



Odisha Higher Education Program for Excellence and Equity (P160331)

SOUTH ASIA | India | Education Global Practice | Requesting Unit: SACIN | Responsible Unit: HSAED
IBRD/IDA | Program-for-Results Financing | FY 2018 | Team Leader(s): Sangeeta Dey, Sangeeta Goyal

Seq No: 13 | ARCHIVED on 26-Sep-2023 | ISR57704 | Created by: Sangeeta Dey on 29-Aug-2023 | Modified by: Sangeeta Dey on 25-Sep-2023

Program Development Objectives

Program Development Objective (from Program Appraisal Document)

The development objective of the Program is to improve the quality of and students' equitable access to selected institutions and enhance governance of the higher education system in Odisha.

Overall Ratings

Name	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Progress towards achievement of PDO	<input type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory	<input type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory
Overall Implementation Progress (IP)	<input type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory	<input type="checkbox"/> Satisfactory

Implementation Status and Key Decisions

- The program is making satisfactory progress with respect to achieving its program development objective (PDO) "To improve the quality of and students' equitable access to selected institutions and enhance governance of the higher education system in Odisha". For PDO indicator 1, the target has been achieved with "100% of supported colleges implementing blended learning" for part of the undergraduate (UG) curriculum against the end-of-program target of 75%. For PDO indicator 2, the target has been achieved with the "on-time graduation rate" having increased by 4 percentage points for each category of students (General, Scheduled Caste, Scheduled Tribe, Women) over the baseline in 75% of the selected colleges, against the end-of-program target of 50%. All PDO indicator 3 targets on "strengthened governance in faculty management" up to Year 4 have been achieved. The year 5 target for the third PDO indicator 'Personnel Information Management System (PIMS) upgraded and used as e-database for faculty management' has not been met yet. The Higher Education Department has initiated the process to develop a separate MIS for faculty management.
- All intermediate results indicators of the program have also been achieved.
- The results for all the Disbursement Linked Indicators(DLIs) have been achieved and corresponding disbursements have been made.
- There are continuing delays on civil works especially for phase 2 higher education institutions. The Higher Education Department will be doing close monitoring towards completion of civil works within the implementation period.

Data on Financial Performance

Disbursements (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Currency	Original	Revised	Cancelled	Disbursed	Undisbursed	% Disbursed
P160331	IBRD-87820	Effective	USD	119.00	69.62	49.38	69.47	0.15	100%

Key Dates (by loan)

Project	Loan/Credit/TF	Status	Approval Date	Signing Date	Effectiveness Date	Orig. Closing Date	Rev. Closing Date
P160331	IBRD-87820	Effective	31-Aug-2017	07-Nov-2017	07-Dec-2017	30-Nov-2022	31-Mar-2024



Program Action Plan

Action Description	Program related: Consultants for M&E, capacity building and faculty development recruited to the PMU Completion Measurement: Contracts signed				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		Client	Due Date	31-May-2017	Completed
Completion Measurement	PMU is staffed				
Comments					

Action Description	Program related: HED MIS operational Completion Measurement: MIS reports available				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		Client	Due Date	31-Aug-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement	MIS Functional				
Comments					

Action Description	Program related: Needs assessment for short-term faculty training programs completed Completion Measurement: Needs assessment report published on the HED website				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Technical		Client	Due Date	31-Mar-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Report received				
Comments					

Action Description	FM and Procurement: Executive order issued by the HED mandating the use of online FM system at the all government-aided colleges in Odisha Completion Measurement: Executive Order published on the HED website				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	31-Mar-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement	Executive order completed				
Comments					



Action Description	<p>FM and Procurement: Model Finance Rules for colleges developed and recommended for adoption</p> <p>Completion Measurement: Executive order issued recommending Model Finance Rules for adoption and made available on the HED website</p>				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	31-Oct-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement	Executive order issued recommending Model Finance Rules for adoption and made available on the HED website				
Comments	HED has constituted a Committee to develop the model Finance Rules for Colleges. The Committee is chaired by the retired FA cum Special Secretary HED and the work is in progress.				

