be used to develop turnaround strategies; (vii) policy and procedures to monitor SOEs' debt and contingent liabilities (DCL) will provide fiscal space for strategic budget allocation to critical infrastructure and social services; and (viii) comprehensive database of financial and non-financial data to monitor SOEs including publication of audited financial statement. Mid-Term Review (MTR) mission will take place from January 24 to 27, 2022. The main objectives of the mission are to i) review the achievement of the Disbursement Linked Results (DLRs); (ii) evaluate overall Program performance compared to the Program Development Outcome (PDO); and iii) propose any structural changes to the Program design and results framework that may be needed to enhance the Program outcomes.

Data on Financial Performance

IDA-63680

Effective

01-Mar-2019

Disbursements (by loan)

P167491

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed		% Disbursed
P167491	IDA-63680	Effective	USD	100.00	100.00	0.00	51.51	49.71		51%
Key Dates	(by loan)									
Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Dat	e Signi	ng Date	Effectiveness D	ate Orig.	Closing Date	Rev. Clos	sing Date

03-Jul-2019

30-Jun-2024

30-Jun-2024

1/20/2022 Page 1 of 21

27-Jun-2019

DLI Disbursement

DLI ID	DLI Type	Description	Coc	DLI Amount	Achievement Status	Disbursed amount in Coc	Disbursement % for DLI
Loan: ID	A63680-001						
1	Regular	DLI1 Use of Imp Fis Proj Bud Making	XDR	7,250,000.00	Partially Achieved	1,812,500.00	25 %
2	Regular	DLI2 Imp Bud Align, Bttr Perf of BMCs	XDR	10,100,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
3	Regular	DLI3 Red No of days DDO to rc budg inMDA	XDR	4,350,000.00	Partially Achieved	3,640,950.00	84 %
4	Regular	DLI4 Rel Pymt of Sal, TSA Auto Pymnts	XDR	6,500,000.00	Partially Achieved	1,511,665.00	23 %
5	Regular	DLI5 Impr Pen Ser Facili of Pymnts EFT	XDR	7,250,000.00	Partially Achieved	6,500,000.00	90 %
6	Regular	DLI6 SOE Auto Bod Debt Cont Liab Pol Mak	XDR	5,050,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
7	Regular	DLI7 Impr Perf SOE Sec Red Subs Pc Total	XDR	7,950,000.00	Partially Achieved	1,450,000.00	18 %
8	Regular	DLI8 Bud Hold MDA eff n trans use FI	XDR	8,700,000.00	Partially Achieved	4,944,500.00	57 %
9	Regular	DLI9 Act tak Int Ext Audit in MMDAs, PP	XDR	5,050,000.00	Not Achieved	0.00	
10	Regular	DLI10 PFM Action Plan Implementation	XDR	10,100,000.00	Partially Achieved	2,416,666.67	24 %

Program Action Plan

Action Description	Ensuring establishment of the PECT and PITs (within 3 months of the Effective Date) and that these are maintained throughout the Program implementation						
Source	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status						
Technical		Finance Division	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed		
Completion Measurement	PECT and PITs are in	n place throughout the F	Program implementation				
Comments		Program Executive and one of the program Executive and one of the program of the	` ,	o were transferred have be	een replaced by		

Action Description	Strengthen IPF as PFM Learning Hub by recruiting three permanent staff within six months of the Effective Date							
Source	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status							
Technical		Finance Division	Recurrent	Continuous	Completed			
Completion Measurement	IPF strengthened with the addition of three permanent staffs							
Comments	The IPF has appointed	ed more than three perm	anent staffs					

1/20/2022 Page 2 of 21

Action Description	DLI technical notes are reviewed and amended from time to time in consultation with the Bank								
Source	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status								
Technical		Finance Division	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed				
Completion Measurement	DLI technical notes a	DLI technical notes are periodically updated, in consultation with the Bank team							
Comments									

Action Description	Arrange DLI verification by the OC&AG, the Cabinet Division and through a third-party verification agent (to be appointed no later than 3 months after the Effective Date)							
Source	DLI#	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status						
Technical		Finance Division	Recurrent	Yearly	In Progress			
Completion Measurement	Submission of DLI ve	erification reports accept	able to the Bank					
Comments		cond verification report to	·					

Action Description	Assign separate organizational budget codes to the FD wings responsible for Program implementation (macro-economic, SOE, Debt, Expenditure etc.) to enhance managerial accountability of funds allocated to deliver on the specific DLI schemes							
Source	DLI#	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status						
Fiduciary Systems		Finance Division	Due Date	30-Jun-2019	Completed			
Completion Measurement	The Program budget	The Program budget for FY20 be distributed by FD wings						
Comments		r Secretariat, Finance I te organizational/impler		pecific code [3200002] for c t codes assigned.	verall Program with			

Action Description	Program to use the separate standard document for procurement of permitted works through e-GP system, which does not have the provision of rejecting bids based on above/lower than the estimated cost							
Source	DLI#	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status						
Fiduciary Systems		Finance Division	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress			
Completion Measurement	eGP used for all Pro	gram procurements						
Comments		There aren't any new works under the program. Use of specific documents will be ensured in case of any rehabilitation work. Regular procurement of operational items such as computer equipment, printing materials are done through eGP.						

