

Understanding Inequality Through Data & Analysis

# EMERGING EVIDENCE ON GENDER FROM THE BUILDING THE EVIDENCE ON FORCED DISPLACEMENT RESEARCH PROGRAM

JENI KLUGMAN ELENA ORTIZ

#### **ABSTRACT**

This paper investigates the extent to which gender analysis was undertaken on various fronts in the Building the Evidence on Forced Displacement research program. The program is a partnership between the the UK Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office, UNHCR and the World Bank. We adapt the World Bank's own methodology of "gender tagging," which provides a consistent framework to assess the diversity of the more than 45 studies published to date. Specifically, we examine whether qualitative or quantitative gender analysis was undertaken, whether the indicators provided are causally linked to gender gaps, and whether the implications discussed propose ways to close gender gaps. We reviewed 45 studies across five global themes. The good news is that a number of studies highlight important gender findings: 31 of these papers meaningfully present gendered indicators and constraints in the text, and 24 assess gender gaps. However only 9 consider gender-specific policy implications by, for example, calling for expanded access to sexual and reproductive health services in areas affected by forced displacement. Overall, only 7 out of the 45 papers - or about 16 percent of the papers - adequately address gender and meet all three of our proposed criteria. The overarching implication of this review is that more work is needed to understand and address the intersectionality of gender and displacement, to close gender gaps in education and paid work, and to address heightened risks of gender-based violence during displacement.

The authors of this paper conducted their under the Gender Dimensions of Forced Displacement project. The project is co-led by Lucia Hanmer and Diana Arango under the guidance of Hana Brixi, Global Director, Gender Unit, The World Bank Group. The authors may be contacted at jeni.klugman@gmail.com.

Funding: This work is part of the program "Building the Evidence on Forced Displacement: A Multi-Stakeholder Partnership". The program is funded by UK aid from the United Kingdom's Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office (FCDO), it is managed by the World Bank Group (WBG) and was established in partnership with the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). The scope of the program is to expand the global knowledge on forced displacement by funding quality research and disseminating results for the use of practitioners and policy makers. This work does not necessarily reflect the views of FCDO, the WBG or UNHCR.

**Acknowledgements:** With thanks to Audrey Sacks, Fernando Xavier Montenegro Torres, Mattias K. A. Lundberg, Jan von der Goltz, and Noah Yarrow, as well as Lucia Hanmer and Diana Jimena Arango for their valuable inputs and to Emma Anderson for her valuable research assistance with this work..







## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Introduction and motivation1
2. Framework for assessing the integration of gender
3. Findings from the global themes 6
Education
Health9
Jobs
Social protection
Social cohesion
4. Conclusions
References
Annex 1: List of papers reviewed
Annex 2: Assessment of papers against gender criteria

## <sup>4</sup> 1. INTRODUCTION AND MOTIVATION

A confluence of factors, including conflict and insecurity, poverty, and climate change, have forced tens of millions of people to flee their homes, both within and across national borders. This creates immediate humanitarian needs and brings long-term consequences for the wellbeing of affected people and communities. The World Bank's Building the Evidence on Forced Displacement (BEOFD) program is a research initiative that aims to expand high quality and policy-relevant research on forced displacement to inform more effective and durable responses. It is a partnership between the UK Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office, the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), and the World Bank, engaging organizations such as the Overseas Development Institute (ODI), Columbia University, and others. The research portfolio collectively covers refugees, IDPs, returnees, and host populations in 36 countries and 6 regions of the world.

Research under the BEOFD program examines the impacts of forced displacement across several thematic areas: gender, health, social protection, education, social cohesion, and jobs.

This note reviews the various thematic programs to examine the extent to which the published research papers to date have integrated gender.<sup>1</sup>

The specific program of work on Gender Dimensions of Forced Displacement (GDFD) is not the focus of this note. Box 1 summarizes key findings from the Gender Dimensions of Forced Displacement program, while the rest of the note extracts and assesses gender-related findings from the other topic areas.

<sup>1</sup> Not included in this review are several forthcoming impact evaluations, nor are the various policy toolkits and blogs include. For an overview of all outputs, visit <a href="https://www.worldbank.org/en/programs/building-the-evidence-on-forced-displacement">https://www.worldbank.org/en/programs/building-the-evidence-on-forced-displacement</a>

### **BOX 1:** HEADLINE FINDINGS FROM THE GENDER DIMENSIONS OF FORCED DISPLACEMENT (GDFD) RESEARCH

The GDFD program examined how forced displacement affects men and women differently in terms of poverty, livelihoods, gender-based violence, and social norms.

The multi-country studies of multidimensional poverty covering Ethiopia, Nigeria, Somalia, South Sudan, and Sudan and monetary poverty analysis in Somalia and Jordan find that displaced households are generally poorer than non-displaced households. The analysis relies on a newly developed Multidimensional Poverty Index (MPI), which complements traditional monetary poverty measures by capturing the acute deprivations across 15 indicators of health, education, living standards, and financial security.<sup>2</sup> If a person is deprived in at least a third of indicators, they are identified as 'MPI poor'. The extent – or intensity – of their poverty is measured through the percentage of indicators of which they are deprived.

The MPI reveals that, generally, displacement affects a household's deprivation status, whereas gender affects differences within households, although results vary by country.<sup>3</sup> Among the forcibly displaced who are multidimensionally poor, girls are often less likely than boys to attend school. In all countries studied, males more often than females live in households where they have completed primary education and another household member has not – suggesting that men and boys' education is the priority. The gender of the household head is an indicator of multidimensional deprivation in most, but not all, countries.

For monetary poverty, many of the differences in income poverty risk between internally displaced persons (IDPs) and non-IDPs are associated with differences in household demographic characteristics and the gender and number of earners in the household. These, in turn, are often associated with displacement-related changes in household composition and gender roles.

The poverty analysis points the need to go beyond the gender of the household head to understand deprivation and poverty. For example, male-headed households are income poorer than female-headed households in both

<sup>2</sup> https://ophi.org.uk/multidimensional-poverty-index/

<sup>3</sup> Admasu, Alkire, & Scharlin-Pettee 2021.

Somalia and Jordan. However, further analysis reveals other links between gender and poverty. In Somalia, IDP families with children, especially single female caregivers, experience the highest poverty rates as is also the case for Syrian refugees in Jordan. In Somalia, compared to IDP families without children, IDP single female caregivers and couples with children are 17-20 percentage points more likely to be poor, which is not the case among non-IDP families.<sup>4</sup> Access to economic opportunities is key. In Jordan gender-specific barriers which prevent women from accessing labor markets increase the poverty risk faced by refugees. In Somalia, having more income earners of either sex reduces household poverty risk, whether or not displaced. Interestingly, for IDP households, the largest decline in poverty risk is associated with having more female earners, while having more male earners is associated with the lowest poverty risk for non-IDPs.

The research findings on livelihoods cover diverse forced displacement settings – refugees in Ethiopia<sup>5</sup> and protracted displacement of IDPs in Darfur, Sudan<sup>6</sup> – and demonstrate that substantial barriers constrain the economic opportunities of displaced women, most notably limited education and substantial care responsibilities.

The drivers of these constraints vary across settings. Endowments, specifically lack of access to land, emerge as important in Ethiopia while lack of education is critical in both Ethiopia and Darfur. Gender norms as well as factors like access to land shape participation in paid work and self-employment versus agricultural work in Darfur, with women working predominantly in family farms and businesses. Some barriers are similar for displaced and non-displaced women. For example, female household headship increases the likelihood of women's employment for refugees and hosts in Ethiopia. Nonetheless, some differences emerge across different contexts. Interestingly, in Darfur, displaced women are more likely to work than women in the host community. While women's participation in paid work can reduce their poverty risk (as found in Somalia), there is also evidence that displaced women in paid work have low earnings relative to men.

The findings on intimate partner violence (IPV) in Colombia, Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), Nigeria, Liberia, and Mali, underline that IPV rates are significantly higher for women that have been displaced, and living in households in proximity to conflict, measured by conflict-related deaths,

<sup>4</sup> Hanmer, Rubiano-Matulevich, & Santamaria 2021.