Action Description	<p>FM and Procurement: Procurement Manual prepared by the GoO adopted by the HED</p> <p>Completion Measurement: Manual disseminated to all colleges in the state</p>				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	31-Aug-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement	Manual received				
Comments					

Action Description	<p>FM and Procurement: FM and Procurement training to nominated staff of selected institutions</p> <p>Completion Measurement: Training on use of manuals to all colleges in the state</p>				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	07-Dec-2019	Completed
Completion Measurement	Training on use of manuals to all colleges in the state				
Comments	Training has been done for round colleges. It has not yet been done for all round 2 colleges				

Action Description	<p>Governance and Accountability: Strengthening the vigilance cell in the HED</p> <p>Completion Measurement: Strengthening the vigilance cell in the HED to handle procurement complaints</p>				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Fiduciary Systems		Client	Due Date	31-Mar-2018	Completed



Completion Measurement	Strengthening the vigilance cell in the HED to handle procurement complaints
Comments	This is planned to be done soonest

Action Description	<p>Social and environment actions: MoUs for HEIs should incorporate at least two to three specific actions to improve enrolment, retention and on-time graduation for the SC, ST and female students</p> <p>completion measurement: PMU Annual Report</p>				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Due Date	07-Dec-2017	Completed
Completion Measurement	PMU Annual Report				
Comments					

Action Description	<p>Social and Environment actions: HEIs should ensure functional GRM cells, Equal Opportunity Cells and Women Harassment Redressal Cells with adequate students and faculty representation in selected institutions</p> <p>Completion Measurement:PMU annual Report</p>				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	PMU annual report				
Comments					

Action Description	<p>Social and Environment Actions: Inclusion of the Environment Audit and Management Plan as part of the MoUs of selected universities/colleges</p> <p>Completion Measurement: Inclusion in MoUs with universities/colleges</p>				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Due Date	07-Dec-2017	Completed
Completion Measurement	Inclusion in MoUs with universities/colleges				
Comments					

Action Description	<p>Social and Environment Actions: Inclusion of EHS aspects in bidding documents of the construction agencies</p>				
---------------------------	---	--	--	--	--



	Completion Measurement: Inclusion in bid documents of the construction agencies				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Due Date	30-Sep-2018	Completed
Completion Measurement	Inclusion of EHS aspects in bidding documents of the construction agencies				
Comments	The bidding documents are being prepared				

Action Description	Social and Environment Actions: Capacity building of relevant staff of universities, colleges, the HED, and construction agencies to ensure awareness of and adherence to the existing legal and regulatory provisions. Completion Measurement: PMU A.R.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Recurrent	Yearly	Completed
Completion Measurement	Awareness and training done				
Comments	The civil works have not started yet				

Action Description	Social and Environment Actions: Strengthening insttl. and monitoring systems of HED/HEIs to adequately capture env. dimension thro' designation of an Env. Officer in PMU and assigning EHS functions to Bldg mgt Committee with HEIs.				
Source	DLI#	Responsibility	Timing	Timing Value	Status
Environmental and Social Systems		Client	Due Date	07-Dec-2017	Completed
Completion Measurement	Staff in place				
Comments					

Risks

Systematic Operations Risk-rating Tool

Risk Category	Rating at Approval	Previous Rating	Current Rating
Political and Governance	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Macroeconomic	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial
Sector Strategies and Policies	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate



Technical Design of Project or Program	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Low
Institutional Capacity for Implementation and Sustainability	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Fiduciary	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial	<input type="checkbox"/> Substantial
Environment and Social	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Stakeholders	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate
Other	--	--	--
Overall	--	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate	<input type="checkbox"/> Moderate

Comments

Technical Design of Program: The risk rating has been downgraded to 'Low' from 'Moderate' as the Program has completed all activities except for the civil works in progress.

Fiduciary management risk mitigation measures: a) Given the declining performance of the College Accounting Procedure Automation (CAPA) which is an online accounting system instituted for government aided colleges, the HED will provide refresher training to the HEIs on the use of CAPA in the remaining implementation period. THE HED is considering making CAPA mandatory in all the government aided colleges from the next financial year starting April 1, 2024; b) the HED will follow up to inform colleges about the local audit review findings and monitor the actions taken by the colleges to address major audit observations.

Results

PDO Indicators by Objectives / Outcomes

Improve the students' equitable access to selected institutions				
▶ Blended learning and self-study approach adopted in the selected HEIs (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No blended learning implemented	100 percent of selected HEIs implementing the blended learning and self-study approach	100 percent of selected HEIs implementing the blended learning and self-study approach	75% of selected HEIs implementing the blended learning and self-study approach modules
Date	10-Dec-2020	21-Apr-2022	01-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2022
Comments	The target has been overachieved and 100% of the selected HEIs (137 colleges) are implementing the blended learning and self-study approach modules. There are no targets beyond March 31, 2022 for this indicator.			
▶ Improved student outcomes. Percentage of on-time graduation rate of students in undergraduate degree programs in selected colleges (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	60.00	59.85	75.00	50.00
Date	01-Aug-2017	21-Apr-2022	30-Sep-2022	31-Mar-2022
Comments	"Increased on-time graduation rate of students" was scheduled for monitoring from 2021 onwards. Given unforeseen delays in coursework and examination schedules with the closure of colleges and universities since March 2020 due to CoVID-19, this target was revised from 5 percent to 2 percent improvement annually in OTG at the time of the restructuring in January 2021. The baseline of 60% of colleges was also revised to 50% due to the uncertainties caused by the pandemic. The data was collected and published by			