Action Description	For each bid/proposal under the Program, form Bid/Proposal evaluation committees consisting of members with the
Action Description	appropriate knowledge and experience of procurement of similar goods/services

1/20/2022 Page 3 of 21

Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status		
Fiduciary Systems		Finance Division	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress		
Completion Measurement	Procurement commit	tees are suitably qualifie	d/experienced				
Procurement committee includes experienced staff members. Some procurement packages have been prepared and published for all DLIs except DLI 9 (internal audit).							

Action Description	Assign one trained Government official as procurement focal point within six months of Effective Date								
Source	DLI#	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status							
Fiduciary Systems		Finance Division	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress				
Completion Measurement	Trained officer de	esignated as the Procurem	ent Focal Point						
Comments	the evaluation co	A procurement cell has been established with the recruitment of a procurement specialist, two junior consultants and the evaluation committees for the procurement process have been notified. In addition, 1 PEC is assigned as procurement focal point.							

Action Description	Maintain a publicly accessible website where all disclosable procurement data will be available and regularly updated					
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status	
Fiduciary Systems		PECT	Recurrent	Continuous	In Progress	
Completion Measurement	Website with d	Website with disclosable procurement data				
Comments	Publicly accessible Program website (http://www.spfms.gov.bd/forms/form/1/-) with different procurement sections was launched in January 2021. Annual procurement plan is uploaded in the website and needs to be updated with the latest procurement data					

Action Description	FD seeks the advice of environmental and social expert(s) for the Program, as needed for Program activities				
Source	DLI# Responsibility Timing Timing Value Status				
Environmental and Social Systems		Finance Division	Recurrent	Continuous	Not Yet Due
Completion Measurement	Either in-house capacity built or assistance sought from IMED				
Comments	So far no need seems to be has arisen, but the Bank team will speak with PECT on this.				

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

1/20/2022 Page 4 of 21

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	Substantial	Substantial	Substantial
Macroeconomic	□Moderate	Substantial	Substantial
Sector Strategies and Policies	□Moderate	□Moderate	□Moderate
Technical Design of Project or Program	□Moderate	□Moderate	□Moderate
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	□Moderate	□Moderate	□Moderate
Fiduciary	Substantial	Substantial	Substantial
Environment and Social	□Low	□Low	□Low
Stakeholders	□Moderate	□Moderate	□Moderate
Other			
Overall	□Moderate	□Moderate	□Moderate

Comments

The risks will be re-assessed during the MTR and ratings updated accordingly.

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Improve fiscal forecasting and resource allocation consistent with Government priorities					
►Use of improved fiscal projections for budget-making (Yes/No, Custom)					
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	
Value	No	No	No	Yes	
Date	31-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024	
Comments	in June 2021. The fi has been completed is expected that mo	The requirements for the Macroeconomic model have been finalized and approved by the Finance Division in June 2021. The full dataset of macroeconomic variables for the real, monetary, external and fiscal sectors has been completed. Training program is ongoing on the macroeconomic model for improved projections. It is expected that model will be used for FY2022-23 budget preparation. The Debt Bulletin has been published - https://mof.gov.bd/site/page/9466b739-2f5c-4914-ba82-b204af6a594e/Debt-Bulletin			
►Improved budget ali	gnment with development strate	gy through better performance	of BMCs (Percentage, Cus	tom)	
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target	
Value	0.00	0.00	0.00	20.00	
Date	01-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024	

1/20/2022 Page 5 of 21

Consultative workshop to finalize the Peer Review Guideline for the Budget Management Committee (BMC) Scorecard was held on December 2, 2021. The Peer Review Guideline sets the principles to assess performance of BMCs of ministries/divisions/other institutions. Objectives of peer review are as follows:

- Measure performance of BMCs of ministries/divisions using a scorecard;
- Share the best practices among the ministries/divisions/other institutions;
- Improve the functioning of the BMCs in the areas such as, budget preparation, execution and monitoring, disposal of audit objections and capacity development.

The scorecard is designed on the assumption of linking policy, planning and budgeting under medium-term budget framework (MTBF). For this reason, the functions of BMCs are divided in four areas:

- (a) Alignment of MTBF with policies and strategies,
- (b) Budget Review & Approval
- (c) Monitoring, Evaluation & Audit Disposal; and
- (d) Capacity Development of BMCs and Miscellaneous.

▶ Reduced number of days for DDOs to receive budget in selected MDAs (Percentage, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	53.92	56.97	60.00
Date	01-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024

56.97 percent of Drawing and Disbursing Officers' (DDOs) FY2021-22 budget was released by July 31, 2021. 59.99 percent and 67.99 percent were released up to September and December 2021 respectively.