<sup>5</sup> Admasu 2021.

<sup>6</sup> Stojetz and Brück 2021.



compared to those living in peaceful areas of the country.<sup>7</sup> In Mali, wartime conflict increases the risk of all forms of IPV—physical, emotional, and sexual. In Colombia, women who have been forcibly displaced experience more severe forms of IPV often resulting in a visit to a medical facility. Women also have less control over their earnings in conflict-affected districts. Moreover, the risks faced by displaced women along their displacement journey and impacts of gender-based violence (GBV) often persist over time.

Two studies in the series focus on gender norms, which can be defined as the acceptable and appropriate actions for men and women that are reproduced through social and economic interactions. Norms are typically embedded within both formal and informal institutions. Gender attitudes can be defined as expressed views about appropriate roles, responsibilities and behaviors. The findings suggest that gender attitudes and gender norms do not always shift together, and do not always progress toward gender equality during forced displacement.<sup>8</sup> Moreover, attitudes and norms can shift without corresponding changes in behavior, at least within the time frames of the studies. For example, among women in Colombia, displacement corresponded with less rigid patriarchal norms around gender roles and GBV but reduced the ability of women to make decisions about contraception and earnings.

The next section outlined criteria against which to assess the extent to which the global themes investigated in the World Bank's forced displacement research program integrated gender.

Section 3 applies those criteria to the research papers available, and the final section concludes.

<sup>7</sup> Arango et al. 2021.

<sup>8</sup> Arango et al. 2021; Krafft, Assaad, and Pastoor 2021.

## 2. FRAMEWORK FOR ASSESSING THE INTEGRATION OF GENDER

The appropriate framework for assessing the extent to which gender was integrated is not obvious. Only one of the research programs – social cohesion – explicitly mention gender among the study objectives in the website descriptions. We adapt the Bank's own methodology for assessing the gender integration, known as Gender Tagging. Gender Tagging is applied to all Bank operations and is summarized in Box 2.

#### **BOX 2:** WORLD BANK GENDER TAGGING

The World Bank Group's Gender Strategy for 2016-2023 lays out four strategic objectives: improving human endowments; removing constraints for more and better jobs; removing barriers to women's ownership and control of assets and enhancing women's voice and agency and engaging men and boys. These objectives guide the World Bank's work around gender and are covered by the GDFD research program.

The Gender Tag was introduced in 2017 to systematically track the implementation of the Gender Strategy.<sup>9</sup> All IBRD and IDA operations – regardless of the sector or mode of financing – are subject to gender tagging. In order for an operation to be "gender tagged", three elements are required:

<sup>9</sup> https://worldbankgroup.sharepoint.com.mcas.ms/sites/WBGender/sitepages/systempages/detail. aspx/documents/mode=view?\_id=153&siteurl=/sites/wbgender

- 1. Analysis of gender gaps,
- 2. Actions designed to narrow or close the identified gaps, and
- **3. Monitoring and Evaluation** through indicators with baseline and target values in the Results Framework to monitor the project's contribution in narrowing the gaps.

Between FY14 and FY19, the share of World Bank projects that were gender tagged increased from 24 percent to 65 percent, reflecting a growing commitment to advancing equality under the Gender Strategy.<sup>10</sup>

While the Gender Tag is not directly applicable to research, here we adapt this approach to help establish a framework for this assessment. This allows us to apply a method consistently and transparently across the diverse set of papers.

Our framework assesses three basic questions, namely, does the research:

- Assess quantitative or qualitative data to identify gender gaps - to the disadvantage of either men or women;
- 2. Provide indicators that are causally linked to gender gaps, and apply research methods to identify the constraints that drive the observed gaps.
- Present policy and programmatic implications that consider ways in which development and humanitarian actors could work to close gender gaps and address their drivers.

Note that our assessment criteria do not require analysis of whether gender

gaps differ between hosts and forcibly displaced groups, although this was a major focus of the gender dimensions of forced displacement research program, as outlined in Box 1.

Our focus is on the new BEOFD research and analysis, and our method does not count mentions of gender in the literature review, background, or context sections of the papers. The list of research papers reviewed is in Annex 1.

Each of the thematic programs had a large policy focus, for example, the health research theme aims to "provide practical programming and policy guidance to national and international actors who are involved in directing and funding health responses in situations of forced displacement," while the education program seeks to identify "what

<sup>10</sup> https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/35219/World-Bank-Group-Gender-Strategy-Mid-Term-Review-An-Assessment-by-the-Independent-Evaluation-Group.pdf?sequence=5&isAllowed=y



programs and policies are needed to provide inclusive and quality education for forcibly displaced populations." All four thematic areas are relevant to closing gender gaps and realizing the strategic objectives of the World Bank's gender strategy outlined in Box 2, though none of the thematic areas explicitly refer to the Bank's commitments on gender.

The following section applies this framework, and presents the findings grouped by theme. It is based on a desk review of research papers of the five research programs that were available as of October 2022. It is largely descriptive in the sense that we merely document the extent to which gender was integrated. Broader cross cutting findings are highlighted at the end.

As noted above, we do not examine work outside the global themes, that is, the set of 11 focus papers nor the 15 impact evaluations that have been commissioned under the overall project. The website descriptions suggest that these activities do not address gender dimensions, with a couple of exceptions. <sup>11</sup>

<sup>11</sup> The exceptions are two of the forthcoming evaluations, about intimate partner violence prevention in Cameroon and women's economic participation in Kenya – and one of the forthcoming focus papers, which is the impact of displacement amidst the Boko Haram insurgency in Nigeria on the social norms in host communities, with a focus on women's empowerment, contraceptive use, and violence against women.

#### 3. FINDINGS FROM THE GLOBAL THEMES

The BEOFD program – excluding GDFD outputs – has generated 45 research papers as of October 2022, that are subject to review here. This section presents how the program research papers compare against the three-fold gender criteria outlined above.

Only 7 of the 45 research outputs meet all three gender assessment criteria (table 1). About two thirds include gender-disaggregated indicators, but most do not explore gender analysis. We found that 9 outputs discuss policies to close gender gaps, the bulk of which emerge from the Health program.

#### TABLE 1: BEOFD TREATMENT OF GENDER: SUMMARY TABLE

Global theme	Total	Number of papers meeting criteria				
	number of research papers	Assessment of gender gaps	Presents gendered indicators and identification of constraints	Considers policy and program implications to close gender gaps	Meets all three criteria	
Education	2	2	2	1	1/2	
Health	9	7	7	4	3/9	
Jobs	2	1	0	0	0/2	
Social Protection	6	4	3	2	2/6	
Social Cohesion	26	11	18	2	1/26	
Totals	45	25	30	9	7/45	

The good news is that 30 of these papers present gendered indicators and constraints in the text, and 25 assess gender gaps. However only 9 consider gender-specific policy implications by, for example, calling for expanded access to sexual and reproductive health services in areas affected by forced displacement. Overall, only 7 out of the 45 papers – or about 16 percent of the papers – fully address gender and meet all three of our proposed criteria.

The sections below cover the various global themes in turn, identifying and assessing the approach and findings against our three gender assessment criteria. We review all the studies with a focus on those which included gender analysis and indicators.

We argue that there appear to be a number of missed opportunities for the analysis of gender, opportunities which, if investigated, could have deepened our knowledge about the impacts of forced displacement across various sectors, and led to better-grounded policy recommendations.

It seems that in some cases lack of gender-disaggregated data limited the analysis, although more generally, it seems that there was potential for deeper investigation of gender related dimensions, consistent with the World Bank's global gender strategy and commitments. This is especially important where gender-related constraints are cross cutting – for example, social norms that limit for example constraints on women's mobility that impede their

access to services and ability to take up economic opportunities.

#### **EDUCATION**

This theme addresses the implementation, impact, costs, and cost-effectiveness of education for forcibly displaced populations and host communities, and the programs and policies needed to provide inclusive and quality education for forcibly displaced populations.