the Universities for two cohorts of students in the three year degree courses during the implementation period till 2022. For the first cohort of students the target - 'OTG rate increased by 2% points for each category (all, Scheduled Caste, Scheduled Tribe and women) of students over the baseline in at least 50% of the selected colleges' was met with this achievement in 59.85% colleges. And for the second cohort the target of 'OTG rate increased by 4% points for each category of students over the baseline in at least 50 % of the selected colleges' was also met with this achievement in 75% of colleges.

Improve the quality of selected institutions

► Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning (Number, Corporate)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	501,544.00	501,544.00	530,000.00
Date	01-Apr-2018	21-Apr-2022	11-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2024
Comments	The data will be updated in the next ISR.			

□ Students benefiting from direct interventions to enhance learning - Female (Number, Corporate Supplement)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	260,803.00	260,803.00	275,000.00

Enhance governance of the higher education system in Odisha

► Strengthened governance in faculty management (Text, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	No reforms implemented	Target not achieved	Target not achieved	PIMS upgraded and used as edatabase for faculty management
Date	10-Dec-2020	15-Mar-2023	11-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2024
Comments	Due to administrative challenges in integrating additional faculty data in the existing PIMS to update it, the Higher Education Department has initiated the process to develop an MIS for faculty management with external technical support, which will be part of the PIMS.			

Intermediate Results Indicators by Results Areas

Results Area 1: Improving quality of and students' equitable access to selected institutions

► Number of project beneficiaries (students) disaggregated by gender (core) (Number, Custom)

	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	661,700.00	880,810.00	880,810.00	827,200.00



Date	01-Apr-2017	15-Mar-2023	11-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2024
Comments				
<input type="checkbox"/> Number of project beneficiaries (female) (Number, Custom Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	333,600.00	440,400.00	440,400.00	417,000.00
Date	01-Aug-2017	15-Mar-2023	11-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2024
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Annual performance milestones met by the HED and selected institutions (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	-HED achieved two APMs namely Career Counseling Cells & MIS functional. -Out 137 colleges, 71 achieved 5 APMs, 53 achieved 4 APMs, 10 achieved 3 APMs & 3 achieved 2 APMs. -Only one university achieved 3 APMs (as on 31st March 2020)	4 out of 5 APM achieved for the Higher Education Department. All APMs achieved for colleges and universities.	4 out of 5 APM achieved for the Higher Education Department. All APMs achieved for colleges and universities.	5 milestones each for the selected colleges, Universities and HED to be achieved
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	31-Mar-2022
Comments	this target was Partially achieved: HED-PMU achieved 3 out of 5 milestones; 62% of colleges achieved 3 out of 5 milestones against target of 80%; 60% of universities achieved 3 out of 5 milestones against target of 80%.			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Percentage of sanctioned posts filled with regular faculty in selected institutions (Core) (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	74.00	95.40	95.40	95.00
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	31-Mar-2022
Comments	This target was substantially achieved.			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Number (cumulative) of faculty and administrators in degree colleges and state universities who completed a short-term training program (by gender) (Core) (Number, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	250.00	4,500.00	14,902.00	6,000.00
Date	04-Dec-2017	15-Mar-2023	11-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2024
Comments	This target has been over achieved.			



<input type="checkbox"/> Number (cumulative) of female faculty and administrators in degree colleges and state universities who complete a short-term training program (Number, Custom Breakdown)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	85.00	955.00	6,238.00	1,500.00
Date	01-Aug-2017	15-Mar-2023	11-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2024
▶ Evaluation of the curriculum implementation (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	Evaluation to be done	2nd revision of CBCS curriculum after Govt of India issues detailed guidelines on the National Education Policy	2nd revision of CBCS curriculum after Govt of India issues detailed guidelines on the National Education Policy	2nd revision of CBCS curriculum evaluated
Date	04-Dec-2017	15-Mar-2023	15-Mar-2023	31-Mar-2020
Comments	The second revision of the curriculum was to be undertaken after detailed guidelines from the Government of India on the undergraduate courses and their duration (4 years vs 3 years). The decision to implement the four year undergraduate in under review at the national and state level.			
▶ Improved satisfaction levels of beneficiaries (students and faculty) in selected institutions (core) (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	n.a.	Survey report completed showing that 72% of selected HEIs improved in at least 50% of the satisfaction survey parameters (76% of round 1 and 67% of round 2 colleges) against the target of 60%.	Survey report completed showing that 72% of selected HEIs improved in at least 50% of the satisfaction survey parameters (76% of round 1 and 67% of round 2 colleges) against the target of 60%.	At least 60% of the selected HEIs improve at least in 50% of their satisfaction survey parameters
Date	04-Dec-2017	15-Mar-2023	15-Mar-2023	31-Mar-2022
Comments	There are no targets beyond March 31, 2022 for this indicator.			