Comments

Comments

Improve budget execution in service delivery MDAs

▶ Timely and reliable payments of salaries and vendor invoices with a strengthened TSA and automated payment system (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	EFT used for officers' salaries only. No online bills submission. Stock take of special accounts & EBFs will be done.	- 85% (1m out of 1.2m) transactions are done through EFT. EFT is used mainly for pay bill and pension purposes. During the mission the team reiterated that DDO online bill submission includes vendor invoices on which there has been limited progress so far. - 21,000 of the 36,000 DDOs are submitting staff pay bill online. The task for developing a full-fledged DDO with provision for submitting all types of bills online is on-going.	- 85% (1m out of 1.2m) transactions are done through EFT. EFT is used mainly for pay bill and pension purposes. During the mission the team reiterated that DDO online bill submission includes vendor invoices on which there has been limited progress so far. - 21,000 of the 36,000 DDOs are submitting staff pay bill online. The task for developing a full-fledged DDO with provision for submitting all types of bills online is on-going.	- 40% EFT - 30% DDOs submitting online bills - Number of new (outside TSA) special accounts opened annually reduced by 40%

1/20/2022 Page 6 of 21

Date	01-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024
Comments	impact on the detern Reduction in costs o and prompt settleme	of improving cash management nination of borrowing requirement f borrowing to the government ent of government obligations w of cash held outside of the TS	ents will be improved by co will increase fiscal space fo ill increase confidence in the	nsolidating cash balances. or allocation to service deliv ne payment system. DLI 4
omote enhanced trar	nsparency of the budget execution	and enable timely accountabil	ity	
►Budget holders in s	selected MDAs effectively and tran	sparently use financial informa	tion (Percentage, Custom)	
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
√alue	0.00	70.00	70.00	50.00
Date	01-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024
Comments		ports are available for 70% DD ports (BERs) by a sample group		
	budget excedition rep	onto (BEING) by a sample group	o oi users iroini selecteu ivi	IDA3.

Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Improve budget execution in service	ce delivery MDAs			
►SOE and autonomous bodies'	debt and contingent liabilities	statement prepared and sub	mitted to the policy makers	s (Text, Custom)
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	- SOE debt and contingent liabilities are not effectively controlled - Partial data of SOEs profitability published in the annual Economic Survey of Bangladesh - Fiscal risks assessments have not been conducted	- A template for the debt and contingent liabilities statement has been prepared. Virtual stakeholder workshop held on June 28, 2021 to finalize the Procedure to Regulate the Debt and Contingent Liabilities of State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs)/Autonomous Bodies (ABs) As of June 2021, SOE-MC provided a list of 70 SOEs for which validation is ongoing to ascertain publication of their financial statements on individual websites.	- Virtual stakeholder workshop held on June 28, 2021 and November 28,2021 in presence of the Senior Secretary of FD to finalize the Procedure to Regulate the Debt and Contingent Liabilities of State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs)/Autonomous Bodies (ABs). Finally, the procedure was approved by the Senior Secretary of FD on 28 December 2021 and official Government Order (GO) issued on December 30, 2021. - As of November 2021, SOE-MC provided a list of 84 SOEs for which validation is ongoing to ascertain publication of their financial statements on individual websites.	- Policy and procedures to regulate SOEs' debt and contingent liabilities (including an upgraded framework for reporting by SOEs to the Finance Division) have been drafted and issued by MoF 100 SOEs and autonomous bodies have published their audited financial statements (covering the relevant Fiscal Year for which the DLR is being assessed) SOE debt and contingent liabilities statement (covering the relevant Fiscal Year for which the DLR is being assessed) has been prepared by MoF for all SOEs and

1/20/2022 Page 7 of 21

				submitted to policy makers.
Date	01-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024
Comments	Currently, financial informat Bangladesh, SOE fiscal risk controlled. This indicator se	s are not assessed and deb	t and contingent liabilities a	
Improved performance	of the SOE sector and reduced subs	idies as a percentage of tota	al public sector spending (T	ext, Custom)
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value		- Independent Performance Evaluation Guideline (IPEG) that will cover 166 SOEs/ABs has been approved and Government Order was issued in March 2021. - 10 SOEs have been selected that will undergo an independent performance evaluation, in accordance with the SOE performance evaluation guidelines developed.	- Independent Performance Evaluation Guideline (IPEG) that will cover 166 SOEs/ABs has been approved and Government Order was issued in March 2021. - Membership of the Independent Performance Evaluation Committee (IPEC) for conducting the independent performance evaluation was officially approved on November 14, 2021 and evaluation is expected to start on the first set of 10 SOEs/ABs. - The following 10 SOEs have been selected to undergo an independent performance evaluation in accordance with the approved SOE independent performance evaluation guidelines (IPEG). 1. Chittagong Port Authority (CPA) 2. Bangladesh Bridge Authority (BBA) 3. Bangladesh Overseas Employment and Service Limited (BOESL) 4. Khulna Development Authority (KDA) 5. Bangladesh Inland Water Transport Authority (BIWTA) 6. Bangladesh Small and Cottage Industries Corporation (BSCIC)	- SOE performance evaluation guideline have been developed by the Finance Division, with clear scoring criteria A policy and procedures manual that enables an effective review of grants to SOEs has been drafted and issued by the Finance Division At least 10 SOEs have undergone an independent performance evaluation, in accordance with the SOE performance evaluation guideline developed Turnaround strategies have been developed for at least 10 non-performing SOEs The ratio of SOE transfers to total put spending (in the

1/20/2022 Page 8 of 21

			7. Bangladesh Pow Development Board (BPDB) 8. Bangladesh Petrolium Corporati (BPC) 9.Bangladesh Ship Corporation (BSC) 10. Bangladesh Fol Industries Develop Corporation (BFIDC	d ion ping rest ment	
Date	01-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024	
Comments	DLI7 seeks to impro	While there is some performance monitoring of SOEs there is no systematic and independent monitoring. DLI7 seeks to improve the monitoring and evaluation of SOEs through the completion of independent performance evaluation.			