As of October 2022, the education program had published two papers, in partnership with UNHCR, FDCO and the American Institutes of Research (AIR). The first is a systematic review and cost-effectiveness analysis of interventions focusing on education in situations affected by forced displacement.

The review identified 194 programs across 22 countries selected based on criteria related to socioeconomic classification, region, policy environment, and size of the displaced population.<sup>12</sup> The review doesn't state how many interventions deliberately targeted displaced women and girls but does highlight some. For example, the Womanity Foundation's *School in a Box* program in Afghanistan implemented vocational training pilot programs in public schools for displaced women.

The review also highlights a range of gender-specific education outcomes, including the following:

- In Kenyan refugee camps, the targeted provision of mobile technology and online social networks targeting displaced women increased their access to higher education. It does not specify if there was a provision of mobile technology for men or its impact on men.
- Training programs for conflict-affected teachers in Uganda aimed at promoting positive gender norms positively influenced teachers' knowledge of gender-related issues but did not have a significant effect on the adoption of teaching practices to close gender gaps. Findings suggest that traditional gender norms were a barrier to behavior change.
- In the Philippines, the construction of typhoon-resistant schools was significantly associated with increased educational attainment for girls while there was no significant effect for boys. The review states that it is possible that the larger effects for girls were driven primarily by differences in school enrollment at baseline, and urges caution in interpretation because these results are based on one study that had a high risk of selection bias. The program was targeted to children affected by disaster and not necessarily IDPs. They don't discuss the possibility that girls' education may be more vulnerable to disruption due to disasters.
- A lack of female involvement in the planning of education facilities in

- Afghanistan resulted in poor designs and low-quality construction, highlighting the need for women's inclusion at all stages of educational provision.
- Evidence on gender differences in learning outcomes of education programs in contexts of forced displacement was mixed. Evaluations of programs aiming to expand the quality and reach of education in DRC, Jordan, Senegal, and Sudan did not find significant differences in learning outcomes by gender. However, the Feed the Monster<sup>13</sup> program in Syria aimed at increasing literacy among displaced children did find larger effects for girls.

However, the systematic review found that drawing conclusions about gender impacts of education programs in forced displacement contexts is challenging due to small sample sizes. On average, the median sample size of the programs reviewed was 402 students, making it statistically difficult to detect different effects by gender. The review did not specifically identify which interventions did collect gender-disaggregated data on outcomes.

The second paper summarizes a series of case studies covering Chad, Colombia, Jordan, Pakistan, which will also be published separately, as well as Sudan, that explore how education systems can be adapted and strengthened to better serve displaced and non-displaced children following crisis.<sup>14</sup>

<sup>13</sup> The Feed the Monster program focused on distance learning using education apps for out-of-school primary aged children in Syria.

<sup>14</sup> Burde et al. 2023, forthcoming.

The review combines several methodologies, including a desk review, key informant interviews, focus group discussions, and costing analyses. For interviews, analysts applied a common coding structure following 11 categories, one of which was gender to evaluate different effects for girls and boys. Notably, discussion of these gendered impacts is sparse. The only major key finding related to gender is that in Pakistan, long travel distances to school prevent education access especially for girls.

Both papers do include gender-specific policy recommendations, such as greater collaboration between local women's organizations and local governments to ensure greater equity and inclusion in access and education design and more training for displaced women teachers from national governments and organizations like UNHCR to increase their capacity.

Assessed against the three evaluation criteria, both education papers do consider gender-specific indicators and do evaluate the gendered impacts of forced displacement on educational access. Only the case study review incorporates policies to close gender gaps into their recommendations through emphasizing the importance of working with local women's organizations, training more female teachers, and working to ensure girls don't have to travel great distances to get to school. The case study review does not, however, specify any possible differences between host communities and forcibly displaced populations in these recommendations. Overall, it seems that the exploration of gender in the case studies is limited and the recommendations are very broad

and general - thus there appears to be scope to further investigate how educational access and experiences differ for displaced girls and boys, and the implications for education programs.

#### HEALTH

The health research theme aims to provide practical programming and policy guidance to national and international actors who are involved in directing and funding health responses in situations of forced displacement. As of October 2022, the program has produced 9 outputs: four case studies covering Bangladesh, Colombia, DRC, and Jordan that generate new evidence around different experiences with healthcare access for forcibly displaced and host populations; one synthesis paper summarizing the case studies; and four knowledge briefs examining existing literature on the impacts of COVID-19 among displaced populations.

Through four case study reports and one summary paper, the program assesses how healthcare quality and access differs for displaced and non-displaced populations through focus group discussions, key informant interviews, and health facility assessments. All of these studies meet the first two gender assessment criteria through providing gender-specific data and meaningfully analysing gender-specific issues while producing new evidence. The summary report provides few mentions of gender besides recognizing that displaced women face added challenges and that these should be accounted for in policy

design.<sup>15</sup> However, the case study reports do present some important gender-specific findings:

- In Colombia, family planning services are not consistently available at healthcare centers. Of the 20 healthcare facilities studied, half provided emergency contraception or injectables, a quarter provided oral contraceptive pills and IUDs, and only one provided condoms or vasectomy procedures. However, the study did not assess how this limited access affects displaced and non-displaced women differently.<sup>16</sup>
- Similarly, in Jordan, all kinds of contraceptive services are provided at less than 15 percent of the 22 healthcare facilities assessed in the country, severely affecting both displaced and host women.<sup>17</sup>
- In Bangladesh, focus group interviews from Cox's Bazar revealed that women's healthcare was not adequately provided in the camp, that added barriers such as mistreatment and stigmatization of GBV survivors and scarce obstetrics services further hindered care. Women also reported safety risks in the camp, including fear of kidnapping and violence while using the latrine.<sup>18</sup>

 In DRC, displaced women reported added barriers to receiving antenatal care such as cost, transportation difficulties, and a general lack of appropriate providers.<sup>19</sup>

However, the policy implications of the foregoing findings could have been explored further. The summary paper recommends that healthcare policy design consider the determinants of health including gender, recognizing that women have differential access to livelihoods, food security, and safety in protracted displacement which creates a unique set of vulnerabilities related to health. The Bangladesh case study paper recommended establishing women-friendly safe spaces to better help connect with essential healthcare and allowing female patients to bring a female companion to medical visits.

The four knowledge briefs review a broad range of existing literature and datasets from around the world to assess the impacts of COVID-19 in settings affected by forced displacement in terms of indirect health impacts, family violence, response capacity of healthcare workers, and utilization of medical services.<sup>20</sup>

Two knowledge briefs—one by Lau et al. on preventing and mitigating the

<sup>15</sup> World Bank. 2022.

<sup>16</sup> World Bank. 2023b. Forthcoming.

<sup>17</sup> World Bank. 2023d. Forthcoming.

<sup>18</sup> World Bank. 2023a. Forthcoming.

<sup>19</sup> World Bank. 2023c. Forthcoming.

<sup>20</sup> The Jordan, Bangladesh, and DRC country briefs distinguished between hosts and forcibly displaced people in their gender findings, while the Columbia brief did not make this distinction.

impacts of COVID among displaced communities and one by Roa et al. on family violence during COVID— integrate gender-specific examples and analysis which differentiate between hosts and forcibly displaced people into the main findings, highlighting, for example:

- The pandemic has heightened existing gender inequalities, worsening risks of GBV and IPV. In contexts of forced displacement, these effects are magnified during lockdowns which also reduced access to support services. 21 Restrictions on movement within the camps and settlements can inhibit women's ability to escape dangerous or violent situations, while reduced access to services may have confined women in unsafe situations.
- Persons with special needs, elderly people, survivors of GBV, and members of the LGBTQ+ community face unique challenges and forms of discrimination that can exacerbate health risks during COVID-19.<sup>22</sup>
- Experiences of GBV pose longterm physical and psychological health threats to survivors including injury, high medical costs, and depression.<sup>23</sup>
- Efforts have been made by organizations such as Fundación Oriéntame and the International

Planned Parenthood Foundation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia to increase SRH provision during the pandemic, including delivering contraception and pregnancy tests to people's doorsteps. In Somalia and Sudan, UNDP has developed programs in areas affected by forced displacement to increase community-led violence prevention, such as neighborhood watches and community-based conflict resolution strategies.<sup>24</sup>

These two health knowledge briefs recommend linking external resources for SRH provision during COVID and toolkits for addressing gender-based discrimination in service provision, as well as:

- Underlining the need to communicate changes clearly and deliberately in medical service provision to marginalized populations such as women, forcibly displaced people, people with disabilities, and people with diverse gender identities.
- Ensuring the GBV and Violence against Children (VAC) responses are deemed essential services to safeguard their priority and ensure swift responses.
- Adapting GBV shelters and safe spaces to be COVID-safe and providing digital service delivery such as counselling where possible.