Results Area 2: Enhancing governance of the higher education system				
▶ The HED's MIS strengthened up to the specified standards (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	n.a.	MIS is functional and captures data necessary for the DLIs (DLI-1 & DLI-3) and intermediate results indicators and all 147 HEIs are updating data in MIS.	MIS is functional and captures data necessary for the DLIs (DLI-1 & DLI-3) and intermediate results indicators and all 147 HEIs are updating data in MIS.	MIS functional.



Date	04-Dec-2017	15-Mar-2023	11-Sep-2023	31-Mar-2019
Comments				
► Percentage of selected government-aided colleges that completed data entry using online FM system (Percentage, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	0.00	61.46	61.46	60.00
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	31-Mar-2022
Comments	There are no targets beyond March 31, 2022 for this indicator. April 21, 2022 update: This DLI has achieved its annual target of 60%. 61.46% of government-aided colleges have completed data entry using online FM system up to 31 March 2022.			
► Governance benchmarking score card exercise (Text, Custom)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	End Target
Value	n.a.	Action plans shared with colleges following the government benchmarking exercise carried out in 2021	Action plans shared with colleges following the government benchmarking exercise carried out in 2021	exercise carried out
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	31-Mar-2021
Comments	There are no targets beyond March 31, 2022 for this indicator. April 21, 2022 update: The 10 action points from the findings of the governance benchmarking exercise have been communicated and colleges have given back their four priority action areas to be included in the 2020-21 annual performance milestones.			

Disbursement Linked Indicators

► DLI 1 DLI1: Blended Learning and self-study approach adopted in the selected HEIs (Output, 2.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2022
Value	No reforms implanted	100 percent of HEIs development blended learning	100 percent of HEIs development blended learning	75% of selected HEIs implementing the blended learning modules plan
Date	--	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	--
Comments	There are no further DLRs.			

► DLI 3 Improved student outcomes. 1) Percentage of on-time graduation rate of students in undergraduate degree programs in selected colleges (total students) (Process, 1.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2022
Value	60.00	59.85	75.00	50.00
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	30-Sep-2022	--



Comments	There are no further DLRs.
-----------------	----------------------------

► DLI 4 DLI3: Annual performance milestones met by the HED and selected institutions (Process, 6.00, 67%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2022
Value	0% of institutions achieving annual performance milestones	4 out of 5 APM for the HED has been achieved. All APMs for colleges and universities achieved	4 out of 5 APM for the HED has been achieved. All APMs for colleges and universities achieved	DLR 3.5(a): HED-PMU achieve 5 annual milestones DLR 3.5(b): 5 annual milestones each for the selected colleges, Universities. 80% of the selected institutions achieve at least 60% of institution-based annual milestones
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	--
Comments	There are no further DLRs.			

► DLI 5 DLI4: Strengthened governance of faculty management (Intermediate Outcome, 2.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2022
Value	No reforms	Faculty recruitment and promotion rules of government colleges amended	Faculty recruitment and promotion rules of government colleges amended	--
Date	--	31-Mar-2021	31-Mar-2021	--
Comments	The Y5 DLI 4 DLR has been dropped and allocated amount cancelled in the restructuring carried out in December 2022.			

► DLI 7 DLI5: Improved fiduciary management in selected institutions: Percentage of selected institutions that completed data entry using online FM system (Online accounting system) (Output, 2.00, 200%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2022
Value	0.00	61.46	61.46	60.00
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	--
Comments	There are no remaining DLRs.			

► DLI 8 DLI5: Part 2: Enhanced procurement management (Output, 2.00, 0%)				
	Baseline	Actual (Previous)	Actual (Current)	2022



Value	0.00	98.00	98.00	60.00
Date	04-Dec-2017	21-Apr-2022	21-Apr-2022	--
Comments	There are no futher DLRs.			