Promote enhanced transparency of the budget execution and enable timely accountability

▶ Improved pension service (disaggregated by gender) through the EFT no later than the following pension payment cycle after retirement (Text, Custom)

(Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	- Long process often results in a significant delay after retirement to prepare a Pension Payment Order - All pension and GP fund records are manual and prone to human errors	- The Pension Service and GPF Module of iBAS++ have been implemented and is operational. Disbursement for partial achievement has been made. Verification for the next disbursement is in process. - All the new pensioners have been linked to the employee/payroll database and their monthly pension and allowances are paid through EFT from the first month of retirement. - Using NID, electronic Pension Payment Order (ePPO) has been made fully operational. - Deduction of GPF Subscription and Loan Repayment are linked with Budget Execution Module. - Pension backlog cases still an issue. So far	- The Pension Service and GPF Module of iBAS++ have been implemented and is operational. Disbursement for partial achievement has been made. Verification for the next disbursement is in process. - Disbursement has been made on the achievement of all the DLRs' except DLR 5.3. The CAO Pension & Fund Management team has been generating GPF and Pension reports which will be submitted to OCAG for verification soon. - All the new pensioners have been linked to the employee/payroll database and their monthly pension and allowances are paid through EFT from the first month of retirement.	- The GP Fund Module and the Pension Service Module of iBAS++ have been implemented and are operational A centralized pensior roll with EFT payment capability has been established and is operational A government-wide annual GPF and Pension Service report has been produced The number of cases of delayed pension payments is reduced by 50% 90% of new pensioners are paid through EFT no later than the pension payment cycle following their retirement.

1/20/2022 Page 9 of 21

		61.78% back log cases have been resolved.	 Using NID, electronic Pension Payment Order (ePPO) has been made fully operational. Deduction of GPF Subscription and Loan Repayment are linked with Budget Execution Module. Pension backlog has been reduced and at present the of cases is less than 200. 	
Date	01-Nov-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024
Comments	through EFT. Pension proce pensioners, there is an urge pension office (ii) the use of (iBAS++), this IR seeks to s	e timely processing of pensic essing is cumbersome for bo ent need to modernize the sy f EFT and (iii) strengthened a treamline pension processir actions which are necessary	oth the Government of Ban ystem through (i) establish accounting and monitoring ng and payment system by	gladesh (GoB) and the nent of a dedicated systems by linking with undertaking immediate
► Action taken on internal	and external audit reports in Selecte	ed MDAs and post-procurem	nent reviews in the Finance	Division (Text, Custom)
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	Internal audit units are not effective. Internal audit activities consist primarily of ex-post reviews focused on financial compliance.	- It was agreed that internal audit units will be established at	- It was agreed that internal audit units will be established at departmental-level starting with high-risk and high-spending departments. MOF held a virtual sensitization meeting followed by a face to face workshop to discuss the objective of the intervention and to understand the current IA practices in the pilot departments and their challenges. Recruitment process of consultants is on to provide strategic guidance to the	- The Model Internal Audit Charter and the Risk-based Internal Audit Manual have been issued by the Finance Division A system for annual procurement planning and post-review has been established by the Finance Division and training on the system has been conducted Internal audit reports, prepared in accordance with the Model Internal Audit Charter and the Risk-based Internal Audit

1/20/2022 Page 10 of 21

management and internal

control processes at the

relevant Ministry or

- The internal audit

'structure' established at

Finance Division, will be responsible for the

Division or Other

Institution".

guidance to the

Manual. The

departments and to

prepare Audit Charter

and Risk based Audit

departmental internal

audit units will report

Principal Accounting Officer (PAO), who

functionally to the

based Internal Audit

Manual issued, have

heads of departments

any two departments

in any of the Selected

been issued to the

and principal accounting officers of

MDAs.

development of a model internal audit charter, guidelines, risk-based audit manual, quality assurance and continuous training. A consulting firm will be hired to provide technical assistance including conduct of post-procurement reviews.

- It was agreed that postreview of procurement will be conducted at the procurement cell, established in the program office under SPFMS program and entrusted for entire procurement of the program. according to section 19(a) of the 2009 Public Moneys and Budget Management Act (PMBMA) is responsible "to ensure efficient and transparent financial management and internal control processes at the relevant Ministry or Division or Other Institution".

- The internal audit 'structure' established at Finance Division, will be responsible for the development of a model internal audit charter, guidelines, risk-based audit manual, quality assurance and continuous training. A consulting firm will be hired to provide technical assistance including conduct of post-procurement reviews.

- It was agreed that post-review of procurement will be conducted at the procurement cell, established in the program office under SPFMS program and entrusted for entire procurement of the program.

- The relevant Audit Committees resolve 50% of: (i) audit recommendations for each of the Selected MDAs, other than the Finance Division and (ii) audit recommendations and procurement postreviews in Finance Division, based on the stock of total audit recommendations and procurement postreviews, as applicable, pending for each of the relevant Selected MDAs and the Finance Division respectively, at the beginning of the relevant Fiscal Year in which the DLR is being assessed.