<sup>21</sup> Lau et al. 2020.

<sup>22</sup> Lau et al. 2020.

<sup>23</sup> Roa et al. 2020.

<sup>24</sup> Roa et al. 2020. The paper does not specify whether these programs were adopted in Somalia and Sudan in response to a particular spike in violence.



The other two knowledge briefs do not contain any meaningful gender-specific analysis. The first by Audi et al. draws on examples from around the world to explore the generally exacerbated challenges facing healthcare workers in emergency settings during COVID, including a persistent lack of personal protective equipment, stigma, financial insecurity, and a high disease burden.<sup>25</sup> There is a brief acknowledgement that women and girls often lack access to digital platforms and thus telehealth services, but this is the only time gender is mentioned. Despite the fact that women comprise 70 percent of the global health and social care workforce, 26 the brief does not discuss how overburdened health systems have disproportionately affected women.

It is increasingly well recognized that women healthcare workers and healthcare workers of minority gender

idenatities face compounding challenges, and this topic arguably warranted more attention. For example, a recent systematic review of 76 relevant articles from around the world found that during COVID, women healthcare workers were more likely to face higher risks of exposure and infection; barriers to accessing personal protective equipment; increased workloads; low leadership and decision-making opportunities; increased caregiving responsibilities in the home; and higher rates of mental ill-health, including depression, anxiety, and post-traumatic stress disorder.<sup>27</sup> It would be interesting to consider how these factors play out in displacement settings. The knowledge briefs provide useful general overviews, but there appears to be scope to better understand how, for example, COVID has specifically affected female healthcare workers working in displacement settings.

<sup>25</sup> Audi et al. 2020. It is noted that the scope is global, and there is not regional or country focus.

<sup>26</sup> Audi et al. 2020.

<sup>27</sup> Morgan et al. 2022.

The second health knowledge brief focuses on experiences of COVID among displaced Venezuelans and nationals in Colombia, comparing COVID infection rates and health service utilization and concluding that Colombians recorded higher rates of COVID but this could be due to their higher testing and treatment access.<sup>28</sup> Gender is not mentioned.

In sum, two of the four health knowledge briefs successfully meet all three criteria through assessing gender-specific gaps, incorporating data and resources that are gender-specific, and deriving policy recommendations to close gender gaps based on findings. The other two knowledge briefs do not meet any of the three criteria. Of the 9 total Health outputs, 7 meaningfully incorporate gender analysis in the results and discussion, 7 include gender-specific data and indicators, and 4 consider policy and program implications for closing gender gaps. The research collectively underlines that women's health has not been adequately prioritized, especially for women affected by forced displacement. Closing gender gaps in healthcare in fragile settings requires ongoing investigation into the unique needs and challenges facing women and girls, especially those impacted by forced displacement.

#### **JOBS**

The jobs research theme examines the cost effectiveness of various livelihood interventions in displacement settings in Uganda and a multi country study covering Iraq, Jordan, Kenya, Lebanon, Mali, and South Sudan, and the policy changes required to make displaced people self-reliant. The program has released two research papers, both drawing on datasets compiled by the World Bank and UNHCR.

"How to Cope with Refugee Shock: Evidence from Uganda" by Kadigo, Diallo, and Maystadt finds that host households living in close proximity to refugee settlements experience consumption gains, especially in rural areas, due to increased demand for agricultural products.<sup>29</sup> The UNHCR and the World Bank's Living Standards Measurement Survey include data on the population of female refugees and female-headship, but gender is not discussed in the results. For example, differential welfare impacts for female vs male-headed households are not examined. Several sex-disaggregated indicators are included - namely, the age and gender of household heads for both displaced and non-displaced populations. However, gender is not included among policy recommendations.

"Cost Effectiveness of Jobs Projects in Conflict and Forced Displacement Contexts" (2022) assesses the impacts

<sup>28</sup> Shepard et al. 2021.

<sup>29</sup> Kadigo, Oumou, and Maystadt 2022.

and monetary cost of job support programs implemented by the World Bank, UNHCR, and FCDO in six low and middle-income countries (LMICs) affected by conflict and displacement: Iraq, Jordan, Kenya, Lebanon, Mali, and South Sudan. The research reviews over 100 job support project portfolios from FCDO, UNHCR, and the World Bank, concluding that public works have the lowest cost per job created over job training, matching, economic inclusion, capital support, and market systems interventions.<sup>30</sup> The paper notes that gender specific findings are not generally discussed in the paper due to gaps in project reporting, meaning the paper's empirical findings do not include any gender-specific results, nor are the gender implications and policy implications addressed. However, the paper does include a box summarizing how gender norms around women's roles obstruct access to microfinance and promote occupational segregation in the sample countries, excluding women from jobs deemed to be 'for men' such as construction. Access to microfinance is also scarcer for women.

Notably, while the concept note and TOR documents for this program state that the work will include gender-related analysis, they explicitly state that the analysis is not intended to address the needs of women and girls and does not provide mechanisms to monitor gender-disaggregated outcomes.<sup>31</sup>

Neither of the two papers introduce novel gender-disaggregated findings nor discuss gender-specific policy implications. In their paper on Uganda, Kadigo, Diallo, and Maystadt (2021) do meet the first assessment criterium by reporting sex-disaggregated summary statistics, they do not meaningfully discuss these results in the text, exposing a missed opportunity for gender analysis.

#### SOCIAL PROTECTION

This research aims to better understand how social protection systems and humanitarian systems can work together to meet the needs of displaced populations and vulnerable households in host communities. ODI was commissioned to perform most of the analysis, which focuses on Cameroon, Colombia, and Greece. Research drew on both existing datasets and new primary research in the form of surveys and focus groups conducted among displaced populations. As of October 2022, the program had published 3 country reports and 3 thematic reports.

We find that 3 out of the 6 research papers on social protection meaningfully incorporated gender into the analysis. The fullest coverage is reflected in Hagen-Zanker et al. which explores how humanitarian and social assistance impact the welfare and wellbeing of displaced populations in Cameroon, Colombia, and Greece, and how these effects differ for male and

female-headed households.<sup>32</sup> In general, assistance provision generates more pronounced benefits for female-headed households. In Cameroon, assistance receiving IDP and refugee households headed by women were also more likely to see improvements in mental health and wellbeing than households headed by men. This leads to recommendations to target female-headed households in the provision of assistance, and to encourage closer collaboration between assistance providers and local gender-focused organizations to ensure that vulnerable populations are not overlooked.

Research by Lowe et al. covering the integration of humanitarian assistance within national social protection programs in the same three countries also frequently discuss gender-disaggregated results, especially in terms of experiences with assistance programs.<sup>33</sup> Additionally, the share of female-headed Venezuelan households who felt their complaint was fairly dealt with was significantly lower than male-headed households. Based on these findings and others, the paper recommended understanding gaps women and minorities face in receiving information about social protection programs, especially for digitized assistance where women are less likely to be digitally literate and have less access to necessary

technology.<sup>34</sup> These two papers are the only research papers in the social protection theme to include gender in policy recommendations and meet all three criteria of the gender assessment.