Date 01-Oct-2018 12-Jul-2021 21-Jan-2022 30-Jun-2024

Comments

Internal audit (IA) is ad hoc and unstructured with isolated single audits and the applied standards are not based on International Standards for the Professional Practice in Internal Audit issued by The Institute of Internal Auditors (IIA). Focus is more on pre-audit of documents and transactions for accuracy and compliance; outputs are dependent upon the skills of specific individuals holding the position as part of the larger organizational unit with no specific professional practices and capabilities established; funding is approved by management as needed; enabling infrastructure is absent with no or minimal use of information technology. DLI 9 seeks to establish a modern internal audit function in selected large spending and high-risk departments as part of the suite of internal controls using risk-based audit methods concentrating on systemic issues and providing independent and objective advice to management.

Establish an enabling environment for improved PFM outcomes

▶ PFM Action Plan implementation is effectively led through an adequate governance structure and an effective change management approach (Text, Custom)

Baseline Actual (Previous) Actual (Current) End Target

1/20/2022 Page 11 of 21

Value

PFM reform implementation, monitoring, and course-correction are not adequately coordinated, and a comprehensive change management approach needs to be implemented

- Three PFM Action Plan Semi-annual progress report has been approved by the SC.
- All three Independent Verification Agencies are on board.
- IPF has finalized 5 research topics. A consortium led by the CIPFA has been engaged to support the IPF in achieving three fundamental objectives: i) the development of a PFM Competency Framework; ii) a training needs assessment (TNA) and; iii) a Code of Conduct for PFM professionals.
- Field inspection- How to Note has been approved and circulated.
- Five field inspections to Natore, Kishorgonj, Khulna, and Bagerhat have been conducted.
- Recruitment process for hiring 4 Implementation Support Consultants (ICSs) completed in March 2021. 1st cohort of ISCs successfully trained, on boarded and deployed to specific PITS. Training report prepared.
- 19 officials have enrolled for master's degree in different universities.

- Three PFM Action Plan Semi-annual progress report has been approved by the SC.
- All three Independent Verification Agencies are on board.
- IPF has finalized 5 research topics. REol was published in September 2021, Eol received for three research papers and technical sub-committee of 3 members headed by Dr. Md. Tarique, Director, Bangladesh Institute Governance & Management (BIGM) is ongoing.
- A consortium led by the CIPFA engaged to support the IPF has delivered: (i) the development of a PFM Competency Framework; (ii) a training needs assessment (TNA) and; (iii) a Code of Conduct for PFM professionals.
- Field inspection How to Note has been approved and circulated.
- Five field inspections to Natore, Kishorgonj, Khulna, and Bagerhat have been conducted.
- Recruitment process for hiring 4 Implementation Support Consultants (ICSs) completed in March 2021. 1st cohort of ISCs successfully trained, on boarded and deployed to specific PITS. Training report prepared.
- Recruitment process for hiring a 2nd cohort of 10 Implementation Support Consultants (ICSs) completed in December 2021. 2nd

- Two PFM Action Plan progress reports (prepared on a semiannual basis in a Fiscal Year) have been submitted by the PECT to the Steering Committee.
- Two PFM Action Plan stakeholder retreats conducted to review the respective semi-annual PFM Action Plan progress reports prepared under DLR 10.1 in a Fiscal Year.
- The PFM Learning Hub has produced at least 3 research papers on PFM reform lessons and published the said reports through its website. - 6 field inspections to
- government service delivery centers to identify PFM-related issues have been carried out. - The PECT has
- prepared a report evaluating the performance of coaches, facilitators and/or implementation support consultants engaged to support the implementation of the PFM Action Plan.
- 100 civil servants (with data disaggregated by gender) have completed specialized PFM-related courses/certifications.

1/20/2022 Page 12 of 21

			Cohort is expected be on board by the of January 2022.	
			 - 19 officials have enrolled for master' degree in different universities. 	s
Date	01-Oct-2018	12-Jul-2021	21-Jan-2022	30-Jun-2024
Comments	from both successes PFM problems. The implementation, and these are reviewed i accountability. DLI10 capacity of the Instit inspections, and pro	s and failures during the progse change management actions. M&E systems, such as enaing a broad-based program reduction also seeks to establish a sure of Public Finance as a leblem-solving facilitation/ coalanalysis of the enabling environments.	gram implementation and imp vities include the key elemen bling progress reports to the treat encouraging results mo ustainable PFM learning env earning hub and institutionaliz	ats of program's governance, Steering Committee and that enitoring and mutual ironment with strengthened cing the PFM research, field reviews and DLI verification wil

Disbursement Linked Indicators

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
'alue	Static revenue and expenditure estimates restrict effective policy making.	- The macroeconomic model requirements have been finalized (DLR 1.1) and approved by the Finance Division. - The full dataset of macroeconomic variables for the real, monetary, external, and fiscal sectors has been completed. A training has been conducted on the use of World Bank's Macro-Fiscal Model (MFMOD). The procurement of the software is ongoing. - The debt bulleting has been published. Preparation of MTDS is ongoing.	- The macroeconomic model requirements have been finalized (DLR 1.1) and approved by the Finance Division in June 2021. - The full dataset of macroeconomic variables for the real, monetary, external, and fiscal sectors has been completed. A training has been conducted on the use of World Bank's Macro-Fiscal Model (MFMOD). The procurement of the software is ongoing. - The Debt Bulletin has been published - https://mof.gov.bd/site/pag e/9466b739-2f5c-4914-ba82-b204af6a594e/Debt-Bulletin - Stakeholder consultation on the draft Medium Term Debt Strategy was held on January 12, 2022.	DLR 1.5 Projectic from the upgraded Macro-Economic Model have been used for MTMF and budget preparation

1/20/2022 Page 13 of 21

Date	 12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021	
Comments			

▶DLI 2 Improved budget alignment with development strategy and gender, social, and climate considerations through better performance of BMCs (Outcome, 14,000,000.00, 0%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
Value	BMCs are not fully functional and require additional capacity and empowerment. Gender disaggregated budget summary is produced. Average spending on the Social Infrastructure for last two years is 28.87%.	- ToRs of BMCs and BWGs approved and Government Order issued in June 2021. - Review of the performance score card for BWG and BMC is still ongoing. - Most recent available public data for FY2019-20 show 24.32 percent spending on social infrastructure that is within the boundary of the Financing Agreement definition of social sector. Data on actual spending for FY2019-20 is 24.3 percent.	- ToRs of BMCs and BWGs approved and Government Order issued in June 2021. - Consultative workshop to finalize the Peer Review Guideline for the Budget Management Committee (BMC) Scorecard was held on December 2, 2021. - Most recent available public data for FY2019-20 show 24.32 percent spending on social infrastructure that is within the boundary of the Financing Agreement definition of social sector. Data on actual spending for FY2019-20 is 24.3 percent.	DLR 2.4 The average performance score of BMCs evaluated through interministerial peerreviews has improved by at least 25% (\$2.5m) DLR 2.5 The Government's expenditure on Social Sectors has increased to 29.25% of total actual public expenditure (\$2.5m)
Date		12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021	
Comments				

▶DLI 3 Reduced number of days for DDOs to receive budget in selected MDAs (Outcome, 6,000,000.00, 0%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
Value	Currently the budget release and distribution to DDOs takes around 2 months for the first quarter. Budget release from the MoF to line ministry is no longer required from this year. Average budget release delay for quarter 3	- A circular was issued on 12 April, 2020 to ease the fund release process for 4th tranche of the 'grant in aid' given to autonomous bodies and private institutions under Operating Budget.	- A circular was issued on 12 April, 2020 to ease the fund release process for 4th tranche of the 'grant in aid' given to autonomous bodies and private institutions under Operating Budget.	
	and 4 is 2.3 months for health sector	- 53.92 percent of DDOs received their budget for FY 2019-20 by 31 July 2019.	- 56.97 percent of DDOs FY2021-22 budget was released by 31 July 2021. 59.99 percent and 67.99 percent were released up	

1/20/2022 Page 14 of 21

	- The Accounting Module of iBAS++ show that DDO-wise budget release under the umbrella of pay-points for CAFOs, DCAs, DAFOs and UAOs.	to September and December 2021 respectively.
Date	12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021
Comments		

▶ DLI 4 Timely and reliable payments of salaries and vendor invoices with a strengthened TSA and automated payment system (Outcome, 9,000,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
Value	EFT used for officers' salaries only No online bills submission	- DLR 4.2 (At least 50% government payment transactions are made through EFT) has been partially achieved. EFT is used mainly for pay bill and pension purposes. DDO online bill submission includes vendor invoices on which there has been limited progress so far. - Initial data on bank deposits of government sector collected revealed 454,823 bank accounts. - 21,000 of the 36,000 DDOs are submitting staff pay bill online. The task for developing a full-fledged DDO with provision for submitting all types of bills online is on-going.	- DLR 4.2 (At least 50% government payment transactions are made through EFT) has been partially achieved. EFT is used mainly for pay bill and pension purposes. DDO online bill submission includes vendor invoices on which there has been limited progress so far. - Initial data on bank deposits of government sector collected revealed 454,823 bank accounts. - 21,000 of the 36,000 DDOs are submitting staff pay bill online. The task for developing a full-fledged DDO with provision for submitting all types of bills online is ongoing.	DLR 4.4 The number of new special accounts (outside the TSA) opened (in the relevant Fiscal Year in which the DLR is being assessed) has been reduced by 50%
Date		12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021	
Comments				

▶DLI 5 Improved pension service (disaggregated by gender) through the EFT no later than the following pension payment cycle after retirement (Outcome, 10,000,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
Value	Long process often results in a significant delay after	- The Pension Service and GPF Module of iBAS++ have been	 The Pension Service and GPF Module of iBAS++ have been 	DLR 5.5 90% of new pensioners are paid through EFT no

1/20/2022 Page 15 of 21

	retirement to prepare a Pension Payment Order All pension and GP fund records are manual and prone to human errors	implemented and is operational. Disbursement for partial achievement has been made. Verification for the next disbursement is in process. - All the new pensioners have been linked to the employee/payroll database and their monthly pension and allowances are paid through EFT from the first month of retirement. - Using NID, electronic Pension Payment Order (ePPO) has been made fully operational. - Deduction of GPF Subscription and Loan Repayment are linked with Budget Execution Module.	implemented and is operational. Disbursement for partial achievement has been made. Verification for the next disbursement is in process. - All the new pensioners have been linked to the employee/payroll database and their monthly pension and allowances are paid through EFT from the first month of retirement. - Using NID, electronic Pension Payment Order (ePPO) has been made fully operational. - Deduction of GPF Subscription and Loan Repayment are linked with Budget Execution Module.	later than the pension payment cycle following their retirement
Date Comments		12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021	