There is less gender-specific analysis in the paper by Tramountanis et al., which covers social protection and displacement in Greece.<sup>35</sup> Single women and mothers are prioritized in the provision of humanitarian and social assistance, although the transition period between being registered as an asylum seeker and refugee is especially difficult for especially vulnerable groups of refugees such as single or pregnant women and people with disabilities because they are often left without income, accommodation, and other forms of essential support. The paper is based on new surveys of refugees, hosts, and asylum seekers from Greece, and an equal number of men and women were interviewed. However, there is no discussion of any gendered patterns around the provision and impacts of social protection to displaced people, nor does the paper analyze gender-disaggregated data nor provide gender-specific policy implications.

Levine et al. covers the integration of humanitarian assistance and national protection schemes in Cameroon.<sup>36</sup> It briefly provides gender-disaggregated figures on employment and compares

<sup>32</sup> Hagen-Zanker et al. 2022.

<sup>33</sup> Lowe et al. 2022.

<sup>34</sup> For a review of the evidence see, for example, <a href="https://www.gsma.com/mobilefordevelopment/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/Digital-Equity-Policy-Brief-W20-Japan.pdf">https://www.gsma.com/mobilefordevelopment/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/Digital-Equity-Policy-Brief-W20-Japan.pdf</a>

<sup>35</sup> Tramountanis et al. 2022.

<sup>36</sup> Levine et al. 2022.

the sample by gender characteristics but does not examine sex-disaggregated outcomes. Again, however, the paper does not meaningfully evaluate gender-specific results or derive policy recommendations to close gender gaps.

Overall, social protection reflects relatively good coverage of gender, and highlights ways in which social protection is not equally accessible to displaced men and women: four of the six papers meet the first criterion of analyzing gender gaps and three provide sex-disaggregated data, although only two papers address the third criterion of incorporating gender into policy recommendations. The research does demonstrate the benefits of incorporating gender lens into the analysis.

#### SOCIAL COHESION

This program aims to look at the roots of social conflicts in displacement settings through the lens of social inequalities along the lines of income, opportunities, access to services and gender inequalities, between and within displaced populations and host communities. The program published 26 working papers covering over 50 countries,<sup>37</sup> relying on existing datasets. Research from the program documents the long-term impacts of conflict on education and economic outcomes for households, the importance of including IDPs

in peace agreements, social attitudes surrounding migration, and other important themes.

Across the several research themes, this program has the most extensive inclusion of gender. Our assessment suggests that 11 of the 26 research papers present gender gaps, while 18 presents gendered indicators and identification of constraints. However, far fewer papers – only two – consider the gendered policy implications, suggesting missed opportunities for analysis to explore the implications of gender analysis.

Müller, Pannatier, and Viarengo study refugee economic integration in Switzerland, measured in terms of employment rate and earnings. They find that higher unemployment rates at arrival slow down the integration process and that in locations where refugees face relatively more hostile attitudes from Swiss natives upon arrival, they integrate at a faster pace, probably due to a greater effort undertaken in environments that are more hostile.<sup>38</sup> This emerges as the only paper across the entire BEOFD program (outside GDFD) with a designated gender results section. Gender-specific analysis reveals that the employment rates of male refugees increase at a faster rate than female refugees: after 7-8 years, male refugees reach employment rates that are 15 percentage points lower than those of male natives. By contrast, it takes more than twice as long for female refugees to attain a similar gap.

<sup>37</sup> The regional breakdown of the countries is as follows: Europe (5); Latin America and the Caribbean (3); Middle East and North Africa (2); South Asia (1); and Sub-Saharan Africa (45), while Aksoy & Gin's (2021) paper covers 100 LMICs between 2005-2018.

<sup>38</sup> Müller, Pannatier, and Viarengo 2022.

However, for women who are working, the earnings gap between refugees and natives is smaller for women than for men, which is likely attributed to the relatively greater strength of women's networks that foster services that boost women's labor force participation such as childcare.

Other key gender-specific findings from the Social Cohesion program include the following:

- In host communities in eastern DRC, women were more likely to report negative perceptions of in- and out-group relationships while men reported positive associations with hosting. Study participants identified gender equality as a potential source of destabilization because it challenges tradition and the established social order.<sup>39</sup>
- In Colombia, Tellez and Balcells find that internally displaced men are more likely to return and are more likely to formally pursue property restitution than women. A separate study by Kaplan finds that being female is also associated with a lower likelihood of recommending return to others; women were not found to have stronger beliefs that prayer provides protection or helps with trauma.<sup>40</sup>

- Among Guatemalans deported and traveling back from the United States, women were found to be more likely to be extorted during their journey. However, only 8 percent of the survey sample was female, limiting the validity of this result.<sup>41</sup>
- In Iraq, the inclusion of women, youth, and civil society in local peace agreements was not associated with safer conditions for return but was associated with a longer duration of return.
- In Iran, economic shocks erode social cohesion between hosts and displaced communities and disproportionately harm Afghan refugees in terms of expenditures and aid received from other households. Being married, female, and less educated are associated with especially negative consequences.<sup>42</sup>
- women from Turkey displaced before the age of 15 are married to a Greek native, compared with less than 10 percent of Albanian immigrants. Average rates of intermarriage in Eastern Europe are between 2-25 percent. Additionally, the children of women refugees tend to be more educated than those of native women. 43 Data on male rates of intermarriage are not discussed.

<sup>39</sup> Pham, et al. 2022.

<sup>40</sup> Tellez and Balcells 2022.

<sup>41</sup> Denny et al. 2022.

<sup>42</sup> Hoseini and Dideh 2022.

<sup>43</sup> Murard 2022.

- Venezuelans have experienced discrimination in public or the workplace, compared to 35 percent of men. 44 Higher rates of informal employment are overall associated with lower levels of discrimination and these effects are more pronounced for men. For men, a 10 percent increase in informal employment is associated with a 2-3 percent reduction in discrimination, while the change for women is not statistically significant. 45 The reason for this difference is not explained.
- Among IDPs in Mali, there was no statistically significant difference in per capita consumption between female and male-headed households.<sup>46</sup>
- In Bosnia, being male is consistently associated with higher levels of education and income, regardless of exposure to conflict.<sup>47</sup>

All of the foregoing social inclusion papers meet our first two criteria – by assessing gender gaps and including indicators that help capture gender gaps. An additional ten Social Cohesion papers include gender variables in appendix tables, but do not discuss these results in the paper. These papers meet only the second criteria.

Across the social cohesion series, two papers mention gender in the policy recommendations. Pham, O'Mealia, and Wei et al. suggest that women's relatively negative perceptions of social cohesion means that humanitarian actors include inter-ethnic programming for women in eastern DRC. Ludolph, Šedová, and Talevi note the security implications of internal displacement in Nigeria and suggests that efforts are needed to increase IDP mobility and reduce risks of GBV, although these themes are not discussed in the main body.

<sup>44</sup> Whether this difference is statistically significant is not reported.

<sup>45</sup> Groeger, León-Chiliotta, and Stillman 2022.

<sup>46</sup> Foltz and Shibuya 2022. It is noted that only 8% of households surveyed are female-headed.

<sup>47</sup> Kovac, Efendic, and Shapiro 2022.

#### 4. CONCLUSIONS

The overarching implication of this review is that more work is needed to understand and address the intersectionality of gender and displacement, to close gender gaps in education and paid work, and to address heightened risks of GBV during displacement.

The research does reveal some important gender findings - including that COVID-19 has worsened risks of GBV. that access to maternal and sexual health services for displaced women are scarce, that in some contexts displaced households headed by women benefit more from social protection programs than those headed by men, and that displaced women may face greater discrimination economically and socially than displaced men. For example, in Greece, 32 percent of male-headed refugee households knew whom to contact with problems regarding social protection assistance, compared to only 21 percent of female-headed refugee households. For displaced Venezuelans in Colombia, the gap was even wider at 44 and 23 percent of male and female-headed households, respectively.

The studies on Social Cohesion and Social Protection demonstrate how learning from qualitative information from displaced groups, and including the voices of displaced women is key, especially those facing multiple disadvantages. However, in general, the research did not point to the types of policies and programs to achieve gender equality in displacement settings.