►DLI 6 SOE and autonomo 7,000,000.00, 0%)	ous bodies' debt and contingent	liabilities statement prepared	d and submitted to policy make	ers (Output,
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
Value	- SOE debt and contingent liabilities are not effectively controlled - Partial data of SOEs profitability published in the annual Economic Survey of Bangladesh - Fiscal risk assessments have not been conducted	- A template for the debt and contingent liabilities statement has been prepared. Virtual stakeholder workshop held on June 28, 2021 to finalize the Procedure to Regulate the Debt and Contingent Liabilities of State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs)/Autonomous Bodies (ABs) As of June 2021, SOE-MC provided a list of 70 SOEs for which validation is ongoing to ascertain publication of their financial statements on individual websites.	- Virtual stakeholder workshop held on June 28, 2021 and November 28,2021 in presence of the Senior Secretary of FD to finalize the Procedure to Regulate the Debt and Contingent Liabilities of State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs)/Autonomous Bodies (ABs). Finally, the procedure was approved by the Senior Secretary of FD on 28 December 2021 and official Government Order (GO) issued on December 30, 2021. - As of November 2021, SOE-MC provided a list of 84 SOEs for which validation is ongoing to ascertain publication of their financial statements on individual websites.	

1/20/2022 Page 16 of 21

Date	12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021	
Comments			

Comments					
►DLI 7 Improved performance of the SOE sector and reduced subsidies as a percentage of total public sector spending (Outcome, 11,000,000.00, 0%)					
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022	
Value	- SOEs are not classified as commercial and non-commercial - There is some performance monitoring of SOEs, but not systematic and independent - Grants to SOEs are not divided into different categories - Partial data of SOEs profitability published in the annual Economic Survey of Bangladesh	- Independent Performance Evaluation Guideline (IPEG) that will cover 166 SOEs/ABs has been approved and Government Order was issued in March 2021. - 10 SOEs have been selected that will undergo an independent performance evaluation, in accordance with the SOE performance evaluation guidelines developed.	- Independent Performance Evaluation Guideline (IPEG) that will cover 166 SOEs/ABs has been approved and Government Order was issued in March 2021. - Membership of the Independent Performance Evaluation Committee (IPEC) for conducting the independent performance evaluation was officially approved on November 14, 2021 and evaluation is expected to start on the first set of 10 SOEs/ABs. - The following 10 SOEs have been selected to undergo an independent performance evaluation in accordance with the approved SOE independent performance evaluation guidelines (IPEG). 1. Chittagong Port Authority (CPA) 2. Bangladesh Bridge Authority (BBA) 3. Bangladesh Overseas Employment and Service Limited (BOESL) 4. Khulna Development Authority (KDA) 5. Bangladesh Inland Water Transport Authority (BIWTA) 6. Bangladesh Small and Cottage Industries Corporation (BSCIC) 7. Bangladesh Power Development Board (BPDB) 8. Bangladesh Petrolium	DLR 7.5 The ratio of SOE transfers to total public spendir has been reduced by 15%	

1/20/2022 Page 17 of 21

		9.Bangladesh Shipping Corporation (BSC) 10. Bangladesh Forest Industries Development Corporation (BFIDC)
Date	12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021
Comments		

▶ DLI 8 Budget holders in MDAs effectively and transparently use financial information (Outcome, 12,000,000.00, 0%)

V	a	lu	e
v	a	ıu	v

-The previous classification chart limits financial reporting and analysis; and budget controllers do not use financial reports effectively -As at June 2018, the monthly report (in pdf. format) on fiscal position available on FD website was for December 2017 (six months behind). -Annual Accounts are produced with a significant delay and follow the old templates of finance and appropriation accounts

Baseline

Actual (Previous)

- Budget of FY2018-19, 2019-20 and 2020-21 released using new BACS. The option in the accounting tab named "DDO Budget release status" shows that budget had been released through iBAS++ in DDO's end.
- iBAS++ Interfaces completed with Bangladesh Bank, Sonali Bank, MoPA, Social Safety net. Work is ongoing to interface with eGP and NID/TIN databases.
- A technical report on eGP interface with brief System Requirements Specification (SRS) has been prepared and several meetings have been arranged between iBAS++ and eGP (CPTU).
- New template for IPSAS compliant financial statement is under review for OCAG's approval.
- Six SAEs use iBAS++ on a real-time basis with detailed transaction capturing; these SAEs are Public Works Department; Roads and Highways; Department of Public Health Engineering; Controller

Actual (Current)

- Budget of FY2018-19, 2019-20 and 2020-21 released using new BACS. The option in the accounting tab named "DDO Budget release status" shows that budget had been released through iBAS++ in DDO's end.
- iBAS++ Interfaces completed with Bangladesh Bank, Sonali Bank, MoPA, Social Safety net. Work is ongoing to interface with eGP and NID/TIN databases.
- A technical report on eGP interface with brief System Requirements Specification (SRS) has been prepared and several meetings have been arranged between iBAS++ and eGP (CPTU).
- New template for IPSAS compliant financial statement is under review for OCAG's approval.
- Six SAEs use iBAS++ on a real-time basis with detailed transaction capturing; these SAEs are Public Works Department; Roads and Highways; Department of Public Health Engineering; Controller General of Defense Force; Forest Department and Railways.