Among the measures that could have been considered are policy reforms and more proactive programs to increase displaced people's free movement and access to labor markets, for example, and to provide safe, affordable, and quality childcare.

In a number of cases, the analysis appeared to be limited by lack of appropriate data. It is critical to address this gap. Within households, sex-disaggregated individual-level data is needed to enable a better understanding of the situation of different household members, dependency ratios and more.

We know that displacement affects men and women differently, and overlooking these dimensions creates profound blind spots in policy design. Addressing the gender dimensions of forced displacement must become more routine in data collection, research analysis, and program implementation.

#### REFERENCES

Admasu, Yeshwas. 2021. Forced
Displacement, Gender, and Livelihoods:
Refugees in Ethiopia. World Bank
Policy Research Working Paper 9862.
Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/754711638209414704/
forced-displacement-gender-and-livelihoods-refugees-in-ethiopia

Admasu, Yeshwas, Sabina Alkire, and Sophie Scharlin-Pettee. 2021.

Multidimensional Poverty, Gender, and Forced Displacement: A Multi-Country, Intrahousehold Analysis in Sub-Saharan Africa. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 9823. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentde-tail/548251635476246875/multidimensional-poverty-gender-and-forced-displacement-a-multi-country-intrahouse-hold-analysis-in-sub-saharan-africa

Arango, Diana Jimena, Jocelyn Kelly, Jeni Klugman, and Elena Ortiz. 2021. Forced Displacement and Violence Against Women: A Policy Brief. World Bank Report 166696. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/593151638940044686/forced-displacement-and-violence-against-women-a-policy-brief

Audi, Mhd Nour, Katherine McCann, Sarah Guyer, M. Claire Greene, Ling San Lau, Fouad M Fouad, Monette Zard, Patrick Kachur, and Rachel T. Moresky. 2020. Addressing the Human Capital Dimension of the COVID-19 Response in Forced Displacement Settings. Knowledge brief. <a href="https://www.publi-chealth.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/addressing the human capital dimension of the covid-19 response in forced displacement settings.pdf">https://www.publi-chealth.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/addressing the human capital dimension of the covid-19 response in forced displacement settings.pdf</a>

Burde, Dana, Andrea Coombes, Thomas de Hoop, Ozen Guven, Otgonjargal Okhidoi, Hannah Ring, Victoria Rothbard, and Chinmaya Holla. 2023a. Forthcoming. Forced Displacement and Education: Building the Evidence for What Works: Phase I Report: Evidence Synthesis and Intervention Map. AIR Research Paper. https://www.air.org/project/forced-dis-

placement-and-education-study

Burde, Dana, Andi Coombes, Thomas de Hoop, Yasmina Haddad, Chinmaya Holla, Heddy Lahmann-Rosen, and Hannah Ring. 2023. Forthcoming. Forced Displacement and Education: Building the Evidence for What Works: Phase II Report: Case Study Summary. AIR Research Paper. https://www.air.org/project/forced-

https://www.air.org/project/forceddisplacement-and-education-study

Denny, Elaine Kathryn, David
Dow, Gabriella Levy, and
Mateo Villamizar-Chaparro. 2022.
Extortion and Civic Engagement among
Guatemalan Deportees. World Bank
Policy Research Working Paper 10020.
Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
https://documents.worldbank.org/en/
publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/099730304262235605/
idu02026f74207fd304e610a1160b8141ae76d28

Foltz, Jeremy and Sakina Shibuya. 2022. The Effects of Internally Displaced Peoples on Consumption and Inequality in Mali. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 10054. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. <a href="https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/099012105182212190/pdf/IDU17ec2687314aa31482219ba01b58ebe-2daebb.pdf">https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/099012105182212190/pdf/IDU17ec2687314aa31482219ba01b58ebe-2daebb.pdf</a>

Groeger, Andre Gianmarco León-Ciliotta, and Steven Stillman. 2022.
Immigration, Labor Markets and
Discrimination Evidence from the
Venezuelan Exodus in Perú. World Bank
Policy Research Working Paper 9982.
Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
https://documents1.worldbank.org/
curated/en/736921648042623498/
pdf/Immigration-Labor-Markets-andDiscrimination-Evidence-from-theVenezuelan-Exodus-in-Peru.pdf

Hagen-Zanker, Jessica, Marcela Rubio, Christina Lowe and Caterina Mazzilli. 2022. Basic needs and wellbeing in displacement settings. The role of humanitarian assistance and social protection. ODI Working Paper. https://cdn.odi.org/media/documents/basic\_needs\_wp\_-2022-06-29.pdf

Hanmer, Lucia, Eliana RubianoMatulevich, and Julieth Santamaria. 2021.

Differences in Household Composition:
Hidden Dimensions of Poverty and
Displacement in Somalia. World Bank
Policy Research Working Paper 9818.

Washington, DC: World Bank Group.
https://documents.worldbank.org/en/
publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/163081635436026650/
differences-in-household-composition-hidden-dimensions-of-poverty-and-displacement-in-somalia

Hoseini, Mohammad and Mahsa Jihad Dideh. 2022. How Do Shared Experiences of Economic Shocks Impact Refugees and Host Communities Evidence from Afghan Refugees in Iran. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 9915. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/311771643289939369/how-do-shared-experiences-of-economic-shocks-impact-refugees-and-host-communities-evidence-from-afghan-refugees-in-iran

Kadigo, Mark Marvin, Diallo Nene
Oumou, and Jean Francois Paul C
Maystadt. 2022. How to Cope with a
Refugee Shock? Evidence from Uganda.
Washington, DC: World Bank. https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/
handle/10986/37051

Kovac, Devan, Adnan Efendic, and Jacob N. Shapiro. 2022. Forced Displacement, Exposure to Conflict and Long-run Education and Income Inequality Evidence from Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 10021. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/099748104262212564/pdf/IDU0044f959d03d6f046b-40b6970831a4f7cab42.pdf

Krafft, Caroline, Ragui Assaad, and Isabel Pastoor. 2021. How Do Gender Norms Shape Education and Domestic Work Outcomes The Case of Syrian Refugee Adolescents in Jordan. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 9820. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. <a href="https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/914761635472358174/how-do-gender-norms-shape-education-and-domestic-work-outcomes-thecase-of-syrian-refugee-adolescents-in-jordan">https://documentdetail/914761635472358174/how-do-gender-norms-shape-education-and-domestic-work-outcomes-thecase-of-syrian-refugee-adolescents-in-jordan</a>

Lau, Ling San, Sarah Guyer, M. Claire Greene, Rachel T. Moresky, Leslie F. Roberts, Sara E. Casey, S. Patrick Kachur and Monette Zard. 2020. *Preventing* and Mitigating Indirect Health Impacts of COVID-19 on Displaced Populations in Humanitarian Settings. Knowledge Brief. https://www.publichealth.columbia.edu/ sites/default/files/knowledge\_brief\_1.pdf

Levine, Antoine Socpa, Nathalie Both and Heiner Salomon. 2022. Integrating assistance to the displaced into a social protection system in Cameroon:

An ideal, but in whose interests? ODI Report. https://cdn.odi.org/media/documents/Cameroon\_report-published-2022-06-09.pdf

Lowe, Christina, Rebecca Holmes,
Caterina Mazzilli, and Marcela Rubio.
2022. Adjusting social protection
delivery to effectively support displaced
populations. <a href="https://cdn.odi.org/media/documents/Adjusting\_social\_protection\_delivery\_to\_support\_displaced\_populations\_2022.pdf">https://cdn.odi.org/media/documents/Adjusting\_social\_protection\_delivery\_to\_support\_displaced\_populations\_2022.pdf</a>

Ludolph, Lars, Barbora Šedová, and Marta Talevi. 2022. *Inequality and Security in the Aftermath of Internal Population Displacement Shocks: Evidence from Nigeria*. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 10053. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. <a href="https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/099956405182219719/pdf/1DU07814c0ce004af042470b7070b7d-58954fcdd.pdf">https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/en/099956405182219719/pdf/1DU07814c0ce004af042470b7070b7d-58954fcdd.pdf</a>