FY2022

DLR 8.6 60% of Budget Holders generate 10 or more monthly iBAS++ reports for budget execution decisions

1/20/2022 Page 18 of 21

General of Defense Force; Forest Department and Railways. In addition to the SAEs, Bangladesh missions in Abu Dhabi, Dubai, New Delhi and Singapore are now using iBAS++.

- FD has started publishing budget execution reports on MoF's official website (https://mof.gov.bd/site/re ports/a4cf6d30-2002-492e-97ebba3e42840ab6). In addition to the SAEs, Bangladesh missions in Abu Dhabi, Dubai, New Delhi and Singapore are now using iBAS++.

- FD has started publishing budget execution reports on MoF's official website (https://mof.gov.bd/site/re ports/a4cf6d30-2002-492e-97ebba3e42840ab6).

Date -- 12-Jul-2021 12-Jul-2021 --

Comments

▶DLI 9 Action taken on internal and external audit reports in Selected MDAs and post-procurement reviews in the Finance Division (Output, 7,000,000.00, 0%)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
Value	-Internal audit units are not effectiveInternal audit activities consist primarily of ex-post reviews focused on financial compliance -Audit follow-up takes long time	- It was agreed that internal audit units will be established at departmental-level starting with high-risk and high-spending departments. The departmental internal audit units will report functionally to the Principal Accounting Officer (PAO), who according to section 19(a) of the 2009 Public Moneys and Budget Management Act (PMBMA) is responsible "to ensure efficient and transparent financial management and internal control processes at the relevant Ministry or Division or Other Institution". - The internal audit 'structure' established at Finance Division, will be responsible for the development of a model	- It was agreed that internal audit units will be established at departmental-level starting with high-risk and high-spending departments. The departmental internal audit units will report functionally to the Principal Accounting Officer (PAO), who according to section 19(a) of the 2009 Public Moneys and Budget Management Act (PMBMA) is responsible "to ensure efficient and transparent financial management and internal control processes at the relevant Ministry or Division or Other Institution". - The internal audit 'structure' established at Finance Division, will be responsible for the development of a model internal audit charter, guidelines, risk-based	

1/20/2022 Page 19 of 21

	internal audit charter, guidelines, risk-based audit manual, quality assurance and continuous training. A consulting firm will be hired to provide technical assistance including conduct of post-procurement reviews. - It was agreed that post-review of procurement will be conducted at the procurement cell, established in the program office under SPFMS program and entrusted for entire procurement of the program.	audit manual, quality assurance and continuous training. A consulting firm will be hired to provide technical assistance including conduct of post- procurement reviews. - It was agreed that post- review of procurement will be conducted at the procurement cell, established in the program office under SPFMS program and entrusted for entire procurement of the program.
Date	12-Jul-2021	12-Jul-2021
Communico		

▶DLI 10 PFM Action Plan implementation is effectively led through an adequate governance structure and an effective change management approach (Output, 14,000,000.00, 0%)

approach (Output, 14,000,000.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	FY2022
Value	PFM reform implementation, monitoring, and course-correction are not adequately coordinated, and a comprehensive change management approach needs to be implemented	- Three PFM Action Plan Semi-annual progress report has been approved by the SC. - All three Independent Verification Agencies are on board. - IPF has finalized 5 research topics. A consortium led by the CIPFA has been engaged to support the IPF in achieving three fundamental objectives: i) the development of a PFM Competency Framework; ii) a training needs assessment (TNA) and; iii) a Code of Conduct for PFM professionals. - Field inspection- How to Note has been approved and circulated.	- Three PFM Action Plan Semi-annual progress report has been approved by the SC. - All three Independent Verification Agencies are on board. IPF has finalized 5 research topics. REol was published in September 2021, Eol received for three research papers and technical sub-committee of 3 members headed by Dr. Md. Tarique, Director, Bangladesh Institute Governance & Management (BIGM) is ongoing. - A consortium led by the CIPFA engaged to support the IPF has delivered: (i) the development of a PFM Competency Framework;	DLR 10.6 100 civil servants (with data disaggregated by gender) have completed specialized PFM-related courses/certification s.

1/20/2022 Page 20 of 21

- Five field inspections to Natore, Kishorgonj, Khulna, and Bagerhat have been conducted.
- Recruitment process for hiring 4 Implementation Support Consultants (ICSs) completed in March 2021. 1st cohort of ISCs successfully trained, on boarded and deployed to specific PITS. Training report prepared.
- 19 officials have enrolled for master's degree in different universities.

- (ii) a training needs assessment (TNA) and; (iii) a Code of Conduct for PFM professionals.
- Field inspection- How to Note has been approved and circulated.
- Five field inspections to Natore, Kishorgonj, Khulna, and Bagerhat have been conducted.
- Recruitment process for hiring 4 Implementation Support Consultants (ICSs) completed in March 2021. 1st cohort of ISCs successfully trained, on boarded and deployed to specific PITS. Training report prepared.
- Recruitment process for hiring a 2nd cohort of 10 Implementation Support Consultants (ICSs) completed in December 2021. 2nd Cohort is expected to be on board by the end of January 2022.
- 19 officials have enrolled for master's degree in different universities.

Date -- 12-Jul-2021 12-Jul-2021 --

Comments

1/20/2022 Page 21 of 21