Morgan, Rosemary, <u>Heang-Lee Tan, Niki</u>
<u>Oveisi, Christina Memmott, Alexander</u>
<u>Korzuchowski, Kate Hawkins,</u> and <u>Julia</u>
<u>Smith</u>. 2022. "Women healthcare workers' experiences during COVID-19 and other crises: A scoping review." *Int J*<u>Nurs Stud Adv</u> (4). <a href="https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC8801061/">https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC8801061/</a>

Müller, Tobias, Pia Pannatier, and Martina Giorgia Viarengo. 2022. Labor Market Integration, Local Conditions and Inequalities: Evidence from Refugees in Switzerland. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 9814. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/744751643249598650/labor-market-integration-local-conditions-and-inequalities-evidence-from-refugees-in-switzerland

Murard, Elie. 2022. Long-Term Effects of the 1923 Mass Refugee Inflow on Social Cohesion in Greece. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 9912. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/216361643247188116/long-term-effects-of-the-1923-mass-refugee-inflow-on-social-cohesion-in-greece

Roa, Arturo Harker, Sara E. Casey, Goleen Samari, and Dana Nabulsi. 2020. Family Violence Prevention in the Context of COVID-19 and Forced Displacement.

Knowledge brief. <a href="https://www.publi-chealth.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/family\_violence\_prevention\_in\_the\_context\_of\_covid\_-corrected\_metadata.">https://www.publi-chealth.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/family\_violence\_prevention\_in\_the\_context\_of\_covid\_-corrected\_metadata.</a>

Rubiano-Matulevich, Eliana. 2021.

Do Gender Norms Become Less

Traditional with Displacement The

Case of Colombia. World Bank Policy

Research Working Paper 9822.

Washington, DC: World Bank Group.

https://documents.worldbank.org/
en/publication/documents-reports/
documentdetail/311741635474477371/
do-gender-norms-become-less-traditional-with-displacement-the-case-of-colombia

Shepard, Donald S., Adelaida Boada,
Douglas Newball-Ramirez, Anna G
Sombrio, Carlos William Rincon Perez,
Priya Agarwal-Harding, Jamie S Jason,
Arturo Harker Roa, and Diana M. Bowser.
2021. Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic in Colombia on utilization of medical services by Venezuelan migrants and
Colombian citizens. Knowledge brief.
https://www.publichealth.columbia.
edu/sites/default/files/covid\_colombia
brief\_v60.pdf

Stojetz, Wolfgang, and Tilman Brück. 2021. The Double Burden of Female Protracted Displacement: Survey Evidence on Gendered Livelihoods in El Fasher, Darfur. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 9818. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/

documentdetail/582571635477505457/ the-double-burden-of-female-protracted-displacement-survey-evidence-on-gendered-livelihoods-in-el-fasher-darfur

Tramountanis, Angelo, Apostolos
Linardis, Aliki Mouriki, Patricia
Gerakopoulou, Dimitra Kondyli, Olga
Papaliou, Christina Varouxi and Simon
Levine. 2022. Humanitarian assistance
and social protection responses to the
forcibly displaced in Greece. ODI report.
https://cdn.odi.org/media/documents/
Humanitarian assistance and social
protection in Greece.pdf

Tellez, Juan Fernando, and Laia Balcells. 2022. Social Cohesion, Economic Security, and Forced Displacement in the Long-Run: Evidence from Rural Colombia. World Bank Policy Research Working Paper 10019. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. <a href="https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentde-tail/099539304262234248/idu015a9be-2b0af470434608d7404a72dfd1d88a">https://documentde-tail/099539304262234248/idu015a9be-2b0af470434608d7404a72dfd1d88a</a>

World Bank Group. 2016. Gender Equality, Poverty Reduction and Inclusive Growth: Gender Strategy 2016-2023.

Washington, DC: World Bank Group.

https://documents1.worldbank.org/
curated/en/820851467992505410/pdf/102114-REVISED-PUBLIC-WBG-Gender-Strategy.pdf

World Bank. 2022. World Bank Consortium: The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - Final Summary Report. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents1.worldbank. org/curated/en/099001106212246276/ pdf/P1669090e0c4010b0adfa050973837275a.pdf

World Bank. 2023a. Forthcoming.

World Bank Consortium: The Big

Questions in Forced Displacement and

Health - Bangladesh Country Report.

Washington, DC: World Bank Group.

https://documents.worldbank.org/en/
publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/099001106212246276/
p1669090e0c4010b0adfa050973837275a

World Bank. 2023b. Forthcoming. World Bank Consortium: The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - Colombia Country Report.

Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/099001106212246276/p1669090e0c4010b0ad-fa050973837275a

World Bank. 2023c. Forthcoming. World Bank Consortium: The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - DRC Country Report.
Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/099001106212246276/p1669090e0c4010b0ad-fa050973837275a

World Bank. 2023d. Forthcoming. World Bank Consortium: The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - Jordan Country Report. Washington, DC: World Bank Group. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/099001106212246276/p1669090e0c4010b0ad-fa050973837275a

World Bank. 2023e. Forthcoming. Cost Effectiveness of Jobs Projects in Conflict and Forced Displacement Contexts. https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/099720012082210100/p16767104f2a340d1083c-2072102de4feb5

## ANNEX 1: LIST OF PAPERS REVIEWED

#### **EDUCATION (2)**

Forced Displacement and Education:
Building the Evidence for What
Works (Phase 1 Report - Synthesis)
(Unpublished)

Forced Displacement and Education: Building the Evidence for What Works -(case study summary) (Unpublished)

#### HEALTH (9)

Addressing the Human Capital

Dimension of the COVID-19 Response in

Forced Displacement Settings (August
2020)

Family Violence Protection in the Context of COVID-19 and Forced Displacement (November 2020)

Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic in Colombia on utilization of medical services by Venezuelan migrants and Colombian citizens (October 2021)

Preventing and Mitigating Indirect Health Impacts of COVID-19 on Displaced Populations in Humanitarian Settings (July 2020) The Big Questions in Forced
Displacement and Health - Final
Summary Report (Unpublished)

The Big Questions in Forced
Displacement and Health - Bangladesh
Country Report (Unpublished)

The Big Questions in Forced
Displacement and Health - Colombia
Country Report (Unpublished)

The Big Questions in Forced
Displacement and Health - DRC Country
Report (Unpublished)

The Big Questions in Forced
Displacement and Health - Jordan
Country Report (Unpublished)

#### JOBS (2)

Cost Effectiveness of Jobs Projects in Conflict and Forced Displacement Contexts (Unpublished draft)

How to Cope with a Refugee Shock? Evidence from Uganda (March 2022)

TOR: Global Questions on Displacement and Jobs (Unpublished)

TOR: Global Questions on Forced
Displacement and Jobs (Unpublished)

#### **SOCIAL PROTECTION (6)**

Adjusting Social Protection Delivery
to Support Displaced Populations
(September 2022)

Basic Needs and Wellbeing in
Displacement Settings: The Role of
Humanitarian Assistance and Social
Protection (June 2022)

Humanitarian Assistance and Social
Protection in Contexts of Forced
Displacement: effects on social cohesion
(May 2022)

Humanitarian Assistance and Social Protection Responses to the Forcibly Displaced in Greece (April 2022)

Integrating Assistance to the Displaced into a Social Protection System in Cameroon: An ideal, but in whose interests? (June 2022)

Social Protection Responses to Forced Displacement in Colombia (June 2022)

#### SOCIAL COHESION (26)

Attitudes and Policies toward Refugees:

Evidence from Low- and Middle-Income
Countries (March 2022)

Building Stability Between Host and Refugee Communities: Evidence from a TVET Program in Jordan and Lebanon (June 2022)

Displacement and Return in the Internet

Era: How Social Media Captures

Migration Decisions in Northern Syria

(April 2022)

Displacement and Social Empowerment:

Evidence from Surveys of IDPs in Iraq,
the Philippines, and Uganda (April 2022)

Distributional Policies and Social
Cohesion in a High-Unemployment
Setting (June 2022)

Extortion and Civic Engagement among Guatemalan Deportees (April 2022)

Forced Displacement, Exposure to
Conflict and Long-run Education and
Income Inequality: Evidence from
Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina
(April 2022)

Forced Migration, Social Cohesion and Conflict: The 2015 Refugee Inflow in Germany (January 2022)

Hosting New Neighbors: Perspectives of Host Communities on Social Cohesion in Eastern DRC (June 2022)

How do Shared Experiences of

Economic Shocks Impact Refugees
and Host Communities: Evidence from

Afghan Refugees in Iran (January 2022)

Inequality and Security in the Aftermath of Internal Population Displacement
Shocks: Evidence from Nigeria (May 2022)

Immigration, Labor Markets and
Discrimination: Evidence from the
Venezuelan Exodus in Perú (March
2022)

Inclusive Refugee-Hosting in Uganda Improves Local Development and Prevents Public Backlash Labor Market Integration, Local
Conditions and Inequalities: Evidence
from Refugees in Switzerland (January
2022)

Why Student Aid Matters? Roadblocks to the Transition into Higher Education for Forced Migrants in Chile (June 2022)

Local Peace Agreements and the Return of IDPs with Perceived ISIL Affiliation in Irag (January 2022)

Long-term Effects of the 1923 Mass Refugee Inflow on Social Cohesion in Greece (January 2022)

<u>Policy Preferences in Response to Large</u> Migration Inflows (May 2022)

Refugees, Diversity and Conflict in Sub-Saharan Africa (May 2022)

Refugee Return and Social Cohesion (June 2022)

Social Cohesion, Economic Security, and Forced Displacement in the Long-Run:
Evidence from Rural Colombia (April 2022)

Social Cohesion and Refugee Host Interactions: Evidence from East Africa (January 2022)

Superstitions and Civilian Displacement:
Evidence from the Colombian Conflict
(April 2022)

The Effects of Internally Displaced

Peoples on Consumption and Inequality
in Mali (May 2022)

The Geography of Displacement,
Refugees' Camps and Social Conflicts

What It Takes To Return: UN

Peacekeeping and the Safe Return of

Displaced People (June 2022)

#### ANNEX 2: ASSESSMENT OF PAPERS AGAINST GENDER CRITERIA

Title	Assessment of gender gaps	Presents gendered indicators and identification of constraints	Considers policy and program implications to close gender gaps	Meets all 3 criteria
Education				
Forced Displacement and Education: Building the Evidence for What Works (Phase 1 Report - Synthesis) (Unpublished)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Forced Displacement and Education: Building the Evidence for What Works - (case study summary) (Unpublished)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Health				
Addressing the Human Capital Dimension of the COVID-19 Response in Forced Displacement Settings (August 2020)	No	No	No	No
Family Violence Protection in the Context of COVID-19 and Forced Displacement (November 2020)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic in Colombia on utilization of medical services by Venezuelan migrants and Colombian citizens (October 2021)	No	No	No	No
Preventing and Mitigating Indirect Health Impacts of COVID-19 on Displaced Populations in Humanitarian Settings (July 2020)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - Final Summary Report (Unpublished)	Yes	No	Yes	No
The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - Bangladesh Country Report (Unpublished)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

Title	Assessment of gender gaps	Presents gendered indicators and identification of constraints	Considers policy and program implications to close gender gaps	Meets all 3 criteria
Health				
The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - Colombia Country Report (Unpublished)	Yes	Yes	No	No
The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - DRC Country Report (Unpublished)	Yes	Yes	No	No
The Big Questions in Forced Displacement and Health - Jordan Country Report (Unpublished)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Jobs				
Cost Effectiveness of Jobs Projects in Conflict and Forced Displacement Contexts (Unpublished draft)	No	No	No	No
How to Cope with a Refugee Shock? Evidence from Uganda (March 2022)	Yes	No	No	No
Social Protection				
Adjusting Social Protection Delivery to Support Displaced Populations (September 2022)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Basic Needs and Wellbeing in Displacement Settings: The Role of Humanitarian Assistance and Social Protection (June 2022)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Humanitarian Assistance and Social Protection in Contexts of Forced Displacement: effects on social cohesion (May 2022)	No	No	No	No
Humanitarian Assistance and Social Protection Responses to the Forcibly Displaced in Greece (April 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Integrating Assistance to the Displaced into a Social Protection System in Cameroon: An ideal, but in whose interests? (June 2022)	Yes	No	No	No
Social Protection Responses to Forced Displacement in Colombia (June 2022)	No	No	No	No
Social Cohesion				
Attitudes and Policies toward Refugees: Evidence from Low- and Middle-Income Countries (March 2022)	Yes	No	No	No
Building Stability Between Host and Refugee Communities: Evidence from a TVET Program in Jordan and Lebanon (June 2022)	No	No	No	No

Title	Assessment of gender gaps	Presents gendered indicators and identification of constraints	Considers policy and program implications to close gender gaps	Meets all 3 criteria
Social Cohesion				
Displacement and Return in the Internet  Era: How Social Media Captures Migration  Decisions in Northern Syria (April 2022)	No	No	No	No
Displacement and Social Empowerment:  Evidence from Surveys of IDPs in Iraq, the Philippines, and Uganda (April 2022)	Yes	No	No	No
Distributional Policies and Social Cohesion in a High-Unemployment Setting (June 2022)	No	No	No	No
Extortion and Civic Engagement among Guatemalan Deportees (April 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Forced Displacement, Exposure to Conflict and Long-run Education and Income Inequality: Evidence from Croatia and Bosnia and Herzegovina (April 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Forced Migration, Social Cohesion and Conflict: The 2015 Refugee Inflow in Germany (January 2022)	Yes	No	No	No
Hosting New Neighbors: Perspectives of Host Communities on Social Cohesion in Eastern DRC (June 2022)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
How do Shared Experiences of Economic Shocks Impact Refugees and Host Communities: Evidence from Afghan Refugees in Iran (January 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Inequality and Security in the Aftermath of Internal Population Displacement Shocks:  Evidence from Nigeria (May 2022)	No	No	Yes	No
Immigration, Labor Markets and Discrimination: Evidence from the Venezuelan Exodus in Perú (March 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Inclusive Refugee-Hosting in Uganda Improves Local Development and Prevents Public Backlash	Yes	No	No	No
Labor Market Integration, Local Conditions and Inequalities: Evidence from Refugees in Switzerland (January 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Local Peace Agreements and the Return of IDPs with Perceived ISIL Affiliation in Iraq (January 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Long-term Effects of the 1923 Mass Refugee Inflow on Social Cohesion in Greece (January 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Policy Preferences in Response to Large Migration Inflows (May 2022)	Yes	No	No	No

Title	Assessment of gender gaps	Presents gendered indicators and identification of constraints	Considers policy and program implications to close gender gaps	Meets all 3 criteria
Social Cohesion				
Refugees, Diversity and Conflict in Sub- Saharan Africa (May 2022)	Yes	No	No	No
Refugee Return and Social Cohesion (June 2022)	No	No	No	No
Social Cohesion, Economic Security, and Forced Displacement in the Long-Run: Evidence from Rural Colombia (April 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
Social Cohesion and Refugee Host Interactions: Evidence from East Africa (January 2022)	Yes	No	No	No
Superstitions and Civilian Displacement: Evidence from the Colombian Conflict (April 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
The Effects of Internally Displaced Peoples on Consumption and Inequality in Mali (May 2022)	Yes	Yes	No	No
The Geography of Displacement, Refugees' Camps and Social Conflicts	No	No	No	No
What It Takes To Return: UN Peacekeeping and the Safe Return of Displaced People (June 2022)	No	No	No	No
Why Student Aid Matters? Roadblocks to the Transition into Higher Education for Forced Migrants in Chile (June 2022)	No	No	No	No



